

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

----- X

July 18, 2018
Start: 11:47 a.m.
Recess: 11:58 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams
Inez D. Barron
Costa G. Constantinides
Chaim M. Deutsch
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Rory I. Lancman
Stephen T. Levin
I. Daneek Miller
Francisco P. Moya
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Carlina Rivera
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 [sound check, pause][background comments]
3 [gavel]

4 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, alright.
5 Good morning everyone. [background comments] Good
6 morning everyone and welcome to the Committee on Land
7 Use. I am Council Member Rafael Salamanca, Chair of
8 this Committee. I want to welcome my colleagues who
9 are members of this committee and are present today.
10 We have Council Members Gibson, Barron,
11 Constantinides, Lancman, Levin, Reynoso, Richards,
12 Torres, Treyger, Grodenchik, Chair Adams, Diaz, Chair
13 Moya and Rivera-[background comment] and Deutsch. I
14 want to thank Chair Moya and Chair Adams and Acting
15 Chair Deutsch for their work on our Land Use
16 Subcommittees. Today, we'll be voting on a number of
17 items referred out of our subcommittees. We'll be
18 voting to approve LU 143, the Application by Vida
19 Mexicana doing business as Papacito for a revocable
20 consent to operate a sidewalk café at 223 Dyckman
21 Street in Council Member Rodriguez's district in
22 Manhattan. We'll be voting to approve LUs 154, the
23 application to designate the Coney Island Riegelmann
24 Boardwalk in Council Member Treyger's district as a
25 scenic landmark. Congratulations Council Member

2 Treyger. [cheers/applause] The designation consists
3 of the boardwalk extending from West 37th Street in
4 Coney Island to Brighton 15th Street in Brighton
5 Beach including the Beach Front Boardwalk a structure
6 walkway, comfort station, railing, beaches, light
7 fixtures steps and ramps to the beach. Steeplechase
8 Pier and the beach beneath the boardwalk extending
9 from the north edge of the Boardwalk southerly
10 approximately 100 feet into the beach. The Coney
11 Island Boardwalk is one of the best known waterfronts
12 in the world, and has given people of all economic
13 and social background access to the beach since 1923.
14 We'll be voting to approve LUs 158 the MHP Hope Homes
15 Cluster Amendment for property in Council Member
16 Perkins' and Ayala's district. This amendment to a
17 previously approved application is necessary to
18 correct an error in the resolution, the exemption
19 area was identified as one property comprised of
20 Block 1750, Lots 57 and 58. The correction is to
21 identify each property separately as Block 1750, Lot
22 57 and Block 1750, Lot 58. We'll be voting to
23 approve LU 159 the East 90—the 490 East 181st Street
24 application for property located in Council Member
25 Torres' district in the Bronx. HPD seeks approval of

the new Article XI Tax Exemption for a period of 40 years pursuant to Section 577 of the Private Housing Finance Law. The subject property is existing—is an existing 24-unit residential cooperative building for low-income households with 23 occupied and one vacant unit. The prior tax exemption will be terminated.

We'll be voting to approve LU 160 the 1130 Franklin Avenue Tax Exemption Application for property located in Council Member Gibson's district in the Bronx.

HPD seeks approval of a 40-year—of a new 40-year Article XI tax exemption for an existing 20-unit co-op low-income families with 14-occupied and six vacants—vacant units. The prior tax exemptions will be terminated. We'll be voting to approve LUs 161,

the small homes. We have NYCHA SQVH plus the two amendments for property in Council Member Adams' district. This amendment to a previously approved application is necessary to correct an error in the resolutions. In this case, part of the project area

was identified as 147-06 Sutter Place. The correction is identified as 147-06 Sutter Avenue. We will be voting to approve Preconsidered LU Friendset

Apartments for property located at 2911 West 36th Street, in Council Member Treyger's District in

2 Brooklyn. HPD seeks a partial Article XI tax
3 exemption for a period of 30 years for an existing
4 259-unit building. The prior tax exemption will be
5 terminated. Are there any questions or remarks from
6 members of the committee? Council Member Treyger.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you so
8 much, Chair Salamanca.

9 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you so much
10 Chair Salamanca for your unwavering support and to
11 all my colleagues on this committee and to the
12 amazing Land Use staff as well. This is a day that I
13 think many of my colleagues know I waited for quite
14 some time. I want to recognize Councilman Deutsch
15 who worked with me on this issues of landmarking the
16 boardwalk from day one, and I just want to thank the
17 thousands of people that signed petitions, organized.
18 This effort was done without a conservancy. This
19 effort was done without a lobbyist. There were no
20 millionaires that banded together to preserve this
21 structure in Coney Island. This is done the old
22 fashioned grass-grassroots way, and this is a
23 structure, as I had mentioned in the Subcommittee I
24 want to thank the Landmarks Chair Adrienne Adams for
25 her support. As I noted there, it's important for my

2 colleagues to also to remember that that space where
3 the boardwalk is on, was not always publicly owned
4 and accessible to people. Prior to the boardwalk
5 being constructed, that beach was—was owned by
6 private entities that did not allow all people to
7 enter. There is segregation based on, you know,
8 people of color cannot enter certain amenities. Jews
9 cannot enter at certain hotels. So, when the city
10 purchased that land and at the turn of the 20th
11 Century, constructed that boardwalk, it was a symbol
12 of integration and accessibility for all people
13 regardless of the color of your skin, the faith that
14 you believe in, where you're from, what language you
15 speak, how much money you have, this treasure, this
16 public treasure is for all, and I am just so proud
17 that finally we are joining the rants of Central
18 Park, Prospect Park. Southern Brooklyn has a
19 beautiful jewel as well, the Coney Island Boardwalk.
20 So, I thank my colleagues. I ask them please to
21 support this. The council has been so supportive
22 from the beginning. We have unanimous support in the
23 resolution. So, I just—I just ask my colleagues to
24 please support this. Let's make the Coney Island

1 COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

8

2 Boardwalk officially a landmark in New York City.

3 Thank you so much.

4 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Congratulations,
5 Council Member. Are there any other comments from
6 members of the Committee? No. Seeing none, I will
7 now call the vote in accordance with the
8 recommendations of the Subcommittees and the local
9 members to approve LUs 143, 154, 158, 159, 160, 161
10 and Preconsidered LU Friendset Apartments. Will the
11 clerk please call the roll.

12 CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk,
13 roll call vote Committee on Land Use. All items are
14 coupled. Chair Salamanca.

15 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

16 CLERK: Lancman.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

18 CLERK: Constantinides.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

20 CLERK: Grodenchik.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all

22 but I do want to know, Mr. Chairman, who was Mr.

23 Riegelmann. That's my question for the day.

24 Congratulations to you Mark on this magnificent work

25 for New York City Parks. Thank you. Aye on all.

2 CLERK: Gibson.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
4 briefly explain my vote?

5 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Council Member
6 Gibson to explain her vote.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Chair
8 Salamanca and good afternoon to all of my colleagues.
9 I am voting aye on all items on today's agenda, but I
10 especially want to recognize Council Member Treyger
11 for his relentless and tireless efforts, his passion
12 on behalf of the residents of Southern Brooklyn. I
13 love Coney Island and certainly wish you well, and
14 continued success and it's really a great honor to
15 see the Coney Island Boardwalk recognized as a
16 historical landmark in our great city. So,
17 congratulations. I hope we're all welcome to join
18 you at—at a disco event, silent disco event at Coney
19 Island. That would be great, but I wanted to in
20 particular speak in support of Land Use No. 160,
21 which is the 1103 Franklin Avenue Article XI Tax
22 Exemption for the next 40 years. This is a small
23 HDFC in the Morrisania community of my district that
24 through a lot of challenge is able to maintain their
25 HDFC status. So, I'm very grateful for the

2 shareholders of 1103 Franklin that came to me some
3 time ago about their passion about working with the
4 City of New York to maintain their equity, and I hope
5 that through this Article XI we're able to fill the
6 building because we do have a number of vacancies,
7 and I want to recognize the HDFC Coalition for their
8 support, HPD as well as all the residents of 1103
9 Franklin, and with that, Mr. Chair, I vote aye on
10 all, and congratulations colleagues.

11 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Congratulations,
12 Council Member Gibson.

13 CLERK: Diaz.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Aye on all.

15 CLERK: Barron.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
17 explain my vote?

18 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Council Member
19 Barron to explain her vote.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Mr.
21 Chair. I just want to comment on the Coney Island
22 being landmarked. As my Council colleague has said,
23 Council Member Treyger, it's very important that we
24 not omit significant history as we go through these
25 kinds of landmarks naming and preservation, and I

2 believe that the Commission is required to do that
3 kind of investigation and include it in its report.
4 I did not see it in its report, but I do want to
5 commend my colleague for bringing mention during the
6 Subcommittee meeting that yes this was a property,
7 this was an area that conducted discrimination and
8 segregation, and now we are able to say that it is no
9 longer bound by those kinds of restrictions, but I
10 think that it's important that we remind the
11 commission that they should do extensive research and
12 include it in their official report so it's a part of
13 the written record, and with that, I vote aye on all.
14 Thank you.

15 CLERK: Deutsch.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: [off mic] Aye on
17 all.

18 CLERK: Levin.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [off mic]
20 Congratulations Council Member Treyger. Aye on all.

21 CLERK: Miller.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye on
23 all.

24 CLERK: Reynoso.

1 COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

12

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Congratulations
3 to Council Member Treyger and ditto on Barron's
4 speech. Aye on all.

5 CLERK: Richards.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [off mic]
7 Congratulations [on mic] to Council Member Treyger.
8 We don't have to landmark the Rockaways boardwalk for
9 it to be-believed to be the best boardwalk in New
10 York City, but kudos to you. Congratulations. Aye
11 on all and I vote aye.

12 CLERK: Torres.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Congratulations
14 Council Member Treyger, and the legacy you achieved,
15 and I vote-I happily vote aye on all.

16 CLERK: Treyger.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I think there's
18 no question how I'm voting, but I vote aye on all.

19 CLERK: Adams.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: As was said
21 yesterday in the hearing, Council Member Treyger,
22 kudos to you and congratulations. Of course Coney
23 Island and the infamous boardwalk is near and dear
24 and should be near and dear to every New Yorker.
25 Congratulations. I do vote aye on all.

2 CLERK: Moya.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Congratulations to
4 our good colleague Council Member Treyger on this
5 endeavor and I will be voting aye on all.

6 CLERK: Rivera.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yeah, Mark, I'm
8 so happy for you. Congratulations. I vote aye on
9 all.

10 CLERK: By a vote of 17 in the
11 affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions,
12 all items have been adopted by the committee.

13 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, I would
14 like to thank the members of the public, my
15 colleagues, counsel and Land Use staff for attending
16 today's hearing. This meeting is hereby adjourned.
17 [gavel]

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date July 30, 2018