

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

June 27, 2018

Start: 1:11 p.m.

Recess: 6:11 p.m.

HELD AT: Benjamin N. Cordozo  
School of Law Brookdale Center  
Jacob Burns Moot Court, Room 55  
Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10003

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Fernando Cabrera  
Costa G. Constantinies  
Chaim M. Deutsch  
Ruben Diaz, Sr.  
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.  
Peter A. Koo  
Stephen T. Levin  
Mark Levine  
Carlos Menchaca  
I. Daneek Miller  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan J. Richards  
Deborah L. Rose  
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Polly Trottenberg, Commissioner  
NYC Department of Transportation, DOT

Andy Byford, President  
Metropolitan Transportation Authority, MTA

Eric Beaton, Deputy Commissioner for Transportation  
Planning and Management, NYC Department of  
Transportation, DOT

Rami Metal, Director of Strategic Engagement  
NYC Department of Transportation, DOT

Dennis Fulton, Inspector  
Transportation Bureau, New York City Police  
Department, NYPD

Peter Cafiero, Chief of Planning Operations Planning  
New York City Transit, NYCT

Julianne Bond, 14<sup>th</sup> Street Coalition

Judy Pesin, 14<sup>th</sup> Street Coalition

David Marcus, 14<sup>th</sup> Street Coalition

Bill Borak, 14<sup>th</sup> Street Coalition

Paul Nahous, 14<sup>th</sup> Street Coalition

Arthur Z. Schwartz, Legal Counsel

Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President

Breece Peer Appearing for:

New York State Assembly Member Richard M. Godfried

Chelsea Yamada, Transportation Alternatives

Terri Cude, Chair of Community Board 2 Manhattan

Chris Sander, GM, Citi Bike Appearing for Motivate

Jeffrey LeFrancois, Director Operations & Community  
Affairs, Meat Packing Business Improvement District

Zach Miller, Chairman Metro Region Government Affairs  
Committee, Trucking Association of NY

Monica Bartley, Community Outreach Organizer  
Center for Independence of the Disabled New York

Shamber Dulles, Student, John Jay College

Stephanie Burgos-Veras, Riders Alliance

Alex Wood, Riders Alliance

Christine Berthet, Community District 4

Laura Tenebaum, Kenmare Street Little Italy

Lawrence Shire, CB6, Transportation Committee

Matthew Robinson, Resident West 16<sup>th</sup> Street 7<sup>th</sup> Ave.

Thomas Jones, Ex-Air Traffic Controller

Thomas Jones, Resident of 20<sup>th</sup> Avenue

Larry Aranson, Resident of 20th Avenue

Neal Goodwin, Resident of 12<sup>th</sup> Street & 7<sup>th</sup> Ave.

Michele Campo, Battery Alliance of Neighbors

Morna Lawrence, Little Italy and Kenmare Loop

Jackson Fisher-Ward appearing for:

Harvey Epstein Assembly Member, 74<sup>th</sup> District

Steven Fromewick, Resident of West 15<sup>th</sup> Street

Susan Finley, Co-Director, Flatiron Alliance

Judy Cline, Representative, Ruben Museum of Art  
Ruben Museum Education Center & Headmaster Winston  
Preparatory School

Michael Walsh

Gwynn McHugh

Janet Charleston, Resident at 132 West 15<sup>th</sup> Street

Robert Boddington

2 [background comments] [gavel]

3 CLERK: Quiet, please.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good afternoon,  
5 everyone. First of all, I apologize for being a few  
6 minutes late. I was coming back from the cemetery  
7 where we have buried that young person killed in the  
8 Bronx. And as you know, transportation is bad  
9 especially when we're driving. So, welcome to day's  
10 offsite hearing of the City Council Transportation  
11 Committee. I am Ydanis Rodriguez, the Chair of the  
12 Committee. Thank you to Yeshiva University, the  
13 Cordozo Law School for hosting us and helping us  
14 bringing government to the people. First, let me  
15 recognize Speaker Corey Johnson for his great  
16 leadership not only in transportation, but for many  
17 issues in our city. As we know, his district will be  
18 deeply affected by the L Train shutdown, and his  
19 bills also we'll be hearing in order to address DOT  
20 and MTA L Train mitigation plan. I will given him an  
21 opportunity to deliver his opening statement, and  
22 Corey Johnson.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you Chair  
24 Rodriguez. Good afternoon. I want to thank you all  
25 for joining us today. I want to thank Commissioner

2 Trottenberg and President Byford for being here to  
3 testify at this important hearing. Just about every  
4 New York City is aware by now that the L Train will  
5 be shutting down in April of 2019 for no less than 15  
6 months. Understandably, New Yorkers on both sides of  
7 East River are getting more and more anxious about  
8 what some are calling the L Pocolypse. I understand  
9 their concerns, and I share them. I ride the subway  
10 all the time and I frequently ride the L Train.  
11 There's actually an L Train entrance on the block  
12 that I live on. I ride—it runs through my district.  
13 It runs across town. So, even people who don't live  
14 along the L Train, use the L Train. Its closure is  
15 going to be a huge loss for the system and going to  
16 severely affect the entire city. Unfortunately, this  
17 shutdown comes at a time when people's trust in  
18 public transit and the MTA in particular is already  
19 low. I'm not breaking any news here by saying that  
20 the subway system has had many challenges recently,  
21 and people are fed up. I'm fed up. That's why we  
22 need to go into this fully prepared, and why we need  
23 to do everything we can to ease the pain that this  
24 will cause straphangers and residents along the  
25 corridor alike. We have to ensure that throughout

2 this project every step is done with transparency and  
3 accountability in mind. To be clear, this is not the  
4 city Council's plan. We don't own this plan. We  
5 have been briefed on the plan and have worked with  
6 the Administration and the MTA on it, but we will be  
7 absolutely dogged in our oversight, and focused like  
8 a laser on this project from day one until the last  
9 day in month 15, and I think I speak for everyone in  
10 New York City when I say it better be a hard stop at  
11 15 months, and not go longer than that. I would like  
12 to thank the MTA and DOT for the planning that they  
13 have already done and for their efforts that they've  
14 made to hear community concerns on this issue. I've  
15 already made some progress [mic static] on concerns  
16 around accessibility for New Yorkers, and I want to  
17 say here and now that I support the most recent [mic  
18 cut out] announced this week for the Busway on 14<sup>th</sup>  
19 Street. I sincerely hope that flexibility that is  
20 shown in this issue [mic cut out] is a sign of things  
21 to come, and I understand the need for more bike  
22 lanes 14<sup>th</sup> (sic) [mic cut out]. It's clear that a  
23 number of cyclists in the area will greatly increase  
24 throughout the shutdown [mic static] and I hop we  
25 continue to work together as this process continues.

2 Even with these positive steps, I think we can all  
3 agree there are no perfect solutions here. There  
4 will be significant disruption to straphangers and to  
5 residents. That is my primary concern. Mitigating  
6 the pain for these subway and bus riders,  
7 pedestrians, cyclists and neighborhood residents, but  
8 I'm also deeply concerned about how traffic is going  
9 to impact the quality of life for all of the groups  
10 that I just mentioned. That's why I'm proposing  
11 legislation [mic cut out] -2018 an ombudsman for this  
12 project and create at least one information center in  
13 the two boroughs impacted by this closure in  
14 Manhattan and Brooklyn. This legislation is a  
15 starting point in terms of the level of  
16 communication, accountability and transparency, the  
17 Council expects from both the MTA and the DOT [mic  
18 cut out] a resolution (sic) of this [mic cut out]  
19 We're going to have some tough questions here today.  
20 Think of it as tough love. I'm here and my  
21 colleagues in the Council are here to get into the  
22 weeds. We're going to get wonky today. We'll get to  
23 specific questions later, but we want to know some of  
24 the following things: Exactly how many people an  
25 hour can the buses move on 14<sup>th</sup> Street at rush hour.

2 How does that compare to what the L moved during rush  
3 hour. What is HOV enforcement on the Williamsburg  
4 Bridge going to look like? What's the plan on  
5 traffic control on side streets around 14<sup>th</sup> Street  
6 with traffic control agents and also on Delancey  
7 Street? How many enforcement agents do we have? Can  
8 they move around and be deployed in a flexible way as  
9 needed? What hours are they there? Who's in charge  
10 of them? Do we need an increase? How are we  
11 planning for traffic enforcement agents in the  
12 surrounding affected neighborhoods? What are doing  
13 ton encourage commuters to use bikes? What are we  
14 doing to promote safe riding as the number of  
15 cyclists grow? We're doing this because we need to  
16 be ready. Better ask these questions now than in  
17 April of 2019. This will be a crisis for hundreds of  
18 thousands of New Yorkers many of whom are already not  
19 huge fans of the MTA to put it mildly. The bottom  
20 line is that the L Pocolypse shutdown is coming.  
21 That's why we need to be ready. We need to get this  
22 right. We need to get this right for commutes and  
23 straphangers who rely on the L Train everyday. We  
24 need to get this right for the businesses along the L  
25 that depend on public transit to survive. We need to

2 get this right because this is one of any number of  
3 major challenges facing New York City public  
4 transportation at the moment, and we need to prove  
5 that we can handle big challenges when it comes to  
6 getting New Yorkers around our city. I would just  
7 like to end with this: We had a hearing on the L  
8 Train shutdown I believe in December of 2017, and at  
9 that time, I asked a lot of questions, which you'd  
10 consider to be parochial questions related to the  
11 residential blocks off of 14<sup>th</sup> Street in my own  
12 Council District and concerned about congestion and  
13 what is going to happen. I want to be clear, and I  
14 should have I guess been clear at that moment in  
15 time. I had to come back about a half hour later to  
16 clarify my comments, that my issues about traffic on  
17 the side streets is not in anyway about protecting  
18 motorists. To me, it's about how is that traffic  
19 going to impact pedestrians, cyclists, people that  
20 live on those blocks, emergency vehicles that need to  
21 get through, how are we going to ensure that safety  
22 is a priority if we have a crush of vehicles.  
23 Overall, of course, I support congestion pricing to  
24 disincentivize cars from into Manhattan, and creating  
25 a dedicated revenue stream for the MTA increasing

2 rapid bus transit, protecting cyclists and  
3 pedestrians. That is what I support in an overall  
4 way, but the questions that we have today are  
5 specific about how this is going to impact the entire  
6 city, and I—I'm not just concerned about the district  
7 that I represent. I'm concerned about Brooklyn as  
8 well. I'm concerned about the east side of  
9 Manhattan, and I'm concerned about all the affected  
10 areas. So I look forward to hearing the answers to  
11 those questions today, and I thank you, Chair  
12 Rodriguez for chairing this hearing.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,  
14 Speaker. Before I continue, I'd like to announce the  
15 Council Members who are here Council Member Deutsch,  
16 Reynoso, Salamanca, Levin, Cabrera, and Rivera.  
17 Today's important oversight and legislative hearing  
18 address the plan for the city and the MTA have  
19 developed and continue to develop to deal with the  
20 upcoming closure of the Tunnel, the tunnels that  
21 carries the L Train between Brooklyn and Manhattan.  
22 The Transportation Committee held a hearing—held a  
23 hearing in December of 2017 and since then, the DOT  
24 and the MTA have hosted town halls in Brooklyn and  
25 Manhattan and have updated their mitigation plans. I

2 hope that the new person in charge for the New York  
3 City Transit take this as the opportunity to New York  
4 City how the MTA will be more transparent on how we  
5 do projects, and how we will reduce costs and how  
6 projects will be done on time. This significant  
7 damage to the Canarsie by Hurricane Sandy, the tunnel  
8 that carries the L Train between Manhattan and  
9 Brooklyn is forcing us to close the tunnel and,  
10 therefore, shut down train service in order for the  
11 MTA to make necessary repairs. Beginning in April of  
12 2019, the tunnel will be close for 15 months, and the  
13 L Train will not operate into or in Manhattan  
14 affecting over 400,000 New York City and visitors  
15 everyday. Unlike other subway lines and tunnels that  
16 have since shut down such as the R Train tunnels in  
17 2013 and 2014, the L Train does not have nearby lines  
18 to add as alternatives. So, this shutdown will be  
19 even more disruptive than the other closures the city  
20 has endured. That's why it is so important for the  
21 city and the MTA to have a comprehensive and detailed  
22 plan for allowing New Yorkers to get where they need  
23 to go during this major disruption. It will take  
24 many different modes of transportation for the  
25 mitigation plan to be successful. You heard from the

2 Speaker some of the great ideas that we have at the  
3 Council including extra service on other subway  
4 lines, ferry service, additional space bikes and  
5 pedestrians and, of course, shuttle buses in Brooklyn  
6 across the Williamsburg Bridge and in Manhattan with  
7 dedicated bus lanes and the strict enforcement to  
8 make sure that the buses are not stuck in traffic.  
9 While this shutdown will be tough on L Train riders  
10 and residents or affected areas, we need to make sure  
11 that the city and the MTA are doing everything they  
12 can to adequately develop and execute the mitigation  
13 plan keeping New Yorkers engaged and informed  
14 throughout the process. The city and the MTA has  
15 already worked with the communities that will be  
16 affected, and we know that this collaboration has  
17 continued and will continue throughout the shutdown  
18 and we look forward to hearing more about that  
19 collaboration today. Today, we are also hearing two  
20 bills introduced by the Speaker Corey Johnson that  
21 aim to ensure continued public engagement throughout  
22 the shutdown. The first bill requires DOT to  
23 establish at least one community information center  
24 in each of Manhattan and Brooklyn. This center will  
25 provide the public whether commuters, residents or

2 business owners with information and resources about  
3 the shutdown plans. The second require--requires DOT  
4 to designate a person to monitor and receive and  
5 resolve common and comments and complaints about the  
6 major transportation project including the L Train  
7 shutdown. Additionally, we are hearing Resolution  
8 377-3-7-7 introduced by Council Member Espinal, which  
9 calls on the Governor and the MTA to commit to prompt  
10 transition to electric bus fleets, and to commit to  
11 using electric buses a significant part of its  
12 replacement service during the L Tran shutdown. The  
13 environmental impact of the shutdown be lessened as  
14 much as possible, and I would like to invite the  
15 sponsor of the resolution--is Rafael here? No.  
16 Prepared statement. So, with that, I would like to  
17 thank you, and I would like to welcome the  
18 Commissioner Trottenberg and New York City Transit  
19 Pres--President Byford and the other representatives  
20 of DOT and the MTA who are here with us today. Thank  
21 you for being here with us. I now will have the  
22 Committee Counsel to administer the affirmation, and  
23 then invite President Byford and the Commissioner  
24 Trottenberg to deliver their opening statements.

2                   LEGAL COUNSEL: Please raise your right  
3 hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole  
4 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony  
5 before this committee and to respond honestly to  
6 Council Member Questions?

7                   PRESIDENT BYFORD: I do.

8                   COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I do.

9                   CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You may begin.

10                  COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [off mic] It's  
11 just myself. I'm going to kick this off and we'll go  
12 back between us. Good morning Speaker Johnson and  
13 Chairman Rodriguez and members of the Transportation  
14 committee-

15                  SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] I don't-  
16 Commissioner Trottenberg, they-is someone controlling  
17 the volume to the-I want to make sure the audience  
18 can hear you, the folks that-

19                  CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing] A  
20 little bit closer, If you don't mind.

21                  COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Is it-can you  
22 hear me now?

23                  SPEAKER JOHNSON: Not really.

24                  COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [background  
25 comments] Alright, how about that? Can you hear me

2 now? [background comments, pause] No, yes?

3 Alright, well, I'll speak as loud as I can--

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] there  
5 you go. That's better.

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --and  
7 hopefully it will work.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: There you go. You  
9 know, pleased to be here on behalf of Mayor de  
10 Blasio, joined today with Eric Beaton our Deputy  
11 Commissioner for Transportation Planning and  
12 Managing-Management and Rami Metal, Director of  
13 Strategic Engagement. We're also joined by Inspector  
14 Dennis Fulton from the NYPD. Glad to be here with  
15 New York City Transit President Andy Byford. We--  
16 you've received--the Council has received written  
17 testimony from DOT, but what Andy and I have been  
18 doing that we think has been more useful than written  
19 testimony is to give you a visual presentation of the  
20 plan. So, we're going to do that together and then  
21 at the end, we'll offer the city's views on the  
22 Speaker's legislation. So, with that, I'll turn it  
23 over to my colleague.

24 ANDY BYFORD: Okay, thank you,  
25 Commissioner. Can everyone hear me okay? This mic

2 still seems to be working. And so, good afternoon.  
3 First of all, Speaker Johnson and Chairman Rodriguez  
4 and members of the City Council Transportation  
5 Committee, all City Council representatives and  
6 absolutely members of the public who are here today.  
7 I'd like to thank you and enforce what Commissioner  
8 Trottenberg just said. We—we do—we are appreciative  
9 of this opportunity to address you today, and I look  
10 forward to working productively with you to transform  
11 transit in this great city. What—I'm just going to  
12 make a statement, which it's deliberately done to  
13 contextualize what I say, particularly in the light,  
14 Speaker, of what you just said and rightly said about  
15 the need to get this project right, but one further  
16 bit of context, I've worked in Transit for 29 years.  
17 I've faced various challenges on three continents. I  
18 think it's no exaggeration to say that this would—  
19 will without question be the biggest logistical  
20 customer service and community challenge certainly  
21 that I've ever faced, and I think that the MTA with  
22 the exception of recent times of Super Storm Sandy  
23 itself. This will be without question our biggest  
24 logistical challenge. We simply, as you said, we  
25 must get this right. So, just if you'd bear with me

2 just a little bit of context. When I took on this  
3 roles, which is just over six months ago now, I did  
4 so knowing that it will be the toughest job in world  
5 transit right now. It is obvious to me that we need  
6 to modernize New York City Transit from top to bottom  
7 our infrastructure, our processes, and the prevailing  
8 culture to give this city the world class public  
9 transit that it needs and deserves and to that end,  
10 within 100 working days of my arrival, my team  
11 developed to launch and fast forward the plan to  
12 modernize New York City Transit, which the counselors  
13 have before them on-on their-on their desks. This is  
14 a comprehensive plan that addresses all aspects of  
15 our operation. It provides a vision of what is  
16 possible in the near term and over the next five to  
17 ten years with buy-in and strong support from all  
18 stakeholders. These stakeholders include city, state  
19 and federal agencies, elected officials, our labor  
20 partners, the contracting community, our customers  
21 and/or New Yorkers. The plan is anchored around the  
22 four priorities of equal merit that I cited on my  
23 very first day. Namely, number one, the complete  
24 modernization of the subway including expedited re-  
25 signaling of all lines through our capacity and to

2 transform subway liability this work stream will  
3 build on the existing action plan and will deliver a  
4 new customer focused station management model later  
5 this year. A comprehensive station renewal program  
6 over the life of the plan, and sustained focused on  
7 such basics as effective service management and  
8 service cleanliness. Equal Priority Number 2: A  
9 reimagined bus network including exponentially better  
10 service management, increased bus prioritization  
11 measures and a comprehensive review of all 371 bus  
12 routes. Equal Priority No. 3: Concerted progress  
13 towards making the subways as accessible as possible  
14 within the shortest possible timeframe. Within five  
15 years, no customer will be more than two stops from  
16 an accessible station and an accelerated program will  
17 deliver accessibility to 180 more stations within the  
18 currency of our plan, and Priority No. 4: And during  
19 equal—I'm sorry—ensuring an enduring culture change  
20 to harness the passion and pride of all NYC CT-CT  
21 staff to deliver world class customer service.  
22 Implementing this plan will be neither quick, cheap,  
23 nor easy, but it is what we need to do to keep New  
24 York moving, and to correct decades of  
25 underinvestment. The plan will need funding. It

2 will require bilateral support, and it will require  
3 New Yorkers' patience while we under the work, but  
4 the pain will be worth the gain. If we do nothing,  
5 or if we put this off for future years, it will  
6 become ever more difficult and ever more expensive to  
7 deliver. If you haven't yet had an opportunity to  
8 review the plan, I invite you to do so. We've made  
9 copies available to you today, and it can be accessed  
10 by the MTA website, and I will be happy, Mr. Speaker,  
11 to return at a later time to provide a full  
12 presentation to yourself and to Chairman Rodriguez if  
13 you believe that will be useful. Turning to today's  
14 proceedings you have asked Commissioner Trottenberg  
15 and I to discuss our plans to mitigate the impact of  
16 the L Line Tunnel Reconstruction Project. As you may  
17 know, preparatory work for that project is currently  
18 under way with the actual tunnel work, as you said,  
19 due to begin in April 2019. The tunnel reconstruction  
20 will take approximately 15 months to complete, and  
21 there is both an incentive and a punitive penalty  
22 regime in place to focus our contractor on timely  
23 completion. Last December, MTA Managing Director  
24 Ronnie Hakim, provided an update to this committee  
25 on the project, emphasizing our close collaboration

2 with the NYC Department of Transportation to mitigate  
3 the inevitable inconvenience the project will impose  
4 on our L Line riders, and our unprecedented level of  
5 outreach to all stakeholders in advance. Let me  
6 assure you that our collaboration and outreach  
7 efforts are ongoing and they will continue for the  
8 duration of this critically important repair and  
9 resiliency project. Commissioner Trottenberg and I  
10 have prepared a slide presentation that details the  
11 components of our Service Mitigation Plan during the  
12 tunnel reconstruction, and I will get to that  
13 momentarily. We will be happy to answer any  
14 questions you may have and Peter Cafiero and my  
15 colleague to my right who is Chief of Planning  
16 Operations Planning for NYCT. He's also here to lend  
17 his expertise to our discussion. So, as I turn to  
18 the presentation, I would really like to thank the  
19 Commissioner Trottenberg and the DOT whose  
20 cooperation with us has been exemplary. They are our  
21 partners in this, and we could not have put this plan  
22 together without them, and thus Polly will articulate  
23 with your leadership and the positive way in which  
24 you've always gone about this massive challenge. Onto  
25 the presentation. So, and hopefully folks can see

2 towards the back. I mean there's a lot of detail on  
3 this slide, but this first—this first slide is a  
4 cross-section of the L Line Tunnel, the tunnel that  
5 connects Brooklyn and Manhattan and to the East  
6 River, and while you might think that a tunnel is just  
7 that, that it's just a—just a concrete structure,  
8 it's way more than that and it was severely damaged  
9 during Super Storm Sandy some 7 million gallons of  
10 salt water flooded the tunnel during Super Storm  
11 Sandy, and that really damaged the infrastructure and  
12 system that it can take within the tunnel. As a  
13 railman and with 29 years of experience, water is bad for  
14 railways. Saltwater is particularly bad because it  
15 has an enduring, ongoing accelerating, corrosive  
16 quality to it, and that's particularly bad when you  
17 consider what's in the tunnel where you have cable in  
18 there. There's communications cables, there's power  
19 cables, there's fire cables, all of which are  
20 contained within what we call duct banks, and a duct  
21 bank is a concrete structure. If you imagine a  
22 concrete rectangular box through which there are  
23 boreholes and the cables are normally protected  
24 within those holes through the lengths of duct bank.  
25 Normally, that's fine, that's great because that

2 protects against for example of rats gnawing at the-  
3 at the cables. Well, in Super Storm Sandy because  
4 that tunnel was flooded almost to the very top of the  
5 tunnel, that saltwater has invaded every aspect of  
6 that tunnel. It's gone into the duct banks, and it  
7 has—as the—as the water receded, the salt hardened  
8 into it's almost like concrete and has not only  
9 completely blocked up those duct-duct banks, but the  
10 corrosive nature of the saltwater is now attacking  
11 and continues to attack the duct bank-duct banks, the  
12 track and the various other equipment within the-  
13 within the tunnels such that although we're keeping  
14 safe, and we wouldn't be operating if this tunnel  
15 wasn't safe. We took some immediate remedial work.  
16 If we do nothing that tunnel will just degrade, and  
17 it will be eventually become inoperable. So, we have  
18 to do this work. So, what does it entail? 7,110  
19 feet of concrete lining, installing all of these new  
20 systems, ripping out track work, ripping out  
21 concrete, reconstructing 30,000—over 30,000 feet of  
22 concrete duct banks. So, this is no small job even  
23 with the 15-month duration. This is a lot to do.  
24 That is a huge challenge that faces the contractor  
25 not least because everything you rip out you've got

2 to remove, and then you have to get the new equipment  
3 installed within the tunnel. So, that's the context.  
4 In terms of the actual tunnel reconstruction just one  
5 quick reminder. For whatever reason, some people  
6 still seem to think that the whole of the L Line is  
7 shut. It isn't. Most of the L Line, in fact, is  
8 still open. So, from Canarsie, Rockaway Parkway up  
9 to Bedford Avenue and back both directions that  
10 remains open. This is not impacted by this tunnel  
11 work, but, nonetheless, it is a—it is a large element  
12 to the line in terms of ridership that is affected.  
13 A couple of statistics: 400,000 people take daily  
14 trips on the L Line. If—if the L Line was a  
15 standard-alone transit system, believe it or not, it  
16 would be within the top ten busiest transit systems  
17 in the North America. That shows how busy it is, and  
18 that shows there might be true to the task. So, for  
19 the closed section, 225,000 people travel between  
20 Brooklyn and Manhattan, 50 of whom—50,000, sorry, of  
21 whom within Manhattan, and the adults are 125,000  
22 within Brooklyn. So, and then obviously the—the  
23 remains are travel between the two. So, we are  
24 talking big numbers, 225,000 people. So, in terms of  
25 the—the actual plan, our plan assumes, or the

2 modeling assumes 100% of trips will be accommodated  
3 by one of the following service options, which I'm  
4 going to describe to you. There will be shifts to  
5 other modes, such as private cars, taxis, bikes, and  
6 it's hard to predict exactly how much they will be,  
7 but our plan does not factor those in. So, we're—  
8 we're failing safe, if you like. We're assuming that  
9 no one migrates to those other modes, which is  
10 probably not the case but, you know, if we were to  
11 assume that people would bikes and they will and  
12 whether they publicly won't. So, we've modeled a  
13 plan around 100% of those customers, displaced  
14 customers needing to be displaced. So, how are we  
15 going to do it? Well, first up, extensive use of  
16 the subway, and the—the closest most obvious  
17 alternate route for our subway is the J—or the J and  
18 Z Lines. In the peak hour, the M Line in Brooklyn  
19 will be increased from 9 trains per hour to 14 trains  
20 per hour, which is a 55% increase or enough to carry  
21 5,800 riders. To make room for more M Trains, which  
22 go to Midtown and attract more riders, the J service  
23 will be reduced by two trains in the peak hour from  
24 12 trains per hour to 10. Now that probably sounds  
25 counterintuitive, but because most people are heading

2 towards Manhattan and, therefore, we need to create  
3 more room for M Trains, the signaling system will  
4 only allow a certain number of trains. So, we'd have  
5 to make the compromise, but overall we—we add a lot  
6 more service. In fact, here's the statistic: If you  
7 combine the J the M and the Z, the increase will be  
8 three trains per hour or nearly 15%. Three trains  
9 carry almost 3-1/2 thousand riders or about the same  
10 as 67 buses. At other times, we are adding service  
11 to both the J and the M. While both the J and the M  
12 trains will be more crowded than they are today, the  
13 J will be at about our guideline, which is a seated  
14 load plus three square feet per Sandy, and the M Line  
15 will be about as crowded as the L Line is today. The  
16 J and Z lines—Z Trains will make all stops between  
17 Broadway Junction and Marcy Avenue to provide more  
18 frequent service at local stops that will increase  
19 experience—sorry, increase ridership, and the M will  
20 operate 24/7 into Midtown Manhattan. Nights and  
21 weekends will operate to 96<sup>th</sup> Street and stroke (sic)  
22 Second Avenue. In terms of cross-River—River Park  
23 travel, the G Line. We've looked at the G in two  
24 parts, people heading north and people heading south.  
25 So there will be more G service and we will extend

2 the length of the G Service to increase capacity. The  
3 G-G going north, more people going we're predicting  
4 will go north than go south, more L riders that's  
5 because more L riders go to Midtown and 14<sup>th</sup> Street  
6 in Downtown Manhattan, and the G trains going south  
7 will actually be slightly less crowded than they are  
8 today. So, more G service, longer trains to and from  
9 Long Island City, which is 28% of L customers. More  
10 G service and longer trains to and from Downtown  
11 Brooklyn. So, we are extending the length of these  
12 trains because we know that some people will migrate  
13 to the G and some will go north and some will go  
14 south, and we've used modeling to determine which is  
15 the prevailing course of traffic, and most people  
16 will be heading north. Other alternate subway routes  
17 for the—the E and the M. So, additional E&M service  
18 will be provided with the added 7 service, trains on  
19 average should be within our guideline capacity. The  
20 E will be a little over our loading guidelines  
21 comparable to what the L is today, and as crowded as  
22 the E is currently at its most crowded segment  
23 further back into Queens. We recognize that one of  
24 the biggest challenges will be Court Square Station,  
25 but the extra M trains will offer relief to help

2 clear those platforms more quickly. The A, C and the  
3 E I will turn to next and another direction--A--I'm  
4 sorry. Another direction most of the southbound G  
5 customers will transfer to the A or C Trains Hoyt  
6 Skimmerhorn. Polly, was that right.

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: That is.

8 ANDY BYFORD: I was coached to have to  
9 say that the other day, but I said Shammerhorn and--  
10 and Polly cringed. So, I've written it here  
11 phonetically, Hoyt Skimmerhorn. [background  
12 comments, pause] There you go. So, some L and J  
13 riders will transfer to the A and C at Broadway  
14 Junction. Combined, we expect around 12% of our  
15 customers to wind up on the A and C. C trains will  
16 also be linked and they will be linked in--linked in  
17 for 600 feet enough to carry the extra L demand  
18 within guidelines. Next slide. Around 3% of riders  
19 will take the 2, 3 and the 4 and 5 lines. There will  
20 be a small market from Canarsie and East New York  
21 gravitating to the IRT lines, either transferring at  
22 Genius Livonia or taking buses to Utica Avenue or  
23 Flatbush Avenue. Other Modes: Bus and ferry. So  
24 the buses are expected to--so I'm sorry. I should  
25 have said the subway it would take around 70%, 7-0-

2 70% of that displaced traffic, but really we need to  
3 accommodate all 100%. So there will be four  
4 Interborough Select Bus Service routes. 17% of our  
5 line customers we predict will take the bus routes.  
6 So, 80 buses per hour accommodating 4,200 riders, 80  
7 buses per hour will form an intense bus shuttle  
8 across the Williamsburg Bridge. The reason we need  
9 this is because without the supplemental capacity  
10 provided by the bus and the ferry, which I comment  
11 on, too, (sic) subway crowding will be beyond—will be  
12 beyond what we normally experience in this system.  
13 For the buses to attract that demand, they need to  
14 move quickly, which is why our partnership with DOT  
15 is so critical, and we believe that DOT's plans will  
16 enable the buses to move quickly. There will also be  
17 a new ferry service between Brooklyn and Manhattan  
18 that was projected to carry 4% of the displaced  
19 riders who would otherwise have significantly longer  
20 trips. The ferry service will be very frequent and  
21 it will have enough capacity to carry the projected  
22 ridership of around 1,190 riders on eight ferries per  
23 hour. So in summary, 79% of our riders we believe  
24 will take other subway lines, the lines that I just  
25 described. Seventeen percent of our riders will take

2 the Interborough Bus-buses. Four percent of our  
3 riders will take the ferry; 71% of riders will have  
4 no more than 10 minutes of additional travel time in  
5 their AMP. So, this summary sheet you can see up on  
6 the slide there shows you the different services that  
7 we will be using to support this plan, and again, I'd  
8 just like to reiterate that with the Bus and Ferry  
9 Plan, 71% of riders will have trouble to increases of  
10 10 minutes or less. Around 3% for transparency, 3%  
11 will have increase of over 20%, but without the bus  
12 and ferry, that would have been around 40—sorry, I  
13 haven't got the percentage yet. That would have been  
14 as high as 40 minutes without that term—that  
15 additional provision of bus and ferry. I thought I  
16 should say something around what we're doing at  
17 stations. I've made reference to increased use of  
18 stations because of the increased usage because of  
19 the L Line being closed for the tunnel section, and I  
20 made particular reference to Court Square, which we  
21 believe will be one of the biggest stations affected.  
22 At Court Square we will be adding a staircase in  
23 order to—to cope with the additional customers that  
24 we expect. That will be removed at the end of the  
25 closure, and that will be removed for positive

2 reasons because that will then be replaced, an  
3 elevator, accessible elevator will be built in that  
4 shaft, but at other stations, and you can see them  
5 there highlighted with the blobs on the map, we will  
6 be widening or-and/or adding stairways. We will be  
7 re-opening entrances, and we will be adding and  
8 reconfiguring turnstiles. Carrying on in that vain,  
9 we will also be offering free transfers on defined  
10 routes that we know will have to take the load, and  
11 you can see them up there: Broadway G and Hughes  
12 Streets on the J-M-Z; Broadway G and Lorimer Streets  
13 on the J-M-Z; Genius Street 3 and LaBonia Avenue on  
14 the L; 21 Street G and Hunters Point Avenue on the 7,  
15 and terms Genius and LaBonia, that was transfer that  
16 we planned to do anyway, and that will stay in place  
17 post-closure. A bit more about the buses. I tipped  
18 already that there will be four Interborough Bus  
19 services, and these are they and we're calling them  
20 the L1 and they're all SBS Services, the L1, the L2,  
21 the L3 and the L4 and I will describe each of them in  
22 a second in a bit more detail. I made reference  
23 earlier that together there will be a combined number  
24 a total of 80 buses per hour during peak hours.  
25 That's less than a minute apart on average, and mid-

2 days there will be 26 buses per hour, which is a bus  
3 about every 2-1/2 minutes. In the evenings, 38 buses  
4 per hour about every minute and a half. So, it's a  
5 very, very intense bus service. All the more reason  
6 that we must keep the buses moving. There is a new  
7 L4 route, which I will describe shortly. The goal of  
8 the bus plan short, intense routes quickly recycling  
9 to make multiple trips. In other words, going  
10 backwards and forwards to carry people as fast as  
11 possible to Subway Connections to continue their  
12 trips. We will be operating these routes as Select  
13 Bus routes with off-board fare collection and all-  
14 door boarding very similar to what you see today.  
15 That is, in fact, what you see today on existing SBS  
16 routes. I'll just taken you through them quickly.  
17 The first one is the L1 SBS routes. That is the  
18 service between Grand Street and First Avenue and  
19 15<sup>th</sup> Street. It will operate every 2-1/2 minutes  
20 during AM peak hours and every 3-1/2 minutes during  
21 PM peak hours. The Chairman or I think it was the  
22 Speaker actually made reference to the extensive  
23 consultation we've done to date. That has been  
24 useful. We have acted upon suggestions, and at the  
25 suggestion of the community, we've added a second

2 Brooklyn stop at Union Avenue to increase the  
3 Catchment areas served by the route. Onto number 1,  
4 L2 SBS, this is a service between Grand Street and So  
5 Ho. Again, every 2-1/2 minutes in the AM peak and  
6 every 3-1/2 minutes during the off peak. I'm sorry,  
7 the PM peak, and the L2 again, following consultation  
8 will now have a stop at Union Avenue. The L3 is a  
9 service between Bedford Avenue and SoHo and it will  
10 operate every 2-1/2 minutes during the AM and the PM  
11 peak hours. It needs to be more frequent in the PM  
12 peak. One thing I would notice that construction at  
13 the Bedford Avenue Station itself makes it impossible  
14 to stage a large bus operation. So this bus starts  
15 and ends at North Fifth Street two blocks away, and  
16 finally the L4 SBS this is a service between Bedford  
17 Avenue and First Avenue and 15<sup>th</sup> Street. This will  
18 operate every 6 minutes during AM Peak hours, ever 6-  
19 1/2 minutes during the PM Peak, and there's a--this is  
20 the new route that we've added where again response  
21 to public feedback. This runs from Williamsburg to  
22 First Avenue and gives riders from the Bedford Avenue  
23 area a one-seat ride to 14<sup>th</sup> Street. Late nights,  
24 late night bus service obviously traffic is much  
25 lighter and the ferry will now operate. So, we will

2 link the M14 SBS with the L4 SBS as a single route.  
3 Sorry, single through routes every 10 minutes thereby  
4 giving customers a one-seat ride, and the L2 will  
5 also operate all night. Onto the Manhattan side.  
6 The 14<sup>th</sup> Street Transit Corridor. We will be adding  
7 a new M14 SBS across 14<sup>th</sup> Street in addition to the  
8 existing M14A and M14D service. It extends to 10<sup>th</sup>  
9 Avenue skipping Third Avenue. In terms of  
10 operations, there will be 58 combined buses of those-  
11 routs that I just described, and the peak direction  
12 about one bus a minute. That's made up of 34 M14  
13 SBS, and 24 M14A and M14D buses. Midday there are 34  
14 buses per hour, which is a bus a less than every two  
15 minutes. It is projected to serve 84,000 riders  
16 daily and the projected utilization it depends on  
17 fast, reliable bus travel. So, it is critical that  
18 this bus gets smoothly across the bridge, which is  
19 the prefect segue to hand it over to my colleague  
20 Polly.

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [off mic]  
22 That's a green light over on his?

23 MALE SPEAKER: Exactly.

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Your mic is  
25 working a bit better than mine. Thank you, Andy.

2 Alright, let's go to the next slide here. So, just  
3 here we're going to give a bit of an overview of what  
4 we're looking for in terms of the treatments we're  
5 going to have on our street to give buses priority.  
6 It's something we just heard from the Speaker and  
7 we've—certainly, I think both agencies have been  
8 hearing quite a bit of in recent years as bus travel  
9 times have slowed throughout the city, and I think  
10 Andy gave a very interesting statistic, which is as a  
11 standalone transit system, the L Train would be the  
12 tenth largest in the North America. To give a little  
13 context for us, from DOT on the surface side, during  
14 the rush hour, the six East River crossings, the  
15 Queensboro Bridge, the Queens Mid Downtown, the  
16 Williamsburg Bridge the Manhattan Bridge, the  
17 Brooklyn Bridge and the Brooklyn Battery Tunnel carry  
18 about comparable numbers of people as the L train.  
19 So with the L Train shutdown, you can just sort of I  
20 think get a sense of the type of potential volumes of  
21 travelers we now need to accommodate on the surface,  
22 and as you've heard Andy say we clearly believe buses  
23 are going to be an important piece of the puzzle.  
24 You can see here in red the priority bus lanes we're  
25 going to be installing. Williamsburg Bridge where we

2 will have HOV-3, but I'll talk about it in more  
3 detail and then the Busway for 14<sup>th</sup> Street. Andy  
4 talked about the—the outreach sessions we did and  
5 certainly I would say at the town hall meeting we did  
6 in the West Village, the thing we heard loud and  
7 clear was concerns about how the 14<sup>th</sup> Street Busway  
8 would operate and particularly how we could  
9 accommodate local access. Particularly people  
10 potentially who have mobility challenges and don't  
11 want to do Access-A-Ride, and so we took those  
12 comments to heart and went back to think through how  
13 we could refine this plan, and we were fortunate in  
14 that we have a—a sister city Toronto actually where  
15 Andy was working previously to coming to New York,  
16 which sort of faced a comparable transit challenge,  
17 and we think found a very good solution that we  
18 believe can work in New York, which is essentially to  
19 allow local access for pickups and drop-offs of local  
20 residents and visitors. Vehicles will enter onto a—  
21 you can sort of see from the diagram we just gave an  
22 example of how it could potentially work. Driving  
23 north up 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue, turn right onto 14<sup>th</sup>, do your  
24 pickup and drop-off and then exit south on Fifth  
25 Avenue. We're hoping this will provide the local

2 access that we heard loud and clear people need, but  
3 also continue because we think it will be hopefully a  
4 minimal number of trips to continue to provide what  
5 the MTA needs, which is, you know, as traffic free an  
6 environment as they can have to run those buses, and,  
7 you know, one thing that sort of helped us in our  
8 planning here again we talked to our counterparts in  
9 Toronto. We also looked at the taxi data and we did  
10 see that even now with 14<sup>th</sup> Street operating as it  
11 normally does, a lot of the taxi pickup and drop-offs  
12 in the East and West Villages are already happening  
13 on the avenues. So, I think we've hopefully found a  
14 balance here again that will provide the local access  
15 that we heard loud and clear that residents need  
16 while keeping those buses. And so I think once we  
17 sort of frankly got a good handle on how to handle  
18 access, sort of turned us back to making sure we had  
19 the right busway design, and I think the challenge  
20 for us as you've heard from Andy, an extraordinary  
21 volume of buses. We're also going to see an  
22 extraordinary volume of pedestrians, and just here  
23 you can see some cross-sections of how we're  
24 proposing the street will work. Top slide is what  
25 the, you know, how the road currently operates. The

2 second slide is showing where we will be  
3 accommodating pedestrians and bus bulbs (sic) which  
4 are essential for the quick access boarding on and  
5 off of buses, and then the third slide is showing you  
6 where we will put also loading zones both for  
7 commercial enterprises for local residents. One of  
8 the—I think one of the most intensely debated  
9 questions is what are going to be the hours of the  
10 Busway and, you know, one thing we discovered as we  
11 looked at the traffic data for 14<sup>th</sup> Street, and a lot  
12 of people have talked about this, it's a pretty busy  
13 street most hours of the day. I think because we  
14 were able, we hope to come up with a solution that  
15 will assure local residents can have the access they  
16 need. We did want to provide the MTA with the—the  
17 robust Busway hours that I had—they had asked for,  
18 and as you can see here from the traffic data,  
19 traffic really is—traffic volumes really start to  
20 pick up at about 5:00 a.m. So, we're proposing a 5:00  
21 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. Busway. Again, discouraging  
22 through vehicular traffic during those time periods,  
23 but ensuring local access, and we're going to—  
24 because—because we think we now we've come up with  
25 the right proposal for 14<sup>th</sup> Street, we're going to do

2 all our other busways and the Williamsburg Bridge  
3 with those same hours, and you can see on the  
4 Williamsburg Bridge for the HOV lanes, you  
5 essentially see the same type of traffic volumes.  
6 Just quickly, because Andy also mentioned the other  
7 Select Bus Service that the MTA will be running, the  
8 LS1 through 4. We're also going to be doing a lot of  
9 work to prepare the streets and make sure that we can  
10 give bus priority for those routes as well, working  
11 on Delancey Street, Allen Street, and Kenmare Street.  
12 We know that that's obviously going to require more  
13 community dialogue speaking elected officials and  
14 stakeholders because again, those are going to be a  
15 very crucial piece of how we're going to make sure  
16 that Brooklyn commutes can connect with subways in  
17 Manhattan. So, having worked through some of the  
18 challenges we faced on the bus route, want to talk  
19 for a second about the bicycle connections because I  
20 think from DOT's modeling we very much see there's  
21 going to be, you know, somewhere in the area of 3 to  
22 4% going to be using cycling and we're already seeing  
23 even before the L Train shutdown every year  
24 increasing volumes of cyclists both in Brooklyn and  
25 in Manhattan, and we also thought very much about the

2 challenges of making sure that this was safe and I  
3 know the Speaker knows last year unfortunately even  
4 as we had a good year in terms of reducing roadway  
5 fatality, cyclist fatalities went up including, you  
6 know, a couple in the Chelsea area. So, we really  
7 want to make sure we're creating a safe, you know,  
8 bike network to enable people who want to commute by  
9 bike to get back and forth between Brooklyn and  
10 Manhattan and I'm happy to say also I just stood  
11 actually with Council Member Reynoso, Senator Dilan,  
12 Jay Walder and Transportation Alternatives to  
13 announce a robust plan to add more Citi Bike into  
14 this bike network. We're going to be doing new in-  
15 fill stations throughout the core of Manhattan from  
16 Canal Street up to 59<sup>th</sup> Street and over in  
17 Williamsburg, and Motivate is going to run a-what  
18 they're going to call a Pedal-Assist, which they will  
19 have a thousand Pedal-Assist bikes that will-that  
20 people can use to go back and forth over the  
21 Williamsburg Bridge, which can be a tough ride for  
22 perhaps your average cyclist, and they're also going  
23 to be installing a number of valet stations to ensure  
24 that as people bike they'll have a place basically to  
25 dock their bikes. So, we're looking in every way we

2 can to really create that safe, robust bike network,  
3 and I think this is—this is clearly what we're going  
4 to do running along. East/West Manhattan has been  
5 one of the largest challenges and one of the most  
6 contested discussions, and DOT has as many of you had  
7 originally proposed a two-way bike lane along 13<sup>th</sup>  
8 Street. We heard I think loud and clear at our  
9 public sessions from elected officials, from a number  
10 of institutions that there were a lot of concerns  
11 with weather. People felt that that was going to be  
12 safe enough having to look for a bike cyclist coming  
13 in an opposite direction from the way the street ran.  
14 We heard from some of the local institutions,  
15 Atlantic Health Center and Roberta Clemente Health  
16 Center, the City and Country School, Mount Sinai,  
17 which is building a big facility at Second Avenue and  
18 13<sup>th</sup> Street that they're really hoping we could turn  
19 that into—into two one-way pairs, and so we want to  
20 propose to do that. We think that that will make  
21 both lanes operate more safely. It will give more  
22 room for the cyclists, more of a buffer zone and more  
23 wiggle room also for vehicles, and now we'll—we will  
24 also hop over to the Brooklyn side.

25 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: We're ready.

2                   COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Just as—just  
3 as we're looking to do on 14<sup>th</sup> Street, again sort of  
4 a version of what they're doing on King Street in  
5 Toronto. That's basically the design that we would  
6 like to see on Grand Street. The difference is on  
7 Grand Street we're also going to be able to  
8 accommodate protected bike lanes, but it will be the  
9 same principle of doing everything we can to  
10 facilitate the many, many buses the MTA is going to  
11 run allowing local access for residents of businesses  
12 but encouraging through traffic to use alternative  
13 routes, mainly Metropolitan Avenue. Andy, I think  
14 back to you with the ferry service.

15                   ANDY BYFORD: Okay, I made reference to  
16 the ferry earlier on. So, a bit more about the  
17 ferry. You can see the diagram there obviously going  
18 across the East River. The ferry will operate from  
19 6:00 a.m. to midnight on weekdays from 6:00 a.m. to  
20 2:00 a.m. on weekends. The frequency will be every  
21 7-1/2 minutes during a.m. and p.m. peak hours, and  
22 every ten minutes middays, evenings and weekends.  
23 The main constraint for the ferry is the docking  
24 capacity where—at either side. There is a per-limit  
25 (sic) of how many ferries can get in and out or how

2 frequently the ferry can run and still turn around,  
3 unload and load and then sail back to the other side.  
4 The ferry will use SBS ticketing. It will accept  
5 Metro Cards, and the ferry ticket will be valid for  
6 travel on either the M14 SBS or the M23 SBS and vice  
7 versa. Customers will have no need to dip (sic)  
8 again when transferring between the two modes, bus  
9 and ferry. A Metro Card will retain a transfer for  
10 later entry into the subway or the other bus. So,  
11 it's an integrated fare, and again it is good for the  
12 M14 and the M23. So, in terms of preparatory work,  
13 there's—there's already work going on and there needs  
14 to be more work that needs to be done in advance of  
15 the tunnel actually being closed, which again is  
16 April of 2019. So, why do we need to do this? This  
17 is to ensure reliable service during reconstruction.  
18 So, we are taking a real comprehensive look at what  
19 work needs to be done in terms of proactively  
20 maintaining the alternate routes in advance so that  
21 they are reliable as possible. I think it would be  
22 naïve and false of me to say that in a 15-month  
23 closure period there won't be any problems on those  
24 alternate routes because no one would believe me if I  
25 said that that would happen, but what we're doing

2 through a proactive maintenance regime is giving  
3 these—giving these assets extra attention, and—and  
4 doing track work and switch work, and signal work,  
5 and various other work to make sure that as best as  
6 we can with a high level of confidence those  
7 alternate routes are—are very reliable, and you can  
8 see that's quite an extensive program of preparatory  
9 work. So, on these weekends there will be no service  
10 to Manhattan. This is a more extensive closure than  
11 what we're planning during the 15<sup>th</sup> month of the  
12 project, and we don't want people thinking that this  
13 is what they'll be seeing everyday for 15 months.  
14 There's a—there's various mitigations that we will  
15 put in place, but this I stress again is deliberately  
16 done preparatory work on both the L Line and the  
17 alternate routes to make sure their assets work  
18 properly during the closure. And then a final piece  
19 in the jigsaw is to make sure that in the—in the very  
20 immediate run-up to the closure, in other words in  
21 the—in the couple of weeks before the closure starts  
22 and throughout the closure that we excel at both  
23 customer service and communications because clearly  
24 this is a massive change for people. After the first  
25 few days I think people get used to it, but we will

2 have hundreds of staff deployed a subway station, at  
3 bus services at ferry locations to managing crowding  
4 to ensure safety, but also to assist customers who-  
5 who need to know what their alternatives are and what  
6 to do. These staff will be trained and mandated to  
7 actively communicate with customers in real time, in  
8 person and through all of available channels through  
9 the website, through apps and in real time, and we  
10 will make adjustments to the plan in response to  
11 feedback. This is a plan that can be flexed. If we  
12 find that we've laid on too much provision, it can  
13 always be drawn back. If we find that have not got  
14 enough provision, we can add capacity, and a good  
15 example of that is with buses, we will hold some  
16 buses in reserve so that if we need to push more  
17 buses in, we will be able to do that. And the final  
18 thing and this is particularly important to me as a  
19 railway operator, we will be making sure that there  
20 are extensive contingency plans so that if for  
21 example a route, an alternate route does goes down,  
22 the staff and the-both on site and in the control  
23 facility, the rail control center have very well  
24 rehearsed plans, and know exactly what to do, know  
25 exactly what to say to customers so that we can run

2 this thing smoothly. So, it's a big challenge. This  
3 final slide is a---just a summary diagram just to  
4 illustrate really just as a picture how extensive  
5 this is for one section of one line, this is the  
6 alternate travel plan made up of buses, of ferries  
7 and of subway routes, and that this an extensive plan  
8 because we are talking so many people. I'll throw it  
9 back to Polly just to make some final comments.

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And I'll—I'll  
11 just take a minute to comment. My mic is actually  
12 working now I think. To comment on the legislation  
13 that is also before the committee today. The first  
14 bill would require DOT to designate and ombudsperson  
15 to monitor the progress and the status of major  
16 transportation project known as MTPs as well as any  
17 other projects that the Commissioner or the Council  
18 may designate. The bill would require ombudsperson  
19 to establish a system to receive comments and  
20 complaints about such projects and to look into and  
21 troubleshoot those complaints, and the bill goes on  
22 to designate the L Train Tunnel reconstruction as one  
23 such project. DOT's borough commissioners Ed Pincar  
24 and acting Borough Commissioner in Manhattan, Keith  
25 Bray in Brooklyn, Nicole Garcia in Queens, Nivardo

2 Lopez in Bronx, and Tom Cocola in Staten Island and  
3 their teams already play I think a role very similar  
4 to the ombudsman contemplated in this bill for MTPs  
5 and other significant DOT projects in their boroughs,  
6 and when it comes to the L Train project in  
7 particular, both the DOT Project Team as well as a  
8 significant part of the senior management, myself  
9 included and our Intergovernmental and Community  
10 Affairs Teams are engaged with elected officials,  
11 stakeholders, community boards and the public across  
12 the whole affected area. At the same time, we're  
13 aware that the ombudsperson where they have been  
14 created at other agencies have a somewhat different  
15 role than outlined in the bill today. We welcome  
16 continued conversation about what creating this type  
17 of role at DOT might look like, and on an important  
18 note as drafted, the bill could be interpreted as  
19 permitting any project not just DOT projects to be  
20 designated. A DOT Ombudsperson should only be  
21 responsible clearly for dealing with DOT projects. I  
22 also just want to add that when it comes to the L  
23 train shutdown, DOT's correspondence, social media,  
24 and 311 units are already and will continue to be  
25 placing a special emphasis on responding to the

2 communication from the public on this major  
3 transportation challenge. The second bill before the  
4 committee would require DOT to designate community  
5 information centers in Brooklyn and Manhattan to  
6 provide information and resources on the tunnel  
7 shutdown to residents, commuters and businesses.  
8 First, I want to say when it comes to public outreach  
9 and information, DOT will have a role to play, but  
10 the MTA will be the primary agency managing ongoing  
11 communications with the public, and I'm sure  
12 President Byford can speak to the robust plans  
13 they're developing. When it comes to vital  
14 information for the public on transit service and  
15 travel options provided on an ongoing basis, MTA will  
16 take the lead. Construction related questions  
17 pertaining to actual tunnel and station  
18 reconstruction, work including maintenance of a local  
19 construction office will also be the domain of the  
20 MTA. When it comes to major street changes, such as  
21 the bus lane on 14<sup>th</sup> Street and restrictions on Grand  
22 Street in Brooklyn, DOT's Street Ambassadors will be  
23 informing residents and businesses about local access  
24 plans and related information. One the shutdown  
25 begins, DOT's borough commissioners and their staff

2 will be on the ground monitoring and troubleshooting  
3 and available to work with elected officials, local  
4 communities—local community boards and other  
5 stakeholders. In addition, we'll be letting drivers  
6 far from the immediate shutdown area know about their  
7 travel options, and we'll be working closely with our  
8 partners at the Taxi and Limousine Commission to  
9 educate their drivers as well. Finally, we've been  
10 working to make sure that customers could get  
11 information or comment about street access and HOV  
12 changes via calling 311. For these reasons, DOT—for  
13 its part doesn't think we need to create an  
14 additional field office for the L Train shutdown  
15 beyond the—the Borough Commissioner officers we  
16 already have in Brooklyn and Manhattan. Just to  
17 summarize on behalf of our offices (sic) we've put a  
18 lot of details on the table today and I think both  
19 agencies have really tried to address the challenge  
20 of particularly ensuring the access for commuters  
21 come in and out of Brooklyn. We're doing our best to  
22 mitigate clearly what are going to be some  
23 significant impacts on the Manhattan side. Not an  
24 easy balance to strike, but I can assure you the two  
25 agencies have tried hard to strike it. We thank you

2 for inviting us to testify here today and happy to  
3 take questions. [background comments]

4 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Well, thank you  
5 President Byford. Thank you Commissioner  
6 Trottenberg. That's a lot of information. It  
7 clearly shows how hard the MTA and DOT have worked on  
8 preparing for this for a long time, and I want to dig  
9 into some of the details to figure out the impact.  
10 So, bear with me as I run through some numbers and if  
11 my numbers are incorrect, feel free to interject,  
12 and—and correct me. So, from the testimony and from  
13 previous presentations, I know that the agencies  
14 estimate that 84,000 riders per day will potentially  
15 use buses on 14<sup>th</sup> Street. This includes 57% of the  
16 50,000 Intra-Manhattan L Train customers of 28,500  
17 who usually use the L Train in Manhattan itself and  
18 11% of the 225,000 Brooklyn and Manhattan L Train  
19 customers. So, that's about 25,500 people, and then  
20 there are currently 30,000 current M14A, M14D  
21 customers who already use the buses going across 14th  
22 Street. So, that's about 84,000 people that we're  
23 projecting. Articulated buses the buses that we're  
24 talking about have a seating capacity of about 50. Is

2 that right? Approximately 50, seated not standing?  
3 What's the capacity of an articulated bus?

4 ANDY BYFORD: [off mic] Let's say that  
5 for 85-85 including standing.

6 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay, so seated  
7 and standing 85 people. So that means you'd need  
8 about 1,700 buses per day or approximately 99 an hour  
9 assuming a day is 5:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. If you're  
10 just looking at those numbers, but you all again  
11 based off the presentation are basing a significant  
12 number of those people who will be taking subways,  
13 and so we're not going to get that number that I just  
14 spoke about. Is that correct?

15 ANDY BYFORD: That's correct. So, as  
16 again the-the-the rough split is around 70% on the  
17 subways, around 17% on the buses. If we have  
18 underestimated the buses, and I just mentioned  
19 towards the end, we will have some buses held in  
20 reserve so we can increase the bus capacity if we have  
21 to.

22 Yeah, can I just add? So, what happens  
23 on 14<sup>th</sup> Street right now the numbers you cited-

24 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] If  
25 you could just say your name for the record.

2 PETER CAFIERO: Sorry. Peter Cafiero.  
3 I'm the Chief of the Operations and Planning at New  
4 York City Transit. So, right now, riders from  
5 Brooklyn are coming through the tunnel. Riders at  
6 Manhattan are boarding it first day and all going  
7 west. Once the project begins, many of those  
8 Brooklyn riders will be coming by the Williamsburg  
9 Bridge either on the M Train or the shuttle buses and  
10 will end up at 14<sup>th</sup> Street often at Sixth Avenue and  
11 so they'll be boarding the bus but going the opposite  
12 direction from the residents of Stuyvesant Town who  
13 will still be boarding at First Avenue. So, these  
14 buses that you cite, has capacity for multiple riders  
15 on each trip in both directions. So, they'll be  
16 people going both ways on these buses. It will be  
17 very heavy Sixth Avenue going both directions as well  
18 as First Avenue going westbound.

19 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay, so you've  
20 indicated you plan to have anywhere between 60 and 80  
21 buses operate per hour along 14<sup>th</sup> Street, correct?

22 PETER CAFIERO: That's correct.

23 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: The capacity of  
24 each bus is 85 people and the total capacity assuming  
25 you're able to meet your per-hour throughput goals

2 will that actually be sufficient to meet the  
3 anticipated daily and hourly demand?

4 ANDY BYFORD: We believe it will. Again,  
5 if we've underestimated it, we have some Busan (sp?)  
6 buses that can supplement.

7 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay, and what  
8 are the implications if you're not able to meet your  
9 per-hour throughput targets? What are the  
10 contingency plans for such a scenario where the  
11 capacity is not able to be met?

12 ANDY BYFORD: Well, the primary one is  
13 that we do have—again, have these buses in reserve,  
14 but our modeling suggests we're very confident in our  
15 modeling. The—the predicted migration to buses will  
16 be accommodated by the fleet that we are going to  
17 deploy. If we've underestimated it, we'll operate  
18 the Busan buses. We do not believe that that will  
19 exceeded with the reserve.

20 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, if you could  
21 explain the rationale again for only having it be a  
22 busway from 5:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. to not have it go  
23 to midnight, to not have it be 24 hours a day, how  
24 did you arrive at those hours? If you could just  
25 reiterate that.

2                   COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'm going to  
3 just pull up—Mr.—Mr. Speaker, you can see here, it  
4 was—it was really a couple of things. I mean we  
5 conferred with our colleagues at the MTA, and we took  
6 really a look at the traffic data and—and we see that  
7 the morning rush really starts to pick up at 5:00  
8 a.m. and we wanted to pick 5:00 a.m. as a time to  
9 really discourage, you know, really sort of  
10 discourage people from thinking of it as a street to  
11 cycle through. We start to see the traffic come down  
12 at 10:00 p.m. and, you know, something interesting  
13 and again talking to my colleague in Toronto as they  
14 did this on King Street, one thing she mentioned was  
15 they at first had proposed longer hours and they  
16 heard actually a lot from the cabby community that  
17 felt like there was a lot of late night pickups they  
18 wanted to do, and they agreed that 10:00 p.m. was a  
19 good cut-off, but we sort of arrived at that on our  
20 own looking at our traffic data, but it was  
21 interesting that Toronto came to the same conclusion.  
22 That said, one thing that I think you've heard from--  
23 President Byford and I have both said this part of  
24 the plan is easy to adjust. When we chose these  
25 hours looking at—

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I mean and you're  
3 willing to do that base off of--?

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Absolutely.

5 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay.

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: I mean this  
7 is, you know based on looking at the--the traffic  
8 lines, conferring with the MTA about what they  
9 thought they needed, but with an understanding that  
10 we can adjust hours as needed. If more are needed or  
11 if fewer are needed, we'll have the--that will be the  
12 easiest part of the plan to adjust.

13 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay. So,  
14 overall DOT and the MTA plans have indicated--again,  
15 not be repetitive, but it's important to I think get  
16 the numbers out there that 225,000 L Train riders  
17 they predict that the ridership breakdown during the  
18 shutdown is will be as follows: 75% to 85% of  
19 displaced riders will use other subway lines  
20 especially the G, J, M and Z; 5 to 15% will use  
21 shuttle bus service; 3 to 5% will use ferry service  
22 and 5 to 7% will use bikes, taxis, for-hire vehicles  
23 and other personal vehicles. Does that sound about  
24 right what I just said?

2           ANDY BYFORD: I'm Andy. I think the bus  
3 figure is 17%, but I can't—I think did you say that,  
4 Mr. Speaker?

5           SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I said 5 to 15%.

6           ANDY BYFORD: Okay.

7           SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay. So, what  
8 specific factors informed these estimates? How  
9 confident are you in the modeling that's been done  
10 around these estimates, which has informed the this  
11 entire plan?

12           ANDY BYFORD: Okay, so I mean I'll kick  
13 off, but we—we do have detailed modeling available to  
14 us, which I'll ask Peter to speak to in just a  
15 moment, but that that's informed by the knowledge of  
16 people's origin and destinations. So, we do have a  
17 good understanding of where people currently go. So,  
18 let's have a look at the L Tunnel market generally.  
19 People coming through the tunnel heading to Manhattan  
20 who want to go north of 14<sup>th</sup>–14<sup>th</sup> Street, that is  
21 around 57% of people who come through that tunnel who  
22 want to head north of 14<sup>th</sup> Street. People who want  
23 to 14<sup>th</sup> Street is around 28% and people who want to  
24 go south of 14<sup>th</sup> Street is around 15%. So, we've got  
25 modeling that shows where people go, and then in

2 terms of origins and destinations of L customers in  
3 the Manhattan bounds, the A.M. peak, again we've got  
4 cluster maps that show where they've come from and  
5 where they're going to. So, that's basically how the  
6 model works. So, I'll see if Peter wants to add to  
7 that.

8 PETER CAFIERO: I would just add this is  
9 a model that we've used, refined over the years for  
10 many major shutdowns as well as modeling the Second  
11 Avenue Subway, and it's—it's generally performed very  
12 well for--

13 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] So,  
14 you feel pretty confident in this model?

15 PETER CAFIERO: Yes.

16 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: What if the model  
17 is off?

18 PETER CAFIERO: It's—it's again as  
19 President Byford mentioned, we—particularly when you  
20 get down to the individual bus route level, it can be  
21 off, and that's why we're adding bus service to  
22 routes that we predict will need more service, but we  
23 are keeping buses in reserve with drivers that we can  
24 deploy on day 1, day 2, day 3 and react if we are  
25 off.

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay. I want to—  
3 I have a lot of questions. I'm not going to ask them  
4 all. I can come back later. I want to give my  
5 colleagues who are here and the Chair time to ask  
6 questions especially our members from the East Side  
7 who are here and members from Brooklyn who are here  
8 who have questions about how it's going to affect  
9 their communities. But I do want to focus on the  
10 enforcement and the effects on the side street. So,  
11 DOT plans to make 14<sup>th</sup> Street eastbound from Third  
12 Avenue to 9<sup>th</sup> Avenue, and what—

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: The Busway,  
14 yes.

15 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: --as Busway and  
16 westbound from Third Avenue to Eight Avenue. Again,  
17 from 5:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. seven days a week. How  
18 does DOT intend to monitor traffic flow both in  
19 Manhattan and Brooklyn during the shutdown, and I ask  
20 this because again, one of the major issues that's  
21 come up over and over again and I want to again state  
22 this very clearly I am not concerned. I'm not here  
23 today on behalf of motorists. I'm here today on  
24 behalf of people who live on these side streets,  
25 pedestrians, small businesses, emergency vehicles,

2 and the congestion that is likely going to be created  
3 on 9<sup>th</sup> Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Street, 11<sup>th</sup> Street, 12<sup>th</sup> Street,  
4 13<sup>th</sup> Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Street, 18<sup>th</sup>  
5 Street, 19<sup>th</sup> Street on the East Side and the West  
6 side especially the streets that go straight  
7 [applause] especially the streets that go—that all go  
8 all the way through there uninterrupted by Union  
9 Square, or Gramercy Park, but streets that people can  
10 use to get across the entire island. I want to  
11 understand what are the plans, and I know that you  
12 know I live on 15<sup>th</sup> Street, and I see what traffic  
13 can be like right now on 15<sup>th</sup> Street without the L  
14 Train shutdown. So, I want to understand, and I know  
15 we have PD here, how many traffic enforcement agents  
16 are we going to have? What are the hours going to  
17 be? How are they going to be deployed? What are we  
18 doing to do about tractor trailer trucks, and large  
19 buses going down residential side streets? I want to  
20 understand this. Again, not because I am worried  
21 about the motorists, but I'm actually worried about  
22 pedestrian safety. People could get hurt or injured  
23 or killed on these side streets, and so I want to  
24 understand what the plan is on enforcement. How the  
25 enforcement will be meaningful at the very beginning

2 as a deterrent so that people know from day 1 of the  
3 shutdown, that they cannot be doing crazy things on  
4 side streets, and I really need to hear a little bit  
5 more about that.

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So, I think  
7 that maybe I'll take a crack Mr. Speaker. It's sort  
8 of an overall discussion on congestion and then  
9 obviously Inspector Fulton from PD can talk in some  
10 detail about what their--what their enforcement  
11 efforts are going to look like. Look, there's no  
12 question, you know, as we've heard today, we're--we're  
13 shutting down what would be standalone, the tenth  
14 largest transit system in North America. We're  
15 bringing as many people to the surface as all our  
16 East River Crossings carry in the morning rush hour.  
17 So, you know, there's no way unfortunately that we  
18 can say this is not going to have a congestion  
19 effect. It clearly is. One of the reasons we've,  
20 you know, for example wanted the long hours not only  
21 on 14<sup>th</sup> Street, but we want those long hours for the  
22 HOV lane on the Williamsburg Bridge is because quite  
23 frankly we're hoping that will discourage motorists  
24 to some degree or at the very least will encourage  
25 carpooling, and we're hoping social media can help

2 facilitate that. I mean we—we do need to hopefully  
3 discourage people to use other alternatives. I mean  
4 encourage people to use other alternatives. That's  
5 why we want to make the bus service robust, why we  
6 want to have a safe bike network. If we do nothing,  
7 there will be additional congestion in Lower  
8 Manhattan. Our goal obviously here is to try and  
9 balance moving all those people by bus with the  
10 effects on the side streets. I will just say from  
11 DOT's parts we're keenly aware of the anxieties  
12 people have there. We will have our own folks  
13 monitor—monitoring very carefully, and doing whatever  
14 we can as we see real flashpoints arising in terms of  
15 signal timing et cetera, and then then clearly  
16 working closely with PD on enforcement and hand it—

17 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] But  
18 just, Commissioner, I just want to say one thing just  
19 to—I don't want you to gloss over I think something  
20 important you just said, which is you're concerned  
21 about the side streets as well.

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Look, am—I am—  
23 I am very—I am very concerned about the need to close  
24 down the L Train and do this kind of work. I mean

2 we're talking about displacing hundreds of thousands  
3 of--

4 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] I  
5 understand that but, I'm saying--

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --commuters.  
7 So, there's--there's--

8 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing]  
9 Even with the plan that we have you're concerned  
10 about major congestion on the side streets, and what  
11 you're basically saying is there's no silver bullet  
12 here, but we're trying to mitigate as best as we can.

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I think yes. I  
14 think that's a fair characterization. I will say  
15 this and I think we provided your office and we made  
16 public available a lot of details about our modeling  
17 and looking at what the traffic impact would be on--

18 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing]  
19 Yes, you did.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --different  
21 side streets and you certainly see increases in  
22 congestion. I think it's not--it--in some cases, it  
23 wasn't quite as terrifying as we thought it was going  
24 to be not to say it won't be an inconvenience, but,  
25 you know, the traffic volumes are--are hopefully not

2 in a state of total gridlock, but I think that's  
3 particularly why PD enforcement is going to be very  
4 key here as well.

5 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Inspector, I-I  
6 really want to understand the level of enforcement.  
7 I think this is very, very critical for this plan is  
8 the level of enforcement that's going to be involved.

9 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: Okay, you were  
10 right, Mr. Speaker. I'm Inspector Dennis Fulton. I  
11 work for the Transportation Bureau within the NYPD.  
12 So, right now we would dedicate as the plan stands  
13 now 102 traffic enforcement agents, and then also 46  
14 police officers. You were right. The side streets  
15 would be, the different choke points that we  
16 identified so there would be agents on 14<sup>th</sup> Street,  
17 Delancey Street in Brooklyn on 12<sup>th</sup> Street, 13<sup>th</sup>  
18 Street, 14<sup>th</sup> Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Street, 17<sup>th</sup>  
19 Street, and we would again when the plan starts we  
20 would want a show of force. The 46 officers would be  
21 primarily like the traffic agents would facilitate  
22 traffic and—and make sure that the—the correct people  
23 are using where they should be.

24 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: And traffic  
25 enforcement agents cannot write summonses?

2 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: They can write  
3 parking summonses.

4 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Parking  
5 summonses, but not blocking the block summonses?

6 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: No.

7 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: The police  
8 officers can do that, though?

9 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: Correct. The  
10 police officers. We would have 46 police officers  
11 assigned specifically to the L Train shutdown, and  
12 they would be primarily to do the enforcement. Now,  
13 we were also, as I said, we would have specific  
14 posts, but we would also have with the traffic  
15 agents, we would have eight of these 102 that—that I  
16 mentioned, they would be specifically mobile, and  
17 would respond to any other thing that arose like  
18 congested areas and—and the same with the officers.

19 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: And they would  
20 be—they'd be mobile because they'd be in this—those  
21 small traffic enforcement vehicles--

22 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: [interposing]  
23 Yes.

24 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: --where they  
25 could get around easily--

2 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: [interposing]  
3 Correct. They're all--

4 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: --into a spot  
5 that is identified as a hot spot.

6 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: Yes, correct  
7 and then the officers would also have scooters. So,  
8 they would ride around and be able to issue double  
9 parking and no standing and--

10 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] Do  
11 we have final locations for where you believe the  
12 officers and the traffic enforcement agents are going  
13 to be deployed currently?

14 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: I have a--we  
15 have come up with a whole bunch of--we do have posts,  
16 and to answer your question yes. I have--I wouldn't  
17 say it's final, but I would say that we have  
18 identified posts for every single person I just  
19 mentioned.

20 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, Inspector, I  
21 would ask that if we could set up a--a follow-up  
22 community meeting either sometime this summer or in  
23 the fall when more people are back after the summer.  
24 It could be on the East Side or the West Side or we  
25 could do both so that it would be helpful to actually

2 get a plan presented on enforcement specifically with  
3 maps, with deployment, with the number of agents with  
4 what the plan is. So that the public can understand,  
5 and I hope that actually we can raise awareness  
6 through the media ahead of time so that people  
7 understand there will be real enforcement, and  
8 deterrents involved so that people understand  
9 hopefully that they won't want to drive in, and be on  
10 this-be-be in the affected area. Would you commit to  
11 having one or two meetings, and we need a Brooklyn  
12 meeting as well, to-to do that type of work and  
13 present the enforcement strategy to the public?

14 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: I would say I  
15 will go back and take it back, but I think they would  
16 probably be accommodating to being transparent with  
17 which we're going to do, and yes, you're right. We  
18 will show a big show of enforcement when the plan  
19 begins to make sure that people are following the  
20 rules, and the plan can be implemented correctly.

21 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay, I have two  
22 more final questions. Then I'm going to come back  
23 for another round of questions after my colleagues.  
24 How will truck traffic be redirected along the  
25 streets surrounding 14<sup>th</sup> Street? What's going to

2 happen with these large delivery trucks that are  
3 delivering at Dwayne Reade or a supermarket or  
4 somewhere else. A lot of those side streets, the  
5 street that I live on has a sign that says: No  
6 tractor-trailer trucks, but they still drive down the  
7 street anyway, and it's going to be even worse with  
8 the L Train shutdown. So, what is the plan for large  
9 delivery trucks, interstate buses like Megabus, and  
10 Bolt Bus and-and the big Red Tour buses. What's the  
11 plan to ensure that those large dangerous vehicles  
12 are not on these small residential side streets?

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I think I'll-  
14 I'll a sort of-a bit about the street design and  
15 then-and then turn it back to Inspector Fulton on the  
16 enforcement front. So, the way the Busway is  
17 designed, the buses will be allowed to use it. So,  
18 the-the-whatever the tour buses they use, they can  
19 access bus lanes the same as MTA buses. We will have  
20 again on 14<sup>th</sup> Street, the same on Grand Street  
21 designated loading areas. So, we're hoping-I mean  
22 trucks to the extent that they need to do their  
23 deliveries along those commercial corridors, we're  
24 going to create street space for them. It is going  
25 to be I think work with NYPD to-and messaging to make

2 sure to the extent that they want to go through on  
3 those streets, they're going to have to go to the  
4 next major artery. It could be Houston. It could  
5 be—it could be 34<sup>th</sup> Street or 23<sup>rd</sup> Street rather.

6 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Inspector, I just  
7 want to make one point before you answer it. So, in  
8 Chelsea, we have a protected bike lane on 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue  
9 and, you know, I think that we've seen the  
10 statistics. That's actually saved a lot of lives, a  
11 lot less cyclists and pedestrians because of the  
12 shorter crossings have been injured since those bike  
13 lanes were instituted, but what happens on a normal  
14 day is you will have a delivery on 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue where  
15 the delivery truck takes up an entire moving lane,  
16 and it creates a chokepoint and traffic starts to  
17 back up to two, three, four or five blocks on an  
18 avenue right now. You know, even where the trucks  
19 are supposed to be delivering, they're not supposed  
20 to be taking up an entire street, and currently  
21 there's very little enforcement so they do it day in  
22 and day out. They're—they are conditioned that they  
23 can go double park, spend 45 minutes unloading the  
24 truck. It has the cascading effect of traffic, and  
25 so I actually think now ahead of time, you know,

2 almost a year before hand, we should be doing  
3 significant cracking down and enforcement on these  
4 deliveries and encouraging after hour deliveries, off  
5 hour deliveries so that when this actually happens if  
6 you have a tractor-trailer truck on 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue and  
7 18<sup>th</sup> Street taking up an entire lane, plus the L  
8 Train shutdown, it is going to have such a  
9 deleterious effect on the entire plan that I think we  
10 need to start doing more significant enforcement in  
11 the affected areas now long before day one of the  
12 shutdown.

13 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: Just—okay a  
14 couple of questions [applause] that I'll answer. The  
15 first is that the traffic enforcement agents will be  
16 out there to make sure that the trucks go where those  
17 leads, although the—they won't let the trucks go  
18 where they're not actually supposed to—supposed to  
19 be, and then--

20 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing]  
21 You're talking about on the side streets?

22 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: Yes, on the  
23 side streets so that they'll be able to direct. In  
24 the initial part of the plan they'll be able to  
25 direct the trucks and the buses to where they need to

2 go. We put them a strategic locations along the  
3 Delancey and then 14<sup>th</sup> Street.

4 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: But that means  
5 we're going to need to have then at 15<sup>th</sup> Street at  
6 16<sup>th</sup> Street at 17<sup>th</sup> Street at 13th Street

7 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: [interposing]  
8 Well, we--

9 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON:--at 12<sup>th</sup> Street, at  
10 11<sup>th</sup> Street.

11 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: Right.

12 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: We're going to  
13 have to be at the corner of every--of everyone of  
14 those residential blocks.

15 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: Well, we have  
16 them strategically placed on those blocks at all  
17 times.

18 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing]  
19 Well this is why I think it's important we do a  
20 public meeting--

21 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: Yes.

22 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: --because the  
23 people who live in the area know the area quite well  
24 and where there are already issues so that we can

2 collaboratively figure this out together before the  
3 plan goes into effect.

4 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: Okay, and then  
5 we also have the offices. Like I said, if they—they  
6 will be complementing the traffic enforcement agents  
7 by conducting enforcement, and then we also will have  
8 the traffic agents that, you know, continually to  
9 write parkers. Like you said, with the—some of them  
10 we do, we issue. I got the numbers here. We've  
11 actually as of May 31<sup>st</sup>, we issued 4 million parkers  
12 and it's up roughly 12.4% from last year. So, we are  
13 issuing a lot of summonses and we'll take--

14 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] But  
15 that's not

16 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: Yep.

17 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: That's not really  
18 a contextual number for the area that we're talking  
19 about. It would be helpful to understand in the  
20 affected areas what the levels of summonses are, how  
21 many summonses are being done--

22 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: [interposing]

23 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: --for double  
24 parkers trucks, trucks that are illegally going down  
25 side streets. It will be nice to actually look at

2 the affected area and look at the summonses and  
3 analyze it that way. Not the number we're doing  
4 citywide. That's not contextual.

5 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: Right. I don't  
6 have--well, I do have Manhattan South, which would  
7 encompass part of that area. I don't have the  
8 specific, but we are up 12.9%. We wrote a lot of  
9 summons, a million, like 25% of those summonses were  
10 written in--in Manhattan South. So, we do a lot of  
11 enforcement in--in that area, and I have the specific  
12 numbers with me, but your point is well taken. We  
13 will concentrate on an area, and we are currently  
14 taking a good look at it. Like I said, 25% of the 4  
15 million are written in Manhattan--in Manhattan,  
16 Southern Manhattan.

17 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, Inspector, I  
18 think we're going to get to know each other quite  
19 well--

20 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: Okay.

21 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: --over the course  
22 of this process. I look forward to working with you.  
23 I want to again go to my colleagues, but I'll just  
24 end with this comment: This is going to be  
25 extraordinarily painful for a lot of people who live

2 in the neighborhoods that are affected, people who  
3 don't live in the neighborhoods but travel through  
4 the neighborhoods, straphangers, all sorts of folks.  
5 I really want to ensure that safety is paramount for  
6 pedestrians, for cyclists, for children, for senior  
7 citizens, for people who are mobility impaired, and  
8 that we have an Enforcement Plan that helps bolster  
9 that premise. I think the Enforcement Plan is, you  
10 know, besides all of the great work, that the MTA and  
11 DOT have done modeling in trying to go over the plan,  
12 it really is not going to be worth a whole lot unless  
13 we have real enforcement. So, I really want us to  
14 work together from now into the fall, into next year  
15 on what that Enforcement Plan looks like to ensure  
16 that you have the resources you need so that we move  
17 forward. Thank you very much. I want to go back to  
18 Chair Rodriguez. [applause]

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,  
20 Speaker. We will hear now questions—I mean some  
21 questions by my colleagues who had such a hearing  
22 last, and a few questions to ask. [Speaking Spanish]  
23 So, with that, Council Member Levin.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [off mic] Thank  
25 you very much. [on mic] Thank you very much, Chair

2 Rodriguez. I appreciate the courtesy. I'll keep  
3 this very quick. I want to add my voice to the  
4 Speaker on enforcement. I think enforcement is the  
5 key to ensuring that this plan is effective.  
6 Inspector, you're always welcome back in Brooklyn.  
7 It would be good to see you back there. A question  
8 for the MTA. I have in my district, I just talked to  
9 a number of parents who have children that go to  
10 school in the East Village. So, like 13<sup>th</sup> Street  
11 between D and C. It's an elementary school so there  
12 are a couple dozen of these families that-that use  
13 the L Train every morning to be able to get their  
14 children to-to school. Children can't, you know-you  
15 can't, you know, put them on-put them on a bus and  
16 just say see you later. How-is there a-have you  
17 contemplated either extending the 32 Bus Route to go  
18 over the bridge or is there an opportunity to work  
19 with the Department of Education on doing some kind  
20 of, you know, emergency school bus routes for  
21 elementary school age children that, you know, are-  
22 are going to be negatively impacted by this shutdown.  
23 I met with the DOE this week, and they're-sort of  
24 last week, and they were-they said that obviously  
25 that's not their normal rule, but obviously I think

2 that these are extenuating circumstances. How are  
3 we—how are we looking to address that because the  
4 kids have got to be able to get to school in the  
5 morning?

6 PETER CAFIERO: And we've talked actually  
7 to those parents would have come to public outreach  
8 meetings that we've had. So, I've probably talked to  
9 the same parents that you've talked to. It depends  
10 where they live. So, as we've described earlier, we  
11 do have two bus routes that will go to First Avenue  
12 and 14<sup>th</sup> Street. So very close relative to where  
13 those schools are from the Bedford Avenue area in  
14 Brooklyn and from Grand Avenue.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Uh-hm.

16 PETER CAFIERO: The G Train to other—to  
17 the M will get—get people close relatively as well,  
18 and the ferry also depending on where again you live.  
19 We are not—we in Transit cannot provide specific  
20 school service per federal law. We do work to, and  
21 we'll—we can certainly talk to the Department of  
22 Education and see if there is anyway that we can work  
23 with them.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Uh-hm.

2           PETER CAFIERO: The—as we said, and as  
3 President Byford said in his presentation, our goal  
4 is to get buses to go very quickly back and forth  
5 across the bridge and we—we're not looking at the  
6 B32. The B32 bus that you mentioned is really going  
7 to be functioning getting people from the streets.  
8 Is serves up to G and down to the J.

9           COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Right. I mean one  
10 thing about the—so, it's—it's fine to go from—from  
11 Bedford over the bridge, but some of these parents  
12 are living further north into Greenpoint. You know  
13 the M Train is not going to get that close to the  
14 Avenue B and 13<sup>th</sup> Street, and the ferry is at 23<sup>rd</sup>  
15 Street. So, you know, that's a—you know, that's a  
16 nine-block, you know, south and then—and then a good  
17 two or three blocks west. So, that's—that's quite a  
18 schlep. You know, it—so it just—if we can continue  
19 to work on this, I think it's important to be able to  
20 make sure that kids are able to get to school.

21           ANDY BYFORD: Yeah, Council Member, we  
22 will most certainly do that, and perhaps after this  
23 or we stay in correspondence, we'll just make sure  
24 we've got the precise—

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing]

3 Sure.

4 ANDY BYFORD: --details of the people  
5 you're talking about--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yep.

7 ANDY BYFORD: --and we'll see what we can  
8 come up with.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. President  
10 Byford, you mentioned that 71% won't see an increase  
11 more than 10 minutes. You said only 3% will see more  
12 than 20 minutes. What's the maximum increase in, you  
13 know, they're--they're--as the model has shown, what's  
14 the maximum increase that--that your model has shown  
15 for a commuter? Because frankly the--most of the  
16 longer increases are actually my constituents. I  
17 represent, you know, closer to, you know, to Bedford  
18 Avenue, and, you know, west of--of the Lorimer stop,  
19 and so there, you know, you actually get fewer  
20 options the further west you go.

21 ANDY BYFORD: We've broken this down into  
22 segments. That's in five--five to ten segments,  
23 within 15 to 20, 25 or more than 25%. So, the--the--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing]

25 Well, 25% or 25 minutes?

2 ANDY BYFORD: Sorry, 25 minutes. I'm  
3 sorry.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yes, okay.

5 ANDY BYFORD: 25 minutes. So, more than  
6 25 minutes is 3.3% of riders. So, do have the  
7 specific number?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing] And  
9 what would be the max?

10 PETER CAFIERO: We can get that for you,  
11 but-but the-the rider that's most impacted is someone  
12 from Bedford to Third Avenue.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yes.

14 PETER CAFIERO: Which, right, has a very  
15 quick, as you know, L trip, and will be a longer trip  
16 by any of these alternatives, but it's not-if we  
17 hadn't done these alternatives, those trips would be  
18 upwards in the neighborhood of 40 minutes or more.  
19 So, we're-we're looking at 25 minutes approximately--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing] Max?

21 ANDY BYFORD: --for those trips.  
22 Additional time. Correct.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And then you  
24 mentioned that the-the M Train the J and the-the J  
25 and the M Trains will have-will be crowded to-to, you

2 said three-three square feet per standing person.  
3 That's likely what each of those cars is going to  
4 look like?

5 PETER CAFIERO: Well, that's-that's where  
6 we pull out the headline loads. The-the M and the E  
7 will be a little above that, which the L is today.  
8 They'll be roughly around what the L Train is today.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. So, that's  
10 very crowded. Just to be clear, are there any going  
11 to be able-so people will know exactly what three  
12 square feet is. You know, that's-that's 1-1/2-that  
13 1-1/2 by-that's a little less than 1-1/2 by my house.  
14 I'd say 1-1/4 by 1-1/4 or something like that or 1-  
15 1/3 by 1-1/3? That's a small amount of space for you  
16 to be standing in, and that's a crowded, crowded  
17 train. So, just to be clear, that's-that's like-  
18 that's a pretty nearly for-for New Yorker commuter  
19 standards we would see that as a crowded train right?

20 ANDY BYFORD: We would and we accept  
21 that. What we've tried to do with the-the various  
22 routes that we've describe and the mitigation that  
23 we've applied to them. In other words the-the science  
24 behind it. Let's take the G for example putting more  
25 service going north than going south because we know

2 more people will be going north. We--and--and also  
3 that's slit between the J and the M. We've been  
4 mindful of the trying to minimize the additional  
5 loading to the best we possibly can, but being frank  
6 and transparent absolutely it will be crowded. It  
7 will--it should be no more crowded than the L Line is  
8 today.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing] Yes  
10 that's extremely crowded.

11 ANDY BYFORD: I totally get that. What  
12 we're--what we're trying to do is make it no worse  
13 than what the L Line currently is today. I'd love to  
14 make it better, but the--the limiting factor is the  
15 number of

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing] I  
17 don't think it could with the L Line.

18 PETER CAFIERO: --of trains that we can  
19 get through the tunnel.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Understood,  
21 understood, but I--I mean like it's--it's a mean, you  
22 know, how crowded the L Train is.

23 ANDY BYFORD: Sure. I just totally get  
24 that. [laughter]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And then okay,  
3 lastly and this is for DOT. I, you know, don't need  
4 a response to this, but enforcement is so important  
5 on Delancey Street clearing out Delancey Street,  
6 keeping the maximum number of hours to have these  
7 restrictions. So, the weekends I'm all in favor. If  
8 we could have this 24/7, I would be in favor of that.  
9 I understand the limitations. I think it's important  
10 to have it to the maximum extent possible. It's—it  
11 just—in order to clear—in order for this to work, you  
12 have to be able to—especially for my constituents,  
13 you have to be able to have that—that clear path onto  
14 Delancey Street and up onto Allen Street or else the  
15 whole thing falls apart really quickly.

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Well, let-let  
17 me just speak to that and again, I think on the—on  
18 the Brooklyn side everybody wanted all the hours, 24.  
19 I think on the Manhattan side a desire for as-as  
20 minimal restrictions as possible understanding with—  
21 with different sets of—of sort of competing the  
22 impacts as the shutdown happens. We've picked these  
23 hours. There are going to be. At the moment, this  
24 is where we're going to start. It's going to be  
25 consistent. It's going to be 14<sup>th</sup> Street what the

2 bus routes will be for the L service buses for  
3 Delancey and for the—for Grand and for the  
4 Williamsburg Bridge. So, fore now, 5:00 a.m. to 10:00  
5 p.m. for everything. I think it's 17 out of the 24  
6 hours. It's when the—when the traffic volumes we  
7 think justify doing that treatment, we'll—we'll  
8 adjust as needed, but I think it will—it will be a  
9 good place to start, and we'll keep Delancey.  
10 Hopefully, the bus is moving smoothly for all the key  
11 hours where we're going to see high volumes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And if you were  
13 able to have legislation in the state to do  
14 enforcement with cameras, that would be—that—that  
15 would be possible. I mean that would like that's  
16 technologically possible to be able to enforce an HOV  
17 restriction with cameras?

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Yes.  
19 Unfortunately, our two agencies were actually  
20 together up in Albany trying to get that camera  
21 enforcement authorization. We—we succeeded in the  
22 Assembly. We didn't succeed in the Senate. If—if by  
23 some chance the—the—the session is extended, we  
24 really thank that would be tremendously useful  
25 legislation to have.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing] And  
3 that session as well, right? I meant it's good and  
4 can work.

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: [interposing]  
6 Well, we need some lead time to do it.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay.

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: So, we really  
9 kind of need to have it happen this year if we can.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, so if anyone  
11 here knows at state senator, anybody, call that state  
12 senator please. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Thank  
14 you Council Member. Before I ask my question, I  
15 would like to acknowledge Council Members that were--  
16 who are here, that have been here Council Member  
17 Powers, Levine, Menchaca, Espinal, Constantinides.  
18 Also, I'd like to thank all the staff who worked so  
19 hard to put this hearing together. Thank you Jenny,  
20 and also thank you to Pierce Anasara (sp?), Chima  
21 Obichere, James Dijovani, Counsel Malak Nasser, Eric  
22 Denny, Counsel Rick Avello (sp?), Policy Analyst  
23 Jonathan Masserano, Emily Rooney, John Basile and  
24 Jordan Walker (sic). So to my Deputy Chief of Staff  
25 Stephanie Miliano. [pause] On the--Mr. President,

2 you just say about—from the beginning you start, you  
3 know addressing the important. I mean how we have  
4 hope in New York City that with the new leadership,  
5 we will be taking our mass transportation system to  
6 the 21<sup>st</sup> Century.

7 ANDY BYFORD: That's the plan.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And that's the  
9 plan. You know, we've been waiting for decades.

10 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And we cannot  
12 blame the current leadership, but this crisis did not  
13 happen overnight. In 2012, MTA promised the city  
14 that by 2017, all the signal systems would be  
15 upgraded. This is 2018. I know that now there's a  
16 more concrete plan.

17 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And—and—and  
19 instead of waiting for 2040, I will be 80 or so by  
20 that time. If we follow that schedule, you have a  
21 more ambitious plan, but you are asked about, you  
22 know, we need to be patient especially with the other  
23 work that the disruption that will happen during the  
24 weekend and the L Train shutdown, I can say that New

2 York has been more than patient and we know that now  
3 New Yorkers need action.

4 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And-and-and we  
6 believe in, you know, in your leadership of the New  
7 York City transit, but also we believe in  
8 Commissioner Trottenberg from the DOT and other new  
9 leaders at the MTA, but the first thing I want to be  
10 clear is to say that we have been patient, more than  
11 patient, and I think that even with the close of the  
12 L Train, all the boroughs understand that that these  
13 things have to happen because of Sandy and we need to  
14 rebuild that particular area of the-of the MTA. So,  
15 we-I believe that with a good plan, being  
16 accountable, being transparent, sharing information,  
17 being able to provide alternative transportation even  
18 though we know that it will not be the same. We will  
19 be working together. The piece what I feel that we  
20 don't have more patience, we should have more  
21 patience is about transparency, controlling the cost  
22 and delivering the project on time, and I know that  
23 this is something that based on conversation they  
24 have that this is something that's important for you.

25 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You also want to  
3 leave a legacy as someone in the New York City  
4 Transit that you work hard with the rest of your team  
5 to control the costs. So, for me it's like what  
6 penalty should we anticipate will happen to the  
7 private contractor that we know do the project on  
8 time, and what steps are you taking right now to be  
9 sure that this project is done on time, and also  
10 saving money if it's possible.

11 ANDY BYFORD: Okay. Thank you for the  
12 question, and there was quite a lot in there. I  
13 might just comment on the—the broader point that you  
14 made at the start. Absolutely it's untenable, it's  
15 unimaginable, it's unacceptable that where anyone  
16 should even countenance the reconditioning (sic) of  
17 this railway taking 40 years, and it's ridiculous.  
18 So, we've—in this plan, the possible plan, we've said  
19 that within five years we can get five more lines  
20 onto CBTC. Within 10 years we can get another six.  
21 That's a total of 11 and over 90% of riders onto  
22 modern reliable signaling, which adds more capacity,  
23 and which when I talk to my international colleagues  
24 around the world, they—they are breath taken. They  
25 say that is unprecedented, but it can be done, and it

2 can be done because we've identified different ways  
3 of doing it. I've removed the complexities and the-  
4 and the risks the previous--the previous strategy  
5 adopted or--or tolerated. Obviously, it relies on  
6 being funded, but we'll come back to that another  
7 day. So, specifically to the--to your--to your  
8 question around the L Line closure, how can we be  
9 sure? Well, there's a number of factors. One, this  
10 plan has been extensively scoped out. I--I sat through  
11 a very lengthy briefing the other day on the actual  
12 methodology, the way--the plans that's gone into how  
13 the actual--all that stuff will be ripped out of the  
14 tunnel, how it will be removed, how the new kit will  
15 be brought in, how much work is actually being done  
16 in advance of the closure in order to--to prepare the  
17 site, how much of the work is being done in advance  
18 to actually construct things such as you don't have  
19 to construct them in the city. You can--you can take  
20 things into the tunnel and just fit them. But  
21 there's also, as I mentioned in my presentation  
22 there's an incentive package for the contractor to  
23 finish early. There's a very punitive regime if we  
24 finish late, and this particular contractor I would  
25 suggest also has a non-pecuniary incentive to deliver

2 on time or preferably early, and that is the past  
3 they haven't enjoyed the best of reputations with my  
4 board. They're very keen to get their reputation  
5 back. They're very keen to, you know, to be seen as  
6 a preferred bidder again. So, they are heavily  
7 incentivized both financially and reputationally to  
8 get his job done properly. What I will say is I  
9 didn't come here to fail. I came here to deliver  
10 this plan, to develop and deliver this plan. This  
11 will be the first big test, and we have to get better  
12 on time, on budget delivery, and so, you can hold me  
13 accountable for that.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And what I—and—  
15 and we do, and I think that everyone working, you  
16 know, with the experience and leadership that you  
17 bring, and we hope again that we'll leave behind  
18 those night fears (sic) or knowing that we have a  
19 transportation system that build the most expensive  
20 in the whole world even when we compete with other  
21 sister cities in the—in the nation following the  
22 same procurement and regulations. So, we hope again  
23 that with—in your leadership we see those—that  
24 legacy. What will be the—the penalty for those and—  
25 and if the project is not finished on time?

2           ANDY BYFORD: (A) I think that's—I think  
3 that's commercially sensitive but (B) I don't  
4 actually have that to hand. So, may I take and  
5 action that if—if it's not—if I'm not—unable to say  
6 it's due to commercial reasons, I will let you have  
7 that. I do not have that figure to—to hand right  
8 now. But—but I do know it's punitive. They will not  
9 want to incur these costs. It escalates. It is a—a  
10 fixed amount that accumulates literally by the day.  
11 So, even if they're one day over, they get hit very  
12 hard. I—I actually do not have that figure to hand ,  
13 but it may be that I can't say for commercial  
14 reasons, but if I can, I'll let you know what that  
15 is.

16           CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, and-and to  
17 you and also DOT Commissioner and—one of the—I see  
18 this, you know, this as the opportunity not only to  
19 rebuild the trust between riders, the city. We can  
20 go, I mean DOT and MTA, but also I see the time  
21 they're going to be closing the L Train as the  
22 opportunity also to test a couple—a few things that  
23 also could work doing some pilot project. How can we  
24 put together an integrated payment system so that  
25 whoever pays for the ferry, a bus and the Citi Bike

2 should just be only one payment. Is there any other  
3 city that especially you are looking at being as  
4 doing work international on public transportation  
5 that they already have an integrated payment system?

6 ANDY BYFORD: Yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And--and can we  
8 learn from that--

9 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Sure.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --and try to be  
11 open to see that's something that we can look at it  
12 and test, test it as at--as the--

13 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Okay. So,  
14 first up, are there other cities? I can name plenty.  
15 So London has the Oyster Card, which was originally  
16 just for London transport services. So that was the--  
17 the buses and the subway that has since been extended  
18 to the river bus as an extensive river bus system that  
19 goes up and down the Thames River. It's been extended  
20 to bikes. It's been extended to taxis, and it's been  
21 extended progressively to the Mainline Railway for  
22 the suburban network outside London, but commuter  
23 trains coming into London. So, the--the glue that  
24 holds that all together is the Oyster Card, and  
25 where--and so that was where I worked two continents

2 ago. I'm going to let my-my last job but one was in  
3 Australia in Sydney and they adopted the exact same  
4 technology. They call it Opal Card in Sydney, but  
5 it's basically an Oyster Card under another name and  
6 the is also multiple mobile, ferries, buses, subways.  
7 So the good news is we are going exactly down that  
8 road. The MTA put as one of the references within  
9 this plan, but to be fair, something that was already  
10 planned is progressive conversion of ending the Metro  
11 Card and moving to an integrated Smart Card, and it's  
12 open payment technology. So, you won't even--once  
13 it's in and up and running, you won't even need to  
14 have Smart Card. You'll be able to use your phone or  
15 a credit card. So, that's already happening. Not just  
16 for the L Line, but for the whole of the MTA.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And Commissioner,  
18 is there any conversation? Is that something that we  
19 can expect that working Citi Bike we can see an  
20 integrated payment system?

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, I mean I  
22 think a little bit of a contrast for example to  
23 London is on the DOT side, some of the--the  
24 transportation services that we're working on are  
25 really public--public-private partnership. Citi Bike

2 is one. We're not this summer launching out a pilot  
3 of care sharing. We also work with a private vendor  
4 on our parking. So part of harmonizing all these  
5 systems is not only two agencies harmonizing, but  
6 getting all our private sector partners to harmonize  
7 as well. There is an interest in doing that for  
8 sure, but you know, a lot of parties will need to be  
9 involved in getting us there, but it's clearly the  
10 way a lot of cities are moving and New York should do  
11 the same.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I just call for  
13 the MTA and DOT to work with Citi Bike, and as we are  
14 using, we know that bike will be very--will play an  
15 important role during this time as we close on the L  
16 Train for riders to be able under--put one--use one  
17 payment on trying to be able to transfer from the  
18 bike to the bus and the ferry. So, can we at least  
19 look at that possibility?

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Absolutely.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, thank you.

22 So, I have other questions, but I know that my  
23 colleagues and we have the large numbers of--of  
24 members of the public that would also like to

2 testify. So, let's continue with Council Member  
3 Reynoso.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you,  
5 Chair. Thank you to the panel. My name is Antonio  
6 Reynoso, and I'm the Council Member with the most L  
7 stops in their district out of all City Council  
8 Members. I also have the most M stops and MJV stops.  
9 So, I want to start by thanking the MTA and the  
10 Department of Transportation for all the work that  
11 has been done over the past several years. I want to  
12 commend you on the public outreach and the public  
13 work that has been to educating and inform our  
14 communities about what's happening. You have  
15 listened and modified where appropriate. I really  
16 like the concerns that were asked in Brooklyn at  
17 these meetings were actually addressed in one way,  
18 shape or form. In some cases, you didn't feel that  
19 changes could be made, but at least replied as to why  
20 those changes couldn't be made. So I just want to  
21 commend you for the outreach that has been done by  
22 the MTA and the DOT. I don't think we've ever seen  
23 that type of outreach in the city of New York almost  
24 for anything, and it just speaks to how-how important  
25 you think this is, and I want to make sure that the

2 plan is flexible. It's something that I want to just  
3 as a statement to make. Just be ready to modify at a  
4 moments notice when this does start. I think no one  
5 here believes that as soon as the L Train gets shut  
6 down that everything is going to run smoothly. We  
7 know we're going to hit bumps on the road and your  
8 ability to be flexible and the opportunity to modify  
9 is important. I want to also make sure that safety  
10 should always be the number one priority. I want to—  
11 I want DOT and MTA to be weary of residents and  
12 organizations that speak with anecdotes and personal  
13 experience over data, and I want to make sure that  
14 facts with the data and not noise. That's very  
15 important for my side of the district. It wasn't for  
16 noise in my district, Grand Street would stay the  
17 same, but we've seen fatalities of three bikers who  
18 have been killed and pedestrians that have also been  
19 killed on Grand Street, and people fear bike lanes,  
20 protected bike lanes. Everyone wants parking, and we  
21 can't allow that to rule the day. It always has to  
22 be safety first, and we've got to use data to make  
23 those decisions, and I want to make sure that you do  
24 that, and that as a Council Member, I will continue  
25 and always look out of the Department of

2 Transportation and the MTA so long as they're making  
3 changes based on facts and data. That is what is  
4 most important not who makes the most noise. The  
5 questions that I have that I wanted to ask are  
6 related the Citi Bike expansion or lack thereof. I  
7 want to know if anyone from Bushwick for example in  
8 Brooklyn is also losing or who is being affected by  
9 the L Train shutdown, whether or not they can see an  
10 expansion of Citi Bike Service and also Citi Bike  
11 Service being the important term because people don't  
12 want a different bike service to be implemented in  
13 Bushwick where you would have to take one bike  
14 service. Then get on Citi Bike, cross over the  
15 Williamsburg Bridge and continue on. They just  
16 wanted something that's all uniform, the same  
17 infrastructure so they can pay with their fobs, their  
18 Citi Bike fobs from Bushwick all the way to where  
19 they need to go in Manhattan and I just wanted to  
20 know whether or not that's something you're  
21 considering and where—where we are with that?

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: It's a good  
23 question. Again, it was nice to stand with you  
24 today, Council Member and at least announce what is  
25 the first phase of what we're ready to roll out with

2 Motivate, and I think it's going to be a great  
3 addition. You know, what we're really calling in.  
4 So, admittedly the existing territories focus on  
5 Manhattan from Canal to 59<sup>th</sup> on Williamsburg adding  
6 2,500 docks, 1,250 stations, but really trying to do  
7 it adding onto where we have existing stations to  
8 sort of minimize local impacts. We will nonetheless  
9 be coming back to all the local communities and  
10 community boards to refine those plans adding ten  
11 valet stations both on the Brooklyn side and the  
12 Manhattan side in Williamsburg along 14<sup>th</sup> Street and  
13 some of the other Lower Manhattan locations to make  
14 sure again we're really facilitating people using  
15 Citi Bike to get back and forth, and the Pedalist-  
16 Assist shuttle, which as you said today, you've  
17 ridden over the Williamsburg Bridge many, many times.  
18 It doesn't necessarily get easier. So, for some  
19 folks it will be really nice to have those Pedalist-  
20 Assist bikes. We're still discussing Bushwick. We  
21 recognize that scenario where obviously we're also  
22 expecting a lot of people using cycles to come in.  
23 There are still some of contractual things we're  
24 working through there, but it's certainly a  
25 discussion right now with Motivate.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: And related to  
3 the infrastructure that will be built out over the  
4 coming months. I just want to know what the—the  
5 process of—of what happens after we're done. What I  
6 don't want to see is the removal of all the  
7 infrastructure, and then a discussion to bring it  
8 back. I would rather have a discussion of what  
9 infrastructure can stay, and—and tweaking at the  
10 margins what we can take out, but I don't want to  
11 clean it out to have to bring it back. I'd rather  
12 have it stay there unless there's objections or data  
13 or information that speaks to why I should go. I  
14 just want to know what—what DOT is thinking.

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right, agreed  
16 and I—I want to be careful to distinguish because  
17 some of the improvements we are making to the Bike  
18 Network basically predate L Train. Actually, a lot  
19 of them on the Williamsburg side and also what we're  
20 going to be doing with the protected bike lane on  
21 Delancey Street. So, some of those, you know,  
22 already have been through the community process we're  
23 making permanent. Some of the infrastructure we're  
24 putting in specifically to help the MTA with—with  
25 their operations. What we're doing on Grand Street

2 and on 12<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup> Street. Those are temporary, but  
3 we agree what we would like to do is, you know, as we  
4 get into a certain amount of months of the shutdown  
5 start and evaluation process. How are they working?  
6 Are they safe? Are people using them? Is the—you  
7 know, is the community adjusting? Do we think this  
8 is something more because we agree? If in the end  
9 they're working and people want to keep them, by the  
10 time we're done with this whole process, we would  
11 like to keep them, but we have committed and we will  
12 absolutely be going through an evaluation process and  
13 giving everybody, elected officials, community  
14 boards, local residents and institutions the  
15 opportunity to be part of the dialogue on that.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: And just want to  
17 give another just DOT with the Pedalist-Assist by  
18 Citi Bike, for me—I—I rode the bike for three years  
19 over the Williamsburg Bridge. It never got easy  
20 ever. It was a difficult slog up the Williamsburg  
21 Bridge. Yeah, from my side more so than yours  
22 cutting that. I'm so sorry.

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I've got to go  
24 back.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Yeah, we do have  
3 to go back and forth, but knowing that there's  
4 Pedalist-Assist there would make it so that I wanted  
5 to—that ride. The last thing is just the MTA. This  
6 is my last question. Electric buses. I know that  
7 it's a—it's a concern on whether or not you have  
8 them. So, you there are two things here. You do have  
9 C and G buses, that are more—are cleaner than the  
10 diesel buses. I want to know if you can commit to  
11 putting as many electric buses than you have now on  
12 the road. If you don't have them for us for the L  
13 Train Shutdown, if you don't have them then maybe C  
14 and then when the order of new electric buses comes  
15 in for the MTA even if it's not at the beginning of  
16 this process, but even in between or in the middle of  
17 this process, there's a commitment that we get first  
18 dibs on those buses. It's very important that we  
19 start talking about [applause] the health and safety  
20 of our communities. Just want to note factually and  
21 data points again three times the entrants, three  
22 times the—three times more entrants in Woodhill  
23 Hospital related to asthma than anywhere in the city  
24 of New York. We have the third least amount of park  
25 space in Williamsburg than anywhere else in the city

2 of New York. Right, they're out of 51 districts.  
3 When we talk about an issue with health, this a  
4 large one and now you're going to add 90 buses a  
5 minute let's say over the Williamsburg Bridge running  
6 through out district and they not be electric or at  
7 least C and G worst case scenario. That's a  
8 concern.

9           ANDY BYFORD: Okay, thank you, Council  
10 Member. That—that issue has come up loud and clear.  
11 It certainly came up with the various tunnels that  
12 I've been at, and it's a regular topic that I think  
13 people are rightly concerned about. So just in the  
14 broader context of not really for the L Line, we have  
15 said very clearly in our plan, the bus element for  
16 this plan, we intend as long as the technology is  
17 proven to be robust, we intend to move to the all-  
18 electric bus fleet certainly by 2040. If we can do  
19 it earlier than that then we will, but closer to  
20 home, we will be buying more electric buses. We need  
21 to test the charging technology. This won't be  
22 roadside charging. It will be charging in depots.  
23 They will be charging facilities at Michael J. Quill  
24 Bus Depot in Manhattan, and we will be deploying  
25 electric buses as we get them onto the—onto 14<sup>th</sup>

2 Street and onto this—onto this shuttle. There won't  
3 be enough to—to service the whole of the shuttle,  
4 although I am talking to my bus team and the  
5 procurement people can we expedite the acquisition of  
6 those electric buses. C and G I think is a little  
7 more tricky because they're already deployed  
8 elsewhere. It's not that we don't have a C and G  
9 fleet just sitting ready to be redeployed elsewhere  
10 but I hear you. I know that people are worried about  
11 this, and it's my intention that we will deploy as  
12 many electric buses onto that route as possible, and  
13 I'm already asking questions about can we expedite  
14 the order.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you so  
16 much and keep up the good work.

17 ANDY BYFORD: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

19 Council Member Deutsch.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you,  
21 Chair. Good afternoon. First of all, I just want to  
22 tell you President Byford, I was fortunate to have a  
23 meeting with you when you first came on the job, and  
24 first of all, I love your accent. [laughter] You are  
25

2 very understanding. You know, the common sense  
3 approach to things, and I appreciate your leadership.

4 ANDY BYFORD: Okay.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: And I just want  
6 to remind you that if you get 400,000 people upset  
7 and tens of thousands of residents, you actually  
8 won't help.(sic) But I have a lot of confidence in  
9 you and I-I appreciate like I said your leadership.  
10 You have been really accessible, and responsive to  
11 the community. So, I thank you for that. So, first  
12 I'd like to bring up and this is to the inspector you  
13 mentioned about 102 traffic enforcement officers, and  
14 agents and 46 police officers. From the 102 how many  
15 of them are level 2 or traffic control officers, and  
16 how many of them are traffic agents?

17 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: The 102 that I  
18 mentioned will be specifically acting what you said  
19 as traffic control. So, they will be Level 2.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, how many  
21 traffic control officers do you have throughout the  
22 city?

23 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: Right now, I'd-  
24 I'd have to get the number. We have 25, roughly  
25 2,500 traffic enforcement agents, and most of them

2 are assigned to parking, but the traffic control I-  
3 I'd have to get [bell] back to you on the specific  
4 number of how many there are.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: [interposing]  
6 Yeah, throughout the year I've been trying to fight  
7 in the budget to increase the amount of traffic  
8 control officers. So, we're taking 102 traffic  
9 control officers now off the streets from other  
10 areas. Now, how will this affect other areas in  
11 regards to traffic?

12 INSPECTOR DENNIS FULTON: It will affect  
13 it, but we're going to make the best of what we have.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: [interposing] So,  
15 I think when we talk about it is to increase the  
16 traffic control officers immediately before this plan  
17 because if we are going to control traffic on the L  
18 Line area and we are going to increase traffic in  
19 other areas, then it's going to be a hazard to  
20 bicyclists, riders and—and motorists and pedestrians  
21 as well. So, I think we need to talk about these to  
22 make sure that from now 'til when the time gets  
23 started that we have more traffic control officers  
24 not only around the L Line construction, but through  
25 the city. So that's number 1. Number 2, I'd like to

2 bring up. Now the L Line runs through how many  
3 neighborhoods? This is for President Byford.

4 ANDY BYFORD: I would say how are you  
5 defining neighborhoods?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I'm sorry.

7 ANDY BYFORD: How-how are you defining  
8 neighborhoods?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Oh, okay so  
10 actually I'll-I'll as another question. How many  
11 miles is the L Lines? [background comments, pause]

12 ANDY BYFORD: I'm just checking our route  
13 up here. I have a lot of facts in my head. That one  
14 I don't have. Just bear with us one second.  
15 [background comments, pause] I was going to say 11,  
16 but it's the-it's either 11 or 15. We're just  
17 checking.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, it's between  
19 11 or 15 miles.

20 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] We're going  
21 to be specific. We've go it here.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Alright. Yeah,  
23 just a few miles won't make so much of a difference.

24 ANDY BYFORD: There you go. I was close  
25 to it. I said 11. It's 10.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, ten.

3 Alright, so you have 10 miles long, and the  
4 completion date is anticipated to be 15 months.

5 ANDY BYFORD: Correct.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, I would  
7 imagine that the work would be ongoing on most of the  
8 line. It's not going to be like piecemeal. It's  
9 going to be like working throughout the ten miles.

10 ANDY BYFORD: What? Throughout? Not the  
11 whole line the affected area of the line. I meant  
12 that the—the—most of the line, the Bedford—from  
13 Bedford Avenue down to the eastern. So, to get my  
14 geography right the eastern end is still open.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: It's still open.  
16 Okay. So—

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]  
18 You can sort of see on the slide the gray, that great  
19 part is still in operation.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Got it. Okay, I  
21 got it. So, my question is Council Member Reynoso  
22 mentioned about the health issues with—and having  
23 electric vehicles. What—what is your rat mitigation  
24 plan. We have approximately two million rats. I  
25 don't know how they—they estimated 2 million rats in

2 the city of New York, but many of them nest in the  
3 subway system, and when you have construction where  
4 are they going to end up going? Out in the  
5 community. So, I'd like to know what is your rat  
6 mitigation plan before and during construction.

7 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm. On any big  
8 construction job we do—we are aware of that issue,  
9 that if you undertake the work in a particular subway  
10 tunnel or if you undertake even the work in a station  
11 that the rats get displaced. So that is—there is a  
12 rat mitigation plan factored into their work.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Well, I haven't  
14 seen anything on that.

15 ANDY BYFORD: Sure, but I mean it's a—  
16 it's a standard practice where our contractors. They  
17 know that they have to deal with them as they—as they  
18 encounter them.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yeah. So, I  
20 just want to mention that if the Administration could  
21 let us know what that plan is and how it's going to  
22 affect the community, the surrounding community. We  
23 have a rat infestation throughout our city already  
24 [bell] and disturbing the nests will make it—it's a  
25 large issue so--

2           ANDY BYFORD: The one—the one thing I  
3 would say is that the affected area, which is—it's  
4 not the Manhattan side under—under 14<sup>th</sup> Street  
5 because that's—that's—that is somewhat going on in  
6 there but—but—but a little intrusive for it. Most—  
7 most of the work is obviously in the tunnel and to  
8 the East River. I—I very much doubt that there would  
9 be too much of a rat problem within that tunnel under  
10 the river, but certainly, it is something that we are  
11 mindful of and we'll get you some details.

12           COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you and  
13 finally I have one more question. We have about—  
14 approximately 63,000 homeless people in the City of  
15 New York, and we have approximately 4,500 who live  
16 out on the streets who are unsheltered, and I'm not  
17 sure of the exact number of how many live in the  
18 tunnels and the subways. So, during this shutdown, we  
19 need to make sure that homeless individuals rely on  
20 people calling 311 to have breaking ground and the  
21 pertinent agencies respond. So, when you have this  
22 shutdown, you don't have any ridership coming in  
23 there. So, do you have a plan on those who are  
24 working underground or those who are working in the  
25 tunnel that if they observe a homeless person what he

2 or she needs to do because again, we don't want—we  
3 want to make sure they get taken care of--

4 ANDY BYFORD: Sure.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: --and they don't  
6 leave those areas where they are right now, and then  
7 they end up sleeping all over the streets in  
8 different areas and under the boardwalks and the  
9 beaches and anywhere else. We need to make sure we  
10 take care of them. So, do you have a plan on that?

11 ANDY BYFORD: Well, the actual tunnel  
12 section will be a secure site because it's a building  
13 site. So, that wouldn't be a factor within the—the  
14 tunnel because clearly you need to maintain security  
15 in there so that people don't just wander into what  
16 would be a dangerous location. With regards to the—  
17 the rest the line, from the East River side across to  
18 the west side of Manhattan, there will—there will be  
19 personnel keeping on the stations. If people are  
20 found to be in the stations, then we would obviously  
21 make sure that they were asked to leave, but they  
22 were probably looked after.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, great.  
24 So, just—if you just let them know that some type of  
25 training and just let them know what they—what they

2 need to do. So, I just want end off by—it's not a  
3 question. I just want to end up with a comment  
4 saying once again thank you. I've seen this plan  
5 more than once, and I truly appreciate this  
6 comprehensive plan and your leadership and  
7 Commissioner Trottenberg, yours as well. So thank  
8 you very much.

9 ANDY BYFORD: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,  
11 Council Member. We have Council Member Powers—Powers  
12 followed by Council Members Rivera and Espinal, and  
13 then we have 48 members of the public who are ready  
14 to testify and more may—everyone is encouraged also  
15 to come, and still they have time if they would like  
16 to come and do the testimony on their feedback and  
17 suggestions on how we can work together with this  
18 plan. So, with that, Council Member Powers followed  
19 by Council Member Rivera.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you and I  
21 will in respect of everybody who is here who wants to  
22 testify individually, I will just very short  
23 questions to let people get to theirs and my Council  
24 colleagues. Just a quick question because I mean it  
25 just came up here today, but you—they're changing the

2 plan from 5:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. I will note I  
3 actually was in support of 20—the 24/7 plan. I was on  
4 the Manhattan side and—and did think that it offered  
5 an opportunity to maybe be bold in terms of how we  
6 move people along across the industry (sic) but to  
7 ensure we were just moving the buses along as fast as  
8 possible. I know that I represent Stuyvesant Town  
9 and Peter Cooper and I live right next to the L Train  
10 Station. I take it every single day, and so having a  
11 way to get across absent other vehicles like cabs and  
12 so forth to me it was meaningful. Can you tell us  
13 and—and one of the things that convinced me at  
14 exactly with the borders we should do was the day—I  
15 asked this the other day, but I wanted to in the  
16 hearing, too. The data that you provided to—to the  
17 Council Members about the speeds along 14<sup>th</sup> Street  
18 was convincing to me that you could start at Third  
19 Avenue versus First Avenue or Avenue C, and keep  
20 track that of it fast. I'm not seeing data on this  
21 new plan that talks about speeds or time to get  
22 across 14<sup>th</sup> Street with the addition of new vehicles.  
23 I mean are you going to show that. (sic) So, I would  
24 just-help be convinced that adding those vehicles  
25 and—and this is the proper compromise amongst

2 everybody concerns. [bell] Can you tell us exactly  
3 the speeds and the impact on time times to get from  
4 first Avenue to the other side or--?

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I want to—I  
6 just want say, Council Member Powers, you mean by  
7 adding vehicles and allowing the local access?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Yes.

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Okay. Well  
10 again I—I think we'll—we can get you some data on  
11 what we—luckily, we think it's not going to have a  
12 big effect on travel time because as I mentioned in  
13 my testimony, we actually looked at the taxi data,  
14 and we saw, and I think pleasantly surprised that  
15 even now before the shutdown of the L Train on 14<sup>th</sup>  
16 Street is operating as it normally will. Most taxi  
17 pickup and drop-offs are happening on the avenues.  
18 There's not that much of it on 14<sup>th</sup> Street. So, I  
19 think that's the good news. We actually don't think  
20 there's—we think we can do both. We can accommodate  
21 the local access that we heard so clearly. At our  
22 town hall meeting, local residents were concerned  
23 about and it won't have a massive effect on bus  
24 speeds, and I want to let Eric add a bit on that.

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. So,  
3 that's something we take very seriously is, you know,  
4 we heard quite a bit and think it's really important  
5 to provide this local access for the people who do  
6 really need to be there, but at the same time it's  
7 not going to be easy. The message for most people is  
8 going to be if you're able to go to an avenue that  
9 will usually provide you a faster trip. And so, we  
10 think it will be fairly few vehicles. Just for  
11 comparison on 14<sup>th</sup> Street right now, there's in the  
12 range of 500 vehicles an hour each direction, and  
13 when you look at the number of pickups and drop-offs  
14 that have been on most blocks it's under 50 per hour.  
15 So, it's really such a dramatic drop in volume that  
16 even if all of those keep happening, and none of them  
17 moved to the avenues, I think the buses should be  
18 able to keep moving at good speed, and then from a  
19 street design perspective, we want to provide places  
20 where those vehicles can pull off to the side, and  
21 buses can still pass. So, the—the net is that we  
22 think there will be very, very little—real change to  
23 the bus speeds from allowing this. It also allows  
24 for a very clean enforcement system primarily using  
25 cameras so that we don't have people getting confused

2 and having to ask are you a resident? What's your  
3 purpose here? Which again would have the potential  
4 to slow buses in a way that doesn't necessarily show  
5 up in a computer model.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Yeah, my concern  
7 is that—

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]  
9 Sorry, Council Member, but can you please say your  
10 name and your title please.

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Sure. My  
12 name is Eric Beaton, and I'm the Deputy Commissioner  
13 for Transportation Planning and Management at DOT.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you I'm  
15 sorry.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I would just ask  
17 to maybe get some information more data sort of  
18 speeds because that was helpful to me to make it.  
19 You made it kind of—you already made it in the last  
20 round, and—and that when we are adding, I think we're  
21 creating some confusion, maybe some confusion because  
22 we're mixing the different types, local and cabs and  
23 things like that, and I think it would be helpful to  
24 know the impact on speed. I'll just ask the last the  
25 last few questions so we can, we can keep moving so

2 the public can get to their question. You added—you  
3 announced the new—you announced new city Citi Bikes  
4 today. I want to get an understanding of what—if you  
5 knew where exactly those would be around the L Train  
6 stations. I wanted to ask a question quickly about  
7 24/7 construction around 14<sup>th</sup> and 1<sup>st</sup>. I want to thank  
8 some of your team for coming out and myself and  
9 current—and Council Member Rivera last week, but  
10 there is a real concern I have about the 24/7 and the  
11 noise around 14<sup>th</sup> and 1<sup>s</sup> because we're hearing already  
12 from neighbors and you're going to be moving into a  
13 24/7 period, and how do we—how do we, you know,  
14 reconcile that with the people that live immediately  
15 adjacent to 14<sup>th</sup> and 1<sup>st</sup>, and those are my two  
16 questions.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I think I'll—  
18 I'll tackle Citi Bike—

19 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: [interposing]  
20 yeah.

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --and turn it  
22 over to the MTA on the construction question and  
23 look, we know you've—you've mentioned before  
24 Stuyvesant Town. We know there's a desire to—to—to  
25 beef up and improve the [bell] the Citi Bike service

2 there, and again, we're going to be looking with a  
3 big emphasis. We're going to be doing infill again  
4 as I mentioned from Canal up to 59<sup>th</sup>, but first  
5 priority is going to be making sure that we're  
6 getting enough Citi Bikes in all the areas that are  
7 going to be affected by the L Train. We will be  
8 coming back to all of you to get your input with  
9 Motivate, you know, to make sure we think we have the  
10 kind of service you all need.

11           ANDY BYFORD: Thank you. With regard to  
12 noise mitigation, there are controls and limits on  
13 the contractors as to what they can do, and when they  
14 can do it. So, we are specifying the type of  
15 activity that can help them. Clearly, you don't want  
16 people drilling all night right next to residential  
17 areas, but as—we're—we're getting down to fine detail  
18 even looking at things that drive people crazy like  
19 the back alarms. We will be trying wherever possible  
20 to have vehicles fitted with buzzers. There's a  
21 buzzer that doesn't—it just—it effectively creates  
22 white noise rather than the beeping, but we—we can't  
23 say for certain that there will be none of that  
24 because some subcontractors may not have their  
25 vehicles fitted, but we will be keeping a very close

2 eye on this. We intend to be good neighbors  
3 throughout the construction period.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I appreciate and  
5 again, I do want to say your team did com out. I'm  
6 not putting them on the spot. It was last week you  
7 gave thanks. (sic) So, we are certainly waiting for  
8 some answer on that, but we've been hearing  
9 complaints already, and-and-and they're real.  
10 They're not, you know, and-and so I-I do think that  
11 there's a fairness issue around doing, you know,  
12 construction right in front of somebody's house 24/7,  
13 and whatever we can do immediately to keep either  
14 hours down or the noise and certain hours down, we'll  
15 go a long way to help make this-I think this project  
16 and not have to try to do this later on in the  
17 project. I have a number of other questions, but I  
18 will follow up with you guys to get some answers.

19 ANDY BYFORD: But on that point, Council  
20 member, I will follow up with my team. We do intend  
21 to be good neighbors. So, we'll come back to you on  
22 that. Appreciate it.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,  
25 Council Member. Council Member Carlina Rivera.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Hi. Thank you so  
3 much for being here. I know Reynoso mentioned having  
4 the most L stops, but I have the most L stops that  
5 will be closed down. So, I just want to [laughter]  
6 put that on the record of why I'm here because I see  
7 so many of my neighbors and—and many, many tenant  
8 leaders here. Specifically, I see many people from  
9 East 14<sup>th</sup> Street in the Victoria House who live right  
10 on 14<sup>th</sup> Street, and so I just want to thank you all  
11 for spending your time here. I know there's other  
12 buildings here, but there are a lot of you here, and  
13 I see you. So, a couple of things. Of course the  
14 Council Member also mentioned the things that I am  
15 concerned about, which are some of the—the air quality  
16 concerns that we have considering how many buses. I  
17 know by 2040 you're looking for this electric fleet,  
18 and I'm very, very happy about that. That is 22  
19 years from now, and so I just want to emphasize that  
20 I realize that it costs—it's very costly, but the  
21 long-term investment considering the asthma rates in  
22 my district and, of course, in other Council Member's  
23 districts is so, so important. And I want to talk a  
24 little bit about Community outreach. Thank you so  
25 much for having this hearing. I also want to thank

2 the Chair. We are actually in District 2 in my  
3 district, and so I just want to welcome you all.

4 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: We're across the  
5 street from District 3.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: And we're--  
7 [laughter] You know, Corey, you weren't there like  
8 two minutes ago. [laughter] We're across the  
9 street--

10 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: This is the  
11 voiceover of District 3.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVER: --Corey, yes, we  
13 share Fifth Avenue. [bell]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: You can walk to  
15 District 4 by the way.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: So, yes.  
17 [laughter] Alright so six stops are closed, three  
18 stops are in District 2. It's going to be a  
19 logistical challenge, and I want to thank you for  
20 your comment on implementing this plan. It will  
21 neither be quick, cheap or easy. Nothing of quality  
22 or of convenience is. So, I want to talk  
23 specifically about District 2 stuff. When can we  
24 expect the protected bike lanes on 12<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup>  
25 Streets to be installed?

2                   COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I can't give  
3 you an exact time table on that right now because  
4 actually that is part of the-sort of the larger-  
5 addressing of impacts that we're working with the  
6 MTA, and we're right now as I think some of you know,  
7 having some back and forth with our federal  
8 regulators. There are some litigations pending. So,  
9 I don't think I can speak to exactly when the date is  
10 going to be. DOT is ready to go. We're just I think  
11 waiting on sort of our marching orders from MTA about  
12 when we can proceed.

13                   COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: You didn't--

14                   ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] And as we  
15 know, we'll let you know.

16                   COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Okay, great  
17 because I know that we had discussed having I think  
18 presenting this as the Speaker mentioned, again to  
19 the community especially since we didn't have an e-  
20 site forum, and I know we've been in conversation  
21 with that commissioner, too.

22                   COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]  
23 And we will certainly have time to do that--

24                   COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: [interposing]  
25 Okay.

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --before we  
3 would go forward with that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Okay. I didn't  
5 see anything about the pedestrian plazas that you had  
6 originally included in your plan. One of them would  
7 have been on Union Square West, and one of them would  
8 have been south--just south of 14<sup>th</sup> Street on  
9 University Place. Are you going to have pedestrian  
10 plazas installed in this plan?

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Those are  
12 still part of the plan. I think today for purposes  
13 of not inundating you with some of the same  
14 information over and over, we wanted to focus on the  
15 areas where I think we heard particularly in our  
16 community forums there was a lot of feedback a lot of  
17 concerns and between the two agencies trying to  
18 address them the best we could.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Okay, and I guess  
20 the last comment and I guess I still have a little  
21 bit of time. Some of the buses, the L1 stop just  
22 concerned about what the community notice of that is  
23 going to be like as well as the new M14 SBS. We  
24 would--I would love it and I've heard from many, many  
25 of commuters that it would be great if that bus line

2 was actually permanent going forward. If you can  
3 consider that, and that I want to just have you  
4 reconfirm that the M9 and the M14-A and the M14-D  
5 service will at minimum remain at the current levels  
6 in addition to the buses that are going to be going  
7 back and forth.

8 PETER CAFIERO: So, your last question  
9 yes absolutely they will remain at the current levels  
10 and again if we see ridership change on those routes  
11 that needs more service, we can add buses to them.  
12 In terms of the M14 Select Bus, I think joint intent  
13 with the Department of Transportation was the 14<sup>th</sup>  
14 Street Corridor does need a Select Bus Service  
15 permanently. But again, similar to the—to the  
16 Commissioner's answer on the bike lanes, this is one  
17 where we will do additional outreach after this  
18 initial plan is in and come up with a permanent  
19 option that integrates the 14-A and D into that  
20 service.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Alright, and as  
22 for the—the loading and unloading zones, you  
23 mentioned for example Access-A-Ride and having  
24 access. How—what is the signage or the designations  
25 are going to be like? Are they going to be clear?

2 And then I'm going to get into outreach. That's my  
3 immediate next question as to how we are going to  
4 alert the community of these changes, and whether  
5 you're considering implementing some of them a little  
6 bit earlier than April 2019 so people can get used to  
7 them.

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Good questions  
9 and I think certainly in your correspondence to us  
10 what we heard from you and some of your constituents  
11 the need to improve local accessibility, and I-I put  
12 up the chart that sort is what a sample block would  
13 look like. We're going to both create loading zones,  
14 and clearly make sure we get the right signage and  
15 markings, and-and PD is going to help us with  
16 enforcement [bell] particularly both for commercial,  
17 for residents, Access-A-Ride taxis, et cetera, but  
18 we-we've also again baked into this design for those  
19 residents who for mobility reasons or for whatever,  
20 they need to be picked up right in front of their  
21 door. They'll be able to do that as well. To the  
22 extent that they can go to the loading zone,  
23 obviously that will help us keep the buses moving.  
24 We also fully recognize this is going to be an  
25 enormous public education challenge, and we are

2 certainly working through the plan of starting some  
3 of these designs. We're not going to start it all on  
4 day one. We'll—we'll be rolling some of the things  
5 out ahead of time to give people an opportunity to  
6 get used to them, and trial run them before the  
7 actual shutdown occurs.

8           ANDY BYFORD: May I—may I just add to  
9 that, Council Member just very briefly? I did have  
10 that experience in Toronto. We did something very,  
11 very similar. The King Streetcar, which is the  
12 busiest streetcar in North America [coughing], 60,000  
13 riders a day. It was a bit of an embarrassment to be  
14 hones. You could easily walk quicker than the  
15 streetcar because the streetcars were hopelessly  
16 snarled in traffic. One turning car stopped the  
17 whole line. Those streetcars kind of overtake. So  
18 we—so we—so it was a radical thing that we did along  
19 King Street, and it's a very, very useful model for  
20 what we're going to do here and it gave us some  
21 valuable insight into how to get the signage right,  
22 the communication right, the loading zones right, the  
23 exemptions right. Things like Access-A-Ride. So, we  
24 do start from an informed position.

2                   COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I-I do just  
3 want to add because again and I-and I've also spoken  
4 to my counterpart Barbara Gray whose Toronto's head  
5 of their transportation department, and we-we are  
6 actually going to organize a trip to go out and see  
7 it, and we've invited any elected officials or staff  
8 members who would like to come with us because I  
9 think it's potentially really useful for all of us to  
10 go take a look because I think we're lucky to have  
11 President Byford here. Toronto has I think tackled  
12 all of these same issues on King Street, and-and from  
13 what we've heard, it's worked really well. People  
14 like it, businesses like it. The streetcar is  
15 moving. It's been pretty transformational.

16                   COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: And so I'll just  
17 say thank you. Please consider us partners in  
18 getting out the information. As long as we get it in  
19 due time, we will let our constituents know. Just-  
20 just give us ample warning, and then as for  
21 communication also, my district and I know not every  
22 district is like this, but we do have an incredible  
23 amount of LinkNYCs. So, if you can try to utilize  
24 those in terms of your marketing campaign and  
25 specifically around some of the bus stops, I think

2 that that would be smart use of the LinkNYCs. So,  
3 thank you so much for your work on this. Thank you,  
4 Mr. Chair.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.  
6 [applause] Mr. President, what is the budget for  
7 this project? What is the cost estimate?

8 ANDY BYFORD: [pause] It's a lot.  
9 [laughter] You asked me to be honest on—on those and  
10 I guess one of my colleagues would have to take that.  
11 I don't know because I have a lot of stats in my  
12 head. I would have to check that. I—I mean I can  
13 probably text someone right now and find it out and  
14 come back to you.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, that is  
16 important.

17 ANDY BYFORD: I'll do that.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Because, you  
19 know, this is about building trust. I mean for  
20 whatever reason, you show like a good energy. From  
21 the Council one that really wants to be measured and  
22 accountable. [background comments, pause] So, and—  
23 and my [coughs] my second question is being in a  
24 wheelchair is a matter of time. There's no age. It  
25 doesn't matter—it doesn't—I mean there's not a moment

2 where it can be, we can be in a wheelchair because of  
3 our age. It can be because we are dealing with some  
4 health issues that we have in our life. However, MTA  
5 has failed in the past, and that is another crisis  
6 that is affecting our city. Everyday the population  
7 of New Yorkers who need accessibility, is increasing.  
8 However, the numbers of the station with accessible  
9 is too low. What plan do we—I mean in general do we  
10 have in place--

11 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] We certainly  
12 do.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --to be sure that  
14 we address that crisis and what do--what should we  
15 expect to be coming after the renovation of the L  
16 Train lane?

17 ANDY BYFORD: Okay. So, for the L Train  
18 specifically, we will be putting in an elevator to  
19 serve the L Line and the F Line on--at Sixth Avenue.  
20 We are making accessibility improvements at other  
21 stations on the line. More on a--on a macro level,  
22 this plan in addition to a massive acceleration in  
23 signaling, this also sees a huge acceleration in the  
24 implementation of the accessible--accessibility, thank  
25 you, accessibility features and that's deliberate.

2 So, what we're saying is in the next five years, we  
3 will install more than 50, we'll—we'll make more than  
4 50 stations accessible and that's a doubling of what  
5 we're currently doing. In the following five years,  
6 we'll make 130 stations more—we'll make them  
7 accessible. Since I got here, we've initiated a  
8 survey being undertaken by a company called Stantec  
9 whose mandate is to survey all of the remaining  
10 stations to find out what the feasibility, the  
11 complexity and the costs and the options for all of  
12 those remaining stations. In the last 100 days we've  
13 also for the first time appointed an accessibility  
14 advisor. He started on Monday. Alex Golden (sic) who  
15 is my full-time now reporting to me or my Executive  
16 Accessibility Advisor, and it's a very useful person  
17 to have. He's very a useful person to have because  
18 he is now my go-to person for accessibility. He will  
19 liaise with the community. He will liaise with  
20 advocacy groups. He will look at projects such as  
21 this with an accessibility lens. So, that's why I  
22 made reference to this in my opening comments about  
23 it being one of the four equal priorities for—for New  
24 York City Transit. Now, one thing I should, of  
25 course say is that—that's all predicated on funding,

2 but subject to funding the fast forward plan, we will  
3 rapidly accelerate the accessibility of this system  
4 and rightly so because it's not right that a lot of  
5 New Yorkers are currently excluded from the system.  
6 I have just been handed back a figure. The total  
7 budget is \$900 million, and the construction bid  
8 costs was \$472 million, but overall \$900 million.  
9 So, as I said, it's a lot of money.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Is that the same  
11 figure from the beginning or that number has been  
12 increasing from the moment when the project was  
13 presented 'til today?

14 ANDY BYFORD: My understanding is the-the  
15 figure is what we've-we've always expected it to be.  
16 It gets refined over time, as you-as you refine the  
17 design. It's our intention to come in on time, on  
18 budget.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, thank you.  
20 So, Speaker Johnson.

21 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes. Thank you,  
22 again. I don't want to take too long because I know  
23 that, I want to see the presentation from the 14<sup>th</sup>  
24 Street Coalition. They always work very hard and I  
25 want to stay and hear what they have to say, and they

2 spent a lot of time and work on that, and I hope you  
3 all will do the same thing, stay and watch their  
4 presentation. They're very invested and they've  
5 spent an enormous amount of volunteer hours working  
6 on this plan. So, I want to thank them for their  
7 patience. Give me a percentage of this project being  
8 completed on time?

9 ANDY BYFORD: By that, you mean my  
10 confidence?

11 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes. Fifteen  
12 months. No longer than 15 months?

13 ANDY BYFORD: I'm pretty confident. I  
14 would say, you know, I answer questions. You ask me  
15 a question. I'll give you an honest answer. I  
16 believe—I'm—I'm pretty confident. I think we could  
17 bring it in early. It's incentivized to be brought  
18 in early. So, right now I would say I'm 95% certain  
19 or north thereof that it will come in on time, and my  
20 colleagues--

21 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing]  
22 Those are good odds.

23 ANDY BYFORD: Yeah, I am confident and  
24 the reason I am confident, Mr. Speaker, is because we  
25 have put so much effort into getting the—the right

2 contractor doing the staging properly, thinking  
3 through all of the methodologies and the actual work  
4 content. The other that we have to our advantage is  
5 this isn't the first tunnel renovation. We just  
6 reopened. One of the other tunnels. The Court Street  
7 Tunnel just reopened. We have had a--

8 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: This is the R  
9 Train.

10 ANDY BYFORD: Yeah, this is the last  
11 tunnel to be done. So, this is the worst affected.  
12 This is the most difficult to do, but in terms of  
13 actually renovating tunnels, we're getting pretty  
14 good at it. So, I'd say the very high 90s, you know,  
15 and I could be pretty wrong. People will quote me on  
16 that. You asked me a question. So I answered it.

17 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, the—I know  
18 that every project is different, and every project  
19 has its own challenges, and we talked about the  
20 enormous complexity of this project and the  
21 challenges associated with it, and I would like to  
22 say is not me trying to score cheap points against  
23 you or the MTA, but I think it's just important. The  
24 Fulton Station was years behind schedule and billions  
25 of dollars over budget.

2 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

3 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: The 7 Train  
4 extension to Hudson Yards was not over budget, but it  
5 kept getting delayed and delayed and delayed and  
6 delayed. The Second Avenue Subway was able to get  
7 open I guess on New Year's Eve, but in the aftermath  
8 of it, there was a lot of pieces that we know weren't  
9 finished in the proper way, and so the punch list was  
10 very, very long on this stuff that actually still had  
11 to happen after the Second Avenue Subway extension  
12 was done. So, I really hope that this sets a new  
13 precedent and potentially paradigm for getting  
14 complex system wide overarching projects done on a  
15 good timeline on budget in a way that involves the  
16 local communities that are affected and that has real  
17 level of transparency for the public. I think the  
18 most frustrating thing is, of course, people would be  
19 angry if it was delayed, and they don't want it to be  
20 delayed, but just like it's never fun to hear we're  
21 delayed because of train traffic ahead, without any  
22 explanation of what that means, just a generic thing,  
23 the more information the better.

24 ANDY BYFORD: That's right.

25

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: To continue to  
3 update the public throughout the process, here's the  
4 completion. Here's where we're doing well so that  
5 people have a sense okay it's moving forward. It's  
6 going on, or okay there are unexpected challenges  
7 that were found and that is going to make us put more  
8 money into it or need additional contractors, or  
9 additional workers. I think a level of transparency  
10 throughout the life of the project is going to be  
11 very important for the public and for, you know, for  
12 the city as a whole.

13 ANDY BYFORD: So, I could give you a  
14 really lengthy answer there, but I'm just going to  
15 say I entirely agree with you. I can't turn the  
16 clock back, but I think my—hopefully my record today  
17 shows that I do believe in transparency. This—this  
18 plan is predicated on transparency. It's my  
19 intention to public report—publicly report the New  
20 York City Transit Committee meeting. In my publicly  
21 available President's Report, I intend to report out  
22 on progress on this project every month.

23 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Great. I want to  
24 turn it back to the Chair and I believe—are we going  
25 to have the 14<sup>th</sup> Street Coalition presenting?

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I think Carlina  
3 has a question.

4 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay, go ahead.  
5 Sorry. I apologize.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Taking questions  
7 is a priority. (sic) If you have a question then  
8 yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes, it's not  
10 even a question. It's a quick comment. I was going  
11 to ask if you could tell your colleagues at the  
12 Department of Buildings to seriously consider a  
13 moratorium of construction on 14<sup>th</sup> Street.

14 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes. [applause]

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: So, well  
16 actually, I know you're dismayed. Let me actually  
17 give a little answer on that because that is a  
18 discussion we have started with our colleagues in the  
19 Department of Buildings and the Department of Design  
20 and Construction, and the Department of Environmental  
21 Protection and City Hall ,and we have started to map  
22 out all the potential construction projects along the  
23 Corridors in Manhattan and in Brooklyn and coming  
24 together on how we're going to tackle that very issue

2 So, believe Department of Buildings is in the loop  
3 and we're working through it.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, with that,  
6 now let's move onto the public panel for their  
7 presentation from the 14<sup>th</sup> Street Coalition.  
8 [background comments, pause] And as the Speaker said,  
9 we would like to for the President and the  
10 Commissioner to please stay a little bit of portion  
11 of the presentation, and then we're going to after  
12 the presentation, we're going to be continue calling  
13 members of the public. We have 48 members who are  
14 signed to testify. [background comments, pause] So,  
15 the Commission will have 20 minutes to present, and  
16 then the rest of the public will have 2 minutes each.  
17 [background comments, pause]

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Hi everyone. Hi  
20 there.

21 JULIANNE BOND: Hi. Female.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Hi.

23 JULIANNE BOND: Okay, should we start?

24 My name is Julianne Bond, and I along with Judy  
25 Pesin, Co-Chair of the 14<sup>th</sup> Street Coalition.

2 JULIANNE BOND: Okay, should we start?

3 My name is Julianne Bond and I along with Judy Pesin,  
4 Co-Chair of the 14<sup>th</sup> Street Coalition. The Coalition  
5 thanks City Council Speaker Johnson and  
6 Transportation Committee Chair Rodriguez for the  
7 opportunity to present our community concerns and our  
8 recommendations to the MTA, DOT Mitigation Plans for  
9 the L Train shutdown to repair the Canarsie Tunnel.  
10 As reference, the 14<sup>th</sup> Street Coalition is a diverse  
11 community of tens of thousands of individuals and  
12 business owners who live, work, go to school and  
13 commute all over Downtown Manhattan. We are so named  
14 because 14<sup>th</sup> Street is home to the L Train in  
15 Manhattan and will be ground zero during the L Train  
16 shutdown for repairs to the Canarsie Tunnel. We  
17 understand agree that the L Train Tunnel needs to be  
18 repaired, but at the same time, we are quite clear  
19 that the impact of the DOT and MTA's Proposed  
20 Mitigation Plans during this project will be felt  
21 well beyond 14<sup>th</sup> Street, adversely affecting  
22 stakeholders in all parts of Downtown Manhattan and  
23 in Brooklyn. This is one of the reasons that we have  
24 asked for an environmental impact study to better  
25 understand the entire impact on all of the affected

2 neighborhoods. We have come together to ask our  
3 elected officials and the MTA and the DOT to come up  
4 with a mitigation plan that provides for temporary  
5 changes to accommodate the L Train tunnel repair, a  
6 plan that strikes a more cohesive balance between the  
7 potential needs of displaced commuters relative to  
8 the inherent needs of local businesses and  
9 residential communities within the 14<sup>th</sup> Street  
10 Corridor and surrounding downtown neighborhoods that  
11 will be affected 24 hours a day, 7 days a week by any  
12 plan. As you know, affected communities and local  
13 stakeholders continue to be frustrated by the DOT and  
14 the MTA's lack of responsiveness to our legitimate  
15 concerns. Steering committee members Bill Borak  
16 (sp?) and David Marcus will address these concerns  
17 some of which you may already be aware. [pause]

18                   DAVID MARCUS: So, I just want to  
19 reiterate. My name is David Marcus. I want to  
20 reiterate we recognize the need to close the Canarsie  
21 Tunnel for repairs and the impact it will have on  
22 commuters, but we are working towards a solution that  
23 while mindful of commuter needs addresses the needs  
24 and concerns of the local residents, and businesses

2 in neighborhoods that will be affected 24/7 by any  
3 plan. Bill.

4 BILL BORAK: A lot of these concerns were  
5 already raised by Speaker Johnson and some of the  
6 other Council people. So, I'm just going to quickly  
7 mention them: The increased environment and health  
8 issues. We're concerned about quality of life, noise  
9 pollution, congestion and Safety. DOT predicts a 50%  
10 increase in vehicle traffic on 14<sup>th</sup> Street. That's a  
11 concern. According to New York City health  
12 environmental data, our neighborhoods are already  
13 over-congested and already have health problems  
14 because of the pollution, et cetera. [background  
15 comment]

16 DAVID MARCUS: So, a lot has been talked  
17 about, the restrict access to 14<sup>th</sup> Street. I know  
18 questions have been asked so I'm going to cut my  
19 remarks, but one of the things is, you know, there's  
20 a vague 11<sup>th</sup> hour plan all of a sudden to allow for  
21 pick-up and drop-off of local residents and visitors,  
22 but it's without detail and it falls far short of our  
23 concerns. [mic static] Also, at the 11<sup>th</sup> hour there  
24 seems to have been a determination, which was buried  
25 in a response to our lawsuit. About the time of the

2 crossway (sic) operation from 5:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m.  
3 and we feel that that speaks poorly of DOT's claim  
4 that they have collaborated with the community when,  
5 in fact they still refused to meet with us. The  
6 other thing and in all due respect, providing for  
7 East River commuters should not should not include  
8 allow them to have equal sway over the 14<sup>th</sup> Street  
9 traffic patterns and their effect on surrounding  
10 neighborhoods and communities. As was suggested by  
11 Commissioner Trottenberg when she explained the  
12 compromise. We had nothing to do with that  
13 discussion. We are concerned about the denied access  
14 for residents on University Place between 13<sup>th</sup> and  
15 14<sup>th</sup> from their very front doors. Many of those  
16 buildings don't have access to other ingress or  
17 egress. Their front doors are right on University  
18 Place. Neither DOT nor NYPD can provide information  
19 on any other New York City mixed-use residential  
20 street in which traffic is banned and right of access  
21 is denied. We're concerned about medical facilities,  
22 Mount Sinai, New York Eye and Ear, urgent care  
23 clinics and we're also concerned with the urgent care  
24 clinics who often need ambulance service to take care  
25 patients to real hospitals will not have access to

2 these facilities. Issues of daily life. I think of  
3 simple things like where will the garbage be put for  
4 pickup? How will people get furniture, package and  
5 food deliveries? They'll be obstructed customer and  
6 delivery access to businesses and then there's the  
7 issue of the three garages on 14<sup>th</sup> Street where we're  
8 told there will be some system, but I think we need  
9 the details on that. The other concern, again, it was  
10 talked about so I'll touch briefly. It was switched.  
11 We were talking about the two-way bike lane and  
12 yesterday I switched it to 12<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup> Street  
13 Bikeway. It's another 11<sup>th</sup> hour change that was  
14 buried in the court filings. It wasn't publicly  
15 announced until the newspapers got ahold of it. The  
16 change incorrectly represents it was the choice of  
17 the community in order to protect their parking  
18 spaces, which is not true because, you know, 10 years  
19 ago 13<sup>th</sup> Street petitioned DOT and actually they  
20 granted us our wish, and we restricted parking on our  
21 street because we recognized the congestion. It's not  
22 about parking spots. The already congested side  
23 streets are far too narrow for dedicated protected  
24 bike lanes particularly during a period of projected  
25 increased vehicular traffic. That's estimated 50%

2 increase in vehicular volume on the narrow  
3 residential side streets makes it impossible to  
4 accommodate their estimated 2,000 to five days of  
5 daily bicyclists. The side street congestion will  
6 create major response time delays and hamper access  
7 for ambulance, fire trucks, police vehicles,  
8 Sanitation trucks, delivery trucks and will create  
9 unsafe conditions for pedestrians and cyclists alike,  
10 or uncoordinated construction projects, we'll pass on  
11 that because I'm pleased to hear that there's a  
12 recognition that that's being dealt with and I think  
13 that's good thing. And then, in all due respect, we  
14 still believe there's a lack of transparency. We  
15 don't know which changes will be permanent and which  
16 are only temporary. The proposed infrastructure  
17 changes are of a permanent nature, but we're being  
18 told that there-it's only to accommodate the L train.  
19 It's hard to imagine that a lot of that is going to  
20 be-deconstructed when this over. The recent plan  
21 modifications were buried in amended court documents  
22 without communicating to the public until new  
23 services read it in the documents and asked  
24 questions. We have a list of ten questions that we  
25 permit-prepared for the first TV borough president

2 meeting for DOT to respond to the effect on the  
3 communities. They have refused to answer our  
4 questions, and still refuse, and we're waiting.

5 BILL BORAK: Another concern, which is a  
6 major concern that really hasn't been addressed to is  
7 the damage to our fragile and historic  
8 infrastructure. 14<sup>th</sup> Street was rebuilt in 1990 with  
9 the express purpose of handling heavier and more  
10 frequent traffic. The side streets were not. The  
11 use of residential streets will be impacted. I have  
12 a letter here. It was just sent yesterday not far  
13 from where Speaker Johnson lives on 19<sup>th</sup>—on 15<sup>th</sup>  
14 Street and 9<sup>th</sup> Avenue there was a subterranean gas  
15 explosion two weeks ago. This letter talks about the  
16 fragile pipes underneath, the gas mains, the water  
17 mains, the asbestos pipes. We had a letter that went  
18 out months ago that talked about explosions, damage,  
19 flooding, et cetera. No one seems to be really  
20 dealing with this whole issue of the infrastructure  
21 and the impact on buildings, et cetera.

22 DAVID MARCUS: There's a long history of  
23 this damage. Someone mentioned I think earlier about  
24 how—I think Corey Johnson mentioned how long it takes  
25 to repair things. We have that in our community

2 where it takes years and years for construction  
3 projects to get repaired and done. The enforcement  
4 issue. I'm glad that was mentioned. We raised this  
5 with the leaders in our community who work with the  
6 different agencies. It's great to have regulations,  
7 but if the regulations aren't enforced, nothing gets  
8 done. According to local businesses, it's  
9 interesting because I think the police person  
10 mentioned it, will give out tickets. Tickets don't  
11 do anything. Tickets is a cost of doing business so  
12 they just, you know, pay their tickets and they still  
13 do the things that are wrong. So, we just hope that  
14 the Police Department would do what's needed to be  
15 done, and the last thing is the environmental study.  
16 We really, really thing that's needed, not just on  
17 14<sup>th</sup> Street, but all the affected areas. If an  
18 environmental study was done, then we could really  
19 look at what these impacts would be in terms of  
20 health, in terms of the environment, in terms of  
21 structure, in terms of everything. So, that really,  
22 really needs to be pursued. There needs to be a  
23 federal environmental study. Thank you.

24 JULIANNE BOND: So, out of these  
25 legitimate community concerns, the Coalition has come

2 up with some alternative recommendations to the DOT,  
3 MTA's proposed mitigation plans. I'd like to turn  
4 this over to Paul Nahous who is part of our Steering  
5 Committee, and who will present our alternative  
6 recommendations to the MTA DOT's Mitigation Plans.  
7 After Paul's presentation, we have a very brief  
8 summation, and then happy to answer any questions you  
9 might have. [background comments, pause]

10 PAUL NAHOUS: Thank you for the  
11 invitation to join you today and to make  
12 presentations, and to join in this conference. I  
13 feel like I'm in the room where it happens, and thank  
14 you also for still being here. I've been wanting to  
15 speak. We've been wanting to speak with you  
16 direction about some concerns—all the concerns we've  
17 go and some suggestions as to things that might be  
18 considered to make it work better. I'm a designer.  
19 By background, I have a product design firm. I  
20 develop very technical scientific and medical  
21 products. If they don't work, people die, people  
22 don't buy the products either. It's important that  
23 things work. So, look at the product from and  
24 assistance standpoint. We've got a system here, and  
25 it needs to work, or the community as well as the

2 commuters are going to be very upset. They both have  
3 to be pleased and it has to work. I had started off  
4 with—I actually pulled together some slides from your  
5 presentations to look at number initially. A lot of  
6 these have already been discussed, which you can do  
7 really quick. These are the basic number. I can't  
8 find this. Look at these number more closely. Most  
9 of the people who are going over in this area, of  
10 course, are going to either if they don't work there  
11 already, they live and work at the same place, they  
12 will take other trains. If it comes down to 75 or  
13 85% will take existing subways, 5% will take the  
14 ferries. We've discussed that. 5 to 15% you said  
15 recently would be coming across on the express buses  
16 and now it's going to 17, about the same. So you  
17 take 15% and increase it to 30 as 50% of the overall  
18 225,000. Instead of 33, it's like 36. That's fine.  
19 Now these are all and take 20% of those will come up  
20 to 14<sup>th</sup> Street, that's 675 if it's 15% of that  
21 section, 7,650 if it's 17%. That actually, and I'm  
22 wrong here. This number SBS buses like I looked  
23 online. That's not 122. It's 85 total capacity per  
24 bus, which is actually about the same as, well it's  
25 actually about 90 a minute—in 90 minutes. So,

2 actually, what it says is you've got a good balance  
3 for people coming from Brooklyn, but the majority of  
4 people are going to be in Manhattan. This is for  
5 Manhattan people. That's in the back—the way of  
6 background, and we understand that 14<sup>th</sup> Street is a  
7 busway. This is with DOT's map online, trucks have  
8 to deliver on these roads, and the rules and  
9 regulations say they had, they can take these roads  
10 to get to where they do their delivery. They go to  
11 the block that they need to go to, and then they have  
12 to go back on. By taking 14<sup>th</sup>—if 14<sup>th</sup> Street was  
13 taking, you know, for trucks, then you'd lose that  
14 major two-way thoroughfare. It's—which it's good  
15 that you're including the trucks, but also it's—I'm  
16 glad to see you're opening up to vehicles—for other  
17 vehicles as well because it's a major thoroughfare.  
18 If you could compare this to Brooklyn, it would be as  
19 if you were to take Atlantic Avenue or Bushwick  
20 Avenue away. Those cars will go somewhere else.  
21 They'll go into the neighborhoods or they have to go  
22 all the way up to 23<sup>rd</sup> or Houston. It's critical for  
23 not only the transportation, but really the life  
24 blood-life blood of the neighborhood for the stores  
25 and employees. The city needs transportation to get

2 things in and our. We're on an island. Everything  
3 is important. Your plan currently--DOT's plan  
4 currently--am I talking into the mic alright?

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

6 PAUL NAHOUS: The DOT's plan calls for  
7 putting people onto the street alongside the buses of  
8 the curb by extending the curbs 10 foot. I  
9 understand there's a concern that there will be major  
10 congestion. Most--it's--it's dangerous, and we just  
11 have pylons between the buses and the people. Also,  
12 MTA and DOT have declared that their plan must be  
13 flexible and dynamic. You're standing in the way of  
14 the screen, people. Okay. The--it must be flexible  
15 and dynamic because you really don't know [bell] how  
16 many people are going to come--sorry. [bell] We've  
17 got more on this one.

18 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: It's okay. Keep  
19 going, sir. You're doing a good job.

20 PAUL NAHOUS: Okay. [background comments,  
21 pause] It's really hard. The numbers have rounded by  
22 one or two points. So, this we have pretty close,  
23 but we really don't know how many people will be  
24 making it up to Brooklyn--up to 14<sup>th</sup> Street from  
25 Brooklyn or how many people will be arriving from

2 Manhattan. So, therefore, the plan has to flexible  
3 and dynamic, and from what we see, by having a  
4 restricted two-way bus lane—busway, it's really only  
5 variable, flexible relative to the number of buses  
6 you can run on it per hour. If it's not flexible  
7 relative to the traffic patterns, people, you guys  
8 just start painting the lines, and having seen how  
9 for example Fifth Avenue recently painted, totally  
10 reground. It takes days to do that. It's not like a  
11 quick fix. It takes a day to grind it all down. It  
12 takes another day usually to relay it out and then to  
13 tweak it to make sure it's right, and then a third  
14 day usually to paint it. So, it's not a quick  
15 Change. When you say dynamic, I think you want  
16 something in hours. You want to be able to change it  
17 by putting up cones and putting up signs. The busway  
18 now is a 22-foot constricted busway that has instead  
19 of 24-foot sidewalks it's got 34-foot. If you add  
20 them, you know, that you've got a 68-foot pedestrian  
21 plaza and a 22-foot road in the middle. The balance  
22 is wrong. I don't think you need that much. It's  
23 not going to have masses of people walking on one  
24 side of Manhattan to the other, and I think you—I see  
25 on your new—new plans that instead of having the

2 pedestrian [bell] way in the middle of the block,  
3 you've got parking now. So, people aren't going to  
4 be able to walk the whole length anyway. It's going  
5 to be divided. Let's look at it from Planview. The  
6 same thing. You've got a 22-foot constriction in the  
7 middle opening up to three lanes for passing at both  
8 ends. It's a bottle neck. Traffic is going to get  
9 stuck there. You had up until yesterday until today.  
10 Trucks passed on—trucks parked on one sides. You've  
11 opened up parking on the other side, which makes  
12 sense because there's stores, there are stores that  
13 need deliveries over there as well, but you've  
14 interrupted your sidewalk. So, the extended sidewalk  
15 the beige painted area. So, maybe it wasn't  
16 important, and I attend to agree because people are  
17 going to get out of the bus stop. They'll walk  
18 around to subways. The bus bulbs for the express  
19 buses are on the same corners as the subway stops.  
20 So, the traffic flow will be going from corner to  
21 corner. It won't be going down the middle of the  
22 block. You don't need walkways down the middles of  
23 the blocks. Here's a blowup of detail of that—of one  
24 corner, and the problem with the two-way busway, this  
25 picture for example if a bus stops and a wheelchair

2 has to come out, it takes more than a minute to take  
3 a wheelchair on and off besides the passengers. Say  
4 it takes three minutes, you got one bus a minute  
5 you're going to back up three buses, double buses.  
6 Perhaps when you use the expression: It's brilliant.  
7 It is a diesel train. That's what will happen. So,  
8 that's three minutes, and four minutes, five minutes.  
9 It be all the way down. I'll say no more. Two-two-  
10 lane constrictions. So, if you've got the trucks on  
11 one-sided parking where the constriction is. So,  
12 when the truck pulls in and out, you will stop a bus  
13 every single time. If there's a garbage truck on the  
14 other side or this side, it will stop the traffic.  
15 It will back up. I don't think we—we don't think  
16 it's really necessary to have this painted 34-foot  
17 pedestrian way. 24-foot if you use it properly is  
18 plenty. Let's talk to that. Okay, most of the  
19 congestion of the sidewalks is around Union Square.  
20 This is called Union Square Broadway. This ice cream  
21 guy parks here every afternoon, and he blocks up more  
22 than half of the 24-foot sidewalk. You lose 9 feet  
23 approximately relative to the 24-foot for the walk-  
24 through. If he's not there earlier, he's parked in  
25 the bus stop across the street, but down the next

2 corner. Something has got to be done about that guy.  
3 Across the street the other way, notice the ice cream  
4 guy is still there. This guy is taking advantage of  
5 it, but this guy is taking the same amount of space  
6 and just leaves 8 foot clear between that and the  
7 racks of all the stuff that's on the corner.

8 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: This is  
9 fantastic. [laughter]

10 PAUL NAHOUS: And the—and the mango guy,  
11 the mango woman.

12 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I agree. I swear  
13 to God, an ice cream guy, a fish guy, and a mango guy  
14 walked down 14<sup>th</sup> Street and that happened.  
15 [laughter]

16 PAUL NAHOUS: Yeah, and actually the  
17 water guy [laughter] the water guy he has bracelets,  
18 he's the first one to set up and at 8:00, 9:00 in the  
19 morning, he's in the middle of the frickin' sidewalk  
20 by himself, and the other vendors are pulling along  
21 side of him. When they get there, where do their  
22 tables come from? Well, they're—they're locked to  
23 the bicycle racks over here on the side. So, those  
24 bicycle racks aren't being used really very properly.  
25 Half of it is—Yes.

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I—I don't—I don't  
3 mean to interrupt, but I think this is actually a  
4 very, very good point that you're making that I want  
5 to just reiterate, and it's something that I had and  
6 my Chief of Staff Erik Bottcher had alerted me to  
7 this previously to your presentation, but I think  
8 it's a very good point, and it's one that I would  
9 love to [bell] either have DOT come back up after or  
10 have a conversation with, but Paul, the point that's  
11 being made about having the level of flexibility so  
12 you're not taking more of the street bed away when  
13 you are going to have some obstacles. It's just  
14 going to happen over the course of a day, and hour  
15 with trucks and other vehicles that are not buses  
16 that are for whatever reason going to be on the  
17 street to leave that flexibility in place on the  
18 roadway and on 14<sup>th</sup> Street river to river or Ninth  
19 Avenue, you know, Third Avenue to ensure that any  
20 pedestrian impediments on the sidewalk that there's a  
21 plan associated with that to create more openness for  
22 pedestrians to move east to west or west to east on  
23 the sidewalks. Instead of creating more space, just  
24 get rid of the things that are currently on the  
25 sidewalks, have a plan to do that. So you need the

2 flexibility on the roadway or does--Commissioner, do  
3 you want to respond to this?

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, I--I want  
5 to just respond to a couple of things, but I think  
6 just to be clear I think that the slides you have up  
7 are sort of not quite the slides we have. So, just--  
8 just to be clear. We're going to have three travel  
9 lanes. So, we'll have a passing lane and then the  
10 next lane over will be the lane where we will have  
11 the parking, the pickup, the drop-off, the bus bulbs.  
12 So, I--I think just--just to be clear, what we're sort  
13 of basically talking about five lanes not three.

14 PAUL NAHOUS: [interposing] This is  
15 that--this is your--

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, I think  
17 it would be good to pull up the ones that I showed  
18 today if we could.

19 PAUL NAHOUS: Yes, and let us do that.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Okay.

21 PAUL NAHOUS: This is--this is your  
22 drawing except for a change of colors--

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing] I  
24 know that's definitely not our drawing.

2 PAUL NAHOUS: And I changed—I changed the  
3 color—I changed the colors of the buses and I took  
4 some of the buses out because--

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]  
6 Yeah, I mean I think it would be fair to sort of pull  
7 up the one we had today.

8 PAUL NAHOUS: Sure. Please do.

9 [background comments]

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah. No,  
11 just because this would be an asset (sic) if we were  
12 really to address it. So, let's address it.

13 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: It's okay.

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, no, just  
15 because this be our asset if we were really to  
16 address it. So, let address it.

17 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: No, so

18 PAUL NAHOUS: Let me keep going please  
19 and we'll come back to this.

20 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Let me just—let  
21 me just—not to play referee for a moment, but let  
22 just me just say one thing. I think you should  
23 continue in the presentation, but we'd also—we should  
24 also be sure and I don't mean this in a critical way.  
25 I think we should make sure that good presentation

2 and slides that the DOT gave earlier today that we're  
3 operating off of the same information because I don't  
4 want to confuse the public or the media or folks that  
5 are here. We should make sure that there is  
6 alignment on the layout and on the slides, and I  
7 guess Commissioner Trottenberg is saying that some of  
8 the drawings that are being shown here are not  
9 accurate, and we want to make sure that—that it's all  
10 accurate. So, keep going but let's make sure that  
11 we're operating off the same information.

12                   PAUL NAHOUS: Life is too short and I  
13 don't get paid for this. Most of these drawings come  
14 from your decks. This is from you deck. I changed  
15 the color and I've added—taken actually some of the  
16 buses out. Bear with me. I'm really happy to sit  
17 down with you and our paper and go through these  
18 details at some time beyond this. Please. The—the  
19 big difference between the new one is this piece of—  
20 of extended sidewalk has gone away for parking and  
21 the parking here is as you show it, begins with the  
22 same, and you've got three lanes of traffic coming in  
23 narrowing to two lanes, where there's parking coming  
24 to three lanes. That's the same as what you've got

2 there now. The colors a little different. I'd be  
3 happy to look at.

4 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: But keep going.

5 PAUL NAHOUS: Okay, I'm going to go back  
6 through—whoops. [background comments, pause] Well, I  
7 hit a wrong button, and one more street scene, and  
8 across the street from that is the guy selling the  
9 books. These have been there 24/7 for a couple of  
10 years, and this stuff will be here as his as well.  
11 That narrows it down to about nine foot. So,  
12 together, you would gain more by moving the vendor  
13 to—rather than extending out 10 foot onto the road.  
14 If you extend 10 foot onto the road and you just have  
15 the rubber pylons, you really should be putting  
16 blocks or something. So, you're really not going to  
17 gain 10 foot. You're going to get probably 7 out of  
18 it if you do it anyway. I would suggest to these  
19 vendors one place to look, well, this block from  
20 municipal west is going to become a pedestrian lane.  
21 This block will—on the other side, University becomes  
22 a pedestrian lane. Two blocks up becomes a  
23 pedestrian lane. Knock yourselves out. Move them up  
24 there so I can still show the mangoes. What we  
25 propose instead is pretty simple. Kind of like 23<sup>rd</sup>

2 Street and other streets keep four lanes. It gives  
3 you the ability to be flexible. You can up cones.  
4 You can move things around. You can put up concrete  
5 barriers if you need a little bit of walking space on  
6 the side. You can still--well, let's just go through  
7 the list. I gives flexibility. It also enables SBS  
8 buses to pass the local buses. The local buses keep  
9 stopping at that stops that they currently do. The  
10 SBS buses can whiz right by them. It also give you  
11 maximum space for emergency vehicles. Emergency  
12 vehicles can go right past the express buses without  
13 holding them up--without stopping. When asking Pincar  
14 at one of the other tow halls: where will the  
15 express buses go, and you've two-lane busways, you  
16 said they'll go on a pedestrian--they'll go on the  
17 pedestrian lane, the painted area. Not particularly  
18 safe either. Number 4, this provides you four lanes.  
19 It enables you the ability to perform early test runs  
20 without limiting (sic) any of the lanes. You could  
21 be testing this right now with the cars on the road  
22 and see what it's like to put 70 buses, 60 buses on  
23 an hour. It will also provide you the ability to  
24 have space for local residents to get to their  
25 apartments. Otherwise like you have a two-lane

2 busway. It's—it's not going to be easy to do, but  
3 you could have four for sure. Whether you paint the  
4 lanes—you probably could paint them red. That's fine  
5 and that will also provide you curbside space in the  
6 middle of the block for parking trucks at the end of  
7 the blocks for a bus bulb to extend or on the other  
8 side to put the local buses up against the curb. It  
9 gives you lots of flexibility. Right now the plan is  
10 only flexible in terms of the number of buses per  
11 hour. By having four lanes, it gives you lots of  
12 other flexibility. In summation, should I?

13 JULIANNE BOND: [off mic] You can pass  
14 the mic.

15 PAUL NAHOUS: Okay, and I'm going to pass  
16 it to you. Do you want to--?

17 JULIANNE BOND: [off mic] That's a long  
18 process.

19 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I would just take  
20 his mic back. There you go.

21 JULIANNE BOND: Thank you. [background  
22 comments, pause] Okay. So, in summation, by their  
23 own admission in numerous public forums the DOT and  
24 the MTA have acknowledged that they really have no  
25 firm idea of what is going to happen or who will even

show up on 14<sup>th</sup> Street when the L Train shuts down.

Therefor, for all of the reason that Paul has illustrated in our presentation not to mention just using plain old common sense, we should first start with using to the best possible advantage what we already have. We should retain four vehicular lanes on 14<sup>th</sup> Street for maximum dynamic flexibility. We already see the bottleneck that gets created. We see the danger it presents when ambulances and other emergency vehicles have to go flying down the painted out roadways. We should relocate vendors during mitigation. Rather than extending the sidewalks we should clear our sidewalks during this project and use them. Replace curbside parking with SBS platforms, local bus stops and delivery space; ensure bike and vehicle control enforcement 24/7. We really need assurance of this enforcement and safety because we already know and many people have discussed today that this is already an issue and we know it's only going to get worse. Install digital signage alert in advance of 14<sup>th</sup> Street well in advance so that people can see when there are changing traffic patterns, and it will keep the traffic flowing. Regulate the influx of for-hire vehicles and control where for-

2 hire vehicles pick up and discharge near 14<sup>th</sup> Street.  
3 Suspend permits for all sidewalk and street closures  
4 during the project and finally, we-we ask the elected  
5 officials to ensure that the local affected  
6 communities determine which, if any, changes may be  
7 left permanent because we know that Andy Byford and  
8 Polly Trottenberg have publicly expressed their  
9 preference to make many of them permanent. So, we  
10 thank you, and I think other or Schwartz (sic) wants  
11 to say something.

12                   ARTHUR SCHWARTZ: Good afternoon, Mr.  
13 Speaker. I am the Democratic District Leader for the  
14 Greenwich Village community most affected by this  
15 entire project. I span two-two City Council members.  
16 I am also Counsel to the 14<sup>th</sup> Street Coalition and a  
17 dozen block associations and buildings, which have  
18 brought suit under the National Environmental Policy  
19 Act and the New York State Environmental Quality  
20 Review Act as well as the Americans with Disabilities  
21 Act. That suit has already resulted in three  
22 important developments. (A) First we were able to  
23 quickly reach an agreement expanding ADA required  
24 accessibility by adding four elevators over the next  
25 six years of Sixth Avenue and 14<sup>th</sup> Street station.

2 We thank the MTA for its prompt response to this  
3 concern.

4 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: That's fantastic.

5 ARTHUR SCHWARTZ: Second, our lawsuit  
6 prompted the Federal Transportation Administration  
7 and this has sort of gotten buried, to withdraw its  
8 approval for the alternative service plan, and  
9 require the MTA and the DOT to commence an  
10 environmental assessment, which it is currently doing  
11 which if FTA follows the law will result in public  
12 hearings such as this about the environmental impact,  
13 about the weather and environment statement is  
14 necessary. Third, DOT has taken a position based on  
15 one case involving a small parking lot next to a Long  
16 Island Railroad station that since its various plans  
17 in an historic district next to public parks and not-  
18 are connected to an MTA project, they are exempt from  
19 the State Environmental Quality Review Act or SEQRA,  
20 which would require far broader public input process  
21 than the DOT has engaged. Their position is  
22 preposterous. My colleagues with the Coalition have  
23 addressed the problems with the DOT's plan as it  
24 affects 14<sup>th</sup> Street. Council Member Chin has  
25 described the-the Williamsburg Bridge-Bridge part of

2 the plan as an invasion. I want to add three points  
3 to the coalition's presentation.

4 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay, then we  
5 have to wrap.

6 ARTHUR SCHWARTZ: Okay. (1) The  
7 assumption underlying the numbers are hocus pocus and  
8 highly questionable. I highly doubt that taking a  
9 bus from the last L Train stop to 14<sup>th</sup> Street would  
10 be a popular option. The estimates about the number  
11 of pedestrians, which will have—have the DOT widening  
12 the sidewalks into one lane of existing traffic both  
13 on the north and south side are also without any  
14 documented support. DOT not New York City Transit  
15 has thumbed its nose at the affected community. I  
16 dare say that Commissioner Trottenberg is possibly  
17 the—is less popular in Greenwich Village than Donald  
18 Trump.

19 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing]  
20 Arthur, Arthur, Arthur, come on. [crowd yelling]

21 ARTHUR SCHWARTZ: DOT.

22 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: That—that is  
23 inappropriate. That's an inappropriate comment.

24 ARTHUR SCHWARTZ: DOT has not listened,  
25 has not adjusted to community needs--

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] If  
3 could please finish.

4 ARTHUR SCHWARTZ: --expressed by the  
5 Coalition or by the affected community boards. As an  
6 elected official for 23 years and someone who served  
7 24 years on Community Board 2, I have never  
8 experienced such intransigence. The response of the  
9 Commissioner that we will adjust this if there is a  
10 problem is not acceptable nor is DOT's decision to  
11 cancel all meetings with the affected communities  
12 where there would be give and take. The first time  
13 that an ambulance going across 12<sup>th</sup> Street gets stuck  
14 in traffic, it will be too late. The plan can be  
15 adjusted--and the plan could adjusted to address  
16 community needs, and lessen the impact on this  
17 community. Finally, with respect to what are the  
18 purposes of this hearing, given DOT's intransigence,  
19 the appointment of ombudsman is critical.  
20 Commissioner Trottenberg's offhand objections to this  
21 idea is all the more proof of the need for such an  
22 ombudsman. Thank you very much.

23 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay, I want to  
24 say a few things. Number one, I appreciate the  
25 presentation and thoughtful recommendations with

2 regard to pedestrian impediments, the street widening  
3 on sidewalks or other I think very substantive real  
4 things that were raised in this presentation. You  
5 guys put a lot of thought into it. There may not be  
6 agreement between the agencies and the coalition, but  
7 these are things that are important to me as a local  
8 elected official to look at, and I want to thank you  
9 for that. Arthur, I've known you a long time. It is  
10 totally inappropriate to come here and to call good  
11 public servants, who work on behalf of the city every  
12 single day, names. [applause] Commissioner  
13 Trottenberg, I believe is one of the best  
14 commissioners that Mayor de Blasio has appointed  
15 during his tenure. She has worked closely with me.  
16 [applause] She's worked closely with community  
17 boards and other elected officials. She is a good  
18 person. Now, there may be substantive disagreements.  
19 There may be areas of improvement. There may be  
20 things that I am going to have to push the  
21 Commissioner respectfully on, and I will do that as  
22 she can tell you I've done many times over the last  
23 4-1/2 years on a variety of issues. But the good men  
24 and women who work at the Department of  
25 Transportation and the good men and women who work at

1 the MTA have spent countless hours on this. This is  
2 painful for everyone. They've talked about the level  
3 of complexity. They've talked about the challenges,  
4 and they have had dozens of public hearings. There  
5 is a lawsuit involved that you all have brought  
6 forward and I'm not going to comment on that, but  
7 because there is a lawsuit, I believe that the  
8 Department of Transportation has been advised by the  
9 Law Department to not participate because there's an  
10 active lawsuit against them. We should keep it based  
11 on the issues. The Chair, myself, the other Council  
12 members here are deeply committed to serving the  
13 neighborhoods and the entire city of New York. So, I  
14 am grateful for the presentation. I am grateful for  
15 the recommendations. As you can see from Erik  
16 Bottcher in my office, Carmichael Wilson from my  
17 office, Patrice Comerford from my office, and the  
18 wonderful staff of the Transportation Committee, we  
19 are deeply committed to listening to you in a real  
20 way in a meaningful way. But I don't think it's  
21 helpful over the next many months over the next ten  
22 months in preparing for this shutdown and in the 15  
23 months that will happen during the shutdown to call  
24

2 people names, I don't think it's helpful. I  
3 appreciate your presentation today. [applause]

4 ARTHUR SCHWARTZ: Just let me say this:  
5 I will apologize to the Commissioner. I do have to  
6 say that this hearing is the best thing that has  
7 happened since this project was suggested and then  
8 more of this is needed in this community.

9 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay.

10 ARTHUR SCHWARTZ: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you and  
12 with that, I would like to thank both Andy from--the  
13 President of the MTA, New York City Transit and the  
14 DOT Commissioner for staying and listening to the--  
15 [audience members shouting]

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet down, please.  
17 Quiet down.

18 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Excuse me. Hold  
19 on, hold on, hold on. Commissioner, I'll come in  
20 second. There are DOT staff that are staying here?  
21 [woman shouting] No, no, hold on. Please.

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet down, please.

23 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Everyone needs to  
24 be calm.

25 FEMALE SPEAKER: I came there to say--

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing]

3 Just hold on one moment. Hold on one moment. There  
4 are many staff members from the park. [pause] Can  
5 we respect each other? That's what it's about if  
6 we're going to get things done. There are many staff  
7 members some of whom were on the panel and testified  
8 who are the point people on this project, on the  
9 location of the project, on the details of the  
10 project, on the flexibility of the project who are  
11 staying for the entirety of this meeting. He  
12 Commissioner has other obligations for the entire  
13 city. She has top level staff who are remaining at  
14 this meeting to hear from every person who are  
15 testifying. So, if we could please be respectful.  
16 They are staying, they are listening and they will be  
17 responsive to members of the public. If we could  
18 please the next panel up.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And with that, I  
20 got to say that-

21 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] I  
22 am going to use the restroom. I am not leaving.  
23 [laughter]

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I got to say that  
25 this is a New York City Council hearing. So,

2 definitely with the Speaker and the rest of us we're  
3 going to be listening and using your feedback as we  
4 continue conversation with both of them. There is  
5 going to be hearing and meeting the Commission. They  
6 will come and they will be there to answer any  
7 questions for the public, but today is about  
8 listening for the public, and now I would like to  
9 call the Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer and  
10 also Brad A. Pruitt (sic) on behalf of family member  
11 Richard Goldfield to please come and testify.

12 [background comments, pause] Braze Pare (sic).  
13 Please. Manhattan Borough President to begin and  
14 then followed by the representative form the family.

15 GALE BREWER: Thank you very much. I'm  
16 sorry that copies aren't available, but they're on  
17 their way. I think you know most this, but I am Gale  
18 Brewer. I am the Manhattan Borough President, and I  
19 would like to thank Chair Rodriguez and the Speaker  
20 for holding this oversight hearing to discuss he  
21 upcoming closure of the L Train. That's why we're  
22 all here. Every day 275,000 people use the Canarsie  
23 Tunnel to travel to their jobs, to friends to family,  
24 medical appointments and so much else. The upcoming  
25 closure of the tunnel will be an immense disruption,

and we all know that it will require sacrifice.

That's why we need the strongest possible mitigation

efforts to ensure that our streets and our

transportation system still works for New Yorkers

during this disruption. I support the DOT's plan to

turn 14<sup>th</sup> Street into a busway that restricts private

vehicle traffic and I'm calling for the busway to be

in effect 24/7. I also would like to draw attention

to the disproportionately negative effect that

instituted a busway fully during peak hours will have

on workers who are more likely to travel outside of

traditional business hours. I support the DOT's plan

run shuttle buses between Brooklyn and Manhattan, but

I do worry about the negative effects that running 80

buses an hour over the Williamsburg Bridge in

addition to the 60 buses an hour on 14<sup>th</sup> Street will

have on Manhattan neighborhoods. I support the DOT's

plan to make the Williamsburg Bridge H-O-H-O-V free,

and I would like to call for DOT and the MTA to study

the effects of expanding these restrictions to all of

the East River Bridges during this time period. It's

an idea supported by a number [applause] of community

boards in Manhattan who fear and understandably fear

excessive traffic at other crossings. While much of

2 the focus thus far has been on the 275,000 displaced  
3 commuters, it is also important to remember that the  
4 nearly 150,000 residents [bell] who live along or  
5 near the 14<sup>th</sup> Street Corridor. It is crucial to make  
6 sure that we allow some exceptions to the busway for  
7 local deliveries and drop-offs and other uses that  
8 will enable residents to retain access to their  
9 homes. There should be a focus on expanding  
10 commercial loading and pick-up and drop-off along the  
11 avenues close to 14th Street. It is important to  
12 remember that we are balancing the concerns of  
13 commuters and residents, and I want to thank Council  
14 Member Espinal for his efforts to push the MTA to use  
15 all electric buses on all of the routes. [applause]

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: No talking please, no  
17 talking please. [coughing] If you want to do  
18 something, we go like this.

19 GALE BREWER: And we would like to call  
20 for an air quality monitoring in the affected  
21 neighborhoods on a monthly basis if not more often. I  
22 also stand in the support of the DOT's plan to  
23 institute protected bike lanes on 12<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup>  
24 Streets. I know this is controversial, but every  
25 year biking becomes a more engrained part of transit

2 life in our city, and protected bike lanes are needed  
3 to keep up with the demand. Crosstown bike lanes  
4 will bring a 20% reduction in overall traffic  
5 injuries. I would like to finally highlight the  
6 amount of frustration we have seen, though, with DOT  
7 and the MTA's lack of communication and transparency  
8 to date. Maybe this hearing will change that. It is  
9 unacceptable now ten months away, and I have been go  
10 a lot of meetings like many of you regarding the  
11 shutdown. We don't have a final mitigation plan, and  
12 I want to thank everyone in the City Council where  
13 there are two bills that are up for discussion today,  
14 which will increase transparency, and address some of  
15 the shortcomings. I want to be clear that in our  
16 officer beginning in May reconvened an L Train Task  
17 Force comprised of the community boards and local  
18 officials. Others will be invited, and our aim is to  
19 have boards talk to each other to ensure that their  
20 recommendations are inclusive of all voices in the  
21 community. We will be working all summer long. We  
22 also expect to have a final summary of our work soon.  
23 Also, we have organized a real time bus tour with  
24 local Manhattan officials, and I want to thank the  
25 MTA for giving us a real bus, community officials,

2 community boards to examine the routes and get a  
3 foretaste of what commuters will experience. Will  
4 the bus be able to turn around where the MTA says it  
5 can turn around? It is certainly clear that many of  
6 the recommended and planned changes require a lot of  
7 getting used to. I support instituting these plans  
8 earlier than the actual shutdown, maybe even have a  
9 date in which we do something that is a real time  
10 this is what will happen when the shutdown takes  
11 place to allow us the opportunity to study the  
12 effects and make changes where needed. So, these bi-  
13 weekly meetings must take place amongst the relevant  
14 city and state agencies to monitor—to mitigation  
15 effects as the shutdown unfolds. We have to do real  
16 time with the bus, real time in terms of the day in  
17 which this would actually be as if the L Train had  
18 shut down, and that ongoing meetings when there is  
19 the shutdown. Pain will exist. The L Train moves a  
20 population the size of Orlando, Florida every day,  
21 but if you prioritize the efficient movement of  
22 people, we can minimize the disruption. I've  
23 summarized as best I can. I want to thank you for  
24 holding this hearing, and we look forward to working  
25 with all the stakeholders to ensure that this train

2 [bell] closure unfolds quickly and as efficiently as  
3 possible. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,  
5 Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer.

6 BREECE PEER: Yes. Thank you. My name is  
7 Breece Peer (sp?) I'm here on behalf of the New York  
8 State Assembly Member Richard M. Godfried, who  
9 represents the 75<sup>th</sup> Assembly District in Manhattan,  
10 which includes Chelsea, the Flatiron District, Union  
11 Square, and other communities that will be severely  
12 affected by the suspension next year of service on  
13 the L Train. The Assembly Member would like to offer  
14 his support to major elements of the plan proposed by  
15 the Metropolitan Transportation Authority and the New  
16 York City Department of Transportation to mitigate  
17 the negative consequences of suspension of L Train  
18 service. It's clear that the closure of the MTA's  
19 Canarsie Tunnel and the resulting suspension of L  
20 Train service will result in greater traffic  
21 congestion in many neighborhoods including those  
22 abutting 14<sup>th</sup> Street in Manhattan. That thoroughfare  
23 will see a surge in persons traveling via  
24 alternatives in the subway including in particular  
25 more pedestrians, bicyclists and bus riders.

2 Therefore Assembly Member Godfried is pleased that  
3 the New York City DOT and the MTA are proposing a ban  
4 on all non-local private vehicular traffic on 14<sup>th</sup>  
5 Street from early morning until late in the evening  
6 with a priority to be placed on an enhanced bus  
7 service. Assembly Member Godfried also supports the  
8 carefully drawn, extremely finite exceptions to that  
9 rule that have been carved out for local businesses  
10 and residents so that their homes and workplaces  
11 might continue to be accessed via private vehicles,  
12 which would be obligated turn off 14th Street [bell]  
13 at the nearest possible opportunity. The Assembly  
14 Member's profound help that, as has occurred in other  
15 roadways in which vehicular traffic has been banned  
16 or severely limited, fears of increased congestion  
17 would be unrealized and in many cases such strategic  
18 closures might have increased travel efficiency,  
19 improved traffic flow and increased pedestrian  
20 safety. That said, the assembly member shares many  
21 of the concerns expressed by he 14th Street  
22 Coalition, and some of the solutions that they  
23 proposed such as ensuring that sidewalks placed is  
24 cleared during the 15-month closure, that vendors are  
25 relocated to the extent possible, that enforcement

2 above all be and absolutely leak proof on terms of  
3 protecting the surrounding neighborhoods of the area  
4 around 14th Street. In addition the assembly member  
5 has concerns about emergency vehicles and Access-A-  
6 Ride. Although provisions have been made, we need to  
7 ensure that they are able to continue to serve people  
8 in those areas with any major impediment. Similarly,  
9 Assembly Member Godfried is encouraged that the  
10 proposal to construct a two-way bike lane on 13<sup>th</sup>  
11 Street has been modified in the fact of severe  
12 community opposition and the two one-way bike lanes  
13 will be instead created on 12<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup> Streets.  
14 Thank you for the opportunity for him to submit this  
15 testimony.

16 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Gale, I missed  
17 your testimony.

18 GALE BREWER: We'll get you a copy.

19 [laughter]

20 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I always say it,  
21 and she hates me for saying it, but you have the  
22 hardest working--

23 GALE BREWER: I hate it.

24 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: --woman in show  
25 business and not just on the Island of Manhattan, but

2 the entire city, our incredible Borough President  
3 Gale Brewer. [applause] We're so grateful you're  
4 here. You're the best.

5 GALE BREWER: Thank you, Corey. Thank  
6 you for giving this opportunity and for the hearing.

7 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: And thank you  
8 Breece for being here to represent Dick.

9 BREECE PEER: Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So with that, now  
11 we will continue. There is like 50 members of the  
12 public that they have—are waiting to testify. We're  
13 putting time in two minutes. So, if you think that  
14 it would take more than that, please summarize, and I  
15 will pass it to our lawyer who will be calling those  
16 names.

17 LEGAL COUNSEL: Chelsea Yamada,  
18 Transportation Alternatives, Chris Sander of  
19 Motivate. Chelsea Yamada of Transportation  
20 Alternatives, Chris Sander of Motivate, Chelsea  
21 Yamada, Transportation Alternatives, Carol Greider  
22 former Council Member.

23 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: She left.

24 LEGAL COUNSEL: Okay. Jeffrey LeFrancois  
25 the Meat Packing BID, Zach Miller of the Trucking

2 Association and Terri Cude of Community Board 2.

3 [background comments, pause]

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: If any of your  
5 testimonies is more than two, you summarize and stay  
6 on the time.

7 CHELSEA YAMADA: My name is Chelsea  
8 Yamada from Transportation Alternatives. Thank you  
9 Chair and Speaker Corey for having us today.  
10 Transportation Alternatives recommends the following  
11 minimum requirements for the L Train shutdown busway,  
12 which is bigger and better than we could have hoped,  
13 extending the busway beyond Third and Ninth Avenues  
14 would be one of our ongoing recommendations. When the  
15 shutdown occurs, we will be excited for those amended  
16 data points and results. Committing to off-board  
17 fare collection on the local buses as well as the  
18 Select Bus Service, every second counts for  
19 commuters. Shuttle transfer point, I know this is an  
20 ongoing project for New York City Transit, but making  
21 sure that where people are loading onto the L one to  
22 four shuttle buses will be extremely important to  
23 make sure that there are adequate spaces at those  
24 shuttle bus locations. At-level boarding is another  
25 really exciting opportunity that the MTA should

2 definitely take as well as electric bus service. It  
3 would be really nice to have all passengers not just  
4 wheelchair ADA accessibility, mobility needs  
5 commuters being able to get on a bus very quickly,  
6 and at-level boarding is a commitment we recommend.  
7 System wide restriction private car use entering  
8 Manhattan, thank you, Madam Borough President for  
9 imploring that all of the East River bridges are  
10 given HOV 3 Plus restrictions and that will be an  
11 ongoing need for the next year to make sure Albany is  
12 on board. Leave room for 24/7 bus service, replace  
13 people's under transportation with less efficient  
14 parking permissions. Thank you Speaker Johnson for  
15 clarifying. [squawking mic] [background comments,  
16 pause] Well, let's try it again. [squawking mic]  
17 I'm just going to sit next to Terry. [laughs] Sorry  
18 about that. Sorry. Just to rewind replacing people  
19 under transportation with less efficient parking  
20 permissions. Thank you Speaker Johnson for  
21 clarifying that this with people and not car, private  
22 cars. We're excited about the vast string bikes  
23 busways (sic) and by chair expansion thank you  
24 Council Members Antonio Reynoso and Stephen Levin for  
25 highlighting the importance of bike share not being a

2 multiple—multiple system having on integrated fair  
3 payment system. In the conditions that we are seeing  
4 for cyclists currently at present for 12<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup>  
5 Streets proposed bike lanes open for Vision Zero and  
6 every intersection needing the protected  
7 intersections as well as signal turning improvements  
8 for bus riders as well as bike riders a green way for  
9 cyclists has been suggested. Thank you. [bell]

10 Thank you very much for the opportunity  
11 today—I'm sorry. I'm Terri Cude, the Chair of  
12 Community Board 2, Manhattan. [background comments,  
13 pause]

14 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: If people want to  
15 move up a little bit if you have a heard time  
16 hearing, and we're having audio problems and to be  
17 here knowing.

18 TERRI CUDE: Hi, I'm Terri Cude, Chair of  
19 Community Board 2 Manhattan, and thank you for the  
20 opportunity to speak. I want to say that there is a  
21 lot of trouble around the 14<sup>th</sup> Street Corridor.  
22 We've had quite a bit about it, but [squawking mic]  
23 do not forget that not just the buses coming over the  
24 Williamsburg Bridge, but where they come into the  
25 Community Board 2 area is of very strong concern and

2 we don't tend to hear about that. You are in receipt  
3 of the Community Board 2 resolution. However, I do  
4 want to highlight that CB2 urges a complete study  
5 including community input to assess neighborhood  
6 impacts in the Kenmare Little Italy area where there  
7 will be [squawking mic] turns that we're not sure the  
8 buses can even make without changes to geometry and  
9 where the traffic is already jammed, and there is  
10 already impassable streets there. We are very firm as  
11 others have said consider a limitation on building  
12 permits on anywhere that the shuttle buses will be  
13 going, but not just the limitation on building  
14 permits with construction that might take up any of  
15 the streets, but also a moratorium on filming TV  
16 production that has the large trucks and does jam up  
17 the streets as well in all of the areas that will be  
18 affected by the project. We also would like  
19 applicable traffic calming measures to protect our  
20 residential side streets. We believe in free  
21 boarding and all-door boarding on all the bus routes  
22 and we do apposes—I'm skipping around in order to  
23 save time—but we oppose the closure of University  
24 Place between 13<sup>th</sup> and 14<sup>th</sup> Streets. Also remember  
25 there will be people waiting for the buses. Even if

2 there's any kind of a slow down of walkage, one must--  
3 one must admit it may not happen, and some of the  
4 people that need the buses the most need places to  
5 sit and wait and they should be protected with  
6 shelters. There may be waits for the buses. We do  
7 believe in and EIS [bell] and we not only support the  
8 HOV3 extended on the 20--on the Williamsburg Bridge,  
9 but also at least HOV2 on the other East River  
10 Bridges. Finally, there's quite a bit more but to  
11 wrap up--

12 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: You need finish.

13 TERRI CUDE:--CB2 is happy to help keep 2-  
14 way communications as open and flowing as we hope the  
15 traffic will be. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

17 CHRIS SANDER: [off mic] Okay. Good  
18 afternoon Chair Rodriguez. We adopt the mounds of  
19 the Trent Station--(sic)

20 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] If  
21 you could speak a little more directly into the  
22 microphone.

23 CHRIS SANDER: [on mic] Okay. My name is  
24 Chris Sander. I'm the General Manager or Citi Bike  
25 offering testimony on behalf of Motivate, the

1 operators of City Bike. This past month Citi Bike  
2 celebrated its fifth anniversary. In the past five  
3 years, we've become an integral part of the city's  
4 transportation network reaching on average 70,000  
5 rides per day in peak season. Since our 2013 launch,  
6 we've doubled our fleet to 12,000 and more than  
7 doubled the number of stations to 750. There are now  
8 over 146,000 annual members and as the system has  
9 expanded deeper in Brooklyn, Queens and Harlem,  
10 membership has grown more than 400%. With over 60  
11 million total rides, Citi Bike has transformed the  
12 way people get to work, run, errands, exercise and  
13 get around New York City. With all this success, we  
14 at Motivate are excited to partner with the  
15 Department of Transportation [squawking mic] to  
16 provide the critical role for riders in neighborhoods  
17 most directly impacted by the closure of the Canarsie  
18 2, North Brooklyn and the 14<sup>th</sup> Street Corridor. It  
19 is in these areas that we are seeing significant  
20 growth in Citi Bike ridership as well. In  
21 Williamsburg alone there has been nearly a 12%  
22 increase in ridership over the past 12 months.  
23 Combined together ridership on Williamsburg,  
24 Greenpoint and the East and West Village is up more  
25

2 than 6% over the past year. Citi Bike will only  
3 become more popular during the disruption. We have a  
4 plan to meet this demand. Specifically, we are  
5 excited to announce today that we are adding 1,250  
6 new bicycles and denser infill coverage in North  
7 Brooklyn and the Manhattan Core, which will include  
8 2,500 new docks. DOT and Citi Bike will work closely  
9 with local elected officials, community groups as  
10 well as the community boards to ensure a process that  
11 benefits the entire community and city. In addition,  
12 we plan to offer more valet stations. Valets are  
13 staffed by Citi Bike employees in the system's  
14 busiest areas most nearly-most-mostly new transit  
15 hubs. In anticipation of the L Train disruption, Citi  
16 Bike expects to add as many of 10 youth valet  
17 stations. Finally, we are especially excited to  
18 announce our Pedal-Assisted bike bridge. This is a  
19 bold innovative plan that is tailor made for the  
20 communities most impacted by the disruption. [bell]  
21 We're establishing a closed network of a 1,000 bikes  
22 shuttling back and forth over the Williamsburg  
23 Bridge, the two stations in Brooklyn and two in  
24 Manhattan. With Pedal-Assist, people of all ability  
25 and fitness levels who never thought they could bike

2 over the bridge will soon become regular commuters.  
3 This will free up valuable space on other subway  
4 lines and ferries and encourage mode shift from  
5 private vehicles and taxis to our Pedal-Assist bikes.

6 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you.

7 CHRIS SANDER: Thank you.

8 JEFFREY LEFRANCOIS: Thank you very much.

9 Good afternoon. Thank you Mr. Speaker. Thank you,  
10 Chairman. My name is Jeffrey LeFrancois. It's nice  
11 to see everybody. I'm the Director Operations and  
12 Community Affairs for the Meat Packing Business  
13 Improvement District. The Meat Packing BID provides  
14 services and support to the predominantly commercial  
15 neighborhood around 14th Street west of 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue,  
16 and it is comprised of 263 ground floor business,  
17 1,054 hotel rooms and approximately 4,500 residents.  
18 It's also the home the L Train's Western Terminus at  
19 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue, which is a transit lifeline. In addition  
20 to the thousands of employees, many people—millions  
21 of people visit the neighborhood each. To color that  
22 number, the estimated total visitors in 2017 at the  
23 Highline, Whitney Museum and Chelsea Market all of  
24 whom call the area home was nearly 17 million people  
25 and while they all can take the L Train, the vast

2 majority use—utilize public transit. We applaud the  
3 installation of the new bus stop on the south side of  
4 14th Street at 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue to travel eastbound. We  
5 also recognize the need for a dedicated busway as a  
6 means to effectively move commuters across 14th  
7 Street. In considering the number of buses expected  
8 per hour, it must be efficient with limited  
9 obstructions. On 14th Street west of 8<sup>th</sup> there are  
10 active production studios, fashion houses, shops and  
11 restaurants. These entities all require access for  
12 commercial deliveries on loading. While the function  
13 of the street may change, the needs of businesses  
14 along the corridor do not. It is important to also  
15 note the logistical issues associated the proposed  
16 busway, which we have buses turning south onto 10<sup>th</sup>  
17 Avenue, then north on the West Side Highway to return  
18 back to 14th Street for eastbound travel. We  
19 recognize the limited options to turn around, but  
20 introducing a steady stream of bus traffic south of  
21 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue onto West Street pretends just—presents  
22 disruptions to the neighborhood. The strip includes  
23 the Meat Packing Co-Op, the Whitney Museum, and in  
24 particular access to its limited loading dock, a  
25 hotel and under-construction commercial building, and

1 a new pedestrian crossing at West 13<sup>th</sup> Street to get  
2 to Pier 55. We respectfully request that DOT and MTA  
3 consider [bell] measures to mitigate the potential  
4 effects there. Just a couple of final points. It's  
5 unfortunate that no ferry service to the West Side is  
6 being considered as a means of public transit during  
7 the shutdown. Numerous BIDs, all three community  
8 boards along the West Side 1, 2, and 4 are on record  
9 asking the city to study the West Side for service.  
10 Using the L Train Shutdown as a test drive for that  
11 service is a logical step toward a wider and frankly  
12 more holistic plan. Pier 57 located just north of  
13 14th Street will have a water taxi landing and can  
14 serve as an ideal stop for passengers looking to come  
15 to the western end of 14th Street. Not considering  
16 this area and for ferry service is short-sighted, and  
17 finally, the transit system is the economic life  
18 blood and it's allowed our city to be a lot greener,  
19 but we're considering diesel buses. It's an affront  
20 to our efforts to be in the compliance with the Paris  
21 Climate Accord. So, we encourage electric or CMG  
22 use. I thank you for letting us be here today, and  
23 organizing this hearing to speak more on this  
24 channel. (sic)

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you,  
3 Geoffrey my former Chief of Staff. [laughter] Do the  
4 best.

5 ZACH MILLER: Good afternoon. My name is  
6 Zach Miller and I serve as the Metro Region  
7 Government Affairs Committee Chairman for the  
8 Trucking Association of New York. Our association  
9 represents the trucking industry in New York and we  
10 strive to enhance the operating business environment  
11 of the industry. One of our primary missions is to  
12 improve safety within the industry. We're here today  
13 to testify in favor of Intros 2348 and 2349 as well  
14 as participate in the discussion on the L Train  
15 Shutdown as it relates to trucking. TANY recognizes  
16 that it's essential we all work together to tackle  
17 the enormous new challenge ahead. I would hope that,  
18 the Council and DOT utilize TANY as a resource during  
19 this process. TANY will work to educate the trucking  
20 industry including out-of-state truckers and the  
21 changes taking place. We would like to work in  
22 partnership with DOT to identify alternative routes  
23 for trucks not delivering any L Train shutdown zones.  
24 TANY has expertise that can help make this a more  
25 seamless transition for the industry, which has

2 implications for larger traffic patterns. We support  
3 the Speakers introduction because we realize that in  
4 order for this plan to be successful, DOT must engage  
5 with the City Council, and community regularly over  
6 time infills. (sic) Community information centers  
7 will provide an outlet for local merchants and local  
8 delivery companies to get the information they need  
9 and to have any questions answered that arise during  
10 the implementation phase of the planning. Similarly,  
11 a designated ombudsperson will allow for streamlined  
12 communication between the City Council and DOT, and  
13 will allow for up-to-date timely information. We  
14 have recently been briefed on the plan, and  
15 understand that there are still elements that need to  
16 be finalized. Based on what we know, there are a  
17 number of areas we support. We still have some areas  
18 of concern. I'd like to offer some suggestions. We  
19 support making the Williamsburg Bridge open to bus,  
20 cars and HOV3 only. The Williamsburg Bridge policies  
21 should reflect the city's policy at 14th Street, and  
22 will require bus, truck on the street only from 5:00  
23 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. everyday for the duration of the  
24 shutdown. I would support allowing local deliveries  
25 on the 14th Street Corridor, and we do have some

2 concerns with designate deliveries in the middle of  
3 the block. We think it could lead to congestion,  
4 which will create staging, circling the block to find  
5 available parking and transporting freight on  
6 sidewalks, which could prove dangerous to  
7 pedestrians. Some freights such as heating oil  
8 cannot be transported this way as well. Mandated  
9 deliver times [bell] schedule take much meat into  
10 account. We support the Grand—we support the Grand  
11 Street truck route, which supports local deliveries  
12 on 3<sup>rd</sup> to 8<sup>th</sup> and again, we are a resource. We'd like  
13 to partner and together I think we can get through  
14 this. Thank you so much.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I had a question  
16 to Motivated before you leave. We heard from DOT and  
17 DOT and MTA as well as the question they were open.  
18 They didn't say yes we will do it, but they were open  
19 to continue discussing about integrating the permit  
20 system. Is there something that Motivate feels that  
21 the technology is there and the good will is there to  
22 try to test on how an integrated permit system can  
23 work in that area where the L Train will be shut  
24 down?

2           CHRIS SANDER: Yes. Thank you, Council  
3 Member for your question. So, we are very in favor  
4 of removing more barriers to ridership. We would  
5 love to make it as easy as possible. Having an  
6 integrated payment system is something that, you  
7 know, we certainly would love to see. We will  
8 continue to work with or we are happy to work with  
9 DOT and the MTA on making that happen. The  
10 technology does exist in other cities but, of course,  
11 it really depends on what's the existing technology  
12 here and how that—how our systems would work  
13 together.

14           CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Thank you.

15           CHRIS SANDER: Thank you.

16           LEGAL COUNSEL: [background comments,  
17 pause] Monica Bartley, Alex Wood, Sharon Bardells,  
18 Stephanie Burgos, Brian Lozano. [background  
19 comments, pause]

20           CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You may start.

21           FEMALE SPEAKER: Go ahead.

22           MONICA BARTLEY: Speaker Johnson, Chair  
23 Rodriguez.

24           CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It's working.

25           MONICA BARTLEY: It's working?

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes, I believe  
3 so.

4 MONICA BARTLEY: Speaker Johnson, Chair  
5 Rodriguez my name is Monica Bartley, Community  
6 Outreach Organizer at the Center for Independence of  
7 the Disabled New York. The shutdown of the L Train  
8 will impact the lives of people with disabilities as  
9 much as it will affect other commuters. Since the  
10 buses are accessible and the main way to travel, the  
11 increased passenger load may pose a difficulty for us  
12 to get on board during PC Rails. (sic) However, the  
13 impending shutdown of the L Train is an opportune  
14 time to consider the needs of people with  
15 disabilities, seniors and other who would benefit  
16 from the use of elevators. There are currently five  
17 stations on the L Line with elevators and at the  
18 Wilson Station it is northbound only. Evidence  
19 decides the need for the MTA's Accessibility Plan to  
20 include all areas of the city especially areas that  
21 tend to include higher concentration of poor people  
22 and people of color that are more likely to be  
23 overlooked. For example, the L Train stops closest  
24 to New York Avenue (sic) where some of our partners  
25 once lived in Brownsville, Brooklyn and does not have

2 an elevator. There are some key stations such as  
3 Broadway Junction which is more or less a hub as well  
4 as the East New York and Bedford-Stuyvesant sections  
5 of Brooklyn where people do not have elevator access.  
6 It's especially important to consider the  
7 accessibility of public transportation in those  
8 overworked-overlooked areas because people with  
9 disabilities in these areas may have fewer  
10 alternative options for the transportation due to  
11 location farther up from downtown or the city, fewer  
12 taxis, for example and finances. We shouldn't want  
13 our reform to perpetuate and reinforce class and race  
14 privilege with respect to people with disabilities.  
15 We want and enforceable fully funded plan with a  
16 timeline and input from the disability community for  
17 full subway accessibility. Commissioner Trottenberg  
18 mentioned Access-A-Ride and we hope that Access-A-  
19 Ride has been considered in the traffic plan for  
20 pickup and drop-off of passengers around 14th Street  
21 area. Thank you [bell] very much for the opportunity.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

23 SHAMBER DULLES: Hi. So, my name Shamber  
24 Dulles and I'm a college student from John Jay  
25 College. I just want to thank Speaker Johnson, Chair

2 Rodriguez, and Transportation Committee members for  
3 having this hearing. I just want to thank Mayor de-  
4 May de Blasio and Commissioner Trottenberg for  
5 prioritizing thousands of riders. This is a huge  
6 victory because in 2019 L Train riders will have a  
7 busway for 17-hour bus service along the 14th Street  
8 and Williamsburg Bridge. When buses had dedicated  
9 priority on city streets and these L Train riders  
10 will have reliable bus service. Reliable bus service  
11 means people can get to work, go home, go to school  
12 and continue their daily lives without having to be  
13 gridlocked or needing to have them move out of their  
14 homes. As someone who uses the L Line to visit  
15 friends and go to the important areas, I feel secure  
16 in knowing that my life will be put on hold for a  
17 year and a half because a sustainable plan will be in  
18 place. Again, buses moving quickly give riders  
19 options. They can take the bus or the subway and  
20 that is important because it will help ease crowding  
21 on subway lines. This productive partnership proves  
22 New Yorkers really can expect more from transit and  
23 from government. L Train riders can now rest assured  
24 that there is an ambitious plan that will get people  
25 in and out of Manhattan. The Riders Alliance looks

2 forward to working with the Counselor—the Council,  
3 the Council, the Mayor, DOT and MTA to make transit  
4 work better for more New Yorkers in the future.

5 Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

7 STEPHANIE BURGOS-VERAS: Good afternoon  
8 everyone. My name is Stephanie Burgos-Veras and I am  
9 the Senior Organizer with the Riders Alliance, and  
10 also a key member of the Bus Transit Campaign, which  
11 is advocating for better local bus service citywide  
12 and we want to say—we want to give a special thanks  
13 to Speaker Johnson, Chair Rodriguez and the committee  
14 members for holding this important hearing as we get  
15 closer and closer to the L Train shutdown. But before  
16 I was an organizer here at the Riders Alliance, I  
17 used to work along the L Line. I used to take the L  
18 through—from Brooklyn to—from Queens through  
19 Brooklyn to get into Manhattan and I understand how  
20 important it is because if the L Train weren't there,  
21 I would have to take more trains to get into the  
22 city. So, I understand how important it is for the L  
23 Train to people who live here and for people who live  
24 all the way from where I was coming from, from Queens  
25 to work in this area. And we all know that the L

2 Train plays an important role in the social and  
3 economic life—economic life of New Yorkers, and I  
4 understand that when the time was announced, it was—  
5 everyone was panicking and people still are panicking  
6 because we have a big question: How we'll be able to  
7 move on. How we'll be able to get to work. How we'll  
8 be able to continue to live our lives, and thousands  
9 of people are thinking this, but we know that there  
10 are options. There are ways to go—to mitigate this  
11 process, and we have—the people can take other subway  
12 lines, people can bike and we can also make ground  
13 transportation important—I mean reliable, and so  
14 we're extremely happy to know that Mayor de Blasio  
15 and Commissioner Trottenberg are giving buses 17  
16 hours along 14th Street in Williamsburg. I mean  
17 decision will remove the fear that L Train riders  
18 have been carrying a year because they don't know how  
19 they'll be able to move around. And 17 hours  
20 although it's not 24 hours, 17 hours is an extremely  
21 big win for transit riders because it means that the  
22 lives of riders will not be paralyzed, and it means  
23 that transit riders are being prioritized because  
24 there are thousands of riders coming from all parts  
25 of the city. [bell] In getting buses to move

2 quickly during the shutdown, it's about access. It's  
3 about giving access to all of the riders who need to  
4 get to their destinations, and it's important that we  
5 keep New York City moving. But before I close off,  
6 this will only be successful if we enforce the bus  
7 lanes. We need to remind ourselves that this is not  
8 something that is on a small scale. This is a large  
9 scale issue, and we need to make sure that we are  
10 thinking big and the we are prioritizing the riders  
11 and then everyone that needs to get to a destination,  
12 and that cannot afford an Uber or a taxi, and we look  
13 forward to working with the Council and the Mayor and  
14 the DOT to make sure that everyone who depends on  
15 transportation can get to their destination through  
16 the L Train shutdown.

17           ALEX WOOD: Good afternoon Chair and  
18 committee members. My name is Alex Wood. I am a  
19 member of Riders Alliance and I live and ride the L  
20 Train—live on and ride the L Train. My usual  
21 commuted is from 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue to Dekalb stop, and as a  
22 freelance audio engineer, I rely on the L Train at  
23 all times. Whether it is to get to an early morning  
24 recording session or a late night concert, anywhere  
25 from Broadway Junction to 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue. During next

2 year's shutdown, I will definitely be relying on not  
3 only the shuttle services but also general bus  
4 routes, which I already rely on extensively for  
5 Brooklyn to Brooklyn travel. So, seeing and upgraded  
6 in those bus services and how they're able to get  
7 around the city is very important. I spent the  
8 majority of my—I spent the majority of my adolescence  
9 in London, England. So, I've seen the potential of  
10 urban bus systems and, in fact, I grew up preferring  
11 the bus to the Tube, something that many native New  
12 Yorkers find very strange. I wanted to thank MTA and  
13 the DOT for putting together a multi-faceted plan  
14 that gets me and my fellow L riders where we need to  
15 go during the shutdown. I especially want to thank  
16 Mayor Bill de Blasio for giving shuttle buses  
17 priority on the city streets, and the Williamsburg  
18 Bridge 17 hours a day. As someone who works mainly  
19 opposite hours than the general public, I can assure  
20 you that this road is very busy at all times of the  
21 day. So, the 17 I know is really—it will make a big  
22 difference. I know next year's shutdown won't be easy  
23 for anyone, but with these mitigation plans in place  
24 we can start to prepare not just for the coming year,  
25 but also for the coming years where we know that

2 there will be a big population growth, and more  
3 people will be using transit, and this opens up a lot  
4 of opportunities for different types [bell] of  
5 families as well. Thank you.

6 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [off mic] You  
7 know, I want to thank the Riders Alliance for  
8 everything you guys do on Fair Fares.

9 Good afternoon everyone. I want to thank  
10 Speaker Johnson and Chair Rodriguez and the committee  
11 for hosting this. My name is Bryan Lozano. I am the  
12 External Affairs Manager for Tech:NYC. Tech:NYC is a  
13 non-profit trade group with the mission of supporting  
14 technology industry in New York through increasing  
15 engagement between our more than 630 members, New  
16 York Government and the community at large. We work  
17 everyday to make New York the best place to start a  
18 technology company and to cultivate robust  
19 technologies—technology ecosystem here. The transit  
20 system is the life blood of New Yorkers and New York  
21 companies. When transportation fails, productivity  
22 and efficiencies suffer inevitably slowing down  
23 business. For the New York City tech community,  
24 specifically our public transit system has been an  
25 important differentiating factor from other tech hubs

2 in recruiting to local talent. Tech:NYC is here  
3 today because depending on train shutdown will  
4 adverse affect a larger number of tech companies in  
5 our community. Many companies sit along or are very  
6 close to the L Line including the large ones such as  
7 Facebook, Google and OATH, as well as smaller ones  
8 such as Alloy Daily Harvest and Planted. That's not  
9 to mention the company or the companies all over the  
10 city who have employees who rely on the L Train for  
11 their daily commuting purposes. We fully support the  
12 Council's efforts to alleviate the pain of the  
13 pending shutdown. We understand this is a daunting  
14 infrastructure challenge for the city and state, and  
15 our members from neighborhoods care about well-  
16 functioning transit. Our community stands ready to  
17 be helpful. Technology should play a vita role in  
18 helping the city and state manage the L Train  
19 shutdown and improving future transit, and utilizing  
20 Smart technologies like real time mapping to  
21 implementing sustainable transportation. We have  
22 companies in our membership that are transportation  
23 and/or technology experts who would like to be  
24 helpful. We look forward to working with this  
25 committee and your offices to mitigate the disruption

2 of shutdown and its work towards building a transit  
3 system that is worthy of our great city. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

5 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Christine  
6 Berthet, Matthew Robinson, Lawrence Shire, Thomas  
7 Jones, Jean Cline. [pause]

8 LEGAL COUNSEL: Paul Barong (sp?)  
9 Jackson Fisher-Ward, Jean-J-E-A-N. [background  
10 comments, pause] Peter Davies, Laura Tenenbaum, Neal  
11 Goodwin. [background comments, pause]

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You may begin.

13 CHRISTINE BERTHET: Hello. My name is  
14 Christine Berthet. I'm the Co-Chair of  
15 Transportation Committee from Community District 4,  
16 which includes the north side of West 14th Street  
17 from 5<sup>th</sup> to 12<sup>th</sup> Avenue. So, we know it's going to be  
18 a major disruption so our goal here is survival  
19 rather than perfection. I think it is vital that a  
20 sufficient number of HOV lanes be dedicated to buses  
21 during the closure. I'm not clear from what we heard  
22 whether there were one, two or three on the bridge.  
23 It is also vital that buses have priority and  
24 sufficient space to pass on 14th Street. It is not  
25 clear that two lanes of buses are sufficient. We

1 just learned of MTA's plan to refuel 47 buses at the  
2 Queens Bus Depot on the West 14th Street and 11<sup>th</sup>  
3 Avenue and park then on Port Authority lots on West  
4 38<sup>th</sup> and West 39<sup>th</sup> Street in Hells Kitchen. It is  
5 unconscionable that the city and the MTA continue to  
6 add to the diesel bus oversaturation in the  
7 residential area where the third worst air quality in  
8 the city. Any EIS would conclude that it is not an  
9 acceptable option. We ask that the MTA do the right  
10 thing: All buses on 14th Street Corridor and come  
11 into the Queens Depot should be powered by gas or  
12 electricity to mitigate the situation. The DOT  
13 indicated that the traffic on the adjacent streets  
14 will increase by 30%. This seems tolerable.  
15  
16 However, on very residential streets single lane with  
17 a number of schools where a car turning on the avenue  
18 can block the whole street and cause hours of  
19 honking, this is a major problem. NYPD to date has  
20 been unable to enforce the truck regulations for  
21 years. We ask that mitigation prep-to prevent  
22 through traffic to use those residential streets  
23 [bell] and another way to 14th Street be used and be  
24 implemented. We are pleased that the Sixth Avenue  
25 Station will be made ADA compliant, and we hope that

2 our request will be given the proper attention and  
3 that DOT and MTA will respond to them in a  
4 construction way.

5           LAURA TENENBAUM: My name is Laura  
6 Tenenbaum. I represent a coalition of neighbors and  
7 businesses from the Kenmare Street Little Italy area.  
8 We're quite concerned because sort of feel like the  
9 step children of this whole program. We didn't hear  
10 about the plans for our neighborhood until early this  
11 year, and had not attended any of the other meetings  
12 because everything we heard about in Manhattan was  
13 about 14th Street. We reached out, and finally got a  
14 meeting with members of the MTA and the New York City  
15 Transit Authority in early May at which point they  
16 told us they had had no studies, but don't worry,  
17 HOV3 will work for our neighborhood. We have sincere  
18 issues about that especially about where the buses  
19 are supposed to turn onto Cleveland Place, which is  
20 30 feet wide, and if you—I—we have small 3-minute  
21 film posted on You Tube under SoHo Area Productions,  
22 which will show typical rush hour traffic. In that  
23 area you will see an ambulance stuck in traffic for  
24 close to 10 minutes. We have serious issues about  
25 that. We wish there were studies done. None have yet

2 been completed. We're told they may be completed in  
3 the fall. We did-do have some ideas, and one of them  
4 is if anyway the suspension of tolls on the  
5 Verrazano-Narrows Bridge could be affected. We think  
6 that could be done without harming the, you know,  
7 conflicting with the federal mandate because if there  
8 are no tolls, there are no tolls. So, it's not a  
9 one-way collection. That would really bring or will  
10 really take out a lot of unnecessary traffic. That's  
11 in Lower Manhattan [bell] a lot and we also have some  
12 alternative route issues. We've lost some people who  
13 wanted to speak because of the hour, and emergencies.  
14 So, some of our message will not get across tonight-  
15 today.

16 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Well, I thank you  
17 for staying and there are other-other folks from  
18 around Kilmer Square in SoHo who have similar  
19 concerns and we're going to hear from them. I want  
20 you to know that, of course, there's been a  
21 significant amount of focus on the L Train Corridor  
22 along 14th Street. We heard from Brooklyn members  
23 earlier, from the Brooklyn side and, of course,  
24 myself, Council Member Rivera, Council Member Powers,  
25 but Council Member Rodriguez, the Chair of this

2 committee and myself are committed to helping every  
3 affected area, and being responsive to every affected  
4 area, and taking into consideration every affected  
5 area. So, any information like the video you talked  
6 about or other information that you may have for us  
7 for the SoHo area that is going to be affected by  
8 this because of Delancey Street and because of the  
9 bridges and because of Canal Street, et cetera. We  
10 look forward to getting that information and working  
11 with you.

12           LAURA TENENBAUM: Right, we—we appreciate  
13 that because we were concerned when Kenmare was  
14 barely mentioned. Everything was about Delancey.  
15 Kenmare is not Delancey. It is effectually a one-  
16 lane road.

17           SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: It's already  
18 congested.

19           LAURA TENENBAUM: And it is already  
20 congested.

21           SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes.

22           LAURA TENENBAUM: We don't think studies  
23 have been done.

24           SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you, Lauren  
25 as always for your activism.

2                   MATTHEW ROBINSON: Hello. My name is  
3 Matthew Robinson. I live on West 16<sup>th</sup> Street and 7<sup>th</sup>  
4 Avenue. A couple of things. When you look at the  
5 diagram that they had of the cross-town bus at the  
6 two ends it looks like there are just very simple  
7 loops. Those loops actually cannot happen. Also, if  
8 everyone—if anyone has ever been to the Stuyvesant  
9 Cove Park or whatever it is, right in front of the  
10 park or right in front of the entrance or exit of the  
11 ferry is where the park exits. So, you'd actually  
12 have to obliterate the park in order to build the  
13 ferry or to actually receive and deploy everyone  
14 that's there. So, that's a concern of mine in terms  
15 of that park. On the other end, on the west side I  
16 would say that you should go all the way to easily to  
17 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue and there's a way that you can actually  
18 loop the buses around and actually drop-off at the  
19 Highline, drop-off at the Whitney and loop around  
20 seamlessly. Also, another problem is that the bus  
21 drivers actually change shifts in mid stream. So,  
22 you're actually never at a destination stop when  
23 they're making a change. The other thing, too is  
24 when you look at the Select Bus, it goes to 6th  
25 Avenue to 8th Avenue and bypasses 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue. Both 6<sup>th</sup>

2 Avenue and 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue are basically the same train  
3 lines or you can connect on West 4<sup>th</sup> Street. For 7<sup>th</sup>  
4 Avenue line you cannot do that. So, I would—I would  
5 suggests that there be a stop at 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue more so  
6 than 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue, and more importantly, if there is  
7 construction that's going to be at 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue and  
8 14th Street where that's going to be dead. If that's  
9 going to be dead then 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue is vital.

10 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you. Thank  
11 you for being here and we're neighbors.

12 LAWRENCE SHIRE: Good evening. My name is  
13 Lawrence Shire. I'm a member of Manhattan Community  
14 Board No. 6 where I serve on the Transportation  
15 Committee. However, in the absence of a resolution,  
16 the testimony I give tonight is strictly my own. I  
17 reside in Stuyvesant Town and will benefit from the  
18 ferry service, but note that it ends at midnight and  
19 then 2:00 a.m. on the weekends, and I appreciate the  
20 introduction of the L4 Bus, which will help mitigate  
21 those effects, but with respect to bus service that's  
22 being proposed by the MTA overnight, it's really far  
23 too little, kind of skeletal service. On Saturday  
24 night I boarded the L Train at 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue at 1:30  
25 a.m. and it was packed. Standing room only. There

2 needs to be more frequent service on the 14th Street  
3 Corridor that should be looked at again. Now,  
4 regarding truck deliveries and hiccups, I believe DOT  
5 can greatly expand its highly successful off-hour  
6 deliver program on 14th Street and work with  
7 individuals businesses to meet their needs. I would  
8 also recommend that DOT arrange to pre-position a  
9 fleet of tow trucks to quickly to pull off broken  
10 vehicles from 14th Street. I oppose the DOT's new  
11 proposal to allow personal door-to-door on-street  
12 pickups and drop-offs for residents of Manhattan  
13 presumably their guests, too, along with 14th  
14 Street's exclusive busway because this is utter  
15 madness. Letting Ubers wait for minutes to pick up  
16 their e-Hail fared has the potential to ruin the  
17 MTA's ability to move its buses cratering its  
18 capacity carry L Train passengers who have been  
19 detoured up the street. So, I would really hope  
20 instead [bell]—Can I—can I wrap?

21 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yeah, you can  
22 finish.

23 LAWRENCE SHIRE: Alright, I'd like to wrap  
24 up. Okay.

25 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes, go ahead.

2           LAWRENCE SHIRE: I would like—I would  
3 like there to be a workable medical exception for the  
4 busway usage, which would incorporate ambulances,  
5 Access-A-Ride vans, and also the uses of the MTA's  
6 new Access-A-Ride GPS based e-Hail Mobile App because  
7 that can all be tracked. People are given tickets.  
8 Assuming that they are not caught in advance because  
9 I'd have the voided, and that's a way that you could  
10 keep the system honest and keep the street open. I  
11 appreciate your consideration. Thank you.

12           SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you for  
13 being here and than you for your service on Community  
14 Board 6.

15           THOMAS JONES: Hi. Thomas Jones. I'm a  
16 resident of the area. I've used most of the types of  
17 transportation that we've been talking about. I'm an  
18 ex-air traffic controller so I have some experience  
19 in controlling traffic under serious conditions.  
20 What we've got here is a large simultaneous equation  
21 with necessary repairs and costs is one major part of  
22 the equation, and the alternate means of  
23 accommodating riders is the other part of the  
24 equation and the equation must define what will  
25 happen, what costs and who pays. The final equation

2 should approximate the least the proportionate and  
3 fair costs to all. We seem to be finding that the  
4 alternate plans for accommodating riders have a lot  
5 of hidden costs, some of them unnecessary costs for  
6 impractical alternatives and a lot of them imprecise  
7 though they may be borne disproportionately by  
8 residents and businesses along the 14th Street  
9 Corridor and other new bus pathways. We seem to be  
10 finding that the alternatives are costly enough,  
11 unfair enough, impractical enough or unsafe enough in  
12 combo that we should reconsider the other portion of  
13 the equation namely the total shutdown and repair of  
14 the L Line from 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue to Lorimer. It is not  
15 necessary to totally take out both the north and  
16 south tracks there. There are alternatives  
17 especially a series of shuttles, you know,  
18 overlapping shuttles on the working track. It will  
19 take longer to complete, but the-the total rebuild  
20 and it may cost the MTA and the general taxpayer and  
21 the L Line riders a bit more, but it allows greater  
22 fairness and lest costs on the alternative portion of  
23 the equation. [bell]

24 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: If you could wrap  
25 up.

2 THOMAS JONES: I don't--can I just--?

3 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes.

4 THOMAS JONES: I don't think this was set  
5 in stone. It was--there's a myth that the affected  
6 parties preferred by pain for short time over less  
7 pain for longer time, but I don't think the costs  
8 were very evident at that time. I think the whole  
9 idea of shutting the whole thing down, you're giving  
10 up half of your capacity. It should be reconsidered.

11 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I don't think  
12 they're changing the plan on shutting the tunnel  
13 down. I hear you, but I think it's important for us  
14 to have the expectation that it's going to move  
15 forward as is and then mitigated in the best way  
16 possible. Thank you very much. You all really--

17 THOMAS JONES: It is by accident it has  
18 to happen. No blame, but if it happens because  
19 somebody chose to do it and it doesn't work out,  
20 there will be blame.

21 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you for  
22 being here to testify. Jackson Fisher Ward, Morna  
23 Lawrence, Michele Campo, Neal Goodwin, Sam Levy.

24 [background comments, pause]

25 LEGAL COUNSEL: Larry Aranson.

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Give us another  
3 one. I—I see Stephen Fromewick. If Steven Fromewick  
4 wants to come up and that gives us six for this  
5 panel. That's fine. I just want to say to the folks  
6 that are here from Kenmare who I know wanted to  
7 testify, I apologize, with Lauren for you three to do  
8 it together. The DOT just passed me a note, which  
9 said the DOT is looking to meet with Kenmare Square  
10 folks the week of July 9<sup>th</sup> if possible, they'll—  
11 they'll work with you. They're not saying it's set  
12 in stone, then to present options. Lauren, I don't  
13 know if you're listening—to present options for  
14 Kenmare. DOT did a study and have some follow-up  
15 things to look at that we're still working through.  
16 We look forward to presenting that to the affected  
17 folks in that area. So, Rami Metal sitting right  
18 there in the front row if you guys want to connect  
19 with him afterwards, he can make sure that you  
20 coordinate and that the meeting is set up, and you  
21 have each other's information so that it works in a  
22 mutually workable way, and if you'd like to begin.  
23 Yes, sir and then we'll go down the row.

24 LARRY ARANSON: Hello. Good afternoon.  
25 Is this on? Yes. Good afternoon. Thank you Speaker

2 Johnson, Chairman Rodriguez for this opportunity to  
3 express my concerns. My name is Larry Aranson. I  
4 live on 20<sup>th</sup> Street between 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue, and I'd  
5 like to commend you, Speaker Johnson for discussing  
6 and putting a focus on the effective increased  
7 traffic in our neighborhoods. You mentioned 15<sup>th</sup>,  
8 16<sup>th</sup>, 17<sup>th</sup>, 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> Streets, but you stopped  
9 there. Let me tell you about 20<sup>th</sup> Street. Anybody  
10 who looks at the map will see that it is the most  
11 contiguous eastbound street in that entire  
12 neighborhood. You're not going to find anything  
13 that's not blocked by a park or by Stuyvesant Town or  
14 Peter Cooper. It provides the best access as many  
15 taxicab drivers, bicyclists and truckers already know  
16 about. Across the street from me is the Andrew  
17 Haskell Library for the blind and handicapped, and  
18 many, many people trans-blind people and visually  
19 handicapped people transverse our neighborhoods. From  
20 the PATH trains they come in from New Jersey to go to  
21 that library, but more importantly is underneath 20<sup>th</sup>  
22 Street is a huge complex because of its continuous  
23 nature across the city of water mains, electricity, a  
24 high pressure steam line that's over 20 years old.  
25 Well, I'm sorry, a 100 years old, and still has

2 leather and wooden gaskets and high pressure gas  
3 lines as well. Twice in my residency in the  
4 neighborhood I've seen the entire intersection of  
5 Fifth Avenue and 20<sup>th</sup> Street lost replaced by a huge  
6 hole as these services intersected and results in in  
7 explosions taking out several blocks, the last one in  
8 '98 from building side to curb side. From the  
9 building on one side to the curb on the other. This  
10 is very fragile, and I'd like—and one of my concerns  
11 is what is going to be done [bell] to build this up?  
12 I'm sorry that I'm running out of time, but I'd also  
13 like to mention, with your indulgence that I'm  
14 concerned about the fact that even as I left here,  
15 20<sup>th</sup> Street was entirely congested. There is no room  
16 for emergency vehicles. We are underserved by the  
17 Police Department, which is over on 1st Avenue and  
18 21<sup>st</sup> Street, the tendency--

19 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing]  
20 That's a—that's a separate issue.

21 LARRY ARANSON: These are but it relates  
22 to how emergency vehicles and police services get  
23 through our streets, but most what happens if we have  
24 another Sandy while this construction project is  
25 going on? What happens to--the huge growth in

2 population is not going to stop and we're already  
3 overcrowded.

4 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you for  
5 your testimony.

6 LARRY ARANSON: Thank you very much.

7 NEAL GOODWIN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker and  
8 thank you for the opportunity to speak. I'm Neal  
9 Goodwin. I may be too idealistic, but I-I really do  
10 believe in my heart that-that our public servants who  
11 take seriously their-their responsibility to  
12 demonstrate a better form of representative  
13 government than we're seeing now in Washington  
14 wherein the favored-people favored by a particular  
15 administration gets certain goodies, and everyone  
16 else gets their-their human needs brushed off. I-I-I  
17 respectfully invite our public servants to consider  
18 that-that they would be respecting John F. Kennedy's  
19 own observation that as President of the United  
20 States he represents the people who are not  
21 represented by special interest. That not a word  
22 here has been said about the-the-the human needs, and  
23 the contribution, the part that is played in the  
24 cultural, social and business life of the city by  
25 people who have no good alternatives but to use

2 private cars. I'm actually exempt from the accusation  
3 which I've often heard hurled by-by people who  
4 represent bicycling interests that I'm speaking to my  
5 own interest. I don't-I don't have a car that I keep  
6 in the city, but where I am, I seed them go by all  
7 the time. I saw how on 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue the number of  
8 unique visitors to the city to my neighborhood 12<sup>th</sup>  
9 Street and 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue was drastically reduced when  
10 all of the non-commercial parking was eliminated in  
11 order to facilitate the protected bike lanes and the  
12 turn lanes and other such there used to be. [bell]  
13 Well, this-this is an issue that wait for another  
14 time, I thank for this.

15 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you. Mr.  
16 Goodwin for being here.

17 MICHELLE CAMPO: [off mic] Thank you.  
18 Thank you, Speaker. [on mic] Can you hear me?

19 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes.

20 MICHELLE CAMPO: Okay. Thank you,  
21 Council Member Johnson for having this meeting. We  
22 have had-trying to have meetings before, and we have  
23 with the members of the MFA and the-and the DOT. I  
24 am with the Coalition for Little Italy and Kenmare  
25 and that area, and as you know, and you have spoken

2 to the fact that we seem to be--although 14th Street  
3 is important, we seem be getting really short shrift  
4 in that area of being paid attention to, and I can't  
5 even see any member of our Council Members' Office  
6 here to represent us. So, the lack of attention is  
7 not surprising. There is a necessity for an  
8 alternate plan. I have drawn one up, and I just want  
9 to say I've lived on the Bowery most of my life, and  
10 in the past 15 years it's gotten a lot more  
11 congested. Nothing moves, nothing moves. The DOT  
12 made a new plan for the intersection. It's worst  
13 than it was, although I did put my input in there. I  
14 kind of lived there and I observe things. Kenmare-  
15 Delancey to Kenmare nothing moves. It is a river to  
16 tunnel route, a commercial route, emergency service  
17 vehicles. You can hear them in place for half an  
18 hour.

19 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Just for the  
20 record, we need it just for the transcription,  
21 Michele Campo, right?

22 MICHELE CAMPO: I'm sorry. I did not say  
23 that, right? [laughter]

24

25

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: You can say it's  
3 okay. I just want to make sure it's in the  
4 transcription.

5 MICHELLE CAMPO: Yes. Michele Campo,  
6 Battery Alliance of Neighbors, and, you know, this  
7 net--this thoroughfare is already saturated. I said  
8 that already. It's already negatively impacted, and  
9 the side streets, or the business owners who have  
10 been told about this are fairly beside themselves and  
11 there are other streets that are ease--more easily  
12 [bell] gotten to and passed through and come back to  
13 make the loop and then this, which also has  
14 construction on it, which makes the one lane either  
15 way street even more narrow, and there's a firehouse  
16 one block away. They don't know anything about it.  
17 There's a firehouse on Lafayette. They don't know  
18 about it. It's just there.

19 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, I think it's  
20 going to be good for you all to connect with the  
21 Department of Transportation--

22 MICHELLE CAMPO: [interposing] Exactly.

23 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: --to set up a  
24 time for them to come to the neighborhood--

25 MICHELLE CAMPO: [interposing] They will.

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: --and give a  
3 presentation on their study and to hear feedback from  
4 the folks that live there and now the neighborhoods  
5 well. So, Rami Metal is here from the Commissioner's  
6 Office, and he will connect and trade information  
7 with Lauren and you all--

8 MICHELLE CAMPO: [interposing] Yes.

9 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: --to make sure  
10 that connection happens.

11 MICHELLE CAMPO: Yes.

12 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you, Ms.  
13 Campo for being here.

14 MICHELLE CAMPO: Thank you. [background  
15 comments]

16 MORNA LAWRENCE: My name is Morna  
17 Lawrence. I live on Cleveland Place with the same  
18 coalition Little Italy and Kenmare Loop and L2 and L3  
19 buses. I appreciate that Mr. Metal says that he  
20 wants to meet with us, and that's after some follow  
21 up that we've done. Yet, you have to wonder why more  
22 hasn't been talked about today in today's meeting as  
23 to what they intended to do regarding the Loop.  
24 Representatives from the DOT and MTA were very nice  
25 to meet with us, very concerned community collations

2 of business and business owners, and we had many  
3 questions and concerns, some of which we have to  
4 offer-to provide, and we have provided them. Prior to  
5 this, there was little to now reach out to our  
6 communities. We waited more than a month before  
7 contacting Rami Metal and Commissioner Pencar on June  
8 13<sup>th</sup> to follow up with the meeting, but they had  
9 nothing new to offer. For example, when asked again  
10 about the safety and health issues pertaining to  
11 some-to the-so many buses making a right onto  
12 Cleveland Place, Mr. Pincar referred to geometric  
13 diagrams and patterns, which showed that it was it  
14 was possible. With all due respect, we are not  
15 geometric diagrams and patterns. We live in real  
16 time. We live on a real block and with real streets.  
17 So, we continue to have some of the questions and  
18 concerns, which are as follows: (1) Why has the DOT  
19 and MTA made so little effort to reach out to the  
20 communities in and around the Kenmare Street Little  
21 Italy Bus Loop? (2) How many buses will be making a  
22 right hand turn onto Cleveland Place during peak  
23 hours, which is already stressed, as has been  
24 mentioned many times. How many of these buses will  
25 electric? (3) Has the DOT and MTA considered the

2 suggestion made at our May 4<sup>th</sup> meeting to an  
3 alternative bus loop that was just discussed? If in  
4 whole or in part to at least the blame-pain. (4) We  
5 heard today how the New York Police Department  
6 enforcement will be implemented in the West Village,  
7 specifically how and where would the New York Police  
8 Department enforce? Wouldn't the 5<sup>th</sup> Precinct be  
9 implemented or traffic police be implemented in our  
10 even narrower and even more congested [bell] side  
11 streets in Little Italy and SoHo. I have only two  
12 more. (5) What is the MTA planning to do to mitigate  
13 the enormous increase of passengers at the tiny  
14 little antiquated-antiquated Spring Street Station  
15 and in much-just a little bit bigger Prince  
16 Street/Broadway Station and (6) Yet-we have yet to  
17 hear specifically how the DOT plans to put on hold  
18 already existing and future private construction  
19 projects along Delancey, Kenmare, Lafayette and  
20 Houston Street. This is of grave concern. We-I  
21 don't'-we don't understand how that's going to be  
22 implemented.

23 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you, Ms.  
24 Lawrence.

2 JACKSON FISHER-WARD: Good afternoon  
3 [coughs] excuse me. My name is Jackson Fisher-Ward.  
4 I'm there representing the office of Assembly Member  
5 Harvey Epstein from the 74<sup>th</sup> District. So, when I  
6 say I or my, that refers to the Assembly Member. So  
7 the 74<sup>th</sup> District, which includes the neighborhoods  
8 Manhattan's East Side, the Lower East Side, East  
9 Village, Stuyvesant Town, Peter Cooper Village,  
10 Murray Hill, Tudor City and the United Nations.  
11 Thank you to Chair Rodriguez and Speaker Johnson and  
12 the members of the Committee as well for continuing  
13 the dialogue around this issue. As we've heard  
14 before, if the L Train were a standalone transit  
15 system it would be the 10<sup>th</sup> largest in the world. To  
16 shut it down for 15 months presents an incredible  
17 logistical challenge, but also an unmissable  
18 opportunity to make critical improvements to station  
19 accessibility. Disability advocates won a recent  
20 victory when the MTA announced that it will install  
21 accessible elevators at the L Subway Station at Sixth  
22 Avenue and West 14th Street. This is a welcomed  
23 first step, but we can't stop there. Right now there  
24 is not one single accessible-accessible subway  
25 station within my district. The situation across the

2 subway system as a whole is not much better with 80%  
3 of stations currently inaccessible to wheelchair  
4 users, the elderly and people traveling with  
5 strollers. For an estimated 500,000 disabled New  
6 Yorkers the status quo is totally unacceptable. I  
7 urge the MTA to seize the opportunity presented by  
8 the shutdown to work towards its worthy goal of  
9 increasing accessibility across the system by  
10 installing an elevator at the L stop on Third Avenue  
11 and 14th Street. If the MTA is going to make good on  
12 its promise to accelerate accessibility and create 50  
13 plus new accessible stations within five years, this  
14 would be a good time to start. It can upwards of a  
15 year to install an ADA compliant elevator at a  
16 station. The good news is with a 15-month shutdown  
17 we will have the time. I look forward to the  
18 continuation of a robust community engagement  
19 process, and a speedy implementation of a final plan  
20 that takes New Yorkers' suggestion and concerns to  
21 heart. We want this plan to serve commuters well,  
22 respect residents in the affected neighborhoods and  
23 ensure that when the system reopens, disabled New  
24 Yorkers can ride with ease. Thank you. [bell]

2                   STEVEN FROMEWICK: Thank you Speaker  
3 Johnson and Chairman Rodriguez for giving me this  
4 opportunity. My name is Steven Fromewick. I am a  
5 resident of the 200 Block and West 15<sup>th</sup> Street where  
6 I've lived for the past 44 years. Prior to that I  
7 grew in the Bronx. When I was a young man going to  
8 college in the Bronx, I drove a taxicab, and when I  
9 was still a young man later on I drove a limousine.  
10 So, I have a good understanding of how traffic moves  
11 in the city. After graduating from law school in  
12 this very building, one of the things I found myself  
13 doing was an administrative law judge for the Parking  
14 Violations Bureau. I understand cars and parking and  
15 traffic. Today, I represent people who get traffic  
16 tickets in the city of New York. I'm mostly  
17 concerned about commercial traffic. Now, I'm  
18 concerned about everything that's going to happen on  
19 my block and there's a lot that's not going to  
20 change, but commercial traffic is the life blood of  
21 the city. They deliver the—the potato chips from the  
22 delicatessen that you go to that was in the New York  
23 Times, and if the guy who delivers the potato chips  
24 keeps getting tickets every time he delivers it or  
25 has a difficult time doing it, he's going to raise

2 his prices, and I'm going to pay for it, and that's  
3 going to be every single commercial venture in the  
4 city who gets just inconvenienced by what's going to  
5 happen. Now, I have a suggestion that can mitigate  
6 this. Currently, if a commercial vehicle is making  
7 an expeditious delivery, he is entitled to double  
8 park if there's no parking against the curb.  
9 However, he cannot do that between 14th Street and  
10 60<sup>th</sup> Street, Third Avenue to Ninth Avenue. This is  
11 called the Midtown Zone. Now, I don't know why he  
12 can do that on 13<sup>th</sup> Street but not 15<sup>th</sup> but that's the  
13 laws that exist today. My suggestion is that you  
14 relax the law during these 15 months. Maybe have the  
15 Midtown Zone start at 23<sup>rd</sup> Street so that the  
16 vehicles let's say coming down 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue [bell] can  
17 double park for two minutes somewhere 19<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup>.  
18 Run in and make the delivery and then leave without  
19 getting a ticket.

20 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: They do it  
21 already?

22 STEVEN FROMEWICK: But they get tickets  
23 for it, and—and they and a lot of people don't do it  
24 because they know they can't get a ticket and what  
25 they do is they drive around and around and around

2 looking for some place to park, and they will not be  
3 able to drive around and around and around when our  
4 streets are clogged. It's going to be so much worse  
5 and I'm suggesting just relaxing that one little rule  
6 is going to make it somewhat easier. Thank you.

7 LEGAL COUNSEL: Thank you, neighbor.  
8 Thank you all very much. Susan Finley, Walter  
9 Goldberg, Mary Conway Spiegel, William Henderson,  
10 Joshua Warren, Joe Parenta (sp?).

11 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: How many of those  
12 folks are here that we just called up? One, two.  
13 Ma'am, were you just called up? Excuse me. Were you  
14 just called up? Okay, go ahead. Who—was anyone else  
15 called up?

16 LEGAL COUNSEL: Zach Waldman, Richard  
17 Davis, Barb Petel (sp?)

18 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Are any of those  
19 folks here? [background comments, pause] Okay.

20 LEGAL COUNSEL: Judy Cline

21 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes. Come on up  
22 Ms. Cline.

23 LEGAL COUNSEL: Arthur Schwartz.

24 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: He is not here.

2 LEGAL COUNSEL: Brian Howell, Sharon  
3 Riley.

4 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Is Sharon Riley  
5 here? No.

6 LEGAL COUNSEL: Michael Walsh.

7 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Michael Walsh is  
8 here, yes.

9 LEGAL COUNSEL: Gwynn McHugh.

10 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Is Gwynn McHugh  
11 here? No. Yes, come on up and we get one more.

12 LEGAL COUNSEL: Robert Boddington.

13 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes, he's here.

14 LEGAL COUNSEL: We have one last chair to  
15 fill.

16 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yeah, and it is--  
17 ?

18 LEGAL COUNSEL: Adrian Horchock.

19 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Is Adrian  
20 Horchock here? Okay, so, if we can get one more  
21 chair and this is the final panel. Is there anyone  
22 here that wants to testify, but did not sign up? So,  
23 did you fill in slip? [background comments, pause]  
24 Is there anyone else? Okay, it's the final person to  
25 testify. If you could fill out a slip. Okay.

2                   SUSAN FINLEY: Thank you, Gentlemen for  
3 this opportunity. My name is Susan Finley. I'm a  
4 Co-Director of the Flatiron Alliance. We haven't  
5 really heard much about our neighborhood though based  
6 on the map we're looking at the Flatiron Neighborhood  
7 from 18<sup>th</sup> through 22<sup>nd</sup> Street with 20<sup>th</sup> Street being  
8 the most impacted, haven't been mentioned on  
9 anybody's maps, which kind of stuns us. We also feel  
10 like a stepchild in this whole thing. There's  
11 another perception that I have, and it's respectful  
12 but it's my perception of this process as a community  
13 member that while the MTA and the DOT are partners  
14 working on a recovery effort, there have been real  
15 differences in the way they have treated the  
16 communities that will be most negatively impacted by  
17 their mitigation plans. In the case of the L Train  
18 shutdown, the MTA partnered with the community in  
19 order to arrive at a plan. They met with L Train  
20 riders, outlined proposed options, and in the end it  
21 was the community that was given the choice to decide  
22 and the MTA will carry out the mitigation plan they  
23 chose, and most importantly, the MTA's plan has an  
24 end date. The suffering of the L Train riders will  
25 be temporary. The L Train will be up and running

2 again. Whereas, in the case of the community  
3 bordering 14th Street both south and north, this plan  
4 no matter what we're hearing today is--is intended to  
5 be permanent.

6 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing]  
7 That's not been said.

8 SUSAN FINLEY: Well, I'm sorry it's not  
9 been said, but you can read about it and--and that's  
10 our perception. I'm telling you--

11 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing]  
12 That's not my perception.

13 SUSAN FINLEY: Okay, it's--it's our fear.  
14 How's that?

15 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Well, I have not  
16 agreed to that.

17 SUSAN FINLEY: Well, can I say it's my  
18 fear--

19 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yeah.

20 SUSAN FINLEY: --and my neighborhood's  
21 fear. It's our fear and not only that, but by saying  
22 that the decision will be made by the community,  
23 well, if you were asking the community that was  
24 impacted and most negatively impacted, they would say  
25 right now: Please, we don't want your plan to be

2 permanent because by your own admission the traffic  
3 on our standstill narrow historic landmarked streets  
4 is going to be 50% increased and that's based on  
5 flawed data from 2005 that doesn't include Uber and  
6 all of the, you know, Uber and Lyft and all of those  
7 e-sharing applications. So, it's really going to be  
8 worse than that, and the question is, you know, it  
9 sounds wonderful. The plan sounds wonderful, buses  
10 running regularly across town. I understand that  
11 it's sounds great, but people haven't thought about  
12 where the pollution, the noise pollution the air  
13 pollution, the—the danger. On Sixth Avenue right now  
14 you take your—your life into your hands every time  
15 you try to cross the street. We have young children  
16 going to school for the first time. We have a blind  
17 community on 23<sup>rd</sup> Street and—and—and their library is  
18 on [bell] 20<sup>th</sup> Street. So, basically, there are  
19 consequences to this plan.

20 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I think everyone—  
21 I hope you've heard an acknowledgement of all that in  
22 this hearing.

23 SUSAN FINLEY: I have. Today is the  
24 first time.

25 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay.

2           SUSAN FINLEY: It's the first time.  
3 That's why I thank you so much for this hearing, but  
4 what I would like to say is that hundreds of  
5 thousands of people in Brooklyn will be impacted by  
6 the L Train being taken out of service every time  
7 they commute from their homes in Brooklyn and back,  
8 and we are fully willing to do whatever we can on a  
9 temporary basis to help make it easier for them.  
10 Because let's fair, hundreds of thousands of people  
11 inkling people within our neighborhoods--who don't  
12 even know they're going to be affected because nobody  
13 knows who is going to be affected and how--will also  
14 be impacted in their homes and businesses 24/7 with  
15 an increase of traffic and pollution that even the  
16 DOE's flawed data is putting at 50%, and unlike the  
17 straphangers, we don't have the guarantee that this  
18 change won't be permanent and tear the heart out of a  
19 vibrant ecosystem of landmarked historic unique  
20 neighborhoods, and threaten our fragile  
21 infrastructure. A good plan doesn't destroy  
22 neighborhoods in order to implement it. Thank you  
23 very much.

24           WALTER GOLDBERG: Good afternoon. My  
25 name is Walter Goldberg. I live in Williamsburg and

2 commute to Third Avenue and 16<sup>th</sup> Street every morning  
3 for school using the L Train, and that means that  
4 under the DOT plank I will be one of the 3% of riders  
5 who will have 20 minutes added to their commute  
6 everyday. I believe that the planned busway are  
7 comprehensive, but not practical or appealing because  
8 with this plan New Yorkers like me will be forced to  
9 transfer from buses to trains multiple times,  
10 something they've already shown resistance to doing  
11 without this crisis in place, and these transfers  
12 will be nowhere near seamless. I will have to watch  
13 crowded buses go by and choose whether to push myself  
14 onto them or be late and unlike the 5-minute commuted  
15 that I currently have on the L Train, I will have to  
16 suffer through these crowded buses for 30 minutes  
17 going at speeds that I could beat by walking. You  
18 must provide seamless transfers and make sure these  
19 buses are fast and accountable to their riders. You  
20 also must provide a transport-transparent way for me  
21 to ascertain the best mode of transportation on any  
22 given morning whether it be bus, train or ferry. If  
23 you, the City Council do not do so, then I can  
24 guarantee you that commuters of privilege including  
25 myself will give up on public transportation and

2 instead flood the crowded city with private cars and  
3 taxis. I have decided to switch to bike commuting  
4 when that stable rolls around, and so I support and  
5 look forward to the two protected bike lanes that  
6 will be added on 12<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup> Street. Still, Council  
7 has the unquestioned responsibility of ensuring that  
8 these lanes are as safe for riders as possible.  
9 Under the current plan, these bike lanes will have  
10 mixing zones where the majority of NYC crashes occur  
11 already at each intersection. In order to prevent  
12 these crashes, and the deaths of hundreds of riders,  
13 you must implement safer protections at each of these  
14 intersections. These plans must also include  
15 signaling priority for riders on [bell] on 12<sup>th</sup> and  
16 13<sup>th</sup> Street so that they can get where they need to  
17 go quickly with ease and more Citi Bike stations so  
18 that we can get more people riding and less people on  
19 the 14th Street busway. If April rolls around and I  
20 still see a rider down on 14<sup>th</sup> Street, what does that  
21 say about the success of this bike lane? Thank you  
22 for letting me speak.

23 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I just want to be  
24 clear on something. The City Council does not  
25 control the implementation of the plan. We have

2 oversight, we ask questions as you saw today. The  
3 Department of Transportation is agency that is run by  
4 the Mayor of the city of New York. The MTA is a  
5 public authority that is made up of multiple  
6 nominees. We have an oversight responsibility, which  
7 is why we are conducting this hearing. That's why  
8 we're going to conduct multiple hearings. That's why  
9 we're asking multiple questions and using your bully  
10 pulpit, but we do not control the implementation of  
11 the plan. It's just not—that's not the way this  
12 works, and I think it's important for us to be  
13 factual about who controls the plan, who control the  
14 Commissioner of the Department of Transportation, and  
15 who controls the President of the New York City  
16 Transit Authority, and the New York City Council  
17 doesn't control any of those things.

18 WALTER GOLDBERG: I'm aware of that. I  
19 just felt that as our representatives you are account  
20 accountable to us.

21 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: That's why we're  
22 asking the questions. That's why we're fighting.  
23 That's why we're at all these hearings, and that's  
24 why we're here listening to all of you and getting

2 your feedback, but I just want to be clear, we do not  
3 control the plan.

4 WALTER GOLDBERG: Yes, I'm aware. I just  
5 wanted to give as much influence as I could on the  
6 implementation of that

7 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I wish I had more  
8 influence.

9 WALTER GOLDBERG: [laughs] Thank you.

10 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you.

11 JOSHUA WARREN: Hello, my name is Joshua  
12 Warren. I live in Victoria which is on 14th Street.  
13 It was mentioned briefly by our representative  
14 Carlina Rivera. I'd like to thank this Council for  
15 having this hearing, and for paying attention to our  
16 needs. I'm very appreciate of today hearing for the  
17 first time that the--the DOT and MTA heard us loud and  
18 clear with their language today. I don't think that  
19 we feel like we've heard loud and clear. I think  
20 that you're hearing that a lot from the people that  
21 are up here and different of lots of different  
22 pockets of the city that don't necessarily believe  
23 that they've been heard. I think it's very--again,  
24 thank you to those that are still here. I think it's  
25 very disheartening that we were all, you know,

2 announced in this meeting and many people have left  
3 already. It's a very long meeting. I understand  
4 people don't have a lot of time. I did stick around.  
5 Let me at least tell you briefly about our building.  
6 We do have 1,100 or 1,200 people that lived in about  
7 500 apartments our only access is 14th Street. We  
8 have one door in the middle of Mid Avenue. They're  
9 not telling us today, and again, I appreciate to hear  
10 this new plan for local access, which was not part of  
11 the previous sessions. Well, some of what was part  
12 of the previous sessions was Commissioner Trottenberg  
13 saying that she wanted it to be potentially  
14 permanent. So, I would encourage to be a little more  
15 fearful of that problem for our neighborhood as you  
16 are our neighbor, but again, we have one door, we  
17 have one access point. I don't know how this new  
18 plan even works. They're now saying we can make  
19 right turns, but they also told us Union Square West  
20 was going to be closed. So, which right turn am I  
21 allowed to make. Can I make the right off Park  
22 Avenue and then go all the way to Sixth Avenue? That  
23 doesn't sound like what anyone is talking about, but  
24 that the only right turns that would get me the door  
25 at the Victoria. Again, we have 1,000 or 1,200

2 people elderly disabled families. I just had a baby  
3 12 weeks ago. I'm now trying to get car seats into a  
4 car. It's not my car. I-I don't have a car but once  
5 a week or some, I do tend to take a cab. I don't  
6 know where that's supposed to pick me up any more.  
7 If it's Fifth Avenue, which it does suggest that side  
8 street. If you look at the corner of Fifth Avenue  
9 now and 14<sup>th</sup> Street, it's a bike lane, it's trucks.  
10 I'm not sure where to pull over. The truck guy said  
11 something about trucks circling. I'm expecting we're  
12 going to have to circle. I really just don't  
13 understand how this plan works, [bell] and I just  
14 want more information, and I'm excited to hear more  
15 hearings like this and again thank you for—for your  
16 time.

17 JUDY CLINE: Thank you. Can you hear me?

18 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: If you could  
19 speak a little bit closer.

20 JUDY CLINE: Now?

21 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: A little closer.

22 [laughter]

23 JUDY CLINE: Okay.

24 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: There we do.

2 JUDY CLINE: [laughing] Okay. My name  
3 is Judy Cline. I am the Co-President of the 100 West  
4 17<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> Street Block Association. We feel  
5 totally left out. I hear mention of problems up to  
6 16<sup>th</sup> Street. I hear mention of problems beginning  
7 18<sup>th</sup> Street, and 17<sup>th</sup> Street is likely be the first  
8 major truckway north of 14th Street. We go almost  
9 river to river and we are extremely concerned about  
10 this.

11 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I said that  
12 earlier.

13 JUDY CLINE: You said 17?

14 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes.

15 JUDY CLINE: Thank you. Okay. So, we  
16 have—we—we had hoped for a meeting with the DOT and  
17 did not get it. It would have included a  
18 representative from the Ruben—Ruben Museum of Art,  
19 the Ruben Museum Education Center, Headmaster of the  
20 Winston Preparatory School and a few people  
21 representing businesses and residences in our—in our  
22 block. We have had no representation whatsoever from  
23 Community Board 4 until this evening when Christine  
24 mentioned oh, there's going to be a problem on the  
25 side streets. So, we were very happy. I was very

2 happy to hear this from her and with consideration of  
3 mitigation of this problem. We are—we are in trouble.  
4 As a street we have numerous schools. We have PS340  
5 an elementary school. We have the NYC Lab School. We  
6 have a school for autistic children. We have Winston  
7 Preparatory for children with special needs. They  
8 all have buses. They're all parked on both sides of  
9 the street. [bell] We have numerous store, which  
10 are giving us one lane free only. I'd like to know  
11 about some statements that were made this evening.  
12 Something about no through trucks on the side  
13 streets. Is that correct? [pause] No? Evidently  
14 not.

15 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: No, I wanted you  
16 to finish your question and then I'll—then I'll  
17 respond.

18 JUDY CLINE: [interposing] Okay, oh,  
19 okay. That's alright. No through trucks. That  
20 would be—make a big difference to us, and I just have  
21 to say that I'm very disappointed that this meeting  
22 occurs now with [speaking French] when we begged for  
23 our-our hearing, and our input starting well over a  
24 year ago before these plans were made and finalized.

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, Ms. Cline, I-  
3 I say this with-with total respect. You and I are  
4 neighbors.

5 JUDY CLINE: Yes.

6 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: There have been  
7 many meetings.

8 JUDY CLINE: We went-oh, we-we went and  
9 we spoke--

10 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] Bur  
11 I'm just saying you-you--

12 JUDY CLINE: --and we wrote and our  
13 voices--

14 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay, but I-

15 JUDY CLINE: --were never heard

16 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Well, the plan  
17 has changed significantly since the beginning of  
18 these meetings.

19 JUDY CLINE: Not for us. Not for the  
20 side streets.

21 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay, maybe not  
22 for your side street, but I--

23 JUDY CLINE: [interposing] Uh, that's who  
24 I'm representing.

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I—I think it's  
3 important for us to be accurate.

4 JUDY CLINE: But I'm representing—I am  
5 representing my street and other side streets.

6 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing]  
7 Okay, if you want to talk about one individual block  
8 and have questions about that--

9 JUDY CLINE: [interposing] No, I'm  
10 talking about these side streets in my area.

11 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: There was a—I  
12 referenced earlier today that there was a December  
13 2017 City Council hearing that lasted hours that was  
14 chaired by Chairman Rodriguez. There have been  
15 multiple meetings throughout the community on the  
16 West Side in Chelsea, in the West Village, on the  
17 East Side, in Brooklyn. At that hearing I spoke  
18 extensively about the side streets maybe for 25  
19 minutes. Now, you—I don't think you were at that  
20 City Council hearing. It was public hearing. It's  
21 televised. It's on our website. Just because you  
22 weren't at the hearing doesn't mean it was never  
23 addressed. Earlier today when I spoke in my opening  
24 remarks and in my questions, I spend a significant  
25 amount portion of time talking about--

2 JUDY CLINE: [interposing] I heard that

3 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: -9th Street, 10th  
4 Street, 11<sup>th</sup> Street, 12<sup>th</sup> Street, 13<sup>th</sup> Street, 15<sup>th</sup>  
5 Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Street, 17<sup>th</sup>, Street, 18<sup>th</sup> Street--

6 JUDY CLINE: [interposing] Okay.

7 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: --19<sup>th</sup> Street. So,  
8 I just thank it's—I could keep going.

9 JUDY CLINE: I—I know—I know this. I  
10 know this now.

11 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] But  
12 I just—I just.

13 JUDY CLINE: I know it now, but we went—  
14 we went to town hall meetings.

15 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] I  
16 have been talking about this for two years. Two  
17 years I've been talking about this.

18 JUDY CLINE: And we have been talking  
19 about this and we have had no consideration until  
20 today.

21 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] But  
22 I want—Ms. Cline, I want to be clear. I think it's  
23 really important for us to speak accurately.

24 JUDY CLINE: I am speaking accurately.

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: And for you' to  
3 sit there and say that this has not been addressed, I  
4 have addressed it personally dozens of times. So,  
5 it's unfair and a mischaracterization for you to say  
6 that no one has talked about this and addressed this  
7 because any of the people from the 14th Street  
8 Coalition who testified earlier and gave a  
9 presentation will tell you—I see David Marcus in the  
10 back. I see other folks.

11 JUDY CLINE: Right.

12 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I have worked  
13 with them constantly on this.

14 JUDY CLINE: We--

15 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] So,  
16 I just want to be clear, we have to be accurate.

17 JUDY CLINE: I'm—I am being accurate.

18 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I don't feel like  
19 you are being accurate.

20 JUDY CLINE: We have voiced—we have  
21 voiced our concerns at town hall meetings and the  
22 results of the town hall meetings have reflected the  
23 concerns of the commuters period.

24 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I am very  
25 concerned about your block on west 17<sup>th</sup> Street.

2 JUDY CLINE: Yeah, we're worried.

3 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I am very  
4 concerned about--

5 JUDY CLINE: 18<sup>th</sup> is worried.

6 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I'm worried about  
7 all of this.

8 JUDY CLINE: and 20<sup>th</sup>. Yes. Thank you.

9 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay. Thank you  
10 very much for your testimony.

11 JUDY CLINE: Thank you. Thank you.

12 MICHAEL WALSH: This is all, okay. Hi,  
13 my name is Michael Walsh and I represent the 100 West  
14 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> Block that's between 6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> on 19<sup>th</sup>  
15 and 20<sup>th</sup>. As 20<sup>th</sup> Street is a river to river street  
16 just our residents are very concerned about this and  
17 we hope that you will continue to work with the 14th  
18 Street Alliance, who are very much in touch with--  
19 Bill Borak is a resident of our block--that you will  
20 continue to work with the 14th Street Alliance on  
21 these issues and to try to mitigate traffic issues in  
22 our neighborhood. And speaking for myself as long-  
23 time user of the subway, I urge the DOT and the MTA  
24 and the Council to look at other--other options for  
25 depositing the buses near subway stations closed to

2 the Williamsburg Bridge, the F the B the D. There's  
3 other trains down there. I know that for myself if I  
4 was coming from Williamsburg and even if I had get to  
5 14th Street and 8<sup>th</sup>, I would prefer to take and F  
6 Train, switch at West 4<sup>th</sup> and get to—and there rather  
7 than take my chances on a bus stuck in traffic--

8 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Uh-hm.

9 MICHAEL WALSH: -and that is only for the  
10 people who—whose final base destination is the 14<sup>th</sup>  
11 Street Corridor. If you're going to Midtown or  
12 Downtown getting people to a subway as quickly as  
13 possible—I know the subways have their own issues,  
14 but the money devoted to these buses and the  
15 subsequent traffic and environmental problems, you  
16 know, that money would be better spent on increasing  
17 subway traffic on the—especially like the F and the B  
18 and the D and using those as a way to move people  
19 without having to bring them to the 14th Street  
20 Corridor that we heard here today is going to cause a  
21 huge amount of disruption. Thank you to the Council  
22 for letting us speak today. I really appreciate it.  
23 Thank.

24 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you Michael  
25 as always.

2 GWYNN MCHUGH: Hi. Thanks for having us  
3 today. My name Gwynn McHugh. I live on West 17<sup>th</sup>  
4 Street. Councilman, I know when he returned the mail  
5 to you it came to us and my husband Chris Johnson.

6 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Oh. [laughter]  
7 So I took that opportunity to bend your ear I think  
8 you if you read that

9 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I-I-I did read  
10 it. [laughter]

11 GWYNN MCHUGH: Thank you. Hey, again.  
12 [laughs] My husband and I both run our own businesses  
13 from our already noisy third floor home office facing  
14 17<sup>th</sup> Street. We've been downtown about 20 years.  
15 We've been in the area. We've seen population and  
16 tourism locally exploding. It's been wonderful. You  
17 know the Highline, the Whitney, Chelsea Market. You  
18 know a lot of businesses exploding but, with that has  
19 come huge increases in demand from foot traffic, real  
20 estate developers. Everything has created a huge  
21 growth in truck, traffic, noise, pollution all day  
22 everyday already and, you know, maybe people aren't  
23 feeling that, but Chelsea in particular is a  
24 neighborhood with explosive growth the past few  
25 years. So diverting trucks of 14th Street is going

2 to accelerate that—that destruction of habitability.  
3 You know, how can you work all day when the trucks  
4 are honking when you can't open your window, when you  
5 can't get deliveries, take deliveries, can't get to  
6 your customers? You know, a lot of us feel like  
7 you're just going to divert the traffic off to our  
8 streets, 17<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> in particular being the cross-  
9 town traffic routes, creating a noisy dangerous,  
10 unhealthy traffic build gridlock, which, you know, of  
11 course no one wants. We also see them as the  
12 bottlenecks happening 14th Street. I'm not sure.  
13 There were some discrepancies in the 14th Street  
14 Coalition's presentation about the bus lanes, but,  
15 you know, we want—we want the system to work for the  
16 commuters as well. If they can't get through they're  
17 going to be honking, and they're going to be  
18 frustrated as well. So, hopefully we can take a  
19 closer look at that. Also, just to put a human face  
20 on it, you know, many of us rent here. We can't put  
21 sound dampening windows. We can't move. I was  
22 displaced from my place on 22<sup>nd</sup> Street because of  
23 real estate developers coming into the neighborhood.  
24 You know, we're trying to chase the American dream  
25 here. You can't kick out all the little guys. You

2 know, my job creates jobs for others in the city. It  
3 brings in sales tax, real estate income you know, you  
4 got to let us live the dream [bell] Thank you.

5 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Is there anyone  
6 else that's set to testify who hasn't yet?

7 JANET CHARLESTON: Yes.

8 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Oh, yes, yes,  
9 please. I apologize.

10 JANET CHARLESTON: Hi. I'm Janet  
11 Charleston. I live at 132 West 15<sup>th</sup> Street between  
12 6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> and I apologize in advance because I got  
13 her an hour ago from work, if I'm repeating and I'm  
14 already hearing some of my concerns here, but I think  
15 it's important to note—for everyone to know there are  
16 a lot of us out there that are concerned, the  
17 hundreds of thousands of people in the communities,  
18 and I understand want to acknowledge the difficulties  
19 of handling this with the necessary L Train shutdown.  
20 I get it. My specific concerns about West 15<sup>th</sup>  
21 Street is—are some of what you all said we're one  
22 lane, we're already congested and we're already  
23 filled with illegal truck traffic as it is. Also,  
24 it's my understanding that Union Square West all

2 traffic will have to turn right onto 15<sup>th</sup> Street.

3 [background comments, pause] Oh, not 15<sup>th</sup>?

4 FEMALE SPEAKER: No, onto my street.

5 JANET CHARLESTON: Okay sorry, but I  
6 misunderstood that. So, I was especially concerned  
7 about that, and I'm sorry for you. [laughter] And  
8 then my—my other question is about what I recently  
9 heard about the 70 buses and hour for 17 hours a day.  
10 I question whether that's really going to serve the  
11 commuters that well even and whether it's necessary  
12 as most people are going to be using other lines. I  
13 don't know that it's really true that you need to  
14 move that many people at 14<sup>th</sup> Street. I also feel  
15 that to give us no respite from 17-hour day shutdown  
16 on the side streets is—is too much. Not even  
17 weekends? Nothing? I think that's too much. I also  
18 question whether the 70 buses an hour are really  
19 going to move. So, I'd like to see that looked at  
20 again, and to hopefully provide some of the side  
21 streets with some respite. Thank you for hearing me.

22 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you. I  
23 just want to address a few things. You know, I live  
24 on 15<sup>th</sup> Street between 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> Avenues. I've lived

2 on that block for—since May of 2003. So, I've been  
3 on that block for 15 years.

4 JANET CHARLESTON: I've been there for 30.

5 FEMALE SPEAKER: I hear you. [laughs]

6 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: And about two  
7 years ago when there was a devastating fire on West  
8 17<sup>th</sup> Street between 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> Avenues where 17<sup>th</sup>  
9 Street was shut down for a few months, and there was  
10 no through traffic from 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue over to 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue.  
11 So, you couldn't make the right turn off of 7<sup>th</sup>  
12 Avenue onto 17<sup>th</sup> Street. The traffic on my block 7  
13 days a week from 7:00 in the morning until midnight  
14 was gridlocked, standstill, honking, large trucks.  
15 People couldn't get through, and it had a very, very  
16 deleterious, detrimental impact on the quality of  
17 life for 7 or 8-week period in time just with one  
18 block being closed, and traffic being diverted.  
19 There is no way for us to predict what ultimately is  
20 going to happen. We can model it. We can try to come  
21 up with what we think is the requisite number of  
22 buses. We can get traffic enforcement agents that  
23 are mobile to be deployed at intersections that are  
24 difficult. We can come up with a mitigation plan  
25 that we think is maybe the most optimal mitigation

2 plan, but not a perfect mitigation plan, and there is  
3 still—it's still going to be a nightmare on certain  
4 days for all of us who live on the blocks on the west  
5 side, on the east side, the same thing on the other  
6 side of the river, the same thing at Kenmare and at  
7 Delancey. This is going to have a sizeable impact on  
8 hundreds of thousands of people who are not here  
9 tonight, but who are going to be I think very  
10 significantly affected by this plan. The reason why  
11 we are having this hearing, the reason why we have  
12 heard testimony and why we asked difficult questions  
13 from the Department of Transportation and the MTA is  
14 to try to figure out where there is a level of  
15 flexibility, where on the first week or two weeks or  
16 three weeks or three weeks or a month where we see  
17 choke points, where we see areas where it could be  
18 done better, where we can have regular meetings to  
19 discuss this. I think that is going to be a very key  
20 part of this. No plan is perfect. I wish this  
21 wasn't happening. I wish Super Storm Sandy didn't  
22 happen and ruin the Canarsie Tunnel. It happened.  
23 The shutdown is happening 10 months from now. The  
24 plan should not be looked as final yet because we  
25 still have to take more feedback, listen more,

2 understand the concerns of every individual block and  
3 do the best we can to mitigate it. I am committed o  
4 that. I have been committed to that throughout the  
5 entire process, and I look forward to doing that from  
6 now until April of next year, and then from April to  
7 July of when the shutdown actually occurs because it  
8 is going to be so necessary for the folks who live  
9 and work and work in these communities. I am deeply  
10 committed to that. I will not tell you that there  
11 are not going to be any problems. I'm not going to  
12 tell you that it's all going to be perfect right  
13 away. I'm not going to tell you that some days are  
14 going to be total hell for people who live or work on  
15 certain blocks. What I'm going to tell you is that  
16 we are going to be at least on the Council's side and  
17 I believe the same thing from DOT and the MTA we are  
18 going to be responsive. I hope that we're going to  
19 be nimble, agile and flexible in addressing the  
20 concerns that crop up during the process.

21 JANET CHARLESTON: I appreciate that and  
22 that it will be adaptable once it's set into place.  
23 To keep evaluating is important, but I do hope  
24 they'll consider giving a respite from the 17 hours 7  
25 days a week idea.

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I think we should  
3 see how it works in the first few weeks. I think we  
4 should—we have to—the number of people who take the L  
5 Train everyday is significant, and there's no way to  
6 perfectly model the number of folks that are doing to  
7 go to other subways, that are going to bike, that are  
8 going to walk. There's no way to model it. So, if  
9 we start on the side of transporting as many people as  
10 possible through cross-town buses and we see if it's  
11 not necessary the hours can be scaled back. You were  
12 here earlier with Commissioner Trottenberg spoke.  
13 She said that's not set in stone. It's not set in  
14 stone from 7:00 to 10:00 p.m. That could be moved.  
15 It could be changed depending on what we see. I  
16 think it's important for us to start that way, and to  
17 have regular meetings and to be flexible not just on  
18 that, but on many aspects of the entire mitigation  
19 plan.

20 ADRIAN HORCHOCK: Good afternoon. My  
21 name is Adrian Horchock. . I—I-it's actually kind of  
22 fitting that I'm going here at the end. I've learned  
23 a lot and I—I wanted to summarize, too, but my two  
24 cents is I'm a long time L Train commuter and I  
25 noticed that most of us go—once we're in Manhattan,

2 we go to Midtown, and there hasn't been too much like  
3 to ease the number of people who are going to Midtown  
4 like by-it-everybody is basically supposed to take  
5 the M and J and Z Trains but the J and Z actually  
6 down from us. So mainly just the M Train. So, I'm  
7 very worried about that, and I noticed that there's a  
8 lot of concerns like inside Manhattan. Like getting  
9 to Manhattan I believe also the East River Bridges  
10 should be HOV3 Plus like all of them because some  
11 people might be diverted to other bridges, and then  
12 they'll take FDR Drive and that might cause more  
13 congestion, and there's also lots of concerns about  
14 congestion on 14<sup>th</sup> Street. When I come here I don't  
15 want to want to be stuck in traffic. So, definitely  
16 like there--there has to be less--less vehicles on 14<sup>th</sup>  
17 Street. So, I don't like the idea of allowing  
18 pickups and drop-offs on 14<sup>th</sup> Street. That's going  
19 to increase the congestion, and also like to decrease  
20 congestion you should also extend the busway more,  
21 and be more ambitious and that way there will be less  
22 congestion on 14th Street, and people are going to be  
23 able to move around very quickly that way. Thank  
24 you.

2                   SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you,  
3 Adrian, for your testimony today, and I want to just  
4 tell you Ms. Cline, I-I really am compassionate and-  
5 and appreciate your real concerns, and anything that  
6 my office can do in the lead up from now until April  
7 of next year, Patrice-Patrice Comerford is-Patrice,  
8 will you stand up and wave your hand. She's in the  
9 back. We're happy to work with you. My office has  
10 spent a significant amount of time in working with  
11 the school on the corner and the Principal there Pat  
12 Carney, the pickup and drop-off of the-of the  
13 children because there was construction across the  
14 street for a long time, and new residential building  
15 going up, which created overcrowding on the  
16 sidewalks, which created unsafe conditions for the  
17 kids when they were entering and exiting school.  
18 There were issues with all of the yellow school buses  
19 you were talking about from Winston Preparatory and  
20 the other schools that were doubled parked and  
21 leaving their ignition on and creating fumes, and-and  
22 double parking, and we spent a lot of time on that.  
23 So my office has spend a huge amount of time on  
24 working on issues on West 17<sup>th</sup> Street Fifth Avenue  
25 all the way over to 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue. We've worked a lot

2 with the museum and they're wonderful, and their  
3 staff is wonderful. We've worked with Housing Works  
4 and the thrift stores and the restaurants and the  
5 residential buildings right near Cafeteria, and he  
6 other folks that live on my block. So, I—I am  
7 totally open, available to continue to address issues  
8 block by block that are going to crop up, and for us  
9 to do our best to be a bridge between the local  
10 blocks and businesses and our residents and the  
11 agencies that are going to have some flexibility in  
12 address it whether it be us looking at parking  
13 regulations and on some blocks is it better to create  
14 more commercial parking, less commercial parking,  
15 dedicated bus parking? Whatever it is, every block  
16 is different So, I am committed to making sure that  
17 you and your neighbors feel listened to, and that you  
18 feel responded to, and I want to ensure that you feel  
19 that you feel that way. I don't want to discount  
20 anything you say. I got a little heated because I  
21 have been talking about the side streets for a very  
22 long time. It's been something that I've been  
23 harping on, and so I want you to feel heard and  
24 anything that my office can do to continue to serve

2 you and your block, I am ready, willing and able to  
3 do that for you.

4 JUDY CLINE: [off mic] That's fantastic.  
5 One big question to-to clarify. Trucks, through  
6 trucks-

7 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [off mic] In the  
8 mic. [background comments, pause]

9 JUDY CLINE: One question. Through  
10 trucks on our blocks or no?

11 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, my position  
12 is no. They should not be on those residential side  
13 streets.

14 JUDY CLINE: Okay.

15 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: That they should  
16 have to cross on other thoroughfares. If they can't  
17 cross on 14th Street, the two other spots that were  
18 presented were 23<sup>rd</sup> Street and Houston Street.

19 Again, it's going to be traffic associated, but the  
20 trucks and some of the buses are going to have to go  
21 somewhere. That is why earlier when the inspector  
22 from the Transit Bureau of the NYPD testified I was  
23 really drilling him on the number of traffic  
24 enforcement agents, the number of uniformed NYPD  
25 Police Officers who has the power to issue summonses

2 on blocking the box? Will there be mobile deployment  
3 and the fact that we need to ensure that both the  
4 traffic enforcement agents and the uniformed officers  
5 are stationed on all of these residential blocks both  
6 on the east side, the west side, Kenmare,  
7 Williamsburg. That's why we have to go back after  
8 this hearing and the staff here at the City Council,  
9 the great policy analysts and lawyers that we have  
10 that work on these issues, we'll go back. We'll look  
11 at the numbers of the traffic enforcement officers  
12 and the police officers. We'll look at the affected  
13 areas and do some level of analysis with the  
14 Department of Transportation and the NYPD to figure  
15 out do they have the number of people needed to  
16 actually do the enforcement in a meaningful way to  
17 hopefully crack down on buses, trucks and all these  
18 other vehicles that we do not want on these  
19 residential side streets. So, this is the final and  
20 then we're done.

21 JUDY CLINE: So, I--and many of these have  
22 been brought up before. 20<sup>th</sup> Street--and I think I  
23 brought this up with you office--is the only through  
24 street after Houston Street before 23<sup>rd</sup> Street. So,  
25

2 we're very worried about becoming a through street  
3 for trucks.

4 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, again,  
5 everything I said to Ms. Cline, ditto for you and  
6 West 20<sup>th</sup> Street. Anything that we can do to work  
7 with you and your block, my office is deeply  
8 committed to doing that. You know, about I'm about  
9 to say is in no way to minimize your concern. We're  
10 hearing what you just said from every residential  
11 side street.

12 JUDY CLINE: Yes, but look at them now.

13 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I understand.

14 JUDY CLINE: It really is.

15 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I got it, but  
16 every-every-every side street is similarly concerned.  
17 17<sup>th</sup> Street doesn't go entirely through, but it's one  
18 that goes through quite bit.

19 JUDY CLINE: Well, I don't mean to—I  
20 don't mean to say it isn't.

21 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] No,  
22 no, all I'm—all I'm saying is the issue--

23 JUDY CLINE: [interposing] I just want it  
24 to come out. (sic)

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: [interposing] -  
3 the issue that you're raising a lot of folks are  
4 raising in the Village and in Chelsea and on the East  
5 side, and so we want to address this block by block  
6 by block, and my office and the staff here at the  
7 council are totally willing to work with you and  
8 other folks on your block to address those concerns.

9 JUDY CLINE: And I—and I have one more  
10 question about that. The DOT had said that sometimes  
11 they changed the direction of the street in order to  
12 stop something like that, but is that—does that make  
13 things worse?

14 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: There have been—  
15 I'm not a—I'm not a transportation policy expert, but  
16 there have been a significant number of studies from  
17 other cities around the world, and I know no other  
18 city is exactly like New York City and the density  
19 that we have here, but there have been other studies  
20 that have been done that shown in a—in a real, in a  
21 non-biased way that if you do certain techniques in  
22 certain areas it can actually mitigate traffic. It's  
23 actually counterintuitive. You would—you wouldn't  
24 think that it work, but in some municipalities around  
25 the world when they've tried these things, it has

2 worked. I think the DOT is open to trying that in  
3 certain areas, but again, there needs to be a level  
4 of flexibility. There needs to be a level of if  
5 something is not working to not be afraid to change  
6 it and to admit a mistake has been made to show a  
7 level of nimbleness, to show a level of openness to  
8 be able to change on the go over a 15-month period to  
9 be responsive, block by block, but to also- you can't  
10 be responsive just to an individual's block because  
11 one block actually affects the rest of the area.

12 JUDY CLINE: That's right.

13 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, it is a  
14 complicated puzzle and balance that we're going to  
15 have to strike, but we want to do it that looks out  
16 for pedestrians for cyclists, for people who live in  
17 the community for small businesses who work in the  
18 community. We want to do this in a way that creates  
19 a level of safety, and also does not severely impede  
20 the quality of life for all the folks I just named  
21 unless it is-not that it's totally necessary.  
22 Anything we can do to cut down on that, we want to be  
23 able to do that.

24 JUDY CLINE: Thank you, thank you.

25 [background comments, pause]

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay, this is the  
3 final--

4 JUDY CLINE: [laughs] Here take it.

5 MALE SPEAKER: Yeah, I just want to--

6 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: This like 40  
7 today and the final answer.

8 MALE SPEAKER: [interposing] I heard a  
9 lot today about the enforcement, and I've been a big  
10 advocated for the enforcement before today. I just  
11 want to--something that wasn't mentioned today as  
12 we're talking about all this increased policing and  
13 increased, you know, force on the streets. It does  
14 concern me a little we're talking about kind of  
15 creating a zone of police--increased police power, and  
16 how are they going to enforce which cars, what kinds  
17 of whatever sticks they're going to use to decide who  
18 they pull over for which things. And it does concern  
19 me that we're--that a lot of the support today has  
20 been for increased enforcement, which, of course, we  
21 need in this plan, but I--

22 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Can you tell me  
23 what the alternative is.

24 MALE SPEAKER: No, no, I don't know if  
25 there's an alternative, because we need better

2 systems to make sure that we're not biased in  
3 enforcing this, and that there's fairness and-and  
4 perceptions of fairness as to who is getting  
5 exceptions in coming down the street, and I don't  
6 know how to—I mean it's going to mean more oversight.  
7 Thank you.

8 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you all  
9 very much.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: With that--

11 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Mr. Chair, you're  
12 the best.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: With that  
14 [applause] Before we this hearing is closed, I would  
15 like to—I would like to thank Sheraton Sabat Director  
16 and especially Benjamin Cardozo Law School. Also  
17 Brian Hurley who is the AD Technician.

18 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Just hold on a  
19 second Chair. Did you testify Robert?

20 ROBERT BODDINGTON: [off mic] No, I  
21 didn't. I was standing on the floor and you called  
22 to see if I was here, but I was never asked to go up  
23 on the row.

24

25

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: You were supposed  
3 to go up when you were called. So, what we're—we're  
4 going to--

5 ROBERT BODDINGTON: [off mic] It was just  
6 to see if I was here.

7 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Okay. No it  
8 wasn't but Robert you can testify, and we will finish  
9 after you're done testifying.

10 ROBERT BODDINGTON: Alright, thank you.

11 [pause]

12 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: They called  
13 everyone up. You have two minutes because I know you  
14 like to talk my friend and my neighbor. You have two  
15 minutes.

16 ROBERT BODDINGTON: Which is the working  
17 mic.

18 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: If you—they all  
19 work just--

20 ROBERT BODDINGTON: Okay. I'd like to  
21 stand up actually. Thank you. Can I walk over here  
22 as well. I'm not afraid of you. So, if you need to,  
23 you can. [laughter]

24 ROBERT BODDINGTON: Okay, I want to show  
25 you--

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, you put the  
3 mic to your mouth, Robert.

4 ROBERT BODDINGTON: Okay, I want to show  
5 you some pictures. Basically, I've lived on West  
6 15<sup>th</sup> Street since 1972, and I've been commuting to  
7 New York when I was in New Jersey since I was 16, and  
8 I've had about 10 jobs all of which have been either  
9 downtown or uptown, and that is consistent with the  
10 data on a 2015 map by Robert—I think it's Robert  
11 Manduca who surveyed the entire country where the  
12 jobs are, and as you can see from this, the jobs are  
13 in Manhattan--

14 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes.

15 ROBERT BODDINGTON: --and they are  
16 concentrated uptown and downtown--

17 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes.

18 ROBERT BODDINGTON: --and, therefore,  
19 then the L Train, and if you look at this in detail,  
20 I have a detailed map of this, the jobs aren't along  
21 14<sup>th</sup> Street. 14th Street is used as a means to get  
22 from the east side to the west side. If you're going  
23 uptown on the east side, you can catch the IRT if you  
24 live on the west side and vice versa if you live on  
25 the east side. So, it is a shuttle mostly instead of

2 a final destination except in the Union Square area.  
3 This is all reflective on the data. Now, it turns  
4 out that the Regional Plan Association did a survey  
5 of where people from Brooklyn wound. Only 3% wound  
6 up on 14th Street. The MTA disputes that fact. I  
7 believe they said it's something in the 20%, but the  
8 M-the-the Regional Plan Association data is based  
9 upon interviews, and they have a scatter map that  
10 mirrors what the Manduca map does. Now I have asked  
11 the MTA for the methodology of how they determine  
12 [bell]. That is it?

13 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: You can finish.

14 ROBERT BODDINGTON: I've asked the MTA  
15 for the methodology. At the last meeting in-in May,  
16 Andy Byford told me that the methodology had been  
17 disclosed already. I told him it hadn't and he said,  
18 Well, we will have it out there soon then. It still  
19 hasn't been issued.

20 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I-I believe in  
21 transparency. I said that earlier today when  
22 President and Commissioner Trottenberg were here.  
23 So, you can get the information from the-a lawyer who  
24 works on this committee and the policy analyst. We  
25 will share with you what we have on how they modeled

2 their data. You can analyze it yourself with the-  
3 with the good maps that you have from the RPA, and  
4 we're happy to be in touch with you about that. I  
5 think that it's really important we have transparency  
6 on this entire project and how decisions are being  
7 made, and what numbers are being looked at. So, you  
8 and I agree on that, and the information that we have  
9 we're happy to share with you, and if we need more  
10 information disclosed, I'm happy to push for that.

11 ROBERT BODDINGTON: The point is that  
12 50,000 for-all that got on buses need not be the case  
13 if people can get around Manhattan by other means.

14 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: That's why there  
15 needs to be a level of flexibility in the plan from  
16 the start to the finish so that it can be changed as  
17 needed. Neighbor Mr. Boddington--

18 ROBERT BODDINGTON: [laughs]

19 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: --you closed us  
20 out. Thank you.

21 ROBERT BODDINGTON: And thank you for  
22 your eloquent remarks earlier.

23 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you.

24 ROBERT BODDINGTON: They're much  
25 appreciated.

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you very  
3 much. Mr. Chair.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, yes. So  
5 thank you, Speaker and with that we just want to end  
6 thanking again Cardozo School of Law, Sheraton Sabat  
7 Director of Special Events at Cardozo Law School who  
8 made all the arrangements for us possible. Also, to  
9 Brian Hurley AB Technician, all the sergeants of the  
10 Council and Jenny Law who is the Community Engagement  
11 of the Community Engagement Division. Also, today I  
12 would like to say thank you to Jonathan from the  
13 Council Policy and Malak (sp?) who is our lawyer, but  
14 now they're going to be moving to do all the  
15 information team in the Council, but with their  
16 charter revision, the best for you have a great  
17 future, and also I would like to welcome James  
18 Dijovani (sp?) who is the first hearing that he is  
19 sitting as the Counsel to this committee. So, with  
20 that, this hearing is adjourned. I'm sorry, someone  
21 that represents Yeshiva University who we also call a  
22 resident of the university in my Inwood, Washington  
23 Heights, John Greenfield. Thank you for the great  
24 job, and with that, this hearing is adjourned. Thank  
25 you. [gavel]

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

267

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date July 6, 2018