

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

----- X

July 10, 2018
Start: 10:07 a.m.
Recess: 2:00 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: FRANCISCO P. MOYA
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Costa G. Constantinides
Barry S. Grodenchik
Rory L. Lancman
Stephen T. Levin
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Carlina Rivera
Ritchie J. Torres

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jillian McLaughlin, Assistant Vice President
New York City Economic Development Corporation

Emily Soukas, Market Director of Urbanspace

Joshua Wein, Financial Director of RAL Companies

Spencer Levine, Founder, CEO & President, RAL
Companies

Andrew Roche, Civic Hall

Charlie Anderson Appearing for: Assembly Member
Deborah Glick, and State Senator Brad Hoylman

MyPhuong Chung, Chair of Community Board 3
Land Use, Zoning, Public & Private Housing Committee

Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President

Terry Cude, Chair of Community Board 2

Toby Bergman, Member of Community Board 2

Andrew Berman, Executive Director
Greenwich Village Society for Historic Preservation

Sam Moskowitz, Greenwich Village Society

Ariel Kates, Greenwich Village Society for Historic
Preservation

Harry Bowman, Greenwich Village Society for Historic
Preservation

Lucille Krasne, East Village Resident

Aixa Torres, President of Alfred E. Smith Houses
Resident Association, Incorporated

Laura Sewell, Executive Director, East Village
Community Coalition

Sandra Balaban Co-Founder of Why Vote and Civics
Unplugged

Andrew Saldana, Director of Operations, New York Tech
Alliance

Nikki Evans, Director CUNY Office Workforce
Partnerships

Richard Blodgett, Greenwich Village Resident

Rosie Mendez, Former New York City Council Member

Barbara Goran, Lawyer and Resident of 10th Street &
University Place

Khinay West, Appearing for: David Mulkins President
of Bowery Alliance of Neighbors

Brittany Spatz, Educational Alliance

Meghan Joye, Chair, Economic Development Committee,
Community Board 3

Brian Glover, Community School District 1
Appearing for Superintendent Carry Chan

Michael McDermott, East Village Resident

Kathleen Wakeham, Metropolitan Council on Housing

Ray Rogers, Writer, Daily News

Zachary Lerner, Labor Organizer and Director
New York Communities for Change

Tom Birchard, Owner, Veselka Restaurant on 2nd Avenue
and 9th Streets

Eric Raymond, Village Resident

Patrick Purcell, Executive Director of Greater New
York Laborers Employers Cooperation and Education
Trust, Greater New York LECET

Kyle Danto Member of Open New York, Housing Advocacy
Group

Irene Liu, Community Service Society of New York
Abigail Edgecliffe-Johnson, Founder of RaceYa

Kristen Rouse, President & Founding Director
New York City Veterans Alliance

Shelly Fremont, Village Resident

Claire Martalure (sp?), Co-Op President & Resident of
21 East 10th Street

David Eisenbach, 12th Street Resident
Mary Fran Loftus, East 9th Street Resident

Santos Rodriguez Appearing for: Gary La Barbera
President, Building and Construction Trades Council
of Greater New York

Jessie Laymon, Director of Policy
New York City Employment and Training Coalition

Katherine Schoonover, East Village Resident

Elizabeth Languis, Village Resident

Brittany Armstead, Representative for Tech NYC

Sahara, 32BJ Member, Security Guard, World Trade
Center

Steve Herrick, Executive Director, Cooper Square
Committee

Scott Hobbs, Deputy Director, Union Square
Partnership appearing for: Jennifer Falk, Executive
Director

Valentina Jones, President, Lower East Side Power
Partnership

Joyce Ravitz, Chairperson, Cooper Square Committee

Monica Ridderspoor, Lifelong East Village Resident

Trevor Stewart, Village Resident for 36 years

Allison Greenberg, Village Resident and Lawyer

Conelius Sheehan, Member Local Union No. 3

Priya Ramanathanm Program Director, Per Scholas

Daniel Rabuzzi, Lower East Side Resident & Executive
Director of Mouse

Keith Kirkland, CEO & Co-Founder, WareWorks

Jerry Weinstein, Civic Hall

2 [sound check]

3 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Good morning. I'm
4 Council Member Francisco Moya. I'm the Chair of the
5 Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises. We are joined
6 today by Councilwoman Rivera, Councilman Grodenchik,
7 and today we have two public hearings. The first on
8 14th Street and Irving Place, Tech Hub applications,
9 LUs 144, 145 and 146, which we will hear this morning
10 and at 1:00 p.m. this afternoon we will—we will be
11 holding a hearing on the Inwood Rezoning Applications
12 LUs 135 through 140. If you are here to testify on
13 the Tech Hub Applications, please fill out a white
14 speaker slip with the sergeant-at-arms, and indicate
15 the project name on the slip. There will be no
16 testimony on Inwood until 1:00 p.m. today. We will
17 begin now with the Tech Hub Application, the NYC
18 Economic Development Corporation, EDC and 14th at
19 Irving, LLC, our applicants for a zoning map change,
20 a zoning text amending and a special permit. These
21 actions would facilitate the redevelopment of a city-
22 owned site currently occupied by the two-story PC
23 Richards Building with a 21-story technology focused
24 office and retail building in the Union Square
25 neighborhood of Manhattan in Councilwoman Carlina

2 Rivera's district. The redevelopment is intended to
3 provide critical workforce development and small
4 business support services for the local community,
5 and the city as a whole. I know open the public
6 hearing on LUs 144, 145 and 146, but I would like to
7 take this opportunity to turn it over to Councilwoman
8 Rivera for her statement.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Good morning,
10 everyone. Thank you so much for being here. Thank
11 you to the members of the public, Chair Moya and my
12 committee colleagues. Thank you for the opportunity
13 to speak in regards to LU 144, 145 and 146. These
14 three Land Use item would respectively amend the
15 zoning map and grant the special permits to
16 facilitate the development of a 21-story commercial
17 building on property located at 124 East 14th Street
18 known colloquially as the Union Square Tech Hub. The
19 Tech Hub, which is being developed by 14th at Irving,
20 LLC in coordination with NYC EDC is a commercial
21 development project led by RAL Developers that would
22 lease land owned by the city for the construction of
23 a building that would house Class A commercial space
24 at market rate, floors that are leased to Civic Hall
25 for non-profit education and tech training as well as

2 flexible step-up space for small businesses and
3 entrepreneurs. This tech collaboration in the heart
4 of Union Square is on city-owned land, but with a
5 considerable portion of its square footage allocated
6 for purely market rate commercial use. By signing
7 this lease, the City of New York will lose control of
8 this prime property for 99 years, meaning how we vote
9 on these items and the commitments made by the
10 developer, its partners in the city will affect my
11 district and New Yorkers for generations to come.
12 Since my first day in office, I have asked this
13 Administration, EDC and project partners for two
14 things: (1) a Tech Hub, which gives a leg up to the
15 members of our community who need it most, and (2)
16 some sort of commitment to the adjacent communities
17 that their homes and small businesses will be
18 protected from hyper development. As advertised by
19 EDC, this project has the potential to provide the
20 digital skills training and Workforce Development my
21 community has been demanding for many years. It has
22 the potential and underline potential to provide
23 women and people of color to pathways to high paying
24 jobs in the city's growing tech industry that have
25 been out of reach for decades, and it is my mission

2 to make this type of programming a reality for my
3 neighbors. However, the conversations I have had
4 about the on-site benefits as currently proposed have
5 fallen short of what a city-owned project should
6 provide. This site should serve as a gateway to new
7 technology and innovation for New Yorkers in
8 perpetuity, and provide maximum and tangible public
9 benefits. Furthermore, this Tech Hub must not
10 undermine the fabric of the community surrounding it,
11 and, therefore, the vision for this area must include
12 protections from continued out-of-scale and
13 financially out-of-reach development. Anyone who is
14 skeptical that this tech hub would not have a major
15 impact on the affordability and character of the
16 neighborhood surrounding Union Square need only look
17 a few blocks to the south at 51 Astor Place, the
18 construction of which accelerated the expansion of
19 larger corporate office space with the nearby
20 buildings that used to have a more significant mix of
21 business types and sizes. And as we saw with the
22 former Bowlmor Lanes, the site once though
23 undesirable for tall luxury projects by area
24 residents and even City Planning a speculative high-
25 end market has more and more of the neighborhood in

2 its crosshairs. Since the certification of this
3 application, I have felt that the community's request
4 for land use protections have been—have not been
5 seriously considered. Even though neighborhood
6 advocates and organizers continue to contact my
7 office and this Administration asking for their
8 voices to be heard, concerns have been pushed aside
9 in the interest of expediting a project that relevant
10 agencies would have us believe, and correctly in my
11 view, should be considered an isolation of its
12 surroundings and devoid of maximum input. One of the
13 reasons I decided to run for office was because
14 having worked at a local community based non-profit,
15 I saw where our city feel short in involving the
16 community decision making. We miss critical openings
17 to have larger conversations around sense place that
18 is merited during ULURPs especially when it involves
19 the disposition of city-owned land. At the end of
20 the day, the people who have to live with the effects
21 of land use changes are those that reside in the
22 neighborhoods around them. I look forward to hearing
23 from the project stakeholder today, and how they plan
24 to create a tech hub that brings high quality, low-
25 cost or free education to tenants from Fifth Avenue

2 to Avenue D. I also look forward to hearing how we
3 can get the Workforce Development digital skills
4 training center we deserve without having to threaten
5 the skill, character and affordability of our
6 neighborhoods. Only with a comprehensive holistic
7 approach to both access to technology and protections
8 of our vibrant neighborhood can I vote confidently
9 for this project, and right now that vote is
10 seriously in question. Thank you again, Mr. Chair
11 and all of my colleagues and thanks, of course, to
12 all of the advocates and the stakeholders here today.
13 Thank you. [applause]

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Sergeant-
15 at-arms.

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [off mic] No clapping,
17 no clapping. Quiet please. Do these only. If you
18 want to clap, please go like this because the hearing
19 has circulate around the city. So, please just-if
20 you want to clap then go like that with your hands.
21 (sic) [laughter]

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you,
23 Councilwoman Rivera for your statement. I would now
24 ask the counsel to swear in the panel.

2 LEGAL COUNSEL: The first speaking,
3 please state your names. Do you each swear or affirm
4 that the testimony that you're about to give will be
5 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth,
6 and that you will answer all questions truthfully?

7 MALE SPEAKER: [off mic] Yes.

8 LEGAL COUNSEL: Why don't you just state
9 your names and say yes into the mics.

10 JILLIAN MCLAUGHLIN: My name is Jillian
11 McLaughlin and yes I will answer all questions
12 truthfully.

13 JOSH WAYNE: Josh Wayne and yes.

14 LAURIE SECIS: I'm Laurie Secis. Yes.

15 ANDREW ROCHE: Andrew Roche. Yes.

16 SPENCER LEVINE: Spencer Levine. Yes.

17 [background comments, pause]

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: You can begin.

19 JILLIAN MCLAUGHLIN: Thank you. Good
20 morning Chair Moya, members of the Land Use
21 Subcommittee on Zoning and Franchises, and Council
22 Member Rivera. My name is Jillian McLaughlin, and I
23 am Assistant Vice President at the New York City
24 Economic Development Corporation. I am here to
25 present the Union Square Tech Training Center located

2 at 124 East 14th Street. On behalf of EDC I want to
3 thank the Council and members of the community for
4 attending today's meeting and participating in the
5 ULURP process. New York City's Tech Sector is
6 growing. Tech companies and tech careers account for
7 almost 300,000 jobs in the city and span every
8 industry from fashion to media to finance, and tech
9 jobs are good jobs. The average salary is \$70,000 to
10 \$80,000 a year, and unlike other high paying sectors,
11 44% of these jobs are accessible to those without a
12 college education. These are exactly the kinds of
13 opportunities Mayor de Blasio championed in his 2017
14 New Yorkers Works Plan where he committed to creating
15 100,000 good paying jobs over 10 years. Due to the
16 growth of good jobs in tech sector, the city has made
17 investments to strengthen the sector and ensure the
18 benefits it brings are broadly shared among New
19 Yorkers. The city supports a network of accelerators
20 and incubators throughout the city to encourage
21 start-ups to expand within the five boroughs. It has
22 also invested in programs and policies that prepare
23 New Yorkers for the digital economy. Mayor de Blasio
24 created the Computer Science for All Program to teach
25 every public school student computer science by 2025,

2 and launch the Tech Talent Pipeline with the city's
3 tech employers to bring high quality tech education
4 to New Yorkers with limited financial means.

5 Community Board 3 has also shown interest in
6 cultivating the technology sector and called for the
7 creation of a business incubator in our most District

8 Needs Statement to expand employment opportunities
9 for residents in lucrative career pathways. These

10 citywide policy goals, and local needs shape the

11 request for proposals EDC released in 2015. The RFP

12 challenged the city's development community to

13 propose a project that provided flexible office space

14 for growing technology start-ups and included

15 educational uses that would equip New Yorkers of all

16 backgrounds with the skills they need to thrive in a

17 modern digital economy. The RFP generated a

18 tremendous amount of interest and ultimately we

19 selected RAL Companies to develop the Tech Training

20 Center with Civic Hall as its anchor tenant because

21 their vision for inclusive tech sector was closely

22 aligned with ours. RAL and Civic Hall recruited

23 compelling partners committed to long-term

24 restrictions on the use of the Tech Training Center

25 and included the most community benefits of the

2 proposals we received. RAL and the city will enter a
3 99-year ground lease for the property, and as a
4 condition of the ground lease, RAL will construct and
5 operate a building that includes retail space with
6 opportunities for new entrepreneurs, flexible office
7 space for start-ups, a digital skills training center
8 that will offer affordable and accessible courses,
9 event space available to the community, and space for
10 Civic Hall, a non-profit devoted to using technology
11 for the public good. The city already received
12 ULURP approval to dispose of the site in 1983, and
13 the city has the option to build a smaller project
14 with fewer public benefits than the one under
15 consideration today, but chose to seek an additional
16 ULURP approval to expand the scope of benefits. The
17 rezoning actions we are requesting include rear yard,
18 height and setback waivers, as well as changing the
19 underlying zoning district to a C6-4. These zoning
20 actions would increase the project's public benefits,
21 and provide deeper flexible floor plates that can
22 support the dynamic program plan for the building.
23 These changes allow the city to provide six
24 additional floor than would have been possible in an
25 as-of-right project. EDC, RAL and Civic Hall met

2 with local stakeholders and the community board
3 extensively prior to ULURP's certification and
4 received unanimous approval with conditions from the
5 community board in February. We received approval
6 from the borough president in March and the unanimous
7 approval from the City Planning Commission last
8 month. The Tech Training Center has been improved by
9 the feedback provided by each of these stakeholders
10 and look forward to hearing from the City Council and
11 members of the public today. Spencer Levine and Josh
12 Wein of RAL Companies will describe the building's
13 components and their requested ULURP actions in
14 greater detail, and Emily Soukas of Urbanspace will
15 discuss the market space plan for the building and
16 Andrew Roche of Civic Hall will discuss the portions
17 of the building that his organization will sublease.
18 Thank you.

19 JOSH WEIN: Thank you Jillian and thank
20 you members of the Council for hearing about the
21 project. I'm Josh Wein from RAL, and I want to start
22 off by talking a little bit about—about the location
23 of the building and put it into context. The site is
24 located on the south side of 14th Street directly at
25 the end of Urban Place. 14th Street, as many of you

2 know is a four-lane road in two directions. It's a
3 commercial corridor directly adjacent to Union
4 Square. What we liked about this location and
5 specifically for the type of building that we're
6 going to be developing here or hope to be developing
7 here is there's easy access from all five boroughs.
8 We wanted to create a building that would really be
9 for all New Yorkers. Union Square is a hub and a
10 location that provides real opportunity to create
11 something that could be utilized by everyone and just
12 another Class A office building. When we received
13 the original RFP from the city, we thought about what
14 the city was trying to achieve, and how we can
15 promote 21st Century jobs throughout all aspects of
16 the building. We did this through four main
17 components: Education, networking opportunities,
18 start-up businesses and ultimately job opportunities.
19 We were introduced to Civic Hall and really bought
20 into their mission of trying to make technology for
21 the public good. We tried to find other uses that
22 would complement and expand that vision as well. We
23 started with an education facility. Civic Hall
24 wanted to create an education facility that promoted
25 Workforce Development and digital skills training,

2 and they worked with local organizations to create a
3 pipeline for students. We also wanted to create job
4 opportunities that were really for high paying
5 technology jobs that also fulfilled living wage and
6 Hire NYC requirements we've agreed to with New York
7 City's Economic Development Corporation as part of
8 our grand lease. Finally, we've agreed to build and
9 operate this building using union labor. Next slide.
10 As part of our ground lease with EDC, we've made
11 significant binding developer commitments to the
12 project. Starting from the ground floor going up, on
13 the ground floor of this building we're going to have
14 a market space in partnership with Urban Space, and
15 Emily will talk a little bit more about Urban Space's
16 business model and how they work with entrepreneurs
17 as well. We've listened to community feedback
18 regarding no big box retail. So, you'll hear again
19 from Emily about vendors being more locally focused.
20 As, again, trying to create new—promote newer
21 businesses, we agreed to a half mile radius
22 restriction, and we'll also get to know more than
23 five locations with the Borough of Manhattan for any
24 of the vendors from the Food Hall. Finally, in order
25 to promote entrepreneurship as part of the Food Hall,

2 no-25% of all market vendors are reserved for first-
3 time entrepreneurs. The next six floors in the
4 building are going to be master leased to Civic Hall,
5 and will be operated in three different components.
6 The first component, which you'll see as an event
7 space is really geared towards community user events
8 as well as events that are for the technology
9 industry. Originally, as part of our RFP—as a part
10 of our ground lease with EDC we agreed to make the
11 event space available to local organizations either
12 free or charge-free of charge or at cost, 32 times a
13 year. We've since agreed to increase that to 52
14 times a year. Above that, we have three floors that
15 are dedicated to digital skills training. This space
16 is—is restricted for the full 99 years of our ground
17 lease, and will be licensed out to different
18 technology training organizations. And finally, the-
19 the remaining two floors of the Civic Hall space will
20 be an expansion of Civic Hall's current operation,
21 which Andrew Roche—Andrew Roche will expand on in a
22 little bit. Above that, we have five floors that
23 we're calling step-up office space or flexible office
24 space. We really try to address here the ability for
25 start-up organizations to—to get affordable office

2 spaces within prime Class A office buildings and
3 prime locations within Manhattan. Right now, it's
4 very difficult for start-up organizations who don't
5 have a large bankroll to put up a large security
6 deposit or-or agree to a ten-year longer lease. So,
7 what this space does is it agrees to making no-leases
8 no shorter than six months, and that's to prevent
9 traditional co-working spaces, and no longer than
10 five year, and again, that's in order to make it more
11 accessible and more affordable for some of these
12 start-up organizations. The developer has also agreed
13 to build out these spaces as flexible office space
14 for these organizations. So, it-the buildout cost is
15 typically prohibited for a lot of these
16 organizations. So by the developer-the developer
17 actually building it out, it makes it again more
18 accessible, and finally, the traditional office space
19 above will provide job opportunities and will also
20 help subsidize a lot of the components in the lower
21 portions of the building that are being given back to
22 the city and to the local organization at below
23 market rents. I'd like to pass it on to Emily Soukas
24 now who will talk about urban space.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I just want to take
3 this moment to acknowledge Council Members Torres,
4 Richards and Reynoso who have joined us here today.

5 EMILY SOUKAS: Thank you. Urbanspace was
6 founded in 1972 and during its 40 plus years of
7 existence, the company has developed well over 50
8 projects. Urbanspace cultivates environments rich in
9 creativity, places where local makers collaborate,
10 exchange ideas and showcase their wares. Fostering
11 community by transforming city spaces we are
12 motivated to provide the platforms on which artisans,
13 entrepreneurs and chefs succeed. In 1993, Eldon
14 Scott established the first urban space market in New
15 York City with the founding of the Grand Central
16 Holiday. That same year Urban Space crated the Union
17 Square Holiday market the first of our holiday
18 markets in New York. Today, Urban Space operates
19 multiples in retail markets across New York City.
20 While the locations and offerings vary at our
21 markets, one things remains the same: Being in and
22 of the communities in which we operate. Urbanspace
23 has been of the Union Square community for the past
24 25 years as the founder and operator of the Union
25 Square Holiday Market. In partnership with the Union

2 Square Partnership and New York City Parks

3 Department, we are proud to have created a community

4 market that has gleaned an international reputation

5 as one of the must see destinations during the

6 holidays in New York City. Our focus is always on

7 the vendors working with as many local artisans and

8 makers as we can. In recent years, with the growing

9 demand for local, we have expanded parts of the Union

10 Square Holiday Market to embrace just that. We've

11 added specialty market sections such as urban space

12 provisions, which is specifically for local food

13 purveyors and Little Brooklyn, which features only

14 wares made in our neighboring borough of Brooklyn.

15 Urban Space would have no work to do without our

16 vendors. Our vendors are truly our partners in all

17 aspects of our business. From helping us choose our

18 next locations to recommending new vendors for our

19 markets to supporting one another and growing and

20 expanding business, our vendors are what enable us to

21 make markets and build community. We are excited to

22 be part of the CB3 community as it is home to some of

23 New York City's best chefs and makers. In the past

24 10 years of food market operations alone, we have had

25 the benefit of featuring over 20 food vendors through

2 our local CB3 residents and/or business owners.

3 Since this ULURP process has started, I have

4 connected with new businesses in CB3 such as Mikey

5 Likes It Ice Cream Shop to talk about future

6 opportunities and offer advice about expanding their

7 business. We have committed to 25% of the food

8 kiosks to be dedicated to small entrepreneurs or

9 first-time business owners. Our team of market

10 directors and managers spend a lot of time going out

11 into the community, exploring neighborhoods,

12 attending other markets, fairs, festivals and expos

13 to spread the word about our markets and to find new

14 partners. We always cross-promote with our partners

15 and landlords to ensure we have as a diverse an

16 offering as possible that represents the community in

17 which our market exists. At Urban Spaces existing

18 market spaces, 37% of businesses are owned by women

19 or people of color. For our holiday markets

20 approximately 54% of businesses are women owned, and

21 56% are minority owned. Urban Space works with over

22 500 small businesses each year through its food

23 halls, pop-up food markets and holiday markets.

24 Urban Space is receptive to referrals from the

25 Community Advisory Board to be formed as part of this

2 project, and beyond this project Urban Space always
3 welcomes recommendations of vendors who would like to
4 test concepts that at our other pop-ups and
5 locations. We are in constant communication with our
6 vendors to help them grow their businesses. Many
7 first time business owners start at our pop-up
8 markets for a four to six-week stint. Based on their
9 experience at a pop-up, they are able to tweak their
10 offerings in acceptance and to other popular and let
11 the new driving markets graduate to a permanent food
12 hall space with us and/or go onto open their own
13 brick and mortar. For example, by participating at
14 the Union Square Holiday Market, CB3 Business Macaron
15 Parlor was able to finally open a permanent location
16 on Saint Mark's Place. Since then, they opened
17 another location on the Upper West Side, outgrew
18 their Saint Mark's space and relocated to Hester
19 Street, and started a new business, a non-profit
20 called Meow Parlor, which was the first kitty café in
21 New York City and serves as a feline adoption center.
22 Urban Space cultivates environments rich in
23 creativity, places where local makers collaborate,
24 exchange ideas and showcase their wares. Fostering
25 community by transforming city spaces. We are

2 motivated to provide platforms on which artisans,
3 entrepreneurs, and chefs succeed. We are equally
4 excited to be part of a building community that is
5 built on the foundation of interconnectedness in
6 support of startups. With that, I'll turn it over to
7 Andrew Roche, the Founder of Civic Hall to speak to
8 the opportunities and resources this project will
9 provide for tech learners and business alike.

10 ANDREW ROCHE: Good morning. My name is
11 Andrew Roche. It's an honor to be here at the City
12 Council and to see such an amazing array of citizens
13 participating in our democratic process. Twenty
14 years ago, I was a small business owner in Union
15 Square. Actually, I've lived in Union Square my
16 entire adult life in New York, and I was using the
17 Internet to help me grow my business, and I was part
18 of New York's burgeoning technology community. As a
19 citizen of New York, I tried to be a good community
20 partner with my neighbors and I joined the 14th
21 Street BID, which had adopted Washington Irving High
22 School as a place for members of the community to try
23 and help, and I walked into that school and was
24 shocked to discover 3,000 kids, 97% on school lunch
25 and not a single computer anywhere in the school. I

2 was shocked. I sent an email to Tim Franz asking him
3 to help me build a computer lab in that school on a
4 Saturday, and to my surprise, 200 people showed up,
5 and we somehow figured out how to build that computer
6 lab, but more importantly it inspired me to start a
7 non-profit organization called Mouse, and to take on
8 wiring up as many New York City public schools to the
9 Internet as possible. Today, I'm proud to say that
10 Mouse is active in almost 100 New York City public
11 schools and in every borough. Not only making sure
12 the schools are wired, but providing digital skills
13 training to the students who in turn provide those
14 same skills to their teachers and to their other
15 students and even their parents. But over the same
16 20 years since Mouse got started, I've seen two—and
17 I've witnessed two divergent trends. One is the rise
18 of the New York technology community itself, which is
19 rising in the—in response to the changing global
20 economy where now every single New York City industry
21 is competing to find workers and to be able to sell
22 their wares and to conduct business in an economy
23 that changes every single day at a faster and faster
24 pace. The second and more challenging trend,
25 however, is that Digital Divide no longer just refers

2 to the access to the Internet. It also refers to
3 things like skills necessary to find a find a job or
4 skills necessary to help your community or even the
5 skills necessary to run for office. In response to
6 this challenge my long-time collaborator and Amika
7 Sifry and I opened a facility called Civic Hall three
8 years ago as a center for the public good where New
9 Yorkers from all over the city could come to meet and
10 collaborate to solve some of the city's most pressing
11 problems. Since opening in 2015, we have attracted
12 over 1,000 individual members, and a hundred
13 organizations including 12 government agencies. We
14 have produced over 1,500 community events, trainings,
15 hackathons, panel discussions, and-and other
16 community events including over the last two years
17 with the New York City Council a Digital Inclusionary
18 Summit, which has been held at Civic Hall. You may
19 have heard about a couple of organizations that came
20 out of Civic Hall. As a matter of fact, one that I
21 would like to highlight is called the New York
22 Veterans Alliance, which was started by an
23 entrepreneur, an organizer by the name of Kristen
24 Rouse who came back from Afghanistan and was shocked
25 to discover that there were not enough services and

2 resources available to recent veterans, and she came
3 to Civic Hall to see if she could maybe start an
4 organization, and through the people that she met,
5 and through the resources of City Hall, she not only
6 started her organization, but helped participate in a
7 coalition that eventually got this Council to pass a
8 bill with \$3 million budget creating the New York
9 City Department of Veteran Services, and I'm happy to
10 say the New York City Department of Veteran Services
11 is now also a member of Civic Hall, and Kristen Rouse
12 is constantly criticizing that when she can, and
13 offering support—advice and support as they work
14 together to make sure that all veterans in New York
15 receive the best services possible. When we heard
16 about the city's effort to create this center for
17 Economical Opportunity and job creation in Union
18 Square, we were inspired. We're lucky enough to be
19 able to partner with RAL, and we provided a vision to
20 the city where any New Yorker whether they be a
21 student, a teacher, an immigrant, someone who's
22 disabled or legally challenged, an elderly person
23 could come and walk into a building and be able to
24 get digital skills training for free. We joined with
25 a couple—several best in class Workforce Development

1 organizations that work with these different
2 constituencies, including Per Scholas, Fed Cap, CUNY,
3 Mouse I'm happy to say, Access Code, then the New
4 York Computer Science Foundation, which is
5 responsible for partnering with the city for the
6 Computer Science For All Initiative to make sure that
7 every single New York City public school student gets
8 computer education within the next ten years.

9 They've all agreed to partner with us to offer these
10 trainings, and even New Yorkers than they currently
11 serve not only in this location, but throughout the
12 city that could come and be able to access digital
13 skills training as I mentioned before for free. I
14 hope you will recognize this urgent and extraordinary
15 opportunity we all have to create galvanizing new
16 facility that will support not only the organizations
17 that I just mentioned, but also the entire Workforce
18 Development community for all the generations who
19 come after us. Thank you very much, and now I'm gong
20 to turn it over to our partner, Spencer Levine.

21
22 SPENCER LEVINE: Good morning, everyone.

23 I get the liberty to walk you though some of the more
24 technical physical aspects of the project. Starting
25 off with the step-up office space, Josh just

2 mentioned some of the elements of this project, but
3 the—the program here was actually developed in
4 response to some of the other community board need
5 statements that we reviewed with EDC and—and on our
6 own in responding to the RFP. The intent is for the
7 program to foster job growth and employment
8 opportunities for early stage companies and provide
9 opportunities for companies that would otherwise not
10 be able to afford more traditional office space.
11 They've grown out of the one desk and they're ready
12 for a real office. So, some of the commitments that
13 we've made and we've developed this table just as a
14 side-by-side comparison to better understand how we
15 see the step-up office space as it relates to
16 traditional. Yeah, the expected size for a step-up
17 office space is somewhere between 1,500 and 5,000
18 square feet, the lease term as Josh mentioned is
19 anywhere between 6 months and 5 years where a typical
20 traditional office lease is 5, 10, 15, 20 years and
21 there's renewal options on top of that, but they're
22 very long-term commitments. The tenant build is in
23 this case for the step-up office space by the
24 developer. So, they would be pre-built and funded by
25 us. There's no major capital investment required by

1 these companies. Guarantees are limited to one-year
2 of rent. Guarantees often in traditional office
3 spaces are guaranteed for the entire length of the
4 lease term, which is a major hurdle to securing
5 some of these office spaces for companies of this
6 size. But one of the more-most important things is
7 the idea of flexibility. So, the idea behind step-
8 up-the step-up office space is today or six months-in
9 six months a company might need 1,000 square feet, in
10 a year it could 5,000 square feet, and in two years
11 it might need a reduced square footage. So, the-the
12 terms, the flexibility and how this space is built,
13 shared-the idea of using shared services in common
14 spaces within these-these floors provide that spatial
15 flexibility that these companies are looking for and
16 need. As discussed earlier, we are seeking three-
17 it's really four zoning actions as part of this
18 ULURP. The first one the site currently exists in
19 four different zones-it's a one zoning lot within
20 four different zoning districts. We're seeking to
21 simplify the zoning on that site and have it all come
22 under C6-4. We-on here-so we are as a precedent to
23 all re-zonings in the city, the site is being mapped
24 for an MIH area although there is no residential
25

1 permitted under our lease with the city. It's just
2 the precedent of the city. So, that was requested of
3 us. We would allow the project areas to benefit from
4 some bulk waivers and modifications to the rear yard
5 and heightened setback, which are the sky exposure
6 planned on 14th Street. This map here shows side-by-
7 side by the existing conditions of the zoning
8 districts and the proposed rezoning action to conform
9 the entire site to C6-4. It's—C6-4 does exist on the
10 property already. So, it is a—it's just a
11 simplification of the existing zoning—on that zoning
12 lot. So, this slide highlights the two major or the—
13 the two main zoning actions that we're seeking to
14 allow for the program to take place. As Jillian
15 mentioned early on that the program takes advantage
16 of the larger floor plate setbacks. We are seeking
17 to—a waiver to the Sky Exposure Plan requirement
18 along 14th Street, which would actually provide for a
19 more contextual setback on the building. It would
20 align with the setbacks on either side of this
21 building, and a waiver of the rear yards setback
22 requirements. There's kind of a—we had a situation
23 where if this were not a single zoning lot, the rear
24 yard setback that we're proposing, which is 52 feet,
25

1 would actually be in excess of the as-of-right
2 condition, but because this is a single zoning lot
3 shared with the help property and the help property
4 is residential and our building is commercial. The
5 setback requirement would go to 60 feet. So, we
6 are actually seeking a waiver to a 52-foot
7 separation. This—these zoning actions allow for the
8 larger floor plates more light and air into the
9 building. They provide for increased capacities for
10 all the uses that we discussed early on, and it
11 really—it makes the programming more feasible in its
12 application. So, things like we'll talk about the—
13 the event space we've spoken about, but an additional
14 5,200 users a year that's based on the 52 times that
15 it's made available to an additional 100 people
16 because of the floor plate and setback requirements.
17 This is a rendering of the building from Irving Place
18 looking towards—south towards 14th Street. The
19 building, we've talked a lot about it, but it's
20 designed around the idea that there's a social aspect
21 to the building. So, the one thing that I'll point
22 out in this rendering is along the western edge of
23 the building there are these two-story spaces, which
24 we're considering the living rooms, and those are
25

2 areas of shared or social interaction with that-
3 within the building. There are spaces where there
4 might be meeting rooms, community lounges and they're
5 accessible to the tenants on-on the floors that are-
6 that they are adjacent to as well as the-the pieces
7 within the Civic Hall. The master lease would be
8 accessible to all their users as well. This is
9 another rendering of the building at 14th Street
10 level and I want to take the opportunity to just
11 point out that we've actually found the ULURP process
12 to be a very informative helpful process in refining
13 our scope and ensuring that we're meeting the needs
14 of the local community. We've spent a lot of time on
15 outreach and-and that's how we work. RAL works in
16 that way. We-we really like to be good neighbors,
17 and we like to be part of the community. Some of the
18 things that have come out of all these discussions,
19 all these meetings are-are substantive changes to our
20 program to better accommodate some of the feedback
21 that we've gotten and, you know, we've-some are as
22 simple as we've committed to no amplified sound and
23 10:00 p.m. on the roof per the community board
24 recommendation. We've increased access from--lease
25 required 32 times per year to 52 time per year to the

2 even space to ensure community access and use for
3 reduced or free. Civic Hall will be establishing a
4 community advisory committee to make sure the
5 community has access, and programming—and the
6 programming response to the local needs, and there's
7 a—there's a system of reporting that comes along with
8 that. We have and continue to have very informative
9 and productive conversation with LESEN about how they
10 can participate with—for local employment as well as
11 benefit from the digital skills training for
12 employment placement opportunities. We've—we have
13 ongoing conversations with them, and then working
14 closely with Council Rivera as well as and based on
15 the Community Board 3 recommendation we will be
16 establishing a scholarship fund to ensure access to
17 the digital skills training portion of these
18 buildings—of the building. With that, I think I'll
19 turn it over to you.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you to the
21 panel. Thank you for your testimony. Just a couple
22 of questions. What are the proceeds to EDC from this
23 lease?

24 JILLIAN MCLAUGHLIN: Thank you, Council
25 Member for your question. It's important to EDC that

2 our real estate projects provide significant benefits
3 to the community, and we received proposals that
4 offered to pay EDC significantly more rent for the
5 project, but we selected the proposal before you
6 because it provided the deepest public benefits and
7 as a result, we are receiving \$2.3 million in rent,
8 and we believe based on our understanding of the
9 market that this represents more than a 50% discount
10 to what we could charge if the project did not
11 include the public benefits, and part of the discount
12 in rent is paying for—permanently subsidized
13 Workforce Development space that non-profits can
14 afford to [coughs] rent spaces from the building to
15 offer scholarship to students who take classes at
16 courses that are offered by a for-profit provider and
17 to provide event space at discounted rates or free of
18 charge to the community as well as space for
19 startups.

20 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: In the past, have the
21 revenues from this kind of project been used to
22 support local communities?

23 JILLIAN MCLAUGHLIN: For—for this
24 particular project, a significant amount of the rent
25

2 that we could charge has been invested back in the
3 project to benefit the community.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I'm talking in-in the
5 past, have there been other developments where you've
6 had similar proceeds and used the revenues for
7 projects like this to support local communities?

8 JILLIAN MCLAUGHLIN: I mean I think that
9 we always strive to meet the needs of local
10 communities through the actual program in the
11 buildings and through revenues that we receive. For
12 this project, the revenue that we receive in rent
13 will be used to support Economic Development
14 Corporation projects throughout the five boroughs.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, the additional
16 space for non-profits--you might have touched upon
17 this--are their--their request from the community
18 regarding additional space for local non-profit
19 organizations is the proposed planning to allocate
20 any additional space?

21 JILLIAN MCLAUGHLIN: We have--we have
22 devoted six floors of a 21-story building to uses
23 that benefit the community. We believe that the
24 Digital Skills Training Center will serve a
25 tremendous amount of students with the three floors

2 that it has, and we have three floors for Civic Hall.

3 So the call has memberships of which many community
4 organizations participated in, and so we—we think
5 that the current benefits are significant.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: With the L Train
7 shutdown, how do you plan to ensure construction
8 doesn't further exacerbate the--?

9 SPENCER LEVINE: We've committed very
10 early on. We've worked very closely with DOT and the
11 City agencies with what information they have
12 regarding the L Train shutdown to make sure that are
13 coordinating and sequencing and—and really defining
14 the logistics of this project early on. We do have,
15 you know, our general contractor as well as well our
16 team has been meeting with them. We—our—our SEQR is
17 actually includes all of our mitigation that we've
18 taken to this point inclusive of we would be—we have
19 cone things like move—the crane will be inside the
20 footprint of the building. The hoist will actually
21 be on the back side of the building to not impeded
22 pedestrian along 14th Street. We've made concessions
23 as to how much of that sidewalk space we—we will
24 actually take for staging and logistics, and really
25 it's the bare minimum required for a safe pedestrian

2 experience, and we've also conceded and—and typically
3 on a—on a project of this size in a normal condition,
4 we would have—we would be able to garner a lane
5 closure. We are not seeking lane closure for the
6 construction of this project. We'll obviously have
7 periods of time that will be well coordinated with
8 whoever is—has jurisdiction over the street at that
9 time to make sure that our—our delivery is and—and
10 staging is well planned at that time, but we are very
11 conscious of it and working to mitigate the impact to
12 anyone.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: In relation to the
14 adjacent residential building for the rooftop space
15 what are going to be the hours of operation and how
16 will the rooftop noise be controlled since the
17 proposed development will be butting the supportive
18 housing building to its rear?

19 SPENCER LEVINE: So, the rooftop is only
20 to be used by tenants within the building. There
21 won't be any outside events or anything held up there
22 but we know amplified sound, which we've agreed to as
23 a request from the Community Board past 10:00 p.m.
24 and there won't be any —one of the other requests is
25

2 there won't be any food and beverage served up there
3 either.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: And will there be like
5 rules of conduct posted on the roof?

6 SPENCER LEVINE: There absolutely will
7 just like there is in every single one of our
8 buildings. We haven't gotten to the point where
9 we've actually developed what those will be at this
10 point.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay, and in terms of
12 accessibility to the landscape open area in the rear
13 yard, will tenants of the supportive housing and the
14 Office workers be able to access such open space or
15 is there an area that is separated by the two users?

16 JOSH WEIN: Yes, sir. So, what we
17 actually did is—if you could look at the property
18 line right there, we have—our site actually goes
19 through that whole property line. We're actually
20 giving back the right side of our rear yard back to
21 the Help USA Building our own—ourselves, and
22 allowing them to use at their discretion. The one to
23 the left, which is our terrace, is only going to be
24 used by the Food Hall customers, and [background
25 comments, pause]

2 EMILY SOUKAS: Generally, our hours of
3 operation are from 11:00 a.m. to 9:00 p.m. and we
4 most like will have a breakfast service. So
5 somewhere starting around 8:00 a.m. So to be
6 solidified later on.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. I'll now
8 turn it over to Council Member Rivera.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you so
10 much. Thanks again for all of your testimony. So,
11 can you explain the difference between the Workforce
12 training floors and the non-Workforce floors that are
13 leased to Civic Hall, and are there differences in
14 how each—how long each runs with the building? For
15 example with 25 years compared to the 99-year lease?

16 SPENCER LEVINE: I'll let Andrew talk
17 about how he's going to operate those floors, but in
18 terms of the ground lease with EDC, the events space
19 and the two floors of Civic Hall are a 25-year lease
20 restriction and the three floors of digital skills
21 training are a 99-year use restriction and rent
22 restriction at \$50 a square foot, and then Andy, you
23 can talk about it.

24 ANDREW ROCHE: So, Councilwoman, I—I'm
25 not quite sure I'll completely answer your question

2 because it could be answered from a legal lease
3 perspective of how it operates. So, if I'm not
4 getting it right, let know.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Okay.

6 ANDREW ROCHE: So, the entire Workforce
7 Development community is currently challenged. Many
8 organizations are trying to figure out how to upgrade
9 their skills—the skills that they offer to 21st
10 Century methodologies, and they're—they're chasing
11 after the same money for funding their programs, and
12 they're trying very hard to connect to employers so
13 they can actually place people in jobs. These
14 organizations are disparate, and there's actually no
15 center of gravity for them. So, when we presented
16 this proposal to the city our vision was is there
17 should be a shared Workforce Development center where
18 there would be approximately 20 classrooms and each
19 of the partners whether they be citywide partners
20 like the ones I mentioned or local ones like LESEN or
21 others in the Lower East Side would be able to come
22 and just be able to rent or license in effect
23 classrooms for their use without the extra overhead
24 costs of having to lease and maintain their own
25 space, and not necessarily be able to use it all

2 hours of the day. So, that the overall cost for
3 running a facility and providing digital field
4 training would be reduced for every single one of the
5 users. We also anticipate that those same Workforce
6 Development organizations would be able to share
7 pedagogy, data, potentially students and teachers and
8 connections to employers so that there would be more
9 efficiency not only for those who are in the building
10 but for the entire Workforce Development community as
11 a whole.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So, let me—let
13 me just ask so you have assessed that typically I
14 guess even our area or citywide there isn't enough
15 Workforce Development for the Tech Center existing,
16 and that you're trying to bring that not only into
17 Union Square area, but you're trying to provide it as
18 a service to New York City.

19 ANDREW ROCHE: Yes, that's correct.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So, you are going
21 to provide space to other non-profits to be able to
22 do Workforce Development?

23 ANDREW ROCHE: Correct.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: But because you
25 have assessed that other organizations aren't

2 necessarily doing the kind of tech-digital skills
3 training that we need in order for the typically
4 under-represented people to enter the tech industry,
5 how are you going to work with them to make sure that
6 this is not just a community space? That it is truly
7 going to serve the mission of why you are chosen as
8 the sublessee.

9 ANDREW ROCHE: So, as I mentioned, we
10 brought together some of the best in class Workforce
11 Development organizations in the city that currently
12 are serving the constituencies that I mentioned, the
13 students, the teachers, the elderly, immigrants,
14 people with physical or legal barriers, and other
15 others and many of those, and all of those are
16 providing some digital skills training, and if not
17 entirely digital skills training, some digital skills
18 training for their constituencies. There are many
19 other Workforce Development organizations that
20 provide other kinds of Workforce Development that
21 have not fully been able to participate in offering
22 digital skills training to their constituencies or in
23 their communities because of lack of resources to be
24 able to not only provide those services but be able
25 to rent space. The idea here is to create a center

2 of gravity for not only these organizations that I
3 mentioned, but for others in the community to be able
4 to come together, learn from each other, support each
5 other, and be able to galvanize the entire Workforce
6 Development community to be able to upgrade itself
7 from teaching our citizens 20th Century jobs and
8 giving them 21st Century opportunities, and I'd like
9 to add particularly focused on underserved
10 communities, and women of color.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So, the—the
12 partnerships that you've created are any of them—most
13 of them are non-profit and I know Per Scholas I'm
14 glad that you're working with CUNY and that's
15 wonderful. Are there any for-profit partners?

16 ANDREW ROCHE: At the moment, there
17 aren't. We in our original proposal we did include a
18 support letter and a letter of interest from General
19 Assembly, which is a well known tech train
20 organization mostly focused on their professional
21 classes. They charge for their services. They are a
22 for-profit. About 20% of their students are actually
23 on a scholarship, but the reason why they're not
24 formally part of the program today is that they
25 recently were purchased by a much larger nationally

2 based tech training organization, and we have not yet
3 had an opportunity to meet with them to make sure
4 that they they're—or that they're—to see if they're
5 still interested in being part of the project. If
6 they were, we would—we would confirm before we got
7 anywhere into discussions with them for the use of
8 the space that over 20% of the students that would be
9 trained in our facility would be getting those
10 trainings for free.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So, yeah, that's—
12 My concern is that I want to make sure that the low
13 cost portion is—is truly accessible, and I know
14 you're going to provide a lot of services for free,
15 and you know, EDC, Jillian, you mentioned the
16 Computer Science for All rollout and so my concern is
17 we already have a very inequitable education system.
18 You can see that very acutely just in my own district
19 between the two school districts that are neighboring
20 each on 14th Street. So, when you don't have the
21 compute science in elementary, middle and high school
22 to even take the boot camp the General Assembly might
23 offer for \$12,000, you know, I want to make sure that
24 we're not just giving social media 101, that we're
25 providing real classes that are going to give you

1 that opportunity to make the—the \$70 to \$80,000 a
2 year that you mention. When you said 44% of these
3 jobs are accessible to those without a college
4 education. I'd be interested to see those
5 demographics if you have it as to who's accessing
6 those jobs without a college education, but I want to
7 just make sure that we're all working together and
8 they're working with community based organizations
9 the very grassroots level because these—this—my
10 concern is that I'm not going to see people from
11 where I grew up on Avenue C and Avenue B and Pitts
12 Street, but they're not going to make it into the
13 Digital Skills Training Center, that it's going to
14 look a lot of the same, and it's going to look like,
15 you know, the—the tech alley, and—and I want to make
16 that it's going to be reflective of the city where I
17 grew up.

19 ANDREW ROCHE: Councilwoman, if I can,
20 I've been around New York long enough to know what
21 happens at the process—through processes like this
22 where developers come and make promise about what's
23 going to happen in the future, and then when it gets
24 built that public space that was supposed to be
25 accessible to everybody or that community facility or

2 amenity just didn't quite make it to the degree that
3 was originally promised. First of all, I can assure
4 that through our relationship with RAL and with EDC
5 we've confirmed that this team is committed to all of
6 the commitments that we've made so far and any others
7 that we may make as part of this process, but more
8 importantly we are not waiting for the building to be
9 built to start offering these services. For example,
10 we've already helped--helped the organization directly
11 behind our building with the database clean-up that
12 they needed. We helped the Lower East Side Girls'
13 Club with the sales force immigration. We have been
14 working closely with the Educational Alliance to
15 develop a program where students from even the
16 deepest parts of the Lower East Side would be able to
17 have access to technology skills and training. We
18 have been meeting extensively with not only LESEN,
19 but many other Lower East Side groups first to
20 listen.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: [interposing] How
22 many--how many?

23 ANDREW ROCHE: I think it's something
24 around 30 or 40. I--I--we've--I think we've provided
25 your office with the list. We can provide it again.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Oh, I don't need
3 the list again.

4 ANDREW ROCHE: [interposing] But.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I just want you to
6 be able to say how many-

7 ANDREW ROCHE: [interposing] Yeah,
8 actually I think it's closer to 60 now that I've come
9 to think of it.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aright.

11 ANDREW ROCHE: It's been so many
12 meetings, I want to-I want to reiterate something
13 that's really important, which is that for us we want
14 to build-Our theory of change is to build with nor
15 for. You can't create a facility like this without
16 the people directly impacted by it or the people
17 living around it without-not being part of the design
18 and build process.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: And I think that
20 Civic Hall wants to do that, and I know you-you have
21 a 25-year lease and I'm expecting hopefully in 25
22 years you're retired but I want to make sure---

23 ANDREW ROCHE: [interposing] How about an
24 extension?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: --that we're
3 building--that we're building more of a legacy project
4 here that's going to be able to go on in 25 years,
5 and right now there's only three floors out of the
6 whole building that are committed for 99 years to
7 true Workforce Development, and yes I know this type
8 of spacing. Yes, I know that Civic Hall has floors,
9 but there are only three floors truly committed to
10 the full extent of the lease to the community. So,
11 that's why I'm trying to--I'm asking that you consider
12 putting another floor to what I think is supposed to
13 be the true vision behind this project, which is the
14 Digital Skills Training Center. You have Class A
15 office space. You didn't mention how much you're
16 going to charge per square feet, but I'm going to ask
17 you, and then I also want to know how much you're
18 going to charge per square feet for the step-up
19 space, and how that's compared to the market and
20 Union Square because 1,500 square feet, 2,500, there
21 are a bunch of storefronts all over the neighborhood
22 that are vacant because we have a small business
23 crisis, and so I want to make sure that what you're
24 providing as step-up space, what is the difference
25 between you and We Work, and what are you going to be

2 providing conjunction with the City to make sure that
3 these Minority and Women Owned Businesses are
4 thriving?

5 ANDREW ROCHE: So, first off in terms of
6 the step-up office space, I could tell you I
7 mentioned to you when we spoke previously we're
8 anticipating around \$60 a square foot for that space.
9 If you're a traditional market space in Union Square
10 that was in a Class A office building by itself, it
11 could be anywhere fro \$80 a square foot to \$100 a
12 square foot in that area depending on the type of
13 building and location and a bunch of other factors as
14 well. A step-up office here how it's different than
15 a—a traditional co-working pace like a We Work, is
16 those type of spaces are membership based
17 organizations where I—I think last time I saw it was
18 like 90% of the revenue comes from individual members
19 who basically are charged a membership fee. They
20 come on a daily basis. They can sit anywhere they
21 want within the space. They do have a small portion
22 that's dedicated to the types of users were going
23 forward, which is these small companies, but it's a
24 very small portion of their revenue. What we're
25 doing here is we're not having a membership at all.

2 This is going to be short-term leases, six months to
3 five years and again the minimum term that six-month
4 term prevents having any of that membership type-
5 membership type person or individual or even company
6 for coming to this space on a short-term basis. It's
7 really and we're also building-out a space. So,
8 because we're building out the space, it can't-it's
9 never going to be a bunch of desks that are just in
10 the middle of the space. It's always going to be
11 real offices or really geared towards those small
12 businesses call a 1,000 square feet to 5,000 square
13 feet, and we're anticipating right now having
14 anywhere from five to eight companies per floor that
15 are sharing-sharing services such as receptionist-
16 receptions, conference rooms, lunch areas, and what
17 that does is it helps reduce the overall cost of the
18 space because they're not paying for-they're not
19 individually paying for space that now is shared
20 with other-other tenants that are also part of that
21 floor.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Okay. I know
23 that my-my colleague from Eastern Queens has a
24 question. I just want to-and if you don't mind
25 coming back to me later when we have time.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: It's not-not a problem
3 Council Member.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I just-I just
5 want to say one last thing is that, you know, you
6 mentioned the construction being contained to the
7 footprint, and so I'm already on record as asking
8 during the L Train shutdown for a moratorium of
9 construction on 14th Street. So, I'm already on
10 record. I just want to let you know, that I-I just
11 think it's-it's going to be too much. It's a
12 unprecedented shutdown, and it's going to be a
13 disaster, but anyway, we're going to work through it
14 everyone. Don't worry. [laughter] So, there's
15 that. I just want to mention that I am on record for
16 that and in terms of, you know, EDC saying that you
17 could have gone with a smaller project that does not
18 include the-such and critical mass of public
19 benefits. I-I-I just-I find that unhelpful. I find
20 it unhelpful to say that you could have gone without
21 the rezoning because, you know, so to-to avoid my
22 approval and-and not include as many public benefits.
23 It's city-owned land, and this is 14th Street. We
24 could have had so many things there, and so I-I want
25 to believe in this project and that's why I'm asking

2 so many questions and thank you for-for being here.

3 I want to get into the Urban Space after my

4 colleague. I just want to give Council Member

5 Grodenchik a minute to ask what he likes. So, thank

6 you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you,

8 Councilwoman Rivera. I'm going to turn it over to

9 Council Member Grodenchik for a few questions.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: People from

11 Eastern Queens don't always get heard. So, I'm

12 delighted to ask a question or two. Thank you,

13 Chair. Thank you to my colleague Mr. Rivera.

14 Somebody said that Union Square is a hub and it is

15 indeed a hub, and I've been visiting Union Square

16 since I was little boy because my father worked at 72

17 Fifth Avenue. It was always fun to go visit him

18 there, and we used to buy my winter gear at Paragon

19 and all that kind of stuff. So, I'm old. I remember

20 those kind of things, but I am concerned as a

21 resident of Easter Queens. My district is-borders

22 Nassau County, and maybe we should be pushing more

23 jobs into areas like Long Island City and Astoria and

24 where we have those capabilities because it takes a

25 really, really long time even with the L Train

1 running. I don't have any subway stops in my
2 district. So, I don't know from subways, but
3 shouldn't we be focusing more on the other areas of
4 the city where people live where they can get to work
5 in a shorter period of time, and especially something
6 that's as exciting as tech boom because we have young
7 people all over the city, and we see them. We see
8 the young people flocking in here. Maybe we want to
9 de-emphasize a little Manhattan in favor of some of
10 the other parts. So, I'll—I would ask the—the first
11 person who spoke, the Vice President from EDC to talk
12 about that.
13

14 JILLIAN MCLAUGHLIN: You just gave me a
15 promotion. I'm and Assistant Vice President. Now
16 you can deal with that. I thank you for that, and
17 will let my colleagues know. EDC is working on many
18 projects to encourage Outer Borough commercial
19 development, and—and it's a priority for the city
20 that job growth be spread around and opportunities be
21 available to residents across the five boroughs. I
22 think one of the things that really excites me about
23 this particular project is that it is so well located
24 by transit. So, students from across the city can
25

2 hop on the subway and get training. We currently
3 have students--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: It's still a
5 long way. I mean, you know, to get to the subway in
6 my district or Council Member Donovan's district he
7 does have subways, but it's still you have to leave
8 an hour and a half, and it's just something that
9 dawned on me. It also seems to me, you know, Union
10 Square has taken on a lot in my lifetime. I've never
11 lived there. My sister lives in Greenwich Village on
12 9th Street, but she's a constituent. She did vote
13 for you Ms. Rivera. She's a constituent. It's one
14 Grodenchik there, but it's just--it's just a statement
15 I wanted to make today that I think we should be
16 pushing more of the jobs out into the other areas
17 where people can live and work. One of the great
18 things about some of the other cities that I visit is
19 that you don't have that long commute. New Yorkers
20 the commute has gotten worse and worse. Not EDC's
21 fault, the MTA's fault, and it's going to be years
22 before we can reverse that. So, thank for that, Mr.
23 Chair. Thank you for indulging me.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Council
3 Member Grodenchik. I'll turn it over to Councilwoman
4 Rivera.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you and I
6 know there are people here to testify. So, I-I won't
7 ask you all of my questions, but I know that we have
8 been engaging in a dialogue, and so I look forward to
9 continuing that conversation. So, in terms of urban
10 space, can you explain the limitations on the radius,
11 the number of locations per-for the potential vendors
12 in the space, and why did you come to kind of that
13 calculation? You mentioned Mikey's Ice cream, which
14 I think is absolutely an amazing business, and he's
15 wonderful, and can you talk about the other vendors
16 that you've spoken to that you're trying to get in to
17 bring a diverse market place?

18 JILLIAN MCLAUGHLIN: I'll let Emily talk
19 about the different vendors that they're trying to
20 bring into urban space--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yeah.

22 JILLIAN MCLAUGHLIN: --and then I can
23 answer some of the questions that you had--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: [interposing]
25 Okay.

2 JILLIAN MCLAUGHLIN: --the lease
3 restrictions. So, when we visited the community board
4 in December of 2015--or in November of 2015, we heard
5 from them that it was important that there not be big
6 box retail at the site. They wanted to see smaller
7 businesses and smaller retail, and so that's one of
8 the reason that we are so excited about Urban Spaces'
9 partnership, and so in thinking about what
10 restrictions we could have put in place to prevent a
11 big box store for coming to the site, we included a
12 restriction on the number of locations that any
13 tenant who wants to rent space could have to rent
14 space in the building, and a restriction on the
15 radius. So, that it wasn't just the same businesses
16 that you're seeing in the area renting space. We
17 really wanted to provide an opportunity for
18 entrepreneurs to try out their products in one of the
19 busiest retail corridors in New York. So, Emily will
20 answer the rest of your question.

21 EMILY SOUKAS: Urbanspace when we go to
22 look for vendors, we look for that local entrepreneur
23 the mom and pop shop. I've been a resident of CB3 on
24 and off for the last eight years, and I very much
25 have seen how the neighborhood has changed, and one

2 of the reasons why I went to work for Urbanspace was
3 to connect to those small businesses and to give them
4 a place to grow. When we opened Urbanspace
5 Vanderbilt, which is a food hall located in Midtown,
6 we were able to successfully give 20% of our spaces to
7 first time brick and mortar businesses. So, these
8 are vendors that we had worked with at pop-up markets
9 who were really working at local communal kitchen
10 spaces to try something new, and found so much
11 success at our pop-ups that we were then able to help
12 them take that next step and grow to a brick and
13 mortar space. So, we absolutely intend to continue
14 that same style of leasing when figuring out the
15 right vendor mix for this food market.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: When it comes to
17 the local area, do you think that this would be a
18 boost to the other local small businesses in the
19 area? How has it—and how has it worked in other
20 neighborhoods where you brought large markets in
21 terms of your effect on—on local small businesses and
22 mom and pops?

23 EMILY SOUKAS: So, I can speak to the
24 Mad. Sq. Eats, which is a market we started in 2008
25 in Worth Square, which is just adjacent to Madison

2 Square Park. Before our first Mad Sq. Eats, which
3 was in 2008, that Broadway Corridor was really quite
4 vacant. Since we've started, almost all of those
5 retail spaces have been leased up, which is exciting
6 to see, and we have businesses that have expanded
7 into some of those storefronts. There was—we have
8 had businesses who held food carts that would be
9 adjacent to the market or in the park, and because
10 the market was such a success, they would actually
11 rent space from us when the markets popped up in the
12 spring and the fall. Just in creating that sense of
13 community and drawing a plethora of people to this
14 space, they were able to generate more business as a
15 member of our—or as partner in our market as opposed
16 to being on their own.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: In terms of the
18 other jobs on site, in the spirit of the Workforce
19 Development project, are the—could you the developer
20 and labor unions commit to a target of—of local
21 hiring?

22 JOSH WEIN: I mean we're—we have spoken
23 with both the Building Trades Council as well as 32BJ
24 about how—how to staff both the construction and the
25 operation of the building from the construction end,

2 they're—you know it's not a massive mega project
3 where it will have this massive creation of jobs, but
4 it will—it will draw from local and it will—we've
5 spoken to the building trades about opening
6 opportunities when there are the job fairs that
7 could—there would be targeted kind of advertisement
8 with the local communities for those opportunities.
9 In addition, as it relates to the operation of the
10 building, again, it's not a—a massive building to
11 operate. There will a—there will be a sizeable staff
12 and we will work with 32BJ locally. I think also
13 32BJ has a huge contingent of as we saw at some of
14 the community board meetings of—of members who are
15 residents—are currently residents of Community Board
16 3, and the adjacent community boards, and I think
17 there are opportunities for those members to
18 potentially seek a job closer to home in our
19 building, and—and benefit from our operation.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA:

21 JOSH WEIN: To be fair, so I mean so a
22 21-story building it's nothing to sneeze at. It's
23 actually the tallest building in the area besides the
24 Zeckendorf Tower.

2 JOSH WEIN: No. It's actually—I believe
3 it's the third tallest—it would be the third tallest
4 building on that block.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So you get the
6 point. (sic)

7 JOSH WEIN: So, it's—but it's also just
8 from the operation standpoint. The building—the—the
9 floors are going to be leased out. You know, Civic
10 Hall have their operating staff. The building staff
11 per se will not be an enormous staff, but we are
12 making every effort to make sure that we are working
13 locally, building staff also, and in our discussions
14 with LESEN as per the recommendation, and just our
15 efforts, you know, I think LESEN would like to have
16 an opportunity to—to place people from Community
17 Board 3 as well with—with the union.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: How many
19 permanent jobs are going to be created?

20 EMILY SOUKAS: Based on our estimates
21 there will be over 600 permanent job created on the
22 site, and based on our lease with the development
23 team, they've committed those jobs to being living
24 wage jobs, and filling employment opportunities
25 through the Hire NYC program, which provides access

2 to jobs created by our developments to low-income job
3 seekers throughout the city.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: And I just—two
5 more—two things from your testimony, Jillian, now
6 that I have you. One thing was we mentioned the
7 scholarships, and so I want to see how you're going
8 to work that out. You mentioned RAL is going to be
9 providing scholarships. I want to make sure that
10 we're working with the relevant partners to make sure
11 that, you know, we're not just saying it that these
12 are going to go to people that could actually use
13 the—the job training.

14 JILLIAN MCLAUGHLIN: I think our goal is
15 a shared goal. The whole reason that we developed
16 this project was so that New Yorkers who are
17 underrepresented in the tech industry can get a
18 foothold in this industry that is growing and
19 providing good jobs. So, we are committed to working
20 with you to ensure that the scholarships that RAL is
21 providing will be targeted to those that need the
22 training the most.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I—because I don't
24 think this is a really big ask. How much was PC
25 Richards paying to you annually in rent?

2 JILLIAN MCLAUGHLIN: That lease was with
3 a different agency. So, I'm not sure, but I can get
4 back to you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Sure because now
6 you're getting \$2.3 million, and that will go up
7 with-with market. So, the other thing I want to—the
8 last thing I'll mention, and I'll turn it over back
9 to the chair is that in your testimony, you said that
10 you've met with local stakeholders, you received
11 unanimous approval with conditions from the Community
12 Board, the Borough President and CPC. What's not
13 mentioned here is that also in those resolutions are
14 concerns about hyper development and making sure that
15 we are putting height restrictions so that 21-story
16 and 30-story buildings do not continue to just, you
17 know, continue to be constructed in the area, and so
18 I just want to say for the record that in those
19 resolutions from this unanimous approval were
20 concerns about hyper development and making sure that
21 we are keeping the community in scale. Union Square
22 is an attractive popular neighborhood because of the
23 people that live there, and what they have invested
24 financially and emotionally, and so I just want to be
25 clear here that there are a lot of people here who

2 are concerned that his building is going to be a
3 catalyst for hyper-development and bring in very tall
4 buildings, and so I'm hoping that through our
5 conversations and through-with the Administration
6 whoever is here from the Mayor's Office that we can
7 make sure that if we're going to put a tech center
8 there that is truly to bring digital skills along
9 with Civic Hall, and that it's going to bring 600
10 permanent jobs that we're also looking at the people
11 who are walking on those blocks morning, noon and
12 night. And so, I just want to thank you for-for
13 everything that you have-all my questions that you
14 have answered, I know that we'll be meeting shortly
15 after-after this-this week or next week or whenever,
16 but I just really, really want to emphasize how
17 important it is that we are just not putting a
18 building there. You know, this is going to be an
19 important project, I-I think for tech training, but,
20 you know, for \$2.3 million to go to EDC, you know,
21 you're making money and scholarships and having true
22 step-up space and support for Minority and Women
23 Owned Businesses, and making sure that people are
24 getting the jobs that they need. That-that I know is
25 our goal. So, I just hope that RAL you would

2 consider adding an additional floor that EDC you
3 would really have a—I feel like a more productive
4 conversation with me about the scholarships, about
5 what we're providing and that the Administration
6 wherever you are in this room that you're going to
7 able to talk to me a little bit better about how
8 we're going to protect the neighboring communities,
9 and how we're going to make sure that SBS and the
10 other agencies that should be on this panel and
11 should be in the meetings with me every time are
12 providing the services that we need to make this tech
13 center not something that's glassy and sterile, but
14 that it's something that's truly for the community.
15 So, I just want to thank you all, and thank you, Mr.
16 Chair for all the generous time that you've allowed
17 me today.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you,
19 Councilwoman Rivera, and thank you to the panel for
20 your testimony today. Thank you. Before I call the
21 public panel, I just want everyone to—who is
22 testifying to be mindful of the two-minute clock, and
23 I respectfully request that you keep your testimony
24 within that timeframe. The reason for this timeframe
25 is so that we can hear from all the stakeholders who

2 came here today. Thank you. [background comments]

3 The panel is dismissed. Thank you. [background

4 comments, pause] I now call Tara Duvivier; Toby

5 Bergman, Community Board 2; Terry Cude, Community

6 Board 2; MyPhuong Chung, Community Board 3, and

7 Charles Anderson from Assemblywoman Glick's Office.

8 FEMALE SPEAKER: Mi Fung, you have to

9 come up. [background comments, pause]

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Is anyone here from

11 the Manhattan Borough President's Office? No. Okay.

12 [background comments, pause] Okay, we're going to

13 get started. So, if you could just state your name

14 and please adhere to the time on the clock. Thank

15 you.

16 CHARLIE ANDERSON: Sure. I wasn't called

17 first. Just making sure that we're—are we going in a

18 specific order or can I start. Great. Okay. Hi, my

19 name is Charlie Anderson. I'll be reading testimony

20 on behalf of Assembly Member Deborah Glick, and State

21 Senator Brad Hoylman. Thank you for the opportunity

22 to testify before you today regarding the East 14th

23 Street and urban place uniformed land use review

24 procedure for the redevelopment of the lot at 124

25 East 14th. The proposed project claims to construct

2 the 21-story building we heard about, however, the
3 project area and rezoning proposal abuts a
4 neighborhood that has seen a significant number of
5 losses in affordable housing, and community services
6 because of rampant development. Without protections
7 from adjoining—for the adjoining communities, the
8 ULURP—this ULURP application at hand stands to
9 further erode the community and would contribute to
10 the continued attrition of affordable housing, small
11 businesses and neighborhood services that have made
12 this community so attractive to the business
13 development that we are discussion today. Moving
14 onto zoning and density, all 14th Street is already a
15 corridor with tall buildings and this proposed
16 development will not be the tallest structure on this
17 block. These permits allow for space to legalize the
18 bulk and density of they are seeking is emblematic of
19 the development options that many applicants are
20 seeking in the area for commercial office development
21 between Union Square and Astor Place. Without correct
22 zoning protections for the surrounding neighborhoods,
23 long-term residents and existing business owners will
24 suffer. And in the interest of time, I am going to
25 skip to our concluding statements. The mixed-use

1 nature of this community has added to the
2 revitalization of New York seen in the '70s, '80s and
3 '90s, and now the specific drivers that added to the
4 success of Lower Manhattan as an economic venue for
5 New York State. We appreciate the NY—that EDC is
6 using the specific—the special permit process to fund
7 a legal avenue for the proposal to be built.
8 Furthermore, we support the merits that they project
9 aims to create for New York City and the immediate
10 local community. Despite that, we oppose the
11 disappointing failure to include any contextual land
12 marking or zoning protections for the surrounding
13 communities and existing residents and businesses. I
14 am shocked and continued to—that the continued
15 strategy with this Administration, which pits
16 communities against one another by not creating
17 proposals that promote livable communities with ample
18 affordable housing, park space, office space, schools
19 and transportation of the structure. I am
20 concluding. Finally, without adequate community
21 protections, all positive aspects of the ULURP would
22 be lost as seen in the previous ULURP South 14th
23 Street, the recent 550 Washington Street ULURP that
24 passed in 2016 has reverted to an alternative as-of-

2 right option following the sale of the lot. While
3 the many merits of these projects are not—are not
4 conquerors, the fear that a provision, which would be
5 passed for that community input is real. For these
6 reasons, we urge the denial of this application.

7 Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, and please
9 send my regards to one of my favorite Assemblywomen,
10 Assemblywoman Glick.

11 CHARLIE ANDERSON: Will do. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

13 MYPHUONG CHUNG: Hi. My name is MyPhuong
14 Chung. I am Chair of Community Board 3's Land Use,
15 Zoning, Public and Private Housing Committee. This—
16 this project stemmed from a direct request from the
17 Community Board for tech training to help increase
18 opportunity for our residents who need the most help.
19 Community Board 3, has a roughly 25% poverty rate
20 which is about half—I'm sorry, which is about double
21 the national average. We're also the second highest
22 in terms of income disparity in the city. So, any
23 project that comes before us we consider not just the
24 immediate area, but the Community Board, demographics
25 and needs as a whole. This project team presented

2 several times to Community Board 3, and we worked
3 together over the course of several months to improve
4 and increase the public benefits in this project
5 especially to those who are underserved. I won't
6 list all the conditions that we finally agreed to and
7 all the benefits that were outlined earlier and
8 perhaps my colleagues can go into that a little bit
9 more. I do want to say, though, that each of the
10 land use committees where we heard this project much
11 of the time, if not most of the time was spent
12 discussion a 3rd and 4th Avenue rezoning. Separate
13 meetings were also held to discussion 3rd and 4th
14 Avenue rezoning, and a resolution was passed in
15 support of the rezoning process, which always begins
16 with a study to determine what's appropriate and what
17 would meet the goals of the rezoning. In terms of
18 this specific project, we didn't spend a lot of time
19 discussion the specific land use issues or rather
20 major concerns were not really brought up. When we
21 look at land use actions, we always look at the
22 surrounding-surrounding neighborhoods, and we've
23 definitely done that with this proposal with this
24 project and I hope that if the city does consider a
25 look at the 3rd and 4th Avenue Rezoning, I hope they

2 also look at the surrounding areas that would be
3 affected by that rezoning as well. [bell] We did
4 vote to support that rezoning, but I also want to
5 make sure that the—that the needs are being looked at
6 block by block and building by building. Some areas
7 are primarily residential and some areas are quite
8 commercial, and we're also adjacent to the fourth
9 largest transit hub in all of New York, Union Square.
10 So, I hope—our community board's greatest concerns
11 were affordable housing, and affordable businesses.
12 We were upset by the proliferation of hotels that
13 we've been seeing, and a lot of the reasons to be
14 supported—

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: [interposing] You need
16 to—you need to stick to the two minutes. We have a
17 lot of testifying today.

18 MYPHUONG CHUNG: I understand. So, I
19 just want to conclude by saying that [background
20 laughter] if the rezoning is considered, that it
21 truly does maximize affordable housing and businesses
22 and it doesn't just allow for it, and it leverages
23 the existing trends and other resources to make it
24 happen.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. We have
3 the Borough President of Manhattan, Gale Brewer is
4 here today. Would you like to come and--? [pause]
5 Thank you, Madam Borough President.

6 FEMALE SPEAKER: [off mic] Go ahead.

7 GALE BREWER: Thank you very much. I'm
8 Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President. I want to
9 thank Chair Moya and all the subcommittee and we're
10 all talking about the Tech Hub Project. I think you
11 know I chaired the Technology Committee in the city
12 Council so I know a little bit about the topic. It
13 is the fastest growing industry. It has good jobs at
14 high wages. We know that we need training, and
15 particularly in Community Board No. 3, where there
16 are lots of challenges and need for workforce
17 development and good paying jobs. We surveyed the
18 Community Board--with the Community Board in 2017, and
19 more than two-thirds of the responses identified
20 technology as something that they need. I think if
21 you go to any tech company, they'll tell you they
22 need workers right now. I believe in Civic Hall. It'
23 an organization that has worked with stakeholders to
24 advance technology for the public good. We call it
25 civic tech, and I think they will continue to do so

2 with additional space, and I love that the Council
3 Member is pushing them to do even more. This project
4 will have permanent dedicated workforce development
5 space. It will provide digital skills training to
6 underserved communities. Most of the partners in
7 this space are non-profit organizations, and they
8 need to provide free or low-cost trainings, which
9 they have promised. We will hold their feet to the
10 fire, and the non-profit partners in this space would
11 be required to provide tuition scholarships or just
12 free training. Twenty-first Century it's a link to
13 hires with employers working under the same roof and
14 to other organizations and the residents of Board 3
15 to get a priority. I share the community's concerns.
16 That's why everyone is here regarding rezoning of the
17 neighborhood and streets to the north and south of
18 the site. There's a need to take a holistic approach
19 in addressing land use issues in the area. We need
20 stability. We need affordability while allowing for
21 growth. We support the Community Board, all the work
22 they've done, the Council Member in calling on this
23 Administration to commit to actions that will result
24 in zoning protections on the avenues including height
25 limits along Broadway and University Place as well as

2 protections for properties located mid-block on
3 surrounding streets, but I want to make sure that the
4 project does go forward because we need these jobs.
5 It's important to the development of our city as a
6 major hub in global technology to make sure that the
7 residents, Board 3 and elsewhere have access to the
8 opportunities that this industry can provide those
9 jobs key training. Thank you very much Mr. Chair.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you, Madam
11 Borough President.

12 TERRY CUDE: Good morning. I'm Terry
13 Cude Chair of Community Board 2, which is the board
14 immediately adjacent to this proposed development. I
15 appreciate that CB3's recommendation and that of the
16 Borough President include the necessity for zoning
17 and other protections to the neighborhood, and I'm in
18 full agreement with that necessity. I'm here today
19 to stress that the neighborhood that will be affected
20 includes the area in CB2 from Fourth to Fifth Avenues
21 and thank Council Member Rivera for including up to
22 Fifth in the opening remarks. CB2 has long supported
23 zoning protections for the area which we also term
24 the Broadway University Corridor, and appreciates the
25 recognition that this project will have both desired

2 and potentially undesirable effects throughout the
3 greater area. The neighborhood is shared by CBs 2
4 and 3 and the entire area must receive controls to
5 prevent rampant over-development that would
6 irrevocably change a vibrant and so important
7 neighborhood. Thank you. [pause]

8 TOBY BERGMAN: Good morning. I'm Toby
9 Bergman. I'm a member of Community Board 2. My wife
10 and I own a small mixed-use building on East 10th
11 Street where we also live. I was Chair of Community
12 Board 2 three years ago when we first passed a
13 resolution in favor of rezoning what we call the
14 Broadway University Corridor. I believe now is the
15 time to get that rezoning done, and I think that it's
16 important to understand what's happening. I think
17 when we met with City Planning three years ago, they
18 expressed that there were no vulnerable sites with
19 respect to development in the area. That's turned
20 out not to be true, and I think they legitimately
21 misread the massive market change that's happening in
22 Lower Manhattan, and in that area in particular, and
23 the--the--there's a real need for protection. I want
24 to give one example of why that protection is so
25 important. The building that I--my bedroom faces a

2 large old building on the corner of 11th Street and
3 Broadway. That building is going to come down next
4 year and be replaced by 13-story office building. I
5 have no problems with 13-story office buildings, but
6 the loss that has already happened to that—that
7 building is a loss of hundreds of small offices—one-
8 room offices where all different kinds of small
9 businesses have their—have their place. We're losing
10 psychotherapists, writers. They have no place to go.
11 That building is also home to four antique stores.
12 My block is mostly small antique stores. Those
13 stores can't exist without a critical mass. As soon
14 as they're down to six in the neighborhood, they fail
15 to exist. Thank you very much.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
17 all for your testimony today. You are dismissed. The
18 next panel we'll be calling up Andrew Berman, Sam
19 Moskowitz, Ariel Katz, Harriet Bobbin [background
20 comments] Krasne. Did I say it right? [background
21 comments, pause]

22 ANDREW BERMAN: Good morning. I'm Andrew
23 Berman, Executive Director of the Greenwich Village
24 Society for Historic Preservation, the largest
25 membership organization in Greenwich Village and the

2 East Village. On behalf of our several thousand
3 members I'm here today to strongly urge the Council
4 not to approve the proposed 14th Street Tech Hub
5 unless it is accompanied by protections for the
6 adjacent and directly affected Greenwich Village and
7 East Village neighborhoods. Without such protection
8 the Tech Hub will simply accelerate the destruction
9 of these load to mid-rise neighborhoods, current
10 inadequate zoning and increasing pressure from the
11 expanding tech industry is turning them into an
12 extension of Midtown South and Silicon Alley. We've
13 been asking the city to address these issues for more
14 than three years. We've made clear from the first
15 announcement of plans for the Tech Hub a year and a
16 half ago that unless neighborhood protections were
17 attached, it would greatly exacerbate already serious
18 overdevelopment problems. From the beginning we've
19 called for neighborhood and zoned--neighborhood
20 zoning or landmark protections to be part of the
21 plan, but the city has consistently refused. The
22 relationship between overdevelopment in this area and
23 the Tech Hub is not in our minds. The real estate
24 press and several developers have pointed to the
25 announced plan for the Tech Hub as spurring new

2 previously unheard of tech related development in the
3 predominantly residential neighborhoods to the south
4 along University Place, Broadway and the 3rd and 4th
5 Avenue Corridors. We are more than willing to accept
6 a Tech Hub on 14th Street even one larger and more
7 commercial than current zoning allows, but not at the
8 expense of our neighborhoods, and not when it is
9 unnecessary to do so. We've proposed reasonable
10 zoning measures that would protect neighborhood
11 character and encourage or require the inclusion of
12 affordable housing, but the city has consistently
13 said no. We have offered a win-win. The Mayor has
14 said it's his way or the highway. Please stand with
15 the residents of this neighborhood and vote no on the
16 Tech Hub unless protections for the immediately
17 impacted neighborhoods are included. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

19 SAM MOSKOWITZ: Hello. Sam Moskowitz from
20 the Greenwich Village Society continuing the
21 testimony. Along University Place and Broadway
22 Corridors current zoning allows 300 to 400-foot tall
23 office, hotel or condo towers. Such towers nearing
24 completion at University Place and 12th Street
25 sticking out like a sore thumb. An office tower of

2 this scale is planned nearby on Broadway and was only
3 stopped by our successful efforts to get to see it
4 landmarked. Nearly a half dozen similar projects are
5 planned or in motion in this predominantly
6 residential area where a few buildings exceed 12 or
7 so stories and most are significantly less. On 3rd
8 and 4th Avenues developers are encourage to sidestep
9 the area's existing affordable housing and zoning
10 incentives and predominantly residential character by
11 zoning, which allows commercial developments 10%
12 larger than market rate residential ones. Since the
13 affordable housing incentives only apply to
14 residential not commercial developments. As a
15 result, modest walk-up apartments with rent
16 stabilized units are being demolished through 300
17 plus room hotels. In one case by a developer who's a
18 campaign fund raiser for the Mayor and the Mayor's
19 appointee to the Economic Development Corporation,
20 the agency behind the Tech Hub. To address this, the
21 University Place and Broadway, we proposed replacing
22 the current zoning, which has no height limits and no
23 incentives for affordable housing with new zoning
24 that will not only reduce the allowable FAR, but
25 increase it, albeit modestly for developments, which

2 include affordable housing. We would limit the
3 height of new construction to a maximum of 145 feet,
4 about the height of the tallest buildings in the
5 area. Our proposed zoning is the contextual
6 counterpart of the existing zoning with affordable
7 housing provisions added. Had this happened already,
8 the luxury condo tower now rising at University Place
9 and 12th Street could have included 30,000 square
10 feet of affordable housing. For 3rd and 4th Avenues
11 such affordable housing provisions and height limits
12 already exist. They were simply seeking to eliminate
13 the loophole through which developers get around the
14 affordable housing incentives, and build out of
15 character large scale commercial developments. We
16 propose lowering the maximum allowable of commercial
17 FAR to below that for residential developments. This
18 would ensure new development remains predominantly
19 residential and the main incentive for avoiding
20 affordable housing provisions is removed. It is
21 these modest but necessary changes we have proposed
22 as mitigation for the Tech Hub, which the city has
23 refused to consider or even seriously discuss.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

2 ARIEL KATES: Hi. I'm Ariel Kates
3 continuing the testimony for the Greenwich Village
4 Society for Historic Preservation. Thousands of New
5 Yorkers have written city officials in support of the
6 neighborhood protections we have called for or have
7 specifically said that they must come along with any
8 planned Tech Hub for the area. Additionally, every
9 elected official who represents this area including
10 Congress Member Carolyn Maloney, Borough President
11 Gale Brewer, State Senators Brad Hoylman and Liz
12 Krueger, Assembly Member Deborah Glick and, of
13 course, past City Council Member Rosie Mendez and
14 current City Council Member Carlina Rivera have all
15 endorsed these neighborhood protections. Community
16 Boards 2 and 3 have both passed resolutions in
17 support of them. CB3 including in its ULURP
18 recommendation on the Tech Hub as did the borough
19 president. Additionally, a vast array of affordable
20 housing, planning, neighborhood progressive and good
21 government groups have come out in support of the
22 neighborhood protections for this area we have been
23 calling for including the Cooper Square Committee and
24 Affordable Housing provider; Fourth Arts Block, a
25 cultural consortium; Good Old Lower East side an

2 advocate for low-income neighborhood residents; the
3 Metropolitan Council on Housing, a citywide advocate
4 for tenants and affordable housing; New York
5 Communities for Change a citywide advocate for
6 underserved New Yorkers; the Lower East Side Power
7 Partnership, a non-profit seeking to empower
8 individuals and families on the Lower East Side; the
9 East Village Community Coalition, which works to
10 support and sustain the built-in cultural character
11 of the East Village; the East Village Independent
12 Merchants Association, which works to create a strong
13 and diverse business environment that sustains the
14 unique character of the Easts Village; the Lower East
15 Side Preservation Initiative; the Bowery Alliance of
16 Neighbors; the Historic Districts Council; the
17 Citywide Advocate for Historic Neighborhoods; the
18 Municipal Art Society; the Citywide Advocate for
19 Sound Planning Principles; Vision Nirvana; a youth
20 and senior services provide [bell] and Lower
21 Manhattan; Lower East Side, Inc. a non-profit that
22 addresses serious economic and social
23 disenfranchisement of poor and low-income Latino
24 residents on the Lower East Side; Coalition for
25 District Alternative; the East Village's Progressive

2 Democratic Club; Village Independent Democrats
3 [bell], Greenwich Village's Original Progressive
4 Democratic Club. All have called for any tech hub
5 approvals to include neighborhood protections. We
6 hope you will heed their call.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

8 HARRY BOWMAN: Hi. I'm Harry Bowman.
9 I'll conclude Greenwich Village Society for Historic
10 Preservation's testimony. This community has worked
11 closely with our Council Member Carlina Rivera in a
12 good faith effort to balance neighborhood concerns
13 with the city's desires, and the potential good,
14 which could come from the proposed Tech Hub. As it
15 regards neighborhood protections, it has thus far
16 been a one-way conversation. The zoning plan we have
17 offered is by no means our ideal, but a reasonable
18 alternative designed specifically to address issues
19 like affordable housing and not reduce allowable
20 development at all, but merely ensure that the uses
21 and the heights of new buildings are compatible, with
22 the surrounding neighborhood. Apparently, this is a
23 bridge too far for our Mayor. We have offered
24 landmarking as an acceptable alternative, which would
25 address some, if not all of these issues. There too,

2 we have seen no substantive progress. We have been
3 engaging in this conversation with the city for
4 years. So the fact that we are here today with so
5 little progress to show for it lies squarely on the
6 shoulders of this Administration. It is they who
7 have refused to listen, refused to negotiate, refused
8 to compromise. It has been their way or the no way
9 from the beginning even when the plans we offer
10 address their purported goals of creating affordable
11 housing, which seem much less important to this
12 administration than increasing the profits and
13 development potential of real estate interests. It
14 is the role of the City Council among other things to
15 balance the interest of Mayor with that of local
16 communities especially on land use issues. We have
17 tried to work with the Mayor from early on in the
18 genuine hopes of achieving a win-win as we have with
19 other ULURPs, but this time, this mayor has shown no
20 interest in anything other than serving his interest
21 and those of his campaign donors who are behind the
22 proposed Tech Hub and many of the developments which
23 would benefit from it. Don't sign off on turning
24 Greenwich Village and the East Village into an
25 extension of Midtown South and Silicon Alley. Stand

2 up to the Mayor. Stand up for New York City's
3 neighborhoods. Vote no on the proposed Tech Hub
4 unless the Mayor agrees to necessary neighborhood
5 protections.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Yes.

7 LUCILLE KRASNE: [off mic] I am--

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Just push the button.

9 LUCILLE KRASNE: [on mic] Oh.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yeah, there you go.

11 LUCILLE KRASNE: My name is Lucille
12 Krasne. I'm a proud citizen of the citizen of the
13 East Village. I'm here because I felt it absolutely
14 imperative to say something on behalf of our
15 communities. I only can say thank you, thank you to
16 the wonderful people who have worked so hard to try
17 to protect what is left of our community, and I say
18 what is left because I've been there very many years
19 and it's-it-I will ask that if anybody is interested
20 in being my neighbor, there is a very cute apartment
21 on my block between A and B for a mere \$200--\$2.2
22 million. It has three small bedrooms and one bath,
23 but if that doesn't bother you, and the noise on the
24 park doesn't bother you, I would suggest you invest
25 on my block, but this is what's happened to my

2 neighborhood, and I am thrilled to death to have
3 someone like Carlina Rivera helping us protect what's
4 left. And I want to say that to walk down University
5 now is to weep, and I go to a therapist because I was
6 hit by a cyclist. That's another thing the city
7 better do something about. I was hit by a cyclist.
8 So, therefore I got to a therapist on University
9 thrilled that it's not on the block with this—that's
10 decimated our—the look of that area. So, I thank you
11 all. I thank—I thank you for the opportunity to be
12 here, and just to say I support and love and care
13 about the work that these people are doing on my
14 behalf. Thank you very much.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you to all the
16 panelists and you're dismissed. The next panel is
17 Sandra Balaban, Pistachio Saldana, Aixa Torres, Laura
18 Sewell and Nakisha Evans. [pause]

19 LEGAL COUNSEL: Whoever would like to go
20 first, you can—why don't we start here. You can
21 state your name.

22 AIXA TORRES: My name? My name is Aixa
23 Torres, and I am the President of Alfred E. Smith
24 Houses Resident Association, Incorporated. On behalf
25 of the 1,926 families of the Alfred E. Smith Houses,

2 I'd like to express our support for the Tech Hub on
3 14th Street. As a resident association, we can only
4 support a few residents with access to computers or
5 classes for learning technology of the future. At
6 this moment, services provided by Per Scholas or
7 other organization are in other boroughs and travel
8 can be up to two hours. This hub will provide access
9 for some within walking distance and others one bus
10 and/or train ride away may be at the most 30 minutes
11 of travel versus ours. At the end of this--at the end
12 of this means employment for residents who would not
13 have the opportunity or the finance--or the finances
14 to travel two hours for programs like Per Scholas or
15 take advantage of other programs. Thank you for your
16 time, and I'd like to say that there are other
17 resident leaders from public housing who will be
18 sending statements to the committee. I just need the
19 Chairman's name and his contact and they will be
20 sending on behalf of their public housing
21 developments. Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you and I'll get
23 you the contact--

24 AIXA TORRES: [interposing] Okay.

25 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: --before you leave.

2 LAURA SEWELL: Good afternoon. My name is
3 Laura Sewell speaking. I'm Executive Director of the
4 East Village Community Coalition. The Tech Hub and
5 its non-profit partners promised an attractive
6 package of programming in exchange for the
7 privatization of city land, but this project cannot
8 be considered without addressing the need for zoning
9 protections for the 3rd and 4th Avenues, which were
10 excluded from the 2008 East Village Rezoning. CB3,
11 community organizations and the significant number of
12 residents have consistently supported zoning
13 protections along the 3rd and 4th Avenue Corridor
14 south of Union Square. We urge the City Council to
15 simultaneously advance the proposed rezoning of this
16 area along with any approval of this project. The
17 recommendations put forth by CB3 do much to ensure
18 that residents and businesses will maximally benefit
19 from what is on offer from the Tech Hub, and we hope
20 that they are well received by the Tech Hub team.
21 The East Village Community Coalition had a productive
22 meeting with the team and look forward to hearing
23 more about the opportunities on offer for our
24 independent merchants. There's a pressing need for
25 affordable market space for successful small

2 businesses in CB3, which are continually displaced by
3 real estate pressures. Booths in the proposed ground
4 floor retail market could be an attractive option for
5 such businesses but the current programming
6 requirements eliminate merchants who operate shops
7 within .5 miles of the Tech Hub Project with an
8 emphasis on new merchants putting many businesses
9 with CB3 at a disadvantage. EVCC believes including
10 these business would be beneficial to both Tech Hub
11 tenants and residents who are familiar with their
12 services, and we have asked the EDC to waive the .5
13 mile requirement for businesses within CB3. There is
14 a pressing need for services that serve residents
15 rather than tourists, which would serve building
16 tenants as well, and we believe an open dialogue
17 among the parties who will be affected by the
18 introduction of this new market space will be to
19 programming the best served project in the community.
20 I am concluding. We call for responsible planning
21 that serve the needs of the people who live and work
22 here. We ask the Council to stand firm on the
23 rezoning of the 3rd and 4th Avenues in any approval of
24 this project. Thank you for the opportunity to
25 speak.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

3 SANDRA BALABAN: [off mic] Thank you.

4 That's [pause] That's on? [on mic] Thank you for

5 much for the opportunity to speak with you this

6 morning in support of the Tech Hub. I'm Sandra

7 Balaban Co-founder of Why Vote and Civics Unplugged.

8 Like many of us, November 8, 2016 changed my life and

9 my trajectory. Having spent 20 years in education

10 and youth development, I took the election season and

11 extending law very, very seriously demonstrating as

12 it did the breakdown of civics outbreak in our

13 country and the shortcomings of civic education over

14 the last four decades. I felt compelled to leave my

15 job and devote myself to bolstering youth civic

16 engagement and voter engagement. Recognizing that

17 just 36% of 18 and 19-year-olds voted in 2016 versus

18 70% of people over age 70 underscored the vital role

19 that today's young people, our country's largest most

20 diverse, most progressive generation can play in

21 changing the political ecology. Both of the youth

22 organizations I created addressed deep needs in the

23 youth civic ecosystem, but they didn't address my own

24 needs to be part of a civic ecosystem. Thankfully,

25 I discovered Civic Hall, and its Exemplary Organizers

2 and Residents Program. This program is designed for
3 people like me, people with outsized ambitions and
4 undersized budgets who cannot afford traditional co-
5 working spaces, and wouldn't want to. What I found
6 at Civil Hall is an exemplary community of civic
7 movers and shaker who are truly committed to
8 collaborative learning and to building upon one
9 another's efforts and ideas in order to build a
10 better more civically minded city. My work getting
11 not just one, but two youth organizations supporting
12 hundreds of New York City youth off the ground would
13 not have been possible without the inspiration that
14 pulses through Civic Hall and the concrete support
15 I've derived from colleagues and allies there. Civic
16 Hall provides space in multiple ways. Concretely, it
17 has provided good central space for our youth from
18 across four boroughs to congregate for planning
19 meetings and events like our May 31st Youth Town Hall
20 with elected officials attended by Manhattan Borough
21 President Gale Brewer. Thank you Gale, two Congress
22 members and two City Council Members. Thank you Brad
23 Lander and Steve Levin. Beyond physical space Civic
24 Hall has provided me and countless others with the
25 head and heart space we need to fortify ourselves to

2 take on some of the foremost challenges of our time.

3 I frequently welcome non-Civic Hall members into the

4 space for meetings and everyone of them notes how

5 energized an inspired they are to be in this space,

6 and how it gives them an enhanced sense of

7 possibility. What do we need more of these days than

8 an enhanced sense of possibility. I urge you to

9 support Civic Hall in expanding its footprint and

10 continuing to expand possibilities, many, many

11 thanks.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

13 ANDREW SALDANA: Good morning. My name

14 Andrew Saldana and I'm the Director of Operations for

15 New York Tech Alliance. Our mission is to represent,

16 inspire support and help lead the New York technology

17 community and ecosystem and create a better future

18 for all. We also run the world's largest Meetup

19 group, the New York Tech Meetup with over 58,000

20 members. A same choice (sic) tech center and

21 expanded Civic Hall will not only allow programs like

22 our monthly Meetup to thrive. It will also foster

23 the partnerships and connections necessary that will

24 enable organizations like ours to be successful. It I

25 our goal that our members, which include students,

2 those in career transition beginning entrepreneurs,
3 and tech professionals for all five boroughs to learn
4 and volunteer and engage and having a central text in
5 the likes of the call will only encourage continued
6 growth of Tech with all New Yorkers in mind.

7 NIKKI EVANS: Hello. My name Nikki
8 Evans, and I am here on behalf of CUNY. I'm speaking
9 in support of the Tech Training Center at Union
10 Square. I'm the Director for the CUNY Office
11 Workforce Partnerships and I am responsible for
12 several of our university wide tech initiatives on
13 both the academic and Workforce Development side of
14 the house. For the past four years CUNY has worked
15 hard to expand education and training access in the
16 tech space to New York City residents including
17 winning a four year \$6 million USD Training Grants
18 that allows us to provide training access to
19 residents in Manhattan, Queens and Brooklyn. We see
20 this opportunity presented by the Tech Training Hub
21 as a great chance to continue to expand on the work
22 that we are currently doing in both the degree
23 programs and on the workforce side. Honestly, one of
24 the main things that this opportunity provides is
25 space. Space is at premium in New York. Offering

2 training program, offering the time and the energy
3 needs a house for that, and this particular
4 opportunity gives us that, and allows us to offer
5 more training programs. You're right, there are a
6 ton of training programs in the city, but given the
7 size of the city we need more. Also, it offers us a
8 deeper connection to the local start-up community.
9 New York City's tech industry is really being driven
10 by its start-ups. Understanding how they're
11 developing and how they're growing allowing those who
12 are taking training programs to see where their
13 skills can actually fit, and not having that
14 separated into just a regular classroom is very
15 helpful not only for helping them see what types of
16 jobs they can and what the future does hold for them
17 or what kind of jobs they can build, and what kind of
18 companies they can build and where they can be. So,
19 I'm speaking on behalf of CUNY. We are in support of
20 this wonderful opportunity and we hope that the City
21 Council will be in support of the Tech Hub at Union
22 Square.

23 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank—thank
24 you all for your testimony today. The next panel we
25 have Richard Bolt—Blodgett, Ann Mitchell, David

2 Rosen, former Council Woman Rosie Mendez is here, and
3 Barbara Goldwyn. (sic) [background comments, pause]
4 Kyu-Kyun--[background comments] Khianya (sp. Sorry,
5 sorry. On behalf of the Bowery Alliance of Neighbors.
6 [pause] Jean Crier. [pause] Yeah, we'll start over
7 here. Thank you. If you could just state your name?

8 RICHARD BLODGETT: Yes. Good morning.
9 It's still morning. It's a pleasure to be with you
10 today. My name is Richard Blodgett. I'm a long time
11 resident of Greenwich Village. I do not oppose Tech
12 Hub per se. Creating jobs in the tech industry is a
13 very noble objective. However, the preservation of
14 our city's residential neighborhoods is equally noble
15 and should not be ignored. Please look for yourself
16 at that are south of Tech Hub. Walk its streets. If
17 you have not already done so, you will find a
18 wonderful, friendly, vibrant neighborhood that has
19 survived for many years. New York City and its
20 people thrive on neighborhoods like this. Yet, this
21 neighborhood is being threatened by outsized
22 development. The pressure large inappropriate
23 development will only increase the Tech Hub as
24 approved. Job creation is great, but not at the cost
25 of destroying our residential community. If you

2 approve Tech Hub, please provide zoning or landmark
3 protections for the surrounding neighborhood. Than
4 you.

5 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Councilwoman.

6 ROSIE MENDEZ: Oh, former Councilwoman
7 and--

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: [interposing] You'll
9 always have the title.

10 ROSIE MENDEZ: It's been seven months and
11 it's an honor to come back into Chambers and be in
12 front of my Councilwoman Carlina Rivera. I am here
13 because this issue is very important to me, and I am
14 against this project if protections are not put in
15 place for our communities in Community Boards 2 and 3
16 from 3rd Avenue 5th Avenue. I want to let you know,
17 Mr. Chair, that this project came to me in 2014.
18 Then HDC and EDC came forward with a housing project,
19 and I ran on community based planning. It' still the
20 principles I abide by. I certainly want that as part
21 of the community, and--and I told them to go back to--
22 to Community Board 3 that I will not commit to
23 anything until after the Community Board had made a
24 decision. They went to Community Board 3, and then
25 they changed the project to this Tech Hub, which I'm

2 not against jobs, but not at the expense of people
3 losing their homes, of buildings being demolished and
4 having oversized buildings that are not in scale with
5 the community, and losing and having our rent
6 stabilized tenants be displaced. So, that is why we
7 need the protections. So, the city and the agencies
8 went to Community Board 3, never told them that there
9 was a housing option, and they met with the Economic
10 Development Committee of Community Board 3 for
11 several years planning this out. When people from
12 Community Board 3 realized—well, when I found out, I—
13 I at some point knew there was a Tech Hub plan. I
14 always thought there was a housing component because
15 my neighborhood always wants housing and we need it.
16 When I told them that housing was an option, that
17 committee never knew that housing was an option, but
18 they felt that they had gone down this road and
19 invested so much, and they would like to see housing,
20 but they were going to continue to support the
21 project. So, I am here to say it's a worthy project,
22 not at the expense of the residents who have lived
23 there for a long time, not at the expense of my
24 neighbors and we need protections put in place, and
25 if we get that, well be better off. One last thing.

2 My—can I have one more minute? My Land Use Director
3 at the time—please help me out with his name. I'm
4 having a moment.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Matt Viggiano.
6 I'll shout out.

7 ROSIE MENDEZ: Yeah, Matt Viggiano and I
8 walked that area of the district that we're proposing
9 be contextually rezoned block by block, avenue by
10 avenue. We came up with 12 scenarios in which out-
11 of-scale development could happen through
12 assemblages. Department of City Planning said under
13 good planning principles this cannot happen. Maybe-
14 maybe in two of your scenarios, but not in these 12.
15 Since then, four are developed or are being
16 developed. I fear eventually all of the 12 sites
17 will be developed, and there are other scenarios
18 where you could—we did use some good planning
19 principles because he's an urban planner, and that
20 more than 12 sites can be developed. It will be very
21 dangerous for our community. It will change, and we
22 will lose a lot of long-term residents. Thank you
23 very much.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. I know
25 that Councilwoman Rivera has a question.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yeah, I—Rosie,
3 Councilwoman, it's very good to see you. Thank you
4 for being here, and I want—I was going to ask about
5 that exact tour that you took of Broadway, and all of
6 the sites that DCP said would not happen, and you
7 just confirmed that at least four of the 12 are in
8 development or are developed, and can you also speak
9 to your concern at the time of the transfer of
10 existing development rights above some of buildings
11 there. For example, Grace Church.

12 ROSIE MENDEZ: You know, air rights
13 needs, you know, when you're transferring air rights
14 to me it's—it's something we need to look at. I have
15 apposed certain housing developments for affordable
16 housing because the air rights were not being
17 controlled, and currently, and many of these projects
18 that did take place in my then district, that HPD
19 renovated affordable housing, and air rights was
20 created. Those air rights went to unscrupulous
21 developers who have harassed tenants, who have done
22 construction by harassment and, you know, they should
23 not benefit from air rights. There's a very good
24 purpose to air rights, and there should be some kind
25 of screening so that if you have a lot of violations

2 in your buildings, if you've been harassing people,
3 and there's been complaints, you should not benefit
4 from getting these air rights. And so, you know, I
5 think that the answer to your question is air rights
6 is not a bad thing. It depends who's getting them,
7 and the city has not put any mechanism in place to
8 weed out unscrupulous developers from getting their
9 hands on these air rights.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

12 BARBARA GORAN: Thank you. My name is
13 Barbara Goran. I'm a—I'm a neighborhood resident at
14 10th Street and University Place, and especially over
15 the last ten years we've watched the character of
16 University Place changing. We've lost many, many
17 local businesses and that have served our residents.
18 We've lost shoemakers and hardware stores and mom and
19 pop pharmacies and two beloved local restaurants that
20 have been there for decades all under increasing over
21 development pressure. The neighborhood is already
22 under a lot of pressure because of NYU and Union
23 Square activity, and with the Tech Hub, this pressure
24 would only increase. We've all seen what tech hubs
25 in Seattle, Palo Alto, Cambridge, Massachusetts, and

1 other places have done to their surrounding
2 neighborhoods. There are no incentives for private
3 developers to build in the contextual manner and to
4 include low-income and affordable housing in the
5 absence of zoning requirements, and I say this as a
6 lawyer currently representing hundreds of low-income
7 residents who have been forced out by harassment by
8 private developers. So, this development is an
9 example. It's going to replace a 2-story building
10 with a 21-story building that has no housing, no-
11 certainly affordable or low-income housing, which
12 only increases the necessity of adding protections
13 for the—the rest of the neighborhood. It would just
14 be a tragic shame to—to allow the unique character of
15 Greenwich Village and East Village south and west of
16 the Tech Hub to—to deteriorate any further, and I
17 thank especially Councilwoman Rivera, and others who
18 [bell] have proposed sensible approaches to the Tech
19 Hub including zoning protections. Thanks.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

22 JEAN CRIER: Hello. My name is Jean
23 Crier. I am one of your constituents, Councilwoman
24 Rivera. I live on 4th Avenue and 12th Street
25 essentially in the back yard of the Tech Hub just two

2 blocks south of it, and with me here are four of the
3 residents of our building on which I have the
4 pleasure of serving on the board, and behind me if
5 you can imagine this are at least 59 of us who
6 Councilwoman Rivera when you were campaigning I
7 presented a petition to you with our 59. At that
8 time we called us the 59 Club, 59 signatures of
9 people in our building who are deeply, deeply
10 concerned about the prospect of as the word you just
11 said today: Hyper development in our neighborhood,
12 and all of what that impact is. I also presented
13 that petition to the Mayor at his town hall after
14 which actually one of his press people grabbed me and
15 said, Do you want to have a picture with the Mayor,
16 and I was scooped up under his gigantic 6-1/2 foot
17 tall arm, and he is smiling with our petition.
18 Sadly, the mayor has not been as the representatives
19 from GSV-GVSHP have just said: Responsive to our
20 terms and our requests about zoning in our
21 neighborhood nor have any of the previous mayors for
22 that matter who have declined the GVSHP's efforts to
23 protect that neighborhood with zoning or landmark
24 protection. If you imagine the little slip of aisle
25 in this room, and think of all of this as Greenwich

2 Village East and West that precious strip of land is
3 where we live and where now within four blocks of us
4 we have seen 300-foot buildings or 300 size rooms,
5 hotels going up. So, this is one last point, and I'm
6 watching the time. Fifty-nine of us have signed our
7 petition. There are many, many thousands of other
8 residents who are also equally concerned. Fifty-
9 nine. Fifty-nine is the number of people on this
10 half of the room. It is also the number of lots in
11 this area that are unprotected upon which a gigantic
12 building will go if we don't have the zoning
13 protection. That's really serious. Thank you for all
14 of your work. Thank you Councilman Rivera our former
15 one and everybody at GVSHP. This is really vitally
16 important and we care and we appreciate all you'll do
17 to say no to this unless it has the zoning protection
18 we need. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

20 KHINAY WEST: Hi. My name is Khinay
21 West, and I want to thank you for allowing me to
22 testify on behalf of the Bowery Alliance of
23 Neighbors. Dear City Council Members, a year and a
24 half ago, five historic buildings on East 11th Street
25 were demolished and long-time residents were pushed

2 out to make way for a giant hotel. About 12 to 13
3 years ago on 12th Street between 3rd and 4th Avenue
4 most of an historic church was torn down. In a
5 single gesture to the community outcry its front
6 façade was retained as an ornament for the ugly 26-
7 story NYU Dorm Tower that now rises like a big middle
8 finger saying screw you to the community that
9 rightfully opposed it. A few blocks down on 8th
10 Street at 51 Astor Place, a big fat freakishly out of
11 scale office building went up recently. Nickname the
12 Death Star, it is sucking the air and light out of
13 the Aster Place area. Since the Tech Hub seeks to
14 locate in this low-rise neighborhood because of its
15 historical, cultural and architectural dynamism, the
16 city should see the proposed zoning protections as
17 appropriate and beneficial to both the community and
18 the Tech Hub both themselves. Sensible cities like
19 Paris do not allow tall towers to invade historic
20 neighborhoods, and they certainly would not approve
21 of this project unless they first made sure hat the
22 neighborhood was first protected. If the city does
23 not enact sensible contextual zoning protections,
24 real estate developers will bury this area with more
25 eyesore towers of glass and steel and a hyper

2 gentrification that will displace residents, small
3 businesses and the historic character of the
4 community. Please approve the 3rd and 4th Avenues
5 rezoning protections before it's too late. Thank you
6 on behalf of President David Mulkins.

7 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
8 to the panel for your testimony today. We will be
9 calling up the next panel. Steven Mott, Brian
10 Glover, Brittany Spatz, Meghan Joye, [bell] and John
11 Montes. [background comments, pause] Can you just all
12 briefly state your name so we know it. Okay.

13 BRITTANY SPAT: Brittany Spatz.

14 MEGHAN JOYE: Meghan Joye.

15 BRIAN GLOVER: Brian Glover.

16 JOHN MONTES: John Montes.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. No Steven Mott?
18 No. Okay and Mike McDermott. [pause] Okay, you can
19 get started.

20 BRITTANY SPATZ: Good morning. My name
21 is Brittany Spatz, and I'm here on behalf of
22 Educational Alliance to support our—to express our
23 support of the Tech Hub on 14th Street, acknowledging
24 the game changing opportunities that this new center
25 will provide our students, families and staff

2 members. As we—as we at Educational Alliance continue
3 to meet the ever-changing needs of the 50,000 New
4 Yorkers who walk through our doors each year, we rely
5 on cutting edge partners like Civic Hall to help us
6 ensure that all members of our community receive the
7 resources, training, access and opportunities that
8 they need to achieve their goals. We recognize that
9 this hub can provide critical technical support for
10 our staff ensuring that we and other local non-
11 profits can effectively use digital tools that allow
12 us to track, aggregate, visualize, programmatic data,
13 information that's critical to improving our services
14 and maximizing our impact. We recognize that this
15 space has the potential to serve our over 2,000
16 students some of the most at-risk youth in our city
17 fostering 21st Century skills that will prepare them
18 to attain high level jobs, jobs that can break the
19 cycle of poverty, and finally, because of the Hub's
20 emphasis on civic engagement, we recognize that the
21 families we serve many of whom are immigrants will be
22 able to access resources and tools to enable them to
23 step in local leadership roles in new and powerful
24 ways. When I began working on the Lower East Side, I
25 ran Educational Alliance's program at PS 188 where

2 100% of my students were receiving free or reduced
3 lunch, and almost half of them were considered
4 homeless. The thought that in a couple of years
5 these students, my students will be able hop on the
6 M14D, and in just a few minutes be connected to world
7 class instruction, networks, mentors and previously
8 untouchable professional opportunities. That is
9 incredible. Thank you.

10 MEGHAN JOYE: Hi. My name is Meghan Joye,
11 and I chair the Economic Development Committee on
12 Community Board 3. [bell] [pause] Sorry about that.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: It's okay. You can--
14 no, no, you're good.

15 MEGHAN JOYE: Well, we often speak about
16 the struggles of small businesses in our
17 neighborhood. I think it's important that we also
18 focus on what are the larger economic drivers in the
19 next 20 years. All signs of that are pointing to
20 tech. Our district has the second amount of public
21 housing than any other district in the neighborhood,
22 and it is increasingly becoming a city of haves and
23 have nots, and we have to make sure that our most
24 vulnerable citizens have access to the opportunities
25 it takes to succeed in this industry. Community

2 Board 3 has specifically asked for this business
3 incubator in our last two District Needs Statements,
4 and we thank the city for delivering on that ask.
5 EDC, RAL and Civic Hall have presented to our board
6 at least five times, and while many of those meetings
7 were dominated by the 3rd and 4th Avenue unit—3rd and
8 4th Avenue rezoning conversation, when we finally got
9 to consider the project itself, we were pleased with
10 what we heard that said this is city-owned land, and
11 who is the city? We are the city, and when we lease
12 our land to project developers, we have to make sure
13 that it's beneficial to the majority. So, while the
14 developers have many benefits to the communities,
15 it's our job to ask for more. Some of the
16 stipulations that Community Board 3 put in our
17 resolution in support of this Tech Hub, and I won't
18 name them all because there's a lot, but it is one
19 additional floor of Workforce Development space that
20 the basement level be leased out to a theater or a
21 community use. That there be additional scholarships
22 for Workforce Development, that there's free event
23 space for the community, and we would be naïve to
24 think that a development of this size would not have
25 an impact on the greater neighborhood, and while

2 there are current height caps in the—in the 3rd and
3 4th Avenue rezoning it may not be enough. So, CB3
4 has also asked the city to commence the process of a
5 rezoning of 3rd and 4th Avenue while incentivizing
6 affordable housing, and possibly excluding hotels and
7 big box retail. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

9 BRIAN GLOVER: Hi. I'm Brian Glover with
10 Community School District 1. I'm here on behalf of
11 Superintendent Carry Chan to talk to you guys about
12 how Civic Hall has been working with us already on
13 the education side in our district. As you know, we
14 have a new vision for learning in District 1 that's
15 really focused on our core values of equity and
16 collaboration and innovation and bring joy back to
17 learning, and part of that is also helping our
18 learners and have become empowered with more agency
19 and voice. Civic Hall has been trying to help us
20 realize this vision. They've already spent time with
21 our young men exploring a mentoring group, which was
22 taking place at PS15 at the end of the last school
23 year between Avenues C and D on 4th Street. They
24 were there to mentor our young men of color from our
25 middle schools at PS34, 188 and 140. They've also

2 been meeting with the district team so that we can
3 deepen our work and partnership together. They've
4 offered to host our principal's conferences and our
5 Modern Learning Advisory Group at the current Civic
6 Hall location in Chelsea. They came out to present
7 to our school leaders at our end of Your Principals
8 Conference, and we're already developing learning
9 opportunities for both school leaders and school
10 staff with Civic Hall as a partner. The future feels
11 like it's a looking a little bit brighter in our
12 district knowing that this technology hub is going to
13 be available for our students, our families and for
14 our schools. Thank you.

15 MICHAEL MCDERMOTT: Good afternoon. My
16 name is Michael McDermott. Thank you for having me.
17 I'm a resident of the East Village where I have lived
18 for the past 29 years. I'm also a member of Local 46
19 Iron Workers, and amazingly I recently retired. I'm
20 here to speak favor of RAL's application for 124 East
21 14th Street. I have a couple of points here. We can
22 fulfill local hiring requirements gladly. Middle
23 class jobs only unions can provide. Local 46 really
24 needs work right now. I respect my neighbors'

2 feeling about this project, but we need good
3 development and good jobs. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

5 JOHN MONTES: Good afternoon. My name is
6 John Montes. I am currently a resident of Jacob
7 Reese Housing. I live on 12th Street Avenue D.
8 Prior to that, I used to live on-by the Seaport on
9 South Street, and from there I-from way back then I
10 used to work as-in fast food at Popeye's making
11 minimum wage, which was \$7.25 at the time. Later on-
12 later on I got an internship, but it only went up to
13 10-to \$10 an hour. From there, I went to Per
14 Scholas. Per Scholas actually helped in gaining-in
15 gaining technical-technical knowledge, and things of
16 that nature. I picked up my A+ in those
17 certifications, and from the \$10-from the \$10 an
18 hour, I was making with the internship, I bumped up
19 to a \$50,000 a year salary. With that-with that I'm
20 also planning on moving forward. I picked up two
21 more certifications, and I believe that having
22 something-having a place like Per Scholas close to
23 home in Manhattan would be beneficial to a lot of the
24 people in my neighborhood because over on 12th Street
25 Avenue D, I noticed that a lot of people are-a lot of

2 people are struggling when it comes to—when it comes
3 to jobs and financial things of that nature, and Per
4 Scholas being all the way in the Bronx is very hard
5 to reach. I—I myself was actually unable to make it
6 for a final test for Python, which is a coding
7 language, because of my asthma, and that distance was
8 too great for me. Having—having resources like—like
9 that close to home would really—would really benefit
10 in the growth of the community financially, and I
11 think that—well, that would probably be—the best
12 thing for many. [bell]

13 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: Thank you. Thank
14 you all for your testimony today. The next panel
15 will be Kathleen Wake—Wakeham

16 KATHLEEN WAKEHAM: [interposing] Wakeham.

17 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Wakeham, Ray Rogers,
18 Zachary Lerner, Tom Bishard and Eric Raymond.
19 [background comments, pause]

20 KATHLEEN WAKEHAM: Well, good afternoon.
21 My name is Kathleen Wakeham from the Metropolitan
22 Council on Housing. I have lived in the community of
23 the propose Tech Hub for over 40 years. On East 12th
24 Street across from the Post Office on East 11th
25 Street and 4th Avenue there is a construction site

2 because five rent stabilized buildings were
3 demolished to make room for a Moxy Hotel. Around
4 another corner on East 14th Street between 1st Avenue
5 and Avenue B there are other construction sites for
6 upscale buildings that displaced rent stabilized
7 tenants and small business owners. As I walk through
8 the neighborhood that I love because of its vibrancy,
9 its immigrants, political activists, artists,
10 Bohemians, I see a rich culture being taken away by
11 greedy developers who are tearing at the fabric of
12 our community. Also, our neighborhood is becoming
13 unaffordable. According to CAS and MAHD and
14 Community Board 3, the median household income is
15 \$42,268 and 50.5% of tenants are rent burdened. They
16 pay more than 50% of their income for rent. The
17 present proposal for the Tech Hub will make our
18 community more unaffordable as rent stabilized
19 apartments are demolished for hotels and condos and
20 high-end stores and retail chains replace small
21 business owners. I am asking Mayor de Blasio and the
22 City Council to support rezoning protection as
23 proposed by former Council Member Rosie Mendez to
24 Greenwich Village Society for Historic Preservation
25 and others living in the community. This proposal

2 would stop oversized development protect the
3 residential character of the area, and protect and
4 create affordable housing. [bell] A vote in support
5 of the Tech Hub without such protections will be a
6 vote for the overdevelopment and destruction of our
7 neighborhood and for building 300-foot tall high-rise
8 luxury condos, tech offices and hotels rather than
9 appropriately scaled buildings and decent affordable
10 housing as well as protect housing and small business
11 owners. I urge you to take action on this very
12 important issue to preserve the heritage of our
13 neighborhood to protect their homes and to protect
14 and create much needed affordable housing. Thank you
15 to Council Member Carlina Rivera for your support and
16 to City Council for holding this hearing. [pause]

17 RAY ROGERS: Alright. Hi. Okay. Ray
18 Rogers. I wrote a letter to the editor that appeared
19 in the Daily News under the heading *One City Under*
20 *REBNY*. REBNY stands for the Real Estate Board of New
21 York or more appropriately for the Real Estate
22 Bullies of New York ravaging every borough of New
23 York City. REBNY's rezoning policies dictated to the
24 Mayor, Economic Development Corporation, and City
25 Department of Probation are causing extreme hardship

2 on and massive displacement of long-time residents
3 and small businesses. REBNY's rezoning policies are
4 leading to the bulldozing of our community gardens,
5 historic buildings, libraries, schools and hospitals
6 to make way for my super tall luxury high-rises,
7 large hotels, malls and absentee landlords.

8 Politically this must not facilitate but must stop
9 REBNY from running roughshod over New Yorkers. While
10 I admonish the Mayor, I applaud political leaders,
11 Congressman Maloney, Alexandria Ocasio-Cortez,
12 Assemblyman Harvey Epstein and Council Members Ben
13 Kallos, Jumaane Williams, former City Council Member
14 Rosie Mendez and yes you, Carlina Rivera,
15 Congresswoman Carlina Rivera--who I'm happy to have
16 my picture on my website with you--for standing up to
17 show--to have the guts to stand up to REBNY. All of
18 you are on the website: stoprebnybullies.org,
19 holding up this leaflet that says: Beware of REBNY
20 Real Estate Bullies Plaguing New York. Why I'm here
21 today is I've come to support the Greenwich Village
22 Society for Historic Preservation, and reasonable
23 position that the Tech Hub must be human scale and
24 include neighborhood protections. Thank you and thank
25 you Carlina.

2 ZACHARY LERNER: Thank you Council
3 Members for inviting us to share our testimony today.
4 My name is Zachary Lerner, Labor Organizer and
5 Director for New York Communities for Change for our
6 community organization representing over 20,000 low
7 to moderate income New Yorkers across the five
8 boroughs and Long Island. We are here today to urge
9 the City Council to vote on the Union Square Tech Hub
10 proposed by RAL Development. As folks know, we are
11 in a serious crisis right now here in the city. The
12 tale of two cities is only getting worse. Poverty
13 still continues to be concentrated in neighborhoods
14 that have suffered from disinvestment from decades,
15 areas like Brownsville and Mott Haven still have over
16 twice the unemployment rate as the citywide average.
17 The Union Square Tech Hub with no targeted component,
18 and only a best faith effort to reach marginalized
19 communities will do little to solve this problem. We
20 need more and better jobs in New York City. Right
21 now, the jobs that are available to people from
22 places like Mott Haven and Brownsville are often
23 minimum jobs or precarious jobs like driving for
24 Uber. This type of work makes it almost impossible
25 to provide for a family or even see them at all

2 because of the hours you have to work. It make it
3 impossible to find housing you can afford, buy
4 healthy food or live a stable life. Last year Mayor
5 de Blasio unveiled New York Works a plan to create
6 100,000 jobs, but who are these job actually targeted
7 to? The plan focuses primarily on giveaways of
8 public resources, tax breaks, air rights through
9 rezoning, through rezoning incentives and lands a
10 handful of growth industry including tech. The tech
11 industry is notorious for a lack of racial and gender
12 diversity. According to a recent Bloomberg article,
13 just 1% of Facebook and Google technical workers are
14 black. New York-New York Works relies on things like
15 the Tech Talent Pipeline and other training programs
16 in an attempt to correct this problem, but there is a
17 severe lack of investment in these things to just
18 target our local hiring and communities at the
19 highest poverty rates and unemployment. Our members
20 have gone through the Tech Talent Pipeline and have
21 been unable to find work in the tech industry despite
22 having completed the required test and course work.
23 To tackle the vast income inequality we're seeing
24 here in the city, we should not be giving away our
25 valuable public resources to private developers and

2 companies unless it really benefits the marginalized
3 communities that need it most. Union Square Tech Hub
4 currently represents an egregious giveaway of public
5 resources with little to no local benefit in return.
6 Land like this—land like this should be used to
7 reduce the disproportionately high unemployment rates
8 that black and brown youth in New York City face. It
9 should be used to reduce unemployment in the parts of
10 the city where people continue to struggle to make a
11 stable life. The Council should not approve the
12 Union Square Tech Hub [bell] Rezoning unless there's
13 real commitment by Civic Hall for 75% of all the
14 slots for the training programs. That should be
15 designated for low-income New Yorkers, and then
16 targeted hiring where 60% of the jobs that are being
17 created must be for the communities that need it the
18 most. So, we are also in housing crisis and the
19 Council should vote no unless there are common sense
20 protections put in place in the area of South Union
21 Square to protect the affordable housing in the area,
22 and not exacerbate the already high-rise. Thank you
23 so much for your time.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

2 TOM BIRCHARD: Good afternoon. I'm Tom
3 Birchard, a long-time owner of Veselka Restaurant on
4 2nd Avenue and 9th Streets. Thank you for the
5 opportunity to say a few words. My wife Sally
6 Haddock is the founder of Saint Marks Veterinary
7 Hospital, which was the first veterinary hospital to
8 open in the East Village, and it's still the largest
9 vet hospital in the Easts Village. Sally and I
10 raised three children in the neighborhood. We have a
11 very large stake in the East Village. Honestly, we
12 love it there, but we feel increasingly concerned about
13 the rapid pace of—the escalating pace of development
14 that we see especially on 3rd Avenue and 4th Avenue
15 and University Place. We've—again we—we—we love the
16 neighborhood. We feel like we have a large stake
17 there. Some time ago I started hearing the—the
18 neighborhood described as Midtown South, and tech—
19 and—I'm sorry. Silicon—Silicon Alley. I came to the
20 neighborhood in—almost 50 years ago, and had the
21 good—good luck the good fortune to meet my father-in-
22 law, start working at the Veselka. I feel in love
23 with the neighborhood. I have to say, though,
24 that's—at this point I—my family and I don't want to
25 live in—in Midtown South. We want to try to preserve

2 all the things that we love about the East Village,
3 but we're very concerned. So, I want to thank you,
4 Council Member Rivera for-for standing up for us. I-
5 I was very impressed with your opening statement, and
6 I appreciate the fact that you articulated very
7 strongly our-our concerns, and I would encourage you-
8 implore you to fight as hard as you can to-to bring
9 protections to our neighborhood. Thank you.

10 ERIC RAYMOND: Oh, thank you. What's up?
11 My name is Eric Raymond. I am an 30-year resident of
12 the Village. My wife is here. We live on 13th
13 Street. In fact, we used to shop at P.C. Richards.
14 No one else has mentioned it, but it was a place
15 where you could actually buy physical products and
16 take them home or have them delivered by a guy with
17 a-pushing them as opposed to-to the Internet. I
18 would like to commend all the speakers and
19 Councilperson Rivera who had eloquently championed
20 the importance of linking the Tech Hub to the
21 reasonable zoning-and historic preservation proposals
22 of the Greenwich Village Society of Historic
23 Preservation. I wanted to think of something to add
24 to this presentation today, and people have said so
25 many great things. So, particularly for the staffers

2 who I believe these people are staffers of the City
3 Council. I think the—it should be required reading
4 to read the cover story in last month's Harper's
5 Magazine written by New York Historian Kevin Baker,
6 and let me just read the first paragraph of that
7 story. It's called *The Fall of New York and the*
8 *Urban Crisis of Affluence*. New York has been my home
9 for more than 40 years. From the year after the
10 city's supposed nadir in 1975 when it nearly went
11 bankrupt, I have seen all the periods of boom and
12 bust since then, but I have never seen that is going
13 on now, the systematic wholesale transformation of
14 New York into a reserve of obscenely wealthy and the
15 barely [bell] here, a place increasingly devoid of
16 the idiosyncrasy, the complexity, the opportunity and
17 the roiling excitement that makes a city great. As
18 New York enters the third decade of the 21st Century,
19 it is in imminent danger of becoming something it has
20 never been before: Unremarkable. It is approaching a
21 state where it was no longer a significant cultural
22 entity, but the world's largest gated community with
23 a few cupcake shops here and there. So, I commend
24 this article to you, and I support the linkage that
25 has been proposed. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
3 all for your testimony today. I will be calling the
4 next panel. Pat Purcell, Irene Liu, Kyle Denton--
5 [background comments] Dent-Denton-Kyle. Yeah.
6 Kristen Rouse, Abigail Edgecliffe-Johnson. I think
7 we got it. [background comments, pause] Please
8 state your name for the record, and you may begin.

9 PATRICK PURCELL: [off mic] Patrick
10 Purcell, Executive Director-

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: [interposing] Push-you
12 have to push the button to--

13 PATRICK PURCELL: [on mic] Oh, right
14 here?

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: That one right there.

16 PATRICK PURCELL: That's the one that
17 just made me a lot louder. [laughter] Patrick
18 Purcell, Executive Director of the Laborers.

19 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay.

20 PATRICK PURCELL: Good afternoon. My
21 name is Patrick Purcell. I'm the Executive Director
22 of Greater New York Laborers Employers Cooperation
23 and Education Trust, Greater New York LECET. The
24 Labor Management Fund of the Mason Tenders District
25 Council representing 15,000 hard working members and

2 12,000 signatory contractors. Thank you, Chairman
3 Moya for the opportunity to testify here today before
4 the Council in support of the proposed development on
5 14th Street and Irving Place in Manhattan by
6 developer RAL, and also to Council Member Rivera.

7 Thank you so much for the attention and—and
8 seriousness that you that this. It's much appreciate
9 by everybody. [coughs] RAL has a long history of
10 building in New York City and throughout that history
11 they have always put the needs of the community and
12 the working people first. They have consistently
13 honored their commitments and provide a good paying
14 safe jobs for countless New Yorkers, city residents
15 on projects throughout the city. As we look to the
16 future and prepare for this project on 14th Street,
17 we know that they will continue their record of
18 responsible development. Working hand-in-hand with
19 RAL, our training school and programs like non-
20 traditional employment for women, Helmets to
21 Hardhats, Edward J. Malone Initiative for
22 Construction skills and Pathways to Apprenticeship we
23 can increase our opportunities for local residents in
24 construction and provide a real pathway to the
25 middle-class for hundreds of individuals in the

2 Community Board 3 through this project. Thank you
3 again for the opportunity to testify today, and we
4 urge the City Council to approve this Land Use
5 application.

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

7 PATRICK PURCELL: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: [laughs] Yes, you may
9 proceed.

10 KYLE DANTO: Thank you honorable Council
11 Members. My name is Kyle Danto and I'm speaking here
12 today as a member of a housing advocacy group Open
13 New York to express my concern regarding the
14 proposal, approval of the Tech Hub be made contingent
15 on downzoning 3rd and 4th Avenues in the Village to
16 prohibit large hotels [coughs] and cap the height of
17 residential buildings. I urge the Council to instead
18 consider an alternative rezoning under the Mandatory
19 Inclusionary Housing Law to prevent displacement and
20 build homes for some of the most marginalized New
21 Yorkers in this high opportunity neighborhood. As
22 someone who was born right on 14th Street and grew up
23 in Greenwich Village, I value and cherish this
24 community, but at the same time I value it and feel
25 that it is necessary to have inclusion and diversity.

2 For decades we have seen residents of wealthy
3 neighborhoods use exclusionary zoning to keep their
4 communities and their schools segregated causing a
5 housing shortage that has affected us all, but has
6 put low-income individuals in low-income communities
7 at their greatest peril. Job creation today far
8 outpaces home building and it is this imbalance that
9 is the driving force behind gentrification. If we
10 fail to build more homes in the Village and
11 elsewhere, the white workers employed at the Tech Hub
12 may very well move to places like Harlem, Crown
13 Heights and the South Bronx displacing tenants and
14 transforming these communities through
15 gentrification. Absent the hotels tourists will stay
16 in Airbnbs and places like the Lower East Side and
17 East Village and potentially taking up rent
18 stabilized housing. If our goal is to empower
19 tenants not just wealthy homeowners, we must allow
20 for new affordable housing to be built near jobs, and
21 transit and reducing pressure—reduce pressure on
22 gentrifying neighborhoods that leaves gentrifying
23 neighborhoods—that leaves tenants at the mercy of
24 predatory landlords. The solution must be building
25 more mixed-income housing in neighborhoods like this

2 one. Opening up opportunities for people that would
3 otherwise be shut out of the jobs and housing
4 markets. This was the driving idea behind the
5 Mandatory Inclusionary Housing Law, and we should
6 take and we should take advantage of it now. I thank
7 you for your consideration.

8 IRENE LIU: Hi. Good afternoon. My name
9 is Irene Liu and I am with the Community Service
10 Society of New York, an organization that advocates
11 for the upward mobility of low-income New Yorkers.
12 Thank you for the opportunity to share our
13 perspective on the city's proposed Union Square Tech
14 Training Center. My testimony today will be focused
15 on the potential and need for this project especially
16 in expanding access to local tech jobs among under-
17 represented groups who have been left out of the
18 city's boom tech sector. We need a more equitable
19 and inclusive approach to growing New York City's
20 tech force. Combined blacks and Latinos represent
21 just 18% of the New York City tech workforce although
22 they make up 43% of workers in non-tech related
23 industries. Furthermore, just 29% of the city's tech
24 workforce is comprised of native New Yorkers and 30%
25 of the New York City tech workforce lives outside of

1 the five boroughs. Few tech workers are community
2 from high poverty communities of color. We believe
3 that the Union Square Tech Hub holds enormous
4 potential for addressing some of the inequity and
5 diversity challenges within the city's tech industry
6 that I've just outlined. By partnering with the non-
7 profit Workforce Development providers and offering
8 scholarships that help offset the cost of digital
9 skills training programs, the Tech Training Center
10 can enable a broader range of New Yorkers to develop
11 the skills that they need to connect to good paying
12 jobs in the tech industry. However, we also
13 recommend that the city should provide publicly
14 available data on the demographic composition of
15 students participating in the training programs as
16 well as outcomes data on program completions, job
17 placements, salaries, job quality and job retention.
18 We need to ensure that the Tech Training Center is
19 serving and benefitting under-represented groups
20 especially those with low incomes, NYCHA residents,
21 women, people of color, disconnected young adults and
22 other marginalized groups. The reporting process
23 should also include data on the demographic profile
24 of for-profit tech corporations and start-ups that
25

2 will occupy workspace within the Union Square Tech
3 Hub as well as metrics, other training and hiring
4 practices. Space should not be leased to tech firms
5 who fail to demonstrate intentional willingness to
6 invest in job training and hiring of local residents
7 and marginalized workers. [bell] We urge the Council
8 to implement a formal reporting process for the Tech
9 Hub if it moves forward in approving the Union Square
10 Tech Training Center. Thank you.

11 ABIGAIL EDGECLIFFE-JOHNSON: Hi. I'm
12 Abigail Edgecliffe-Johnson. I'm a native New York, a
13 mom of two public school kids, and founder of RaceYa,
14 a startup here in New York City that makes race cars
15 that helps kids learn science and engineering. For
16 the past two years I've been a scholarship recipient
17 at Civic Hall. So, I wanted to speak in support of
18 their proposal, and I just also want to say that, you
19 know, as a woman starting my first company in New
20 York City and changing careers it's been hugely
21 beneficial for me to have the kind of community that
22 Civic Hall brings to, you know, the—the kind of tech
23 sector, right. Because there are tech hubs and then
24 there are tech hubs, and the kind of community that
25 Civic Hall attracts is this incredibly sort of

2 diverse amazing grownup community of people who are
3 working on real problems, and a lot of people that
4 are on their kind of second and third careers like
5 myself, and so the people that you meet when you are
6 working in these collaborative spaces are just a
7 totally different caliber of people. Right, you get
8 people who are teachers and veterans and activists,
9 and technologists who can really more your learning
10 and your business and your ideas forward in a way
11 that's sort of traditional tech hubs that I think one
12 of the other women was talking about in kind of
13 Seattle. I think don't, right and I think that's
14 what's so great about Civic Hall is that they are
15 very intentional about the kind of communities that
16 they build and the kind of people that they attract,
17 and the way that they are incredibly inclusive about
18 building those kinds of communities, and making sure
19 that you get people from all different walks. You
20 know, people like me who are a mom starting her first
21 company. So, and also just that I've been in a lot
22 of other co-working spaces, and they're not like
23 this, and this is really a special and incredible
24 place, and I think the more room you can give to
25 Civic Hall and the kind communities they build, the

2 more room you give New Yorkers to really grow.

3 [bell] So, thank you.

4 KRISTEN ROUSE: Good afternoon. My name
5 is Kristen Rouse, President and Founding Director of
6 the New York City Veterans Alliance, a grassroots
7 organization that often testifies in these chambers
8 pushing our city government to make New York City a
9 better place for veterans and our families. I'm here
10 to testify in support of the Union Square Tech Hub
11 and specifically in support of Civic Hall, which has
12 made the work of the New York City Veterans Alliance
13 possible. I'm a United States Army Veteran. When I
14 returned home to New York City after my third tour
15 duty in Afghanistan, I felt lost. I felt like my
16 life was on track. Civic Hall is what got my life
17 back on track, and what allowed me to find a renewed
18 sense of purpose. Civic Hall is much, much more than
19 a co-working space. It's given me the training, the
20 skills, the tools and most importantly a vibrant and
21 supportive community that has enabled me not just to
22 found an organization, build it and invite my
23 organization into a space, it's also inspired me not
24 just to make New York City a better place for veteran
25 and families, but to be part of a larger movement to

2 make New York City more vibrant, more engaged better
3 invested in our future for all of us. I am proud to
4 be part of movement to make New York City truly the
5 greatest city in the world. I've been part of New
6 York's—I've been part of Civic Hall for three years
7 now, and I have not doubt whatsoever that Civic Hall
8 will deliver, will fully deliver on transformative
9 and substantive opportunities for individuals like me
10 and individuals like so many people who are waiting
11 to tap into their potential to find a way to—to
12 really represent their communities to do better for
13 their communities and to make New York City more
14 inclusive and more representative of all of us.

15 [bell] Than you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
17 all for your--

18 KYLE DANTO: [interposing] Mr. Chair, I
19 just want to mention one other thing. As much as
20 we're here and we did testify, and we are definitely
21 in support of this project, I do want to note the
22 sympathy I have for the folks in this audience having
23 been many, many times more than not on the side
24 fighting with the Mayor these issues. So, I do want
25 to encourage the Administration to do something

2 completely uncharacteristic and actually sit down
3 with folks and continue to work through these
4 problems. I know how hard you're working at this.
5 We do support this, but, you know, again, I can only
6 hope that the Administration comes to the table, and
7 actually works with people because at the end of the
8 day it's about everybody trying to get something done
9 right.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
11 all for your testimony today. The next panel Marlene
12 Silverman.

13 FEMALE SPEAKER: She left.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: She left. Okay,
15 Shelly Fremont, Peter Feld, Rosalind Allison, and
16 Claire Martalure (sp?). [background comments, pause]
17 Martha Lure, and David Eisenbach. [background
18 comments, pause] John Santor. [pause] Thank you.
19 You may proceed. Please press the button. There-
20 there you go.

21 MARILYN SILVERMAN: Okay, better? Okay.
22 My name is Marilyn Silverman. I'm a resident of the
23 area. I've lived here since 1965, and at the risk of
24 just repeating things that other people have said, I
25 guess my though is having lived here for this long,

2 I've certainly seen huge amounts of change that have
3 happened in the area, some very amusing certainly in
4 the '60s and certainly different and unique change.
5 Change is what life is all about, and I guess my
6 thought when I consider what's going on in the
7 neighborhood around me--I live on 10th Street--is that
8 I don't think we've ever had a change that threatens
9 the sort of life force of what the area has been
10 about as much as this has, and I think that's really
11 important, and I also think that it just has to be
12 thought of not as an either/or. The Tech Hub is
13 going to do wonderful things for people, lots and
14 lots of people who need it. It's the future. We
15 have to support it. It is what it's all about, but
16 we also have to support our neighborhoods and--those
17 should not be mutually exclusive things. Thank you.

18 SHELLY FREMONT: Hi, I'm Shelly Fremont
19 and I just was wondering where is everybody? I
20 though there would be more Councilmen there or people
21 there. Anyway, I'm here today as a long-time Village
22 resident to ask you to please save our neighborhood.
23 The Village is a wonderful rare, charming
24 neighborhood. We all know it in Manhattan--[coughs]--
25 and it must be protected. I moved here in 1972 to go

1 to Parsons, and I've raised my two daughters in the
2 Village. Now I have two grandsons, and I love it,
3 and I can't imagine changing. I'm old enough to even
4 remember when Lou Chow's was there, and it just is
5 amazing to me to think of this neighborhood
6 disintegrating. I know a stroll through the Village
7 puts a smile on anyone's face, and all New Yorkers.
8 I don't think I've ever taken a leisurely walk
9 through Midtown Manhattan. It's not quite the same
10 vibe. If the Village is bloated with shrinking
11 sidewalks, and scattered skyscrapers the charm will
12 be lost forever. We won't get it back. It's
13 something we need to protect. You remember Penn
14 Station and how it was destroyed. This could happen
15 to our sacred Village. New York needs these little
16 oases of low buildings and light and air. Other than
17 Central Park there is no place like the Village I
18 mean where you can see sky as you take a walk. Now
19 is the time to save this endangered neighborhood.
20 Thank you.

22 CLAUDE MARTALURE: Hi. I'm Claire
23 Martalure, President of Co-Op and a resident of 21
24 East 10th Street for the last 39 years. I speak for
25 many in my building who unfortunately couldn't be

2 here today. I'd like first to thank the City Council
3 for their time and giving our community the
4 opportunity to express concerns about the pending
5 approval for the Tech Hub without providing the
6 necessary and much needed zoning protections for our
7 neighborhood. The Tech Hub will significantly
8 increase the out-of-character development in the
9 predominantly residential neighborhoods abutting it
10 to the south and is, in fact, already doing so. We
11 are already seeing tall office towers and large
12 hotels being planned and built in this area, which is
13 largely low to mid-rise and mostly residential in our
14 community in part because of the planned Tech Hub.
15 With many more excessively large and oversized
16 buildings to come, if the Tech Hub is to approved, we
17 have proposed a fair and reasonable solution: Allow
18 the Tech Hub on 14th Street, and at the same time,
19 provide zoning protections for the neighborhood to
20 the south to ensure the residential character is
21 preserved and that any new development is in keeping
22 with the neighborhood. For over three years we have
23 supported a rezoning plan that is reasonable, which
24 was endorsed by every elected official and both
25 community boards in the are, which would impose

2 reasonable height limits with new development
3 consistent with what's there now while providing
4 beneficial incentives for including or preserving
5 affordable housing while still maintaining the
6 predominantly residential character of the
7 neighborhood. Nonetheless, the Mayor adamantly
8 refuses to consider such options or [bell] or offer
9 any alternatives to work with our community. Thus, we
10 strongly urge you to reject the proposed Tech Hub
11 rezoning, which would irreversibly damage the
12 Greenwich Village and East Village neighborhoods
13 unless the requested neighborhood zoning protections
14 are also approved in conjunction. Thank you very
15 much for your time.

16 DAVID EISENBACH: My name is David
17 Eisenbach. I come here as a resident who lives
18 around the corner from the proposed Tech Hub on 12th
19 Street, and as a small business activist who—who had
20 to fight for the Small Business Job Survival Act,
21 which Carlina Rivera is a co-sponsor of, and we
22 expect to have a big battle this—this fall and winter
23 to pass this needed legislation for small business.
24 I really appreciated the Council Members' skepticism
25 about the impact of this Tech Hub on small businesses

1 in the neighborhood. Alright, a bunch of makers go
2 into a step-up space and having lunch in a pop-up
3 market is not New York. New York is Veselka. New
4 York is small businesses. That's the East Village we
5 love. That's why we pay the crazy rents we pay to
6 live in our neighborhood. It's about the Street, and
7 I'm tired of this Administration coming to us with
8 proposals to take away our city's resources like
9 Elizabeth Street Garden pretending that it's about
10 affordable housing for seniors. I'm tired of them
11 taking away libraries like Inwood Library, which
12 we're going to testify to fight against the rezoning
13 of Inwood, right. I'm tired of them taking-giving
14 away hospitals all saying that this is for the public
15 good when it's not. It's a cover story, and this is
16 another one of those examples. [pause]

18 JOHN SANTOR: I'm John Santor (sic)
19 Ladies and gentlemen, when you listen to me today
20 please hear my like-minded neighbors as well. Elise,
21 Setia (sic) couldn't be here because of working. I
22 am not against the proposed 14th Street Tech Hub.
23 Rather, I am for my community where I've lived for 40
24 years. Out-of-place commercial development between
25 Union Square and Astor Place is rampant. I demand

2 that fair and appropriate protections for the
3 adjacent impacted predominantly residential
4 neighborhood be enacted as part of any Tech Hub plan.
5 If such protections are not granted, we will see only
6 more out-of-scale development, luxury condos, large
7 office buildings or hotels. The Tech Hub plan will
8 make this worse. The right thing to do is to create
9 a win-win whereby the Tech Hub is accompanied by fair
10 protections for Greenwich Village and the East
11 Village as called for by Community Boards 2 and 3,
12 Borough President Gale Brewer and thousands of
13 neighborhood residents. Carlina Rivera, my
14 Councilwoman, I've followed your suggestions,
15 remained engaged and organized, attended community
16 meetings and public hearings, reached out to
17 neighbors and others, spoken, written, emailed and
18 called. Now, we need you to keep your campaign
19 pledge. I have your back, and will enlist others to
20 stand with us. Speaker Corey Johnson, Chair Moya,
21 Councilwoman Rivera, and members of the Council of
22 the greatest city in the world, you are strong and
23 have enlightened or stood up to the Mayor on other
24 issues. We need you to do that now. We need your
25 help. If and when fair and reasonable neighborhood

2 protections are in place, vote yes on the Tech Hub.

3 Win-win. That's right, that's just. Without

4 neighborhood protections, vote no on the Tech Hub.

5 Thank you. [cheers]

6 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
7 all for your testimony today. We will be calling up
8 the next panel. Santos Rodriguez, Jessie Layman,
9 Andrea Rodovillo, Joel Lobenthal, John Friedman.

10 [background comments, pause] Yeah, Santos, Jessie.

11 MALE SPEAKER: [off mic] He's not here.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Okay. Andrea. Okay.
13 Joel and John Friedman. No? [background comments]
14 Amy Harnes, Amy? Okay. [background comments/crowd
15 noise] Okay. Can we get some quiet, please?

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [off mic] [Asking
17 audience to quite down.]

18 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

19 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Good afternoon,
20 Council Member.

21 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Good afternoon.

22 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: Good afternoon,
23 Council Member Rivera. My name is Santos Rodriguez,
24 and I'm here to testify on behalf of Gary La Barbera
25 President of the Building and Construction Trades

2 Council of Greater New York and vicinity. I'm here to
3 testify on behalf of the Union Square Training Hub
4 Center located at 120-124 East 14th Street. The
5 Building and Construction Trades Council of Greater
6 New York is an organization of local building and
7 construction trade unions that are affiliated with 15
8 international unions and in the North American
9 Building Trades Unions. Our local affiliate unions
10 represent approximately 100,000 union construction
11 workers as well as advocate for all construction
12 workers in New York City. The BCTC has always
13 advocated for good paying construction jobs and
14 safety standards to protect the men and women
15 building our city. Working with direct entry
16 programs like Edward-the Edward J. Malloy Initiative
17 For Construction Skills, which I come out of, New
18 York Helmets to Hard Hat, New Non-Traditional
19 Employment for Women, we can continue to provide a
20 career path with that-within our communities. We are
21 eager to work with RAL to help qualify local workers
22 find work at the site from both Community Boards 3
23 and surrounding neighborhoods.

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] [off
25 mic] [Asking audience to please be quiet.]

2 SANTOS RODRIGUEZ: RAL has consistently
3 been committed to providing good jobs to its workers,
4 and consistently utilizes union labor for its
5 projects. The project at 14th Street will be no
6 different. If approved, this project will generate
7 hundreds of jobs paying middle-class wages. RAL's
8 commitment to a strong workforce—work—excuse me—
9 workforce is not limited to just union labor, but the
10 project itself will provide needed training so
11 workers can access the 21st Century, 21st Century
12 jobs. We thank you again for the opportunity to
13 testify in support of this project. We urge you to
14 approve it so our members can go to work. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

16 JESSIE LAYMON: Thank you. Good
17 afternoon now, and thank you Council Member Moya and
18 thank you especially Councilwoman Rivera for the
19 extensive, you know, work that you have done and all
20 of the listening you've done to your constituents and—
21 and to so many stakeholders on this project. My name
22 is Jessie Laymon. I am the Director of Policy at the
23 New York City Employment and Training Coalition.
24 We're a coalition of all of the groups in New York
25 City to provide any sort of job training, career

2 track programs, educational programs, and direct
3 placement programs to help people get good jobs, and
4 that includes organizations that provide construction
5 skills training, health care training and high tech
6 training including many of the members of the
7 Coalition that have been talked about a fair amount
8 today. We are here today to not yet take a position
9 for or against the Tech Training Center because we
10 think it has great potential to really be part of the
11 career pathway for New Yorkers into the middle-class,
12 but that potential needs to be fleshed out a little
13 bit more before it could be what it promises to be,
14 and in particular, I want to highlight a pitfall of
15 many common-similar scenarios to this that I think is
16 important that we avoid on this one. And then one
17 positive example that I would like to see this
18 project emulate. So the major pitfall and I-I heard
19 it lot today is that we must avoid short-changing the
20 community benefits by counting empty space as a major
21 public good. Space alone can be part of a solution,
22 but programming, which is what is ultimately offered
23 here, training programs that help people get these
24 tech jobs. Programming costs money. These job
25 training providers are going to have to hire new

1 trainers. They're going to have to engage in new
2 outreach efforts to members of the community
3 particularly the low-income community and the
4 communities of color that have been talked about as
5 the targets here to get into the tech sector.
6 There's going to need to be outreach to those
7 communities to get them into these jobs. All of that
8 costs money, and providing space for providers is not
9 enough. There needs to be a funding mechanism, and
10 so I want to highlight the positive example, which is
11 the South Brooklyn Marine Terminal also an EDC New
12 York Works project that just earlier this year was
13 announced where they have partnered with local CBOs
14 to provide an ongoing sustainable funding mechanism
15 for the training programs linked to the rent that is
16 being paid by the new companies that are moving into
17 that facility. That's the sort of thing that we'd
18 like to see emulated here. We really appreciate the
19 hard work that the folks at Civic Hall are doing to
20 reach out to the job training community. They're
21 talking to the right people. We need to make sure
22 that there are actual mechanisms to fund those
23 programs to fill this space and make it live up to
24 its potential. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

3 ANDREA GORDILLO: Good afternoon. Thank
4 you, Chair Moya and Councilwoman Rivera and members
5 of the Subcommittee. My name is Andrea Gordillo and
6 I'm here on behalf of Loisaida, Inc. today.
7 Loisaida, Inc. began as a grassroots movement in the
8 Lower East Side led by Puerto Rican activists,
9 artists, poets and Latino residents in the mid-70s to
10 combat—combat the effects of violence, poverty,
11 discrimination and disenfranchisement. Today, almost
12 40 years later with our Loisaida Center on 9th Street
13 and Avenue C we continue to stand firm in our mission
14 as one of the last surviving non-profit Puerto Rican
15 and Latino based cultural and multi-purpose
16 facilities on the Lower East Side. In recent years
17 we have seen the effects of gentrification in this
18 community. Loisaida has sought to ameliorate the
19 concurrent cultural—cultural erasure through
20 education, public humanities, programmatic
21 interventions as well as neighborhood wide and
22 community events such as the Loisaida Festival, and
23 recently in sponsoring some substantive neighborhood
24 based participation and impact in the New York City's
25 Cultural Plan, which the Community Board 3 has

2 resolved to support in March of this year. Today,
3 Loisaida, Inc. joins the dozens of elected officials
4 and community based organizations and hundreds of
5 local residents in support of the rezoning proposal,
6 as well as the project. We believe that the rezoning
7 proposal and the numerous community benefits
8 negotiated through the ULURP process would advance the
9 goal of cultural preservation of the dozens of ethnic
10 and working class communities that have been under
11 duress in recent years. By reinforcing the intrinsic
12 value, the neighborhood character as well as the
13 stability and retention of critical residential
14 housing affordability and a positive sum game, and a
15 win-win situation, which ensures that no one gains at
16 the other's expense as it relates to the many
17 stakeholders in the matter. Thank you all for your
18 time today.

19 JOEL LOBENTHAL: Okay, this is on. Good
20 afternoon. My name is Joel Lobenthal. I am here as
21 a downtown resident who insists that the City Council
22 approve Tech Hub only if it concurrently constructs
23 zoning and landmark protections that will safeguard
24 the surrounding neighborhood and neighborhoods. We
25 know that Tech Hub is meant to spearhead a massive

1 commercial redevelopment of the blocks to the south
2 and east, which will virtually or could virtually
3 destroy what remains of their unique character. We
4 already have seen one picturesque and historic low-
5 rise building after another in this neighborhood
6 demolished to make way for massively scaled
7 inappropriately sited condos, hotels and New York
8 University dorms. I have spent 50 years wandering in
9 the Village where I've lived most of adult life, and
10 I have seen not only the topography and the character
11 radically change and not for the better. By the way,
12 Lou Challis was mentioned with I was on my 19th
13 birthday my grandmother born in 1897 took me to
14 dinner at Lou Chow's. She had been going there for
15 60 years. Lou Chow's is gone. That whole heritage
16 continuity lineage is gone made way for us-demolished
17 to make way for another NYU dorm. Until the 1990s,
18 this northeast pocket of the Village housed many
19 small independent used bookstores where I as an
20 aspiring budding writer spent many an hour browsing
21 and too many a dollar purchasing. These book stores
22 have been seeded throughout the blocks for decades
23 before. Again, my father now 88 remembers them from
24 his student days in the 1940s. They are all gone
25

1 now, forced out by wildly inflated rents. Only the
2 Strand remains, which I believe does own its own
3 building, which is why it survives. To reiterate, no
4 zoning protections, no Tech Hub. Thank you.

5
6 Good afternoon. Thank you for allowing
7 me to speak. My name is Amy Harris. I've been a
8 resident of the East Village for 15 years, which is a
9 pittance compared to so many of my neighbors. I just
10 want to project a minute into the future and think
11 about the consequences of this decision. We-this is
12 a Pandora's box as we've heard frequently at
13 different hearings. This developer may be thinking
14 about benefits to the neighborhood, but there's no
15 guarantee that future developments and developers
16 will give the parcels of land that are in danger the
17 same consideration, and we are, in fact, and that's
18 why we need zoning protections now. We are, in fact,
19 a neighborhood. We do not aspire to be Midtown
20 itself. We support and need the small businesses
21 that are in our community. In my small area alone in
22 the last few years we have lost a butcher, a cheese
23 shop, a bookstore, a jewelry repair store, a shoe
24 repair store and a laundromat. These businesses were
25 often owned by or employed residents of the East

1 Village, a number of whom were immigrants or single
2 mothers who relied on those jobs, which are not gone.
3 The businesses that tend to go into new developments
4 tend to be chain stores. We don't need more of those
5 in our neighborhood. We need people like Jimmy's and
6 Jimmy's 43 who gives his back space for free to
7 artists every week night in order for them to develop
8 their work. We need people like Moishe from Moishe's
9 Bakery who gave coffee to first responders when the
10 buildings on 2nd Avenue sadly went down. This is
11 what we need to maintain our community, and I'm
12 scared that we will loses these small businesses as
13 landlords push them out in favor of businesses that
14 cater to tech employees and—and tourists who will be
15 flooding the neighborhood. In addition, these new
16 constituencies that will be coming to our
17 neighborhood will be transient or will only be there
18 during the day or for brief periods of time. They
19 will not engage in the civic life of this
20 neighborhood. They will not volunteer a community
21 garden. They will not sit on boards. They will not
22 speak out if a bar wants to open two doors down from
23 another bar, which has been a chronic problem for
24 this neighborhood for a number or years now. [bell]

2 We need to protect our neighborhood, and to do so we
3 need zoning protections now. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
5 to the panel. Thank you for testifying today.

6 [applause]

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [Instruction audience
8 members to use jazz hands.]

9 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: The next panel,
10 Katherine Schoonover, Marilyn Appleburg, Mary Fran
11 Loftus, Elizabeth-Elizabeth. Sorry, I can't read it.
12 Lynn--[background comments] Lanquist.(sp?) and Susan
13 Cramer. Katherine, is that you? Okay Marilyn.

14 MARY FRAN: Mary Fran.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Oh, that's what it is,
16 Mary Fran. Susan, Elizabeth. [background comments]
17 Okay. Judith Stonehill. Judith. Yep, okay.

18 [background comments, pause]

19 KATHERINE SCHOONOVER: You may begin.

20 Good afternoon. My name is Katherine Schoonover, and
21 I live in the area south of the proposed Tech Hub.
22 I'm here to express my opposition to any approval of
23 the Tech Hub unless protections in the form of
24 landmarking, or zoning or preferably both are put in
25 place simultaneously. The area in question has long

2 been largely residential with commercial businesses
3 that support a residential neighborhood. Now, we are
4 already seeing the transformation of this
5 neighborhood into a place we don't recognize, a place
6 with 300-foot tall buildings, and 300-room hotels
7 instead of the mid to low-rise residential buildings
8 that have characterized the neighborhood for decades.
9 If the Tech Hub is approved, this transformation will
10 accelerate alarmingly. It is not that the residents
11 of the neighborhood are against affordable housing.
12 Indeed, much of the housing there now is relatively
13 affordable. The Greenwich Village Society for
14 Historic Preservation has proposed a zoning change
15 that would incentivize affordable housing while
16 preserving the mid to low-rise nature of the area,
17 but the Mayor and the Department of City Planning
18 have rejected it out of hand, and said they would not
19 even consider it because it does not involve a
20 massive up-zoning, which would be a windfall for big
21 developers, a group that the Mayor seems to court at
22 ever turn. The rezoning plan that has been proposed
23 by GVSHP has been endorsed by every elected official
24 and both community boards in the area. It would not
25 only not downsize the area-down zone, excuse me—but,

2 in fact, would allow a modest up-zoning for those
3 developments that include affordable housing and only
4 impose height limits for new development consistent
5 with what's there now. I strongly urge you to reject
6 the Tech Hub rezoning, which would irreversibly
7 damage Greenwich Village and the East Village unless
8 the requested neighborhood protections are also
9 provided at the same time. Thank you, Council Member
10 Rivera for insisting on these protections [bell] as
11 an absolute prerequisite to your approval of the Tech
12 Hub.

13 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

14 MARY FRAN LOFTUS: Mary Fran Loftus. I
15 live on East 9th Street surrounded by new luxury
16 condo construction [coughing] East 11th Street where
17 five residential buildings were demolished to make
18 way for a 300-room hotel and the Death Star, which in
19 the current Harper's Magazine Kevin Baker describes
20 as "The single worst act of vandalism in New York
21 since the original Pennsylvania Station was torn
22 down." For years along with thousands of local
23 residents, Community Boards 2 and 3 and every local
24 elected official I have urged Mayor de Blasio to
25 approve common sense protections for Greenwich

2 Village and the East Village south of Union Square
3 where oversized and largely commercial development is
4 destroying the character of the neighborhood. The
5 Tech Hub plan will only make this worse. I am here
6 today to insist that until Mayor—the Mayor approves
7 fair protections for the surrounding neighborhood,
8 you do not approve the Tech Hub ULURP. If this
9 project passes, construction will likely take place
10 during the extended L Train shutdown. Chances are
11 that those activities will restrict part of 14th
12 Street causing further stresses to our community. As
13 a New York City taxpayer and voter, I urge you to do
14 the right thing: Create a win-win in which the Tech
15 Hub is accompanied by the appropriate protections for
16 Greenwich Village and the East Village. In 2008—in
17 2010, although we desperately needed such
18 protections, they were denied us. A decade later, we
19 need them even more. Thank you.

20 ELIZABETH LANGUIS: That's on? Hi. I'm
21 Elizabeth Languis and thank you for allowing us to
22 testify here today and for holding this hearing. In
23 this beautiful room I'm inspired by the quote that's
24 above you from Abe Lincoln: A government of the
25 people, by the people, for the people, and I only

2 home that Mayor de Blasio is listening to that quote
3 because it's clear from the testimony we've heard
4 today that the people and the residents of the area
5 around the Tech Hub are demanding protection for the
6 great-[bell] for the Village and for our area. I'm a
7 long-term resident of 4th Avenue and 12th Street, and
8 during the time that I've lived there, I've witnessed
9 the ravages of all the inappropriate development on
10 the fabric and texture of our neighborhood stating
11 with the canyon of dormitories including a 26-story
12 dormitory on East 12th Street that destroyed a
13 historic church to now the current development of
14 Moxy Hotel tearing down five historic rent stabilized
15 apartment buildings, and the last thing that we need
16 is a party hotel and that's the last thing we need in
17 that neighborhood. What we need is affordable
18 housing. What we need are residents. What we need
19 is common sense development and zoning protection.
20 I've also witnessed the loss of a couple of long-
21 standing stores, small businesses just in the last
22 few months. A hardware store that had been in the
23 neighborhood for 20 years or more has not disappeared
24 as well as a dry cleaners that's been there for at
25 least 20 years, and instead, what we see is a

2 proliferation of fast food joints that are no cash
3 that clearly are not catering to the residents of the
4 neighborhood, but catering to the people who work in
5 the Tech Centers and so none of that is supporting
6 our neighborhood or the residents. So, I thank you
7 for hearing. I thank you for your support of our
8 desires and what we need for neighborhood, and urge
9 you to not approve the Tech Hub without any
10 accompanying protections for our area. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

12 JUDITH STONEHILL: Do I have to raise
13 this? Yeah. Thank you. I'm Judith Stonehill a long-
14 time Village resident [coughs] and as a Village
15 neighbor I ask the City Council to protect our
16 historic neighborhood from out-of-scale commercial
17 development from 300 tall office buildings and as so
18 many have aid 300-room hotels in the East Village and
19 Greenwich Village. I strongly urge you to reject the
20 Tech Hub rezoning proposal unless protections are
21 provided for the adjacent village neighborhoods.
22 [coughs] As a village homeowner for many decades, I
23 can attest to the importance of protecting and
24 preserving our much loved community. There's a very
25 real danger that our neighborhood will lose its

2 unique and irreplaceable character unless it's
3 protected by the member of the City Council. There
4 is a win-win proposal on the table. Allow the Tech
5 Hub on 14th Street, provide zoning and/or landmark
6 protections for the neighborhood to the south to
7 ensure that its character [coughs] is preserved. A
8 new development is in keeping with that neighborhood.
9 Thank you.

10 SUSAN CRAMER: Hello. My name is Susan
11 Cramer. I've lived on 14th Street for over 40 years.
12 Hard to believe, but—and I was co-chair of Union
13 Square Community Coalition from 2001 to 6, and—but
14 more recently I have co-founded a tech expo and
15 forum. I am very much in favor of encouraging growth
16 in this sector, and actually, I'm in favor of the
17 Tech Hub itself, but the city should not give this
18 away while also allowing a zoning free-for-all that
19 will forever change the character and charm of the
20 neighborhood. The out-of-scale new building on
21 University Place is a perfect example. I dread
22 seeing what chain retail is going in there replacing
23 the small businesses like the newsstand, the bowling
24 alley where our kids played [pause] pizza—the pizza
25 place, you know, where people had invested in the

2 neighborhood and who knew us and who knew our kids
3 and watched them grow up. There is no going back
4 once these buildings are built. Those—those little
5 places that we loved are gone forever. The warmth
6 and community will be gone forever, and you will have
7 sold the soul of the Village for what? Thank you to
8 Council Member Rivera for standing for sensible
9 zoning protection and for representing our
10 constituents so well. I hope all of your fellow
11 Council Members will follow suit. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
13 all for your testimony today. We'll be calling the
14 next panelists. [background comments] Tipper Adams,
15 Steve Hendrick, Joyce Ravitz, Scott Hobbs [background
16 comments] Baca Tina Jones. [background comments,
17 pause] Thank you. Brittany Armstead. [background
18 comments, pause] Thank you. Who will start? You
19 need to just state your name.

20 BRITTANY ARMSTEAD: Good afternoon, Chair
21 Moya and members of the Subcommittee on Zoning and
22 Franchises. My name is Brittany Armstead. I am here
23 as a representative for Tech NYC. Tech NYC is a non-
24 profit. Tech NYC is a non-profit trade group with the
25 mission of supporting the tech industry in New York

2 through increased-increased engagement between our
3 more than 630 members, the New York government, and
4 the community at large. We work every day to make
5 New York the best place to start a tech company, and
6 to cultivate a robust technology ecosystem here. New
7 York City's tech ecosystem is currently the fastest
8 growing job sector in the state of New York. With
9 more than 326 jobs, New York City's tech ecosystem is
10 the third largest in the nation, and has generated
11 consistent job growth since 2010. The Tech Training
12 Center will furnish crucial affordable space for
13 training providers and community partners. It will
14 provide countless local residents the opportunity to
15 develop the skills and knowledge needed to succeed in
16 the ever-growing tech industry, an industry offering
17 stable high paying jobs. The center will also
18 provide space for local businesses and entrepreneurs
19 helping to further stimulate the local economy.

20 Community Board 3's unconditional vote in favor of
21 the project is indicative of the fact that residents
22 of Community District 3 will undoubtedly benefit from
23 this project and the opportunities it will provide.

24 As the tech sector continues to grow, we must ensure
25 New Yorkers of all backgrounds are provided

2 opportunities to benefit from and to drive this
3 sector's growth. The Union Square Tech Training
4 Center represents an innovative and important step
5 towards accomplishing this goal. Tech NYC is support
6 of this proposal, and we believe in the center's
7 ability to serve as a vital job training resource for
8 residents of New York City. Thank you for your
9 times.

10 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

11 SAHARA: Good afternoon, Chair Moya and
12 Council Member Rivera. My name is Sahara, and I'm a
13 member of 32BJ. 32BJ is the largest property service
14 union in the country representing 80,000 service
15 workers across New York City and more than 163,000 up
16 and down the East Coast. Our union supports
17 responsible developers that invest in workers and
18 economic justice, and so I am here today to offer our
19 support for RAL's proposal at 124 East 14th Street
20 where RAL has committed to creating high quality,
21 permanent building service jobs that would support
22 working families. These jobs will provide families
23 sustaining wages and benefits that will allow workers
24 at 124 East 14th to continue to call New York home.
25 I work as a security guard at the World Trade Center,

2 and I know first hand how life changing a prevailing
3 wage job can be. To this end, I want to share that
4 RAL's commitment to providing good building service
5 jobs extends beyond this site to the broader
6 portfolio. RAL has a historic relationship with 32BJ
7 and we are proud to work in partnership with them to
8 strengthen labor standards and communities throughout
9 New York City. The Union Square District known for
10 its diverse economic activity is an example of how
11 New York neighborhoods can flourish when we work
12 together to ensure inclusive development. We believe
13 that the many investments and good jobs and workforce
14 that are planned for the Tech Hub site will continue
15 this trend and help support equitable economic
16 growth. For these reasons, we urge you to approve
17 this project. Thank you.

18 STEVEN HERRICK: Good afternoon. I'm
19 Steve Herrick, Executive Director of the Cooper
20 Square Committee. I'm here to urge the City Council
21 condition its approval of the ULURP Application for
22 the propose 21-story Tech Hub on a commitment by the
23 Mayor to rezone the 3rd and 4th Avenue Corridors.
24 Community Board 3 vote to approve the ULURP
25 Application with five conditions, two of which were

2 related to mitigating the impact this development
3 project will have on the 3rd and 4th Avenue Corridors
4 to the south. The Cooper Square Committee counsels
5 and organizes tenants in the East Village and Lower
6 East Side, and we see first hand the intense
7 displacement pressures that rent stabilized and
8 market rate tenants are facing on a daily basis. We
9 have already seen five tenement buildings at East
10 11th Street torn down to make way for the 285-room
11 Moxy Hotel. We've analyzed data for the 58
12 properties in the 30-in the 3rd and 4th Avenue
13 Corridors, and found that 78% of them have a
14 commercial FAR of 2.0 or less. It had been 90% of
15 them before the Moxy Hotel development broke ground.
16 The growing problem with the zoning for the blocks
17 between East 9th and East 13th Street allows for a
18 6.00 commercial FAR, which is substantial, and it
19 places many low-rise residential buildings in the
20 area at risk of demolition—demolition and
21 redevelopment as office buildings. There are 1,018
22 residential units in 3rd and 4th Avenue corridors.
23 Eight-eight are rent stabilized according to DHCR
24 records. Not only are all of these tenants at risk
25 of displacement for the community through harassment

2 in demolition of their homes, but the tenants paying
3 fair market rent in smaller unregulated buildings
4 also have no right to a lease renewal and can be
5 forced to move upon expiration of their leases, which
6 will make it easy to empty the buildings and demolish
7 them to build new office buildings for the growing
8 Silicon Alley south of East 14th Street. It be gross
9 negligence for the city to approve this ULURP
10 application without taking the appropriate step of
11 rezoning the adjacent the residential area whose
12 zoning currently favors commercial development and
13 does not fit the built environment. This needs to be
14 rectified right away. The Cooper Square Committee
15 recognizes the Tech Hub has the potential to bring a
16 variety of benefits to the community, but all these
17 benefits will be outweighed by the damaging impact
18 that the tech industry will bring to the area to the
19 south. I urge you in the strongest terms to link any
20 approval of this ULURP application to the rezoning of
21 3rd and 4th Avenue Corridors in order to provide
22 protections for the surrounding neighborhood. Thank
23 you.

24 SCOTT HOBBS: Good morning. My name is
25 Scott Hobbs and I serve as the Deputy Director at the

2 Union Square Partnership, and community based non-
3 profit that works to better the Union Square 14th
4 Street residential and business communities. I'm
5 here on behalf of our Executive Director, Jennifer
6 Falk to express our support of the proposed Tech
7 Training Center. Union Square is already an
8 epicenter for New York's growing tech and
9 entrepreneurial sectors. Home to a long list of
10 recognizable companies such as Drop Box, Hulu,
11 BuzzFeed, Master Card, IBM, We Work and more. Today,
12 over 22,000 individuals are employed by technology
13 and professional service firms located in the Union
14 Square district, and we have seen first hand the
15 positive impact these companies and their employees
16 have had on our community. It's supporting the more
17 than 890 ground floor restaurants and retail
18 establishments, many of which are small businesses or
19 independent operators who are investing time and
20 resources in community projects and programs. We
21 believe that once open, the Union Square Tech
22 Training Center will engage, train and employ a
23 population that is equitable and truly representative
24 of our city. The project will build on the strength
25 of our tech sector arming more New Yorkers with the

2 digital skills and knowledge to succeed in the 21st
3 Century workforce. In addition, the Center will
4 provide space for growing tech firms and foster civic
5 innovation. This project will promote collaboration
6 among our technology workforce development, education
7 and non-profit sectors. On behalf of the Union
8 Square Partnership, I would like to thank the members
9 of the City Council for their careful consideration
10 of this application, which our organization believes
11 will create lasting benefits to our community, the
12 city and the tech industry as a whole. Thank you.

13 VALENTINA JONES: Hi. My name is
14 Valentina Jones, and I'm the President of the Lower
15 East Side Power Partnership. Our mission includes
16 education, training, and affordable housing on the
17 Lower East Side. It is vital that you consider
18 written commitments or goals for training and job
19 opportunities for the residents of Manhattan
20 Community District 3. Approximately 30% of our
21 resident have household incomes under \$20,000 while
22 nearly 25% earn more than \$100,000. What we're
23 advocating for is at least a total of 30% for
24 employment at every level, and that would be say 10%
25 below 60% of the AMI, 80%, another 10% below 80% and

1 another 10% below 120%. These income criteria will
2 determine looking at NYCHA and Mitchell Lama, et
3 cetera. We also would like that same consideration
4 in terms of some type of written commitment to Civic
5 Hall and the digital skills training. So, we think
6 there's a potential, but we would like to have it in
7 writing. Our community has seen a variety of
8 developments come and say that there was going to be
9 great community benefits and jobs to everybody, and I
10 don't know a soul that has gotten this. The
11 community feels I think somewhat helpless, and as
12 you'll see with this picture one of the things that
13 very often happens with these tech hubs is that while
14 there's a \$113,000 that people make, that's 10% that
15 are actually black or Hispanic. Where you see the
16 big portion of black and Hispanic workers, 58% made
17 \$19,000 in the non-tech type jobs, the supportive
18 jobs that are involved. So, what we're asking for is
19 some type of written commitment for our community. I
20 think that if we look at gentrification indicators we
21 see rising incomes, changing racial composition,
22 shift in commercial activity and displacement of
23 original residents. We have a city that is very
24 frightened of this kind of thing happening and, you
25

2 have the opportunity. [bell] You can—you can do
3 something now that I think would be much more about
4 inclusive growth, and I think that that I think would
5 be beneficial for people of New York City not just on
6 the Lower East Side, but throughout the city that
7 these types of things are happening. So, hopefully
8 you will take advantage and do something that is very
9 positive and that will have a positive mental health
10 aspect on people throughout the city.

11 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. [pause]

12 JOYCE RAVITZ: [off mic] Good afternoon.

13 Touch--?

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Push the button.

15 JOYCE RAVITZ: I thought I did.

16 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Yeah.

17 JOYCE RAVITZ: [on mic] Yeah. Good
18 afternoon, Chairman Moya and my friend Carlina, and
19 everyone else in the room. My name is Joyce Ravitz.
20 I'm the Chairperson of Cooper Square Committee, an
21 organization that has been working for Lower
22 Manhattan tenants for 59 years. Cooper Square
23 Committee knows that the Tech Hub can benefit our
24 community in many ways. Office space renting below
25 market rate could bring hundreds of jobs to our area.

2 Thousands of low-income residents many from the Lower
3 East Side and Chinatown could get digital training
4 and learn skills they need to enter professional
5 workforce if what is proposed actually happens. But,
6 all of these advantages will be undermined by the
7 ways the tech industry will damage the adjacent area
8 to the south. The Tech Hub as planned, would
9 exacerbate, over-overdevelopment in the residential
10 East and West Village neighborhoods. We must protect
11 the surrounding neighborhood, its tenants and small
12 businesses. I urge you as a longstanding tenant as
13 someone who has worked for many years to preserve and
14 increase affordable housing to save the small
15 businesses essential to the distinctive character and
16 history of this neighborhood. I urge you to link any
17 approval for hub-for this Tech Hub project to the
18 three ULURP applications that will rezone 3rd and 4th
19 Avenue corridors in order to provide protections for
20 the surrounding neighborhoods. Others have testified
21 today how affordable housing would be hurt by this
22 rezoning unless you the City Council can make it
23 impossible for large hotels and big box stores to be
24 built on the 3rd and 4th Avenue Corridors. The Cooper
25 Square Committee sees on a daily basis how the

2 displacement pressures that rent regulated and market
3 rate tenants face. The City Council must follow
4 through on its commitments to the tenants and small
5 business owners who depend on you. Approval of this
6 ULURP action please take necessary step to rezone the
7 residential area in the 3rd and 4th Avenue Corridors,
8 stop large commercial developments, and no rezoning
9 of 14th Street for a Tech Hub that would exacerbate
10 over-development in the residential West and East
11 Village neighborhoods to the south should be
12 approved. A tech hub without neighborhood protection
13 is completely unacceptable. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
15 all for your testimony today. I'll be calling up the
16 next panel. Monica Ridderspoon-soon-spoon? Hendrick
17 Dewart. [background comments] Martin Tesler, Tim
18 Tucker, Barbara Nevins-Taylor [background comments,
19 pause] Tim Tucker? [background comment] No Tim
20 Tucker. Okay, Barbara Nevins-Taylor. No? Hendricks
21 Dewart, Monic Veja. Monica? Yep. Okay. Kathleen
22 Huller, Trevor Stewart. No Kathleen? [background
23 comments, pause] Giada, Lobin Maskie, Giada. No?
24 Sigfried Zelt. No. Phillip Porter? No. Jay Oliver.
25 Allison Greenberg.

2 ALLISON GREENBERG: [off mic] Here.
3 Allison. Okay. [background comments] Kristen
4 Theods, Kristen. You? [background comments] We
5 have—do we have Cornelius Chekhan (sp?) Yes.
6 [background comments, pause] Trevor Stewart. That's
7 you okay. Okay. So, if you could just state your
8 name, we can begin.

9 MONICA RIDDERSPOOR: Hi. I'm Monica
10 Ridderspoor. I'm a lifelong East Village resident.
11 Please vote no on this protections for the Greenwich
12 Village and East Village neighborhoods directly
13 adjacent to this Tech Hub between Union Square and
14 Astor Place are agreed to by our Mayor who many of us
15 are very disappointed in him not coming to the table
16 on this. Please encourage him to do so. Thank you.

17 TREVOR STEWART: My name is Trevor
18 Stewart. I've lived in the Village for 36 years.
19 Most of my career has been around technology. In
20 that sense I'm a huge supporter of the Tech Hub. I
21 think it will bring jobs. I think it will bring
22 prosperity to New York. However, this cannot be done
23 at the cost of basically destroying what is a low-
24 rise residential and small business neighborhood. I
25 want to firstly, just join with what GVSHP'S position

2 is. I think I'm not going to repeat it, but I think
3 MG Berman and his team made an outstanding
4 presentation in terms of the possibilities that are
5 open to the Administration, and I support that fully.
6 I also want to thank you, Councilwoman Rivera for
7 your principled stand on this matter. It's—it's
8 greatly appreciated. It's unconscionable that the
9 Mayor refuses to engage with neighbors while paying
10 lip service to affordable housing, and meanwhile
11 providing nice breaks for his buddies in real estate.
12 Please stand up against the Administration and do not
13 vote for this Tech Hub unless it is—unless adequate
14 protections are in place for the Corridor. Thank
15 you. [background comments]

16 ALLISON GREENBERG: [off mic] My name is—
17 Is this on? [on mic] my name is Allison Greenberg.
18 I'm a Villager, idealist, a political club member, a
19 voter, a taxpayer, a lawyer who represents working
20 people every day, people who are of color, women who
21 are sick, who are vulnerable, I support unions. But
22 let's face it, we go through this dance each time
23 there is a controversial land use project opposed by
24 the people—is the clock running? Do I get two
25 minutes?

2 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: It's okay.

3 ALLISON GREENBERG: It's like at four
4 seconds. We go through this dance each time there's
5 a controversial-thank you-land use project opposed by
6 the people who live and work at or near the
7 development site. Each time the developer does its
8 dog and pony show in the public forum like here, but
9 importantly the developer really relies on backroom
10 lobbying, access and influence that the public does
11 not have. We rely on local non-profit groups who do
12 such wonderful work, but let's face it, how can they
13 contend with lobbyists, unions, good people who show
14 up in T-shirts because they have to and they care,
15 and we're not challenging you. I think we're all
16 really united. We're probably all united today on a
17 national level. It's a shame that we have to be
18 divided at a city level at this time. The argument
19 is always in favor of union jobs, diversity, and
20 other compelling interests. We need Councilwoman
21 Rivera, Chair Moya. Sadly, the members who left
22 today didn't sit to listen to all of the testimony
23 that's been going on for hours. They read, they
24 spoke, they asked really good questions, but sadly
25 after sitting here for ten years of these hearings, I

2 know that those great questions that the Council
3 Members asked they generally do not act on. They
4 don't act on the answers that they get, and we're
5 asking for you, Council Members to show integrity to
6 do the right thing. I'm here for the Inwood people
7 who are going to be speaking his afternoon against
8 what's happening to their neighborhoods as well. I'm
9 here for Greenwich Village. I'm here for the city.
10 We are at a critical juncture. We are begging you
11 don't be jaded. Don't just tell yourselves this is
12 it, the deal is done. We believe in you. We support
13 you, but we need you to surprise us. We need you to
14 surprise your constituents, your fellow New Yorkers.
15 Say yes to your community. No to bad development. As
16 an employment lawyer, I'd like to say that when I see
17 Millennials standing up for seniors in the tech
18 industry, I will be very much in favor of a tech job-
19 a Tech Hub with conditions, but I haven't seen it
20 yet, and I'm hoping to see it. I want to see young
21 people standing up for people 40 and older because
22 they-these people, our seniors need protection, and I
23 don't see it really happening in a Tech Hub as is.
24 So, please do the right thing. We thank you for your

2 service, and we're asking you to support this
3 Village. [bell] Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you.

5 KIRSTEN FIEDOS: Hi. Good afternoon. My
6 name is Kirsten Fiedos. I live on East 14th Street
7 two blocks away from the proposed Tech Hub. While
8 the idea of bringing new jobs to the community is
9 welcome, the Tech Hub will accelerate already rampant
10 out-of-scale commercial development and luxury
11 apartment towers in the surrounding area. The real
12 estate industry has already labeled the area the next
13 Silicon Alley. I along with thousands of other New
14 Yorkers call this area home. This predominately
15 residential neighborhood needs common sense zoning
16 protections that would place reasonable limits on the
17 height of new developments and encourage the
18 preservation and retention of affordable housing.
19 The unintended consequences of not rezoning the area
20 around the Tech Hub will make it increasingly less
21 affordable to long-time residents and small
22 businesses, ultimately causing mass displacement. In
23 order for the Tech Hub to happen, the city must—the
24 city-owned land needs to be rezoned. If the Mayor is
25 really committed to preserving and creating

2 affordable housing then the surrounding areas should
3 also be rezoned or where recommended by our
4 preservation experts landmarked. In 2015, the City
5 Council approved the rezoning for the Saint John's
6 Terminal site, but after community outcry included a
7 series of neighborhoods protections such as
8 landmarking the final phase of the Greenwich Village
9 Historic District, air rights restrictions and
10 eliminating all planned big box and destination
11 retail stores. I applaud then Council Member Corey
12 Johnson who made clear to the Mayor that the only way
13 he would get his approval for the rezoning would be
14 to include neighborhood protection. Regarding the
15 Tech Hub and rezoning the block south of Union Square
16 to limit development, now Corey Johnson said, "I know
17 that area. It's right on the border of our district.
18 To me, I think it makes sense knowing that area,
19 seeing the developments going on there." And I'd
20 like to thank Speaker Johns for lending his very
21 important voice to this discussion. It is my hope
22 now that my Council Member Carlina Rivera honors her
23 campaign pledge and votes no on the Tech Hub rezoning
24 unless the city agrees to the necessary protections

2 for the affected neighborhood to the south. Thank
3 you. [bell]

4 CORNELIUS SHEEHAN: Good afternoon,
5 everyone. Good afternoon City Council members. Thank
6 you for your time dedicated to this matter. My name
7 Cornelius Sheehan. I was born in Saint Vincent's
8 Hospital, which is now a residential property. I
9 began my early life on Horatio Street. I'm proud of
10 my New York heritage and I'm sensitive to
11 neighborhood integrity. I'm a rank and file member
12 of Local Union No. 3, which is affiliated with the
13 Building and Construction Trades Council of New York
14 City, and I am here to support responsible
15 development for the 14th Street Technology Center.
16 The history of RAL Developers and the building trades
17 of New York expresses an understanding critical to
18 the relationship employing skilled trades people who
19 are properly compensated for their education and
20 experience. The workforce—this workforce combination
21 is an unbeatable working partnership that expedites
22 production with capabilities to resolve unexpected
23 conditions and circumstances that face many
24 construction projects. With the knowledge of this
25 history, I am confident that RAL will continue its

2 tradition of hiring union building trade contractors
3 who agree to pay—who agree to—who agree to good pay
4 for workers with an acute responsibility of the real
5 needs of the immediate neighborhoods and communities
6 of New York City. Lastly, I'd just like to answer a
7 question earlier from Council Member Rivera to—to the
8 RAL representatives. I can only speak for Local 3,
9 and part of the hiring practices in Local and Local 3
10 hires locally and hires with a high diversity. Thank
11 you.

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
13 all for your testimony today.

14 KIRSTEN FIEDOS: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: I will be calling the
16 next and last panel. Fria Ramanathan, Ramanathan;
17 Dale Rabuzzi. [background comment] Daniel Rabuzzi,
18 Kate Kirkland, Jerry Weinstein. [background comments,
19 pause] Are there any other members of the public
20 that wish to testify? Okay, thank you. [bell]
21 [background comments, pause] Welcome. You may begin.

22 PRIYA RAMANATHAN: Well, good. Thank
23 you.

24 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Just
25 state—state your name.

2 PRIYA RAMANATHAN: It's been a long day
3 for everyone. Thank you so much for this time. My
4 name is Priya Ramanathan. I'm the Program Director
5 at Per Scholas. I'm here to tell you how state of
6 the arts should be a small part of the Civic Hall at
7 Union Square's Digital Skills Training Center, and
8 the value we believe it will bring to the community.
9 Per Scholas has been a New York Institution for over
10 20 years providing free technology training, and
11 career development services to over 500 New Yorker
12 each year helping them to launch successful careers
13 in the city's growing tech sector. As Per Scholas
14 continues to grow, we see this project as the logical
15 future home for a Manhattan based program location.
16 We are currently in the South Bronx and Bed-Stuy,
17 which has not been as successful, and you probably
18 heard from John who is one of our graduates who spoke
19 earlier today. Per Scholas is committed to helping
20 curious and motivated job seekers from all over New
21 York City. Most of them are extremely under-represented
22 and in the tech industry. More than 90% of our
23 students are people of color and a quarter are women.
24 About a third of our students are young adults and a
25 third are immigrants. The average household income

2 of our students is about \$21,000 and about 70% of our
3 students are out of work at the time that they enroll
4 in our program. More than half of our students do
5 not have any college experience let alone four-year
6 degrees. Our program provides job seekers the unique
7 opportunity to gain a foothold in the growing tech
8 sector where they can earn higher salaries, decrease
9 their need for public assistance, become financially
10 stable and lead happier and healthier lives. Per
11 Scholas has many of the student relationships with
12 organizations like Henry Street, Chinese-American
13 Planning Council and the Door. They refer candidates
14 to our program, and we refer students to them for
15 additional wrap-around services. We actually have a
16 young adult bridge program called Tech Bridge to help
17 us enroll more young adults 18 to 24 in our program.
18 With our new location at Civic Hall we hope to—we can
19 hopefully grow these programs, and we can provide
20 even more opportunities for upscaling and career
21 steps to thousands of our alumni who live and work in
22 the area. Civic Hall Union Square Project presents a
23 unique opportunity for us to further our mission of
24 enabling all New Yorkers to become full fledged
25 digital citizens. Thank you.

2 DANIEL RABUZZI: Well, good afternoon.

3 Name is Daniel Rabuzzi. I'm the third generation in
4 Lower Manhattan. My parents lived and work in Union
5 Square. I live on Grand Street in the Lower East
6 Side, and I am delighted that you are my Council
7 Member, Councilwoman Rivera. I am, however, speaking
8 to you today as the Executive Director of Mouse. We
9 are the youth tech organization that Civic Hall
10 founder Andrew Roche founded in Union Square 22 years
11 ago. For us this would be coming home. We are now
12 active in 94 public schools across five boroughs. We
13 are deeply involved in the entire CB3, the entire
14 area there. For us this is crucial for the young
15 people. I'm really thinking of, you know, the young
16 people that are at the Island School, right on East
17 Houston who live in Baruch Houses, who live in
18 Vladeck Houses, the people who, in fact, are not here
19 at these hearings. I said at CB3. It's always
20 interesting. We're talking about young people.
21 Mouse, by the way we work as young as second and
22 third grade all the way through 12th Grade. Okay, we
23 are, in fact, the youngest, the ones who absolutely
24 need to get in. They're not here at these hearings.
25 So, just pause for a minute. While we've heard from

2 a lot of us, like myself where I'm the older end of
3 the spectrum, what I'm talking about with Mouse, I'm
4 representing the young people in our district who
5 don't have access to computer rated design, to
6 computer science, to virtual reality, augmented
7 reality. These are the 21st Century competency
8 skills. The other point is proximity. We work
9 closely with Per Scholas. We work closely with CUNY.
10 The ability to be all together so the young person
11 and whoever we all are right, they want to know, hey
12 I can go from here to there and we're all there to
13 help them, and ultimately, and this is the real key
14 and I think this is Andrew Roche's real genius with
15 Civic Hall is it will have employers in the same
16 building. It is not enough. I've got space all over
17 town, but there--it's far away from where the
18 employers are. I work closely with the employers.
19 They're on my board, right all the tech companies,
20 the established and the newcomers. They want to
21 mentor, they want to have internships. They want to
22 have it happen at their space. One of the most
23 important things about this and why I would urge you
24 to go ahead and approve this is so that the young
25 person from Baruch Houses can have a mentorship, a

2 hop scotch away on the M14, okay, and get the skills
3 [bell] that they need for 21st Century. Please
4 approve this.

5 KEITH KIRKLAND: Hello. Okay. [coughs]
6 Hi, thanks for having me. My name is Keith Kirkland
7 and the CEO and Co-Founder of WareWorks and at
8 WareWorks, we build products and experiences that
9 communicate information through touch. Our first
10 product is called Wayband and it's a wearable and
11 haptic navigation device for the blind and visually
12 impaired. Basically, we figured out a way to guide a
13 person to end destination using only vibration and we
14 helped the first person run a New York City marathon
15 without any type of assistance back in November.
16 We're also part of the Entrepreneurs and Residents
17 Program at Civic Hall, and we did all of that work
18 sitting in Civic Hall's office space. We couldn't
19 afford to be in New York. We still can't afford to
20 be in New York. We actually had to move our offices
21 over to New Jersey because that was the place that we
22 could find the best deals for our company. One of
23 the things that I believe that this Tech Center at
24 Civic Hall will bring to the community is access to
25 opportunity. I'm also born and raised in Camden, New

1 Jersey. It's one of the most dangerous and poorest
2 cities in the country, and so I know first hand what
3 it's like to not have opportunity and not have access
4 to opportunity. I'm sitting here speaking in a place
5 that most of the people that I grew up with will
6 never, ever have the opportunity to be, and for me it
7 really looks toward the future and what we're capable
8 of bringing by equalizing the playing fields that
9 everyone who has the ability and who has the drive
10 can acquire the skillset that they need. I'm also
11 ridiculously excited for what this is going to do for
12 people of-of-with disabilities. We spent most of our
13 time working with blind people, 70% unemployment
14 rate, median incomes across the country are about
15 \$37,000 a year, and we see a huge opportunity to give
16 them access to tech tools that will allow them to
17 participate more inclusively in this 21st Century
18 that we're creating. So, for that, I highly vote
19 that we-we get this thing approved. Thank you.

21 JERRY WEINSTEIN: I'm Jerry Weinstein,
22 and it's an honor to address City Council. Each week
23 I profile a different Civic Hall member for our in-
24 house publication and after viewing about 100
25 members, I think I've cracked their DNA. Almost

2 everyone in this community some mixture of activist
3 and entrepreneur that is whether our members are
4 working with the homeless population, veterans, LGBTQ
5 youth, a mental health or public education, they not
6 only organize protests, butt hey work on solving
7 concrete problems. They build resilience. As an
8 ambassador, I get to work closely with founders and
9 orgs to connect them with opportunities and in my
10 professional life to help them best tell a story that
11 inspires and amplifies. What's happening just this
12 week tells you how we're living our mission. At
13 lunch today, what is left of it, two of our projects:
14 Street Lives New York City and Human.New York both
15 working with the city's homeless or having a public
16 discussion on building with the community. Tomorrow
17 night the founder of Yonio here on a summer
18 fellowship is offering a woman's health workshop on
19 pelvic pain, and on Thursday night Pluto, a start-up
20 I proudly advised, kicks off a monthly Meetup on
21 building diverse and inclusive workplace cultures.
22 The novelist Dave Eggers recently penned an op-ed in
23 the Times point out how the West 47th Street Trump
24 Administration was atypical in its lack of support
25 for culture. Go figure. He wrote, "Culture expands

2 the moral imagination. It makes it impossible to
3 accept the dehumanization of others. When we are
4 without art, we are diminished people, myopic,
5 unlearned and cruel. I think this applies equally to
6 what we do at Civic Hall. Our members who are equal
7 parts activists and entrepreneur in effect using art
8 and commerce not only for ferociously raising their
9 voices, but building solutions with their communities
10 and seeing them scale. With your support, we will
11 continue to expand the civic imagination. [bell]

12 CHAIRPERSON MOYA: Thank you. Thank you
13 all for your testimony today. One—one last time are
14 there are there any more members of the public who
15 wish to testify? Seeing none, I now close the public
16 hearing on this application, and LUs 144, 145 and 146
17 will be laid over. We will begin the Inwood Rezoning
18 hearing in about five minutes. I would like to take
19 this opportunity to thank the members of the public
20 who came here to testify. My colleagues, we've been
21 joined Council Member Rory Lancman and, of course,
22 always the great staff in our Land Use Division. I
23 thank you all for attending today's hearing. This
24 meeting is hereby adjourned. [gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date July 25, 2018