

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTIONS

----- X

April 12, 2018
Start: 1:18 p.m.
Recess: 3:32 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm. 16th Fl.

B E F O R E: COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

RAFAEL L ESPINAL, JR.
STEPHEN T. LEVIN
CARLOS MENCHACA
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
ERIC A. ULRICH
KALMAN YEGER

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Dan Zarrilli
Mayor's Senior Director for Climate Policy and
Programs and the City's Chief Resiliency Officer

Mark Chambers
Director of the Mayor's Office of Sustainability

Jainey Bavishi
Mayor's Director of Recovery and Resiliency

Amy Peterson
Director of the Mayor's Office of Housing and
Recovery Operations which Manage the Build it
Back Program

Gabriella Velardi Ward
Resides Across the Street from Graniteville
Wetland Forest

Rachel Eve Stein
Deputy Director for Sustainability and Resiliency
At the Center for New York City Neighborhoods

Isabelle Silverman
Senior Fellow at Environmental Defense Unit

Catherine McVay Hughes
Co-Chair of New York Rising Community
Reconstruction Program for Southern Manhattan

Judith Weis
Professor of Merida at Rutgers University, Marine
Biologist

Buck Moorhead
Board Member with New York Passive Houses

Diana Switaj
Director of Planning and Land Use at Manhattan
Community Board One

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lisa DiCaprio
Professor of Social Sciences at New York
University

Patrick Houston
Climate and Inequality Campaigns Organizer at New
York Communities for Change

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Alright,

good afternoon, my apologies for being late but could not be helped due to our commute to say. I am Council Member Costa Constantinides, Chair of the Committee on Environmental Protection. I want to recognize I have two members of our committee here today, Council Member Rafael Espinal and Council Member Kalman Yeger both from Brooklyn, thank you both for being here.

Today the committee will hold oversight on the mission work and accomplishments of the Mayor's Office of Sustainability and the Office of Recovery and Resiliency. With the work of these two offices the Mayor has made it clear that ours is a city constantly working to stay ahead of the climate change curve and we do this by addressing growth and income inequality at the same time that we address sustainability. At today's hearing we'll hear from the administration about the progress made in advancing this work to date. The New York City Mayor's Office of Sustainability, MOS works to improve the quality of life for all New Yorkers and to protect the common environment by ensuring the city has clean air and surface waters, green streets

1
2 and is moving city residents towards zero carbon and
3 zero waste goals. MOS works to reduce NYC's impact on
4 climate change by implementing strategies to limit
5 green house emissions from the city's transportation,
6 energy, waste and building sectors. The Office of
7 ORR, Office of Recovery and Resiliency was
8 established in 2015 by our Mayor De Blasio to lead
9 this effort to build a stronger more resilient. New
10 York guided by scientific data and analysis of the
11 New York City panel on climate change, ORR works to
12 ensure that NYC's communities, economy and public
13 services can withstand and combat the impacts of 21st
14 century threats such as climate change. This work
15 spearheading our resiliency program with about a 20-
16 million-dollar budget. Together MOS and ORR play a
17 significant role in the city's effort to mitigate,
18 adapt and recover from climate change. The offices
19 are guided by and oversee several city initiatives
20 including the One NYC plan and its related greenhouse
21 gas reduction and climate resiliency goals along with
22 the efforts to recover and rebuild from super storm
23 Sandy. One NYC is Mayor De Blasio's update of the
24 previous administration's Plan NYC when NYC is
25 divided into four sections or visions each with a

1
2 theme of growth, equity, sustainability and
3 resiliency. Today's hearing will focus on the latter
4 two visions of sustainability and resiliency. New
5 York City is responsible for one percent of the green
6 gas emissions in the entire nation. We have taken a
7 number of aggressive steps to advance the goals
8 enumerated in One NYC, New York City passed my Local
9 Law 66 of 2015 which requires the city to reduce
10 citywide greenhouse gas emissions 80 percent by 2050.
11 While many steps have been taken to reduce green
12 house gases and improve sustainability we still have
13 a lot of work to do and on some things, we've
14 committed have not been yet completed. At a minimum
15 climate change education and community partnerships
16 need to be strengthened. When NYC puts forward
17 initiatives towards achieving 80 by... our 80 by 50
18 goal, one is to develop the near term local actions
19 and long term regional strategies to reduce green
20 house gas emissions in the power sector, the second
21 initiative is to develop a mode shift action plan to
22 reduce greenhouse gas emissions in the transportation
23 sector, the third initiative is to build up zero
24 waste to reduce green house gas emissions from the
25 solid waste sector and the fourth initiative is to

1
2 continue implementation of one city built to last to
3 reduce green house gas emissions from buildings, 30
4 percent by 2025 which is not far away as, as we feel,
5 right, about seven years away to try the long term
6 path from... away from fossil fuels. Buildings
7 including fuel heating oil, natural gas, electricity,
8 steam, biofuel are responsible for over 70 percent of
9 our citywide green house gas emissions. Given this
10 and the vast... and the vast majority of existing
11 buildings are expected to remain well beyond 2015,
12 the city's stock of 1,100,000 buildings represent the
13 greatest potential source of citywide green house gas
14 emissions is indisputably necessary for the city to
15 reduce emissions from the building sector. Six years
16 ago, the council enacted the greens buildings law
17 effecting over five... 50,000 square feet, now that
18 legislation needs to be strengthened to accelerate
19 retrofitting of large buildings which we are working
20 on. Those measures would undertake and will make the
21 city a national sustainability leader and keep the
22 city's promises to future generations to reduce green
23 house gas emissions and protect our earth, you know
24 this... I really look at this in, in two parts, right,
25 I think we've talked about this together, this is...

1
2 we're going to be looking at the promises we've made
3 to those who were affected by climate change and, and
4 hurricane Sandy, we're going to make sure today,
5 we're going to talk about those promises and how
6 we're keeping them and making sure that as we move
7 forward those promises are kept. And in looking to
8 future and saying what is our resiliency and
9 sustainability goals for the future, how do we make
10 sure as climate change affects us whether it's heat,
11 whether it's another catastrophic event, whether it's
12 just... you know every day is a little bit... every time
13 it rains there's just a little bit more flooding in
14 Southeast Queens, an extra inch, those inches add up
15 and how are we going to be pro-active as a city on
16 these particular issues together. So, I'm looking
17 forward to hearing that testimony today not only what
18 we've done but how we can think about our
19 sustainability plan and our resiliency plan for the
20 future as we know climate change is going to impact
21 the city in different ways and you've all... we've
22 talked about these issues together. So, I look
23 forward to having this back and forth conversation.
24 Alright, no one has come yet, so I will... I will at
25 this time... we're... let's hear from the administration.

1
2 So, we have... so we have Eric Ulrich also here from
3 Queens, Council Member Eric Ulrich. So, we have... I'm
4 just going to let you all introduce yourselves,
5 Samara's going to swear in the administration panel
6 and then we'll take your testimony, thank you.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Would you please raise
8 your right hands, do you swear or affirm to tell the
9 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
10 today?

11 DAN ZARRILLI: Yes.

12 MARK CHAMBERS: Yes.

13 DAN ZARRILLI: Over to us?

14 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Yes.

15 DAN ZARRILLI: Great. Good afternoon, my
16 name is Dan Zarilli, I'm the Mayor's Senior Director
17 for Climate Policy and Programs and the City's Chief
18 Resiliency Officer. I want to thank you Chairperson
19 Constantinides and members of the committee for this
20 opportunity to speak about the progress that the De
21 Blasio administration has made as a global leader in
22 the fight against climate change. Today I'm going to
23 briefly describe the city's actions to address
24 climate change, a description of the team that leads
25 the city's climate program and an overview of the

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 three main themes of our current work before turning
3 it over to my colleagues. First a bit of history, New
4 York City first formed an office of long term
5 planning and sustainability in 2006 to develop a
6 strategic plan that included climate action for the
7 first time, that plan known as Plan NYC was released
8 in 2007 and shaped the city's actions to address
9 future threats in a number of ways. In October 2012
10 the impacts of hurricane Sandy brought home the
11 reality that climate risks were much more immediate
12 than many had thought, and the risks were not limited
13 to hurricanes; rising seas, more heat, stronger
14 storms threaten us as well. In response in June 2013
15 the city released its first comprehensive climate
16 resiliency plan to supplement its climate actions and
17 set forth a detailed risk assessment and new
18 initiatives launching an over 20-billion-dollar
19 program to prepare New York City for a future with
20 climate change. When the De Blasio administration
21 came into office that legacy informed our work and we
22 knew that we had to expand on it as well. In April
23 2015 the administration released a groundbreaking One
24 New York, the plan for a strong and just city that we
25 call One NYC, a strategic plan for inclusive growth

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 and climate action. One NYC supported by our
3 partnership with 100 resilient cities addressed the
4 challenges that we face as a city with growing
5 population and inequality crisis, aging
6 infrastructure as well as the risks of climate
7 change. What was previously known as the Office of
8 Long Term Planning and Sustainability is now
9 operating as the climate policy and programs team
10 charged with delivering the sustainability and
11 resiliency portions of One NYC with a new focus on
12 equity. Today we're continuing to deliver on these
13 commitments from One NYC, the team with direct
14 reporting to the First Deputy Mayor is leading the
15 administration's efforts to deepen our climate work,
16 fill the void of leadership left by Washington D.C.
17 and deliver results for New Yorkers. Our team's
18 current climate actions can best be summed up in
19 three themes; sustainability, resiliency and
20 accountability. Our climate mitigation or
21 sustainability work is focused on reducing our own
22 contribution to climate change by cutting our
23 greenhouse gas emissions as quickly as possible, this
24 work is led Mark Chambers in the Mayor's Office of
25 Sustainability the mandate of which is to make New

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 York City the most sustainable big city in the world
3 and a global leader in the fight against climate
4 change. To accomplish this goal the MOS team is
5 working to keep the city on track to meet our goals
6 of reducing greenhouse gas emissions 80 percent by
7 2050 or what we call 80 by 50, an effort that we
8 recently accelerated to align with the Paris
9 agreements 1.5 Celsius stretch goal. We've already
10 achieved the 15 percent reduction getting to the 80
11 by 50 means making our buildings, the largest sources
12 of GHG's in the city much more energy efficient,
13 expanding renewable energy options, sending zero
14 waste to landfills by 2030 and improving our air
15 quality. Mark's going to speak a lot more about this
16 work. Our climate adaptation or resiliency work
17 focuses on adapting the city to the risk of climate
18 change such as rising seas, more frequent and intense
19 storms and extreme heat. This work is led by Jainey
20 Bavishi in the Mayor's Office of Recovery and
21 Resiliency. ORR specifics mandates to ensure that the
22 city's neighborhoods, economy and public services are
23 prepared to withstand and emerge stronger from the
24 impacts of climate change and other 21st century
25 threats. To accomplish this goal the ORR team is

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 working with many agencies to deliver on the city's
3 over 20-billion-dollar investment program in
4 institutionalizing resiliency into city operations
5 more broadly and Jaimey's going to get into this in
6 a... in a bit more detail. And finally, New York City
7 is bringing this fight straight to the fossil fuel
8 companies that cause this climate crisis in first
9 place. With their decades long campaign of deception
10 and denial about the risks caused by burning fossil
11 fuels and we're doing this is two ways, we're
12 divesting our pension funds of approximately five
13 billion dollars in fossil fuel reserve owners by 2022
14 and we filed suit against five investor owned fossil
15 fuel companies; Exxon Mobile, Chevron, Conoco
16 Phillips, BP and Shell. Most response... these are the
17 companies most responsible for climate change and,
18 and we're seeking damages to pay for preparing the
19 city for the impacts of climate change. All this work
20 not only benefits New Yorkers it also serves as a
21 model to other cities around the nation and around
22 the world. Through networks such as the C40 climate
23 leadership group, 100 resilient cities and others
24 were demonstrating the ways in which we can combat
25 climate change in working with other cities to scale

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 up effective solutions. As you'll continue to hear
3 today this team is making significant strides across
4 the entire administration and in partnership with the
5 city council and many stakeholders on the necessary
6 actions to prepare New York City for the future.

7 We've achieved much, we've been recognized with
8 significant awards and yet we have so much more to do
9 before we'll ever be satisfied. I'd like to thank the
10 council and the members of the Environmental
11 Protection Committee for your close partnership and
12 shared commitment to our goals, we look forward to
13 continuing our work with you as we build a more
14 sustainable and resilient New York City. I'll turn it
15 over to Mark Chambers.

16 MARK CHAMBERS: Thank you Dan. Good
17 afternoon, my name is Mark Chambers, I'm the Director
18 of the Mayor's Office of Sustainability. Similar to
19 my colleagues I want to thank Chair Member...
20 Chairperson Constantinides and the members of this
21 committee for the opportunity to discuss the work of
22 MOS. The council in this committee have been
23 invaluable partners over the years so again we thank
24 you very much. MOS's charge is to ensure New York
25 City is the most sustainable big city in the world,

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 our work at MOS is grounded in the belief that
3 environmental sustainability, environmental justice
4 and economic sustainability for our residents must
5 work hand in hand. We recognize that to become the
6 most sustainable big city in the world we have to be
7 conscientious about... [clears throat] excuse me... of
8 the resources we consume and the structures we build
9 and where we build them. We have to act with urgency
10 while innovating because of the unique conditions of
11 our density in our island home and most importantly
12 we recognize we have to do things on a bolder scale
13 than ever before because the challenges are greater
14 than ever before. As Dan mentioned we've known for
15 years that we have to address the existential crisis
16 of climate change. Across the globe greenhouse gas
17 emissions are growing at an unprecedented rate
18 causing a rise in the average global temperature and
19 changes to climate patterns. The hurricanes that
20 devastated the gulf and the Caribbean and the
21 wildfires in the American West have showed us the
22 terrible cost of our warming planet. We had hoped we
23 could depend on Washington for leadership but sadly
24 we cannot, President Trump's decision to pull the
25 United States out of the Paris climate agreement last

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 year simply put was a failure in moral leadership on
3 one of the most significant challenges facing
4 humanity. Even before the failure in Washington we
5 under... we understood the risks posed by climate
6 change and we were taking action to reduce our
7 emissions 80 percent by 2050 than in June of last
8 year Mayor De Blasio signed executive order 26
9 committing New York City to the principles of the
10 Paris agreement and it's stretch goal to limit global
11 temperature rise to 1.5 degrees Celsius. Hundreds of
12 other U.S. cities and institutions followed suit
13 sending a profound signal to the world that the
14 majority of Americans will not retreat from this
15 exponential fight. The success of Paris agreement
16 hinges now more than ever on the involvement of
17 cities like New York to put their resources, their
18 innovation and their leadership into play. Please
19 allow me to briefly outline some of the progress that
20 the De Blasio administration has made on the
21 sustainability front. I'm sure... as I'm sure Jaimey
22 will reiterate her remarks everything you'll hear
23 today about our accomplishments is the sum of efforts
24 by numerous city agencies, community organizations
25 and advocates as well as private and philanthropic

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 partners. So, onto our progress. Our greenhouse gas
3 emissions are down significantly, since 2005 GHGs
4 have decreased citywide by approximately 15 percent
5 despite significant growth of the city's population
6 and economy. Per capita GHG emissions in 2015 was an
7 average of 6.1 metric tons of carbon dioxide
8 equivalent per capita, significantly lower than
9 average American's 19 metric tons per capita. Part of
10 this could be attributed to the nearly 500 million
11 dollars the city is spending on energy efficiency in
12 private buildings. Our buildings are greener, the
13 energy used in the city's building stock is the
14 largest contributor to GHGs. The city is cutting
15 greenhouse gases in its own buildings by investing in
16 high value energy efficiency projects. These projects
17 are expected to yield more than 67 million dollars in
18 avoided annual energy costs and approximately 176,000
19 metric tons of avoided GHG emissions, the equivalent
20 of taking almost 38,000 cars off the road. The city
21 has also contributed roughly 16 million dollars for
22 energy efficiency projects in private buildings. This
23 year the New York City retrofit accelerator launched
24 a new high performance retrofit tract to assist
25 private buildings with retrofits over the next ten to

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 15 years which are expected to reduce GHGs 40 to 60
3 percent and NYC carbon challenge is working with more
4 than 100 companies and organizations to have
5 voluntarily committed to reducing their GHGs 30 to 50
6 percent. To date participants have cut emissions by
7 close to 600,000 metric tons of carbon dioxide and
8 are collectively saving nearly 190 million dollars in
9 annual... annually in, in lower energy costs. Solar
10 installations have increased... have increased six-fold
11 since Mayor De Blasio took office. Part of this
12 increase is a result of solarize NYC, our program to
13 expand access to clean, reliable and affordable solar
14 power for all New Yorkers by reducing market barriers
15 for solar and by attracting more solar energy
16 companies to the city. Solarize NYC has active
17 campaigns in Harlem and Brownsville with more
18 partnerships on, on the way. The first official
19 campaign was announced in 2017 and featured solar
20 campaign partnership with WE ACT for environmental
21 justice called solar uptown now which centered in...
22 which we centered in Harlem. More recently solarize
23 Nehemiah launched a group purchasing campaign for
24 rooftop solar for the Nehemiah homes in Brownsville,
25 Brooklyn. We're rapidly expanding access to electric

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 vehicles or EVs. In 2015 the city decided to lead by
3 example with the launch of the NYC Clean Fleet which
4 included the commitment to create the largest
5 municipal electric fleet in the United States with a
6 goal of cutting municipal vehicle emissions in half
7 by 2025 scaling up to an 80 percent reduction by
8 2035. By the end of 2017 the city had already
9 procured 1,030 out of 2,000 electric vehicle sedans
10 it committed to integrate into the fleet by 2025. In
11 2017 Mayor De Blasio announced the city's ambitious
12 goal of having electric vehicles comprise 20 percent
13 of new vehicle registrations by 2025. To support this
14 goal the city has invested in creating EV fast
15 charging hubs to be developed in collaboration with
16 Con Edison, these fast charging hubs will be scaled
17 up to a total of 50 locations citywide by 2020 and
18 accompanied by 100 curbside parking spots to provide
19 access to multi-hour charging. For sending less waste
20 to landfills than ever before, organic waste like
21 food scraps, soiled paper, and yard waste generate
22 methane gas, a harmful greenhouse gas and this waste
23 accounts for one third of everything New Yorkers
24 throw away. e-waste in our landfills leach heavy
25 metals and can compromise... can compromise our

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 ecosystem. To address this the city's organics
3 collection program is now the largest in the country
4 serving more than 3.3 million residents and our e-
5 waste program has recycled more than 15 million
6 pounds of electronic waste since 2015. New York
7 City's air is the cleanest in five decades, New York
8 City's air quality is the cleanest it has been in 50
9 years but we're still redoubling our efforts to
10 ensure our air gets only cleaner by helping buildings
11 choose cleaner energy sources through our green
12 buildings and solarize NYC programs. Over the course
13 of the year we will continue to act with urgency and
14 boldness in our effort to make New York City the most
15 sustainable big city in the world, but our success
16 depends in a large part on deepening our partnership
17 with the council and this committee. We are
18 interested in working with the council to pass energy
19 efficiency mandates as was discussed earlier for
20 large buildings and we're exploring ideas to further
21 expand access to solar and to electric vehicles as
22 well as reducing single use plastics. In conclusion I
23 would like to thank the committee for the opportunity
24 to discuss MOS's portfolio and the progress we've
25 made in ensuring that our air is cleaner, our energy

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 is greener and that we send less waste to landfills.
3 Fulfilling our climate agenda is no easy task and we
4 look forward to deepening our partnership with the
5 council in that effort. I will now turn the floor
6 over to Jainey Bavishi to update the committee on the
7 city's resiliency work. Thank you.

8 JAINEY BAVISHI: Thanks Mark. Good
9 afternoon. I am Jainey Bavishi the Mayor's Director
10 of Recovery and Resiliency. I want to thank
11 Chairperson Constantinides and the members of the
12 committee for this opportunity to speak about the
13 work and the accomplishments of the Mayor's Office of
14 Recovery and Resiliency and the complimentary role my
15 office plays to MOS's climate sustainability work.
16 Five years ago, hurricane Sandy devastated New York
17 City with unprecedented force, it was the worst
18 natural disaster we've ever faced made worse by
19 climate change. As we assessed the damage it was
20 clear that we could not just plan to simply recover
21 from the storm, instead we used that moment to not
22 only address the risk of another Sandy but to broaden
23 our approach to the chronic risks of climate change.
24 In May of 2014 Mayor Bill De Blasio established ORR
25 to lead the effort to build a stronger more resilient

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 New York. ORR spearheads an over 20 billion-dollar
3 One NYC resiliency program to ensure that the city's
4 neighborhoods, economy and public services will be
5 ready to withstand and emerge stronger from the
6 impacts of climate change. Since its creation ORR has
7 been at the forefront of the global resiliency
8 movement that is changing the way cities respond to
9 climate change. As Dan mentioned in April of 2015
10 Mayor De Blasio released One NYC, not only was the
11 document groundbreaking in it's focus on becoming the
12 fairest city in America it was also the first
13 resiliency plan of any city on the planet. Guiding
14 the city's resiliency agenda is the administration's
15 commitment to use the best available science to
16 inform policy. The New York City panel on climate
17 change, an independent body of leading climate
18 scientists advises the Mayor on the latest localized
19 climate change projections. Because of the increases
20 in global, global temperatures as a result of the
21 burning of fossil fuels and other greenhouse gases
22 the NPCOMMITTEE CLERK projects that by the 2050's
23 average New York City temperatures are projected to
24 increase by 4.1 to 5.7 degrees Fahrenheit. Annual
25 precipitation is projected to increase between four

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 and 11 percent and sea levels are projected to rise
3 between 11 and 21 inches and that is on top of a foot
4 of sea level rise that we have already witnessed
5 since 1900. What this means is that extreme events
6 like flooding and heat waves are becoming more
7 frequent and more intense and a similar Sandy like
8 event in 2050 could cause 90 billion dollars in
9 damage compared to Sandy's 19 billion. With these
10 climate facts in mind something that is short... in
11 short supply in Washington we're making bold and
12 innovative investments in preparedness and
13 resiliencies that make sense for today and tomorrow.
14 As additional changes in the climate began to
15 materialize and sea level rise accelerates different
16 options might become more practical or perhaps even
17 absolutely imperative. That's why we're investing in
18 such a way so as not to preclude future actions we
19 may need to take at climate... as climate risks evolve.
20 I'd like to briefly describe the city's progress with
21 our One NYC resiliency plan, comprised of a multi-
22 layered approach to neighborhoods, buildings,
23 infrastructure and coastal defense. Needless to say,
24 our resiliency work is the, the... our resiliency work
25 to date is the product of a massive team effort let

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 out of the Mayor's Office and implemented by nearly
3 every city agency and includes state and federal
4 agencies as well as myriad of community organizations
5 and private and philanthropic partners. Our city is
6 safer and more resilient than it was before hurricane
7 Sandy and much more is coming. Our neighborhoods are
8 more resilient, tens of thousands of households are
9 benefiting from investments in single family, multi-
10 family and public housing stock. Building and zoning
11 codes have been upgraded, every school damaged during
12 Sandy was up and running in record time and we
13 continue to make significant progress in making our
14 schools more resilient. We provided 54 million
15 dollars to hundreds of local small businesses to
16 assist in their recovery from Sandy and launched
17 business prep and Rise NY... NYC to support their long-
18 term resiliency. And last year we released Cool
19 Neighborhoods NYC, a comprehensive strategy to
20 mitigate the drivers of extreme heat and protect the
21 most vulnerable New Yorkers from the impacts of
22 extreme heat. Our buildings standards are smarter, we
23 upgraded the city's building codes including 16 new
24 local laws to account for vulnerabilities related to
25 extreme weather and climate change. Additionally,

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 FEMA in partnership with the city is drafting new
3 more precise flood insurance maps that will more
4 accurately communicate flood risks and keep premiums
5 affordable. The city is also working with FEMA to
6 create a second map product, product reflecting
7 future conditions that account for climate change,
8 this will assist us in making coastlines more
9 resilient and climate ready while keeping flood
10 insurance affordable for those who need it. Our
11 infrastructure is better protected, this includes
12 upgraded traffic infrastructure, hard in
13 telecommunication systems, new green infrastructure
14 and we continue to fortify our wastewater treatment
15 plants all of which ensure vital public services
16 continue during and after emergencies and DEP
17 investments ensure uninterrupted access to high
18 quality drinking water including a new backup water
19 syphon in Staten Island. We've also released
20 preliminary climate resiliency design guidelines
21 which provide direction to engineers and designers on
22 how to incorporate resiliency considerations into all
23 capital projects. Our coastal defenses are being
24 implemented and our storm water management efforts
25 and stronger, this includes a new Rockaway Boardwalk

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 with integrated coastal protections, completed T
3 groins and sea gate and nearly ten miles of new dunes
4 across the Rockaway Peninsula and in Staten Island.
5 Construction is underway on new sewer infrastructure
6 in Southeast Queens and expanded blue belts in Staten
7 Island to reduce the impacts of flooding and we're
8 looking forward to breaking ground on the 760-
9 million-dollar Eastside Coastal resiliency project
10 next spring. Over the course of 2018 the ORR team
11 will continue building New York City's resilience for
12 the impacts of climate change, this city has some of
13 the brightest and most dedicated people working
14 everyday on behalf of our residents, but we can't do
15 it alone, so much of what we do demands on the
16 experiences of communities, communities directly
17 affected by climate change as well as local and
18 global resilience experts. Our success also depends
19 on our partnership with the council and this
20 committee to help foster a culture of resilience in
21 New York City, one that is grounded in the lessons of
22 hurricane Sandy but is ultimately geared to
23 addressing the risks.. the broader risks of climate
24 change that we face. For example, how we manage storm
25 mater and how we use land will be critical to how we

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 weather future storms. I look forward to having these
3 conversations with the council. As I conclude my
4 testimony I want to thank this committee for this
5 opportunity, building urban resilience in the age of
6 climate change is a long-term process, we... we'll
7 always need to innovate and adapt to account for
8 changes in rising temperatures and seas. Success will
9 look different at different points in our future, but
10 it will always demand democratic partnership and
11 collaboration across actors at all levels of society.
12 We thank the committee for its dedication to this
13 issue and look forward to working with the council as
14 we continue to protect our city from the risks of
15 climate change. I will now turn the floor over to Amy
16 Peterson from the Housing Recovery Office to update
17 the committee on the progress of the build it back
18 program and the city's housing recovery efforts.

19 AMY PETERSON: Hi, thank you. Good
20 afternoon, noon Chairperson and members of the
21 Committee on Environmental Protection. I'm Amy
22 Peterson, I'm the Director of the Mayor's Office of
23 Housing and Recovery Operations which manages the
24 build it back program. Thanks for inviting me to
25 testify today. Through the city's hurricane Sandy

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 housing recovery program build it back the city has
3 prioritized helping homeowners remain in their
4 affordable long-standing waterfront communities,
5 ensuring these New Yorkers have the resources
6 necessary to recover and make their homes and
7 communities more resilient. Within the city's hardest
8 hit waterfront communities build it back is
9 rebuilding and elevating approximately 1,375 homes to
10 today's stringent regulations for flood compliance,
11 another 6,675 homeowners with moderate Sandy damage
12 have been assisted with repair and reimbursement
13 helping neighborhoods that were not in the flood
14 plane when Sandy hit and homeowners who did not have
15 flood insurance. Approximately 250 homes are being
16 acquired through a combination of buy out and
17 acquisition programs. Build it back provided multiple
18 ways for homeowners to repair and rebuild their homes
19 including the direct management of construction
20 projects by the city, city managed construction. Over
21 the last few years the city has brought on additional
22 resources to ensure that we can get this work done
23 from partnering with the building and construction
24 trades unions to expand construction capacity in 2015
25 to adding our new modular program in 2017. As a

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 result of this concerted effort the city has
3 completed 97 percent of the city managed construction
4 projects and 90 percent of all construction projects
5 including the homeowner managed construction. We are
6 working on the last elevations and rebuilds including
7 the new modular program, an innovative program
8 expending contractor capacity and speeding the
9 duration of construction for each home, community-
10 based projects including groups of attached homes in
11 Coney Island and new infrastructure in Sheepshead Bay
12 Courts and our most complex and challenging
13 elevations and rebuilds throughout Queens. Overall
14 build it back through it's single family programs
15 helping 8,300 homeowners and landlords of one to four
16 unit homes housing a total of 12,500 families, build
17 it back has served over 99 percent of these
18 homeowners by starting construction, reimbursement
19 for repairs or acquisition of their homes. For 93
20 percent of those homeowners we've completed
21 construction, reimbursement and acquisition. We've
22 distributed over 133 million dollars in checks to
23 over 600... 6,100 families. Through our construction
24 partner HPD we've accelerated relief to multifamily
25 households benefiting more than 19,600 households and

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 143 developments through repair resiliency and
3 reimbursement services. Funded by the US Department
4 of Housing and Urban Development the build it back
5 program, single family program is funded by a 2.2
6 billion dollar federal community development block
7 grant dollar and overseen by our office in
8 coordination with HPD and the Department of Design
9 and Construction. The CDBGDR disaster recovery funds
10 provide assistance to homeowners after all the other
11 forms of disaster assistance have been exhausted.
12 Hurricane Sandy impacted neighborhoods outside FEMA's
13 100-year flood plane and as a result built it back's
14 repair and reimbursement program provided much needed
15 support for homeowners who didn't have flood
16 insurance and many of whom were outside the flood
17 plane. About half of the housing flooded by Sandy was
18 outside of FEMA's 100-year flood plane and of those
19 in the flood plane less than 50 percent of those had
20 flood insurance. Two thirds of build it back
21 homeowners receiving the repair and reimbursement
22 lived outside of the flood plane and only one quarter
23 of those homeowners had received NFIP payments. For
24 this reason, we are encouraging residents to purchase
25 flood insurance. In 2014 the city dedicated funding

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 to provide rental assistance to homeowners displaced
3 by construction so they are not burdened with
4 existing mortgage payments and additional rental
5 payments while their homes are being elevated and
6 rebuilt. We expanded our services to include
7 comprehensive relocation assistance, assistance
8 partnering with the center for New York City
9 Neighborhoods and the New York Disaster Interface
10 Services. Services were designed to help address
11 barriers to securing temporary housing including
12 large multigenerational families specific... physical
13 or mobility needs and pet friendly units. Nearly
14 1,100 homeowners have received assistance with
15 temporary housing and relocation and 83 percent of
16 those homeowners were temporarily relocated within
17 their original community or their borough. Hurricane
18 Sandy was an unprecedented storm for New York City,
19 build it back... build it back began with key policy
20 decisions that drove subsequent successes and
21 challenges. The city prioritized keeping families in
22 their homes and neighborhoods and prioritized
23 homeowner choice in the process. The resulting
24 program design and implementation have been driven by
25 many factors including the unique nature of housing

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 and site conditions in New York City specifically in
3 the communities most impacted by hurricane Sandy in
4 Southern Brooklyn, in Southern Queens and the East
5 and South Shores of Staten Island. An ever-evolving
6 regulatory environment from 2013 today ranging from
7 post Sandy changes to building codes and flood map
8 requirements, the need to complete thousands of
9 single family home construction projects in the
10 busiest construction market in decades, and I
11 wouldn't say of the least, the most... the complexities
12 of providing relief within the federal disaster
13 funding framework. We have learned so much
14 collectively over the last five years about what it
15 takes to elevate and rebuild homes in these
16 communities, about the importance of clear
17 communication on how different federal programs from
18 flood insurance to SBA loans to HUD funded programs
19 can assist homeowners during the recovery and about
20 the impact of neighborhood resiliency planning. This
21 is why we believe the joint city council and Mayoral
22 Sandy recovery task force is such an important effort
23 for the city. With your partnership we will lay out
24 the principles and best practices for future recovery
25 efforts with a focus on preparedness, technical

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 assistance for building owners and community
3 engagement. The transformation in these neighborhoods
4 is remarkable and I would welcome the opportunity to
5 take the committee on a tour to see these homes.

6 Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I, think
8 based on the nodding from many of my colleagues here
9 I think we might take you up on that offer but I'm
10 going to ask a few questions then I'll turn it over
11 to my colleagues to ask questions, I don't want to
12 monopolize all the time. With that said let me ask a
13 little bit about, you know what is the level of
14 funding allocated for city agencies for renewable
15 energy projects?

16 MARK CHAMBERS: So, renewable energy
17 projects in particular relate to solar or...

18 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: In, in
19 general, right, I mean it doesn't... I'm going to try
20 to go through all... let's, let's go through all of it
21 then.

22 MARK CHAMBERS: Well, I mean I think the
23 best way to say it is that the city has allocated 1.2
24 billion dollars over ten years towards... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Right...

3 [cross-talk]

4 MARK CHAMBERS: ...projects that range in
5 all levels of energy efficiency including solar and
6 including preparing buildings to be able to, to
7 access more, more renewables and more distributing
8 generation.

9 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Alright, so
10 1.2 billion over ten years, how much of that have we
11 spent so far?

12 MARK CHAMBERS: So, we spent
13 approximately 500 million.

14 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: About 500
15 million and what is... what is that... what have we... walk
16 me... what did that... what did... what did we get for
17 that, how did... walk me through what we got as far as
18 solar projects, I think you put it... it's in your
19 testimony, right?

20 MARK CHAMBERS: Yeah, sorry... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Let's just
22 re, re... let's re-go through that.

23 MARK CHAMBERS: So, so far... so, the pre...
24 the predominant agency that distributes these funds
25 is DCAS, the Department of Citywide... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh...

3 [cross-talk]

4 MARK CHAMBERS: ...Administrative Services
5 they have installed about ten megawatts of solar
6 already, that's on 57 city buildings... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh...

8 [cross-talk]

9 MARK CHAMBERS: ...and additionally they're
10 going to install an additional 100 megawatts of solar
11 by 2025, the intent is to start construction on 100
12 projects this year which will ultimately add an
13 additional 18 megawatts to the city's solar capacity
14 totaling 29 megawatts over time.

15 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And how are
16 we working with the city agencies to implement... how,
17 how do we choose the buildings, how do we sort of
18 roll this out effectively and, and when we're
19 building a new building or we're, we're doing
20 construction on a city building how are we making
21 those choices, imbedding that into those agencies to
22 make sure that's a consideration for them?

23 MARK CHAMBERS: Absolutely, it is a... it's
24 an all hands-on deck effort... [cross-talk]

25

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Right...

3 [cross-talk]

4 MARK CHAMBERS: ...I would look at this
5 from the point of view of preparing city agencies to
6 be able to respond to co-changes that we've worked
7 with this committee and many others onto established
8 thresholds for new construction but as far as
9 actually deploying the, the dollars DCAS particular
10 has utilized several different mechanisms to bring
11 agencies together, there's the ACE program which
12 allows for city agencies to suggest energy efficient
13 projects to, to DCAS in which they will evaluate and
14 then they will grant money out of that 1.2 billion to
15 making sure that agencies are building new buildings
16 and retrofitting their buildings with those dollars
17 to get the maximum amount of efficiency out of those
18 projects. From the Mayor's Office of Sustainability,
19 we help with that coordination and for the.. office to
20 make sure that city agency from DCAS to SCA to
21 Department of Education, everyone that is building
22 buildings in the city is working together and that is
23 only become even more strengthened as we've pushed
24 forward on other sustainability plans, in particular

25

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 our 1.5-degree plan which better aligned city
3 agencies towards those goals.

4 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I, I mean
5 I'm looking at... you know they're building an
6 extension in the school in my district just for an
7 example, are we going to... how do we ensure that the
8 sustainability aspects and resiliency aspects get
9 baked into that cake before it's built, right, it's,
10 it's a lot easier to bake those things in at the
11 beginning then to go back and have to retrofit them
12 down the line and say oh we're now going to have to
13 change everything we've done so how do we ensure that
14 we're baking those into the cake at the... at the
15 frontend and rather than having to go back and
16 retrofit them later?

17 MARK CHAMBERS: Absolutely, the, the best
18 way to do that is by aggressively pushing on energy
19 codes and aggressively pushing on building standards
20 to make sure that everyone is operating from the same
21 rulebook and that those buildings are... as a base are
22 incorporating energy efficiency strategies into
23 their, their outcomes and into their construction
24 plans.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Alright, so
3 just looking at Local Law six of 2016 that required
4 the development of a geothermal screening tool...

5 MARK CHAMBERS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: ...as well as
7 a detailed analysis of geothermal technology
8 installation on city owned buildings... [cross-talk]

9 MARK CHAMBERS: Yes... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: ...how is this
11 screening tool coming, is it... is it publicly
12 available yet?

13 MARK CHAMBERS: The report is, isn't
14 public available, the screening tool will be online
15 this summer... [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Okay...
17 [cross-talk]

18 MARK CHAMBERS: ...and, and so we're very
19 excited about that to make sure that the screening
20 tool is a... it's a first screening to allow for any
21 user to be able to look at both the geological and
22 the hydrological benefits of, of different areas
23 across the city and, and be able to use that as a
24 tool to determine whether or not geothermal is
25 appropriate for that, it also analyzes different

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 types of geothermal technologies to see what might be
3 best in those locations.

4 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And as far
5 as city owned buildings that are doing major
6 construction projects have there been any yet and
7 with a cost benefit analysis found that geothermal
8 was the, the, the right way to go, looking at the
9 social cost of carbon as well?

10 MARK CHAMBERS: So, that I'd have to come
11 back to you on... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Okay..
13 [cross-talk]

14 MARK CHAMBERS: I'd have to check on, on
15 which, which projects have completed that analysis.

16 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And, and as
17 far as... we're looking at the, the NYCHA boilers and,
18 and the 200 million that we're spending on these new
19 boilers on, on fossil fuel boilers have we considered
20 doing renewable energy as either a supplement or a
21 substitute to these boilers and, and how... you know
22 how have those conversations gone?

23 DAN ZARRILLI: So, I think part of that
24 answer is, you know these boilers... definitely need
25

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 new boilers and so they're very much more energy
3 efficient boilers... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh...
5 [cross-talk]

6 DAN ZARRILLI: ...to provide heat and
7 there's a, a need to provide the heat as quickly as
8 possible... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Absolutely,
10 uh-huh... [cross-talk]

11 DAN ZARRILLI: ...to these into these
12 developments so I think our team can probably go back
13 and find out a little bit more detailed information
14 on the exact standards and how that's going to be
15 applied.

16 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Okay.
17 Alright and as far as... you know so we have... and I
18 knew it as, what was 478 our bill? So, I, I, knew it
19 as, as... you know the bill that we tapped for... and
20 I'll ask and then I'll, I'll... I have two more, I have
21 one and, and one other after this. Our solar ready on
22 city owned buildings bill, when something's deemed
23 not solar ready, what are the steps that we take to
24 make those be... you know we can't just say afterwards
25 well, you know not solar ready, you know too bad like

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 how do we then, you know work to make sure those
3 buildings become solar ready over a five-year period
4 or whatever it is?

5 MARK CHAMBERS: Absolutely, the... first
6 the determination of being solar ready has, has many
7 components; size of, of the building, structural
8 capacity of the building and.. [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh...
10 [cross-talk]

11 MARK CHAMBERS: ...so forth, if the... a
12 building is determined not to be solar ready then it
13 depends on what would it take to get there and that
14 then goes into the framework of how each, each of the
15 construction agencies are evaluating adding those
16 components to, to projects that are coming online for
17 those buildings. So, if a building is then slated for
18 let's say a façade, you know replacement or, or an
19 upgrade adding the components that would make the,
20 the building solar ready are then added to that
21 project, same thing goes for electrical robes and so
22 forth.

23 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: So, we're
24 doing construction, we're, we're taking that into
25 consideration as well, we're baking that into the

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 cake as well saying that, you know some things are
3 not going to be solar ready, if you're standing next
4 to a 12-story building and you're a five-story
5 building there's nothing we can do there... [cross-
6 talk]

7 MARK CHAMBERS: Right... [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: ...but when
9 we're doing construction on a school or a library is
10 there mayoral money coming in because I know that
11 very often council members and borough presidents put
12 the dollars in for school upgrades and, and library
13 upgrades in particular, how are we making sure that
14 DDC and, and there, they're... we're adding additional
15 Mayoral dollars for sustainability and resiliency to
16 make those roofs solar ready or to make the buildings
17 resilient?

18 MARK CHAMBERS: I mean I think to, to
19 kind of reiterate the, the answer to the original
20 question about the, the, the retrofit money that's
21 exactly what it's being used for is to be able to
22 where we can do energy efficiency projects that are
23 the, the first in line and the... and the low hanging
24 fruit absolutely and where there's a little bit more
25 work that needs to be done to allow the, the sites to

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 fully take advantage of whether it is solar or
3 whether it is cool roofs as well which has a
4 significant impact on the... on the buildings those are
5 then incorporated into those buildings in their
6 construction... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And I know...
8 and, and I got... I can only use my district and I know
9 my colleagues will use their districts as a form of
10 reference as I, I have a three-million-dollar project
11 coming in one of my libraries, it's going to close
12 this summer. I just want to make sure that as that's
13 happening that, that we're building in opportunities
14 for solar and for resiliency and it, it's... you know
15 that change the scope of the DDC project which then,
16 then puts the project off years away or is that
17 something that DDC's already taking into account, I
18 keep driving this point home but I want to make sure
19 that we're getting good answers here and, and that
20 we're, we're flagging this as all my colleagues I'm
21 sure will as well?

22 MARK CHAMBERS: We're happy to follow up
23 on that as well.

24 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Okay, great
25 and the last thing I have is on... well you know what

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 I'm, I'm going to pass this off, I'm going to let my
3 colleagues ask... [cross-talk]

4 JAINEY BAVISHI: I just wanted to add
5 from a resiliency perspective, I mentioned in my
6 testimony that we've released preliminary climate
7 resiliency design guidelines and it's for this exact
8 purpose so... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Right...
10 [cross-talk]

11 JAINEY BAVISHI: ...that when we are
12 spending money on city, city capital... when we're
13 spending city capital on capital projects that we are
14 accounting for resiliency considerations as we design
15 and build those projects and we're working very
16 closely with OMB on, on those guidelines.

17 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: So, when...
18 so, when they... so, I'm going to go... I'm going to take
19 that deep, deep... a little bit deeper then, so when
20 they put out a cost to a council member that says,
21 you know there... it's going to cost two million
22 dollars to renovate a library, the resiliency and
23 sustainability aspects are built into that cost?

24 JAINEY BAVISHI: I can't speak to how
25 DDC presents cost to a council member, the... I would...

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 so, I'll leave that one alone but, but I, I do think
3 that we're, we're... the, the kind of resiliency design
4 guidelines are just one instrument that are going to
5 help us build a culture of resilience and, and that's
6 ultimately what we need to do, we need to start
7 baking these costs in, we need to start accounting
8 for them because baking them in now will essentially
9 make our investments go further in the future...

10 [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And there's
12 all this... go ahead Mark.

13 MARK CHAMBERS: So, I'll just... one more
14 point to that is Local Law 31 also contributes to
15 this. I mentioned before about making sure that the
16 standards are in place so that everyone's working
17 from the same rulebook, Local Law 31 which goes into
18 effect this year does require city buildings to
19 achieve a very low energy standard so that also helps
20 in being able to make sure it's baked in from the
21 beginning.

22 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Okay, I'm,
23 I'm going to probably come back for a second round
24 because I have more but I don't want to monopolize
25 the microphone so who is... who is up first?

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards and Menchaca.

3 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Alright, so
4 first I'll, I'll pass it off to Council Member
5 Richards and then Council Member Menchaca.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you
7 Council Member Costa.

8 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Sure.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you, I
10 know my colleagues want me to stop asking so many
11 questions when I chair hearings too but, but such an
12 honor to be here. Mark... [cross-talk]

13 MARK CHAMBERS: Yes... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Welcome...

15 MARK CHAMBERS: Thank you, thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I think this is
17 your first budget hearing...

18 MARK CHAMBERS: It is my first hearing.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS:
20 Congratulations, you didn't do so bad your first...
21 [cross-talk]

22 MARK CHAMBERS: I appreciate that...

23 [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...round but I
25 didn't get through my questions yet so... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 MARK CHAMBERS: Let's begin.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Just a few
4 questions, so I wanted to go through what are the
5 strategies around air quality and what are you still
6 seeing as some of the largest contributors to... who
7 are some of the largest contributors to poor air
8 quality in the city and sort of what are some of the
9 strategies you're looking towards in your new
10 capacity?

11 MARK CHAMBERS: Sure, so... I mean I want...
12 I want to point out, I mentioned in my testimony that
13 New York City does have the, the best air quality
14 it's had in the last five decades, so progress is
15 being made but progress still needs to be made..
16 [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-
18 talk]

19 MARK CHAMBERS: ...being able to look at
20 the reductions from the air, low class air quality
21 again has a lot to do with how we are treating our
22 building sector and how we are focusing our attention
23 on being able to first with the support of this
24 committee transition out of dirtier fuels to cleaner
25 fuels which the city has been very active in... and

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 very successful in transitioning but we have more
3 work to do. Being able to look at our building sector
4 and being able to reduce the amount of fossil fuels
5 that are going into the heating and hot water of our
6 buildings is an essential part of addressing our
7 localized air quality. In addition to that we
8 consistently are working locally and region,
9 regionally through DOT to, to look at this transition
10 to electric vehicles will also.. which will also have
11 a significant impact on our localized air quality
12 from the transportation sector.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, you would
14 be open to a number four oil phase out?

15 MARK CHAMBERS: I think that.. getting..
16 moving away from, from fuel oil is.. as we've seen is
17 a very effective way to deal with air quality.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, so that's
19 something we certainly have some legislation on and
20 we look forward to working with you on. I wanted to
21 go through your electric.. your EVs, so I think we set
22 a goal of 2,000 EVs.. sedans being integrated into the
23 system we're now at 1,030 that have been converted,
24 how many do you anticipate this year will convert?

25

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 MARK CHAMBERS: I'd have to check on, on
3 an actual... the, the, the final number for this year,
4 I mean we've, we've significantly increased every
5 year and also, we're kind of driving sort of the
6 local market of getting to these vehicles that are
7 coming out online, so I can get back to you on
8 exactly what the number is for this year but... [cross-
9 talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yeah... [cross-
11 talk]

12 MARK CHAMBERS: ...we are... we are
13 aggressively moving to, to meet our target early.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Right and then
15 there's been some challenges in which we've heard
16 from companies like UPS and others who want to go
17 full EV and there's been a lot of challenges around
18 infrastructure, can you speak to... [cross-talk]

19 MARK CHAMBERS: Absolutely... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...what are the
21 thoughts, how are we going to expand opportunities?

22 MARK CHAMBERS: Sure, the, the real
23 challenge is around charging, you know being able to
24 have the sufficient infrastructure for charging is
25 essential for both last mile delivery as well as for

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 private vehicle ownership and fleet ownership
3 transitioning to electric vehicles. The Mayor has
4 committed ten million dollars at first the, the
5 additional money coming to establish fast charging
6 hubs throughout the city, the goal is to have about
7 50 fast charging hubs established in the next few
8 years which would... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: You said 50?

10 MARK CHAMBERS: 50... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...okay... [cross-
12 talk]

13 MARK CHAMBERS: ...all throughout... all
14 throughout the city, currently working on a, a
15 roadmap to look at the distribution of that and the
16 goal there is to not just move forward with, with
17 slower charging which we're doing as well, there'd be
18 a 100 of the... of the typical kind of level three
19 chargers but moving towards fast charging throughout
20 the city where these hubs would allow for, for both
21 businesses as well as private owners to be able to
22 charge more quickly and we're also trying to change
23 and normalize the behavior of moving over to electric
24 vehicles, it's essential for both our vehicle
25

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 emissions reductions as well as a, a transition to
3 more of a kind of shared mobility program.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And how do you...
5 how are you tying... so a lot of new development going
6 on around the city, how are you working with HPD and
7 others to sort of ensure that they're... and, and
8 obviously we've up, updated our building codes but
9 around things like EV... [cross-talk]

10 MARK CHAMBERS: Sure... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...charging
12 stations, solar, geothermal, is there a close
13 connection, are we really working together
14 strategically on ways to enhance more green...
15 renewable energy?

16 MARK CHAMBERS: Absolutely, I, I mean... I
17 think the best way to think about it is that these
18 are all an integrated system, is how do we move
19 electrons around more effectively and to do that we
20 have to attack it from several levels. Being able to
21 advocate and kind of put money behind additional
22 charging is important to be able to, you know kind of
23 change behavior, it's also important for work with
24 our kind of private sector partners to encourage them
25 to switch over to electric vehicles and it's also

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 looking at how that works with the building system, a
3 more efficient building usually has the ability to,
4 to look at how it better uses that electricity and
5 that might come from storage... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-huh... [cross-
7 talk]

8 MARK CHAMBERS: ...vehicle... electricity
9 storage but it also comes from having more charging
10 options when, when a vehicle... when a, a building is
11 either built or being retrofitted. We have currently
12 on, on the books a, a bill that allows for additional
13 charging conduit that is installed once a new parking
14 goes into place... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
16 talk]

17 MARK CHAMBERS: ...and we are actually
18 working now on a... on a bill that would increase that
19 significantly by requiring electric vehicle
20 infrastructure to be installed in buildings when new
21 spaces are added and that, that's part of attacking
22 this from all different sides and letting a building
23 better utilize and more flexibly utilize its energy
24 for the benefit of all.

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Two more
3 questions, so obviously environmental justice is
4 important to this committee and the chairman has
5 certainly taken this by the helm as well, I know
6 Council Member Inez Barron had also sponsored some
7 legislation around this, what are some your
8 strategies around addressing, you know some of the
9 more vulnerable communities such as Rockaway, Sunset
10 Park where, you know low income residents exist, what
11 is the strategy around ensuring that we can address
12 climate change through an EJ lens?

13 MARK CHAMBERS: Absolutely, I mean... I
14 think one of the, the major tenants is that when it
15 comes to the, the impacts of climate change they... you
16 know we need... we share in the burden, we also need to
17 share in the benefits so the ability to make sure
18 that we are establishing not just the framework that
19 is applicable to all but also to make sure that
20 everyone will benefit from a lot of the work that
21 we're being... we're doing. The, the building's mandate
22 that Chairperson Constantinides mentioned earlier is
23 it, it does begin to address that work by making sure
24 that we are kind of prioritizing a lot of our older
25 buildings and, and larger buildings, making sure that

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 those buildings are operating more efficiently and
3 also by spurring on a significant amount of job
4 growth in, in terms of the actual work that's going
5 to be needed to be able to, to retrofit those
6 buildings, I mean we, we're looking at upwards of
7 17,000 jobs that could be created as a result of
8 moving forward on, on this and we believe that that
9 as well as additional efforts to kind of target areas
10 around the city that may have been historically
11 underinvested in allow for us to really be thoughtful
12 and... as well as effectively tying together the, the
13 work that we're doing around environmental social
14 justice as well as economic and environmental
15 attributes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright, last
17 question, Dan Zarrilli, 145 million dollars for the
18 Rockaways, where are we with our little project,
19 you're going to... okay, sorry, that's right, sorry.
20 He, he lived in the Rockaways then I think...

21 JAINEY BAVISHI: The projects have
22 various schedules but they're all expected to be
23 completed around 2021.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: 2021... [cross-
25 talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 JAINEY BAVISHI: That's right... [cross-
3 talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay. And we're
5 going to hear a little bit more as we... [cross-talk]

6 JAINEY BAVISHI: Sure, we can keep...
7 [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...communicate...
9 [cross-talk]

10 JAINEY BAVISHI: ...you updated as... [cross-
11 talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
13 talk]

14 JAINEY BAVISHI: ...the... as, as progress...
15 [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay... [cross-
17 talk]

18 JAINEY BAVISHI: ...as we make progress on
19 those projects.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright, good
21 thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Alright,
23 thank you Council Member Richards, just very quickly
24 before Council... I hand it over to Council Member
25 Menchaca, what would you think about take...

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 transitioning your offices to an actual department...

3 you know department or agency and, and sort of...

4 [cross-talk]

5 DAN ZARRILLI: I think we'll, we'll get
6 back to you on that.

7 [off-mic dialogue]

8 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And I, I
9 think... just figured I'd, I'd ask I, I, I think I knew
10 the answer, but I figured I'd ask that question as
11 well and at this point I'll turn it over to Council
12 Member Carlos Menchaca.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chair
14 and thank you to the members of the committee and I
15 also want to welcome you Mr. Chambers to this
16 incredible work that we're doing, welcome.

17 MARK CHAMBERS: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So, the... I, I
19 think I want to start with Amy... with Amy first, a lot
20 of the work that, that you testified today really
21 kind of shows a, a big... unless... is that on too?
22 That's off too, okay. Let's try again. I don't know
23 if this is what's causing it, okay. Are, are these
24 solar powered or, or... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Share,
3 share, sharing is caring.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, share,
5 share... okay, let's try... let's try this, okay. Great
6 news, we're in the 90's in the percentage of work and
7 I, I just hope you, you feel proud, I know we, we do
8 too, there's a lot of work that went into this..

9 [applause]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah, hell
11 yeah, you deserve that work, you've been at the helm
12 of this turning the ship around in a lot of ways,
13 have not been easy, you got a lot of heat from
14 everyone about this and you and your team have really
15 kind of dedicated the right resources and so I think
16 the, the questions that I have beyond us going and,
17 and touring because I think that's going to be an
18 important part, we got to... we got to go see this
19 work, are there one or two places that would be
20 important for us to kind of look at first that you
21 want to talk about, I want to give you the
22 opportunity to do that and then secondly in
23 anticipation, I think it was... I don't know who
24 testified to this but the, the cost of, of response
25 tomorrow will be astronomically more than in 2012 so

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 I, I kind of want to get a sense from you about how
3 we're... how we're thinking about that, build it back
4 is very specific in its... in its program to literally
5 build it back but how, how are we thinking in... and
6 in... and in preparation... and in preparation?

7 AMY PETERSON: Yes, so thank you. I think
8 that one, the, the idea of the task force that we're
9 jointly going to engage on is really important and
10 Jainey and I who are both on that task force have had
11 a lot of discussions about what we need to focus on
12 in thinking and we'd like it to be something that,
13 you know we could engage on and, and have, you know
14 kind of completed by the next anniversary which is in
15 October, we're about to approach another hurricane
16 season. In terms of neighborhoods there's so much
17 unique about New York City and so much unique about
18 what we've done both in Coney Island where we had
19 huge challenges with attached homes and being able to
20 get multiple homeowners to engage, we have some
21 success stories where we actually have elevated homes
22 and been able to do alternative mitigation for
23 homeowners. Sheepshead Bay Courts is where a group of
24 homeowners came together and formed a homeowner's
25 association to be able to make some improvements to

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 an entire block but really if you go to Edgemere and
3 Arverne and the Rockaways and Staten Island you can
4 see blocks and blocks of homes where multiple homes
5 have been elevated. I think in looking forward the
6 things that we think about and the rest of the
7 country are thinking about, I mean one of the
8 horrible things that happened over the last couple of
9 years is the additional hurricanes in other states
10 across the country and in Puerto Rico and so some of
11 the things that we did after Sandy like rapid repairs
12 which was a unique new program that had never been
13 done anywhere else has kind of been taken and, and
14 redone in different communities so I think we have an
15 opportunity now both to think about build it back but
16 really to think about how all of the things both from
17 a preparedness before the storm but then all of the
18 benefits that come to homeowners that currently
19 aren't in any way related, right, FEMA individual
20 assistance, flood insurance, SBA loans, HUD, they're
21 not inter... related at all, how we can make sure that
22 they're related and it's very clear what... how people
23 can prepare themselves for a future storm and how we
24 as a city can deliver the, the response that we need
25 to respond.

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Got it and, and
3 I think the task force is the place where a lot of
4 this is going to happen and I'm really happy to know
5 that, that there's... and in your testimony and now in
6 your question and answer you really focused on all
7 the other programs that are not... and not immediate to
8 the response but part of the larger conversation
9 around flood insurance, I know there's a lot of
10 advocacy happening, I'm not going to concentrate on
11 that but I know that that, that's happening. Great,
12 so I'm looking forward to the tour and, and kind of
13 seeing some of this work and talking about it, I
14 think we just need to talk about it because I, I
15 think so much of what we saw in response and the lag
16 time is still in the air and we got to just flush it
17 out with real information and so I'm going to work
18 with... I want to work with you and the committee to
19 make that... make that happen. And then I think... well
20 here's the other piece about, about kind of build it
21 back concept, it's still... it's still kind of designed
22 around floods and rightly so I think but that's not
23 all that could come in terms of climate change crisis
24 moments, we're talking about fires, we're talking
25 about... there's a lot of other things, tell us a

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 little bit about how you're thinking about it as
3 you're... as you're kind of transitioning through and
4 what to expect, how, how, how... be specific?

5 AMY PETERSON: Yes, so certainly on
6 emergency preparedness and, and disasters generally
7 that's something that New York City emergency
8 management's focused on but yeah, and our office is
9 the housing recovery office and so we're really
10 looking at an overarching housing recovery plan for
11 moving forward and it can be a climate related
12 disaster but it could be another disaster and you
13 know while the city has faced disasters before and
14 developed programs after them and certainly deals
15 with small housing emergencies very effectively
16 figuring out the ways to help homeowners, homeowners
17 prepare so that everyone knows what they need to have
18 access to in case there is a disaster for their own
19 particular home preparedness and then how we would
20 provide shelter in the immediate aftermath and how we
21 could help people... how we could help restore housing
22 depending on what the disaster is something we're,
23 we're all talking about.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Great, looking
25 forward to, to hearing more about that. Some general

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 questions, this.. these questions are coming from Red
3 Hook, some of our Red Hook folks watching from home.
4 So, NYCHA had a voluntary emergency response.. NYCHA
5 had a voluntary emergency response form which with
6 special needs and it went from paper to online and
7 has that model been rolled out, is there any, any
8 update on, on how that's going, how that's getting
9 rolled out, what the impact has been and where has it
10 been, is it citywide, is it certain boroughs, anybody
11 have an update on that?

12 JAINEY BAVISHI: I don't, we would have
13 to.. [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Are you aware
15 of it though?

16 JAINEY BAVISHI: I'm not aware of it.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, it'd be
18 good for us to get an answer on that.. [cross-talk]

19 JAINEY BAVISHI: Sure.. [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Also the
21 emergency preparedness for Red Hook and Gowanus and
22 really all kind of public housing we, we're noting
23 that there are short.. a shortage of IV bags in the
24 mainland of America because of what's been happening
25 in Puerto Rico so there's, there's a lot of resources

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 that were sent over and kind of depleting or just
3 using, I don't know if that's on your radar at all,
4 I'm seeing some nods over here on your team, can you
5 give a sense about what, what that looks like, I've
6 worked on... I've worked on a lot of legislation with
7 office of emergency, OEM management and there's a lot
8 of push back for this, they're like we got it, we
9 know how to do it, don't tell us how to do it but I'm
10 unclear about whether or not OEM is ready and
11 prepared in, in, in moments where we have been...
12 having to respond nationally in Puerto Rico, Houston
13 and whether or not we're ready here and have
14 replenished our, our, our kind of emergency and
15 resiliency items, anybody? I know OEM isn't here but...
16 [cross-talk]

17 JAINEY BAVISHI: Right, this, this would
18 be a question for, for... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay... [cross-
20 talk]

21 JAINEY BAVISHI: ...emergency management.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Let's see, what
23 else. Okay, so last question on solar stuff, so I'm
24 really happy that the Chair really drilled down on
25 the larger concepts around solar and embedding it

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 into all the work we're doing, hundreds of millions
3 of dollars are coming to Sunset Park under a really
4 great opportunity that the community has been bold
5 about in demanding for resources; Brooklyn Army
6 Terminal just released a... an RFP so it sounds like
7 its on your radar to bring possible solar farm to the
8 rooftops of, of the Brooklyn Army Terminal, I'm
9 thinking about NYCHA and the half a billion dollars
10 that's coming to Red Hook and we went with another
11 kind of power plant concept, some folks said we
12 should have gone solar instead of... so, how, how can
13 we... how can we bring information to communities so
14 they can really push for this because they're,
15 they're pushing on the ground but we're, we're saying
16 no and I kind of want to get a sense about what's
17 causing the no and, and where we can move that to a
18 yes especially with, with bigger... with big
19 multimillion dollar projects and then I'm going to
20 add another piece to that which is ULURPs so a lot of
21 ULURPs that are, are potentially on their way. In
22 Sunset Park there's something called Industry City, I
23 don't know if you've ever been there but it's pretty
24 massive, it's six million square feet of property and
25 they're considering proposing an opportunity to

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 change the zoning, would you join us in that
3 conversation to figure out how we can create
4 community capacity to think about this when we have
5 that conversation?

6 MARK CHAMBERS: The short answer is yes,
7 I, I, I think we're, we are committed to everything
8 you said around being able to not just increase
9 access but also increase awareness, I think... I
10 mentioned Solarize NYC which was... is something that
11 I'd love to come talk to you a little bit more about
12 is a great opportunity for communities to do just
13 what, what you're suggesting. Additionally, I think
14 it's important though that we also mention that solar
15 is extremely important, it's one tool in the tool
16 kit, you... we, we actually need everything on deck,
17 you know it's solar as well as significant demand
18 reduction so being able to, to work to get more
19 distributive generation but also working to make sure
20 that buildings are operating more efficiently are all
21 important pieces and, and critical to doing that.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: One final note,
23 schools, there are six schools coming to district 38,
24 more schools are get... more seats are getting built in
25 my district than anywhere in the city that's due to

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 the organizing that's happening on the ground and
3 parents and kids and everyone's asking for on
4 addressing the overcrowded school issue and I just
5 haven't heard anything about solar for any of these
6 new schools that are coming and, and so that, that
7 just worries me that there's no synergy that's real
8 and at the front of a lot of this work so I'm hoping
9 to work with you on making sure that every investment
10 has every kind of community investment... oh
11 participatory budgeting, by the way PBNYC dot org or
12 you can go vote, it's vote week until Sunday, oh
13 there's a lot of love for it here including you all...
14 you all if you live... have you voted, any of you voted
15 yet, do you know, okay, part... participatory
16 budgeting... okay, if you don't have a council member
17 that is participating in part... in PB write them a
18 letter and advocate but PB projects is another place
19 where we can bring solar stuff and it'd be great to
20 work with you to figure out PB sized projects, we're
21 pushing the Mayor to do matching with PB so that if
22 we put a million the Mayor should put in five, that's
23 the matching that we're talking about for capital
24 that we can actually start thinking about some of
25 these bigger projects that are community based and,

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 and get, get that imagination and these... and these
3 spaces where kids are designing the future and they
4 go to... they go to solar but then we, we come with a
5 price tag of a million and two million dollars for a
6 project and it's not possible so I look to work with
7 you and, and bring you on board to our advocacy
8 campaign.

9 MARK CHAMBERS: Looking forward to it.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Awesome, thank
11 you.

12 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Carlos
13 that's an awesome idea. We're going to work on this
14 together, I'm, I'm excited about that. Alright, I
15 have a few more questions to ask, so when it comes to
16 resiliency I know that FEMA has put in millions of
17 dollars to build... you know to... sort of reinforce
18 those buildings that were affected by, by hurricane
19 Sandy, I know in my particular neighborhood I think
20 we've spoken about this in private but like Halletts
21 Cove Peninsula, you know Astoria Houses, eight of
22 the... eight buildings there were affected by Sandy
23 they're getting resiliency treatments, the other
24 eight buildings, the other buildings there on the
25 campus because they did not have flooding are not

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 getting those same treatments so if, if there were to
3 be a future storm those buildings would be in, in a
4 very bad way where the other buildings we've just
5 made them resilient, how do we... how do we find the
6 monies because I know it is... the... that's the real
7 challenge, right, is, is, is finding these real
8 dollars to do these, how do we... what's our plan to
9 find those monies to make sure that we're, we're,
10 we're making all of our, our, our public housing and,
11 and neighborhoods resilient and not just those that
12 we're getting those FEMA dollars for that were
13 already affected? I'm not leaving... give... I'm not
14 giving you the one...

15 JAINEY BAVISHI: I don't have the answer,
16 I mean this, this is... it's, it's an incredibly
17 important question and part of the answer is that the
18 way federal funds flow for resilience projects is
19 broken... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Absolutely...
21 [cross-talk]

22 JAINEY BAVISHI: ...they, they... the way...
23 we, we get federal money in a very reactive way but
24 we need to be doing proactive work, in the meantime
25 as I mentioned before we're, we're trying to make

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 sure that we're not just thinking about resilience
3 projects in a silo that every time we do substantial
4 rehab or new construction that money is going towards
5 building a more resilient city and you know we'll
6 have to think creatively about alternative financing
7 schemes and, and you know we, we've started some
8 conversations with private sector partners around
9 that, there is no silver bullet but we're completely
10 committed to continuing to explore creative
11 solutions.

12 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Because I
13 mean... I know in, in, in Western Queens you have the
14 Astoria Houses, the Ravenswood Houses, the
15 Queensbridge Houses all along the waterfront there
16 and, you know some were, you know affected by Sandy
17 in a very real way, some were, were affected but not...
18 you know did not lose power but their buildings
19 weren't flooded but still affected by Sandy and how
20 do... just to answer the real question is how do we
21 ensure that our, our public housing residents, our
22 communities, low income communities, communities of
23 color are protected those are our most vulnerable,
24 right, that, that's what... at the forefront of what
25 we're trying to do.

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 JAINEY BAVISHI: That's right and we
3 share those goals.

4 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And so,
5 looking at... going back to schools for a second, what
6 is the average cost of a renewable energy project in
7 a school or, or, or a city owned building?

8 MARK CHAMBERS: We'd have to come back to
9 you on, on doing an actual average, I mean I think
10 it's important to understand that there are different
11 ways to finance... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh...
13 [cross-talk]

14 MARK CHAMBERS: ...solar on a particularly
15 renewable energy project on, on a... on a project... on a
16 building particularly a school so we... I'm happy to
17 come back to you and talk to you about whether or not
18 it's your capitalizing the cost or whether or not you
19 are using some other kind of power purchase agreement
20 and so forth.

21 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And how do
22 we work... how do we... how can we better work together
23 with agencies like school construction authority to
24 make it achievable, I mean any... Council, Council
25 Member Menchaca talked about that and you know I

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 definitely want to do more solar in my schools this
3 year, I'm... I mean I've, I've... I have my own capital
4 budget but when I look at the price tag to do that
5 it's, it's out of the range of, you know doing one
6 school, you have 17 schools in your district it
7 would... it would take me longer than I have in office
8 to get that done so how do we... how do we work with
9 the agencies to make those affordable up front so we
10 can make these investments in partnership between the
11 council members, the borough presidents and, and
12 then... and your offices as well?

13 MARK CHAMBERS: Yeah, I mean I think...
14 it's a conversation we'd love to have, it... again it's
15 important to make sure that looking at different
16 financial models is going to be the way to make that
17 money stretch further... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh...
19 [cross-talk]

20 MARK CHAMBERS: ...because you're not just
21 investing in the actual panels themselves but you're
22 also... there are the, the energy that they're
23 producing and being able to utilize that energy for
24 the building itself or for sharing it is part of how
25

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 you're able to distribute those costs so I'm happy to
3 have that conversation... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I'd love to
5 have that conversation with you because I mean as
6 our, our... we're sitting there going through the city
7 budget I think it's important for us to see how we
8 can best do this work together because we have whole
9 bunch of schools and, and city owned buildings that
10 are on our list for solar readiness, I was like how
11 do we take that from where they are that they are
12 solar ready to actually implementing solar in, in a
13 more quick basis in all partnerships.

14 MARK CHAMBERS: Yeah and I think... I think
15 power purchase agreements are one of the, the key
16 ways in order to be able to do that quickly and so we
17 can have that conversation.

18 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: And, and I
19 know this is not an Education Committee hearing but
20 I'll ask the question anyway but... as we implement
21 these renewable energy projects whether it's
22 geothermal, whether it's solar, whether it's other
23 wind, you know if it's at a school or a library or a
24 place where people gather how do we... is, is there a
25 curriculum, are we creating opportunities working

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 with the Department of Education to educate our
3 children about, you know what solar is and, and why
4 it's important it's on our buildings because they're
5 going to be the ones who are going to lead this city
6 in the future so I... are we making those partnerships
7 in the DOE to make that part of the, the science
8 curriculums?

9 MARK CHAMBERS: Absolutely, D, DOE has a
10 kind of a very active sustainability program in which
11 they are looking to make a lot of those synergies
12 happen within their offices and additionally we work
13 with them to be able to use the, the, the mantle of
14 the Mayor's Office of Sustainability to be able to
15 promote a lot of the same visions, the same education
16 throughout. We have a program called green NYC which
17 is really a public education and outreach arm of the
18 Mayor's Office of Sustainability and working with
19 Department of Education is exactly the, the type of
20 synergy that we look forward to and, and be able to,
21 to be able to make sure we're pushing messages out to
22 the public that are consistent so you're seeing it at
23 school but you're also seeing it online and you're
24 seeing it in other places.

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Are, are
3 there... is, is, is... are they going to PTAs, are they
4 going to community boards, how do... how can we better
5 connect, you know with families and, and so they're
6 understanding what's going on in their... in there,
7 their children's schools and can get better educated
8 themselves?

9 MARK CHAMBERS: So, happy to have that
10 conversation, there's a lot of different ways and
11 outreach that we're doing but also outreach that is...
12 more outreach that's possible, the more people that
13 are asking questions and the more places in which we
14 can be again both physically and virtually allow for...
15 [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh...
17 [cross-talk]

18 MARK CHAMBERS: ...both kind of parents as
19 well as students as well as neighbors to be able to
20 look to how they can better utilize their particular
21 environment towards their benefit so we're happy to
22 have that conversation and happy to work with you on
23 that.

24 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I'm not... I'm
25 not sure if my colleagues have asked this question

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 yet but we know... you know the, the Governor's talked
3 about Indian Point going offline in the near future,
4 how do we ensure that we're ready for that and not
5 just putting more stock in sort of unclean grid,
6 right, you know we don't... we don't want to have the
7 Peaker Plants throughout our city just to be turned
8 on more often, how are we working to ensure that
9 we're going to have a cleaner source of energy as
10 Indian Point goes offline?

11 MARK CHAMBERS: Well it's a great
12 question, I think... I think when... in... last year in
13 January when the Governor announced that Indian Point
14 would be... plans, plans to retire as early as 2021 it
15 definitely raised some concerns and I think the Mayor
16 was consistent and it has continued to be consistent
17 that any closure plan for Indian Point really should
18 address New York City's, you know reliability of
19 energy, the costs, you know local emissions as well
20 as greenhouse gas emissions so we are... we are
21 concerned with what, what does come to replace Indian
22 Point and we are using the opportunity to advocate
23 primarily for transmission into the city making sure
24 that any renewables that we're also advocating for
25 can actually get to, to the city... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh...

3 [cross-talk]

4 MARK CHAMBERS: ...and that we're able to
5 have reliable energy throughout that time period as
6 we transition from our current energy sources to
7 renewables and particularly offshore wind as well as
8 upstate solar, upstate hydro things along those
9 lines.

10 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Are there
11 things that we can do as a city that maybe aren't
12 reliant on the state to get those things done or, or
13 we're kind of at the mercy of, of this partnership
14 with them?

15 MARK CHAMBERS: No, I mean I think that
16 as with our... as we talked before about kind of
17 working on the... on the, the federal government, I
18 mean more cooperation is better... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Right...

20 [cross-talk]

21 MARK CHAMBERS: I think... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I, I
23 wholeheartedly agree... [cross-talk]

24 MARK CHAMBERS: ...but we are actively
25 trying to use our purchase power... purchasing power to

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 be able to guide the market and also working with
3 the... with NYSERDA and state as well as the New York
4 Independent State Operator to make sure that we're
5 prioritizing the actual components that will let us
6 get access to that power and actually be able to use
7 it in the city simultaneously. Again, the demand
8 reduction in the city is going to be critical to us
9 being able to manage changes that are outside of our
10 control with changes that are within our control so
11 reducing the demand that the building sector is, is
12 demanding out of... out of the energy sources is really
13 our number one strategy to be able to reduce
14 emissions and it's the largest impact we can have
15 right now.

16 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Because I
17 know... I mean, you know again frame of reference, my
18 own district, right, I have... I have... we have power...
19 we have 55 percent of the city's power coming from
20 Western Queens both my district and Council Member
21 Van Bramer's with Ravenswood, you know plant there,
22 you have NRG, you have Astoria Gen, you know those
23 Peaker Plants when they click on, you know the closer
24 you get to those power plants the higher the asthma
25 rates and there's no... there's a... there's a direct

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 correlation there, I mean folks will try to make
3 different... I, I'll draw that straight line I don't
4 need to have you guys do it but I'll, I'll say that
5 the closer you get to those power plants the higher
6 the asthma rates are and, and asthma has a real
7 effect on our community, so I think... I don't want to
8 see those plants clicked on any more than they have
9 to be.

10 MARK CHAMBERS: And I, I, I completely
11 agree, and I think we're, we're actively working to...

12 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Alright, so
13 I... any other questions guys? Yeah, absolutely...

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So, I, I, I was
15 just really happy that the, the Chair's really
16 focusing on this kind of larger, larger piece about
17 schools and, and one thing I want to inject as we
18 move forward is or are all the economic development
19 opportunities and training the future workforce and
20 so this is... this is a... even like in build it back and
21 making sure that, that... this is... this is all going to
22 have to get built by people and they need to be built
23 by our people, New Yorkers and... especially minority
24 women businesses, public housing residents and, and
25 so I'm really hoping that we can work together on a

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 plan that already is out there and peace meal and
3 when we think about Sunset Park for example with
4 some... one of the, the largest portfolio of city owned
5 property that's getting investment and we're thinking
6 about green... or kind of resiliency infrastructure
7 that we bring... that we... there's, there's a real
8 connection between the jobs and, and this new
9 technology and, and the training and working with our
10 unions and so that's, that's already... I, I don't want
11 to open that up too much other than that... as, as a
12 member of the committee and with the support of the
13 Chair I'd like to continue to work on and think about
14 that and measure our success and to be able to say
15 this is what we're doing, and this is... this is how
16 we're going to do it.

17 DAN ZARRILLI: Just one thing to add to
18 that because I think we completely agree in
19 connecting people to the jobs that are being created
20 is a... is immensely important in connecting New
21 Yorkers to these jobs is immensely important so we
22 can... we... right now you can go into the Workforce One
23 Centers and we have a partnership with building
24 trades and so we're screening people to be able to
25 take advantage of pre-apprenticeship training

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 programs that we're willing to pay for that
3 ultimately puts them on the path towards
4 apprenticeships and to careers in the construction
5 trades and so that already exists, we would love your
6 help in helping to spread the word on that.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And then the
8 final question with the Green NYC program what
9 happened to the birdie?

10 DAN ZARRILLI: The birdie's a... [cross-
11 talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Is the first
13 time this public hearing has been able to happen
14 since you guys killed the bird?

15 MARK CHAMBERS: So... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: No, seriously
17 what happened... I'm getting a lot of calls on this by
18 the way.

19 MARK CHAMBERS: Fair enough... fair enough,
20 I mean I... we are... we are happy that, that everyone
21 is, is in... is invested in, in outreach and education
22 around, around a lot of the things that Green NYC is
23 focused on, birdie is alive and well... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: We're glad
25 to hear that...

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 MARK CHAMBERS: ...birdie is still an
3 employee of, of the city as, as... and he, he remains
4 the, the mascot of, of Green NYC program, I mean
5 there's nothing that ever happened to birdie I think
6 it was... I think that it was... it was strictly... [cross-
7 talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I did not
9 realize it was a rumor, okay, I'm really happy to
10 know that birdie..

11 DAN ZARRILLI: The rumors of birdie's
12 demise are greatly exaggerated, yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay. Thank you
14 for... this is why we have public hearings..

15 MARK CHAMBERS: Birdie exists.

16 DAN ZARRILLI: Oh yeah, birds on... [cross-
17 talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: You were just...
19 okay, this... [cross-talk]

20 MARK CHAMBERS: I mean I think one thing...
21 one thing that's important to say is that we have to
22 reach all, you know 8.6 million residents of this
23 city and some of them want to be reached through
24 birdie, some of them want to be reached through other
25

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 channels and we're going to leave no stone unturned...

3 [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: We could
5 increase the family.

6 MARK CHAMBERS: Exactly.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Amen to that,
8 thank you so much.

9 MARK CHAMBERS: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I have two,
11 two last questions, one on Green NYC, what is the
12 budget for the outreach?

13 MARK CHAMBERS: So, the budget is... it's
14 spread over some time but it's about a million
15 dollars.

16 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Okay and,
17 and that's for... that's citywide?

18 MARK CHAMBERS: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: That's,
20 that's for citywide outreach, outreach and, and...

21 [cross-talk]

22 MARK CHAMBERS: For... within, with, within
23 the Green NYC program.

24 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Within the
25 Green NYC... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 MARK CHAMBERS: The other... so, as with
3 zero by 30 and with other like agency programs that
4 are aligned with Green NYC... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh...
6 [cross-talk]

7 MARK CHAMBERS: ...they also have budgets
8 but for... particularly for the management of the Green
9 NYC program it's about a million... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Could we use
11 more?

12 MARK CHAMBERS: Anything that helps to
13 increase awareness and anything that helps move us
14 further in our pathway towards 80 by 50 is... will be
15 great.

16 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Alright and,
17 and so my last question, Jainey I'm not going to
18 leave you out, so as we're getting millions of
19 dollars... billions of dollars in recovery and
20 resiliency funding, funding, you know from the... you
21 know from the federal government as more of these
22 projects come online is the city budgeting
23 appropriately for long term maintenance?

24 JAINEY BAVISHI: Long term maintenance is
25 certainly on our radar, we've haven't actually gone

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 through a budgeting process for some of these new
3 coastal protection projects that are, are not online
4 yet but it... but we... our colleagues at OMB are well
5 aware that that is a, a... will be a need and we will
6 certainly budget appropriately as these projects come
7 online.

8 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Alright,
9 great. Well I, I appreciate all your testimonies
10 today, I look forward to our partnerships, I'm so
11 glad to hear it was fake news that birdie is no... was,
12 was, was injured in any way but I, I really in, in
13 all seriousness appreciate your time and your
14 partnership and look forward to doing a lot more
15 together. Thank you.

16 MARK CHAMBERS: Same here, thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you.
18 Alright, so we're going to have our next panel,
19 please step forward; Gabriella, Gabriella Velardi
20 Ward; Rachel Eve Stein; Isabelle Silverman and
21 Catherine Hughes if you all step forward please.
22 Alright, if we could start here on the left.

23 GABRIELLA VELARDI WARD: Just put it on,
24 yeah there it is. This is very encouraging, but I
25 want to emphasize a particular case of proactive

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 proactivity or no proactivity. My name is Gabriella
3 Velardi Ward and I live across the street from the
4 Graniteville wetland forest and it's my home and the
5 home of many of my neighbors that are in jeopardy of
6 being flooded because the forest and wetland across
7 the street from us is in danger of being cut down and
8 filled in and a big box store gas station parking lot
9 for 835 cars and two other very large buildings are
10 going to go there if we can't stop it. I'm familiar
11 with the good work of the Mayor's Office on
12 Sustainability has done in the past and let me
13 explain that, I was... I worked for the Park Department
14 for 23 years as an architectural designer in capital
15 projects as an architectural designer and as
16 construction supervisor and I was the parks
17 representative to the Mayor's Office of Construction
18 for sustainable construction in the late 1990's so I
19 was in on the ground but now it's evident that
20 sustainability alone is not sufficient, it's failed
21 because we have not done enough fast enough. So, now
22 we must seek resilience as a last resort. I applaud
23 your desire and political will to prioritize
24 resilience if resilience also means prevention of
25 flooding before it occurs and does not mean after the

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 fact resilience, after the damage is done resilience,
3 after people's lives are destroyed resilience. Today
4 I'm here to represent the environmental justice
5 community of Graniteville in Staten Island. In the
6 last few years Staten Island has lost much of its
7 natural resilience and now Graniteville is in danger
8 of losing its wetland forest which is if not stopped
9 will become a South Avenue retail project. The
10 Graniteville wetland forest saved this community
11 during hurricane Sandy, we were not flooded. If we
12 lose the wetland we will lose our property and maybe
13 even our lives, we're very close to Arthur Kill and
14 if... we have no, no buffer between Arthur Kill and us.
15 So, let me ask why is that New York City has approved
16 the destruction of this free and natural resilient
17 buffer against disaster, why is it that New York City
18 has allowed the destabilization of this environmental
19 justice community in the name of profits, why is it
20 that this toxically overburdened community is going
21 to lose the only resilience it has, why is it that no
22 one seems to care if Graniteville is flooded in the
23 coming years and be assured it is not a matter of if
24 we are flooded it is when we are flooded, why is it
25 that no one cares that the loss of the only open

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 green space we have, the wetland forest will leave us
3 defenseless in the face of rising tides, why is it
4 that no one cares that profits at large.. of large
5 corporations are prioritized over the lives of
6 people, why is it that all of this is okay because
7 it's legal and then let us ask why is this happening
8 in an area that has majority of black and brown
9 people. The days of development on wetlands are gone,
10 climate change is not going to happen in 50 years,
11 it's happening now. In fact, this morning I heard
12 that the Gulf Stream is at its weakest in 1,600
13 years, if we lose the Gulf Stream we're in severe
14 danger, if Western Europe will be... will go back to
15 the ice age and, and the East Coast of the United
16 States will be in real trouble so, that's, that's the
17 latest, it's happening now. I applauded the
18 prioritization of sustainability coming from the
19 Mayor's office over 20 years ago, the decrease in our
20 carbon footprint is laudable, lead was meant to
21 encourage developers to put sustainability first and
22 that came out of the committee that I was on. I did
23 not... it did not work, it didn't do enough early
24 enough and fast enough. We need to acknowledge that
25 nature has the best system of protection, we must

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 protect the wetlands that still exist, we must create
3 new wetlands, marshes and oyster beds, we must leave
4 the forest alone, have we learned anything from last
5 years severe hurricanes. There must be regulation to
6 prohibit the construction of anything public or
7 private that's the big elephant in the living room,
8 the private sector they have to be... they have to
9 conform to the regulations of the public... of the
10 public sector also because if you're doing one thing
11 and they're doing another you're, you're losing. The
12 public and private on wetlands, no grandfathering in,
13 no exceptions, no approval environmental just... in...
14 environmental impact statements without serious
15 consideration of climate change and the damage the
16 project will cause to people's lives. There can be no
17 proforma approvals any longer, we need to take these
18 steps if we are to survive, we can no longer have out
19 of control development and growth, in the human body
20 out of control growth is called cancer. We humans are
21 acting like a cancer spreading throughout the earth,
22 forcing the inhabitants of small islands to relocate
23 because the oceans are rising and gobbling up the,
24 the land and I want to inform everybody in New York
25 City not only those here, Staten Island is a small

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 island, we're in trouble not just the South and East
3 shore, the whole North shore and especially the
4 Northwest shore where Graniteville is. Property
5 rights cannot be sacrosanct when those rights
6 destroyed people's lives. How do we stop the madness,
7 how do we get off this moving train, let's heed the
8 warnings that act to protect the vulnerable in this
9 city which I've heard a lot about today, no matter
10 who they are or where they live by setting our
11 wetlands, marshes and forests, let us act to prevent
12 flooding in Graniteville, let us act to protect our
13 natural resiliency? Staten Island gets lost in the
14 shuffle a lot, Staten Island is not an urban center,
15 it's not an urban community, it's very suburban in a
16 lot of ways and it needs to keep its wetlands and
17 marshes and forests, it needs to keep them because we
18 need it. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you,
20 next up.

21 RACHEL EVE STEIN: Hi, good afternoon, my
22 name is Rachel Eve Stein and I'm the Deputy Director
23 for Sustainability and Resiliency at the Center for
24 New York City Neighborhoods. I'd like to thank
25 Committee Chair Constantinides and the members of the

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 Environmental Protection Committee for holding
3 today's hearing on the Mayor's Office of
4 Sustainability and the Office of Recovery and
5 Resiliency. The center promotes and protects
6 affordable home ownership in New York so that middle
7 and working-class families are able to build strong
8 thriving communities. Our focus on flood resiliency,
9 disaster recovery and long-term sustainability stems
10 from our home owner recovery efforts following
11 hurricane Sandy. When Sandy struck our homeowner
12 services, expertise and strong relationships with
13 community groups and impacted neighborhoods allowed
14 us to respond quickly and focus on both the short and
15 long-term needs of homeowners. Over the last three
16 years we have expanded the center's climate
17 resiliency resources and programs for homeowners.
18 Today we offer the following services; flood
19 insurance information, flood help NY dot org is a
20 first of its kind web platform that engages and
21 informs homeowners about how they can protect their
22 homes from rising sea levels and how to lower their
23 flood insurance rates, increase literacy of flood
24 insurance and resiliency issues and connects them to
25 related tools and services from the center.

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 Resiliency audits and counseling, for qualifying
3 homeowners we also offer resiliency audits and
4 counseling through the residential technical
5 assistance pilot program. To participate homeowners
6 must meet income thresholds and live in one of the
7 following New York rising neighborhoods; Carnarsie,
8 Gravesend, Bensonhurst, Bergen Beach, Georgetown,
9 Marine Park, Mill Basin, Mill Island, Red Hook,
10 Rockaway East, Howard Beach, and Lower Manhattan.
11 Recently we expanded to include Coney Island,
12 Brighton Beach, Sea Gate, Manhattan Beach, Gerritson
13 Beach, and Sheepshead Bay. eligible homeowners
14 receive a free home resiliency audit and elevation
15 certificate all together valued at about 1,800
16 dollars. The homeowners are then scheduled for a
17 housing counseling session at a nearby community-
18 based organization to discuss flood insurance options
19 and financing for resiliency retrofits. Flood
20 insurance and home resiliency retrofits are highly
21 technical and complicated topics which is why the
22 free expert assistance provided through this program
23 is invaluable to homeowners. We thank all of the city
24 council members who helped us understand the needs of
25 their constituents and have been crucial to getting

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 the word out about our services. We look forward to
3 working with you on future events. Back water valves.
4 In addition to the home resiliency audits and
5 counseling services we are expanding our services to
6 provide free backwater valve installations for
7 qualified homeowners in Coney Island, Brighton Beach,
8 Sea Gate, Manhattan Beach, Gerritson Beach,
9 Sheepshead Bay, and Howard Beach. Backwater valves
10 help reduce flood damage by preventing sewer, sewer
11 back flow which can save homeowners thousands of
12 dollars in property damage and clean up, I should
13 also mention it is in Canarsie as well. For closure
14 prevention and homeowner stabilization services,
15 along with these specialized services the center
16 continues to offer high quality foreclosure
17 prevention, housing counseling and legal services to
18 homeowners throughout New York City. Thanks to
19 generous support from the city council we also
20 provide specialized service for senior homeowners
21 including a state planning and scam prevention. Our
22 partnership with the Mayor's Office of recovery and
23 resiliency has been essential to the success of Flood
24 Help NY services, their marketing and outreach
25 support have helped us reach our audience of coastal

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 communities, they are crucial to the success of our
3 home resiliency art... audit. ORR provided technical
4 assistance throughout the design phase and have
5 continued to give us expert guidance as we design the
6 residential backwater valve installation program. We
7 are committed to supporting the city's 80 by 50
8 energy reduction goals through our energy
9 sustainability programming. Last year the center was
10 awarded funding from NYSERDA for the community energy
11 engagement program or SEEP for short which provides
12 New Yorkers with technical and financial guidance to
13 implement energy efficiency and renewable energy
14 retrofitting projects. The center has coordinated
15 with the Mayor's Office of Sustainability to ensure
16 both homeowners and multifamily building owners get
17 the support they need to make cost saving and energy
18 receiving retrofits. To that end we send multifamily
19 leads to the retrofit accelerator program and they
20 direct homeowners to us. We think engaging homeowners
21 is critical to the city's energy reduction goals.
22 Homeowners are in a unique position to adopt energy
23 retrofits because they have control over the
24 structure and use of their property but still face a
25 number of technical and financial barriers. We are

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 dedicated to overcoming these barriers with New York
3 homeowners and hope to work with MOS on this
4 endeavor. Thank you very much for the opportunity to
5 testify today, we look forward to working with you to
6 promote resiliency while preserving affordability in
7 our flood prone neighborhoods.

8 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Alright,
9 thank you.

10 RACHEL EVE STEIN: Uh-huh...

11 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Isabelle?

12 ISABELLE SILVERMAN: Okay, now it's on.
13 Good afternoon Chair Constantinides and staff. My
14 name is Isabelle Silverman and I'm a Senior Fellow at
15 Environmental Defense Fund. Thank you for the
16 opportunity to testify. I'm going to leave out EDF, I
17 mean IDF is a not for profit organization, I think
18 you know that, we have 35,000 members in New York
19 City and over two million in the country. Over the
20 past few years EDF has worked closely with the
21 Mayor's Office of Sustainability on several important
22 sustainability issues such as the clean heat
23 initiatives, the retrofit accelerator, the Mayor's
24 carbon challenge, large building retrofit mandates,
25 electric vehicles and other energy and environmental

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 issues. We appreciate the productive working
3 relationship and the open dialogue we have with the
4 Mayor's Office of Sustainability and are encouraged
5 by the discipline and focus behind their efforts. EDF
6 supports the Mayor's Office of Sustainability's work
7 and wants to see them succeed in achieving the city's
8 goals of reducing greenhouse gases emissions by 80
9 percent by 2015. As per New York City's reports the
10 1.5-degree report aligning New York City with the
11 Paris Climate Agreement and New York City's roadmap,
12 map to 80 by 50. MOS has been declared the lead
13 agency for the vast majority of key actions that will
14 help move us towards the 80 by 50 goal. Implementing
15 and overseeing the different key actions and
16 programmatic goals will be challenging to say the
17 least and will require resources beyond what is
18 currently allocated. The city should take every step
19 to make sure that MOS is adequately staffed and
20 funded to advance the daunting task of decarbonizing
21 the city over the next 30 years. Major collaboration
22 and coordination across various agencies which is the
23 key function of MOS will be necessary to achieve the
24 city's ambitious goals. At the same time the Mayor's
25 Office... MOS will need to stay at the forefront and...

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 of upcoming sustainability issues and opportunities.
3 We only have 32 years to get this right and avoid
4 costly major sea level rises. Without adequate
5 funding and staffing MOS success will be hampered and
6 then regarding the Mayor's management report, the
7 city should include MOS's performance in the Mayor's
8 management report, it should analyze MOS and other
9 city agencies performance and progress towards the
10 city's, city's 80 by 50 goal. I did a little search
11 in the MMR, the Mayor's Management Report, there was
12 nothing about greenhouse gas emissions or
13 sustainability work searching for these words and yet
14 that's probably the most difficult... one of the most
15 difficult tasks we'll have over the next 30 years.
16 The city should also track the financial costs to the
17 city of New York, of rising temperatures, extreme
18 weather events and rising sea levels on an ongoing
19 basis. And then I just wanted to mention briefly what
20 you said about asthma, of course the phase out of
21 number four heating oil helps tremendously... [cross-
22 talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh...

24 [cross-talk]

25

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 ISABELLE SILVERMAN: ...by providing... of
3 course you know that and we'll, we'll be happy to
4 help with that, advance that and... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I'm, I'm
6 looking forward to it.

7 ISABELLE SILVERMAN: Yeah, exactly
8 because these buildings really didn't have to do
9 anything so far, they just stayed or they went from
10 six to four oil which wasn't a big deal so now it's
11 their turn to help clean up our air and keep us
12 healthier and then I think also they're implementing
13 rules that are going to be redone for Local Law 87
14 and those can also help us towards reducing
15 greenhouse gas emissions. Everybody's talking about
16 that eventually about 60 percent of buildings will
17 have to go to heat pumps, electric heat pumps and
18 move away from burning fossil fuels in their
19 basements to generate heat and domestic hot water so
20 it will be very helpful to have some pilot projects
21 on that because they... the real estate agent
22 industry's a little hesitant do it in large
23 multifamily buildings or commercial buildings, it
24 hasn't really done... been done enough in the city,
25 more single family homes so that... the city will be...

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 very helpful if the city could help with pilot
3 projects or heat pumps and then what you said about
4 the Peaker Plants being turned off in the.. turned on
5 in the summer, I think it's so sad that.. to think
6 about so much electricity's probably just being
7 wasted in the city by air conditioning down to 67
8 degrees and, and, and air conditioning being on when
9 people are not even there, lights being on and then
10 we turn on Peaker Plants for basically to waste
11 energy so.. I mean that's sad. The retrofit mandates
12 you're working on, one of the ideas that EDF has is
13 as we have a minimum temperature in the.. during
14 heating season, the 68 degrees that we have to
15 provide to tenants.. [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh..
17 [cross-talk]

18 ISABELLE SILVERMAN: ...maybe we should
19 also look at a maximum temperature in the heating
20 season so let's say 78 degree and if they go
21 consistently over that temperature and overheat
22 consistently which causes great discomfort obviously
23 to residents when they can't turn off their radiators
24 that then the landlords are confronted with looking
25 at their heating system and how to balance it better

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 to avoid overheating and underheating and that..
3 tenants could actually file a complaint with the city
4 when there is overheating and underheating. So, of
5 course we're looking at all of that and then set a
6 2050 goal, so the real estate industry knows where we
7 eventually want them to go to, you know
8 electrification. So, thank you very much and of
9 course we're available for questions.

10 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you
11 Isabelle.

12 CATHERINE MCVAY HUGHES: Good afternoon
13 Chair Constantinides. My name is Catherine McVay
14 Hughes, I served 20 years as Manhattan Community
15 Board one Chair, half that time as Chair and Vice
16 Chair and after super storm Sandy I was appointed Co-
17 chair of the New York Rising Community Reconstruction
18 Program for Southern Manhattan. So, I just want to go
19 over a couple key points here. As you know 2017 was
20 the cost, costliest year ever for weather and climate
21 disasters in the United States totaling 306 billion
22 dollars. Moody's, a major credit rating agency has
23 added climate to credit risks now warn cities to
24 address their climate exposure or face rating
25 downgrades and FEMA, the future of the Federal

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 Emergency Management Agency, FEMA and its federal
3 flood insurance program is uncertain and FEMA's flood
4 insurance premiums are to rise this year. They are
5 slated to expire at the end of this July 2018 and
6 FEMA is more than 25 billion dollars in debt. We do
7 not know if or how much the federal government will
8 assist in rebuilding our communities if there's
9 another Sandy, it was only a superstorm it wasn't
10 even a hurricane one. So, the hurricane Sandy
11 recovery task force, can we get a status update on
12 that I asked some of my elected officials and I, I
13 never heard back on this. The members of this task
14 force were to be appointed by the Mayor and the city
15 council speaker within 120 days of the enactment of
16 this local law, this deadline has already passed. In
17 addition the task force was to submit to the Mayor
18 and the Speaker a report no later than 12 months, it
19 should be an update.. it should also include an update
20 on the lower Manhattan coastal resiliency project,
21 you have the map here known as LNCR which includes CB
22 one's segment, South of Brooklyn Bridge including the
23 historic South Street Seaport in the financial
24 district, you know Lower Manhattan is an island too
25 and we feel left out just like Staten Island. FiDi is

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 the fourth largest business district in the country
3 and where one out of every 18 citywide jobs are
4 located according to our local business improvement
5 district, BID. LMCR is in the planning phase with a
6 budget total to be determined and a completion date
7 to be determined. Okay, as you know I'm also a member
8 of the New York Harbor Regional Storm Surge Barrier
9 Working Group, we need to construct a layered defense
10 of local sea walls and regional New York harbor storm
11 surge system, so it could address future storm
12 surges. A 20 to 25-foot-high off shore storm surge
13 barrier system and I have a diagram in the testimony
14 so you can see it here, so this is the circle of
15 protection, would one, avoid the complex
16 hydrogeological built infrastructure and social
17 infrastructure issues faced by the current dual
18 purpose SIRR and RBD projects; two, could protect the
19 metro area for the next 100 years allowing for a long
20 term change; three, would protect far more
21 communities than the current SIRR and RBD projects
22 for the same 20 billion dollar cost, about the cost
23 of one 19 billion dollar Sandy type storm that was in
24 2012. The social justice case for the metropolitan
25 New York, New Jersey regional storm surge barrier

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 system has been demonstrated in a recently published
3 environmental law in New York, developments in
4 federal and state laws. For disclosure purposes I'm
5 one of the five authors on that, it highlights and
6 maps the low and middle-income communities and
7 communities of color, suffer more from Sandy and its
8 aftermath than wealthier neighborhoods. The same
9 communities also experienced lower and less effective
10 rebuilding efforts. The circle of protection defends
11 diverse income and racial groups at lower costs and
12 with better outcomes than local community-based
13 barriers such as are currently being planned. The
14 regional storm surge barrier is one of five
15 alternatives currently being considered by the US
16 Army Corp of Engineers in New York, New Jersey harbor
17 and tributaries known as HATS, coastal storm risk
18 feasibility study alternative to, has the perimeter
19 defenses only addressing sea level rise and building
20 a regional storm surge barrier to address the threat
21 of storm surge, this would shore in the coastline,
22 you heard is over 500 miles just on the New York City
23 side and provide a comprehensive protection for the
24 entire region, it has historic support and it is
25 currently alternative to and intensively selected

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 plan and I hope that this committee will hold a
3 hearing on it and support it as well. The Mayor's
4 management report, MMR, the city must track the
5 financial cost of climate change and add indicators
6 to capture sea level rise, energy use and green house
7 gas emissions. The 372-page preliminary 218 MMR
8 annual report was released in February 2018 and fails
9 to reflect the city's targets and goals to meet its
10 C40 commitment by 2020 and its 80 by 2050 target.
11 This document needs to be updated to include indices
12 that are annually measured and publicly shared so
13 that the progress can be monitored and evaluated
14 going forward. Also Local Law 22 of 2008 requires a
15 30 percent reduction in citywide greenhouse gas
16 emissions by 2013 and requires annual inventory and
17 analysis of greenhouse gas emissions by the city
18 government emissions by 2017, you know we heard some
19 numbers being bantered around and I just wanted you
20 to see on this document that the city produced last
21 fall on page 43, the citywide annual greenhouse gas
22 emissions, it's been steady, it... if you just look at
23 the chart from 2005 so 2016, 2020, 2015, 2014, 2013
24 it's pretty stable there so we'd had the 15 percent
25 in the first ten years but how are we going to get to

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 the 80 by 2015 and this committee you have the
3 answers and the power to make sure that we're... this
4 city does not... you know that we stay above water so
5 thank you very much for the opportunity to testify.

6 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you
7 all for your testimony, I appreciate your time, thank
8 you. Alright, so Margarita Irmier [sp?]; Buck
9 Moorhead; Judith Weis and Diana Switaj. I'm going to
10 ask everyone... I, I don't want to use the clock today
11 but I'm also going to ask you to be very succinct.
12 So, if you can just make sure that your testimony is
13 succinct today I, I don't want to have to use the
14 clock and, and let's do this together so I appreciate
15 that. Lisa I, I, I got you as well, yep I got you,
16 you're coming up next. Alright. Alright, if you can
17 start there on the left. Make sure your... push the
18 button and make sure it shows red there.

19 JUDITH WEIS: Can you hear me now? Yeah...
20 [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I hear you
22 now, alright... [cross-talk]

23 JUDITH WEIS: My name is Judith Weis, I'm
24 a Professor of Merida at Rutgers University, I'm a
25 Marine Biologist and I would like to comment on

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 shoreline structures which are in the works since
3 they've got sea level rise and, and hurricanes and so
4 forth, there are all kinds of ways of protecting
5 shorelines and they have different effects on the
6 animals that live in the water. In terms of the
7 marine life clearly a natural shoreline, a marsh such
8 as... the woman who was testifying before who's marsh
9 is threatened, marshes are, are ideal, they provide
10 habitat for a variety of marine animals, for birds
11 and other land animals and wildlife. The salt marshes
12 also sequester a lot of pollutants including heavy
13 metals, including nitrogen that's a pollutant problem
14 for nutrient pollution including carbon dioxide which
15 is the cause of the sea level rising in the first
16 place. Some marshes also provide to a degree
17 protection for residents living behind it as she said
18 before. Enhanced salt marshes un... it would be very
19 unlikely to say, and I wouldn't say if we had more
20 marshes we wouldn't have had all the problems from
21 Sandy, Sandy would have topped over marshes so it,
22 it's clear we would benefit from more, more marshes
23 and enhanced marshes but marshes alone are not going
24 to protect us from something of the magnitude of
25 Sandy. There are a variety of different kinds of

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 hardened shorelines and on the reverse side of the
3 paper you have, I hope you have it, there... on the
4 back side there are some photos, right, so not all
5 hardened and modified shorelines are equivalent.
6 There are some... there are, are relatively new
7 experiments going on, it's more than experiments,
8 its, it's, it's trying out and, and apparently
9 working pretty well something called living
10 shorelines which are in areas where the shoreline of
11 a marsh is getting eroded and sea level rise is
12 effecting it and, and it's clearly eroding inward you
13 put some large... either large boulders in the seaward
14 side of the marsh or you can put oyster or something
15 hard, oysters are certainly ideal, you have a double
16 bed of fish from having oysters there and it, it is
17 going to protect the marsh from the erosion that's
18 happening from the sea level rise and I would like to
19 recommend to you a book that came out last year
20 called Living Shorelines and it's the first one in,
21 in the references that I've provided. These articles
22 about all sorts of kinds of living shorelines and I
23 recommend that book to you heartily as giving you the
24 background as you have to deal with considering these
25 issues. There's also what is prevalence along the

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 Hudson River called riprap which are big boulders
3 along the edge of the slope and, and that's what,
4 what is mostly along the upper West side Hudson River
5 coastline and it turns out that riprap is much better
6 than a hard... than, than a sea wall, riprap is almost
7 as good as a natural shoreline in terms of the number
8 of organisms and the diversity of organisms that can
9 live there. Another relatively... let, let me say less
10 destructive approach is a breakwater which is a kind
11 of a wall but it's not right at the shoreline it's
12 out in the water a bit and this is one of the, the
13 things planned for the, I believe it's the Southern
14 coast of Staten Island that they would have these
15 breakwaters which is also not that bad because it's
16 not totally... it's not eradicating the intertidal zone
17 which is what a sea wall does. A sea wall comes right
18 up and you've got the land on the one side and the
19 water on the other side and you have no longer an
20 intertidal zone and the intertidal zone is... there's,
21 there's... you know myriads of creatures that live in
22 the intertidal zone and their habitat is totally gone
23 if you put a wall right at the edge, if you put the
24 wall out in the water they still have their
25 intertidal zone. And so, the last one I wanted to

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 mention are bulkheads or sea walls which is a very
3 common thing that urban communities have and that's
4 the kind where you're intertidal zone is gone all
5 together and it's by far the least conducive to
6 marine life but there has been some, some experiments
7 and, and it... written up in one of the chapters in
8 that book about what the city of Seattle did with
9 their sea wall. A sea wall doesn't have to be just a
10 flat wall, you can give it texture, you can give it
11 things that stick out, you can envision, you know
12 large flower pots attached on the outside of the sea
13 wall so now it will gather some sediments, you'll get
14 a whole bunch of other animals being able to live on
15 it so providing texture and a three dimensional
16 aspect to that flat wall can be really helpful and
17 there's an article about the Seattle sea wall. If you
18 just google Seattle sea wall you can learn a lot
19 about it and see pictures of what they did and that
20 was done, I'd say... I don't know five, five to ten
21 years ago, less than ten years ago. So, the... that was
22 what I wanted to talk about. I would just like to
23 make one comment in reference to a remark that was
24 made earlier about the... what was it called... the, the,
25 the barrier, the storm surge barrier, pictures I've

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 seen of, of that plan includes at the New Jersey end
3 and the... is it... it's Rockaway or Coney Island end
4 permanent things that are projecting into the New
5 York Harbor so it's not that the stuff sits on land
6 and then when the storm is coming it closes up,
7 they're sitting permanently there narrowing the
8 channel for the water to go in and out and then when
9 the storm is coming then the whole thing closes but
10 it's permanently obstructing the normal flow of the
11 water and if you picture water that's going pretty
12 fast and now you reduce where its got to go through
13 its going to go through like dickens, right, it's
14 going to go through a lot faster because you've taken
15 away a lot of the room for it to be in and under
16 those circumstances the scouring and destruction of
17 the shore line and the bottom by this water that's
18 going full force into and out of the harbor can be
19 really destructive and I don't think the people who
20 are planning that thing have thought, thought about
21 that... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Alright,
23 alright... [cross-talk]

24 JUDITH WEIS: ...part... [cross-talk]

25

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you...

3 [cross-talk]

4 JUDITH WEIS: ...and that's... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you,
6 next.

7 BUCK MOORHEAD: Hi, I'm Buck Moorhead,
8 I'm a Board Member with New York Passive House. Thank
9 you Chairman Constantinides for having this hearing
10 and your patience in listening to all of us speak
11 here, we... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Okay...

13 [cross-talk]

14 BUCK MOORHEAD: ...appreciate it. New York
15 Passive House fully supports the goals of, of the 80
16 by 50 plan. We recognize as, as most people do that
17 75 percent of, of the city's energy use is in
18 building energy... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh...

20 [cross-talk]

21 BUCK MOORHEAD: ...and about half of that
22 energy is actually in heating and cooling load so
23 focus on measures that address the buildings envelope
24 and reduction of those required heating and cooling
25 loads will effectively reduce the overall required

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 energy use. We appreciate the efforts that the city
3 council has made very aggressively and specifically
4 your committee to propose legislation that's directed
5 at energy conservation and also alternative energy
6 measures that you've done, I mean there were six or
7 seven bills in June I think or some... if I'm... I may be
8 miscounting but we... so we... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: We passed 16
10 bills last year out of the committee, so we were
11 busy..

12 BUCK MOORHEAD: Oh, I was just missing a
13 digit there.

14 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Yeah, there
15 you go.

16 BUCK MOORHEAD: So, we appreciate the
17 efforts of the city council, we also appreciate the
18 efforts of the Mayor's Office for long term planning
19 and sustainability which has been working.. you know
20 we, we find when New York Passive House assists with
21 these measures that we're, we're talking with city
22 council and we're also talking to the Mayor's Office
23 about ways to find the best ways to, to draft that
24 legislation so that it's, it's readily understood and
25 that it's implementable and that you can measure and

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 verify outcomes at the end because we want it all to
3 work... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Right...
5 [cross-talk]

6 BUCK MOORHEAD: Energy conservation is,
7 is really the, the, the least sexied of these
8 alternative... it's not an alternative energy it's
9 simply reducing the amount of energy you require,
10 we'll always want solar and wind in alternative
11 energy but it will be... you'll just need less solar
12 if, if one takes care of the envelop properly so we
13 will continue New York Passive House as a
14 collaborative organization, we want to work with city
15 council, with the Mayor's Office as we can, with
16 other of our colleagues, environmental organizations
17 to try to help form the best way forward so thank you
18 for what you're doing.

19 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you.

20 DIANA: Hello, good afternoon, my name is
21 Diana Switaj, I'm Director of Planning and Land Use
22 at Manhattan Community Board one who's district
23 includes most of Manhattan below Canal Street South
24 of the Brooklyn Bridge as well as Ellis, Governor's,
25 and Liberty Island. Thank you for holding this

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 important hearing today and inviting testimony on
3 sustainability and resiliency. CB1 commends the many
4 years of leadership from the city council in tackling
5 greenhouse gas emissions from our buildings, the
6 largest source of the city's carbon emissions. Intro
7 1745 of 2017 is a bold and innovative step towards
8 cutting carbon emissions and reaffirm New York City's
9 leadership in tackling climate change. We look
10 forward to the council reintroducing and passing this
11 bill, a critical step in the holistic approach to
12 addressing sustainability and resiliency. Lower
13 Manhattan continues to be one of America's largest
14 business districts and our residential population is
15 one of the fastest growing in the whole city. Our
16 district is only 1.5 square miles, but it has a huge
17 impact on the city and regional economies. In 2013
18 Lower Manhattan had a gross economic output of over
19 62 billion dollars and generated an estimated 2.4
20 billion dollars in city tax revenues. Our district
21 remains a resilient place that more and more people
22 want to live, work and visit. We have a lot of work
23 to do to ensure that these powerful growth trends
24 result in a district that is protected and livable
25 for all. At a height of seven feet Community District

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 one experienced one of the highest indentation levels
3 in Manhattan during superstorm Sandy, two people in
4 our district drowned and the storm resulted in
5 billions of dollars of damage to infrastructure,
6 housing and commercial property and utilities. As we
7 approach the sixth anniversary of superstorm Sandy
8 the board is concerted both the short term and long-
9 term time frames as Lower Manhattan remains largely
10 unprotected. We face an increasing potential for
11 suffering extreme weather events and subsequent
12 damage to Lower Manhattan and low-lying areas across
13 the city. CB1 has worked collaboratively with the
14 city, state and federal representatives since October
15 2012 when Sandy devastated our community. We thank
16 the city for the funds it has already contributed
17 towards resiliency in Lower Manhattan. The Lower
18 Manhattan coastal resiliency project or LMCR is
19 underway but there is a substantial funding
20 shortfall, CB1 maintains that it is critical to fully
21 finance the LMCR project and ensure that our district
22 is protected in the future. It is unclear where the
23 required funding will come from and we urge the city
24 to find ways of securing additional funding resources
25 for the construction of a more resilient Lower

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 Manhattan. As the LMCR project goes through the
3 initial analysis and preliminary design stages more
4 is uncovered that adds challenge to an already
5 monumental task. Not only is Lower Manhattan
6 surrounded by water on three sides, but all of the
7 edges have been built out on land fill presenting
8 unique vulnerability and challenges. The Office of
9 Recovery and Resiliency team is uncovering more
10 complexity in protecting Lower Manhattan than was
11 ever imagined and this will lead to greater
12 challenges, cost and commitment. CBI also commends
13 the Mayor's Office of Sustainability and the Mayor's
14 Office of Recovery and Resiliency on the work they
15 have done thus far to analyze the problem and begin
16 to formulate a plan both for the long term and more
17 recently for intermediate measures. This is herculean
18 task that has never before been attempted however
19 every year since Sandy that the city doesn't endure a
20 hurricane feels like a narrow miss and eventually our
21 luck will run out. We must all work together to
22 ensure that creative and effective sustainability and
23 resiliency measures are put in place to protect Lower
24 Manhattan and the entire city now and in perpetuity.
25 Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: I look
3 forward to working with you guys and, and exploring
4 this further so thank you all for your testimony
5 today. So, the, the, the last panel Lisa DiCaprio;
6 Andress Banning, Benzing, sorry and either Pisa Core
7 or Patrick Houston. Alright, do you want to start
8 there? On the... on the left there, yep, uh-huh.

9 ANDREAS: Thank you Chairperson
10 Constantinides for allowing us to testify today at
11 the public hearing. My name is Andreas Benzing, I'm
12 President of New York Passive House and I will keep
13 it very short. Mayor De Blasio has called climate
14 change the challenge of our generation and New York
15 City has responded to this challenge by committing to
16 achieving greenhouse gas reduction of 80 percent by
17 2050. Passive House buildings which which achieve
18 substantial energy reductions and resiliency through
19 cost effective and skillful design and construction
20 are key to achieve these commitments. These buildings
21 use up to 90 percent less energy for heating and
22 cooling and up to 70 percent less energy overall.
23 Furthermore, in the event of power outage they can
24 remain comfortable for long periods even in extreme
25 weather. With the substantial lower energy

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 requirement, the Passive House approach enables the
3 construction of net zero energy buildings that
4 feature low to no resilience on fossil fuel energy.
5 It is exciting to see the application of Passive
6 House evolving in New York City, it currently has
7 about 100 building, large buildings as well going up
8 in the city or, or around the city. We hope it will
9 be included in the commercial court as well and we
10 applaud your leadership in pushing energy efficiency
11 for buildings in the city. Thank you so much.

12 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you.
13 Thank you.

14 LISA DICAPRIO: Well my name is Lisa
15 DiCaprio, I am a Professor of Social Sciences at NYU
16 where I teach courses on sustainability. Thank you
17 for the opportunity to speak at this oversight
18 hearing on recovery and resiliency. In it's January
19 7th, 2018 New York Times article on the implications
20 and politicization of the new theme of flood maps for
21 New York City David Chin notes that New York with
22 it's 520 miles of coastline quote, "has more
23 residents living in high risk flood zones than any
24 other city in the country and the pace of development
25 along the water has only increased since superstorm

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 Sandy", are the waterfront edge design guidelines
3 adequate given new scientific studies about the
4 relentless rise of our oceans which will only
5 accelerate in the future? The climate central surging
6 seas risk zone map illustrates how New York City will
7 be flooded at different levels of sea level rise. We
8 should be especially alarmed by the current and
9 projected days of sunny day, high tide flooding. This
10 phenomenon as New York Times reporter Justin Gillis
11 explained in his September 3rd, 2016 article,
12 flooding of coast caused by global warming has
13 already begun is now real and not just a theoretical
14 possibility. Quote, "for decades as the global
15 warming created by human emissions cause land ice to
16 melt and ocean water to expand scientists warned that
17 the accelerating rise of the sea would eventually
18 imperil the United States coastline, now those
19 warnings are no longer theoretical, the inundation of
20 the coast has begun, the sea has crept up to the
21 point that a high tide and a brisk wind are all it
22 takes to send water pouring into streets and homes"
23 end quote. A new national oceanic and atmospheric
24 administration report on sunny day, high tide
25 flooding is detailed in a March 28th, 2018 Washington

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 Post article by Jason Samuels. Federal report, high
3 tide flooding could happen every other day by late
4 this century. By 2050 according to this report's
5 projections quote, "high tide flooding will occur
6 between 50 and 250 days per year along the East coast
7 depending on the greenhouse gas emission scenario",
8 end quote. Astrid Caldas, Senior Climate Scientist at
9 the Union of Concerned Scientists is quoted as saying
10 quote, "just imagine seeing streets and property
11 flooded every other day, that gives a completely new
12 meaning to the term nuisance flooding or actually it
13 completely obliterates the concept as flooding would
14 become much more than a nuisance but a rather serious
15 problem requiring significant resources and
16 innovative policies", end quote. In New York City
17 sunny day, high tide flooding is already affecting
18 several low-lying communities in Queens that surround
19 Jamaica Bay as described in Nathan Kessinger's
20 October 12th, 2017 article in Queens, chronic
21 flooding and sea level rise go hand in hand. These
22 neighborhoods include; Hamilton Beach, Broad Channel
23 and Howard Beach. What is the status of the current
24 resiliency projects for these communities which
25 include a new storm surge berm, street raising and

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 bulkhead projects? According to projections of sea
3 level rise made by the New York City panel on climate
4 change certain areas of Hamilton Beach and Broad
5 Channel may experience tidal flooding on a daily
6 basis. Are the current resiliency projects adequate
7 given these predictions or are they simply providing
8 the illusion of protection? Related to this question,
9 is New York City sufficiently prioritizing planning
10 and the allocation of resources for resiliency
11 initiatives or even relocation if necessary for
12 existing communities at risk? Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you
14 Lisa.

15 PATRICK HOUSTON: Hello, my name is...
16 hello, can you hear me?

17 LISA DICAPRIO: You want to try this one?

18 PATRICK HOUSTON: Yeah. Thank you.
19 Alright, there we go. Hey everybody, my name is
20 Patrick, I am with New York Communities for Change,
21 Patrick Houston with New York Communities for Change.
22 Thank you for the time to testify and today I'm going
23 to go through the document that I will share with you
24 but for the sake of staying within the time limit
25

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2 I'll skip over small sections so if you see me
3 briefing through...

4 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Uh-huh...

5 PATRICK HOUSTON: So, as you know
6 inequality and climate change are two of the greatest
7 moral crisis of our time, they are deeply intertwined
8 and they're especially an issue here in New York and
9 so at the city level New York Communities for Change
10 we're focused on the city's top source of climate
11 pollution and the greatest job creation opportunity
12 outside of direct spending to create jobs which is to
13 clean up dirty buildings here in the city. So,
14 buildings like Trump Towers, like the Kushner
15 building, large buildings like this are only two
16 percent of the city's buildings overall but they're
17 responsible for almost half of the city's climate
18 pollution and so New York as a whole currently
19 generates about 50 million metric tons of CO2
20 equivalent, a large... and this is to large buildings...
21 large buildings over 25,000 square feet that's the
22 two percent, they generate about 20 to 25 million
23 metric tons of CO2 equivalent pollution. So, that's
24 more pollution than most countries so as you know the
25 administration has done a wonderful analysis of the

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 problem and the One NYC which follows on the Plan NYC
3 and the key is to follow through. So, you know the
4 council passed the Mayor's... the council passed and
5 the Mayor enacted law committing New York City to at
6 least 80 percent reductions of pollution by 2050 and
7 the city has bound itself to act but the problem is
8 that the Mayor's plan for addressing nearly half of
9 the city's climate pollution is hugely insufficient
10 in terms of climate and air pollution reductions it
11 also doesn't do a good job at addressing good and
12 fair labor standards and even worse it will lead to
13 and contribute to the widespread MCI issue with the
14 rent hikes in rent regulated housing already about
15 two million New Yorkers depend on rent regulated
16 housing. So, to be precise the pollution impact of
17 the Mayor's plan for large buildings will cut
18 pollution citywide about seven percent by 2030 but
19 those large buildings are nearly again 50 percent of
20 the city's climate problem... climate pollution. The
21 Mayor's proposal would lead to large scale energy...
22 would not lead to large scale energy efficiency
23 upgrades. So, since it doesn't require large scale
24 upgrades except in a limited number of residential
25 buildings it therefor does not create the economic

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 activity needed nor that economic activity that is
3 potential. So, NYC will not get the jobs that could
4 employ thousands of people especially people in
5 moderate and low income communities because a lot of
6 these jobs won't require a college education and
7 other forms of advanced education and so I'm going to
8 jump down now so thank you Council Member and
9 Chairperson Constantinides for the plan that you've
10 been working on, this is the Intro 1745 and by our
11 experts analysis the... this Intro 1745 generates about
12 13 percent of climate pollution cuts by 2050, that's
13 much better than the Mayor's projected seven percent
14 by 2050 so we believe that that plan 1745 is on to a
15 good start and our experts say if continued it can
16 help us achieve 80 percent reductions by 2050 so it's
17 at the right pace. And so, the Mayor's plan and, and
18 Intro 1745 both unfortunately would lead to rent
19 hikes in rent regulated housing and so displacement
20 and homelessness are a crisis that we do not want to
21 contribute to as we address the, the climate issue.
22 I'm going to jump down. And so, it is our hope that
23 any bill that's introduced on buildings on this topic
24 fixes the problem of... and avoids the problem of rent
25 regulated housing and incurring the cost of MCIs from

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 the building retrofits. New York City must also... and
3 then the second key part, New York City must also
4 ensure that good labor standards to produce good jobs
5 and high-quality work should be part of any final
6 legislation, on... excuse me... final legislation or
7 package of legislation and budget items. This
8 oversight form shines a spotlight on a fundamental
9 failing of the MOS, the lack of even a plan or
10 proposal much less finalized law to reach 80 by 50,
11 that's impossible without dealing with large
12 buildings that ought to be at the top priority of the
13 Mayor's Office of Sustainability agenda. And last I'm
14 going to jump down one more time to the bottom of the
15 third page, so we believe that, you know it's time..
16 beyond time for New York to become the world's leader
17 with providing... addressing climate issues and
18 becoming a jobs leader as well by requiring that
19 large buildings slash climate pollutions drastically
20 on pace to achieve 80 by 50 and that's going to
21 require that these mandates go through to 2050 and
22 not stop at 2030. Two, that fair labor standards are
23 attached to these jobs and finally that tenants of
24 affordable housing don't incur the cost of the energy
25 efficiency retrofits in large buildings. So, again

COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

1
2 thank you for the ability to testify and thank you
3 for the work that you've begun with addressing dirty
4 buildings in New York City.

5 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you,
6 thank you all for your testimony today, I appreciate
7 your time. With that I thank everyone who testified
8 today for your time and your input here today and we
9 look forward to continuing working with both the
10 Mayor's Office of Sustainability and the Office of
11 Recovery and Resiliency. I want to thank the staff as
12 well, today everyone... all of our staff, my
13 Legislative Attorney both of them today; Nadia
14 Johnson our Policy Analyst, Jonathan Seltzer our
15 Financial Analyst and my staff Nick Widzowski so with
16 that I will gavel this meeting of the Environmental
17 Protection Committee closed.

18 [gavel]
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

May 4, 2018