

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

----- X

September 26, 2018

Start: 10:33 a.m.

Recess: 11:00 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: MARK TREYGER
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Justin L. Brannan
Andrew Cohen
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Chaim M. Deutsch
Daniel Dromm
Barry S. Grodenchik
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Bard S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Eric A. Ulrich

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

3

2 [sound check] [pause] [gavel]

3 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Please be quiet,
4 please. Quiet down. Be quiet, please.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay. Good
6 morning. I'm Council Member Mark Treyger, Chair of
7 the Education Committee, Member--

8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet
9 down, please. Please, please quiet down.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you for
11 joining us today as we vote on Proposed Introduction
12 Nos. 561-A and 672-A, which I am proud to sponsor. I
13 would like to thank the members of the Education
14 Committee who are here, Council Member Kallos,
15 Council Member Levine, Council Member Cohen, Council
16 Member Lander, Council Member Deutsch, Council Member
17 Rose, Council Member Brannan and Council Member
18 Borelli.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: And I am here.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And Council Member
21 Rodriguez, and Council Member Barron [background
22 comments, pause] and Council Member Grodenchik.

23 [laughter] I cannot forget Parks Chair. Proposed
24 Intro No. 561-A would require the DOE to report the
25 income and total expenditure of parents associations

2 and parent-teacher associations in New York City
3 public schools disaggregated by community school
4 district and school, and school information would
5 also be disaggregated by student demographics
6 including race, ethnicity, and English language
7 learner status. PTAs and PAs have the potential to
8 raise substantial amounts of money and effectively
9 increase opportunities of a school while neighboring
10 schools may struggle with budget constraints.
11 Proposed Intro 561-A would bring transparency to the
12 contributions made by PTAs and PAs to school budgets,
13 and to be clear, the amount of money a PTA or PA
14 raises does not equate to the level of engagement in
15 a school, but it does have an impact on the number of
16 opportunities the school provides their students, and
17 we are having a conversation in New York City about
18 equity, and I don't believe that your Zip Code should
19 determine the number of opportunities you should
20 receive. So, this is just a transparency bill to
21 find out—about the depths of certain inequities in
22 our school system. We heard at the hearing that some
23 PAs and PTAs raised over a million dollars while some
24 lack the capacity. I think we'll learn more with the
25 bill. Proposed Intro No. 672-A would require the

2 Department of Education to provide information about
3 the Department of Citywide Administrative Services,
4 civil service examinations, the students, including
5 information about the city's Civil Service process
6 such as the application process, hiring system and
7 descriptions of Civil Service tests as well as the
8 titles of upcoming exams open to high school
9 graduates and related job descriptions, and
10 instructions for how to find more information online.
11 Recent studies suggest 43% or more of the city's high
12 school graduates may be going straight to the
13 workforce as opposes to pursuing post-secondary
14 education. We could support them by promoting
15 information about non-traditional career paths
16 including careers in the public sector. I'd like to
17 thank the Education Committee staff for their
18 efforts: Beth Golub, Jan Atwell, Kalima Johnson,
19 Caitlin O'Hagan and Elizabeth Hoffman. I'd like to
20 also thank my staff Anna Scaife, Vanessa Ogle and
21 Eric Feinberg, and we've been joined by Council
22 Member Cornegy, and with that, I will ask the
23 Committee Clerk to please call the roll, and begin
24 the vote.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

6

2 CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk,
3 roll call vote Committee on Education. Items are
4 coupled. Chair Treyger.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I vote aye.

6 CLERK: Barron.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

8 CLERK: Cohen.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Permission to
10 explain my vote.

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Permission granted
12 to Council Member Cohen.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you. I just
14 want to say I had some reservations about 561-A. You
15 know, I'm fully aware that not all PAs function the
16 same way, and that some don't function at all and, of
17 course, I'm aware of the deep disparities in
18 fundraising. However, I think that pulling this one
19 strand out of-out of the funding per-pupil pictures a
20 very limited value. Yesterday I did ask Bill
21 Drafting to see if we could draft a bill that would
22 sort of give us a more fuller picture of all sources
23 of funding, which I think would be more relevant and
24 useful in policy making decisions, but the-the bill
25 is neutral on its face, and I did have a good

2 conversation with the Chair yesterday, and he
3 convinced me of the merits of the bill. So, with
4 that, I'm going to vote aye on all.

5 CLERK: Cornegy.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

7 CLERK: Deutsch.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

9 CLERK: Kallos.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to
11 explain my vote?

12 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Council Member
13 Kallos.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I-I was inspired
15 by my colleague Council Member Cohen. I think more
16 transparency is a good thing, and I appreciate the
17 sponsor looking at this issue and getting it out in
18 the open. I am hoping that this chair and committee
19 and the body and the DOE as a whole will ensure that
20 this information is used for positive purposes only.
21 I grow concerned in a city of particularly in my
22 district hyper competitive parents, hyper competitive
23 schools where all of a sudden how much a PTA raises
24 will now be coming into see whether or not a school
25 is good or bad despite the fact that I believe all

2 the schools in my district are stellar. So, let's
3 just make sure that this information is used for
4 good. I vote aye.

5 CLERK: Lander.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Permission to
7 explain.

8 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Council Member
9 Lander.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Mr.
11 Chair. In voting on this bill, I am proud to be a
12 co-sponsor of it. I do think the transparency here
13 is important. This is a meaningful fact of resources
14 in our public schools, and having it made public I
15 think is-is-is not just appropriate, but-but the
16 right thing to do. I will say at the hearing, the-
17 the conversation I hope we'll have is about parent
18 leadership for all, and how we make sure that's
19 happening in all schools, those that can raise money
20 and those that can't raise money. You know, whether
21 we should look at some sort of tide model where 20%
22 of PTA funding goes into a pot that's spread around
23 more equally or whether we should consider totally
24 different ways of thinking about how the DOE can do
25 more to engage and support parent leadership in all

2 schools irrespective of resources, I think is an
3 essential conversation as the new Deputy Chancellor
4 over this division who I hope will be able to develop
5 that agenda with us. So, I'm glad to be a co-
6 sponsor. I'm proud to vote, but I agree we can't
7 stop here in the work to achieve, you know, more
8 equal, equitable parent leadership across our school
9 system. I vote aye.

10 CLERK: Levine.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote aye.

12 CLERK: Rodriguez.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

14 CLERK: Rose.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

16 CLERK: Grodenchik.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

18 CLERK: Brannan.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

20 CLERK: Dromm.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

22 CLERK: Borelli.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

24 CLERK: By a vote of 14 in the
25 affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions,

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

10

2 both items have been adopted by the committee.

3 [pause]

4 CLERK: Good morning, continue--
5 continuing the roll call vote on Education, Council
6 Member Levin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.

8 CLERK: Thank you. The revised vote is
9 15 in the affirmative 0 in the negative and 0
10 abstentions. [pause] [background comments] Good
11 morning. Continuing the roll call vote on the
12 Committee on Education, Council Member Salamanca.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

14 CLERK: Thank you. By-the revised vote
15 is 16 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0
16 abstentions.

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And the Education
18 vote is officially now adjourned. [gavel]

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date: September 30, 2018