

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

----- X

May 2, 2018
Start: 10:44 a.m.
Recess: 12:13 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm.
14th Fl.

B E F O R E: ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mark Gjonaj
Barry S. Grodenchik
Bill Perkins
Carlina Rivera
Helen K. Rosenthal
Ritchie J. Torres
Jumaane D. Williams

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Michael McKee, Treasurer of Tenants' Political Action Committee, Board Member of Met Council on Housing, and City-Wide Tenants Union and Member of Real Rent Reform Campaign

Rebecca Nieves, Representative
Office of Assemblymember Harvey Epstein

Kathleen Wacom, Metropolitan Council on Housing

Susan Steinberg, President, Stuyvesant Town-Peter Cooper Village Tenants Association

Delsenia Glover, Director of Education and Organizing Tenants and Neighbors & Campaign Manager of Alliance for Tenant Power

Jenny Laurie, Exec. Director, Housing Court Answers

Ellen Davidson, Staff Attorney, Legal Aid Society

2 [sound check] [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Good morning

4 everyone. I'm Council Member Robert Cornegy, Chair

5 of the Committee on Housing and Buildings, and I'm

6 joined today by Council Member Cabrera, Perkins,

7 Rosenthal and Torres [background comments] and

8 Williams. We're here to hold a vote and hear

9 testimony on several resolutions, which will call

10 upon the New York State Legislators—Legislature to

11 take action on rent reform. The first two

12 resolutions sponsored by myself would call on the

13 state to repeal vacancy decontrol and vacancy bonus.

14 The next four resolutions are sponsored by Speaker

15 Johnson. The first calls on the state to limit rent

16 increases on the renewal of rent stabilized units

17 where preferential rent was being charged. The

18 second request that the state make the major capital

19 improvement rent increase a temporary surcharge. The

20 third calls on the Urstadt, and allow New York City

21 to regulate residential rents and the final

22 resolution sponsored by Speak—by the Speaker is would

23 call on the state to extend the statute of

24 limitations for rent overcharges. The next

25 resolution sponsored by Council Member Rivera would

2 call on the state to extend rent stabilization to
3 unregulated apartments. The final resolution is
4 sponsored by Council Member Powers and would call on
5 the state to provide rent control tenants relief from
6 high rent increases. [background comments] So, we
7 are going to call our first panel to give testimony
8 Rebecca Nieves, Michael McKee, Kathy Wacom, Susan
9 Steinberg. [background comments] Good morning.
10 [pause] When everyone is settled, you can begin your
11 testimonies. Just please identify yourself.
12 [background comments] Mikey, no. It's ladies first.
13 [background comments/laughter] I saw you.

14 MICHAEL MCKEE: Good morning. My name is
15 Michael McKee. I'm the Treasurer of the Tenants'
16 Political Action Committee. I'm also a board member
17 of the Met Council on Housing, and the City-Wide
18 Tenants Union, and I'm a member of the Real Rent
19 Reform Campaign, the lobbying group that represents
20 local community groups throughout the city, and
21 suburban counties. Tenants' PAC supports the various
22 resolutions calling on the State Legislature to pass
23 and the Governor to sign several bills to close
24 loopholes in our Rent Protection Laws and to
25 strengthen rent and eviction protections. Because

2 New York City lacks home rule power rents and
3 evictions, we must look to Albany to fix our broken
4 Rent Laws, and for the last 25 years we have beaten
5 our heads against a brick wall. Tenants' PAC urges
6 you to include a resolution in support of
7 S6828/A.8409-A, which is necessary to prevent the
8 eviction of hundreds of loft tenants most of them in
9 Northern Brooklyn, and I'm sure Council Member Levin
10 would be happy to sponsor such a resolution. And I
11 want to point out to you about the Vacancy Decontrol
12 Bill. It not only repeals vacancy deregulation, but
13 going forward, it regulates the deregulated units
14 that we have lost or at least 98% of them, which is a
15 very important provision. These measures should have
16 ben enacted years ago, but Governor Andrew Cuomo has
17 refused to support any of them for the last 7-1/2
18 years. Now that he has had an election year
19 conversion, his minions claim that he wants to repeal
20 vacancy deregulation, and to make major capital
21 improvement rent increases temporary surcharges. In
22 addition to an indifferent governor beholden to the
23 real estate developers who have poured millions of
24 dollars into his campaign coffers, the Republicans
25 who control the State Senate and the rogue Democrats

2 who empower the Republicans have stopped any of these
3 bills from coming to the floor. The State Assembly
4 passes and other pro-tenant bills every year or every
5 other year, and everyone in Albany understand that
6 they are one-house bills, but the Assembly has failed
7 to use any real leverage to force the governor and
8 senate to enact them. Tenants are encouraged by
9 statements from Speaker Corey Johnson beginning at
10 his inauguration on January 28th that he intends to
11 use his bully pulpit to help us put pressure on
12 Albany to act on these bills. Other speakers have
13 supported stronger rent protections, but none has
14 made this fight a daily priority until now. We are
15 very grateful to the Speaker. The gutting of our
16 rent protection laws over the last 2-1/2 decades has
17 been the major contributor to the disastrous
18 affordability crisis we are now experiencing not only
19 in the city but in the suburban counties as well.
20 Some of you will be surprised to hear this next part
21 of my testimony. We should never forget that it was
22 not the Republicans in Albany who did the first real
23 damage but, in fact, the Democrats and the New York
24 City Council who set the stage for our current
25 crisis. In 1994, when the city Rent Laws were up for

2 up for renewal for three more years, Speaker Peter
3 Vallone, who was seeking real estate support to run
4 for Mayor was able to cobble together 28 votes to
5 enact permanent vacancy deregulation and permanent
6 High income deregulation. State Law allows the city
7 to weaken the Rent Laws, but not to strengthen them.
8 One by one Democratic members of the Council from
9 Brooklyn, Queens and the Bronx told tenant advocates,
10 "I don't have any apartments in my district renting
11 for \$2,000 a month. So, this bill will not affect my
12 constituents." Verbatim they all said exactly the
13 same thing. We replied that if they passed this
14 bill, monthly rents of \$2,000 would become common all
15 over the city. Of course, we were right, and they
16 were wrong, but the damage was done, and now can only
17 be undone by Albany. In 1997, the State Legislature
18 and Governor George Pataki incorporated these
19 deregulations amendments into state law thus
20 preempting the city from altering them, and expanded
21 the two deregulation mechanisms to the suburban
22 counties. We have lost hundreds of thousands of
23 affordable units since the amendments became law. We
24 look forward to working with Speaker Corey Johnson
25 and other members of the City Council to restore our

2 Rent Laws. We hope that all of you will participate
3 in this fight. For starters, each one of you can
4 organize one or more town hall meetings in your
5 districts to activate and mobilize tenants to apply
6 pressure to Albany, and you can help pay for buses to
7 Albany next year when the State Rent and Co-Op Laws
8 once again come up for renewal. Thank you very much.

9 [pause]

10 REBECCA NIEVES: I am Rebecca Nieves, and
11 I'm representing the Office of Assemblymember Harvey
12 Epstein. We are in support of all resolutions
13 proposed today. Assemblymember Epstein represents
14 the East Side of Manhattan including the
15 neighborhoods of the Lower East Side, East Village
16 Alphabet City, Stuyvesant Town-Peter Cooper Village,
17 Marie Hill, Tudor City, and the United Nations.
18 Protecting tenants' rights and preserving affordable
19 housing has been a priority for Assemblymember
20 Epstein before he took office. His work towards a
21 more affordable New York City will not waver.
22 Assembly District 74 has seen innumerable changes in
23 hardships regarding its housing. For example, 40% of
24 occupied rent stabilized units in the Zip Code of
25 1009 alone are apartments with preferential rents.

2 That is about 5,500 homes at risk of rents being
3 hiked up to the legal maximum when leases are up for
4 renewal. In one Zip Code in District 74, we've run
5 the risk of displacing and vacating over 5,000 homes
6 with vacancies come bonuses and decontrol that makes
7 it increasingly hard for people to stay in New York.
8 By continuing to prevent New York City from
9 regulating residential rents, the problem will only
10 be exacerbated. It is imperative that New York City
11 can enact regulations and work with the State
12 Legislature to protect tenants and ensure we are
13 working towards making New York more affordable for
14 everyone. Once again, I am Rebecca Nieves
15 representing the office Assemblymember Harvey
16 Epstein, and we are in support of these resolutions.
17 Thank you for the opportunity to speak.

18 KATHLEEN WACOM: Oh, good morning. My
19 name is Kathleen Wacom. I represent the Metropolitan
20 Council on Housing. As a rent stabilized tenant for
21 over 40 years, I am in support of all the resolutions
22 presented today, and I would like to speak about MCIs
23 and the vacancy bonus and decontrol. Tenants are
24 rent burdened because of rent increases, fees, MCIs
25 and other surcharges. According to the Coalition

2 Against Tenant Harassment, and the Association for
3 Neighborhood Housing and Development and Community
4 Board 3, which includes Chinatown and the Lower East
5 Side where I live, the median household income is
6 \$42,268. Here over 50% of tenants are rent burdened.
7 The recent rent Guidelines Support Study states that
8 citywide tenants' incomes have remained stagnant for
9 the fourth consecutive year while landlords profits
10 are 43%. The vacancy decontrol and vacancy bonus are
11 incentivizing landlords to harass longstanding
12 tenants from their homes. This is done by
13 aggressively offering buy-outs and by frivolous and
14 lawsuits. To fight these lawsuits and evictions many
15 tenants use their savings and retirement funds to pay
16 legal fees. According to the Right to Counsel
17 Coalition, 250,000 to 300,000 evictions are due to
18 non-payment of rent. Many are among the more than
19 60,000 homeless people living in shelters. Often,
20 but the time a tenant is eligible for SCRIE or DRIE,
21 the rent is unaffordable. These programs freeze
22 rents. They do not roll back rents. So, tenants
23 either cut back on medicine and food or move from
24 their homes. Also, many registered rents are
25 preferential and market rate leases are illegal. To

2 remedy this, the statute of limitations must be
3 extended, and MCIs must be temporary. I thank the
4 Council for these resolutions, and I hope that the
5 state, who has the ability to make these changes will
6 do so to protect affordable housing and maintain the
7 stability of our neighborhoods. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Ms. Wacom, do you
9 have your testimony for submission?

10 KATHLEEN WACOM: I-I do have to photocopy
11 more of this, and I will do that.

12 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Alright, thank you.

13 KATHLEEN WACOM: Thank you. [background
14 comments, pause]

15 SUSAN STEINBERG: [off mic]-[on
16 mic]Buildings Committee, I want to thank you very
17 much for this opportunity to testify, and I thank you
18 for being the-the warriors for tenants. We really
19 need your help. I'm Susan Steinberg. I'm President
20 of the Stuyvesant Town- Cooper Village Tenants
21 Association representing 28,000 residents and 11,230
22 units, and we are all supporting the Preconsidered
23 Resolutions, which are before you today. Despite the
24 protections of rent regulations, rents have risen
25 dramatically in Peter Cooper Village in Stuyvesant

town. A one-bedroom now starts at \$3,156 per month.

This is not affordable. When I moved in in 1980, I

paid \$250, and I realize there's a little time in

between, but nevertheless. In our city, the cost of

living is 129% higher than the national average, and

people's incomes are really not keeping up with the

rise in rents. As a result of the weakening of

Rent Laws, every time they come up for renewal in

Albany, and the skyrocketing of rents in our once

stable community is now filled with transients who

double and triple up to make the rent and let them

leave a lease renewal when the rent goes up.

Thousands of units churn annually thanks to vacancy

decontrol, vacancy bonuses, preferential rents and

major capital improvements that we pay for 'til

death. In prefiguring all of these amendments and

loopholes is the Urstadt Law, which snatched away New

York City's control of its rent destiny. It's time

to take back that control. The series of resolutions

to repeal or limit the Albany catalog of bad faith is

really important to us, and as I said, the 28,000

residents of Stuyvesant Town-Peter Cooper Village

support this. A lot of our community has been

uprooted. We're no longer stable. I haven't known

2 my neighbors for the past 12 years because they
3 change every two years when the rent is up.
4 Community used to be very important to us. It's
5 still important to us. We want to be able to know
6 our neighbors not to have this constant churn. So,
7 once again, I thank all of you for your time, and
8 thank Speaker Corey Johnson for allowing us this
9 opportunity.

10 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Are there any
11 question of my colleagues? Yeah, Council Member
12 Williams.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very
14 much, Mr. Chair, and it's more of a comment that I
15 wanted to state. Thank you, everybody, for your
16 testimony and the work you do. Just have to give a
17 special shout out to Mike McKee who has been stalwart
18 in this journey for quite some time. These are
19 issues I've been working on. Just calculating and
20 I'm scared to say it's actually been almost two
21 decades now been working on these issues. I want to
22 thank Mike for pointing out that it was not the
23 Republicans who started this drama, and I'm—as I am—
24 folks know doing some things, I always point out
25 there are Democrats who need to be held accountable

2 for the state of housing and homelessness in this
3 this city, and in this state. We can't just blame it
4 on the orange madness that's going on because it was
5 fertile ground that was laid long before the orange
6 craziness. The Governor in particular, and this is
7 not hyperbole. There's a lot of issues I have with
8 him, but housing is one of his most palpable failures
9 across the state, and in this city. He could have
10 done so much to strengthen rent regulation in the
11 city, and rent regulations to the rest of the state.
12 What he did before 21-A (sic) was just egregious to-
13 to no end. He weakened, and not only did he weaken,
14 he took it away from our ability to even negotiate
15 against rent regulation. This is appalling what this
16 governor has done with rent regulations. I'm happy
17 to be supportive all these resolutions, and I ask the
18 clerk to please add my name to all of them. I wish
19 there was more that this city can. We're doing all
20 that we can, and I'm glad my colleagues along with
21 the Chair and the Speaker are doing all that they can
22 do, but the State really has to step up here. I hope
23 when the state comes back with Democrat control that
24 they pass the things that they say they would pass if
25 the Assembly passes. That's going to be a big test

2 to see what happens. It's easy to talk when you
3 don't have the power. When you do have the power,
4 we'll see what happens, but the Governor has to
5 provide leadership. He seems to providing the
6 leadership the closer we get to September. So, maybe
7 we can push him here, and I also hope if we do civil
8 disobedience and be disruptive of the status quo
9 thing, which I will gladly take a part, we should
10 move it into some of these Republican districts that
11 are not feeling the pressure. I'm happy to go there
12 and disrupt some of those neighbors so that maybe
13 they can put pressure on Flannigan and others as
14 well. So, I'm going to be supportive of this. I
15 don't know if I'll be able to wait until the vote,
16 but I wanted to make sure I put my comments on the
17 record. Thank you, everyone. Let's push it. I mean
18 communities are being ravaged by rent-by preferential
19 rent in particular and rent regulation and decontrol
20 and all of those things, like literally ravaged. We
21 have to do more on this. Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you. Council
23 Member Rosenthal.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so
25 much, Chair Cornegy. I really just like Council

2 Member Williams want to thank everyone for taking
3 their time to come and testify today, and for the
4 people who are about to testify, you guys are on the
5 front lines doing the work. I especially want to
6 thank Assemblymember, the representative from
7 Assemblymember Harvey Epstein's Office. I'm not
8 shocked that this—he's starting off doing exactly
9 what we would hope he would do, living up to his
10 word. But Michael, I, too, want to lend my thanks
11 for your pointing out how this al began in 1994.
12 It's incredibly frustrating that we've left ourselves
13 in this sort of powerless situation, and it's a great
14 reminder to all of us on the Council that, you now,
15 not to get strong armed into doing something that,
16 you know, we're told is not going to really affect
17 people when, in fact, the implications are
18 devastating. So, thank you for continuing to remind
19 us about that. Next time you can also include the
20 part about in 2010, which is the part I always love,
21 and the five developers who in the middle of the
22 night stole millions of dollars out of the city's
23 pocket. Anyway, thank you all very much.

24 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you, Council
25 Member Rosenthal. I just want to add my voice to the

2 voice to the—to the chorus represent a district that
3 in the 90s couldn't have fathomed a \$2,000 rent in
4 Bedford-Stuyvesant and Northern Crown Heights, which
5 that is now below—I mean that is the average if
6 you're lucky. So, it's that vision and foresight
7 that sometimes we need to pay attention to the
8 advocates a little bit better. So, I just want to
9 thank you for pointing that out. Council Member
10 Torres.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Can I—can I ask a
12 question because I see the repeal of vacancy
13 decontrol as the Holy Grail. You know, without the
14 repeal of vacancy decontrol everything we do in the
15 city whether it's the right to counsel, MIH all noble
16 initiatives are tinkering at the margins. And so, if
17 we have a democratic wave at the next election, and a
18 democratic senate, what are the—what are the—what are
19 the actual prospects for the repeal of vacancy
20 decontrol? Because you know more about the merits
21 and the politics better than anyone.

22 MICHAEL MCKEE: I think—thank you Council
23 Member. I think—first of all, in response—as a
24 general response to the—several of the comments, we
25 should never underestimate the power of real estate

2 money. That's what got them the votes in—in 1994 at
3 the City Council. There were numerous City Council
4 members who made an absolute ironclad commitment to
5 use at the time that they would vote no who ended up
6 voting yes. Most notably, Anthony Weiner who was one
7 of the few City Council Members who actually
8 understood the long-term significance of this
9 amendment and told us that he understood that this
10 was not really the simple little amendment that this
11 was a—a—the beginning of the dismantling of the rent
12 regulation system. In the end, he ended up voting
13 for it, and two years later introduced a bill that
14 would have gutted code enforcement, which the Housing
15 Committee under Archie Spigner tried twice to report
16 out of committee, and twice we stopped it, and then
17 ran for Congress in 1998 with a ton of real estate
18 money. And I think we should never, ever
19 underestimate the ability of the real estate lobby to
20 buy what it wants, and they do this in Albany all the
21 time. The Upstate senators of either party do not
22 have rent regulation, unfortunately. We hope someday
23 they will, but they don't care about the issue one
24 way or another. They really don't. It's not
25 something that—they'll vote--whatever their

2 leadership tells them to do, that's how they'll vote.

3 So, witness that virtually all of the Republican

4 senators with the exception of Kemp Hannon from Long

5 Island, who is real audio log, they all vote to renew

6 the Rent Laws periodically because that's the deal.

7 So, about next year, I wish I could believe that

8 Andrew Cuomo really means what he seems to be saying

9 lately, and I wish I didn't feel that if he is re-

10 elected in November that he will be serious about any

11 of these issues next year. This is clearly and

12 election year conversion. There are two words to

13 explain why he is now saying this or his minions

14 actually are saying it. Supposedly, he's going to be

15 coming out with a platform at some point, and the

16 first begins with C and the second word begins with

17 N, but if the Democrats take control of the State

18 Senate, I believe we will have a real shot at getting

19 some of these bills done, all of them I hope, but in

20 2010 when the Democrats had a one-vote majority in

21 the State Senate, the real estate industry, the RSA,

22 the Rent Stabilization Association went to three

23 Democratic senators and promised them a \$150,000 in

24 campaign funds if they would vote against two of our

25 bills that came to the floor. One was the bill to

2 close the preferential rent loophole, and the other
3 was the bill to restrict owner use evictions, and
4 they all three voted against that bill even though
5 two of them we had had helped Tenants PAC and helped
6 elect, and they did indeed follow through on that
7 pledge to give them \$150,000 each. Two of them, and
8 this is kind of heartwarming to see that two of them
9 lost anyway. One of them is still in the Senate,
10 David Valesky of Syracuse, and I-I-I-it's not a slam
11 dunk. You know what? Repeal of home-repeal or
12 Urstadt and restoration of Home Rule is not slam
13 dunk. I tell people all the time. I tell tenant
14 advocates all the time don't assume that just because
15 we can get Home Rule back if we ever can that we're
16 going to win in the City Council and the history is
17 against us. Because if Urstadt is repealed, 75% of
18 the money that now goes to politicians in Albany goes
19 to City Hall. They'll still have things they need in
20 Albany like 421-A and stuff like that, but they will-
21 they will be sending all of their campaign money to
22 you guys, and by the same token, having a Democratic
23 majority in the State Senate is not a slam dunk. And
24 I-I want to finish by saying that if you really think
25 about it, Andrew Cuomo did this to himself. He now

2 is in a position where he cannot get 32 votes for
3 anything that he says he wants to whether it's on
4 this issue or other progressive issues. The reason
5 for that is that despite his promises, repeated
6 promises to veto any partisan reapportionment plan in
7 2012, he in return for a dubious legislative package,
8 which included an anti-labor union pension bill
9 setting up a new lesser tier for new hires, he
10 allowed both houses to redraw their own lines, and
11 allowed the Senate Republicans to create hyper-
12 partisan gerrymandered lines that they have use to
13 stay in power. I'm sorry. I'm a little cynical.
14 I've been down this road too long, but it's not going
15 to be—it's not going to just happen. We're going to
16 have to hold our friends in the Senate if they are in
17 the majority, we're going to have to hold them
18 accountable, and we're going to have to make it clear
19 to our friends in the Assembly that it's not enough
20 to just pass one-house bills every year and say and
21 put out a press release. You've got to actually use
22 some leverage to force the other players to—to do
23 this. A long-winded answer, but thank you for letting
24 me get that off my chest.

2 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Well, thank you.
3 Council Member Rivera.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes, thank you.
5 I've prepared a very, very short statement on my
6 bill. Of course, I want to thank you all for being
7 here. Thank you, Chair Cornegy and the members of
8 the Committee, Mike, Kathy, Rebecca and Susan, thank
9 you for all of your work. After the resolution, I
10 probably won't be getting a lot of real estate checks
11 coming in once they—once they read it, but just know
12 that I'm always open to communication and working
13 with all the stakeholders involved. So with rental
14 prices continuing to remain at sky high levels here
15 in our city, and with tenants often seeing rent
16 increase of hundreds of dollars or more. When their
17 lease expires, it's clear that something has to
18 change. That something is rent stabilization. Rent
19 stabilization is the great equalizer in our city's
20 fight against gentrification. Roughly, one million
21 New Yorkers go about their day with the financial
22 security of knowing they won't be facing an egregious
23 rent hike at the end of their lease. Unfortunately,
24 that's still leaves millions of New Yorkers in market
25 rate apartments who worry about losing that basic

2 human right, the right to a home. Excessive rent
3 hikes and no right to a lease-lease renewal leave so
4 many New Yorkers in this position where they don't
5 know what's going to happen, and these are middle-
6 class families who are struggling to make it. We
7 have the opportunity right now to do the right thing,
8 and still thrive economically. So, it's time for the
9 State to something bold, and I encourage all of my
10 fellow Council Members to support my resolution
11 calling on the State Legislature to pass and the
12 Governor to sign legislation that guarantees rent
13 stabilization protections to all apartments in New
14 York City. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you, Council
16 Member. Thank you so much for your testimony, and
17 for your work and advocacy around these very germane
18 issues to communities across the city. [background
19 comments] Oh, I'm sorry, I'm sorry, I'm sorry.

20 And likely--

21 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Council Member
22 Gjonaj, I apologize.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you. I
24 agree with you, and first of all, Mike, you've
25 committed your life to fighting for tenants. It's a

2 very worthy and notable cause, and I truly commend
3 you on it. I just want to question it. It's more
4 than Albany that's the blame for this, and we know
5 that realtors, landlords will somehow figure out to
6 make money. So, if they can't make the money based
7 on rent increases, they'll cut services because they
8 have to have a balance at the end of the day, and
9 hopefully it will be a profitable one for them.
10 Otherwise, they'll have to cut services further to
11 make sure they have—they turn over a profit, and able
12 to meet their obligations. But one thing that never
13 comes up in the discussions is the charges that are
14 placed on are passed through from the landlord to the
15 tenant. Real estate taxes and water and sewer rates
16 for New York City. Today water and sewer rates are
17 more expensive than the fuel, average around \$1,200
18 per apartment per year. Real estate taxes are about
19 \$3,000 per apartment, per year. That's \$400 a month
20 combined that a landlord pays back to the city in the
21 form of real estate taxes and water and sewer. So,
22 the city charges landlord, landlord passes onto
23 tenant. Tenant pays landlord, landlord pay city.
24 Who's the culprit in your mind?

2 MICHAEL MCKEE: [off mic] I think you-[on
3 mic] I think you raised a very interesting point, and
4 I agree with you about real property taxes and water
5 and sewer changes. I think the Water Board has been--
6 this goes back 30 years 25 years at least, basically
7 instead of bonding to pay for enhancements to our
8 water supply and protection of the watershed, the
9 Water Board--the City Water Board has loaded
10 everything into the rates--and that is why water and
11 sewer charges have skyrocketed. This is especially a
12 problem for HDFCs, low-income co-ops who are, you
13 know, basically by definition the tenants in--or the
14 shareholders in those buildings are low-income and
15 this--many of them are being slammed with this as are
16 some small landlords, and as far as what--

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: [interposing] But
18 you agree that might the charges get passed onto

19 MICHAEL MCKEE: [interposing] Well, yes,
20 I'm getting--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: --the tenant and
22 the tenant for that.

23 MICHAEL MCKEE: I'm getting to that. I'm
24 getting to that, and as far as real property taxes
25 goes, it's clear to anyone who observes this system

2 that it's a very unfair system, and that apartment
3 buildings are over-assessed compared to single-family
4 homes, and I believe the reason for that is that most
5 tenants are not aware that when they write their
6 monthly rent check, 25% of that is going to the city
7 for real property taxes, and it's, therefore, easier
8 to pass it onto the tenants from the city's point of
9 view than it is to pass it onto homeowners. Whether
10 we'll ever see any kind of reform of our real
11 property tax system is a big question, and I have my
12 doubts even though people talk about it all the time.
13 I do want to point out to you, Council Member, that
14 according to Department of Finance data, which is
15 made available in the aggregate every year to the
16 City Rent Guidelines Board under Local Law 63, which
17 requires owners of income producing property
18 including rent stabilized buildings to report
19 annually their income and expenses to the Department
20 of Finance for purposes of real property assessments,
21 but they make these data available in the aggregate
22 to the Rent Guidelines Board, and they show that on
23 average landlords of rent stabilized properties in
24 New York City are netting 42 cents on the dollar.
25 Actually, it's 41.7% according to the report that was

2 published in March. They report--they--they--they
3 publish this every year. Now, that's an average. It
4 means some landlords are netting more, and some
5 landlords are netting less, but it means basically
6 landlords are spending 58 cents of every dollar they
7 collect on all costs of running their building,
8 including everything. All the operation they--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: [interposing] I
10 mean does this take into consideration mortgage
11 loans?

12 MICHAEL MCKEE: Excuse me. I haven't
13 finished.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Sorry.

15 MICHAEL MCKEE: --leaving 42 cents for
16 debt service and profit.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Uh-hm.

18 MICHAEL MCKEE: Now, that's in my view an
19 amazingly positive net, and while it is best a
20 surrogate for profit, you can't really tell if a
21 building is profitable unless you look at the
22 individual books for that building, which we don't
23 have the ability to do. But net operating income is
24 a very good surrogate for profit. It's the best
25 we've got, and it certainly paints a picture of a

2 real estate industry that is doing—I'm sorry—pretty
3 well. I—I beg you to tell me another industry that
4 even approaches a 42% net.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I can't—I don't
6 know. I can't--

7 MICHAEL MCKEE: [interposing]
8 Supermarkets operate on 3 to 5% margin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Mike, you're—
10 you're extremely knowledgeable, and again I enjoyed
11 the conversation with you, but there's real points
12 here. Over the next five years, New York City is
13 projecting \$1 billion increase in real estate taxes.
14 A large portion of those increases on top of what is
15 currently being paid is going to be passed onto the
16 very group, the very families and individuals that we
17 claim to want to be helping to rent protections will
18 be paying an unfair share of real estate taxes that
19 will be included in their rent and passed through the
20 landlord.

21 MICHAEL MCKEE: You are correct.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Year over year
23 billion dollar increases. Multiple-family buildings
24 are and those are dwelling buildings are subsidizing
25 homeownerships, and other classes on real estate, the

2 Class 4s that we have, and not enough is being said
3 or done to pushback on the city. I want to add one
4 more thing: Would you be—and we all know that New
5 York City has become very unaffordable for many and
6 not even including homeowners let alone renters
7 that live on a fixed income, and I wholehearted
8 agree. Would you consider a means test an income
9 test that would truly give the financial help to
10 those families similar to SCRIE and DRIE tenants that
11 earn under \$50,000 a year the most vulnerable of our
12 New York City residents, affording them the same
13 rights that SCRIE and DRIE tenants currently benefit
14 from where it's a rent cap and no future rent
15 increase will be passed onto the tenant, and the city
16 would subsidize the landlord through a real estate
17 tax credit. Would you be supportive of something
18 like that?

19 MICHAEL MCKEE: No, I would not agree to
20 that.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Tell me why.

22 MICHAEL MCKEE: It's a ridiculous idea.
23 First of all, the city couldn't afford it. It would
24 cost a fortune. SCRIE and DRIE already cost a lot,
25 and that's with—even with many people who are

2 eligible not applying for it, which is a big problem
3 with SCRIE and DRIE, but what this really is, this
4 was—this was a proposal that was originally floated
5 by Pedro Espada when he was the Chair of the Senate
6 Housing Committee, and which was drafted by the real
7 estate industry and it's basically a trap to say that
8 well, we'll take care of the low-income people and
9 the people who really deserve and—and need the
10 protections for rent regulations. Once you enacted
11 something like that, then you would have a rationale
12 for just ending that regulation, rent protections for
13 all—all the other tenants. I believe that all
14 tenants deserve and need rent and eviction
15 protections. Rent regulation is not an affordability
16 program, and the proof of that is that rent regulated
17 rents are not affordable in many, many cases. In
18 many cases people are struggling to pay the rent
19 stabilized rent. I know through—I have three friends
20 who in the last eight or nine years have moved out of
21 New York City and given up their rent stabilized
22 apartments. One of them moved to New Jersey and one
23 of them moved to North Carolina, and one of them
24 moved to Texas because they could no longer afford to
25 pay the rent stabilized rent. And so, this is not an

2 affordable program. You cannot guarantee
3 affordability through rent regulation. What it is,
4 is a program to level the playing field, and to
5 create a better balance between the power of
6 landlords and the power of renters including people
7 going out into the market and looking for apartments,
8 and now you can't possibly find a rent stabilized
9 apartment. You can only find a market rate
10 apartment, which is wrong, and we get vacancy
11 decontrol repealed and if we are able to reregulate
12 the units that have been lost, we have to recognize
13 that a huge amount of damage has been done to
14 affordability, and you can't take all of that back.
15 You can't recapture it all. So, if we do succeed in
16 repealing vacancy deregulation, and reregulating the
17 units that have been lost, we're going to have much
18 higher regulated rents than we used to have, and that
19 is a shame, but it's the reality. So, I would not
20 agree with that—that proposal. I think it's a bad
21 proposal. I think it is—it is—it is a real estate
22 proposal disguised as a pro-tenant proposal, and I
23 oppose it.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I thank you for
25 that, and I'd like to continue this with you, but

2 thousands of seniors and disabled are benefitting
3 from those programs, and I think any help to those
4 that are most vulnerable that could be homeless on a
5 whim because they can't afford their rent or
6 increases regardless of how low or high they are by
7 RGB on a yearly basis. That's the--those are the
8 families that government should seek to protect while
9 offering the same protections to New Yorkers to rent
10 stabilized apartments, but that is a very vulnerable
11 population, and any aid I would imagine should be
12 supported by all that understand that those families
13 are truly facing the most--the most economic
14 challenges because of the income that they have.

15 MICHAEL MCKEE: Have you costed this out,
16 Council Member?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I have.

18 MICHAEL MCKEE: Well, I hope you aren't
19 using Pedro Espada's cost estimates because they
20 were--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: [interposing] Uh-
22 hm.

23 MICHAEL MCKEE: --utter nonsense.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: He had the--
25

2 MICHAEL MCKEE: [interposing] He claimed—
3 he claimed in 2010 that it would cost I believe \$10
4 million after five years when, in fact, the Community
5 Service Society did an analysis of this and said it
6 would cost \$5 billion a year in lost city revenue
7 after five years.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: How much a year?

9 MICHAEL MCKEE: \$5 billion. That was an
10 estimate at the time made by the Community Service
11 Society, a very prominent non-profit organization. I
12 think we certainly do need to do more to protect
13 people from high rents, and I think the solution to
14 that is stronger rent protections and rent rollback.
15 Okay. Does the Rent Guidelines Board have the power
16 to enact a rent rollback? They sure do. Are they
17 like to do it? Don't hold your breath, but they
18 could do it.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Alright, thank
20 you for your time. Thank you to the panel.

21 MICHAEL MCKEE: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: So, it's a point
23 with me Mr. McKee. I—I got caught up in listening to
24 your wealth of knowledge and forgot I had a hearing
25 to chair. [laughter] So, but—but I do want to thank

2 you, and—and honestly this could go on for a while,
3 and it's not just interesting banter. We are trying
4 to make some resolutions for the tenants. So, having
5 that wealth of information is not wasted on this
6 committee or myself.

7 MICHAEL MCKEE: Thank you, and we hope
8 that all of you will get involved in the fight
9 between now and next June to close these loopholes,
10 and stop the erosion of affordable housing because
11 that's what's at stake here, and I would remind you
12 of the suggestion that each of you could organize
13 town halls in your districts for the purpose of
14 activating and mobilizing grassroots tenants, too,
15 because without that kind of grassroots pressure, we
16 can't win, and Corey understands that, and I think
17 most of you understand that.

18 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you again for
19 your testimony. I'm going to call the next panel.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [off mic] I do
21 have a comment. (sic)

22 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Oh. Helen
23 Rosenthal, [laughter] again.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: My comments--

2 MICHAEL MCKEE: [interposing] Surely, you
3 want to ask a question of somebody else on the panel.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well, I mean I
5 just need to be clear about what's happened on the
6 Upper West Side as an explanation of why I support
7 these resolutions. You know, exactly the story about
8 your couple of friends who are leaving, I mean I
9 have—people in my—many people in my district the only
10 reason that we have middle-income, what we can call
11 middle-income people on the Upper West Side is
12 because of rent regulation, and if we lost those
13 units, then the Upper West Side becomes an area where
14 you have the very rich and the very poor. And any
15 macro-economic—economist would tell you that a—our—
16 our country can't survive on that—that-can't continue
17 on that situation where you have the very rich and
18 the very poor, and we need the middle class in order—
19 and-and opportunities to pull up lower income people
20 to the middle-class in order for our country to
21 survive. So, I would caution anyone from making sort
22 of bad public policy decisions based on a couple of
23 bad apples who are truly outliers who perhaps played
24 the system. If we're going to be making policy based
25 on those people, we're going to be in a lot of

2 trouble. And lastly, in terms of property taxes, you
3 know, I do think that property taxes unfairly as it's
4 structured now, the algorithm unfairly taxes condo
5 and co-op-under-taxes condo and co-op owners and
6 over-taxes single-family homes. And, I would ask my
7 colleagues that when we're talking about property tax
8 reform, which the Mayor has promised to do, that they
9 are willing to have an open mind about possibly
10 increasing taxes on single-family homes because
11 inevitably that will be one of the outcomes of true
12 property tax reform. Although, I would argue that
13 with assessment values going up, which is what's
14 causing everyone's taxes to go up, not because the
15 city is increasing the percent on property taxes, but
16 simply because assessments are going up. We need to
17 recognize, though what the landlords are doing is
18 simply taking advantage of the markets, and on one
19 hand we have to appreciate that's what they're doing.
20 We live in a capitalist country. On the other hand
21 we are a social society that believes that everyone
22 needs to have a home, be able to go to public school,
23 have shelter, and rent regulation is the system that
24 we have. So, our only option is to undo Urstadt
25 [bell] bring all this back to the city where it

2 belongs, and allow New York City to make the choices
3 that it wants to do, which we know is to protect our
4 rent regulated tenants. So, I just want to thank you
5 for your testimony and for your fact-based testimony
6 because they incentive, the financial incentive on
7 behalf of the building owners that revenue rent
8 represents is strong, and you are right. They are
9 using their—their money for the—you know, to
10 influence the financial gains of who they represent,
11 and that's problematic if most of the people are not
12 being fairly represented. So, thank you very much.

13 MICHAEL MCKEE: I just want to respond to
14 one point you made, which is about one, two and
15 three-family homes being undertaxed. That's
16 generally true, but I think you have to recognize
17 there are low-income homeowners and you can always
18 incorporate something like a circuit breaker into the
19 system so that base on income people can get a break
20 because there are indeed many low-income homeowners
21 in the city. Not all homeowners are affluent
22 although most of them are.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well, I'm—I
24 guess I was thinking about my district, but you're
25 right--

2 MICHAEL MCKEE: [interposing] Yeah, yeah.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --citywide,
4 and I hope that when we do property tax reform we are
5 not--our hands are not tied by REBNY in order to
6 change the algorithm altogether.

7 MICHAEL MCKEE: I think you need to talk
8 to the other end of City Hall about that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Just for the
11 record, I represent one of the districts that the
12 homeowners there are actually house rich and cash
13 poor. So, with estimated values of \$2.5 million and
14 people living on fixed incomes that we are the
15 epitome of--of that. There's an old saying, You can't
16 beat equity. So, the appreciation of the value of a
17 house just doesn't do people any good if they don't
18 have an adequate income.

19 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: I think this is--oh,
20 I just want to acknowledge we've been joined by
21 Council Member Chin. Council Member, do you have a
22 question? Thank you so much for your testimony, and
23 what seemed like a grilling, but it wasn't, Mike.
24 I'll call the next panel. Ellen Davidson, Delsenia
25 Glover and Jenny Laurie. [background comments,

2 pause] Thank you. [pause] You can begin whenever
3 you're settled. [background comments, pause]

4 DELSENIA GLOVER: [off mic] Good morning.
5 I thank you, Mr. Chair for the opportunity to
6 testify.

7 MALE SPEAKER: Turn on the mic.

8 DELSENIA GLOVER: Oh. [on mic] Good
9 morning and thank you, Mr. Chairman for the
10 opportunity to testify here today. My name is
11 Delsenia Glover, and I am Director of Education and
12 Organizing at Tenants and Neighbors. In this
13 capacity I also serve as the Campaign Manager for the
14 Alliance for Tenant Power, a coalition of
15 organizations working to strengthen the Rent Laws for
16 rent regulated tenants.

17 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you.

18 DELSENIA GLOVER: I am here today to
19 testify in support of the list of bills being voted
20 on today, regarding preferential rents revealing
21 vacancy deregulation, rent control relief, vacancy
22 bonus and the number of bills to extend that
23 regulation to unregulated apartments and extend the
24 statute of limitations for rent overcharges. Just a
25 word about my organization. Tenants and Neighbors is

1 comprised of two or three organizations. The
2 information service and the coalition that share a
3 common mission to build a powerful and unified
4 statewide organization that empowers and educates
5 tenants, preserves affordable housing, livable
6 neighborhoods in diverse communities, and strengthens
7 tenant protections. The Information Service
8 organizes tenants in at-risk regulated and subsidized
9 buildings helping them to preserve their homes as
10 affordable housing. The coalition is a 501(c)(4)
11 membership organization that does legislative
12 organizing to address the underlying causes of loss
13 of affordability. Our membership organization has
14 over 3,000 dues paying members, thousands of tenants
15 who are and will continue to be affected by what
16 happens with the Rent Laws, this legislative session
17 and next year when the Rent Laws come up for renewal.
18 Rent regulation, as you know, is the largest system
19 of affordable housing in New York for low and
20 moderate income tenants, and is largely concentrated
21 in historic communities of color that are now rapidly
22 gentrifying. Tenants and Neighbors has been
23 organizing and working with tenants and tenant
24 associations in rent regulated buildings for many
25

2 years. We have seen the loss of tens of thousands of
3 rent regulated units due to these loopholes in the
4 law, and the devastating effects that that loss has
5 had on our communities. We have also seen tenants
6 living in rent regulated units who are increasingly
7 unable to afford to pay the rent, and many are paying
8 more than 50% of their income in rent including the
9 elderly. This highlighting of these pieces of
10 legislation by the Housing and Buildings Committee
11 and the City Council is particularly significant
12 right now as we approach one year out from the Rent
13 Law Renewal of 2019. We in the movement for housing
14 justice are very pleased to have the support of the
15 City Council and we'll look forward to your support
16 as we move into next year. Thank you again for the
17 opportunity to testify today.

18 JENNY LAURIE: Thank you. Hi. My name
19 is Jenny Laurie. I'm the Executive Director of
20 Housing Court Answers. Housing Court Answers staff
21 information tables in the New York City five county
22 Housing Courts, and we run a hotline for tenants
23 facing eviction because they owe back rent, and we do
24 trainings for advocates eviction prevention programs
25 and on a variety of housing topics. Every year about

2 200,000 tenants in New York City are sued for non-
3 payment of rent, and get hauled into Housing Courts,
4 and the one piece of legislation that I'd like to
5 focus on today is the, or the two pieces really is
6 real of vacancy decontrol and closing the
7 preferential rent loophole, and I very much want to
8 thank this committee, Council Member Cornegy, and
9 Speaker Corey Johnson for your great leadership no
10 making-strengthening the Rent Laws a real prominent
11 piece of your agenda for low-income tenants or for
12 tenants in the-in the coming years. I think it's
13 vitally important for preventing evictions, and
14 that's what my organization is all about. These days
15 is seems like half of the tenants who come to our
16 table in the Bronx have preferential rents. They
17 don't always know what it means, and they don't
18 always know whether it's legal or what it is, but
19 they understand that they have something that really
20 blocks them from asserting their rights, and blocks
21 them from housing-from feeling stable in their
22 housing. Yesterday, I was filling in on hotline
23 because we had a couple people out sick, and I-a
24 woman called and she needed money for back rent, and
25 I asker her, as we always do, are you rent

2 stabilized? And she said, no, I have a rent that is
3 pre-rental, and I said pre-rental, do you mean
4 preferential? And she said, yes, that's it, and I
5 said but you're—you don't think you're rent
6 stabilized? She said, no I'm not. I have a
7 preferential rent, and—and it's true, right? So,
8 she's not—she is rent stabilized. Technically, that
9 apartment is, but if the landlord decides, which the
10 landlord might very well since she's been behind on
11 the rent, not to renew the preferential rent, she's
12 facing a rent increase. What she thought she was
13 facing is a rent increase of \$300 a month. Who knows
14 whether that was legal or not. I couldn't tell over
15 the phone, but she's absolutely right. She's not
16 rent stabilized. She's the equivalent of a market
17 rate tenant. A recent Community Service Society
18 Report found that—reveled that in 2017, half of poor
19 renters reported being unable to afford a \$25 monthly
20 increase in rent and that near poor and moderate
21 income households were just as bad off. For near
22 poor it was 47% and for moderate income it was 40% of
23 people who said they couldn't afford a \$25 increase.
24 We know from the Housing and Vacant Survey that city
25 tenants, rent regulated tenants have very high rent

2 burdens with one-third of tenants paying over 50% of
3 their incomes in rent, and we know that about a third
4 of the city rent regulated apartments or we guess
5 that a third of the rent-city rent regulated
6 apartments have a preferential rent. So, those three
7 things combined are creating a really impending
8 disaster for tenants who really were facing a huge
9 eviction crisis as prices increase in neighborhoods
10 particularly low-income neighborhoods across the
11 city. So, I would urge the Council to support
12 closing the preferential rent loophole and, of
13 course, all the other resolutions that are before you
14 today. Thank you very much.

15 ELLEN DAVIDSON: Good morning. My name
16 is Ellen Davidson. I'm a Staff Attorney at the Legal
17 Aid Society, and I'm coming here in support of the
18 resolutions that are before this committee today. I
19 feel like I've been here for years testifying about
20 the housing crisis in New York City. I feel like the
21 first time—I think the first time I testified about
22 the housing crisis in New York City, Council Member
23 Perkins was Council Member Perkins. [laughter]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: [off mic] That
25 was a 100 years ago. [laughter]

2 ELLEN DAVIDSON: Welcome back and, you
3 know, back then I thought it was back, and it is
4 astounding to me that in all that time things have
5 only gotten worse. I mean I think I used apoplectic
6 terms back then, and—and I—and I—I'm using apoplectic
7 terms now. It's just hard to imagine how things
8 could get worse. A recent report from the Coalition
9 for the Homeless looked at apartments that were
10 affordable to people who were low-income, and looked
11 at the mismatch between how many people have in New
12 York City who are low-income and how many apartments
13 that are affordable to those people who are low-
14 income, and we found that in 1999 there were over a
15 million households in—that live in New York City who
16 needed apartments that rented for under \$800, and at
17 the time, there were 1.3 million apartments in New
18 York City that rented for under \$800. Today, as the
19 economy has changed, we now have about 867,000
20 households who need apartments that rent for under 3-
21 rent for under \$800 in order for those apartments to
22 be affordable, and according to the HVS, there are
23 now 349,862 apartments available for these low-income
24 New Yorkers. So, we lost a million apartments in New
25 York City that rented for under \$800 in a little less

2 than 20 years, and that's why we have a housing
3 crisis, and so, from our perspective at the Legal Aid
4 Society an immense amount of our clients live in rent
5 regulated houses—housing and the—and the loopholes in
6 the laws have made their lives miserable. Beyond the
7 harassment—extreme harassment they face where
8 landlords do such things as come into their apartment
9 building—apartments and use sledge hammer to get rid
10 of their kitchens and bathrooms in order to force
11 them out or get rid of staircases in order to force
12 them out, or the much more ordinary experience that
13 our clients have, which is they don't have heat and
14 hot water during the winter, and the landlords are
15 hoping that they will pick up and get tired and
16 leave. The other, which is, you know, a huge problem
17 and where do they go? They HVS found that the median
18 asks for rent is now \$1,875. The other problem that
19 we're seeing with preferential rent is we now go into
20 buildings with horrific conditions. Because as
21 lawyers one of the things we do is we work with
22 tenants to do group HPs so a group the tenants can go
23 and ask the court to order the judge to correct
24 Housing Code Violations, and we go into buildings and
25 huge majorities of the tenants in those buildings are

2 afraid to ask their landlords to follow the law. We-
3 clients—we cannot get clients to agree to participate
4 in a group HP because they have preferential rents,
5 and they know that if they assert their rights, their
6 right to a renewal lease is gone, and so their choice
7 is to have a home, you know, a roof over their heads,
8 that might be leaking, but a roof over their heads or
9 stand up in court and say tot the judge I just want
10 my landlord to follow the law. So, all of the
11 loopholes have been created in the Rent Laws have
12 made life miserable for New York City tenants, and I
13 want to thank the New York City Council, this
14 committee, Chair Cornegy for holding this hearing,
15 for passing these resolutions for fighting for New
16 York City tenants and I hope I'll see you all in
17 Albany over the next what? Thirteen months because
18 that's where I'll be. Anyway, thank you so much.

19 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Thank you all so
20 much for your testi—your testimonies and for the hard
21 work you do on behalf of people who so much need your
22 advocacy. Thank you. [background comments] So,
23 we're going to at this point ask Billy Martin to call
24 the roll. [background comments, pause]

2 CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk,
3 roll call vote Committee on Housing and Buildings.

4 All items are coupled. Chair Cornegy.

5 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: I vote aye.

6 CLERK: Cabrera. Chin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye on all,
8 and can you please add my name to the Resos as a co-
9 sponsor? Thank you.

10 CLERK: Rosenthal.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I vote aye on
12 all, and ask that you add my name to all of these
13 resolutions as co-sponsor. Than you.

14 CLERK: Torres.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all and
16 please do the same for me, add my name to the
17 resolutions.

18 CLERK: Grodenchik.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all
20 except 1932, 1935, and 1937.

21 CLERK: Perkins.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: I vote aye on
23 all Preconsidered Resolutions, and I would like my
24 name to be added as a supporter, as a sponsor, and
25 it's good to be back. [pause]

2 CLERK: Rivera.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye on
4 all. Please add my name to all resolutions as a co-
5 sponsor.

6 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: We're going to keep
7 the roll open for the next 15 minutes. [background
8 comments]

9 CLERK: All items on today's agenda have
10 been adopted by the committee by a vote of 7 in
11 affirmative, zero in the negative and no abstentions
12 with the exceptions of Preconsidered Land Use Items
13 T#s 1932. 35 and 37 are adopted by the Committee 6 in
14 the affirmative, 1 in the negative and no
15 abstentions. [pause]

16 Continuation roll call the Committee on
17 Housing and Buildings, Council Member Cabrera.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.
19 [pause]

20 CLERK: Continuation roll call the
21 Committee on Housing and Buildings. Council Member
22 Espinal.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: With many thanks
24 to the Chair, I vote aye. [laughter, background
25 comments, pause]

2 CLERK: Continuation-continuation roll
3 call, the Committee on Housing and Buildings, Council
4 Member Gjonaj.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: 1930 I'm up, 1931
6 I'm down, 1933 I'm up, 1934 I'm down, 1932 I'm down,
7 1935 I'm down, 1936, I'm up, and 1937 I'm down.
8 [background comments, pause]

9 CLERK: The final vote Committee on
10 Housing and Buildings were Preconsidered Resolutions
11 T# 1930 and 1936 are adopted by a vote of 11 in the
12 affirmative, zero in the negative and no abstentions,
13 also 1933.

14 Preconsidered Resolutions T# 1931 is
15 adopted by a vote of 10 in the affirmative and 1 in
16 the negative and no abstentions.

17 Preconsidered T# 1934 is adopted by a
18 vote of 10 in the affirmative, 1 negative and no
19 abstentions.

20 Preconsidered T# 1932, 1935 and 1937 are
21 adopted by a vote of 9 in the affirmative, 2 in the
22 negative and no abstentions. All items are adopted.

23 CHAIRPERSON CORNEGY: Housing and
24 Buildings is now adjourned. [gavel]

2 CLERK: Revised committee vote is as
3 follows:

4 Preconsidered Resolutions T# 1930, 1933
5 and 1936 are adopted 10 in the affirmative, zero in
6 the negative and no abstentions.

7 Preconsidered Resolutions T# 1931 and
8 1934 are adopted 9 in the affirmative, 1 in the
9 negative and no abstentions and

10 Preconsidered Resolutions T# 1932, 1935
11 and 1937 are adopted 8 in the affirmative, 2 in the
12 negative and no abstentions.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 30, 2018