

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
CONCESSIONS

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING,
DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS

----- X

March 27, 2018
Start: 2:34 P.M.
Recess: 5:43 P.M.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Room 16th
Floor

B E F O R E:

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Ben Kallos, Chair
Chaim M. Deutsch
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Vanessa L. Gibson
Andy L. King
Inez D. Barron
Diana Ayala
Mark Levine
Rafael Salamanca, Land Use Chair

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Artie Pearson, Director of Land Use

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

2

3 Malcolm Morse, HDFC Manager Housing
4 Cooperative Asset

5 Ted Weinstein, (HPD) Division of Housing
6 Preservation and Development

7 Lacey Tauber, Government Affairs at
8 (HPD) Division of Housing Preservation
9 and Development

10 Desiree Andrepont, Community Builders

11 Susan McCann, Community Builders

12 Eileen Torres, Executive Director of
13 BronxWorks

14 Betty Ann Tamaisar, Department Director
15 for Workforce Development at BronxWorks

16 Pastor David Serrano, Jr., pastor local
17 church

18 Pastor David Serrano, Sr., pastor local
19 church

20 Mohan Montabeak (SP?) 32BP SEIU (Service
21 Employees International Union)

22 Eva Hermida Ramos (SP?), public speaker
23 on building

24 A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

25 Kevin Parris

Paul Freitag, Executive Director
(WSFSSH) West Side Federation for Senior
and Supportive Housing

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
CONCESSIONS

3

2 Ross Karp, (HPD) Division of Housing
3 Preservation and Development, Project
4 Manager Special Needs Housing

4 DAMCONE (SP?)

5 Allen Adantu (SP?) Friends of Anabil
6 Aviles Playground

7 Ellen Finney, DOROT, Community Outreach
8 Social Worker

9 Reverend Alistair Drummond, West End
10 Presbyterian Church Pastor

11 Lynn Wisher (SP?), 5th Avenue
12 Presbyterian Church, Member of Board of
13 Directors of the West Side Federation
for Senior and Supportive Housing

14 Pannos Katrice (SP?) 32B Union

15 Karen Jorgensen, Director at Valley
16 Lodge

17 Elissa Waldman, Director of Community
18 Programs at Institute for Family Health

19 A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

20 Bud Kourtney (SP?) Catholic Worker,
21 Valley Lodge Choir Director

22 Mark Greenberg, Executive Director
23 Interfaith Assembly on Homelessness and
24 Housing Coalition

25 Eustasia Smith (SP?)

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

4

2 Sandy Roach, Board Chair for
3 Bloomingdale Family Programs

4 Stephanie Louise, Live on New York

5 Rebecca Sower, Director of Policy and
6 Planning of the Supportive Housing
7 Network of New York City

8 Nathan Gebbert (SP?).

9 Nikki Navarro

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

5

3 (Test, test, this is Subcommittee on
4 Planning, Disposition and Concessions. Today's date
5 is March 27, 2018. This recording is being recorded
6 by Juan Delunte (SP?).

7 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Good afternoon and
8 welcome to the Subcommittee on Planning, Dispositions
9 and Concessions, I'm Council Member Ben Kallos, the
10 Chair of this Subcommittee. Uhm today we are joined
11 by Land Use Chair Salamanca, Council Member Inez
12 Barron as well as Council Member Diana Ayala both of
13 whom have items on the agenda today from their
14 districts. I want to apologize to those in
15 attendance. The City Council has multiple hearings
16 as we speak and we have the challenge of trying to be
17 in more than one place at a time. Uhm for my part I
18 was coming from the Parks Committee Hearing where we
19 were talking about funding for parks which are
20 literally falling into the river and other parks
21 which are being privatized at \$180 an hour. Yes, in
22 New York City you have to pay \$180 if you want to use
23 a park on the east side. Today, we will be holding
24 four public hearings and we will be voting on two
25 applications. The applications we will be voting on
were the subject of prior hearings. We will now move

1 on, we will now start with our public hearing on Land
2 Use Items 52-59 and will begin with Land Use Item 59,
3 the 721 Van Siclen HDFC Tax Exemption Application for
4 property located in Council Member Barron's district
5 in Brooklyn, pursuant to article 11 of the Private
6 Housing Finance Law. This 40 year Tax Exemption
7 would not only facilitate the renovation of the
8 building but also remove the property from a list of
9 buildings slated for 3rd party transfer around 10
10 foreclosure auctions, so the plain language on this
11 one is we've got some property. This property ended
12 up as a cooperative and the cooperative has some
13 outstanding uhm money that it owes the City in the
14 form of back taxes and uhm paying for water because
15 yes even though you don't see it on your rental bill
16 all the time, land... tenants, landlords have to pay
17 for their water bill and so when a building hasn't
18 paid its rent or... sorry, hasn't paid it taxes or
19 hasn't paid its water bills, uhm they will sometimes
20 be put into foreclosure where they are then auctioned
21 off to a third party, whether it is a nonprofit or a
22 for profit to take over management of the building.
23 In this case, the City has stepped in to work with
24 the tenants and creating HDFC and using a retroactive
25

1
2 tax abatement to keep the property affordable and uhm
3 use that money to help take care of the outstanding
4 debt as well as working to pay off the amounts owed
5 to the water for water and uhm to make sure that the
6 building gets into a state of good repair. Okay, so
7 I'm hoping that that was the most accurate well, very
8 uhm broad description of what is going on here and so
9 from HPD Housing Preservation and Development we have
10 Artie Pearson, Director of Land Use and we also have
11 their testimony submitted so I will now ask our
12 Counsel to swear you in sir.

13 COUNSEL: Please state your name?

14 ARTIE PEARSON: Artie Pearson.

15 MALCOLM MORSE: Malcolm Morse.

16 COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the
17 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in
18 your testimony before the Subcommittee and in
19 response to all Council Member questions?

20 ARTIE PEARSON: Yes.

21 MALCOLM MORSE: Yes.

22 ARTIE PEARSON: Land Use Number 59
23 consists of an exemption area containing one
24 privately owned building located at 721 Van Siclen
25 Avenue, that's block 4329 Lot 1 in Brooklyn Council

1 District 42. This property is a candidate for
2 foreclosure under the 3rd Party Transfer Program in
3 realm Action Number 53 Round 10 for which HPD is
4 seeking Article 11 Tax Benefits. 721 Van Siclen
5 Avenue was taken into city ownership in 1982 and sub,
6 sub, subsequently entered into the Tenant Land Use,
7 the Tenant Interim Lease Program on March 31, 1998.
8 HPD conveyed the property to the existing occupants
9 as low income cooperatives with household incomes
10 capped at 120% of AMI. The buildings is a mixed use,
11 four-story walk up with 38 residential units and 4
12 commercial spaces of which one is used as an office
13 by the Board. It is fully occupied and comprises 33
14 one bedrooms, 3 two bedrooms, 1 one bedroom and one
15 superintendants unit. Of the 38 units, 21 are home
16 ownership and 15 are rentals. The commercial spaces
17 are mainly mo, mom and pop shops and currently have
18 long-term leases. Four Aces Restaurant recently
19 vacated the premises as a result of a court action
20 taken against it by the HDFC for uncollected rent so
21 one commercial unit is currently vacant. In view of
22 the fact that the required maintenance fees have not
23 been raised for many years before the 5% increase and
24 the collection rates are low, sufficient funds have
25

1 not been available to meet operating expenses and
2 other obligations, therefore, the property became
3 eligible for TPT. Realizing they were in danger of
4 foreclosure, the shareholders worked out a plan to
5 help save their building. The shareholders have
6 selected a new board, they have been working toward
7 paying back taxes and recently entered in a payment
8 agreement with DEP for the arrears. The HDFC will
9 also enter into a voluntary repair agreement to
10 address the outstanding hous, housing code violations
11 in need of repairs. No subsidies is being provided
12 and no preservation loan is needed at this time as
13 there are reserves in the building and along with
14 timely collection of maintenance fees the fund will
15 continue to grow. In an effort to help maintain
16 continued affordability and stability in the
17 building, HBD is for the Council seeking Tax Benefits
18 retroactive to 2011 for a term of 40 years that will
19 coincide with their regulatory agreement and also
20 mandate annual maintenance increases among other
21 requirements such as hiring a 3rd party manager.
22 Approval of Tax Exemption will facilitate removal of
23 721 Van Siclen Avenue HDFC from consideration as a
24 candidate of Round 10 of the Third Party Transfer
25

1
2 Program allowing for long-term home ownership by the
3 shareholders. We can answer any questions that you
4 might have?

5 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: I'd like to turn to
6 Council Member Inez Barron for her statement and any
7 questions?

8 INEZ BARRON: Thank you Mr. Chair. Uhm,
9 thank you to the panel for coming and just to briefly
10 share information about this building. It is a
11 building in my District, not far in fact from where I
12 live. It's a substantial building and you have heard
13 the description of what the apartments are that are
14 there. So the management company that they have was
15 perhaps not as effective as it should have been
16 during the time that they have been there and as you
17 have indicated, they did not have the collections
18 coming in because they were not having the required
19 increases in the maintenance so they fell into the
20 state where they owed the City quite a bit of money
21 and they were placed, they are has been said in HDFC
22 and they were placed in the TPT Program. Previously,
23 my predecessor, my husband, Charles Barron worked
24 with HPD about 12 years ago to assist another Housing
25 Development that was in a similar state to work on

1
2 getting themselves out of that position so that when
3 they came to a position of demonstrating their
4 ability to manage themselves they were able to become
5 the shareholders themselves. In this instance, we
6 did not think that it was fair that people who have
7 been paying regularly and are in fact presently
8 shareholders should lose all of the money that they
9 have invested so the Board was reconstituted, they
10 came together, they organized themselves. They
11 allowed people to forego some of the more recent
12 transactions that they were negligent on but they did
13 come to an agreement and they have now established
14 the opportunity for the present residents to
15 reestablish themselves and maintain their
16 shareholder, maintain the ability to own their
17 apartments and we feel that is very important. We
18 know that this is an area, is across the City being
19 targeted by those who want to gentrify and displace
20 people who have lived through the hard times and we
21 felt that that was not a just situation and I am very
22 pleased to say that HPD was very, very, responsive.
23 They sent people to the meetings that the
24 shareholders had, they gave us a lot of direction, a
25 lot of information and there was also a legal aid

1 lawyer who worked tirelessly at no cost to help the
2 tenants understand all that they had to do. It was
3 an extensive list that they had to gather of all
4 kinds of documents in order to qualify for
5 consideration and they have gathered all of that and
6 done all of that and so that is why we are here now
7 at this juncture so that they could be approved for
8 Article 11. I whole-heartedly support them. I
9 continue to impress upon them, listen we are here
10 now, we are not going to come back here again, we've
11 got to be able to maintain what we say we are going
12 to do or we will be in a worse situation going
13 forward so I whole-heartedly support the program and
14 I do thank Manues (SP?), HPD, and the lawyer and
15 those residents that are there understanding the
16 opportunity that they have and fighting to maintain
17 their ability to have ownership.

19 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: I want to thank
20 Council Member Barron for her hard work and uhm based
21 on her statement also your predecessor, uhm it sounds
22 like you have pretty activist members here fighting
23 for you. I am going to ask just some uhm questions
24 that I try to ask on all about every single project.
25 So, currently there are 21 who have home ownership,

1 uhm 15 that are rentals. Uhm will those 15 rentals
2 remain rentals or will they be converted into
3 cooperative ownerships?
4

5 MALCOLM MORSE: We are not entirely sure
6 at this time, we can't say that every one of them
7 will be but the building is interested in uhm once
8 the units become available to push towards home
9 ownership.

10 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: What is the AMI cap
11 for people who want to be, what will the maintenance
12 be tied to? Is there a situation where somebody
13 might be required to pay more maintenance than they
14 can afford to pay? And uhm, if somebody sells, sells
15 their cooperative unit are there any limitations on
16 who they can sell to?

17 ARTIE PEARSON: Right, so the program
18 allows for uhm an income cap up to 120% of AMI that
19 will be written into the regulatory agreement once
20 it's finalized.

21 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: And uhm how much will
22 maintenance be?

23 MALCOLM MORSE: Alright so maintenance
24 is, so the way that this building operates, they meet
25 as a Board and they decide when maintenance

1
2 increases. Currently the maintenance for a one
3 bedroom recently went up from \$440 to \$462, it is
4 \$556.50 for a two bedroom and \$651 for the one three
5 bedroom.

6 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: And uhm so how much
7 can they sell a unit for to somebody who is at 120% o
8 the AMI or below?

9 MALCOLM MORSE: So the regulatory
10 agreement that they have agreed to sign on to in
11 exchange for the Article 11 Tax Abatement, for this
12 year, the one bedroom, the max would be \$358, roughly
13 \$358,000, \$424,000 for the two bedroom and \$491,000
14 for the three bedroom but I want to stress that in
15 the meeting that I had with the shareholders back in
16 December, they raised concern that that was too much
17 and we explained to them at the meeting that that is
18 just the cap, if a building decides that they want to
19 further restrict the income caps they can vote on it
20 as a Board.

21 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: And uhm if a tenant
22 were to sell and gain \$391,000 or \$400,000 or more
23 dollars, do they get all of it or would the building
24 take some or would HPD take some to recup taxes or,
25 or how does that work?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MALCOLM MORSE: So buildings, uhm once again that was something that the shareholders raised, they were concerned about, their abilities to impose a Flip Tax and so the regulatory agreement gives them the power to impose a, impose a Flip Tax to what they would want it to be, uhm if somebody says it is 70/30, if they want to make it, if they want to make it where it is 80/20 they can but it is up to the Board, they can decide what they want their Flip Tax to be but nothing comes to HPD, it is all just between the person selling and the HDSC.

CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Sure so it is just full disclosure, I am attorney and attorneys tend not to ask questions we don't know the answers to. So in other HDFC arrangements and in fact every other one there is part of the regulatory agreement, maintenance is tied to a specific AMI as well as having specific provisions for sale of requiring 95% of coops flipped within the first five years or something that that fee goes back to the cooperative to help maintain it. So, is this dif, how is this different than the other projects that we have seen at this committee?

1
2 ARTIE PEARSON: So the other project,
3 projects that we brought before the Committee were
4 modeled more along the ANCP Program. These are Till
5 Buildings that remained Till Building, slightly
6 different, yeah.

7 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Okay uhm, that, that
8 is helpful and so I guess is there a reason why we
9 couldn't bring some of the ANCP provisions over to
10 this building and so this is a first hearing and I
11 will turn, I imagine that there will be ongoing
12 conversations between the Board and HPD and, and
13 Council Member Barron to ensure that the tenants who
14 are staying here are incentivized to stay there, that
15 folks aren't saying they are being confronted with
16 the option of \$300 or \$400,000 of windfall and
17 whether it is creating a 30 or 40 or 50 or 60 or 70%
18 Flip Tax voluntarily by the coop Board voting on it
19 now or what have you and if we can just work with the
20 HPD to make sure that some of the ANCP Incentives
21 remain a part of these conversions too?

22 ARTIE PEARSON: We will certainly take it
23 back to the Agency and discuss it.

24 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Okay, are there any
25 members of the public, uhm who would like to testify

1 on this matter. Uhm, seeing none we will now close
2 the hearing on Land Use Item 59. Our next hearing is
3 on Land Use uhm Item, Land Use Items 55-57 the Park
4 Haven, Park Haven Rezoning. HPD seeks approval for
5 an Urban Development Action Area Project, AUDAA,
6 designation project approval and disposition of city
7 owned property and also seeks a Zoning Map Amendment
8 to rezone to the project area from R6 to R7D with a
9 C1-4 Commercial Overweigh and a Zoning Text Amendment
10 to designate the project area as a mandatory
11 inclusionary housing area utilizing N line H option
12 2. These actions will facility the development of an
13 11 story mixed use building with 169 units of
14 affordable housing, fresh food supermarket and a
15 community facility space in the District of Council
16 Member Ayala. Under the existing R6 Zoning there is
17 no specific height limit. The height is governed by
18 sky-exposure, planes unless a Quality Housing Program
19 is elected. The floor to air ratio could range for
20 Height Factor Buildings for only 7.78 to 2.43. Under
21 the proposed R7D Rezoning a Residential Floor Area
22 Ratio of 5.6 would be permitted and MIH Development
23 Center C1-4 a Floor Area Ratio 2.0 would be allowed
24 for commercial uses. The height limit under R7D with
25

1 a qualifying ground floor and MIH would be 115 feet.
2 We will now open the public hearing on Land Use Items
3 55-57 and just the plain language version of his, uhm
4 the City has a bunch of uhm vacant lots that have
5 served as pretty much parking uhm for at least I
6 think at least I think the past decade or more. The
7 community has wanted to do something uhm with this
8 property which is incidentally right adjacent to
9 People's Park and so the City is proposing to turn
10 the property over to a developer at little to no
11 cost, most likely \$1 and in addition, we would like
12 to increase how much you can build there by more than
13 half. So we are more than doubling uhm what you can
14 build there. We are also putting a cap, saying you
15 can't really go higher than 115 feet. Uhm we are
16 also making sure that this developer uses a fresh
17 incentive to build a food supermarket and uhm that
18 looks like the, oh and the last but not least is we
19 are going to require that when all of this expires
20 and some of it will eventually expire, Mandatory
21 Inclusionary Housing will require that a certain
22 percentage of these units remain affordable forever
23 so I think those are the key items and uhm, hold on,
24 I will now ask the, I will now call the first panel.
25

1 We have Ted Weinstein from HPD, Lacey Tauber,
2 formerly of the Council, now of HPD, Desiree
3 Andrepont of the Community Builders, Susan M. of the
4 Community Builders and Eileen Torres of BronxWorks
5 and Betty Ann Tamaisan of Bronxworks and now they
6 Counsel will swear you in.
7

8 COUNSEL: Please state your names?

9 LACEY TAUBER: You have to talk into the
10 mic, yeah. Uhm Lacey Tauber, Government Affairs at
11 HPD.

12 DESIREE ANDREPONT: Desiree Andrepont of
13 Community Builders.

14 EILEEN TORRES: Is it on? Eileen Torres,
15 Bronxworks.

16 COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the
17 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in
18 your testimony before this Subcommittee and in
19 response to all Council Member questions?

20 LACEY TAUBER: Yes.

21 DESIREE ANDREPONT: Yes.

22 EILEEN TORRES: Yes.

23 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: You may begin.

24 LACEY TAUBER: Okay, can you hear me
25 okay? Alright uhm Land Use uhm Number 55, 56 and 57

1
2 are related unit of action seeking Zoning Amendments,
3 establishment of a Mandatory Inclusionary Housing
4 area, UDAP Designation, Project and Disposition
5 approval for 9 city owned sites located 345 St. Ann's
6 Avenue in the Mott Haven section of the Bronx,
7 Council District 8, the project is known as Park
8 Haven. Two privately owned lots adjacent to the
9 development site at block 2268 lots 48 and 50 are
10 included in the Rezoning Area creating an assemblage
11 of 11 lots forming the Project Area. The city owned
12 parcels are all vacant lots, some of which are
13 currently used as parking for an adjacent church. Of
14 the two privately owned parcels, Lot 48 contains an
15 active church and lot 50 contains a vacant five-story
16 building. Park Haven will be developed through HPDs
17 extremely low and low-income ELLA Program. Under the
18 ELLA program sponsors develop multi-family buildings
19 in order to create low-income rental housing for
20 families with a range of income to 30% to 60% of the
21 Area Median Income or AMI. Projects may include a
22 tier of units with rents targeted to households
23 earning up to 100% of AMI. Subject to project
24 underwriting up to 30% of the units may be rented to
25 formerly homeless families and individuals referred

1
2 by the Department of Homeless Housing or other Public
3 Agencies. The Park Haven Project will have incomes
4 capped at 80% of AMI. LU Number 55 will facilitate
5 the construction of an 11-story mixed use building,
6 containing 169 units plus a superintendant's unit.
7 There will be a mixture of unit types, including 43
8 studios, 55 one bedrooms, 45 two bedrooms and 26
9 three bedrooms of varying income tiers distributed
10 throughout the building. Rents will be established
11 with tiers affordable to families earning from 30% to
12 60% of the Area Median Income (AMI) with up to 20% of
13 the units affordable to families with incomes up to
14 80% of AMI. The rents are anticipated to range from
15 \$462 for a studio to \$1,888 for a three bedroom
16 apartment. That's 40% and 80% AMI respectively.
17 Formerly homeless households referred by DHS and
18 other city agencies will pay up to 30% of their
19 income as rent. The building will be energy
20 efficient and the amenities will include a gym,
21 indoor recreational area, outdoor recreation area, a
22 tenant community garden on the 10th and 11th terrace,
23 rooftop activity space, laundry adjacent to the
24 outdoor terrace, a grocery store selling fresh fruits
25 and vegetables, active design principals and

1 workforce development services offered by Bronxworks.
2
3 Additionally, the ground floor will contain
4 approximately 14,297 square feet of commercial space,
5 designed to be a fresh supermarket which is traveling
6 as a separate Euler (SP?). Additionally, the project
7 will have approximately 7,300 square feet of
8 community facility space for use by the residents and
9 members of the community and approximately 8,820
10 square feet of open space to be utilized as
11 recreation space and a Tenant Community Garden. LU
12 Number 56 seeks an Amendment to the Zoning Map to
13 Rezone the Project Area from an R6 District to an R7D
14 District with a C1-4 overlay District. Under the R6
15 existing zoning the maximum FAR for residential use
16 is 2.43 and 4.8 maximum for community facility. The
17 proposed R7D C1-4 will allow an increase in the FAR
18 for residential use to 4.2 and 4.0 for community
19 facility. It will also allow a maximum FAR of 2.0
20 for commercial use. LU number 57 seeks a Zoning Text
21 Amendment to designate the project area of the
22 Mandatory Inclusionary Housing Area utilizing option
23 1, a number of permanently affordable units under MIH
24 will be 39 along with the MIH Designated Units HPD
25 will require an additional 15% of permanent

1 affordable units bringing the anticipated total
2 number of permanently affordable units to
3 approximately 62. In order to facilitate
4 construction of the Park Haven Project, HPD is before
5 the Planning Subcommittee requesting approval of Land
6 Use Numbers 55, 56 and 57 and uhm I'm going to turn
7 it over to uhm the project team to give the more in
8 depth description of the project.
9

10 DESIREE ANDREPONT: Hi, my name is
11 Desiree Andrepont, I'm with the Community Builders.

12 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Sorry to interrupt, do
13 we have testimony from uhm, the Community Builders
14 and Bronxworks. Written testimony?

15 DESIREE ANDREPONT: I have written. Hand
16 out the one page. Here's that.

17 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: And just as a reminder
18 to HPD as with other Committees we would prefer that
19 written test, that testimony from applicants be
20 written. And for members of the public you can go to
21 council.nyc.gov uhm to get copies of the testimony
22 that has been submitted and also see transcripts from
23 the hearing as well as appearance cards. You may
24 continue.
25

1
2 DESIREE ANDREPONT: Uhm, HPD issued a
3 request for proposals in 2015 for development of
4 seven contiguous city and vacant lots in the corner
5 of 142nd Street and St. Ann's Avenue in Mott Haven.
6 TCB provided a response and was designed as developer
7 in 2016. For this project, Community Builders as
8 partnered with BronxWorks, so local non-profit
9 organization dedicated to helping individual and
10 families improve their economic and social well-being
11 and has been deeply involved in the south Bronx
12 community since 1972. BronxWorks for this project
13 will provide onsite support services and workforce
14 development and training, onsite support services
15 will be inside the residential portion of the
16 building and workforce development training program
17 that they currently operate will relocate to this
18 site, uhm and be available from the street. The
19 proposed development will be a newly constructed 11-
20 story, 181,605 square foot, mixed income, mixed use
21 building with 170 unit and two ground floor leased
22 spaces. The ground floor programming is expected to
23 include a fresh foods grocer under the City's Fresh
24 Program and a workforce development program operated
25 by BronxWorks that I previously described. The

1 building mix has studios, one bedrooms, two bedrooms
2 and three bedrooms and will also include a supers
3 unit so there are 169 residential rented unit and one
4 supers unit. 80% of the units will be low income
5 housing, Tax Credit Eligible Units that are at or
6 below 60% of AMI and 20% of the units will be
7 affordable to middle income residents earning 80% to
8 100% of the AMI. Of the total residential units, 50
9 units will be designated at permanently supportive
10 housing for chronically homeless families with
11 children under the age of 18 during the time of
12 intake and BronxWorks will provide onsite support
13 services to these families through a New York State
14 ESHE (SP?) Grant so that grant has been awarded. The
15 newly constructed building will be highly energy
16 efficient and is expected to meet passed house
17 standards. The building will also meet Enterprise
18 Green Community Standards as required by HPD, other
19 building features include solar panels, rooftop
20 activity track, tenant community garden, a gym
21 onsite, above grade laundry, indoor recreation areas
22 and outdoor landscaped recreations areas to encourage
23 active and healthy living for the residents. The
24 ground floor commercial and communities, this will be
25

1 centered around an open residential lobby and central
2 staircase as well as an open air corridor adjacent to
3 the residential entry.
4

5 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Perfect, uhm over to
6 Council Member Ayala for any questions or statements?

7 EILEEN TORRES: So I'm Eileen Torres, I'm
8 the Executive Director of Bronxworks we did not
9 prepare a written testimony I mean, we so do you want
10 us to testify without having that, we are happy to do
11 so. We don't have a copy of what we will be
12 testifying.

13 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Did you show up
14 intending to testify?

15 EILEEN TORRES: Uhm, yes.

16 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Please do.

17 EILEEN TORRES: Okay so, I'm, I'm Eileen
18 Torres, I'm the Executive Director of Bronxworks and
19 Bronxworks as already mentioned is a multi-service
20 organization that has been based in the southern part
21 of the Bronx since 1972. We've been operating
22 shelters for homeless families since 1992. Uhm and
23 providing benefit assistance since the inception of
24 the organization, since the founding. Uhm, so for
25 this particular project, for Park Haven, uhm we would

1
2 be providing supportive services to 50 supportive
3 units for formerly chronically homeless families,
4 includes intensive use management, after school
5 services for the children, uhm also provide, we will
6 also provide financial literacy services for the
7 residents, we will serve as their representative
8 payee for the families, thereby ensuring that we pay
9 the rent and that they won't become homeless again
10 and making sure that they are stably housed. Uhm, we
11 will also relocate all our Workforce Development
12 Programs that are currently at a different location
13 and my colleague, Betty Ann Tamaisar can give a full
14 description of the Workforce Development Programs
15 that will be in the facility.

16 BETTY ANN TAMAISAR: So thank you Eileen.
17 Good afternoon, my name is Betty Ann Tamaisar and I
18 am the Department Director for Workforce Development
19 at Bronxworks. I would like to take this opportunity
20 to thank the City Council Subcommittee of Planning,
21 Dispositions and Concessions for allowing me to
22 testify on the Park Haven Project. We have
23 Bronxworks, we are a cross-development department,
24 are very excited about relocating the four programs
25 currently housed in the Department to 146 2nd Street

1 and St. Ann's Avenue. The four programs are the Jobs
2 Plus Program which serves NYCHA public housing
3 residents in Betances, Courtlandt, Moore and Melrose
4 Houses. The strong, Stronger Families Program that
5 services custodial and noncustodial fathers, the
6 Young Adults Internship Program that services youth
7 16 to 24 and the Family Self Sufficiency Program that
8 services HPD Section 8 voucher holders.
9

10 Collectively, these programs provide job readiness,
11 occupational training services, job placements,
12 parenting and healthy relationship classes and access
13 to benefits and financial counseling. In 2007, we
14 served 1,271 unique individuals. Of that number, we
15 assisted 908 of those individuals with job readiness
16 services, 595 individuals with job search, 490
17 individuals with occupational skills training and
18 OSHA General Industry, OSHA Construction,
19 scaffolding, flagger, 8-hour, 16-hour and Fire Guard
20 Certifications. We also assisted 419 individuals
21 with financial counseling services, inclusive of
22 helping them to decrease debt and increase services,
23 credit scores, etc. Least but definitely not last we
24 assisted 385 individuals to gain employment in
25 various sectors with companies the agency has ongoing

1 relationships with. To demonstrate the agency's
2 commitment to those that they serve, Bronxworks is
3 one if not the largest employer of WorkForce
4 Development participants. Thank you for allowing me
5 to speak this afternoon.

7 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Council Member Ayala.

8 DIANA AYALA: Good afternoon, thank you
9 for submitting testimony today. This project is a
10 little bit, was actually a project that was initiated
11 prior to my becoming a Council Member for this
12 district but I know that my predecessor worked really
13 hard to negotiate it. I have a lot of concerns about
14 this project. I am always excited to see housing
15 coming to uhm my District, especially the south Bronx
16 where I know that we desperately need affordable
17 housing when families are cons... you know being
18 pushed out, day in and day out because they are
19 overburdened with rent. Uhm, I know that we are kind
20 of missing an opportunity in this site because it is
21 a city owned lot I think that that gives us a lot of
22 flexibility in terms of the, the level of
23 affordability that we are providing to this community
24 and so I have some concerns and I am hoping to kind
25 of work through them today and maybe follow up with

1 some conversation later, but I do have some
2 questions, uhm could you tell me what the uhm, the
3 length of the regulatory agreement for the HPD
4 Financing is?
5

6 LACEY TAUBER: Yeah, 60 years.

7 DIANA AYALA: Okay 60 years. Okay now
8 this project proposes to include a 30% satisfied for
9 formerly homeless families, can you explain HRE and
10 HPDs procedures for matching homeless applicants with
11 available units in this project and can you confirm
12 that HRE does not consider Community Preference or
13 last known address. Uhm, I believe our operating
14 funding source ISHI uhm funded through the state of
15 TDA and we have had several conversations internally
16 about how we are going to draw families for this
17 particular site and so we have asked this question
18 internally. One of the questions that we are hoping
19 to do and, and we're really hoping to address the
20 issue of children in schools, uhm in a school
21 district and living in shelter outside of the
22 District so what we are hoping to is target families,
23 chronically homeless families in shelter that have
24 children in this communities school district which I
25 believe is School District 7.

1

2

LACEY TAUBER: Uh-huh.

3

4

DIANA AYALA: Uhm, we've, that's our goal. We don't know exactly what the rules are going to be and how those, what those funds require in terms of how the residents are drawn, is that, is that correct?

5

6

7

8

9

LACEY TAUBER: That's correct. I'm sorry, that's correct uhm and we have been trying to obtain feedback from HRE and DHS uhm concerning this. Uhm I just want to sort of give you the fuller name for each because I think, its the Empire State Supportive Housing Initiative Grant that we have been able to secure already for this facility. And those are operating funds to provide the onsite services?

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

DIANA AYALA: Uhm this is, so HPB what is your policy around housing families that are coming from homeless shelters? Is there a policy? I know this is fairly new where we are now starting to set aside units for formerly homeless individuals but is there a pol... an internal policy that you use?

22

23

24

25

LACEY TAUBER: Yeah, yeah the referrals come to us through the Department, as I was describing in the testimony through the Department of Homeless Housing and uhm I believe there is a borough

1 preference expressed by folks in that system but its
2 through HRA so I'm not really prepared to speak to
3 that when it comes to HRA.

4
5 DIANA AYALA: Okay and you can confirm
6 that HRA does not consider community preference?

7 TED WEINSTEIN: Not on the district
8 level.

9 DIANA AYALA: Okay. Uhm HPBs ELLA Term
10 Sheet has two standard options and this project is
11 currently slated for ELLA Option 2. Have you looked
12 at the viability of ELLA option 1?

13 DESIREE ANDREPONT: Uhm we have uhm I
14 think when we originally submitted the proposal, we
15 wanted to try to provide a critical mass of families
16 that could be served onsite through a service program
17 so we did, all of our focus has been on the option 2
18 with the 30% formerly homeless, so uhm I think in our
19 original proposal we had 32 units, we have been able
20 to because we have been able to up-zone and include
21 the MIH and the FRESH. We have been able to now
22 include 50 units and so there is some critical mass,
23 of, of families that we would need in order to
24 support onsite services. So, that was our rationale
25 for the 30% homeless.

1
2 DIANA AYALA: I just, so my frustration
3 with this project is that, uhm you know, listen, I am
4 in favor of set aside for formerly homeless families,
5 I, that's not in question but I think that in this
6 community where we desperately need affordable
7 housing that this project does not do enough to
8 afford the people that actually live there that are
9 being priced out an opportunity to apply for units
10 that we can afford. This is the poorest
11 congressional district and we are setting aside 5% of
12 the units at 40% of the AMI and 5% of the units at
13 50% of the AMI because we are saying well we are
14 offering 30% to homeless families but these homeless
15 families in honestly are homeless families that may
16 or may not reside in the South Bronx but at the same
17 time we have families that do live there that are
18 being, that are going into shelter because they have
19 been priced out so I, it just doesn't make any sense
20 to me and uhm and I think that I would strongly you
21 know encourage that you go back and, and, and have a
22 conversation because it think that there needs to be
23 a more equitable distribution of the units that
24 actually, you know meets the needs in this community
25 so that we are servicing families that really need it

1
2 but we are also taking into account that there are
3 families that live there that need it as well. And I
4 don't think that these numbers do that for me and I
5 don't think that they do that for the families of the
6 south Bronx and so I would again strongly urge you to
7 kind of, to go back and I am happy to have further
8 discussion about that but that's really where I am
9 right now. I have a lot of concerns about this, uhm
10 this is a city owned you know lot so it should offer
11 us a lot more flexibility to do this, to go deeper
12 and to make more units uhm permanently affordable and
13 so you know, that is my position in regards to that.
14 But I, I wanted to also ask uhm how much of the, of
15 the projected, how much of this project is slated to
16 receive, how much of the project slated to receive in
17 city subsidies and what percent of the total project
18 cost is this?

19 DESIREE ANDRPONT: Got it.

20 DIANA AYALA: Okay thank you.

21 DESIREE ANDREPONT: The subsidies from
22 the city uhm HPD specifically is \$23.8 million and
23 that's approximately 30% of the development cost.

24 DIANA AYALA: Okay.

25

1
2 DESIREE ANDREPONT: And then HDC provides
3 a loan of \$11,050,000 and that's, that's
4 approximately 14%.

5 DIANA AYALA: Okay.

6 DESIREE ANDREPONT: Of the funding.

7 LACEY TAUBER: Let me just add that these
8 are estimates and sometimes the financials will
9 change before the project closes.

10 DIANA AYALA: Okay so given that this
11 project is going to receive a significant amount of
12 tax payer subsidy is there a plan to ensure that the
13 permanent jobs created are good jobs that pay
14 prevailing wage?

15 DESIREE ANDREPONT: Uhm I actually did
16 look at the uhm the impact of prevailing wage on the,
17 on the piriformis so what happens is the uhm the
18 increase in the Operating Cost by paying those, those
19 higher wages reduces the amount of supportable debt
20 on the project. So for this particular project I
21 just briefly plugged in what the underwriting
22 standards are for the City's Housing and Finance
23 Agency (HDC) and that change came to about \$650,000
24 gap. It reduced our supportable first mortgage by
25 \$650,000 so uhm, I know, my understanding is that

1 these ELLA type projects is very low income projects
2 because they have such a, a very low cash flow, they
3 often can't support prevailing wage operating jobs,
4 uhm that said it is something that we can look at but
5 it does have a real impact on the financials of the
6 project and the financial feasibility of the project.

8 DIANA AYALA: I would appreciate it if
9 you could, look, look into that a little bit further.
10 Uhm if you could tell us what are the fees, what fees
11 will the developer earn on this project?

12 DESIREE ANDREPONT: The estimated
13 developer fee is 12.8%, it comes to \$10 million. We
14 are sharing our fee with our partner Bronxworks and I
15 just wanted to also mention I don't think I said this
16 earlier but the Community Builders is a nonprofit
17 affordable housing developer and Bronxworks our
18 partner is also a nonprofit so these fees go back
19 into the communities where we work uhm and I, I just
20 wanted to make sure that that was something that
21 everybody understood.

22 DIANA AYALA: I appreciate that. What
23 percentage of the 12.8 is going to be split with
24 Bronxworks?

1
2 DESIREE ANDREPONT: We have an agreement
3 right now to split 10% with Bronxworks.

4 LACEY TAUBER: Alright and so I do want
5 to emphasize that this is the first agreement that we
6 have with any developer who has been willing to share
7 any fees with us without us guaranteeing any part of
8 the project or taking on any risks, uhm and so all of
9 those fees would then once collected would go right
10 back into all the services that we provide which in
11 turn then goes back to the community.

12 DIANA AYALA: Actually I had a question
13 or you Eileen. So you mentioned that Bronxworks
14 would become the designated payee for.

15 EILEEN TORRES: That is correct.

16 DIANA AYALA: For families coming in,
17 what does that mean?

18 EILEEN TORRES: So for families who
19 receive social security, you know SSI payments what
20 we usually do uhm we have an unsupportive housing
21 facility that we operate, uhm its a voluntary
22 arrangement with them, the family, the head of
23 household would then agree to have us serve as a
24 representative payee so there's an account that we
25 have set up that comes in so it is earmarked for that

1 family member and then what we do is we make sure
2 that we pay their rent first and then they
3 reallocate. We have a spending plan with them that
4 we allocate for the month and so then we give them
5 the money throughout that month just to make sure
6 that we are paying the rent on time uhm and we are
7 paying any expenses that they may have that they need
8 so we can make sure that they stay housed.

10 DIANA AYALA: I think I was a little bit
11 confused. I didn't understand in your testimony that
12 it was voluntary so that raised a little bit of a red
13 flag for me. Uhm, I mean, I'm excite again for the
14 possibility of affordable housing, I just need to
15 make sure that is affordable housing that is in the
16 best interest of all of the parties involved and I
17 think that there needs to be further conversation.

18 DESIREE ANDREPONT: We can definitely
19 look into that I think that there are some uhm ways
20 that we can approach it and maybe come to something
21 that can uhm keep our, the critical mass of the
22 formerly homeless units but also meet some of the
23 lower income requirements, we will go back and do
24 some work and see what we can do.

25 DIANA AYALA: Okay thank you.

1
2 LACEY TAUBER: Right so I just want to
3 reemphasize a little bit of what Desiree was saying
4 which is the way we are be, we are able to have such
5 intensive case management on site is by having a
6 basic minimum of 50 units within that facility. Uhm
7 if we don't have those 50 units it's not financially
8 feasible to run a program so I just want I just want
9 to sit up and make sure that I made that point.

10 DIANA AYALA: I understand that but we
11 are running in a city, we are running out of city
12 owned lots to building on, right, so we are building
13 higher and higher, here we have a unique opportunity
14 to do that and to do that well and while I appreciate
15 the efforts we made as a formerly homeless person
16 myself uhm to house formerly homeless families, I
17 also have to take into consideration that I have
18 families that are existing families that live in this
19 community that are being priced out and becoming
20 homeless every single day and that we are not doing
21 enough to build affordable options for them to apply
22 for and this project has 9 units that could possibly
23 maybe right, that we are in the poorest congressional
24 district so I will count the 9 that are 40% and only
25 have of that, half of those units are have a

1
2 community preference attached to it so I, it just
3 doesn't work for me. So thank you.

4 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Thank you Council
5 Member Ayala. So it is, I, I think these are some of
6 the concerns that I know we, I also shared when we
7 were in discussions and if I can just add on to it
8 just a little bit. So I guess the, I'm going to take
9 it in a slightly different direction which is just
10 how many lots are being merged as part of this?

11 TED WEINSTEIN: Nine.

12 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Are there any other
13 additional lots that are unimproved and do not have
14 any structures on them?

15 TED WEINSTEIN: There were two adjacent
16 lots on the 142nd Street side that are not developed
17 that appear to be used for storage, they are
18 privately owned lots. Nine city lots those two lots
19 are not city owned.

20 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: And what kind of
21 storage was on those lots, is it like very clean and
22 it just has a storage bin on it or does it appear
23 that there are random parts of auto parts and boat
24 parts and other items just strewn around lots?

1
2 TED WEINSTEIN: It's not a high life for
3 the neighborhood.

4 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Okay so qui... now so
5 you've got this whole row of empty lots, some of them
6 are owned by the city so bad on us, there are these
7 two empty lots that are owned by somebody else, bad
8 on them, what, what happened to those lots?

9 TED WEINSTEIN: They've been privately
10 owned and there is no indication. After uhm the
11 Community Builders were selected through a very
12 competitive process, uhm they did try to reach out to
13 the owners of those lots but were unsuccessful.

14 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: So they, unsuccessful
15 means? So who reached out to whom and what, what
16 happened?

17 TED WEINSTEIN: Community Builders tried
18 to track down.

19 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: They are right here.

20 DESIREE ANDREPONT: Yes, we tried to
21 track down the owners, we were not successful in
22 reaching them or, or hav, or coming to any
23 discussions about acquiring the sites.

24 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Okay so who are the
25 owners or do you know or?

1
2 DESIREE ANDREPONT: I don't have that
3 information.

4 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Are they individuals?
5 Are they LLCs?

6 DESIREE ANDREPONT: They were LLCs.

7 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Okay. Uhm and so how
8 long have we been trying to do a project here as a
9 city?

10 TED WEINSTEIN: Many years.

11 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: So I believe in some
12 of our conversations we talked about like this goes
13 back to 1998 possibly.

14 TED WEINSTEIN: Yes.

15 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Uhm how long would it
16 take for the city to use eminent domain to save this
17 location as a light, we are literally doing urban
18 renewal, the purpose for which eminent domain should
19 be used, not for stadiums, not for making money but
20 to actually just dealing with urban light, what is?
21 How does it take for that?

22 LACEY TAUBER: I mean I think it takes
23 longer than we have to talk about it in the context
24 of the approval of this project and I think, you
25 know, we, we care what you are saying about wanting a

1
2 priority for us to look at this you know moving
3 forward but it's not something that I think makes
4 sense for us to address right now. I mean, it's a,
5 it's a very complicated process and buy in all levels
6 of the administration, you know, we, we are in an
7 affordable housing crisis and we want to move forward
8 with the project as quickly as we can.

9 TED WEINSTEIN: For much of that time
10 period, especially the more recent years, the City
11 policy was not to acquire. The policy was dispose of
12 properties and so well large amounts of properties
13 were acquired through Urban Renewal Plans. I mean
14 that is one of the differences that, you know the
15 south Bronx really had numerous Urban Renewal Plans
16 that were adopted which covered large amounts of
17 land, large territories not just two small lots.

18 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: And nine lots, two
19 lots would have been a 20% increase uhm so I guess I
20 would like HPD to come back to us and I don't want to
21 see another project coming before us where there is
22 literally vacant lots that are being used for auto
23 storage which I am almost sure is a violation of the
24 law. I don't think you can just use a residential
25 lot and use it for industrial storage, so I am

1
2 curious why DEP has not issued violations and why HPD
3 possibly has not issued violations but I would prefer
4 not to see that again and I would also know from
5 Community Builders is there a way to build this in
6 such a way that if HPD were to commit to moving
7 forward with emanate domain perhaps the owner might
8 be interested in working with you such that either we
9 could get it done as part of this deal or that the
10 project could be built in such a way so as those two
11 lots became available you could extend properly and
12 seamlessly.

13 DESIREE ANDREPONT: We can certainly look
14 at that for sure.

15 LACEY TAUBER: I say we hear you on
16 projects moving forward, from here, uhm Ted said it
17 is a very different context now than it was in the
18 90s when we first started looking at this lot, so.

19 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Similarly there is a
20 People's Park which will be available that is
21 currently used by the community, anytime I see a
22 developer coming in, profit, for profit or non-profit
23 I always wonder about their commitment to the
24 community and whether or not we can get a conservancy
25 working with our Council Member Ayala or others to

1 uhm make sure that theirs folks not only caring for
2 your own outdoor pace but for the adjacent space that
3 your tenants will hopefully use.
4

5 DESIREE ANDREPONT: We uhm are definitely
6 going to be providing fencing around the space that
7 is currently there, Parks Approved fencing and our
8 goal is very much to make the back of the building
9 attractive to the park uhm so when you are looking at
10 the back of the building you can actually see the
11 back of the building from the corner on the next
12 block. So we, again there, again going back to the
13 uhm concerns about cash flow in these types of
14 projects. There is a tremendous amount of cash flow
15 in these low income projects so adding on uhm adding
16 on any kind of maintenance or any kind of program for
17 maintaining the park would significantly increase the
18 cost of the project and change the financials. One
19 thing that we are doing, we have heard a lot of
20 concerns from the community about safety in People's
21 Park, especially in that back corner and we are
22 working uhm, uhm, Bronxworks has former law
23 enforcement on staff that man, that manages their
24 security uhm across their properties and, and places
25 where they operate so one of the things that we have

1 talked about with them is how do we position our
2 security cameras and the security procedures that we
3 have on site to make sure that we are maybe hopefully
4 making that area uhm of the park a little safer. And
5 having eyes on the park too, uhm just have a physical
6 presence there, uhm I think will actually help the
7 safety and improve that park significantly.

9 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: In conversations with
10 Council Member Ayala we discussed the absence of
11 supermarkets throughout different parts of the
12 neighborhood. The fresh grocery on the ground floor,
13 7500 square feet at grade 6700 below grade but that
14 won't be available to customers, it will be available
15 for storage which makes for a very small supermarket.
16 Is there any opportunity to make additional space
17 available for the grocery and any commitment to
18 making sure that the prices are affordable.

19 DESIREE ANDREPONT: We are definitely
20 exploring uhm how we can provide a little more space
21 to the grocer, they have asked for us to try to find
22 more space so we have been looking at how we can
23 accommodate more space in, on that ground floor.
24 That is something that we are looking at. Uhm, I
25 will tell you that the rent, the, the fresh program

1
2 actually provides incentives not just to Developer
3 but also to Grocery Operators so the grocer will
4 receive Real Estate Tax benefits that will flow
5 through the property to them as, as tenants and I
6 believes there are some sales tax incentives so the,
7 so the operator actually has incentives to that are
8 helping him keep prices affordable but if you would
9 like I can talk with him and make sure that that it
10 is affordable.

11 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Absolutely, it's up to
12 the uhm local member and you and the the supermarket
13 just about making sure that folks can actually use it
14 as a supermarket I guess. You may have caught my
15 remarks on the way in about being slightly miffed
16 about a park. In my District you can look in and but
17 if you want to step foot in, it's \$180 an hour, so I
18 guess one question is, will your public space be
19 available and open to your neighbors to other
20 cultural or religious institutions in the
21 neighborhood or to folks who are on the other side of
22 that fence who say that, that looks like a pretty
23 garden, I'd love to participate or have a role versus
24 just being stuck at those bars staring in?

1
2 DESIREE ANDREPONT: We have discussed uhm
3 how we can make that open space between the park and
4 the, and the building entrance, uhm how we might be
5 able to use that open space in a way that invites the
6 community in for certain programing so we had talked
7 about I know there's Eileen, you guys have a fresh
8 food market.

9 EILEEN TORRES: That's uhm so I did want
10 to I've been trying to jump in a little bit, so sorry
11 about that. So just going back to the park, uhm one
12 of the things we have a very, very strong present in
13 Mott Haven and one of the things that we are actually
14 the lead partner for is Our Healthy Livable Mott
15 Haven and in that, for that project we have actually
16 done a tremendous job in activating St. Mary's Park
17 which is right across the street uhm from this, from
18 where this facility will be. We are hoping that we
19 would be able to do something very, very similar to
20 People's Park uhm and so that is something that we
21 have on our, you on our list of items of wishful
22 funding that we would like to be able to get so we
23 can expand what we currently do in St. Mary's Park
24 and have that in People's Park. Uhm we also have, we
25 also have opened a Farm Stand in front of Belvis

1 (SP?) which is right near this, where this facility
2 will be as well that offers fresh fruits and
3 vegetables into the community and we would like to be
4 able to expand that too.
5

6 TED WEINSTEIN: Belvis is a health
7 center.

8 EILEEN TORRES: Right.

9 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: I would like to note
10 that we have been joined by Council Member Chaim
11 Deutsch and just in terms of the developers, what is
12 the make up in terms of minority and women as
13 executives, in terms for development, will you be
14 using MWBE certified contractors, architects, other
15 service providers and in terms of those who are doing
16 the work, will those people receive a wage that is
17 commensurate with the area normal, will those people
18 be getting the health benefits so that if they get
19 injured, they can go to, it sounds like there is a
20 health provider across the street and have that
21 covered and in the event that that injury means that
22 they can't keep working, will they have disability
23 insurance.

24 DESIREE ANDREPONT: And so.
25

1
2 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: For both doing the
3 work to build it and then operate it.

4 DESIREE ANDREPONT: Okay so I'll start
5 with the onsite, uhm there will be approximately 70
6 full time and part time jobs at this property after
7 it is built. That includes Workforce Development,
8 folks that are already currently employed in another
9 location. We will have grocery, new employees for
10 the grocery. They will have approximately 30
11 employees full and part time. The support services
12 that BronxWorks will provide, will have, there will
13 be 9, 9 jobs there and then we expect to have 5, at
14 least 5 full time folks on board. We are not going
15 to manage this property but internally as an
16 organization we have a minimum wage of \$15 an hour,
17 that is our minimum across all of our properties and
18 we will, we expect that the property manager who will
19 be working with us on this project will follow those
20 guidelines as well. Also as an organization we have
21 uhm hiring goals that we internally implement. These
22 are not things that are required by uhm municipality
23 or uhm or any kind of funding. These are our own
24 internal requirements so we are, our goals are to
25 have 30% MBE, 10% WBE, 5% DBE, another 5% for small

1
2 businesses, 3% for DVE and we are required section 3
3 which is not a requirement here but targeting 10% uhm
4 we are have already had conversations with our
5 contractor who is Managnok (SP?) about meeting these
6 requirements. They have provided us with an outline
7 of how they uhm approach this, uhm and I have, I
8 beli... I have that if you would like it but I
9 believe that he has provided that, uhm Greg Balso
10 (SP?) in testimony earlier in the month or last month
11 but I can, I can, I can provide that to you for how
12 they are going to achieve these.

13 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Testimony at City
14 Planning Commission or?

15 DESIREE ANDREPONT: No I.

16 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Was it the first
17 hearing at the council?

18 DESIREE ANDREPONT: I believe it was at
19 the Council but I can find out on another project but
20 I can find out and I can get you the information as
21 well.

22 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: So they may have to
23 testify at another project?

24 DESIREE ANDREPONT: Yeah.

25

1
2 EILEEN TORRES: I just want to say in
3 terms of BronxWorks uhm you know we have
4 approximately 850 employees uhm and we are committed
5 to hiring those who are from the Bronx and reflect
6 the diversity of those residents that we serve. I
7 myself was born in the South Bronx so it starts in
8 the very top to everyone you know below and so at
9 least count when we did our survey which admittedly
10 was probably at this point about 3 years ago, 70% of
11 our employees were born and raised in the Bronx and
12 currently still live in the Bronx so just to give you
13 an idea of what our commitment. Also we have
14 Workforce Development in the department itself, we
15 have hired in a number of our own participants who
16 are a part of those programs to serve in various
17 capacities throughout the entire organization.

18 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Uhm there are still
19 outstanding questions in terms of.

20 DIANA AYALA: Yes.

21 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: In terms of...

22 DIANA AYALA: Leadership.

23 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Yes but I would like
24 to if you can give that to us in writing and...

25

1
2 DESIREE ANDREPONT: Okay that would be
3 great.

4 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: So Council Member
5 Salamanca.

6 RAFAEL SALAMANCA: Thank you Chair
7 Kallos. Uhm good afternoon. First I want to
8 acknowledge I have a relationship with BronxWorks you
9 do great work in my community and it's, it's good to
10 see that you are part of this project. Uhm Community
11 Builders, uhm where are you based out of?

12 DEISREE ANDREPONT: We have offices here
13 in New York City and Chicago, D.C., uhm we operate in
14 14 states from the Mississippi River on east. The
15 headquarters are in Boston. The company was founded
16 in Boston.

17 RAFAEL SALAMANCA: Okay how many, uhm how
18 many uhm developments have you developed in the, in
19 the Bronx.

20 DESIREE ANDREPONT: This will be our
21 fist.

22 RAFAEL SALAMANCA: This will be your
23 first, okay. Uhm, so now, and the reason I bring
24 that up is you would understand my colleagues
25 frustration, she's my neighbor and colleague. We

1 both have the same, uhm we represent the poorest
2 Congressional District in the, in the nation and when
3 I saw that HPD was going to action 2 I was really
4 disappointed in seeing that. You know the needs of
5 this community HPD. You know that option 2 is
6 unacceptable for our community but yet you would want
7 to give this community option 2 and not provide any
8 30% AMI units to members of the community and I would
9 like you to please explain that to me.
10

11 TED WEINSTEIN: This was, this was as you
12 know this was the result of an RBC competitive
13 process.

14 RAFAEL SALAMANCA: And this is city-owned
15 land and that's what is most frustrating about this
16 project.

17 TED WEINSTEIN: Uhm, there were 15
18 submission in response to the RBC, was very
19 competitive, it was a very high number. They
20 obviously then they varied a lot in terms of what
21 they were proposing. This was a project that in many
22 ways was a very attractive project uhm but one of the
23 things that it proposed was uhm doings its part to
24 try to meet not just the affordable housing crisis
25 but also the homeless crisis and so there is a newer

1 program, it is, it is right there on our term sheet.
2
3 There were all of these two options of how to use the
4 LIP, the low income program and this was a project
5 proposal that was looking to try to meet both of our
6 needs. Uhm sometimes that is difficult uhm, because
7 there are only so many units in a building uhm the
8 point here was that they were able to get state
9 funding through the SIH program which again was
10 unusual uhm and so their wil, their interest and
11 their willingness to try to address that need was
12 something that we thought was worthwhile at this
13 location.

14 RAFAEL SALAMANCA: Not every.

15 TED WEINSTEIN: Let me, not every project
16 has that. Not every project would have that but one
17 of the things that we do try to do is through the
18 variety of sites that get developed through our
19 programs, each different proj, different locations
20 serve different needs, some serve some type of needs,
21 some serve other types of needs, some serve old
22 needs. This project, this was considered the
23 opportunity to try to serve the need of addressing
24 the homeless crisis.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

RAFAEL SALAMANCA: So again, my frustration with lines to address those needs always in poor communities. So you are telling me that you think it is appropriate for 169 units that only 18 units are 40% and 50% AMI? I'm sorry. So you have 9 units which is 5% of the project at 40% AMI and another 9 units which is another 5% of the project at 50% AMI. So you are telling me that in the poorest Congressional District in the state or nation, HPD thinks its appropriate to only provide 10% of 169 units which is 18 units to 50% and 40% AMI and totally excluding the 30% AMI bracket?

TED WEINSTEIN: Uhm again this, this is a.

RAFAEL SALAMANCA: It's wrong, it's wrong, I.

TED WEINSTEIN: I understand what you are saying.

RAFAEL SALAMANCA: It's wrong and 40% of your units which is 67 units at 60% AMI and then 20% of your units at 80% AMI. I really encourage when you sit down, another question, Community Builders, how many times have you met with my colleague on this project?

1
2 DESIREE ANDREPONT: We've met uhm with
3 Council Member Ayala once since.

4 RAFAEL SALAMANCA: Okay.

5 DESIREE ANDREPONT: She has been in
6 office.

7 RAFAEL SALAMANCA: Well, you know, I'm
8 the new chair of the Land Use Committee and I am
9 getting involved in every project that happens in the
10 City of New York and I will be working with my
11 colleague and I will support my colleague every way
12 possible and I have encouraged my colleague to really
13 look into this, in terms of changing the MIH to
14 option 1 and also changing the composition of the
15 project to getting a mix and match which gives us,
16 which gives her a better opportunity to negotiate
17 what is appropriate for that community. We all know
18 that 10% homeless set aside is what is mandatory in
19 city projects and what is frustrating is that HPD
20 decided to use MIH option 2 at that and then go with
21 a 30% homeless set aside which gives my colleague 0
22 units at 30% AMI and that is wrong. Thank you Mr.
23 Chair.

24 LACEY TAUBER: Uhm, I just want to
25 reiterate on behalf of HPD that you know, we are

1
2 looking, we have made a commitment already to go back
3 and look at this, uhm what we really want to do is
4 ensure though that we can keep uhm enough of the
5 wholeness set aside to support the work of BronxWorks
6 in this project. Uhm I think that, you know,
7 they've, they've let us know that they need a certain
8 amount in order to do this work and bring that
9 benefit to the community and that is something that
10 we want to also prioritize here but we absolutely
11 hear you about the units for the residents in your
12 community and that is something that we are going to
13 look at and see if we can figure something out that
14 works for both.

15 DESIREE ANDREPONT: As the developer we
16 are equally committed to making sure that we have
17 something that works for the folks in the community
18 itself. So it is something, I think there are some
19 things that we could look at, what is underwritten
20 here and follows the term sheet guidelines but we can
21 go back and look at how we can address some of the
22 affordability issues that you have.

23 DIANA AYALA: Something yeah we can
24 discuss that.

25

1
2 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: So I believe there are
3 a lot of outstanding questions from the Council
4 Member from the Land Use Chair and also from me, uhm
5 in the time that we have I am hoping that HPD will
6 use its emanate domain powers to reach out to the
7 additional property owners to see if we can free
8 those additional spaces up. They may be the space
9 that we need for a larger fresh site, it may be the
10 space we need to get to lower levels of
11 affordability. I am going to excuse this panel. I
12 am going to recess this hearing briefly so that we
13 can take a vote on two items that have previously
14 been heard by this committee and then we will resume
15 on this very application. The first project that we
16 will vote on is a Special Project Loan for 165 West
17 80th Street Application, Land Use Item 41 in Council
18 Member Rosenthal's District in Manhattan. HPD seeks
19 an Urban Development Action Area Project UDAAP
20 Approval presumed to section 6094 of the General
21 Municipal Law and article 11 40-year full tax
22 exemption approval to section 57z7 of the private
23 housing finance law. These actions will facility the
24 transfer and rehabilitation of 165 West 80th Street
25 through the sponsor. She will purchase and redevelop

1 the building under Special Project Loan Program. The
2 existing building currently contains 39 studio
3 apartments, 15 of which are occupied. The sponsor
4 will rehabilitate the building so that upon
5 completion the project will provide approximately 29
6 affordable cooperative dwelling units, 20 studios, 9
7 one bedrooms and one superintendant unit. The
8 occupied units will be sold to the existing tenants
9 to average at 65% to the AMI for \$250 per dwelling
10 unit and vacant units will be sold for a price
11 affordable to family earning no more than 120% of
12 AMI. There is a letter of support from Council
13 Member Rosenthal. We will also be voting to approve
14 Land Use Items 42 and 43, the CUCS West 127th Street
15 Supportive Housing Application in Council Member
16 Perkins District in Manhattan. HPD seeks approval of
17 the Urban Action Development Area Project UADAP,
18 Designation of project approval, Disposition of city
19 owned property and special permit to allow community
20 facility floor area ratio to be applied to
21 development to create supportive and affordable
22 housing. These actions will facilitate the
23 development in a 12-story community facility
24 building, 34 units reserved for homeless adults and
25

1
2 36 units reserved for homeless families all with
3 onsite supportive housing, 46 units affordable to low
4 income individual and families, reserved for
5 households earning 50% to 60% of the AMI and one
6 superintendant unit. There will be a 30 foot outdoor
7 landscaped rear yard with an outdoor patio. Other
8 amenities include fitness room, laundry facility,
9 computer room, teaching kitchen, lounge, community
10 room, rooftop garden and 24-hour security. Uhm
11 Council Member Perkins supports this projects. I
12 will now call for a vote in accordance with the
13 recommendations of Council Member Rosenthal and
14 Perkins to Land Use Items 41 through 43. Counsel
15 please call the roll.

16 COUNSEL: Chair Kallos.

17 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: I vote aye.

18 COUNSEL: Council Member Gibson.

19 VANESSA GIBSON: I vote aye.

20 COUNSEL: Council Member Deutsch.

21 CHAIM DEUTSCH: Aye.

22 COUNSEL: By a vote of three

23 affirmatives, 0 negatives and no extensions the Land
24 Use Items are referred to the full Land Use
25 Committee.

1
2 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: We will leave the vote
3 open until the conclusion of full hearing. I want to
4 thank our uhm Capital Budget Chair, Vanessa Gibson
5 for making her way over and for the chance to go
6 early during the Parks Hearing so I could get here.
7 Excuse you to your next Capital Hearing. So thank
8 you. Uhm, turning back to uhm the Land Use Items
9 Numbers 55, 56 and 57 I would like to now call the
10 next panel. Uhm it appears that we only have uhm 3
11 members of the public testifying this matter. And we
12 have a very large number of people who will be
13 testifying on the WSHFSH also colloquial referred to
14 WISHFISH, so for this one will be asking folks to
15 limit testimony to 5 minutes on the following, public
16 testimony we will ask for about 2 minutes, so we have
17 Pastor David Serrano. Sorry, Pastor Serrano, Jr.
18 From the adjacent church. We have David Serrano, I
19 imagine Sr. from the adjacent church and we have
20 Mohan Montabeak (SP?) from 32 BJ. Uhm each of you
21 will have five minutes. I imagine that the 32 BJ
22 testimony might be shorter and might not take up the
23 full five minutes so we will start with them. And
24 uhm then we will continue on for the remainder of the
25 panel, yes please.

1
2 MOHAN MONTABEAK (SP?): Good afternoon, my
3 name is Mohan Montabeak. I am a Building Service
4 Worker and a member of 32 BJ SEIU. I am here today
5 testifying on behalf of my union. This project is
6 going to create badly needed affordable housing in
7 the Bronx. My union believes that new affordable
8 housing can also create new good jobs. Jobs that pay
9 wages that allow people to afford to put a roof over
10 their head, save for retirement and access health
11 benefits. This should be the city-wide standard.
12 That is why we are urging the subcommittee to urge
13 HPD and the Community Builders to commit to paying
14 the Industry Standard Program Wage to building
15 service workers in the Bronx. My union and I
16 understand how important more affordable housing is
17 for this neighborhood. A good jobs commitment is an
18 important step towards ensuring that this development
19 truly benefits the Bronx. Thank you.

20 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Does anyone have any
21 questions for the 32 BJ person. Uhm just so do you
22 know whether or not the Building Service Workers who
23 will be working on this project will be entitled to
24 any uhm any health benefits or any uhm retirement or
25 is that not known at this time?

1
2 MOHAN MONTABEAK: It is not known yet at
3 this time.

4 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Okay I, I support your
5 cause as I think you have heard some of my questions
6 and I will leave it to you to work with the local
7 member and the developer on this. I would like to
8 excuse you from the panel if that is okay?

9 MOHAN MONTABEAK: You got it.

10 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Whoever would like to
11 go first, please identify yourself, feel free to
12 scootch (SP?) over there, there's two microphones.

13 DAVID SERRANO SR.: Uhm My name is David
14 Serrano I am the pastor of the Thessalonica Christian
15 Church for the last 28 years. Uhm but the church is
16 serving that community for 79 years, uhm we have a
17 lot of programs for the community but our building is
18 too small. That's why, in 1992 when I heard that the
19 uhm Park Department was going to extend People's Park
20 to the lot that we would mention uhm we did a
21 proposal to the Land Use Board to let us use that
22 land uhm to build a church and use our building as a
23 community center. In 1994, we received the answer
24 after meeting with the Commissioner with the State
25 and he agreed with us to make what we call a swap,

1
2 uhm, David Rosala (SP?) was an Assembly Member at
3 that time so he got a 9 Foot Park and Recreation that
4 is located at Brown Place and 137th uhm they still a
5 park there and they agreed to make a swap. What it
6 was going to do, they were going to reuse the
7 property to HPD an uhm and HPD started dealing with
8 us to acquiring the property and we stared doing
9 that. We started working at that but sorry, there
10 was located at Longwood Avenue in the Bronx, they
11 moved to 100 Gold Street but we didn't know anything
12 about it before the moved. They never said to us
13 that they were going to move, eventhough we were in
14 the process to get the property. So when we find out
15 that they move and we contact them, uhm but they said
16 Mr. Weinstein told us that they misplaced our
17 records. Uhm, so you know they are leaders, I
18 believe that. I ask them, what have we got to do.
19 You have to start the process all over again. Uhm,
20 we started the process all over again but until today
21 I didn't know that they found our records, I don't
22 know if they got them back because I think that is a
23 responsible Department from the City of New York.
24 They moment that they get those files back, they were
25 supposed to call me or send me a letter or a fax and

1
2 let me know we found your records, let's continue
3 with the process. They never let. So we have to
4 start all over again so by that time, uhm it was
5 2005, we got a company called OPM, and we start doing
6 uhm, you know the project and we finish with it. We
7 present it to HPD and we don't know what happened
8 because they never called back. They spoke to our,
9 Planning Board Representative and he told me, told me
10 our member going through the process that we rejected
11 the plan. In the meantime, when we had the meeting
12 with them, they liked the plan, they gave us a price
13 for the lot, they said that within a week we were
14 supposed to receive the number to continue the
15 process until today they never did. So you know we
16 keep, we, that was my problem, I keep believing what
17 they were saying, so we went, I called Mr. Weinstein,
18 I told him, listen we want to do the right thing here
19 what are we supposed to do now? Do you have some
20 better person you can let us know who they are that
21 work with you because we don't want to make the same
22 mistake. Okay he gave us three names, we went, we
23 contacted them and we choose Full Spectrum. Full
24 Spectrum by that time was working on a green

1
2 technology so they were, they were highly
3 recommended, when I.

4 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: So I think you have
5 another person who can testify for the remainder of
6 five minutes and if you want to, they can continue
7 with the same testimony or make the, make the case.

8 DAVID SERRANO SR: Okay, thank you.

9 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Thank you for
10 everything you do in the community.

11 DAVID SERRANO JR: Uhm David Serrano Jr.,
12 the son of this man here. I just wanted to uhm I
13 started working heavily with my father in the
14 community when I was about 21. And I am 45, I will
15 be 45 now and so I've been in the South Bronx working
16 in the community for quite a few years and uhm we
17 have helped people get over their addictions, we have
18 helped families get back together. We've been, we've
19 had boots on the ground seeing what the community
20 needs and seeing who the community is and honestly
21 here I'm just here to, to voice or to reiterate some
22 of the concerns that have already been expressed. I
23 have trouble believing that somebody that isn't from
24 here, or from the South Bronx, right, who doesn't
25 live there and see the people there and hug the

2 people there and cry with the people there, how is it
3 that they are qualified to know what our people need?
4 How does that make sense to anybody unless all we are
5 considering is money? If that is all that we are
6 considering then I am going to be disappointed in the
7 decisions that our city is making. If we are really
8 concerned about the people then we've got to look a
9 little bit beyond that. I understand that dollars
10 and cents at the end of the day they are relevant in
11 the matter but you know I agree, we have homeless
12 people, we have homeless vets, we have single moms,
13 we have kids that are struggling, that are, that are
14 involved in serious gangs that are not good for them.
15 What are we going to do about that? Right, a
16 supermarket is not going to help any of those
17 situations at all. Uhm and so my concern and my plea
18 is please let us just not look at just what is
19 financially practical, let's look at what our people
20 need, the members of our community, the citizens of
21 our city, what they need, not what is going to look
22 good at the end of the day. Uhm you know on
23 someone's resume or let's look at what our people
24 need, what our citizens need and let's try to address
25 those concerns. Uhm, I really believe that the City

1
2 is full of people of honor and integrity that at the
3 end of the day just want to help the people of New
4 York City and I think that has to begin by making
5 sure that the people that are going to develop and
6 build are from New York City. If someone has never
7 walked down St. Anne's Avenue, if you've never
8 purchased milk from the corner store, how are you
9 going to tell me what it is that our people need
10 there. And sorry I'm a preacher so I get a little
11 emotional but the reality is I agree, I agree with
12 our Council Members, right, how are we going to build
13 something that is in essence ignoring the real needs
14 of the people that live there? It seems to me that
15 there is another agenda that doesn't have it at its
16 core the individuals that live in our city and on our
17 streets right now. Thank you.

18 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Do you want to send
19 the remaining two minutes back to your father?

20 DAVID SERRANO JR.: Sure.

21 DAVID SERRANO SR: Yes, thank you I just
22 want you to know that I have been working in that
23 community for 28 years like I said before and I have
24 been a liaison in the Ricker's Island, I have been a
25 liaison in the service of the 40 Precinct. I have

1
2 been part of the Community Council, I've been part of
3 the Community Board. I've been working with Habitat
4 of Humanity so I've been working in that community
5 for 28 years. Uhm, I'm here to say that I believe
6 that the process that HPD used it wasn't fair to us
7 to the church, to our community, it wasn't fair.
8 Like I told you.

9 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: How was, did you bid
10 on this as well?

11 DAVID SERRANO SR: Yes we did.

12 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: So in terms of the,
13 uhm what your, your son had said in terms of what the
14 community needs, how, what was your proposal versus
15 the proposal that ended up getting selected?

16 DAVID SERRANO SR: Do you want to answer
17 that?

18 DAVID SERRANO JR: We just, we had a lot
19 of more community, we had a lot more community
20 oriented programming. Uhm afterschool programs for
21 the kids, watching, what's the word I'm looking for,
22 daycare for our single parents, that are in the, in
23 the neighborhood, housing for vets which is a
24 problem, uhm you know, helping to reform individuals
25 that have been incarcerated and now are struggling to

1 find work. That is a problem. Right? And so but
2 again I'm not sure that we, that you, we can be aware
3 of these problems unless we are walking the streets.
4

5 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: And so I, how many
6 units of affordable housing were included in your
7 proposal or, you don't have to.

8 DAVID SERRANO SR: In the beginning it
9 was only 80 because of the zoning. But with the
10 change of the zoning we could do more than 150.

11 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: So your proposal may
12 have been a little bit more modest because you didn't
13 include a zoning change?

14 DAVID SERRANO SR: Yes. But that was in
15 2005 because after that and that's the one that we
16 submitted and they, never answered, at least the
17 church, the community and me, we never know why they
18 rejected.

19 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: And the, and so you
20 bid in 2005 but not on the current RFD?

21 DAVID SERRANO SR: Yes we did.

22 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Okay.

23 DAVID SERRANO SR: Because after that,
24 what we did is when we went to them they gave us
25 three, like I told you three developers so we

1 gathered, we spoke to Full Spectrum, we decided with
2 Full Spectrum. When we, we was about the do the
3 presentation to HPD, HPD told our member, that we was
4 unable to use Full Spectrum because they have a
5 financial problem, a financial situation.
6

7 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: So your frustration,
8 is the folks, the developer that you were introduced
9 to by HPD or one of them wasn't qualified and that
10 ended up being the one that you ended up selecting.
11 Okay.

12 DAVID SERRANO SR: Not only yeah because
13 after that we chose another developer Evan Hart
14 Developer Corporation and when we was about to do the
15 presentation, HPD had a situation with the building
16 and they called Evan Hart to fix the situation. Evan
17 Hart was unable to fix the situation so they told a
18 member of the church, told the pastor he cannot use
19 Evan Hart because he has a problem with us.

20 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: So they said no, so
21 they said no to two out of the three that they
22 recommended?

23 DAVID SERRANO SR: Yes.
24
25

1
2 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Would you, would you
3 forward to this committee the various proposals that
4 you submitted?

5 DAVID SERRANO SR: Uhm sure.

6 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Perfect.

7 DAVID SERRANO SR: Definitely and
8 although.

9 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: You can send it to
10 bkallos@benkallos.com, I'll give you a card.

11 DIANA AYALA: I have questions.

12 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: I would like to turn
13 it to Council Member Ayala for questions?

14 DIANA AYALA: (SPEAKING SPANISH). Pastor
15 so, I have, I mean I'm trying to get to a place where
16 I kind of, where I have a better understanding of how
17 you, you feel that we can be helpful. Uhm this is a
18 complicated uhm issue that dates back to 24 years and
19 so it becomes a little bit difficult for me to kind
20 of you know come in 24 years later into the
21 conversation. Uhm, I'm, I'm just trying to figure
22 out how it, how it is that you feel that we can be
23 helpful?

24 DAVID SERRANO SR: I can give you all the
25 papers, the letter, everything concerning the swap

1
2 that we did with Park and Recreation, everything
3 concerning the letters that we sent to HPD, asking
4 them to answer what we, the proposal. We have all
5 the letters, we have all the information that you
6 need. I can give you the package, you can review the
7 package and then we can sit down and talk about it
8 but whatever you want to ask me you can do it now.

9 DIANA AYALA: So we did submit, you
10 submitted, you asked, you sent us a series of
11 questions that you wanted HPD to respond to. We did
12 email those to you this afternoon, I don't know if
13 you had an opportunity to review them.

14 TED WEINSTEIN: No.

15 DIANA AYALA: But a lot of them had to do
16 with the swap or the conversation of there ever being
17 some sort of an agreement to swap lots. There
18 doesn't seem to be on HPDs part you know any
19 evidence, and uhm physical evidence that there was a
20 deal so if you have any information.

21 DAVID SERRANO SR: Yes we do.

22 DIANA AYALA: In writing that would
23 attest to that you know I am happy to review it. I
24 think that I just want to be very clear you know that
25 this project before I became Council Member and you

1 know it is pretty uhm it's advanced at this point.
2
3 And even if we, even if assuming that everything you
4 know that could go wrong went wrong tomorrow, uhm we
5 cannot guarantee that the church would be awarded
6 site control and so I want to make that very clear.
7 Uhm I am happy to have the discussion with you but I
8 think that, there has been an opportunity to have
9 this discussion along the way, ULAR processes are on
10 a time clock and so you know you went to the
11 Community Board. I know that you have had
12 conversations with the borough President. I have had
13 conversations with our staff as well regarding this
14 project and you know all parties seem to agree that
15 there was enough time for the church to actually
16 develop this site and that every deal kind of fell
17 through because the church did not, could not, did
18 not have a developer that I guess was suitable or
19 that was eligible I'm not sure because this is 24
20 years of activity that I was not privy to.

21 DAVID SERRANO SR: Can I just answer you?

22 DIANA AYALA: Yes.

23 DAVID SERRANO SR: Why if that was the
24 case, let's say that we did the presentation and they
25 didn't like the developer, uhm why didn't call us and

1 sit down with us and let us know that was a problem
2 because they never talked. We never know until
3 today, HPD never said why they rejected the pro, the
4 project until today. So why didn't call us and set
5 up a meeting and let us know, listen, the developer,
6 the developer that you are going to use is no good,
7 get another one, you know how many developers are
8 crazy to do a project like that there.

10 DAVID SERRANO JR: If I could add, I mean
11 really what is the worst case developer that we get
12 somebody outside New York City that has never
13 developed here.

14 DIANA AYALA: I guess in HPDs perspective
15 that you got a developer that doesn't have the
16 financial means to really support this, this type of
17 project, that's what I mean and I think that that is
18 what they saw and and again I, we can have a further
19 conversation but I want to be very clear about
20 expectation here and that you know this is a project
21 that has accelerated to the point where we are almost
22 finalizing the ULAR process and that is on a clock
23 and that is very difficult to stop it once it already
24 begun unless there is a real, you know, a real reason
25 to do that but even if I did that, even I had the

1
2 authority to do that I could not guarantee that this
3 site is going to be turned over to the church and so
4 I would like to add that as part of this process the
5 church would benefit from additional air space. I
6 believe the Land Use, the Zoning Law would also
7 impact your lot and so that it would afford the
8 church an opportunity to build on their lot and you
9 can build the affordable housing that you are looking
10 for, you can build yourself a brand new church as
11 part of this agreement but I cannot guarantee, so
12 that's an added plus to this because if you know it
13 wasn't, I don't know if that was originally part of
14 the plan but that's exactly what will happen.

15 DAVID SERRANO SR: So what you are saying
16 is that even though we find out that it was no fair,
17 it wasn't fair that what they did even though we
18 prove you that we get everything ready for them to do
19 it with us uhm you can stop this?

20 DIANA AYALA: Well you, you haven't
21 proven that yet. You can submit to us, you can
22 submit to, to our chair, whatever documentation you
23 have and we will seriously review that.

24 DAVID SERRANO SR: Okay I left the book.

25 DIANA AYALA: Who has the book?

1
2 DAVID SERRANO SR: I don't know who has
3 the book.

4 DIANA AYALA: Our Land Use Division has
5 the book we will review it and we will have a
6 conversation with you.

7 DAVID SERRANO SR: Okay please of course,
8 you know what I am saying is if we have, if the
9 process was unfair.

10 DIANA AYALA: Then we will catch that.

11 DAVID SERRANO SR: Good.

12 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: I want to thank you
13 for being a quite long hearing that started late. I
14 wanted to thank Council Member Ayala for her
15 leadership on this. She has the full support of the
16 Land Use Chair, myself and the Land Use Staff and we
17 look forward to supporting you on this. Are there
18 any other members of the public who wish to testify
19 on this matter? Seeing none I will close the public
20 hearing on this application. I will actually turn
21 this over briefly to Council Member Levine who will
22 lead us on Land Use Item 58 prior to getting to a
23 matter in his District.

24 MARK LEVINE: Okay. This is Mark here to
25 reek havoc on this Subcommittee. Free housing for

1
2 everybody. Uhm, I wish I had that power. Uhm,
3 forgive me while I read the more boring official
4 text. Our next hearing is on Land Use Item 58, which
5 is 500 West 174th Street and HDFC Tax Exemption
6 Application for property located in Council Member
7 Rodriguez's District in Manhattan pursuant to article
8 11 of the Private Housing Finance Law. This 40-year
9 tax exemption would not only facilitate the
10 renovation of the building but also remove the
11 property from the list of buildings slated for 3rd
12 Party Transfer Round 10 Foreclosure Actions. So I
13 will now open up the public hearing on Land Use Item
14 58. We have Artie Pearson, who has asked to testify,
15 well not asked to. Is testifying from HPD. Please.

16 ARTIE PEARSON: Afternoon, I'm Artie
17 Pearson.

18 COUNSEL: Let me just do the affirmation.
19 Please state your names.

20 ARTIE PEARSON: Artie Pearson.

21 MALCOLM MORSE: Malcolm Morse.

22 COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the
23 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in
24 your testimony before the Subcommittee and response
25 to all Council Member questions?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ARTIE PEARSON: Yes.

MALCOLM MORSE: Yes.

ARTIE PEARSON: Land Use Number 58

consists of an exemption area containing one
privately owned building located at 500 West 174th
Street that is block 2130 lot 44 in Manhattan Council
District 10. This property is the candidate for the
End Foreclosure Action 3rd Party Transfer Round 10
and Realm Action 51 for which HPD is seeking article
11 Tax Benefits. 500 West 174th Street was taken
into city ownership in 1978 and subsequently entered
in to the Tenant Interim Lease Program. On October
27, 1992, HPD conveyed the property to the existing
occupants as a low income cooperative with no
household earning more than 120% of AMI. The
building is a mixed use 6-story walk up with 27
residential units and 3 commercial spaces. It is
fully occupied and comprises 51 buildings, one
bedrooms, 17 two bedrooms, and 5 three bedroom
apartments and shareholders have either passed away
or moved the HDFC had fewer resources to draw from in
order to meet tax obligations and other operating
expenses. Therefore the property became a candidate
for foreclosure. Currently the shareholders have

1 worked out a plan to help save their buildings which
2 includes entering into an installment with the
3 Department of Environmental Protection in order to
4 address arrears. The building has been working with
5 a new property manager and within the last 12 months
6 worked toward resolving outstanding repair issues as
7 well as vacant units to bring in more revenue. It
8 recently receives a DAMP Partial Abatement and no
9 preservation loan is needed, I'm sorry they currently
10 have a DAMP CAP Partial Tax Abatement and no
11 Preservation Loan is needed. With the required 2%
12 increase of maintenance fees under program guidelines
13 and the timely collection of such fees the HFC will
14 have sufficient reserve funds for future needs. An
15 effort to help maintain affordability and stability
16 in the building, HPDs for the Council, is before the
17 Council seeking an article 11 Tax Exemption for a
18 term of 40-years that will coincide with their
19 Regulatory Agreement. Approval of the Tax Benefits
20 will facilitate removal of 500 West 174th Street HDFC
21 from consideration as a candidate for Round 10 Aiding
22 and Long-Term Home Ownership by the shareholders.
23
24
25

1
2 MARK LEVINE: Thank you Director Pearson,
3 thank you both and we are going to move on to our
4 next panel.

5 ARTIE PEARSON: Okay thank you.

6 MARK LEVINE: We appreciate you very much
7 and that will be Eva Hermida Ramos (SP?) here to
8 testify on this same Land Use Item if she is still
9 here. Okay.

10 EVA HERMIDA RAMOS (SP?) Okay I am Eva
11 Hermida Ramos. (SPEAKING SPANISH). Thank you. Okay.
12 I am Eva Hermida Ramos I live in 500 West 174 for a
13 long time ago. Before the building became a
14 corporation. I think so more than 32 years old to
15 live in there. Uhm, my building is, my building is
16 27 units, 3 business. Uhm my reason that I coming
17 over here because I didn't know about the meeting
18 somebody told me last night at 8:30 a... uhm p.m.
19 that building or the that place has a big meeting to
20 discuss or to talk about something or a solution that
21 HPD have so for that, 11, extension 11 but I was
22 called to Mr. Moses from HPD and then he told me it's
23 true the meeting will be coming over here to present
24 my building problem or the building problem. My
25 issue that I coming over here is because I am very

1 frustrated for a long time ago, always I will go to
2 HPD to try to get the best solution for my
3 corporation but I never receive any help. Many
4 people in HPD gave it to me or to show me, many
5 solutions but when I went over there to try to
6 resolve every single problem that we have in the
7 corporation, economy problem because the building is
8 okay. Nobody help me. Nobody didn't tell me the
9 problems that the big problems and big solution that
10 HPD have for building like my building. And then I
11 went, I went to different places, I went to
12 different, I went to different, different political
13 people to try to get the best solution for us and
14 never nobody didn't care. I think is because that
15 people to live in there is the Spanish people.
16 Nobody didn't help us. Nobody didn't.

18 MARK LEVINE: (SPEAKING SPANISH).
19 (SPEAKING SPANISH). Some of the issues that you are
20 raising are beyond the scope of this hearing.

21 (SPEAKING SPANISH).

22 EVA HERMIDA RAMOS: Uh-huh.

23 MARK LEVINE: (SPEAKING SPANISH).

24 EVA HERMIDA RAMOS: Uh-huh.

25 MARK LEVINE: (SPEAKING SPANISH).

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

EVA HERMIDA RAMOS: (SPEAKING SPANISH).

MARK LEVINE: Okay.

EVA HERMIDA RAMOS: (SPEAKING SPANISH).

MARK LEVINE: Okay, let me just pause and explain, we do unfortunately have to move on. I'm very sorry you weren't informed of the hearing. In order for this matter to have come so far in the Land Use process your board would have a did agree to a Regulatory Agreement one that by, by all appearances will be a great financial benefit to the building uhm which will provide I believe 40-years of Tax Relief to the building so I'm sorry to hear about challenges that you have had accessing HPD services and local elected officials. Uhm, I'm not your Council Member, I'm your member to the south and I'm happy to help uhm support you in that role in any way that I can. (SPEAKING SPANISH). We do have to move on.

(SPEAKING SPANISH).

EVA HERMIDA RAMOS: Okay but can you give it to me, your office, your place that I have to go to next because I think, everything, my building to have to decide, where do I start to go to find somebody to help us.

1
2 MARK LEVINE: I will give you my card,
3 again I'm not your Council Member but happy to
4 support you, I truly believe in HDFCs. (SPEAKING
5 SPANISH).

6 EVA HERMIDA RAMOS: Thank you.

7 MARK LEVINE: Thank you very much. Okay
8 we are going to move on to our. Forgive me. Are
9 there any more members of the public who would like
10 to testify on this matter, this Land Use Item. Oh
11 no, thank you for coming. Seeing none I'm now going
12 to close the hearing on this application and we are
13 going to move on now uhm to the main event. We've
14 been through the undercards, now the prize fight
15 which is uhm Land Use Item 52 through 54. Three Land
16 Use Items we are going to be considering uhm which is
17 our West 108th Street an Application by the Westside
18 Federation for Senior and Supportive Housing aka
19 WSFSSH and its in my own District, Council Member
20 Levine's District, the applicant HPD seeks a Zoning
21 Map Change, a Zoning Text Amendment to MAP the area
22 as a Mandatory Inclusion Area Housing area utilizing
23 option 2 and an Urban Development Action Area Project
24 Approval including the authority to sell city owned
25 property for this project. If approved, a community

1 facility containing approximately 280 supported and
2 affordable residential units would be developed as a
3 new transitional shelter with approximately 110 beds
4 and replacement ambulance parking. In a later phase
5 of the project approximately 80 senior housing units
6 would be developed. Under the current zoning RAB, a
7 community facility has a floor area ratio of 4.1 and
8 is limited to 75 feet in height. Under the proposed,
9 RAA zoning a community facility would have a floor
10 area ratio of 6.5 and a height of 145 feet or 14
11 stories with a qualifying ground floor. The
12 residential floor area ratio would increase under the
13 proposed zoning from 4.0 to 7.2. I am now going to
14 open up the public hearing on Land Use Items 52
15 through 54 and we have here I believe our, staller
16 representative from HPD, Kevin Parris, Paul Freitag
17 from WSFSSH, Ross Karp from HPD and our own Lacey
18 Tauber from HPD and I am going to ask the Committee
19 Counsel to administer the affirmation.
20

21 COUNSEL: Please state your names.

22 LACEY TAUBER: Lacey Tauber Government
23 Affairs and HPD.

24 ROSS KARP: Ross Karp, HPD.

25 KEVIN PARRIS: Kevin Parris, HPD

2 PAUL FREITAG: Paul Freitag, WSFSSH.

3 COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the
4 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in
5 your testimony before the Subcommittee and in
6 response to all Council Member questions?

7 LACEY TAUBER: Yes.

8 ROSS KARP: Yes.

9 KEVIN PARRIS: Yes.

10 PAUL FREITAG: Yes.

11 COUNSEL: Thank you. You may begin.

12 MARK LEVINE: Alright you may begin.

13 LACEY TAUBER: Land Use numbers 52, 53,
14 and 54 are related unit of actions seeking a zoning
15 map amendment, establishment of a Mandatory Inclusion
16 Housing Area, UDAP Designation and Project
17 Disposition Approval for three city owned sites
18 located at 103-107, 137-143 and 151-159 West 108th
19 Street in Manhattan. Council District 7, the project
20 is known as WSFSSH at West 108th Street to be
21 developed under the Supportive Housing Loan Program.
22 The Supportive Housing Loan Program provides funds
23 for the rehabilitation of existing buildings or for
24 new construction buildings that provide supportive
25 housing for the homeless, people with special needs

1
2 and other persons of low income. HPD works with the
3 Department of Homeless Services as well as other
4 public agencies to ensure that the completed projects
5 meet programmatic guidelines. The sponsor of the
6 project West Side Federation for Senior and
7 Supportive Housing WSFSSH was selected through a
8 competitive process and proposes to combine the city
9 owned lots with a privately owned lot located at 183
10 lot 10 forming the project area. The city owned lots
11 contain active public parking garages all of which
12 operate on a month to month lease between the city
13 and garage operators. The private lot, lot 10 is the
14 current location of the Valley Lodge Shelter and
15 provides transitional housing for homeless seniors
16 with a capacity of 92 shelter beds. Under LU54, the
17 sponsor plans to construct two 11 story buildings
18 with affordable and supportive housing units as well
19 as community facility spaces on the disposition area
20 and adjacent private lot. The project will be build
21 in two phases, an eastern building and a western
22 building. In total, there will be approximately 279
23 units for occupancy by homeless and low income
24 persons plus 2 units for superintendants as well as a
25 new transitional housing facility containing

1 approximately 110 shelter beds. Formerly homeless
2 tenants referred by DHS and other city agencies will
3 pay up to 30% of their income as rent. Other tenants
4 will pay rent set up to 30% to 60% of the Area Median
5 Income (AMI) on an annual basis. The, I think that
6 was suppose to be 32 not 30F. The western buildings
7 will be the first phase and includes 119 supportive
8 units all of which will be studios and 79 affordable
9 units that breakdown as follows, 53 one bedroom, 18
10 two bedroom and 8 three bedroom apartments. Rents
11 will vary from \$191 for a supportive studio at the
12 30% AMI tier to \$1321 for a three bedroom in the 60%
13 AMI tier. The building will be energy efficient and
14 amenities will include 24 hour security, community
15 room, administrative offices, social service offices
16 and will also contain space for the Central Park
17 Medical Unit (CPMU) which is a volunteer ambulance
18 service offering free emergency medical care
19 throughout Central Park. The space will be for an
20 office and enclosed parking for approximately 3 CPMU
21 ambulances when not in use. The building would also
22 include a new public restroom and storage area for
23 the adjacent Anibal Aviles Playground as a federally
24 qualified health center that is available to the
25

1 residents and the public in partnership with the
2 Institute for Family Health. On site social services
3 will be available to all residents. During the
4 construction period, residents of the Valley Lodge
5 Shelter will be relocated to a facility in community
6 District 7. Post construction, the shelter will be
7 returned to the West 108th Street location and will
8 contain 110 beds. It should be noted that the
9 proposed shelter enlargement for Valley Lodge exceeds
10 25% of its current floor area meeting the requirement
11 for a Fair Share Analysis which was conducted by the
12 Department of Homeless Services in conjunction with
13 this application. The Fair Share Analysis determined
14 that the use of the site is appropriate and
15 consistent with the criteria for the location of city
16 facilities. The second phase of the project includes
17 the construction of the eastern building that will
18 provide 81 units of Senior Supportive Housing and one
19 superintendants unit. The building will also contain
20 community event spaces and an office suite for
21 WSFSSH's support service. LU number 52 seeks a
22 Zoning Map Amendment to change an R8B Zoning District
23 to an R8A District that will provide sufficient floor
24 area for the intended design and use of the
25

1 development. LU number 53 seeks a Zoning Text
2 Amendment to MAP an MIH area utilizing option 2.
3 Because the proposed project would be community
4 facility use group 3 which is for profit or nonprofit
5 institutions with sleeping accommodations it would
6 not required MIH compliance. However, if a site were
7 to be developed for residential use in the future,
8 compliance with option 2 would be required. In order
9 to facility construction of the WSFSSH at West 108th
10 Street Project HPD is before the Planning
11 Subcommittee requesting approval of LU numbers, 52,
12 53, and 54 and now I am going to turn it over to
13 WSFSSH to talk through more details of the project.

14
15 PAUL FREITAG: Okay. Good afternoon, my
16 name is Paul Freitag I am the executive director of
17 the West Side Federation for Senior and Supportive
18 Housing otherwise known as WSFSSH. Last year WSFSSH
19 celebrated our 40th Anniversary of providing housing
20 and services to older New Yorkers on the upper West
21 Side. We have a very, very long term commitment to
22 this community. Uhm beginning with our very first
23 building the Marseilles Apartment located at Broadway
24 and 103rd. WSFSSH has now grown to include 26
25 buildings located on the West Side in Harlem and also

1
2 in the South Bronx with over 2000 apartments. We
3 develop, we own, we manage and we provide services in
4 all of our buildings and I believe that the
5 comprehensive nature of our mission is the key to our
6 success. I would like to say that during our 40 year
7 history we have seen a reduction in the need for
8 affordable housing but unfortunately this is not the
9 case. Today there are over 200,000 older New Yorkers
10 on waiting lists for affordable housing apartments
11 and WSFSSH has actually had to close almost all of
12 our waiting lists because the time that you would be
13 on a waiting list often exceeds the expected life
14 span of the resident on the waiting list. In
15 community District 7 and 9 it is estimated that there
16 are 44,000 seniors currently on waiting lists that
17 would have them waiting more than 10 years. So first
18 to talk about the project. This was already
19 introduced but just to go through it uhm quickly. We
20 are proposing that, I would like to first talk about
21 the program for this project. So this is a 100%
22 affordable development which includes 275 permanently
23 affordable apartments uhm in a mix of studios, one
24 and two bedroom apartments, one two and three bedroom
25 apartments. Additionally, the development will allow

1 us to expand Valley Lodge our transitional shelter
2 for older New Yorkers which is operated at this
3 location on West 108th Street for almost 30 years.
4 During its 30 year history, Valley Lodge has helped
5 literally thousands of older New Yorkers transition
6 from homelessness to permanent housing with services.
7 Uhm, this chart shows the distribution of the units
8 and the proposed rents. Uhm the two phase, this is a
9 two phase development with 198 units being built in
10 the first phase and 81 in the second. The Senior
11 Supportive Units will be targeted for older New
12 Yorkers earning 30% of AMI which is affordable to
13 Seniors who are living on a fixed Social Security
14 income. The majority of the family apartments will
15 be for families earning at or below 60% of Area
16 Median Income with a percentage also for individuals
17 at 30% of AMI. For household consisting of a single
18 individual, 60% of AMI is an income is about \$40,000
19 a year. It just as a point of reference and the
20 family units will have a 50% preference for Community
21 Board 7. One of the aspects of this project that I
22 am most excited about is a plan to not only provide
23 high quality affordable housing services but also to
24 bring program elements that will benefit the entire
25

1
2 community not just our residents. Our commitment to
3 serve the greater community has been a focus of our
4 conversation for various community groups during the
5 last two years and I am so pleased to be able to
6 incorporate their feedback into our plans. WSFSSH at
7 West 108 will include the following community
8 services 1) We will be working with the Institute
9 for Family Health, a partner of WSFSSH for almost 30
10 years who will provide a 5,000 square foot community
11 health center where all residents of the upper West
12 Side can receive primary care medical services for
13 themselves and their families. This healthcare will
14 be affordable to all who need it. 2) We heard from
15 the local community about the needs for restrooms in
16 the Anibal Aviles Playground immediately to the west
17 of the phase 1 site and we are incorporating these
18 restrooms into our design. We are happy to learn
19 from our conversations with the Parks Department that
20 with the addition of the restrooms to the playground
21 will allow Parks Department to staff the playground
22 associate who can then provide supervision and
23 programming. 3) In our conversation with
24 Bloomingdale Family Services we learned having a
25 place for them to store equipment near the playground

1
2 would help them provide a richer experience for the
3 children in their daycare and headstart programs that
4 use the playground on a daily basis. We are happy to
5 report that the storage space into our design. 4)
6 During our conver... during our public conversations
7 we learned at the Central Park Medical Unit, a not
8 for profit ambulance corp that provides services in
9 Central Park was seeking a location to store their
10 ambulances when they are not in use. We are happy to
11 provide this for the Central Park Medical Unit and
12 have even had additional conversations with them
13 about how they could use our new building in order to
14 provide first aid classes and other safety focused
15 trainings to uhm to their members and to the
16 community at large. Finally, we have heard from many
17 organizations about the need for public meeting
18 spaces. The proposed building will include a number
19 of meeting spaces of different sizes and we are
20 designing them in such a way so that they can be
21 directly accessed from the sidewalk for use by the
22 greater community for a range of functions and
23 meetings. WSFSSH currently provides community
24 meeting space in several of our existing buildings
25 and we are happy to also provide this community

1 service in this new development. So these two plans
2 show the ground floor level and the lower level, in
3 blue are those spaces that will be dedicated to
4 community serving services and in the orange are
5 those shared WSFSSH and community meeting spaces. So
6 now I would like to move on from the program to the
7 site itself. Uhm this slide shows the existing
8 conditions on West 108th Street between Amsterdam and
9 Columbus. On this is a very a unusual block
10 currently in comparison with the mostly residential
11 East, West blocks on the upper West Side. The north
12 side of the block consists of the three city owned
13 parking garages and WSFSSH's Valley Lodge
14 Transitional Housing and the Anabil Aviles
15 Playground. The southern side of the block is
16 occupied almost entirely by MS 54 and its associated
17 ball fields. Between the playground and the ball
18 fields, a very large percentage of the block consists
19 of open space and both the playgrounds and the ball
20 fields are mapped as parks and will remain as open
21 space into the future. Also of note, is that the
22 existing garages are noncompliant with the current
23 required rear setbacks and extend all the way to the
24 rear lot leading only to the rear of the lot line
25

1 leaving only a very narrow slot between the rear of
2 the garages and the buildings on West 109th Street.

3 This slide shows the proposed site plan, so to the
4 west of Anabil Aviles Playground we have the phase
5 one development and to the east we have the phase two
6 development. Uhm the proposed uhm the proposed phase
7 one building heights, the proposed phase one building
8 heights along the street will range from six to nine
9 stories and after a 15 foot setback will rise to 11
10 stories. Of note is that the proposed building will
11 conform with the required rear setbacks and provides
12 between 30 and 40 feet of breathing room between the
13 rear of the building and the back lot line. This
14 year yard will be landscaped. Go to the beginning.

15 Uhm so this shows the street elevation of the
16 building looking south. Given the length of the
17 facade, of the building, the facade has been
18 organized in a manner to reduce the overall masking
19 along the street. If we look at the far west, the
20 building at the far end, this is actually an existing
21 building. Our building has taken its que from the
22 existing height, stepped up one story to seven
23 stories then sets up to nine stories in the middle
24 and then steps back down to six stories immediately
25

1 adjacent to the playground. Of note, is that the six
2 story portion of the building next to the playground
3 is only marginally taller than the existing garage in
4 that location and therefore will no additional impact
5 in terms of shadows on the playground. Uhm you can
6 see that after a 15 foot setback the building does
7 rise to 11 stories. Let's see. Uhm you can also see
8 in this rendering in the back, the 22-story cathedral
9 tower building which is on the block between 109th
10 and 110th street and not shown in this view is a 17-
11 story residential building down at the corner of
12 Amsterdam and 108 so our proposed building is
13 significantly less high than other buildings in the
14 vicinity. Our goal here was to create a building
15 which would match the scale and context of the
16 existing block but also allow us to maximize the
17 affordable housing apartments and also provide for a
18 very rich blend of community services. In order to
19 do this, we are requesting a Zoning Change from R8B
20 to R8A. However, although R8A could have an allow
21 FAR 7.02, the proposed building will use only an FAR
22 5.3. This lower FAR would be enforced through a land
23 disposition agreement with the city. Uhm this shows
24 the how the facade of the building will appear at
25

1 sidewalk level. The ground floor has been designed
2 with a great deal of transparency to animate the
3 sidewalk and allow views in and out of the spaces.

4 The building has been designed with numerous
5 entrances into the residents, into the community
6 health center with specific entrances that can be
7 used to access the community meeting spaces.

8 Overall, this development will unloading a block that
9 currently is dominated by blank facades and by
10 multiple curb cuts to provide access to the garages.

11 The building that we are presenting here today is the
12 result of a two year process of reaching out to
13 community organizations to present our plans and get
14 their feedback and ideas. Specifically this input
15 has lead to our program of community services that we
16 are proud to have incorporated into this project. I
17 am very grateful for the time that organizations have
18 taken to meet with us and as of today we have 33
19 organizations who have signed on to support our
20 efforts to create affordable housing with community
21 services on West 108th Street. Thank you.

22
23 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Thank you Council
24 Member Levine you want to ask any questions.

1
2 MARK LEVINE: I really enjoyed that power
3 while I had it. Alas, back to being a regular
4 Council Member. I do have several chair of the
5 Health Committee, there is that. I do have several
6 questions uhm for you after a very thorough
7 presentation, uhm could it would perhaps be an HPD
8 question, could someone explain the status of
9 Avilla's Playground, which I understand uhm is not
10 entirely clear the extent of which is mapped as city
11 parkland or not and what implications that might have
12 for future development in the vicinity.

13 ROSS KARP: Sure, I will speak to that.
14 You are current it is not currently mapped as a park
15 but it is, uhm it is property that is within the
16 jurisdiction of the Department of Parks so it is
17 treated as a park by the Department of Parks and
18 Recreation. So it has, it carries with it all of the
19 designation that a particular park would have it is
20 just not currently mapped as a park.

21 MARK LEVINE: Is it, is there DPA, there
22 Department of Parks and Recreation documentation to
23 confirm that?

24

25

1
2 ROSS KARP: I can, I can send you some
3 clarification documentation about that, in our
4 conversations with parks.

5 MARK LEVINE: And would this then
6 generate, floor, even though it is not mapped as park
7 land would it generate floor area for future adjacent
8 development?

9 ROSS KARP: It would not because its,
10 because it's in the jurisdiction.

11 MARK LEVINE: We lost, we lost audio.
12 Roger. We lost audio. We are back. Alright.

13 ROSS KARP: So just to finish my response
14 so because this is a property that is under the
15 jurisdiction and management of parks it doesn't carry
16 any zoning designation.

17 MARK LEVINE: Is it what is known as a
18 JOP, a Jointly Operated Park.

19 ROSS KARP: Uhm I'm not clear if it's
20 under that designation, I can find out for you
21 though.

22 MARK LEVINE: Okay, we are just concerned
23 that if it generates floor area and uhm god forbid
24 WSFSSH would change its plan for the eastern building
25

1 that then we could wind up with a very, very, very
2 tall structure there.

3
4 ROSS KARP: Understood. I can get back
5 to the Council with or conversations with Parks about
6 this site.

7 MARK LEVINE: Okay and can you explain
8 which phases of this project trigger MIH and to which
9 you could explain one would or would not.

10 ROSS KARP: So because this property is
11 falling under Use Group 3 which is community so with
12 sleeping accommodations, it's not considered, it's
13 not considered residential and you need to be, you
14 need to be, your project needs to be a residential
15 project that is using residential FAR to trigger MIH.

16 MARK LEVINE: But for the eastern
17 building, phase 2, we would trigger MIH because it's.

18 ROSS KARP: That's correct.

19 MARK LEVINE: Even though it would be
20 presumed 100% affordable, I'm not sure what the
21 program there is so.

22 LACEY TAUBER: Right so, oh, sorry, uhm.
23 I don't know what to do here. So yes so we are using
24 the SARA Term Sheet which actually provides deeper
25 affordability levels. This is something about the

1 way I talk yes, okay, oh, but you know what here, let
2 me move my phone, maybe that's the problem. Nope,
3 okay, uhm, so it's really more about what would
4 happen after the Regulatory Agreement would expire if
5 that, if there were something different that would
6 happen. You know, I mean we assume we are going to
7 be working with WSFSSH for as long as we can, you can
8 plan for but I think the idea is for both phases that
9 we would be looking at what would happen after the
10 Regulatory Agreement. I'm going to stop talking.

11
12 MARK LEVINE: Sorry about the microphone.
13 Uhm, just, just to understand so we are concerned
14 about the question of why the phase two site would
15 trigger MIH, only in the eventuality that this 40-
16 year Regulatory Agreement is expired and then and
17 then a future owner could develop it but that even if
18 WSFSSH they had a radical change of mission,
19 hypothetically in the next couple of years, that uhm,
20 this that would still be held to restrictions on the
21 site. Is that correct?

22 ROSS KARP: Yes so, I am Ross Karp, I am
23 the HPD project manager, Special Needs Housing so the
24 first building is being financed with a Supportive
25 Housing Loan Program which because 60% of the

1 building is being set aside for formerly homeless
2 tenants it's classified by DOBS a community facility.
3 The second pha... and so that this building will have
4 a 60-year Regulatory Agreement so whatever happens
5 for the first 60 years Mandatory Inclusionary
6 Housings won't necessary be irrelevant just because
7 the building will be restricted to that use as we
8 build it when we close, the first 60 years. The
9 second phase, the financing has not been fully
10 developed, uhm, we are expecting it to be 100% senior
11 building and so those are often financed under a
12 different loan program where it wouldn't be
13 classified as a community facility and if that is the
14 case then it is classified as a residential building
15 then it will be subject to Mandatory Inclusionary
16 Housing.

17
18 MARK LEVINE: Got it. But to the extent
19 now that we are debating about over which open if MIH
20 we choose, it would have no impact on the program for
21 this building as currently envisioned. Again it is
22 only for the eventuality of this as the agreement
23 expires.

24 ROSS KARP: Yes.

25

1
2 MARK LEVINE: So for phase two the plan
3 is that I think that project begins or construction
4 would begin in 2023, do I have that right? Or maybe
5 demolition begins in 2023? So that's a five year
6 period in which presumably the garage is still going
7 to operate but the site will be owned by WSFSSH is
8 that right?

9 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: No because we are not
10 doing a disposition today on that. Someone can
11 explain that?

12 ROSS KARP: Correct, so the intent is for
13 the first phase we would be doing the disposition for
14 the first garages and then subsequently disposing of
15 the third garage at the time that that project is
16 ready to close?

17 MARK LEVINE: So this ULAP would
18 authorize you to dispose but you wouldn't do that?

19 ROSS KARP: Correct.

20 MARK LEVINE: So it would be status quo
21 on that lot until, until presumably 2022 or whenever?

22 ROSS KARP: Correct.

23 MARK LEVINE: Okay understood. Uhm, how
24 many building service jobs will this project create?

1
2 ROSS KARP: So our estimate is that there
3 will be approximately 17 uhm positions created,
4 building service positions created by the two
5 building. The one building being the shelter and the
6 other being the Permanent Affordable Housing.

7 MARK LEVINE: And have you, estimated
8 phase two?

9 ROSS KARP: We have not estimated phase
10 two.

11 MARK LEVINE: Okay so 17.

12 ROSS KARP: Phase one.

13 MARK LEVINE: On phase one from the two
14 building. Uhm will prevailing wage apply?

15 ROSS KARP: No we will not use prevailing
16 wage in the, for the building service employees, uhm
17 we actually. This is a project that has a great deal
18 of community benefits, we are providing a lot of our
19 community space free of rent and as because it is
20 100% affordable project, obviously we are
21 constrained, we cannot raise the rents in order to
22 generate additional revenue and so for that reason
23 the project has actually been planned in a way that
24 it would not provide prevailing wage for the
25 maintenance workers.

1
2 MARK LEVINE: WSFSSH is not a deep
3 pocketed developer. Your providers in Support of
4 Housing and Homeless shelters so I understand that
5 you are under financial constraints. The City
6 however has a stated mission of creating and
7 supporting good paying jobs with good benefits and
8 this is an opportunity to do that. Building service
9 work has been that kind of employment sector for the
10 city, providing the kind of jobs that people can
11 build a career off of and provide for their families
12 and, and prepare for retirement, etc. There are
13 other projects other ULURPs that have been approved
14 in the last term where we were able to find the
15 funding to provide Prevailing Wage for the Building
16 Service Workers, why can't the City not asking
17 WSFSSH, why can't the City put in the extra funding
18 to make that a reality in this site?

19 ROSS KARP: So uhm, the Supportive
20 Housing Loan Program is already putting in a little
21 bit over our Term Sheet for this project because of
22 the all the community benefits and to be able to
23 provide extra units and 30% AMI which is not
24 something we usually see in our projects. We can of
25 course continue to look into this but I think it

1 would be very hard for HPD to put in more funds in
2 this project.
3

4 LACEY TAUBER: I think some examples of
5 that can happen when there is an opportunity to add
6 more units at higher AMIs which there is just not an
7 opportunity to do in this project because of the way
8 that this loan program works and also doing Senior
9 Housing on the, on the second phase, uhm and then
10 there is actually also an issue with the, the fact
11 that there is a shelter there and it's not super
12 clear uhm what kind of workers in the project would
13 be covered under an agreement and think there are
14 some concerns about, uhm you know from DHS about
15 hiring agreements that could interfere with their
16 ability to enforce their own requirements for
17 building staff, I don't want to speak for DHS but
18 that was something that was brought to our attention
19 and uhm I mean it is something that definitely
20 something that we have looked at but we just don't,
21 we don't really have the opportunity to budge here
22 like we do in some other, some other Term sheets,
23 some other types of financing.

24 MARK LEVINE: Alright this is a City with
25 an \$88 billion Budget, we will see what we approve in

1
2 June. We are talking about uhm probably sub six
3 figures here is the differential in providing the
4 kind of good paying jobs that we, that we know you
5 believe in and the administration believes in, I
6 believe in and the Council believes in so this, this
7 is doable from a funding perspective if we take the
8 big picture on HPDs Budget and the City's Broader
9 Budget and I would employ you to continue to explore
10 creative ways to make that happen. There is, there
11 is something important at stake here that are values
12 are on the line and I think we need to push the
13 envelope to make that happen. Uhm, there is a school
14 across the street from this site, uhm, Booker T.
15 Washington MS 54, has an artificial turf athletic
16 field which is very, very degraded and uhm that's
17 really in need of replacement and I have been
18 strongly advocating that as part of this project to
19 bring back this block to life and to do right by the
20 school which is going to suffer through a difficult
21 construction period that there be a replacement for
22 that turf uhm and I do appreciate one of the very
23 positive signals that I am receiving from the
24 administration on that. Can you say anything about
25 the timing of when such a turf would be installed?

1
2 LACEY TAUBER: Yeah so the funding for
3 the turf is secured uhm and we researched on the
4 timing and they told us that the installation is
5 estimated to begin in 2020, uhm which reflects their
6 Capital Process which includes about a year for
7 design which is set to begin this spring and six to
8 nine months for procurement uhm which includes the
9 bidding period. So.

10 MARK LEVINE: Okay that lead time is very
11 frustrating. I just came from the Parks Capital
12 Budget Hearing, I'm unfortunately quite fluent in the
13 long time it takes to do a Parks Capital Budget but
14 boy this is, this is about as cut and dry as I would
15 think a design project could be. You are, it is a
16 little bit more than unrolling some green carpet but
17 you, you are not talking about a lot of complicated
18 elements here. Uhm, there is no building. There is
19 no comfort station, there is not a ton of
20 horticulture involved. I don't think there is a lot
21 of like regrading on the site needed if any, you are
22 essentially, I am over simplifying but you are
23 replacing a worn out carpet. Uhm I know there will
24 be drainage issues and more as long as we are doing
25 the project but I just don't understand why you would

1 need two years lead time to start work, right, I
2 think that's what you told me, two years lead time to
3 start work, not, not even to complete it. Is that
4 right?
5

6 LACEY TAUBER: Yeah I mean this is, we
7 hear you and this is something that we can take back
8 to Parks and see if there is any opportunity to speed
9 it up.

10 MARK LEVINE: Alright, we are going to
11 continue to push on that. Uhm, so the, the proposed
12 R8 Zoning which would allow 6.5 FAR, uhm sorry the
13 R8A Zoning that we are proposing would allow a 6.5
14 community facility FAR; uhm, however it appears that
15 you are not intending the use the full FAR, you are
16 intending to go up to 5.3, uhm that must not be a
17 common thing in these kinds of processes but uhm,
18 uhm, again looking to the long-term here, how do we
19 ensure that there is no future development that would
20 exceed the 5.3 FAR?

21 ROSS KARP: So as it relates to the
22 WSFSSH Project uhm and our disposition documents and
23 our Land Disposition Agreement Documents we, we are
24 going to, uhm mention or it's going to be in those
25 documents that this project is going to be utilizing

1
2 only the 5.3 FAR and so we are going, we are going to
3 memorialize it in those documents. And as it relates
4 to future projects, correct me if I am wrong, I
5 believe that even in the future project even though
6 we will be disposing to WSFSSH there may be some HPD
7 oversight as far as future developers on this site.

8 MARK LEVINE: Great. Uhm, we have raised
9 real concerns uhm acknowledging the priority of
10 affordable housing amongst the city's needs uhm of
11 what the loss of the parking would be mean for the
12 surrounding community and I have advocated for DOT to
13 identify on street parking that could be added in the
14 surrounding vicinity to help ease the transition and
15 I am wondering if you can update us. It looks like
16 Lacey you have something to say on that?

17 LACEY TAUBER: Yes, I think the mic is
18 working again, that's nice. Uhm so DOT is going to
19 be adding angled parking on 104th Street. There will
20 be a gain of 33 parking spaces, uhm I mean we know
21 that's a fraction of the total that uhm our in the
22 garages now but also WSFSSH has done a really
23 thorough job of assessing parking opportunities
24 within a one mile radius of the site so that if folks
25 who are parking in there now reach out, you know,

1
2 your office or the VPs office of whomever can assist
3 them with finding alternatives.

4 MARK LEVINE: Okay so what can you say
5 about the timing of creation of new on street
6 parking?

7 LACEY TAUBER: Uhm as far as I understand
8 they are ready to go and uhm you know, we can make
9 that happen whenever you feel the timing is right.

10 MARK LEVINE: Right, I would certainly
11 want to open the Community Board before there was any
12 action on the ground there, but as I mentioned given
13 the loss of parking in the garages, some mitigation
14 seems warranted.

15 LACEY TAUBER: Yea, absolutely we can
16 take that back to DOT and make sure that they arrange
17 to talk to the Board.

18 MARK LEVINE: I will also mention that as
19 another mitigation step or another way to give people
20 alternatives, I've worked with DOT to secure
21 expansion of car sharing in the neighborhood which
22 will allow people who might only need a car on the
23 weekends or a trip or two a week uhm to to uhm avoid
24 the burden of having to pay for a car all week when
25 you can just use the car share if it is local and

1 convenient. That doesn't work for everybody but we
2 have heard from constituents who want that so we are
3 adding that to the menu of options.
4

5 LACEY TAUBER: I would just add I think
6 there is an opportunity to add a few more spots if
7 the city bike stations get moved around but may, I
8 think that is something they can discuss with the
9 Community Board.

10 MARK LEVINE: Okay yes, I, I had actually
11 asked DOT to look at that, there are probably as you
12 said probably a chance to move docks from the street
13 to sidewalk and with concentration of the Community
14 Board we should pursue that as well. Uhm the Chair
15 raised a good question which is given concerns about
16 the, the long term fate of the property and we are
17 thinking here very far ahead uhm would it not be
18 appropriate to put a Deed Restriction to Supportive
19 Housing and/or other such uses?

20 ROSS KARP: I don't think any of us
21 probably will be the. Well I think we can get back
22 to you on that as far as the agency's perspective on
23 doing a Deed Restriction at this site to that affect.

24 MARK LEVINE: Okay but we would
25 appreciate you getting back to us on that. Uhm, I, I

1
2 have worked to advocate for the broader community in
3 this process and Paul mentioned a few little things
4 that I think will matter to people who live nearby
5 or, or go to school nearby or have the kids school
6 nearby, I just want to reemphasize them because they
7 are things that we have fought for and we are very
8 excited that WSFSSH has now been able to include
9 and/or HPD including bathroom for Aviles' Playground
10 just sorely needed which would trigger we hope
11 provision of a playground associate by the Parks
12 Department, a staff person who not only cares for the
13 bathroom, that is an important function but runs
14 programming for young people play groups and summer
15 learning activities and it is an extra pair of eyes
16 on the playground so it is just wonderful to have
17 that kind of staff person there on site. I believe
18 Paul also mentioned that they were going to be able
19 to secure storage space for a great early childhood
20 education center, Bloomingdale Family Services that
21 does often bring their kids to the park to play and
22 to have a little bit of storage for their materials
23 and their playgrounds would be very nice for them and
24 we are, we are certainly excited about that. Uhm
25 there is a great need for more meeting space in the

1
2 community and the fact that you are designing kludes
3 (SP?) of meeting space which has a separate street
4 entrance so it really could feel like something the
5 community could be at home at uhm I think will be
6 welcomed and the Central Park Ambulance Corp is just
7 one of these great, great, great little groups that
8 doesn't get the credit it deserves but these are all
9 volunteers who are providing emergency medical care
10 through the park and sometimes in adjacent lots and
11 to have a permanent home for them, a modernized home,
12 uhm is really a great benefit to park users in the
13 Broader Neighborhood and we are very happy that that
14 is going to be part, it is currently part of the
15 design and the uhm the uhm the establishment of a new
16 community clinic, federally qualified health facility
17 is going to provide very much needed low cost medical
18 care services that are going to be available to
19 residents regardless of income and ability to pay and
20 regardless of immigration status and so we are, uhm
21 very excited about that benefit for the community as
22 well. Uhm again I think it is important to consider
23 the broader impact on the community and the needs of
24 the community and they can make an ultimate
25 determination of the project. That is all the

1 questions I have, uhm, I'm going to pass it back to
2 the chair, uhm to perhaps move on to the next panel,
3 I am anxious to hear from the public and/or proceed
4 with his own questions.
5

6 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: So I just want to
7 reiterate Council Members Levine's great
8 questions, and I fully support them and they need
9 to be addressed if it is going to move out of
10 this committee and I do appreciate the idea of
11 throwing a Deed Restriction on there to say that
12 it has to be a nonprofit, that it has to be
13 supportive housing so that if anyone does come as
14 a successor agency and does decide that they want
15 to use the additional FAR that you are being
16 gifted but not using then it will continue with
17 the land. With that being said I do want to just
18 echo Council Member Levine. It seems that what
19 you need is an R7D not an R8A, I am not sure if
20 we received from you the list of changes, the
21 list of waivers that you would need in order to
22 build an R8A it also seems that there appears to
23 be a problem with MIH as designed that should be
24 brought to City Planning and that Supportive
25 Housing being built in an MIH zoned location

1
2 doesn't get the MIH bonus which seems strange so
3 this may be an opportunity to fix that so that if
4 you build 100% Supportive Housing that that
5 should satisfy MIH requirements. Feel free to
6 correct me if I am wrong.

7 ROSS KARP: I did want to speak, you were
8 referring to the R8D I just want to clarify the
9 distinction that for the zoning purposes this
10 project needs to utilize the community facility
11 FAR that's uhm part of the zoning designation so
12 with the R7D understanding is that the community
13 facility FAR is only a 4.2 and this project needs
14 to utilize 5.3 FAR to, to realize its.

15 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: And an R7D what is the
16 Inclusionary Housing Bonus.

17 ROSS KARP: Uhm I believe it brings you
18 up to a 5.6 probably.

19 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: And this whole project
20 is in the, in the first building that you are putting
21 up which is use group 3 by nature of being supportive
22 housing any market rate. Do you have any market rate
23 in any of this development?

24 ROSS KARP: No.

1
2 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Uhm so the question
3 would be that I am asking HPD to bring back to City
4 Planning is why if we build a shelter or if we are
5 building supportive housing why that doesn't satisfy
6 inclusionary housing especially if all the beds are
7 close to each other and there are no separate doors
8 for different people.

9 ROSS KARP: MIH was designed for
10 residential, so but you.

11 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: But the folks are
12 going to be sleeping there, right, they are going to
13 be part of the community, they are going to live
14 there.

15 ROSS KARP: Understood.

16 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: But for the fact that
17 article 2 section Chapter 2 says specifically that
18 nonprofit sleeping accommodations in non R8, R9, and
19 R10 Districts are a different use group than a would
20 be residential. So okay.

21 LACEY TAUBER: And if it was residential,
22 to be clear the MIH would apply.

23 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Right but the MIH only
24 requires a certain percentage be affordable so yeah,
25 just tack on the Deed Restriction it still has to be

1
2 maintain, let's restrict it to 100% affordable
3 supportive housing or shelter and/or all. Okay I
4 would like to excuse this uhm panel and we have our
5 next panels. As mentioned before there are a lot of
6 folks testifying. It appears uhm okay, we have many,
7 many people testifying in favor so we are going to
8 ask those people if they don't mind doing two
9 minutes. We have the DAMCONE (SP?), Friends of Anabil
10 Aviles Playground, Ellen Finney from DOROT, Reverend
11 Alistair Drummond from the West End Presbyterian
12 Church and Lynn Wishert (SP?) from the 5th Avenue
13 Presbyterian Church, slightly out of that
14 neighborhood but welcome and please begin.

15 ALLEN ADANTU (SP?) FRIENDS OF ANABIL
16 AVILES PLAYGROUND: Greeting Chairman Kallos, Council
17 Member Levine, uhm I am here as President of Friends
18 of Anabil Aviles Playground in support of the West
19 108th Street Development proposed by WSFSSH. I was a
20 member of Community Board 7 when the garages were
21 previously up for consideration some 15, 20 years ago
22 and at the time I voted in favor of keeping them as
23 garages rather than allowing them to be sold off to
24 private developers. That was the right decision then
25 but the circumstances have changed now. Now we have

1 a community besieged by Market Rate Development, a
2 record loss of affordable units every year and a
3 proposal from which will restore the nonprofit to
4 build 100% affordable project. The time has come for
5 the garages to go. The playground is going to be the
6 beneficiary of the project with a new bathroom which
7 will enable to Parks Department to staff our
8 playground, provide storage space for Parks
9 Maintenance and provide daily oversight, programming
10 and activities for our children during warmer months.
11 But even without the restrooms FOAAP would still
12 support this project. The park is on a recent
13 upswing. A safety fence, repainting and replanting
14 and increased use of the park have breathed life into
15 the playground. I might also by the generous support
16 of the Council Men as well but it is not too long ago
17 that drug paraphernalia was routinely found on the
18 playground surrounded on two sides by parking garages
19 and the third side by the shrouded rear yards of West
20 109th Street tenants. It has regularly attracted
21 drug dealers and users who could operate at night in
22 relative darkness and largely undisturbed. The new
23 development will put people with east facing windows
24 overlooking the park, discouraging illegal activity
25

1
2 and increasing security and safety in the playground.
3 It will also improve 108th Street overall currently
4 with two parks, a playground and little housing by
5 augmenting the number of pedestrians putting eyes on
6 the street and further enhancing the block. I park
7 my car nearby at 110th Street in the Avalon Building
8 where I live with my family. No doubt my parking
9 rates will increase with the reduction of the spaces
10 in this garage but the increased safety and security,
11 new affordable units and a new bathroom for the
12 playground, the choice is clear. Thank you.

13 ELLEN FINNEY: Good afternoon, I'm Ellen
14 Finney, Community Outreach Social Worker at DOROT
15 representing Mark Meridy, Executive Director of DOROT
16 and Resident of Community Board 7. DOROT would like
17 to reaffirm our steadfast support of WSFSSH and the
18 development of the West 108th Street Housing Project.
19 DOROT has been serving older adults on the upper West
20 Side and Manhattan Valley for over 40 years, our
21 mission is to alleviate social isolation and provide
22 services and support and to enable older adults to
23 live independently as valued members of the
24 community. We are familiar with the challenges face
25 by older people in this community, particularly with

1 those who struggle to maintain housing. For over 35
2 years, DOROT has partnered with WSFSSH to operate our
3 Homeless Prevention Program. The program has saved
4 hundreds of neighborhood seniors from homelessness by
5 offering them transitional houses and a range of
6 services. WSFSSH has been an outstanding partner in
7 our shared mission of supporting seniors and
8 preventing homelessness and the seniors who come to
9 us are ordinary New Yorkers. In recent years we have
10 struggled to find them housing in this neighborhood
11 or in any neighborhood in the City. At this time
12 over 200,000 New York City Seniors are on the waiting
13 list for affordable housing. Waits are typically
14 five years or longer, far too long for a Senior
15 Citizen to wait. The West Side Federation Project at
16 West 108th Street will create a much needed
17 affordable housing for seniors and families and
18 invaluable community assets such as space for
19 healthcare, social services and recreation that are
20 vital to our community. In our experience, WSFSSH is
21 the most qualified and responsible organization to
22 fulfill this need, thank you.

24 REVEREND ALISTAIR DRUMMOND: Good

25 afternoon I'm Reverend Alistair Drummond. I am the

1 pastor of the West End Presbyterian Church which is 3
2 blocks south of Valley Lodge on 105th Street. I have
3 been pastor there for 24 years and as a neighbor of
4 Valley Lodge and a Board Member of WSFSSH for 12 of
5 those years and as being involved with WSFSSH I know
6 the way being a gooder responsive member of the
7 community for all of these years. With 40 years of
8 experience WSFSSH can clearly manage big complex
9 construction projects in residential neighborhoods
10 including the Red Oak Building on 106th Street and
11 Tres Puentes in the Bronx and WSFSSH is part of,
12 always part of the community operating, very
13 responsive to residents disputes that may arise.
14 Valley Lodge has operated on West 108th Street
15 successfully for more than 30 years. WSFSSH on West
16 108th is a very necessary resource for our
17 neighborhood. New York City continues to wrestle
18 with housing affordability especially in Manhattan.
19 As Paul said earlier, 200,000 seniors are on wait
20 lists for affordable housing units alone. The need
21 is very real. WSFSSH is the kind of top tier
22 responsible provider that can help protect our
23 neighborhood from the effects of rapid gentrification
24 and help to preserve the income diversity that makes
25

1
2 Manhattan Valley very special while continuing to
3 provide resources for low income seniors to live with
4 security and with dignity. So I support WSFSSH at
5 West 108th and the services, all the services that it
6 will provide for all of Manhattan Valley. In January
7 2017, the annual interface march for peace which
8 marches through the, oops my time is gone. Took the
9 theme of.

10 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: If you don't mind
11 giving it one sentence.

12 REVEREND ALISTAIR DRUMMOND: Yes one
13 sentence, it took the theme of supporting this
14 project and stopped in all the faith communities on
15 the west side because of the commitment of the whole
16 community to this particular project, thank you.

17 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: Thank you I will bring
18 up the next panel.

19 LYNN WISHERT (SP?): Good afternoon, my
20 name is Lynn Wishert (SP?) I am a member of the Board
21 of Directors of the West Side Federation for Senior
22 and Supportive Housing. As a director, I am aware of
23 the Federation's successful housing developments that
24 have been concentrating in several communities
25 throughout upper Manhattan and the south Bronx over

1 the last four decades. I am also a member of the 5th
2 Avenue Presbyterian Church and as the Council Member
3 noted it is located out of the upper West Side at 7
4 West 55th Street. The church has supported
5 ministries with people experiencing homelessness and
6 cooperated with many not for profit organizations
7 serving a variety of needs of older adults since at
8 least mid 1980s. As a congregation we understand
9 that our faith based institutions, our individual
10 efforts as citizens of this City and our governing
11 authority share the responsibility to nurture vibrant
12 communities in part by addressing housing and
13 security and homelessness in our neighborhoods.
14 Today I speak in support of the West 108th Street
15 Development from my perspective as a member of this
16 church by describing one of its efforts with WSFSSH
17 Valley Lodge to shelter and foster community for
18 homeless older adults. With support from the
19 Department of Homeless Services, the 5th Avenue
20 Presbyterian Church and Valley Lodge partnered first
21 with the Church of the Ascension on West 107th Street
22 and then in successive years with West End
23 Presbyterian Church on West 105th Street in
24 sheltering 10 men at a time for four months during
25

1
2 six consecutive winters. During these intermittent
3 incredibly brief periods, because of the quality and
4 services and care provided by staff of Valley Lodge,
5 94 individuals many of whom having experienced
6 decades of homelessness and unwillingness to accept
7 assistance through options offered by DHS moved from
8 living as unsheltered individuals on Manhattan's West
9 Side into transitional and permanent housing. Valley
10 Lodge has been a good neighbor on West 108th Street
11 for 30 years. The proposed development increases the
12 capacity of the Valley Lodge Shelter, addresses a
13 critical need for supportive housing for older adults
14 and adds to the permanently affordable housing
15 options for families in Manhattan Valley.

16 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: I just, very, very
17 briefly, uhm thank you Lynn and and Reverend Drummond
18 and all and Allen Adantu (SP?) who is not here
19 anymore for coming and speaking out and for thinking
20 about the needs of the community beyond if it doesn't
21 apply to WSFSSH it is your bread and butter but it
22 great to see the faith based institution, a senior
23 based nonprofit thinking about the broader needs of
24 the community, I wish we saw more of that and uhm I
25

1 do appreciate you engaging and waiting and getting
2 your voices on the record today. Thank you.

3 REVEREND ALISTAIR DRUMMOND: Thank you.

4 LYNN WISHERT: Thank you.

5 CHAIR BEN KALLOS: I am going to turn
6 this back over to Council Member Levine and our next
7 panelist is Pannos Katrice (SP?) from 32 BJ.

8 PANNOS KATRICE (SP?): (SPEAKING
9 SPANISH). Good afternoon, my name is Pannos Katrice
10 (SP?) I am a building service worker and a member of
11 32 BJ SEIU. I am here to call on the City to fund
12 good building service jobs on West 108th Street. Our
13 Union has a historic relationship with the West Side
14 Federation for Senior and Supportive Housing. We
15 also believe that good jobs and affordable housing
16 should go hand in hand. As long as there are working
17 people earning too little to afford rising housing
18 costs the affordable housing crisis will continue.
19 That is why we are calling on this same committee to
20 urge the City to ensure that they are creating good
21 building service jobs at this development. Providing
22 good jobs is important part of responsible
23 development. Good jobs can help New Yorkers out of
24 poverty and allow workers at the site to support
25

1
2 their families and continue to call New York, New
3 York home. Thank you. Very supportive.

4 MARK LEVINE: Could you, could you remind
5 us where is that you are currently working?

6 PANNOS KATRICE (SP?): My building.

7 MARK LEVINE: Yes.

8 PANNOS KATRICE: I'm on the upper east
9 side.

10 MARK LEVINE: Got it. But you are, you
11 are in a resident, you are doing residential building
12 service work currently?

13 PANNOS KATRICE: Yes I am a doorman.

14 MARK LEVINE: Got it. Work similar to
15 what will be done here.

16 PANNOS KATRICE: It is a building service
17 work, I am a building service worker.

18 MARK LEVINE: Okay, well we, we, we thank
19 you first of all for the work that you are doing,
20 keeping New York City liveable.

21 PANNOS KATRICE: Thank you.

22 MARK LEVINE: Building Service Workers
23 are, are often underappreciated but are making it
24 possible for hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers to
25 remain in their homes and we thank you for that. We

1 thank you for speaking out on behalf of good jobs and
2 this project. I am not sure if you were here during
3 my questions during the Administration but uhm I
4 expressed my belief that that our values of a City
5 should steer us to create good jobs with good wages
6 and benefits, so. Again thank you for speaking out
7 and for, and for your work and for being here today.

9 PANNOS KATRICE: Thank you very much.

10 (SPEAKING SPANISH).

11 MARK LEVINE: (SPEAKING SPANISH).

12 Alright next up we have uhm Karen forgive me if I
13 mispronounce the last, last name, Jorgensen I think?
14 Uhm Elisa Waldman, Bud Kourtney and Mark Greenberg.

15 KAREN JORGENSEN: Okay hi my name is

16 Karen Jorgensen, I've been the Director of the Valley
17 Lodge Shelter on West 108th Street since we opened in
18 1988 and we are a proud program of WSFSSH serving 92
19 homeless men and women 50 years of age and over and
20 with me today are residents, alumni and staff of
21 Valley Lodge. At Valley Lodge I get calls daily from
22 people already evicted as well as those facing
23 eviction because their income is no longer enough to
24 pay the rent and eat. These calls come from all over
25 the City including from some of the City Council

1
2 District Offices Mr. Levine because we do have two of
3 your people currently in Valley Lodge referred by
4 your District Office and we are working very hard to
5 get them housed in affordable housing. Uhm as I said
6 there are many people at Valley Lodge who worked all
7 of their lives and were responsible tenants but were
8 forced into the shelter system. The Social Security,
9 Retirement is usually no more than \$1000 a month not
10 enough to afford any apartment on the open market and
11 as people are evicted more and more apartments go out
12 of stabilization into fair market rental and in the
13 Manhattan Valley Neighborhood where Valley Lodge is
14 located they are advertising apartments renting for
15 \$3,000, \$4,000 and \$5,000 a month. Years ago the
16 Board of Directors of WSFSSH made the decision to
17 have only one shelter Valley Lodge and to devote all
18 of our future efforts to the development and
19 preservation of affordable housing. The City has
20 indicated its commitment to affordable housing and we
21 do not want to lose this opportunity as daily
22 affordable apartments are lost in the Manhattan
23 Valley Neighborhood as well as in the rest of the
24 City so we urge the Subcommittee to support and
25 approve this project. Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARK LEVINE: Thank you.

ELISA WALDMAN: My name is Elisa Waldman and I am the Director of Community Programs at the Institute for Family Health, a federally qualified health center network that has been providing comprehensive primary care in medically underserved communities in New York City for more than 30 years and in upstate New York for more than 10 years. We also operate three residency training programs for Family Medicine and a number of community health and health promotion programs. In New York City the Institute offers primary care, behavioral healthcare, dental care, at nine full time health centers, five school based health centers, six sites that care for people who are homeless. Services are available for people of all ages regardless of insurance status or ability to pay. The Institute has been working with the West Side Federation for Senior and Supportive Housing since 1990 when we began providing services at Valley Lodge, a transitional shelter for vulnerable homeless adults, an Institute family physician provides primary care two days a week at Valley Lodge, working closely with the Valley Lodge staff to coordinate services. On average, we provide

1 1000 primary care visits per year to the residents of
2 Valley Lodge. I personally have worked very closely
3 for the past 27 years with the staff of Valley Lodge
4 coordinating the Institutes healthcare services. The
5 Institute is thrilled to be part of the WSFSSH
6 Project at 108th Street. The Institute will occupy
7 roughly 5,000 square feet of community space for
8 healthcare serving both the residents of the new
9 building and the community at large. The institute
10 has a history of developing health center in
11 collaboration with community partners and looks
12 forward to working with the upper west side Manhattan
13 Valley Community to help meet its primary care
14 health needs. As a long time community partner,
15 WSFSSH will help make this block of 108th Street more
16 vibrant, pedestrian friendly that will promote health
17 and well being of the entire neighborhood. WSFSSH
18 has a strong track record of designing, building and
19 managing complex developments in residential
20 neighborhoods and the Institute for Family Health is
21 happy to support WSFSSH and to be part of the
22 services that will provide on the upper west side of
23 Manhattan Valley. Thank you.
24
25

1
2 BUD KOURTNEY: I would like to thank
3 Council Member Levine for your, your edict on the
4 eradication of homelessness. I thank you for that.
5 It is nice to know that there is many dreamers at
6 this time which is certainly what we need. My name
7 is Bud Kourtney I live and work at the Catholic
8 worker on the lower east side, I apologize the way I
9 am dressed. I rushed here from our Zipline thinking
10 that I wouldn't have to sit here for a while but I've
11 been the choir director at Valley Lodge for the last
12 five years. I lead a choir of alumni and folks in
13 transitional housing who live at Valley Lodge. I
14 have seen the work that the that the folks at Valley
15 Lodge do and at WSFSSH and for me it's a family.
16 They, its not, it's not a shelter. I live and work
17 with people every day at the Catholic Worker, people
18 in off the street. I am spending. This is the
19 Catholic season went in one night a week I am going
20 out and spending the night on the streets to try to
21 understand a little bit of homelessness and for
22 myself one night a week is hell so I can't imagine
23 how folks day after day, year after year live on the
24 street so the need to have a home to take people in
25 is so necessary and important. Not only at Valley

1
2 Lodge do they do that but they have programmed such
3 as the choir and the drawing department where people
4 keep coming back. The alumni return because it is
5 something to do. I am a recovering alcoholic, 26
6 years sober, I know how important it is to have
7 something to get you off the streets away from the
8 temptation and to have folks come in and sing with us
9 week after week, this past June we sang at Carnegie
10 Hall, the Valley Lodge Choir, we performed at
11 Carnegie Hall with the Dallas Street Choir. The only
12 homeless choir ever to be invited to Carnegie Hall
13 and I know for myself and I speak for probably every
14 member of the choir it is one of the highlights of
15 our life so please vote yes on this. Thank you.

16 MARK LEVINE: Well thank you Bud for the
17 incredible service you are doing to give back. You
18 said, so you work at Mary House, Catholic Work, oh
19 got it so you are doing work in multiple locations
20 helping people in need and we are very grateful for
21 that and appreciate you taking time out to come put
22 your voice on the record here.

23 BUD KOURTNEY: Thank you.

24 MARK LEVINE: Thank you very much. Okay
25 go ahead Mark.

1
2 MARK GREENBERG: Good afternoon, thank
3 you Council Members for holding this hearing and.

4 MARK LEVINE: Mark, check that your mic
5 is on, there we go now.

6 MARK GREENBERG: Good afternoon I'm Mark
7 Greenberg, I want to first thank the Council and just
8 the Committee for their great questions and the
9 challenges that you are offering to WSFSSH to make
10 this project even greater than it, uhm might
11 otherwise be. My name is Mark Greenberg I am the
12 Executive Director of the Interfaith Assembly on
13 Homelessness and Housing Coalition of over 60 faith
14 institutions established in the upper West side in
15 1985 and I am here to strongly support this project.
16 Since its inception of the Assembly we have looked at
17 the West Side Federation for Senior and Supportive
18 Housing as a crucial and dependable ally in our work
19 of helping those who are homeless to rebuild their
20 lives and helping build a more compassionate New York
21 City. I am pleased to speak in strong support of the
22 current efforts of WSFSSH to expand it's Valley Lodge
23 Facility to serve more New Yorkers in need of
24 affordable housing through this West 108th Street
25 project. The need for permanent affordable housing

1
2 in New York City has never been greater than it is
3 right now and the pressures on existing affordable
4 units and those who live in them are increasing every
5 day with over 60,000 New Yorkers living in shelters,
6 many thousands more on the streets and tens of
7 thousands doubled to tripled up with family or
8 friends. This innovative project in Manhattan Valley
9 that will include 194 permanent affordable housing
10 and a new Valley Lodge Shelter serving 110 older
11 adults, 18 more than today is exactly what the people
12 of our city and our community need. When completed,
13 these housing resources coupled with healthcare,
14 childcare, community meeting spaces, public bathrooms
15 will be an invaluable resource and will help preserve
16 the rich diversity that makes this community one of
17 the greatest places on the globe to live and work.
18 Clearly any new project of this magnitude has its
19 challenges but it is over 40 years of service, WSFSSH
20 has proven time and time again that it is up the
21 challenge and on behalf of the members, the assembly
22 and those who we seek to serve and proud to stand in
23 support of this project. Look forward to working
24 with members of the upper West Side Community, ensure
25 that the needs and concerns of the community are

1
2 considered every juncture in the development of this
3 very impressive, worthy and desperately needed
4 endeavor.

5 MARK LEVINE: Thank you Mark for first
6 working and leading the Coalition. It is incredibly
7 important and for uhm everything that you do on
8 behalf of this cause. Uhm, Elisa just before let you
9 guys go, if you could briefly say a work or two on
10 the staffing and the services of the facility. How
11 many doctors, nurses and the scope of if you, if you
12 are not prepared to you can get back to me.

13 ELISA WALDMAN: I will have to get back
14 to you.

15 MARK LEVINE: Fair enough. Okay thank
16 you panel. I am very pleased that we have been
17 joined by our colleague on the Subcommittee who is
18 busy chairing his own committee hearing today is why
19 he couldn't be with us and he came and we are going
20 to pause this hearing to resume a vote so that
21 Council Member King can register his voice and I am
22 going to pass it over to the Committee Counsel to
23 administer that.

24 COUNSEL: Continue vote to approve Land
25 Use Items 41, 42, and 43. Council Member King?

1
2 ANDY KING: I vote aye.

3 COUNSEL: The Land Use items are approved
4 by a vote of 4 in the affirmative, 0 negative and 0
5 extensions and referred to the full Land Use
6 Committee.

7 MARK LEVINE: Thank you Council Member
8 King, now we are going to resume our hearing on Land
9 Use Items 52, 53 and 54 and I will call up the next
10 panel which will consist of. Okay we have I think it
11 is Eustasia Smith (SP?), okay Sandy Roach is here,
12 Stephanie Louise and Rebecca Sower. And I know for
13 some of you who have been waiting this was a long
14 time, uhm but it really is valuable to have voices
15 from the public who are entered on the record this
16 way and everything that you are saying here, you
17 probably know this, is recorded, is transcribed and
18 it is being streamed live and it it really does
19 matter when the public speaks up so thank you all for
20 waiting and Sandy we will pass it off to you first.

21 SANDY ROACH: Okay my name is Sandy
22 Roach, Sandra Roach and I have lived in the Manhattan
23 Valley Community for 55 years. I am very active in
24 community life, I currently serve at the Board Chair
25 of the Bloomingdale Family Program a very highly

1
2 regarded headstart and childcare program in Manhattan
3 Valley and they are very happy that we will be able
4 to store our trikes and our outdoor play equipment
5 and not have to slap it over to the playground every
6 time we, every time we use it. I have seen enormous
7 changes, good and bad in Manhattan Valley in the past
8 50 something years but the most dramatic change in
9 the recent years has been the explosive
10 gentrification that is changing who we are as a
11 community. This is a great place to live and have a
12 family, I raised my three children here and
13 grandchildren too. Uhm, and its a great place to
14 live because it has such a vibrant mix of families in
15 this community but today it is increasingly hard for
16 low income families and low income seniors to live
17 here even though many have deep and long standing
18 ties or roots to this community. Affordable housing
19 is disappearing in favor of luxury rentals and condos
20 to stay in this community many of the low income
21 families we serve are doubling up and tripling up in
22 apartments, a whole family living in one room. Two
23 or three families sharing a kitchen. It is a
24 terrible way to live. It is inadequate and unsafe.
25 The WSFSSH Project on West 108th Street offers an

1
2 opportunity to provide these families with a decent
3 and affordable place to live and with services that
4 strengthen the entire community. I share the respect
5 of the Manhattan Valley Community for the high
6 quality of services provided by WSFSSH. This new
7 facility will be a much needed and much valued asset
8 to our entire community.

9 MARK LEVINE: Impeccable timing Sandy. I
10 wish some of my colleagues could learn from your
11 example, and, and Bloomingdale is just an amazing
12 organization and to strengthen your connection to
13 that park through this small accommodation would be,
14 would be a great thing.

15 SANDY ROACH: Very nice.

16 MARK LEVINE: Thank you for all your
17 service. Please.

18 Stephanie unfortunately had to step out
19 my name is Katelyn Hoosie (SP?) I am standing in for
20 her. I am happy to fill out a card afterwards. I am
21 a Public Policy Associate for Live On New York. Live
22 on New York strongly supports WSFSSH 108, at West
23 108. This project would support the entire community
24 and aligns with our mission to make New York a better
25 place to age. WSFSSH is a long standing member of

1
2 Live On New York as well as an active member of our
3 Affordable Senior Housing Coalition. New York City
4 currently faces an unprecedented affordable housing
5 crisis which has been outlined earlier today. It is
6 one that affects every community throughout New York.
7 As found in our 2016 study an estimated 200,000 low
8 income seniors are on waiting lists for affordable
9 housing throughout New York City. This is simply on
10 one type of affordable housing through the HUD-202
11 Program. This housing crisis has intensified as the
12 cost of living continues to rise which is
13 particularly detrimental to seniors who often live on
14 fixed incomes. We released an update to our 2016
15 study which found an estimated 19,700 seniors in
16 waiting lists specifically in community District 7
17 and 9 of which this project is located within. An
18 overall response rate of 44% of the HUD-202 buildings
19 it is estimated that 44,000 are actually on waiting
20 lists in this area. With a total of 45 units on
21 average turning over each year the odds of getting an
22 affordable housing unit are increasingly bleak. It
23 is for these reasons in addition to all the community
24 facilities and the true mission based nature of
25 WSFSSH West 108 that we are happy to endorse this

1 project and we are happy to support the community
2 driven effort that is going on here today. Thank
3 you.
4

5 MARK LEVINE: Thank you we love Live On.
6 Thank you for speaking.

7 KATELYN HOOSIE (SP?): Thank you.

8 REBECCA SOWER: Hi, good afternoon
9 Council Member Levine or good evening. My name is
10 Rebecca Sower I am the Director of Policy and
11 Planning of the Supportive Housing Network of New
12 York. We are a membership organization representing
13 about 200 nonprofits across the state that develop
14 and operate supportive housing so WSFSSH is one of
15 our members. Supportive housing as you know is
16 permanent affordable housing with support services
17 and it ends homelessness amongst the most vulnerable
18 by providing both a respectful affordable place to
19 live and person centered support to help tenants stay
20 housed and healthy. I would like to speak in support
21 of the proposal for West 108th Street. So WSFSSH is
22 actually one of the founders of the supportive
23 housing model, having come to the mission of creating
24 affordable housing with embedded services in order to
25 serve the people who were in the late 70s, just then

1
2 appearing on the upper west side with all their
3 belongings in shopping carts. WSFSSH's founder,
4 Reverend Lara Jervis (SP?) decided to do something
5 about the problem learning the complexity of the
6 housing development along the way. Today as we have
7 heard, the organization has created 1800 apartments,
8 mostly on the upper west side of Manhattan but in
9 other neighborhoods as well. In the first 10 years
10 WSFSSH took over dilapidated single room occupancy
11 hotels, got it, and turned them into small efficiency
12 apartments. Many of the projects that they worked on
13 received very staunch opposition from the community
14 but in fact none of the fears that the Community
15 Members had come to pass. U Could Haul is one
16 example, WSFSSH promised the renovation would not
17 lead to increased crime and that has been the case.
18 They promised the renovation would improve the
19 neighborhood and anyone who shopped at the
20 neighboring Victoria Secret or enjoyed a smoothie at
21 Juice Generation can attest to how true that has
22 been. WSFSSH has been a good neighbor, has always
23 fulfilled their promises and for the past more than
24 30 years has had the staunch support of their
25 neighborhood, you can see that here today because

1
2 they have earned it. I can also speak to the need
3 for the West 108th Street project with great
4 certainty. I just want to say that we did a couple
5 of years ago in preparation for the NYC 1515 program,
6 did looking into the demographics of these permanent
7 form of services and we found actually that of the
8 chronically homeless single adult population just
9 under 1/3 were over 55 so WSFSSH is the only provider
10 that is exclusively dedicated to serving this
11 population which is why it is so important that a
12 project like West 108th Street come to partition.

13 MARK LEVINE: Thank you Rebecca and has a
14 reminder the plan then for this project is 50 years
15 and older for the, for the single adults, is that
16 right? And then for the family portion its, it's,
17 there's no age restriction, understood. Okay. Uhm
18 thank you Rebecca for your very strong statement and
19 thank you for this panel and we have a sole act for
20 the final panel which is Nathan Gebbert, sorry if I
21 am mispronouncing that name. And while Nathan is
22 getting settled are there any other members of the
23 public who would like to testify. Okay. If you, if
24 you can just fill out a speaker slip. You already.

1 We would welcome you. You could actually join this
2 panel if you are all. Okay. Nathan take it away.

3
4 NATHAN GEBBERT: My name is Nathan
5 Gebbert and I am representing myself and for 23 years
6 I have lived on the top floor of 138 West 109th
7 Street directly behind Valley Lodge in the proposed
8 development. I will lose some light and air and
9 experience inconvenience should the project go ahead.
10 I also park my car on the street and the demolition
11 of the garages might make that more difficult. I
12 speak nonetheless to express my unambiguous support.
13 We must do everything we can to create more
14 affordable housing in the city. If I have to give up
15 something to see that that is done I am happy to do
16 so. As New Yorkers this is what we do for each other
17 and I am excited to welcome new people to this
18 neighborhood that I love, by sharing we only make it
19 better.

20 NIKKI NAVARRO: Hi.

21 MARK LEVINE: What a, what a lovely
22 statement. Thank you very much for coming here and
23 sharing that with us. It's not not the statement I
24 was expecting to hear. Okay go ahead Nikki. If you
25 can identify yourself. I know you well.

1
2 NIKKI NAVARRO: My name is Nikki Navarro
3 uhm I'm here today in support of affordable housing
4 in a neighborhood that I love, a neighborhood where I
5 grew up, where I have a lot of memories. I had given
6 some slot up because I have spoke in many areas in
7 the City about how I feel about affordable housing
8 and WSFSSH but I realize that everyone did, I am a
9 product of that community and I have been in that
10 community for almost 60 years. I came to that
11 community with my grandparents and my parents and
12 five siblings in 1948, just forget that figure. Uhm
13 I have seen drastic changes and the saddest part of
14 the changes are affordable housing because it meant
15 that a lot of members of my family had to leave the
16 neighborhood and a lot of the people I grew up had to
17 leave the neighborhood. It meant that a lot of
18 Latinos that I have embrace and the ones that we
19 created memories in that neighborhood and the ones
20 that stayed during the hard times are gone, many are
21 gone and many of them will continue to leave if we
22 don't allow WSFSSH to continue to build affordable
23 housing. WSFSSH is the only one in that neighborhood
24 that I know that is building affordable housing for
25 young families. And seniors. 194 units, its just

1
2 like a drop in the bucket for what we need in that
3 neighborhood and so uhm to have people oppose that,
4 uhm for for, for cars has been really awful to me,
5 this whole process, I mean two and a half years we
6 have been living with this and we finally come to the
7 end of it I hope. I hope that you uhm come to my
8 center lots of times you know who we are. You know
9 the services we give to the community. You know that
10 we are the only ones doing 30% of their income.
11 I've, we've had, I've had a client, I'm a social
12 worker I had a client that only paid \$1 one year
13 because that is all should, she could afford
14 according to her income because of her expenses. We
15 look at the expenses, that year she had hearing aids
16 that she had to purchase, she had glasses that she
17 had to purchase and because of those purchase we
18 could bring down, down the rent that she paid for
19 that year. I don't know anybody else who is doing
20 that. I could work someplace else, I am committed to
21 the mission WSFSSH has. I am committed to that
22 community. I still work there. I still have family
23 there and I'm not going anywhere I'm going to fight
24 every, everyone who thinks that they can push it out
25 and this is my way. I appreciate WSFSSH giving me

1
2 the opportunity to come to you and fight for the
3 neighborhood that I love, that I grew up in and that
4 is still a wonderful place, we are just trying to
5 make keep it, we are trying to keep it. Thank you
6 Mark.

7 MARK LEVINE: Thank you Nikki. You run
8 one of the best senior centers in New York City.

9 NIKKI NAVARRO: No I've got two.

10 MARK LEVINE: To stand corrected for the
11 record. Two of the best senior centers I have ever
12 seen. Alright so okay I am, now going to close the
13 public hearing and we are also going to lay off Land
14 Use items 52 to 59. I want to thank the Council and
15 Land Use staff for preparing today's hearing and the
16 members of the public and my colleagues for attending
17 and this hearing is hereby adjourned.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
CONCESSIONS

150

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 1, 2018