

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

----- X

March 23, 2018
Start: 1:23 p.m.
Recess: 5:50 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: MARK TREYGER
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL
- INEZ D. BARRON
- JOSEPH C. BORELLI
- JUSTIN L. BRANNAN
- ANDREW COHEN
- ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.
- CHAIM M. DEUTSCH
- DANIEL DROMM
- BARRY S. GRODENCHIK
- BEN KALLOS
- ANDY L. KING
- BRAD S. LANDER
- STEPHEN T. LEVIN
- MARK LEVINE
- YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
- DEBORAH L. ROSE
- RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.
- ERIC ULRICH

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Dorita Gibson
Senior Deputy Chancellor at the New York City
Department of Education, DOE

Ray Orlando
Chief Financial Officer at the New York City
Department of Education, DOE

Elizabeth Rose
Deputy Chancellor at the New York City Department
Of Education, DOE

Ursulina Ramirez
Chief of Staff at the New York City Department of
Education, DOE

Mark Cannizzaro
President at the Council of School Supervisors
And Administrators, CSA

Karen Alford
Vice President for Elementary Schools at the
United Federation of Teachers, UFT

Donald Nesbit
Executive Vice President for Local 372

Randi Levine
Policy Director of Advocates for Children of New
York

Gregory Bender
Policy Analyst at the United Neighborhood Houses

Grant Cowles
Senior Policy and Advocacy Associate at Citizens
Committee for Children of New York

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Emily Larcher
Freshman at Baruch College, an Alumna of
Generation Citizen's Action Civics and Community
Change Fellowship Programs and Member of GC's
Student Leadership Board

Brooke Wallace
Program Director at Generation Citizen

Michael Rodgers
Vice President for Youth and Community Runner
Engagement at New York Road Runners

Chloe Peshmen
CBO, Preschool Director in the Bronx

Robin Vitale
Vice President of Health Strategies for the
American Heart Association in New York City

Marcel Braithwaite
Director of Community Engagement for the Police
Athletic League, Inc.

Melissa Aase
Executive Director of University Settlement

Carlyn Cowen
Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer at the
Chinese American Planning Council

Allen Ross
Executive Director of Samaritan Suicide
Prevention Center

Kylynn Grier
Policy Manager at Girls for Gender Equity

Jane Golden
Program Officer at Sheltering Arms

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Elizabeth Adams

Director of Governmental Relations at Planned
Parenthood of New York City

Esante Latimer

Student at Canarsie High School and Intern for
The Children's Defense Fund of New York

Lucas Liu

Chair of CEC3 Multilingual Committee

DeJohn Jones

Parent Leader with the New Settlement Parent
Action Committee in the Bronx

Victor Almanzar

Leader with New Settlement Parent Action
Committee

Maria Gill

Mother of Six Girls, Member of Make the Road New
York and the Coalition for Education

Brian Adjew

Sophomore and Youth Leader at Sistas and Brothas
United and the Urban Justice Collaborative

Irma Barrios

Youth Leader with Urban Youth Collaborative and
Make the Road New York

Arlynn Leach

Youth Leader with Future of Tomorrow and the
Urban Justice Collaborative

Stephanie Bolara

Youth Leader at Make the Road New York and the
Urban Justice Collaborative

Roberto Cabanas

Coordinator for the Urban Youth Collaborative

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Laura Cavalieri
PTA President and Advocate for Dyslexia

Andrea Colon
Community Engagement Organizer with the Rockaway
Youth Task Force and Youth Leader with the Urban
Youth Collaborative

Onyx Walker
Future of Tomorrow and the Urban Youth
Collaborative

1
2 [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, good

4 afternoon. I actually would like to first start this
5 hearing with a brief moment of silence for the loss
6 of a, a hero in New York City, the tragic loss of
7 firefighter Michael Davidson who was battling a fire
8 in, in Harlem and lost his life and this is another
9 tragic reminder of the sacrifice and of the bravery
10 demonstrated each and every single day by New York's
11 bravest. So, I'd just... like to begin this hearing
12 first with just a, a brief moment of silence to pay
13 our respect to our lost firefighter and to all of the
14 FDNY family. Okay, thank you very much. Good
15 afternoon and welcome to the Education Committee's
16 hearing on Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget. This
17 afternoon we will focus on the Department of
18 Education's Preliminary Expense Budget. We will be
19 hearing from Deputy Chancellor Elizabeth Rose, we'll
20 be hearing from DOE's Chief Operating Officer
21 Ursulina Rimirez, Chief Financial Officer Ray Orlando
22 and Senior Deputy School Chancellor Doctor Dorita
23 Gibson followed by testimony from unions, parents,
24 advocates, students and others who wish to testify in
25 front of the council. We will hold a separate hearing

1
2 on the DOE's Capital Plan with the School
3 Construction Authority on Monday morning, this is a
4 result of our rescheduling due to the snow storm. The
5 Department of Education's Fiscal 2019 Preliminary
6 Budget totals 25.6 billion dollars excluding pension
7 and debt service which represents 28 percent of the
8 city's total budget including pension and debt
9 service DOE's total Fiscal 2019 budget is 32.5
10 billion dollars. This year DOE's budget is 1.3
11 billion or five percent more than the fiscal 2018
12 adopted budget although this sounds like a large
13 amount the changes introduced in this plan are
14 actually minimal in comparison to the size of DOE's
15 budget. I would like to take a moment to thank former
16 Chancellor, actually the current Chancellor for her
17 service and for her leadership Chancellor Carmen
18 Farina. Under the leadership of Chancellor Farina
19 graduation rates have reached the highest rates to
20 date at 72.6 percent, student test scores have also
21 improved with 40.6 percent of students in grades
22 three to eight meeting or exceeding standards in
23 English language arts, better known as ELA. While..
24 and I actually just want to also just state that one
25 of the biggest differences as well with Chancellor

1
2 Farina's leadership has been her ability to boost
3 morale in a system that surly lacked it due to the
4 prior administration. While 40.6 percent shows we
5 still have improvements to make, DOE has made
6 significant strides from where we were in 2014 when
7 only 26.4 percent of students met or exceeded
8 standards on the ELA exam. We're about to start the
9 tenure of a new Chancellor, Chancellor Carranza who I
10 very much look forward to working with. I hope we can
11 have a productive, cooperative relationship because I
12 can tell you right now there are areas where we need
13 to see some improvements. There are a number of
14 outstanding requests we have made to DOE that have
15 not been answered. As the council we're looking for
16 accountability from each city agency and at this
17 moment the DOE is failing. We have asked for
18 information on fair student funding and entitlement
19 amounts for each and every school, the DOE has not
20 provided it. We have asked for information about
21 spending on bus routes for students in temporary
22 housing, DOE has not provided it. DOE sends answers
23 to some of our questions which we requested five
24 weeks ago, these questions came the day before the
25 hearing, this is unacceptable. I want you to know we

1
2 are keeping ourselves accountable and we cannot
3 approve a budget without timely communication from an
4 agency on key budget information. Now I'd like to
5 turn back to our hearing today on DOE's fiscal 2019
6 Preliminary Budget and I hope we can get answers to
7 these outstanding questions. While the overall budget
8 of the DOE continues to grow I am always concerned
9 that not enough of this funding is trickling down to
10 the classrooms. How are students gaining from
11 increases in the DOE's budget, how do we ensure we
12 are providing adequate special education programs to
13 all students who need them, do students have access
14 to technology in school so they can become high
15 achievers with 21st century learning skills, how do
16 we make classes smaller? As a former teacher I know
17 the value of class size and what it... what it can mean
18 for a child's educational attainment. That brings me
19 to my next point, state funding. The Speaker, my
20 colleagues and I have traveled to Albany and
21 advocated to the Governor directly that the state is
22 legally obligated to provide increased funding to New
23 York City schools based on the campaign for fiscal
24 equity, we have not seen this increase yet but the
25 council will continue to fight for our funding

1
2 because I like other educators know our students
3 deserve it. We hope the DOE will engage in this
4 dialogue with the state as well to gain the funding
5 our schools deserve. Until we have all schools, all
6 schools receiving 100 percent of their fair student
7 funding entitlements our work is not done. I have
8 been visiting schools throughout the city and I have
9 been told personally that fair student funding has
10 had the greatest impact on students. If we see a
11 large increase in state funding in the enacted budget
12 I want to make sure this money goes directly to
13 schools and it has a direct impact, a positive impact
14 on, on our students, that is what I'm advocating for
15 in Albany and that is the promise I'm looking to hear
16 from the DOE today. We need to work harder to get
17 schools the funding they deserve. I would also like
18 to have a conversation about the fair student funding
19 formula and if we really think it is sufficient to
20 properly fund the needs of all students. For example,
21 should we provide an additional weight to support the
22 needs of homeless students, what about additional
23 weights to support the needs of immigrant students.
24 Schools who receive large number of what is referred
25 to as over the counter students, students who are

1
2 among the city's, city's highest need definitely need
3 extra support especially if these students arrive in
4 the middle of the school year. School should be a
5 place where all students have the opportunity to
6 learn and thrive and these students may need
7 additional support to ensure they graduate on time
8 and career ready. That is our goal as educators and I
9 think it is time to reevaluate the fair student fund..
10 the fair student formula to ensure we are providing
11 adequate funding for all students. Finally, I am
12 concerned in general about the DOE's lack of support
13 for homeless students and fail to understand why the
14 current program funded at 10.3 million dollars is not
15 included in this budget, I hope to hear answers about
16 this today. Before I conclude I'd like to thank the
17 incredible staff of this committee; Elizabeth
18 Hoffman, Kaitlyn O'Hagan, Dohini Sompura, Smita
19 Deshmukh, Jan Atwell, Joan Povolny, Kalima Johnson,
20 and Mili Bonilla. I'd also like to thank my staff as
21 well Anna Scaife, Vanessa Ogle and Eric Feinberg. I'd
22 now like to introduce my colleagues who have joined
23 us today and will welcome the administration shortly
24 after. So, we have been joined by Council Members
25 Lander, Deutsch, Council Member Alicka Ampry-Samuel,

1
2 Council Member Brannan, Council Member Rosenthal,
3 Chairman Dromm, our honorary Chairman as always and
4 Council Member Kallos. And I'm sorry, Councilman
5 Salamanca as well from, from the Bronx. And we'll
6 just swear in our... just to make sure I have the... do
7 you swear or affirm to tell the truth, the whole
8 truth and nothing but the truth and to answer Council
9 Member questions honestly? And I'll just... so I, I
10 announced who's here so whoever would like to testify
11 first may begin. Thank you. Sure.

12 DORITA GIBSON: Speaker and to all the
13 members of the Educational Committee that are here
14 today. My name is Doctor Dorita Gibson, Senior Deputy
15 Chancellor at the New York City Department of
16 Education. Here with me this afternoon is Ursulina
17 Ramirez, DOE Chief of Staff and Chief Operating
18 Officer; Ray Orlando, DOE Chief Financial Officer and
19 Elizabeth Rose, Deputy Chancellor for Operations.
20 Thank you for the opportunity to testify on the Mayor
21 De Blasio's Fiscal Year 2019 Preliminary Budget as it
22 relates to the Department of Education. as you are
23 aware Chancellor Farina will be retiring at the end
24 of the month and thank you for those comments that
25 you made about her, we appreciate that. We are very

1
2 grateful for her 52 years of service. Under
3 Chancellor Farina's leadership we brought a new era
4 of communication, collaboration, and celebration to
5 the nations, nation's largest school system. Together
6 we challenge our energy in improving instruction and
7 putting all students on the path to achieve their
8 dreams. It's not easy to advance a school system as
9 large as ours but we have made notable progress. Last
10 years graduation rate as you said earlier, 70... 74.3
11 percent is the highest it's ever been while our drop
12 out rate, 7.8 percent is the lowest it has ever been.
13 New York City students also outperform the rest of
14 New York State in the ELA exams for the second time
15 in a row and our overall improvement outpaces the
16 rest of the state in both ELA and math. Additionally,
17 a record number of students are taking and passing
18 advanced placement exams and are ready for college.
19 The administration's equity in excellence for all
20 agenda will continue to build our progress ensuring
21 that by 2026 80 percent of the students will graduate
22 high school on time and two thirds of the college.. of
23 the students will be college ready. Through equity
24 and excellence for all we are addressing our students
25 academic, social and emotional needs and building a

1
2 pathway to success in college and careers for all
3 students. There are over 1,150 schools with at least
4 one equity and excellence for all initiative this
5 year. This number has continued to grow over the
6 course of the year. Our schools are starting to
7 educate children early with free and full day, high
8 quality education for three-year olds and four-year
9 olds through Three for All and Pre-K for All. This
10 school year approximately 69,500 children are
11 enrolled in a free, full day, high quality Pre-K
12 program, more than three times the number of children
13 enrolled before the expansion. The administration's
14 3-K for All for our little three-year olds all
15 initiative launched last September in two districts,
16 in the South Bronx, district seven and in
17 Brownsville, district 23 is building on the success
18 of Pre-K for All and providing New York City children
19 a continuum of early care and education. the
20 preliminary budget includes funding to increase the
21 number of districts that 3-K for All will come in
22 this fall and next for the next two to four both
23 years. This expansion will create 3,166 new seats
24 bringing the city's, city's total commitment to
25 approximately 19,000 seats in 12 districts over the

1
2 next four years. As part of the larger effort to
3 strengthen birth to five care and education across
4 the city Early Learn programs are transitioning from
5 ACS to the management by Department of Ed by early
6 2019. This transition is being led by ACS and DOE
7 with engagement with other city agencies as well as
8 providers, early childhood care and educational
9 experts creating a unified birth to five care and
10 education system that will benefit children, families
11 and providers. Beyond 3-K for All and Pre-K for All
12 our schools are strengthening foundational skills and
13 instruction earlier, we know that literacy undermines
14 the future academic success and through our universal
15 literacy initiative we are working to have all
16 students reading on grade level by the end of grade
17 two. To support this effort, we have over 240 reading
18 coaches currently working in over 300 elementary
19 schools across 14 districts including all of the
20 districts in the Bronx and we are on track to bring
21 universal literacy to all 32 districts this fall.
22 This literacy support will be a game changer for our
23 students as they learn to read. Through Algebra for
24 All approximately 900 teachers across 357 elementary,
25 middle and high schools have received training to

1
2 strengthen their math instruction. Our goal is to
3 give all eighth graders access to algebra and have
4 them complete algebra no later than ninth grade. We
5 are also offering students more challenging hands on
6 college and career aligned courses. Our AP for All
7 initiatives have brought new AP courses to 152 high
8 schools this year including 60 that offered no AP
9 courses before. Last year we saw a record high number
10 of students who took and passed at least one AP exam,
11 overall AP participation continues to increase at a
12 higher rate among black and Hispanic students.
13 Specifically, 13.2 percent more Hispanic students and
14 8.9 percent more black students took at least one AP
15 exam in 2017 than in the previous year. This
16 initiative will eventually ensure that every high
17 school student has access to at least five AP
18 classes. Through our computer science for all
19 initiative we're aiming to bring computer science to
20 every elementary, middle and high school by 2025, we
21 are already seeing progress through this initiative.
22 Last year the number of students taking an AP
23 computer science exam tripled and the number of
24 students passing an AP computer science exam
25 quadrupled. We are also providing additional supports

1
2 to students and families on the path to college
3 through our college access for all initiative. By
4 2018/2019 school year every middle school student
5 will have had the opportunity to visit a college
6 campus and every high school student will have
7 resources and supports at their high school to
8 graduate with an individual college and career plan.
9 Under this initiative we have eliminated the CUNY
10 college application fee for low income students, we
11 are having our second SAT school day when all high
12 school juniors are able to take the SAT during the
13 school day free of charge on April 24th, that's a big
14 lift for us. Because of this program we had the
15 highest ever number of high school juniors taking the
16 SAT last year, 61,800 students and 51 percent
17 increased from last year. Additionally, across the
18 renewal school program we have seen encouraging
19 results, ELA and math scores have increased by ten
20 and four respectively and graduations have increased
21 by 13 percent points, attendance has increased by
22 four percent points and chronic absenteeism has
23 decreased by 11 percent points. Renewal schools have
24 also seen significant improvement in school climate,
25 teacher retention and classroom instruction. As a

1
2 result, 21 renewal schools have seen strong and
3 steady gains and as a result 21 of the renewal
4 schools have been getting... have, have been designated
5 as Rise schools marking the beginning of their
6 transition out of renewal school program. Many of the
7 schools continuing in the program are on an upward
8 path and we expect many more of them to become Rise
9 schools in the near future. The city council has
10 truly been a partner in this work and I would like to
11 thank Speaker Johnson, Chair Treyger and all the
12 members of the city council for your continued
13 leadership and partnership on behalf of our 1.1
14 million students, thank you very much. In
15 collaboration with the city council we launched free
16 school lunch for all this year, under this initiative
17 we are serving lunch to students at no charge to
18 ensure that they have access to a healthy meal during
19 the school day. As a result, and on average we are
20 serving 25,000 more lunches each day this school year
21 when compared to the same period last year. The
22 generous funding from the city council has enabled us
23 to provide additional programming for students and
24 supports for our schools. Through city funding for
25 instance we're offering intensive restorative justice

1
2 programs in 25 schools and provide schools with LGBT
3 curricular resources. City council funding is also
4 helping us build our investments in culturally
5 responsive education, our social studies scope and
6 sequence and passport to social studies curriculum
7 include multiple perspectives in learning about
8 African, Latino, Asian, Middle Eastern, and native
9 heritage people as well as about the gender, LGBT and
10 religious history topics. Also, thanks to the city
11 council funding we are also providing 450 additional
12 teachers with cultural responsive training this
13 school year in partnership with NYU critically
14 conscious educators rising and border crossers.
15 Supporting our lesbian, gay, bisexual, and
16 transgender students, families and staff is critical
17 to our mission of equity and excellence. This year we
18 expanded our work with gender and sexuality
19 alliances. GSA, the first ever citywide GSA summit
20 was held January 2018 with over 600 students and GSA
21 advisors in attendance. In addition, our partnership
22 with the Trevor project has provided four train the
23 trainer workshops to school-based staff in
24 recognizing the signs of suicide ideation. We have
25 also hired a licensed social worker centrally to

1
2 focus on family support for vulnerable populations
3 including LGBT students. We believe that all students
4 benefit from diverse and inclusive classrooms. Our
5 work to address segregation and make schools more
6 reflective of the diversity of New York City is
7 critical to the success of our broader agenda. Last
8 year we released the first citywide school diversity
9 plan building on this plan we were excited to
10 announce our first ever district wide school
11 diversity plan in Manhattan district one this fall
12 and have launched a diversity working group in
13 Brooklyn's district 15 with the aim of announcing
14 district 15's middle school diversity plan at the end
15 of the school year. Our citywide school diversity
16 advisory group has also kicked off and is hosting
17 town halls in all five boroughs, we started in the
18 Bronx earlier this month and to solicit... in order to
19 solicit more ideas and feedback from our ongoing
20 work. Career and technical... technology... technical
21 education which we call CTE programs are also a key
22 part of our strategy to put students in the path to
23 college and career. CTE programs provide students
24 with a comprehensive educational experience that
25 includes a strong academic foundation, experiential

1
2 opportunities in the workforce and the development of
3 industry validated skills. Over the last two years
4 through the next year we are launching 40 new high
5 quality CTE programs across the city guided by labor
6 demand and market demand. For the second year in a
7 row city council funding has enabled us to
8 significantly expand and strengthen work-based
9 learning opportunities including paid internships for
10 students enrolled CTE programs. Last year we
11 implemented, implemented new initiatives to support
12 the academic, social and emotional needs of students
13 living in temporary housing, we hired social workers
14 for schools with the highest concentrations of
15 students in shelters, implemented literacy programs
16 in shelters and provided school-based health centers.
17 Additionally, we are providing a yellow school bus
18 service to their home schools for students in grades
19 K through six who reside in the Department of
20 Homeless Service shelter. We remain committed to
21 improving educational opportunities for all English
22 language learners and ensuring that they have access
23 to rigorous instruction and the full range of the
24 Department of Ed's educational opportunity to... within
25 the department. We currently have over 500 bilingual

1
2 programs across each borough. Last September we
3 opened the first ever bilingual program Urdu in
4 district 22 in Brooklyn and expanded Bengali
5 bilingual programs in elementary and high schools.
6 Our commitment to meeting the individual needs of our
7 students with disabilities remain a core priority.
8 This year we have continued to grow our autism
9 spectrum disorder known as ASD Nest and ASD Horizon
10 and bilingual special education programs. We opened
11 new ASD Nest and Horizon programs in seven schools in
12 28 new sections or classes citywide. We established
13 29 new sections of bilingual special education
14 programs across five new districts. In addition,
15 collaborative school communities, an initiative to
16 strengthen partnerships, inclusion practices from 14
17 to 34 school districts as a part of district 79... 75
18 from district's one through district 32 schools. As
19 part of the city's One New York City plan the DOE has
20 opened our first two transition and college access
21 centers in Brooklyn and in the Bronx with plans to
22 expand to every borough in order to broaden supports
23 for students transition to college, career and
24 independent living. None of our instructional
25 programs can achieve it's potential without a strong

1
2 partnership between families and schools that is why
3 family engagement has been a central priority. We are
4 pleased that our increased emphasis on parent
5 engagement has resulted in significantly more parents
6 attending parent teacher conferences and
7 participating in parent groups. In addition, we have
8 offered more skill development opportunities for
9 parent leaders and encourage more parents to take on
10 leadership roles and educational consuls with PTAs
11 and PAs and in community schools. As part of our
12 commitment to engage our diverse families we have
13 significantly expanded and improved language access
14 services for nearly 40 percent of parents who speak a
15 language other than English at home, improvements
16 include hiring nine new full time field language
17 access coordinators to oversee services in schools
18 expanding services into community and citywide
19 educational consuls and giving schools direct 24 hour
20 access to over the phone interpretation in over 200
21 languages. These efforts have led to an almost 70
22 percent increase in school's request for over the
23 phone interpreters this year. We will continue to
24 build upon these positive steps to keep our parents
25 engaged and informed. We are also making investments

1
2 to ensure that all students have access to high
3 quality physical and arts education. through our PE
4 works initiative all schools have completed a needs
5 assessment; an individualized PE action plan and we
6 have hired almost 300 additional certified PE
7 teachers for elementary schools that did not have one
8 before. We are also investing 23 million dollars
9 annually to support the arts education and have the
10 highest number of... and we have the highest number of
11 arts teachers in recent history. The Mayor's
12 Preliminary 19... 2019 budget for our school buildings
13 on this administration's progress and continues the
14 historic investments made in previous years to ensure
15 that students have access to rigorous instruction and
16 nonacademic support to boost achievement and making
17 additional targeted investments in our school. The
18 preliminary budget of approximately 32.5 billion
19 dollars includes 25.6 billion in operation funds and
20 another 6.9 billion in educational related pension,
21 debt and service funds. Our funding is a combination
22 of city, state and federal dollars and the city tax
23 levy dollars making up the largest share at 57
24 percent, state dollars at 37 percent and federal
25 dollars at six percent. In addition to the

1
2 administration's major preliminary budget investments
3 in 3-K for All, the Mayor's budget includes funding
4 to support new antibullying initiatives, including
5 ways to support families in reporting bullying
6 incidents, mental health, first aid training and
7 community workshops anti-bias and anti-bullying
8 training for all staff, increased bullying
9 protections for students and funding for student led
10 clubs that promote diversity and equity. We are also
11 targeting support for 300 schools across the city
12 with high rates of incidents in bullying and we will
13 expand our district 18 restorative justice pilot to
14 district five in Manhattan, 12 in the Bronx and 16 in
15 Brooklyn. Providing student with safe, nurturing
16 learning environments is at the heart of our equity
17 and excellence for all agenda and these investments
18 will build on initiatives such as Single Shepard and
19 community schools to help students succeed
20 academically, socially and emotionally. Non-profit
21 organizations play a vital role in our student's
22 lives bringing a wealth of resources to our
23 classrooms and our schools. We deeply value these
24 partnerships and are delighted the preliminary budget
25 includes funding to waive extended use fees to

1
2 eligible non-profits. This will enable these
3 organizations to continue to access school facilities
4 for programming and events that improve student
5 achievement and enrich school experiences. Since 20...
6 2009 the state has not met its court ordered
7 obligation under the campaign for fiscal equity, in
8 this school year alone New York City public school
9 students have been shortchanged 1.6 billion in state
10 education funds, we have nonetheless raised the
11 citywide average fair student funding level from 88
12 percent to 91 percent. In addition, we are funding
13 renewal and community schools at 100 percent of their
14 fair student funds level and no school in the city is
15 below 87 percent. We're committed to reaching 100
16 percent for all schools, but we can only achieve this
17 goal if the state keeps its commitment to fulfill the
18 CFE settlement. While we are confident that we're
19 headed in the right direction and we're excited to
20 build upon Chancellor Farina's legacy as we welcome
21 our incoming Chancellor Richard Carranza on April
22 2nd. We know there is more work ahead of us, we look
23 forward to our continued partnership with you and our
24 Education Chairs and families and I thank you for
25 this time and we'll be happy to answer any of the

1
2 questions that you may have this afternoon. Thank
3 you.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very much
5 Deputy Chancellor and actually would just like to, to
6 note that I appreciate the DOE's acknowledgement that
7 segregation exists in our schools and in our city.

8 DORITA GIBSON: Thank you...

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I think this is the
10 first time I think we've heard that acknowledgement
11 at this... at this forum and here in the DOE... with the
12 DOE and I do appreciate acknowledging it, of course
13 the work is to solve this and I... and I note for the
14 record that the DOE alone cannot solve this, this
15 will require a lot of different moving parts to get
16 aligned; in our housing policies, land use... [cross-
17 talk]

18 DORITA GIBSON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...city planning, DOE
20 and... but I, I think it's... we begin by acknowledging
21 the problem exists and I appreciate that
22 acknowledgement, I'm sure there will be some more
23 questions on this but I, I want to also just touch on
24 the issue of students in temporary housing. In fiscal
25 year 2017 and 2018 budgets the DOE added 10.3 million

1
2 dollars in order to better support the needs of
3 homeless students, the funds were used to provide
4 literacy support through after school tutoring in
5 shelters and to add social workers in schools to
6 provide homeless students with social, emotional
7 health, mental health services as well as target
8 chronic absenteeism. This is the second year in a row
9 the administration has not included this funding in
10 the preliminary plan, why wasn't this funding
11 included in the fiscal 2019 preliminary plan?

12 DORITA GIBSON: I'm going to turn it to,
13 to Ray for that.

14 RAY ORLANDO: Hi, good afternoon. The
15 students in temporary housing funding included in our
16 current year budget is a ongoing topic of
17 conversation with the Office of Management and Budget
18 and I believe with you all who are... have the
19 responsibility of actually appropriating the funds
20 and we expect... well let me just say I would be
21 surprised if the Mayor's Executive Budget didn't
22 include funding for students in temporary housing.

23 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I would just
24 respectfully say that we don't administer the, the
25 program we certainly want to get funding but we just

1
2 didn't even see it in the plan that was presented to
3 us and that's why we're raising it here and of course
4 I think many of us have read or reviewed the
5 Comptrollers report with regards to the city not
6 meeting the needs of, of, of these vulnerable
7 students and so can you share with us what changes
8 are you considering or discussions you're having with
9 regards to this program right now?

10 ELIZABEHT: So, we are hoping to continue
11 these programs in particular we are looking to
12 slightly increase the number of bridging the gap
13 social workers and also, I believe to expand the
14 number of after school... after school reading club
15 locations in the shelter system.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, just to be
17 clear the DOE is continuing these programs despite
18 the fact they were not reflected in the preliminary
19 budget, is that correct?

20 ELIZABETH ROSE: So, we are hoping that
21 the budget issues will be resolved in exec and we
22 will be able to continue funding these programs.

23 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And would you
24 consider expanding this program and adding additional
25

1
2 social workers and if yes how many and what would the
3 cost be to provide additional social workers?

4 ELIZABETH ROSE: What... the cost for
5 social workers about 100,000 dollars in salary so,
6 you know we, we are looking carefully at all of our
7 programs and we do want to continue supporting these
8 very, very vulnerable and high need students.

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: But the number is
10 significant, the number of, of students that we're
11 talking about here and we do have an obligation to
12 meet their needs so I... it is our expectation and hope
13 that we... it will see an, an increase of support to
14 meet the needs of, of these kids and I would add... I
15 would just add that... and, and you're going to hear me
16 repeat this often but one of the ways that school
17 leaders can better meet the needs of, of, of children
18 is through the fair student funding stream and...
19 because as we've... as, as we've noted, as we've read
20 and reviewed and as I've... as I've seen in my years of
21 experience these... sometimes these students don't stay
22 in one school due to a variety of reasons and so when
23 they enter a school after the attendance register
24 month... [cross-talk]

25 ELIZABETH ROSE: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...the funds don't always travel with them and that becomes an issue for that school community to adequately meet, meet their needs. I would also ask is the DOE considering placing DOE guidance counselors in family shelters because the numbers could fluctuate in a school, but we know that a lot of children are in... living with their... with their families in shelters, is the... is the DOE considering having guidance counselors placed in family shelters?

ELIZABETH ROSE: So, we're focused on supporting schools that have higher numbers of students in shelter in the schools, we are able to identify those schools and while we agree the numbers do fluctuate from year to year and within the year there are some patterns and so that's why we're looking at placing guidance counselors in the schools that have the highest numbers of students in shelter that did not have sufficient social work support.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, what type of communication are we having with family shelters that deal... that, you know basically house these... house these children, I mean do we have any connection and,

1
2 and any type of feedback on the ground at these
3 locations?

4 ELIZABETH ROSE: We, we do, we have
5 through the family assistance, we also have ongoing
6 relationship with Department of Homeless Services and
7 we work very closely with them to ensure that we have
8 full information about students who are coming into
9 the shelter system so that we can provide them with
10 supports.

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: But do we leave it
12 to the family to enroll their child each time they're
13 being moved around, how does that... how does that
14 system work?

15 ELIZABETH ROSE: So, both at intake at
16 PATH and again through the family assistance we help
17 counsel families, families have the right to keep
18 their child in the school of origin and that helps
19 create continuity and support for the student or they
20 have the right to move their student, their child
21 into the school that they would attend if they... based
22 on the zone of where the homeless shelter is located
23 so parents have that choice, we counsel them on that
24 choice and we support them with whichever choice the
25 family makes and we support them through providing

1
2 transportation services whether that's yellow bus
3 service or metro cards and we do now offer yellow bus
4 service for all students in shelter in grades K
5 through six and that counseling, those, those choices
6 the parent has the right to make that choice at any
7 time so we support them with information and then we
8 will support them based on the choice that they make
9 to ensure that their child has the transportation to
10 get to school and in contact with the school itself.

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And the reason why
12 I question about... I, I, I raise the question about a
13 dedicated guidance counselor is because it's, it's
14 becoming more clear that students for a variety
15 reasons they're, they're going through temporary
16 housing or you know there is a significant number of
17 them missing a lot of class... [cross-talk]

18 ELIZABETH ROSE: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and how are we
20 flagging this early to make sure that we're not
21 failing them instructionally because this is
22 affecting the, the family, the child first and
23 foremost, it's effecting the school community for a
24 variety... in a variety of ways but my concern is we're
25 not flagging this early and there's not enough

1
2 adequate communication to address the issue at the
3 onset and we're just simply reacting at the tail end,
4 can you speak to this?

5 ELIZABETH ROSE: So, we do provide
6 students... schools with information when a student is
7 registered at a shelter, so the school does in fact
8 get a flag that they have a student who is now living
9 in shelter so that the school can provide supports to
10 that student.

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And the concern
12 that I have is that the school does not have the
13 resources to adequately support that child because
14 sometimes the needs are far greater than, than, than
15 what the school has as far as capacity to deal with
16 it and that's why I do believe that there needs to be
17 additional social workers, additional guidance
18 counselors dedicated to, to, to this issue and that's
19 why we... the council raised a red flag not seeing
20 these funds in, in the prelim budget but... and I think
21 it's not just about getting it back to where it was
22 last year but obviously the need is getting greater
23 and I think that we want to see the resources aligned
24 with, with the actual need. Not all schools operate
25 with 100 percent of their fair student funding

1
2 entitlements, in fact only renewal and community
3 schools have full funding while all other schools
4 have a minimum of 87 percent on average of their FSF
5 entitlement, if extra foundation aid is granted is
6 there a commitment to raise all schools to 100
7 percent FSF through a phasing process and will all
8 schools see an increase in FSF this year?

9 RAY ORLANDO: I think a lot of that
10 depends on how the state budget shakes out obviously
11 and I believe that will be a conversation that we
12 will have with you all and with OMB when the state
13 budget lands. I think folks know that the formula is...
14 has a floor at 87 percent and an average of 91
15 percent and without the additional CFE resources that
16 you referenced, the 1.6 billion dollars we're unable
17 to bring all schools to 100 percent. The... however the
18 floor has gone up since 2014 when it was at 81
19 percent to its current level of 87 percent and in
20 fact since 2014 FSF has been funded, has seen
21 increased funding of over a billion dollars so we
22 are... we are working our way towards 100 percent and
23 we hope to get there and it would be a heck of a lot
24 easier if we could get the CFE money that you and I
25 both advocate for vehemently and thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Oh, there's no
3 question that the state owes our city schools
4 significant amount of resources and quite frankly
5 that... the number from years ago has significantly
6 increased because of added costs built into our
7 budgets year after year so there's no... there's no
8 dispute about that but the one thing I just... I, I did
9 mention this at our first hearing and its worth
10 repeating during the... during our budget hearing is
11 that in my visits to many of our renewal schools this
12 has been one of the key difference makers for these
13 school communities, having added flexibility to hire
14 additional support staff to better meet the needs of
15 their kids, you know I, I, I go back to a question I
16 asked as a member of this committee in the last term
17 and now... and now as the Chair of the committee I
18 asked a question about the October register month,
19 that's a key month for schools because now you, you
20 get an allocation of kids that are actually enrolled
21 in the building versus projections and immigration
22 patterns don't take into account October register
23 month, families come here from all over the world
24 past October, they come in November, December,
25 January, February beyond. The needs of those kids are

1
2 not being met when they enroll into a public school
3 and the child who might need a paraprofessional for,
4 for, for any variety of reasons the school might not
5 need... might need to hire additional teachers, the
6 school might need, need to hire additional support
7 staff, they don't have the resources. Some of these
8 schools that have become now Rise schools they have
9 been able to hire additional whether it's social
10 workers, guidance to better meet the social,
11 emotional learning needs of their kids so getting
12 schools to 100 percent F, FSF, fair student funding
13 is, is, is a major, major priority definitely for,
14 for us here in the council, for me personally based
15 on what, what I've seen because for all of the
16 advocates, parents and families who say we need more
17 educators, we need more support staff, we need to
18 address social, emotional learning support you have
19 to pay for it and this is how you do it and so yes,
20 the state needs to step up big time, I am tired of
21 the bickering from Albany, they have to do their job
22 but we have to make sure that we are appropriating
23 those resources accordingly and making sure that they
24 have a direct positive impact in the classroom. Now
25 the DOE's budget is projected to increase by.. well

1
2 before I go here how much additional funding is
3 needed to get all schools to 100 percent of their
4 fair student funding entitlement?

5 RAY ORLANDO: This year that number would
6 be over 700 million dollars.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And the DOE's
8 budget is projected to increase by 1.3 billion
9 dollars when compared to the fiscal year 2018 adopted
10 budget so please explain to us how this increase will
11 impact individual school budgets?

12 RAY ORLANDO: Much of the increase is
13 actually due to mandated growth and expenditures that
14 we have no control over. Those expenses include
15 pension costs, fringe benefits, debt service, there
16 are increasing payments to charter schools, much of
17 the money that... much of the growth that you see
18 between '18 and '19 is for mandated expenses without
19 additional resources from the state under the CFE
20 commitment we'll have to see if... what we're able to
21 do in the upcoming year but I, I don't foresee there
22 being a significant increase in, in, in school
23 budgets year over year.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, am I hearing
25 correctly that right now in your current plan there

1
2 is no... there's no effort or no initiative to increase
3 the fair student funding stream for, for... of our
4 public schools?

5 RAY ORLANDO: The fair student funding
6 stream is going to be dependent on how the state
7 budget shakes out and unless we receive the funds
8 that we're owed I do not believe it's going to be
9 possible to raise the floor in the upcoming year from
10 87 but we'll have to see.

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Well the DOE has
12 increased head count in, in certain areas, we have
13 seen increases in hiring for literacy coaches, we've
14 seen increases in hiring at central, we have seen
15 increases in certain areas I just want to make sure
16 that when we have these resources we're actually
17 making a direct impact in, into a classroom. I have a
18 couple of questions on teacher... on teacher
19 recruitment and then I want to turn to my colleagues
20 because I know many of them have been very patient.
21 We have seen a steady decline of teachers with five
22 years or more experience leaving the system, how do
23 we explain for that?

24 RAY ORLANDO: Teacher recruitment and
25 retention is one of our great challenges as, as you

1
2 know and as this council knows, I believe that over
3 time what has happened is teaching as a profession
4 has changed, we are in fact in a place where a lot of
5 teachers of longstanding have decided to retire after
6 long careers and I think what we're seeing is that
7 folks who come into the system as recent graduates
8 have a different profile historically than we've seen
9 in teaching. I think the younger generation doesn't
10 see working in one place for many decades as a career
11 path that's common and so we see a lot of folks who
12 leave us at earlier ages and who in fact might stay
13 two, three, four, or five years but might not stay
14 ten years so we... the, the mix is kind of changing as
15 the profession has changed and as frankly society has
16 changed.

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Well I, I will say
18 that now I'm going to former teacher hat on and not
19 just Chair of this committee, there are very real
20 reasons why we, we are experiencing this problem and
21 they deal with finances in my opinion we don't pay
22 teachers enough. I believe also an issue that we, we,
23 we hear about, but we have to understand when
24 political leaders talk about paid family leave it
25 actually does not really pertain to educators that is

1
2 a major issue and there is a significant financial
3 burden placed on educators when they decide to have
4 families and that's just not acceptable and in a city
5 like New York that prides itself to be the capital...
6 the, the progressive capital we have a lot of work to
7 do and I believe that that has a profound impact on
8 the ability to attract and to retain educators. I
9 want to particularly hone in as well on the, the
10 challenges that DOE is experiencing to recruit
11 bilingual teachers, can, can, can we hear why is the
12 DOE having difficulty hiring bilingual teachers?

13 URSULINA RAMIREZ: I'll start and then
14 I'll let my colleagues jump in. So, we actually
15 recently got some additional flexibility from the
16 state around a hiring of bilingual and dual language
17 teachers. As you know a lot... our students speak a
18 wide range, range of languages and trying to ensure
19 that we have teachers who speak all of those
20 languages has just... it's been a difficulty for all of
21 us but I do... we... you know we are rapidly opening up
22 dual language and bilingual programs and trying to
23 find additional incentives to, to hire more bilingual
24 teachers and just to note on, on... another thing
25 around teacher recruitment that goes into the

1
2 bilingual education dual language but also broader
3 recruitment is really thinking about education not
4 just as a ladder but a lattice and making sure that
5 there are master and model teachers and we work
6 really closely with our union partners to make sure
7 that we're giving our teachers options that are not
8 just going into the administration... into an
9 administrative role for folks who want to stay in
10 teaching but still want to be supportive partners to
11 their fellow teachers so I just wanted to add that
12 context.

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And, and I have a,
14 a... just a... just a follow up on that, how does the DOE
15 evaluate bilingual teachers particularly in cases
16 where they are supervisors they're not fluent in the
17 language being taught?

18 DORITA GIBSON: Well, well supervisors
19 supervise basically on a... on a criteria of what's
20 needed and they, they don't often speak the language
21 but they do look at their lesson plan, they.. the
22 teacher is bilingual because she can really prepare
23 her, her lessons with her assistant principal or
24 principal in, in English if the.. if the principal
25 doesn't speak that language and that's gone over

1
2 before they do the formal observation so they can do
3 that, they, they, they visit the classrooms quite
4 frequently, they talk to children, they talk to the
5 teachers as well. The other part that we're trying to
6 do is to, to really find administrators who
7 supervised foreign language in another language and
8 that, that really is the key, we try to do that, and
9 we do that the best that we can, and we continue to
10 recruit, and we continue to look for that.

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right because as a
12 former teacher I know one of the areas where teachers
13 are observed is in the area of engagement and making
14 sure the students are, are lively and the teacher is
15 facilitating the discussion and that could be a
16 challenge when you have not everyone understanding
17 the language that's, that's spoken in the room so I
18 just wanted just to make sure that the DOE is
19 providing support to schools in these circumstances.
20 I do have some more questions, but I want to be
21 mindful of my colleagues and their time and I think
22 it is only right that the first Council Member to ask
23 questions is the Chair of our Finance Committee and
24 the outstanding Education Chair of our council before
25 as well, Council Member Danny Dromm.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Council Member
3 Kallos tried to beat me out but I got here extra
4 early... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Oh... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...as teachers
7 should.

8 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Chair, Chair Dromm
9 the only difference I would say is that now we have
10 to put members on the clock... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Yes... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...that's something
13 we have to... that's an adjustment period.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I'm fully aware of
15 that and that's why I'm trying to prioritize my
16 questions for the... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...department but...
19 [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you... [cross-
21 talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...let me also say
23 that it's been pleasure to work with our new Chair,
24 he's been fantastic and I look forward to really
25 continuing to work with him and also to thank the

1
2 Department of Ed and Chancellor Farina and all of you
3 at the table as well for the, what I would say a
4 wonderful job that you did over the last four years
5 in terms of student outcomes and, and really, really
6 working hard and close with me and I... and I thank you
7 and congratulate you on the gains that, that you have
8 made, you know one area of major concern for me and
9 I'm glad it was mentioned in your testimony Deputy
10 Chancellor Gibson, is the LGBT students and I know
11 that in this years budget we put in about... or you put
12 in about 1.5 million dollars for anti-bullying,
13 social and emotional learning supports, how is that
14 going and has that money been spent?

15 ELIZABETH ROSE: So, we are in the
16 process of doing a lot of work around LGBTQ students
17 in particular. As Deputy Chancellor Gibson said we
18 just did our first GSA summit, we have an upcoming
19 LGBT and gender inclusive curriculum conference
20 coming up in June on the anti-bullying social
21 emotional learning front, we have provided funding to
22 300 schools to do social emotional learning training
23 with their staff that has... those monies have been
24 provided to the schools and we are meeting with the

25

1
2 three district superintendents where we'll be
3 expanding the restorative justice... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: How many schools
5 are you working with for that... in that one... 1.5
6 million do you know?

7 ELIZABETH ROSE: So, we have 300 schools
8 that are each receiving social emotional learning
9 training at across the three districts I'd have to
10 come back to you with a, a number on the three
11 districts that are receiving restorative justice
12 training and then we also provided funding for
13 superintendents to help them working with their
14 principals.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, great. Let
16 me ask you also about the Gay, Straight Alliance
17 expansion, that has not started yet but is there a
18 plan now how that is going to move forward moving
19 into the next budget cycle if approved?

20 ELIZABETH ROSE: So, I know we have
21 funding for diversity clubs at schools where schools
22 would apply to... for, for us to provide funding to
23 support the opening of additional diversity clubs
24 which would include GSAs, we're also creating with
25 the funds that we have to support LGBT students, we

1
2 are creating handbooks and guidance to help schools
3 get these clubs off the ground and, and learn how to
4 from their colleagues, learn how to operate and
5 promote these clubs to their students.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Have you seen an
7 increase in the number of GSAs in schools?

8 ELIZABETH ROSE: So, I still don't think
9 we have a central track of exactly how many there
10 are, but we are certainly in supporting GSA
11 activities in our schools through the fund... through
12 the summits, through the curriculum training as well
13 as other initiatives.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: And let me also
15 ask you because I'm running out of time, the LGBT
16 community liaison office got a 500,000 dollar
17 increase in their budget... [cross-talk]

18 ELIZABETH ROSE: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...last year, has
20 that money begun to be spent and in what areas was it
21 spent?

22 ELIZABETH ROSE: It, it has begun to be
23 spent and in fact it is also been baselined into the
24 budget for next year and those funds include the GSA
25 summit, the curriculum conference, some suicide

1
2 prevention work with Trevor project, we've hired a
3 social worker as a family support manager for a
4 vulnerable populations, we have a number of family
5 and community engagement training dates, we have
6 professional development on gender identity and so
7 we've had a number of, of activities related to this
8 funding.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Can I just quickly
10 ask what would it mean Mr. Chair if I... if you... if you
11 don't mind if every school was funded at 100 percent
12 fair student funding formula how much per school... how
13 much more money per school would each school get
14 approximately?

15 RAY ORLANDO: I'll have to come back to
16 you on that, I'm sorry, it's, it's a little
17 complicated obviously but... it's knowable I just don't
18 know it, I'm sorry but I can get it for you... [cross-
19 talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: But you... I would
21 estimate it's probably in the hundreds of thousands,
22 am I right on average?

23 RAY ORLANDO: Depends, the school sizes
24 are different, we fund the students not the schools,
25

1
2 super complicated but I, I can get it for you but I,
3 I, I just don't have... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, I'm sure
5 it's... [cross-talk]

6 RAY ORLANDO: ...it in my head... [cross-
7 talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...significant,
9 yeah... [cross-talk]

10 RAY ORLANDO: I'm happy to look... [cross-
11 talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: It is significant...
13 [cross-talk]

14 RAY ORLANDO: It probably not be
15 insignificant I will... I will grant you that it would
16 not insignificant, yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Uh-huh. Okay,
18 thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Chair
20 Dromm, it is significant and that's why it matters so
21 much. Next, we'll turn it over to, to, to Council
22 Member Kallos.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you to
24 Finance Chair Dromm for your current and past
25 leadership and our new Chair Mark Treyger, it said

1
2 some... says something when former teachers have led
3 our Education Committee for two consecutive terms, I
4 will use my time to ask three questions so pencils
5 out. Thank you to Mayor De Blasio and Chancellor
6 Farina for finally keeping the promise of universal
7 school lunch which combined with breakfast after the
8 bell has done much to take on youth hunger but we
9 have one meal remaining, how many schools offer after
10 school with dinner programs to how many students and
11 how much would it cost to roll it out to every school
12 with how much federal reimbursement available?
13 Second, as a proud graduate of the Bronx high school
14 of science, a public school I was disappointed to see
15 reports of a decrease in qualifying scores for
16 children of color, when I attended there was a
17 discovery program that opened specialized high
18 schools to low income children with lower scores
19 following a summer enrichment program. In 2016 I was
20 happy to see the Mayor announced the discovery
21 program for Brooklyn Tech where his son graduated,
22 will you make the discovery program available to
23 Stuyvesant and Bronx Science to increase
24 opportunities to low income communities of color and
25 my last question is, last week I joined students in

1
2 grade, middle and high schools in walking out for
3 sensible gun reform without knowledge of whether it
4 would be met with discipline, I understand the Mayor
5 also participated, what is the DOE policy on this
6 activism and despite prior opposition with so many
7 student activists will DOE now support an expansion
8 of the young adult voter registration act from
9 providing registration forms with diplomas to
10 actually registering, registering students in school
11 along with mock voting and supporting the council
12 legislation to do just that?

13 ELIZABETH ROSE: Okay, I will start with
14 question number one which was about food, we do offer
15 a supper service at schools, I don't have the number
16 of schools that are currently serving it, but we can
17 follow up with your office after this meeting and
18 happy to discuss where we're seeing use of that. We
19 do know that it is an important component for many
20 families and that families sometimes choose to
21 participate in after school programs because they
22 know that there is that supper program available to
23 them.

24

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I, I would love
3 to have an eye towards universal after school with
4 universal supper, great, next question.

5 DORITA GIBSON: And I'll answer the
6 question on the discovery program. We... under this
7 administration we really increased our seats in
8 discovery which is a great thing, Bronx Science is
9 involved with it as well. This year we're opening up
10 discovery to Stuyvesant, the principal has been
11 working very hard with that and last year we spoke
12 about it in length and this, this summer he's... and,
13 and he's going to start participating with the other
14 specialized high schools to advance this year.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Great and last
16 question. Student voter registration and mock voting
17 and will the kids get in trouble for walking out with
18 us.

19 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Go ahead.

20 ELIZABETH ROSE: So, on the discipline
21 related to the walk out, in... we did send guidance to
22 all principals as well as to families that obviously
23 if a parent sent in notice that their child would
24 walk out that there would be no implications at all,
25 any student who participated in the walk out without

1
2 that would be included in a... the, the infraction
3 known as BO3 which is cutting class for which there
4 is a very mild disciplinary response of typically a
5 conversation with the school counselor.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And voter
7 registration.

8 URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, on that piece we...
9 so, in... just recently the Mayor announced he'd fix
10 education for all to which we will be expanding voter
11 registration and really thankful to you all who have
12 been leading this work for the past couple of years
13 and so we're excited to expand voter registration.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And mock voting.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, thank you
16 Council Member Kallos, pens... pencils down I guess. Is
17 it... yeah, there's no extra time here and I'm joking.
18 Next, we have Council Member Lander.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Mr.
20 Chair, you know I admire the... Council Member Kallos's
21 effective strategy so I'll put my three questions out
22 for you guys as well. And I will start also by just
23 praising the Chancellor and we're going to... we're
24 going to miss her a lot. I'm excited about the roll
25 out of participatory budgeting in our high schools so

1
2 props to the Mayor and the DOE on that. So, three
3 questions, well first the district 15 middle school
4 integration planning process is great, Council Member
5 Menchaca and I have been at every meeting, it has not
6 been simple, but it has probably... and I want to give
7 big props to Sadie for her leadership and WXY is
8 going a good job, it is probably the most thoughtful
9 set of conversations about race and inequality and
10 education that I have been a part of they are really
11 diverse, we're asking hard questions, we're being
12 honest about segregation and, and the challenges of
13 integration, I have found it really encouraging and
14 would encourage people to come to public workshops
15 three and four. I'm not so sure about only doing it
16 in places where the districts ask because of course
17 the history of segregation is one in which there's
18 resistance not like... but that said question one is,
19 it's working well in D15, is there money in the
20 budget to do it in other districts, I don't know that
21 other districts have been chosen but are we putting
22 the resources there to do what WXY is doing in D15 in
23 other districts? Question two, you know I'll just run
24 out... I'm going to put my questions on the table,
25 thank you. question two, I know it's not any... well

1
2 you guys pay for the school based health centers in
3 the renewal schools but there are school based health
4 centers in schools beyond the renewal schools that
5 the state has been paying for but the state has been
6 dramatically reducing the funding and jeopardizing
7 the school based health centers in many of our
8 schools and I'm nervous they're not going to fund
9 them and we're going to lose them, can you update us
10 on that status and let us know what we can do to make
11 sure we don't lose the school based health centers in
12 those schools in our districts whether they are or
13 aren't renewal schools and then third maybe most
14 pointedly and this is not budget question but it's a
15 timely question. It was brought to my attention that
16 the DOE has changed the language in the FAQ's about
17 testing the... whereas last year's let people... parents
18 know about their right to opt out, the new guide it
19 does not include any language about parent's rights
20 to opt out, it's significantly different and I just
21 want to know why is that change and why is that
22 information not being provided and I, I can read it
23 to you if, if you need to see it, it's what was given
24 in 217 and 218 is significantly different and it does
25 not contain information on parent's right to opt out

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

of the test, it was a... I was very surprised by it and find it pretty disturbing, but I did not engineer that falling over to provide dramatic effect, okay...

[cross-talk]

URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, to that last point if you can send that to us that would be really helpful but I'm, I'm not aware of that language change and so I want to make sure... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay, I mean...

[cross-talk]

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...I'll... I'm looking at... [cross-talk]

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...both of them I'll send them to you right away, it's a... it's a significant change so...

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Okay. We'll, we'll look into that right away. On, on district 15... well one, thank you so much, I know you've been an active participant in district 15's conversations and like you said it's not... they're not the easiest conversations to have but necessary. We are looking to explore other districts, agree with you it's not

1
2 always the districts who are saying I want to do this
3 that we need to be targeting. Right now, we do not
4 have in our current budget plans for expansion but
5 with that being said we are looking at the successes
6 of district 15 and the successes of district one to
7 assess what would it cost to expand this to
8 additional districts. So, we'll be working with our
9 partners in OMB to, to, to figure that out especially
10 as we see the successes of D15 and D1.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And if you could
12 get us the cost of what it would cost... [cross-talk]

13 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...to do that would
15 be very helpful.

16 URSULINA RAMIREZ: We will do that.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

18 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Uh-huh.

19 ELIZABETH ROSE: So, question number two
20 is related to school-based health centers, I will
21 take that one. We share your concerns about the state
22 funding to our partners who are providing the school-
23 based health centers and the cut backs in, in that
24 reimbursement and it does place some risk for our
25 school-based health centers, we completely agree and

1
2 share your concerns. We typically need at least 700
3 students in a building for a school-based health
4 center to make sense through the reimbursement
5 process that those health centers operate under and
6 so lobbying to support the continued reimbursement of
7 these health care providers is something that you
8 could do that could be very impactful.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay, alright.
10 Mr. Chair I hope we can work on that together I'm
11 nervous that Albany is not going to do right by our
12 schools in this area as well which is not a surprise
13 but is a problem.

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Absolutely and, and
15 thank you Council Member, Member Lander for really
16 working on this issue and for your leadership in the
17 district 15 work as well. I'd like to... oh I... okay,
18 Council Member Rodriguez.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I have to give
20 credit to the administration for a lot of good things
21 that we have seen in the last four years while of
22 course where we are as city take us also to address
23 how we have failed to our students for decades still
24 today we have not been able and I know that that
25 does... that doesn't change so fast and so quick to be

1
2 sure that we guarantee that all the students who are
3 graduating from high school are college material,
4 many of them they are sent to community college and
5 they need remedial courses more than 80 percent in
6 math, science and I think that, you know definitely
7 the early childhood education investment that we have
8 sent right now I hope that it will pay off in the
9 future but we cannot wait, we have to continue
10 thinking outside the box. We know that 42 percent of
11 the students in New York City are from the 1.2 they
12 are Latinos, a big percent they are ELLs, right? What
13 percent is our ELLs? what's that?

14 [off-mic dialogue]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Almost half,
16 right, of the New York City... of those 42 percent they
17 are English language learners and first of all I'm
18 surprised that the Chancellor for the ELLs she's not
19 here because for the first time we have seen how this
20 administration recognizes that number in translating
21 putting someone in charge of that population but the
22 fact that she's not here for me is a little bit of a
23 surprise, she should be here because we're talking
24 about a, a particular sector in the DOE that needs a
25 lot of work, you know we have failed to the ELLs and

1
2 I'm talking... I'm not talking about this
3 administration, I'm talking about we as a city, you
4 know today we had... still dealing with a reality where
5 we are welcoming the English language learner
6 students but they are not getting all the services,
7 sometimes they're even asked to graduate with the
8 same proficiencies of the English and native American
9 within the same time frame something that it is
10 impossible so for me... one concern that I have...
11 question that I have first of all, one, how... why the
12 Chancellor isn't here to, second, how poverty is used
13 in the formula per each school to distribute budget
14 in our school and the last question is, a student who
15 take the AP in Spanish they get to read the
16 instruction in English, why the ELL students who take
17 the AP of science and math doesn't get also to have
18 the option to get the instruction in Spanish.

19 DORITA GIBSON: So, I'll answer part of
20 that question and then I'll let Ray answer the fiscal
21 piece on terms of the budget, but we've spent 400
22 million dollars in ELL work and, and we are dedicated
23 to that work with the Deputy Chancellor Baez. There's
24 a lot of work to be done, a lot of work has been done
25 over the last four years. I, I will agree that we

1
2 have been reminiscent in, in making sure that all the
3 services are covered but we're moving in that
4 direction by opening up more bilingual classes and
5 we're opening more dual language classes than ever
6 before in the city and we're paying a great deal of
7 attention to our students with, with English
8 language... who are English language learners. The,
9 the... I'll have to get back to you on the, the test
10 question because I think that if there is a bilingual
11 science program or a bilingual program in the school
12 in regents classes they could take that test in their
13 home language but if they're in an English class I
14 will have to really look into that to get more
15 information on that for you, I don't know that
16 answer.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: And, and I'm
18 not... I'm not asking for... you know taking the... I, I
19 used to be... I've been a co-founder to a school, a
20 teacher for 13 years... [cross-talk]

21 DORITA GIBSON: Yes... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...so I, I
23 understand that, that, that option is there but I'm
24 talking about when the student gets to take the AP...
25 [cross-talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

DORITA GIBSON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: The AP in Spanish give the option for the student to get... to read the instruction in English, why... and this is a suggestion if you look at it and explore... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And this will be the final... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...why the ELL student... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...point... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...couldn't also who take the AP of science and math especially the ELLs don't get to also to have the option to read the instruction in Spanish... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright... [cross-talk]

DORITA GIBSON: So, so we get that... we get the exams from the college board for the AP classes and, and we'll, we'll look into that to see why that is so.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Very good and we'll now turn to Council Member Rosenthal.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Oh...

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: And about the poverty, how poverty is used to distribute the budget?

RAY ORLANDO: Oh sure... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: If you don't mind?

RAY ORLANDO: So, there are weights in the... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And this will not be used against Council Member Rosenthal's time but go ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I appreciate you, thank you Treyger.

RAY ORLANDO: There are poverty weights in the fair student funding formula depending on the poverty level, in addition there are weights for English language learners specifically in a variety of both H bands and proficiency and two years ago we added 40 million dollars to the formula for when we created two what we call new commanding weights which are services to ELL students who have formally finished being ELL students and are no longer

1
2 categorized as ELL students but still require
3 transitional services.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Correct and
5 actually thanks to the incredible staff here we have
6 in the city council we actually did examine how
7 poverty is accounted for in schools particularly up
8 to the third grade because below the third grade
9 there's not much assessments that we can measure by
10 however I'll, I'll add that I think it should be more
11 than what we saw in those numbers but that's a
12 discussion that we're going to have in, in our budget
13 as well. Next, Council Member Rosenthal.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so
15 much Chair Treyger, great to see the A-team. Let me
16 ask you... I want to ask actually about accessibility,
17 you know when we talk about the MTA, you know we know
18 that only 125 out of 400 stations are, are
19 accessible, wheelchair accessible, what's the
20 analogous set of numbers for the DOE, how many
21 schools are wheelchair accessible?

22 ELIZABETH ROSE: Hold on, I have it and
23 I'm just trying to figure out... I have this, I'm just
24 trying to figure out where in my binder I have it,
25 Erin can you... if you can... ah it's in the capital plan

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

binder which is on Monday so if you ask that question again on Monday we'll have an answer... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, so let me ask... [cross-talk]

ELIZABETH ROSE: ...and I'll follow up with you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...it a different way... [cross-talk]

ELIZABETH ROSE: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...I appreciate you... [cross-talk]

ELIZABETH ROSE: We... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...and if... whoever's bringing the binder just make a Xerox of the sheet and bring it up to me beforehand... [cross-talk]

ELIZABETH ROSE: Right... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...that would be great be... and then so let me ask you the corollary question. One of the things that I found in my schools that do have elevators is there's a real disconnect between having it and... [cross-talk]

ELIZABETH ROSE: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...who has the
3 key to make it work and I understand the very strict
4 rules that you have to have but do you... what kind of
5 training goes into making sure custodian or whoever's
6 responsible for the key is instructed... you use a key
7 to let the elevator work member one and number two
8 along the same lines I was very excited that a new
9 school that went up in my district got a hearing loop
10 but unfortunately it was put in the cafeteria where a
11 loop does no help because they're a loop in a, a
12 looped system for... [cross-talk]

13 ELIZABETH ROSE: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...people who
15 have hearing loss, you know what you need it is in
16 like an assembly room where there would be a
17 microphone and that's how the loop works is to help
18 people in the audience who are hard of hearing, if
19 you have the loop set up in a cafeteria it does... it
20 has... serves no function so I'm wondering like do you
21 have accessibility people at central who... [cross-
22 talk]

23 ELIZABETH ROSE: Yep... [cross-talk]

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...pay attention

to this or how does it work because we've had some
frustrating experiences?

ELIZABETH ROSE: So, we're actually
really proud of the work that we've been doing on
accessibility and we, we know that we sort of in,
inherited a lot of work to do and still a lot of work
to come. We now have I believe about seven staff
members across SCA, DSF and the space management
group who are focused on accessibility, they have... we
have an accessibility committee that is looking on a
district by district basis; elementary... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Deputy...

[cross-talk]

ELIZABETH ROSE: ...school, middle schools...

[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...Chancellor

Rose... [cross-talk]

ELIZABETH ROSE: ...high schools... I'm
taking up your time, sorry... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: You are and to
be honest with you my question is... don't tell me what
you're doing like... with all due respect what I'm
saying is with... what you're doing now isn't working

1
2 because I've just given you two examples where under
3 the current... under the system you have now with a
4 school that you built under... not you personally
5 although you've been extraordinary in help... you
6 personally have been extraordinary in helping it get
7 up and going I'm just saying it's not working, I have
8 an, an example of a hearing loop that got put in a
9 space that can't use functionally, a hearing loop so
10 who's idea was that and how much more tax payer money
11 are we going to have to spend to get it in the right
12 place and secondly... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And this is the
14 final question Council Member... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...the key
16 system just doesn't work. The... it's not working for
17 students who need to use the elevator to get around
18 because the rules around it are too constricting for
19 a functional use for a kid in a wheelchair and then
20 my second question just sort of that I know my
21 colleague Council Member Brannan's going to pick up
22 on is about the Governor who said this morning in
23 answer to the question when Cynthia Nixon talks about
24 fair funding for our schools his answer was to say
25 the total amount of money that's given over from the

1
2 state to the city indicating that it's a lot of
3 money, look we're a big city, we spend a lot of
4 money, we're... we spend a lot of money because we're
5 big probably our education budget is larger than a
6 smaller city's because we're bigger so do you have
7 the answer to the question, how much money should the
8 state be giving New York City if we're at 87 to... what
9 did you say, 87 to 91 percent CFE for each school,
10 how... what's... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: SFS... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...the
13 additional piece, thank you?

14 ELIZABETH ROSE: Ray asked... answered that
15 a little bit earlier today, the additional piece of
16 funding from the state... [cross-talk]

17 RAY ORLANDO: Sure, it would be... so, the
18 state owes us one... this year one billion 600 million
19 dollars under the CFE promise... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And then...
21 [cross-talk]

22 RAY ORLANDO: And it would be... [cross-
23 talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...oddly he said
25 that he didn't have the information of how much money

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

gets spent per school, the... isn't... I mean I looked
that up and... [cross-talk]

RAY ORLANDO: Wow... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...when I was
doing some work... [cross-talk]

RAY ORLANDO: That, that information's
available... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...is there a
reason the Governor... [cross-talk]

RAY ORLANDO: ...on... yeah, I... that
information... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...doesn't have
it... [cross-talk]

RAY ORLANDO: ...is available on our
website.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes, in, in our...
[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you...
[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...in our... yes, thank
you Council Member. In our discussions with the
Governor I, I informed him and his staff of what a
school allocation memo is and where, where we could
find them, and I thank the committee staff here as,

1
2 as well. Yeah, there was some education happening up
3 in Albany. So, I'd like to... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Was that
5 before or after his eleven o'clock call on the...
6 [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, it, it, it...
8 [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...Brian Legrer
10 show... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...somehow... [cross-
12 talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I'm just
14 curious... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...did not make it
16 into the letter but it's okay. I'd like to now call
17 upon Council Member Barron.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Mr.
19 Chair, thank you to the panel for coming. I too am
20 disappointed the Chancellor even though she's leaving
21 is not here because I would have asked her why it is
22 that a school that was forced to co-locate with
23 another school still after a full year has not been
24 able to get their media center up and running and
25 they still have not been able to get all of the

1
2 things that they were promised in such flowery
3 language and I think you understand that's 233
4 Langston Hughes School still after a full year of
5 being located... co-located has not been able to get
6 their video lab up. To follow up on Council Member
7 Lander's point about the letter to parents not
8 including information about opting out a friend of
9 mine has a child in I think 6th grade and the
10 principal has told the parents that if their child
11 opts out and does not come to school on the day of
12 the test they will be given a score of one so I'd
13 like to have your response to that and I can give you
14 the principal's name so you can let the principal
15 know if in fact that's correct and another question I
16 have is will there be a locked box for CFE funds to
17 whatever degree we will receive them so that we will
18 know that that money is dedicated to those particular
19 schools, will that be a guarantee? I'd like to know
20 how many teachers particularly in the middle school
21 level are teaching out of... out of license
22 particularly for math and science because I have some
23 stats from schools in my district and I was never
24 able to get a definitive answer each and every time
25 that I've asked that question, I'd like to know for

1
2 the AP exams that have been taken what is the number
3 of students that have passed the various AP exams and
4 I'd like to know what you're doing to address the
5 trend that continues to see a decline of black
6 teachers in our public school system? Okay, since you
7 not have answered that I have another question I'll
8 add with that, you have a comment in your remarks
9 about CTE teachers and I know it's been a challenge
10 to get teachers who are to be certified by the state
11 so what is it that you're doing in that regard as
12 well?

13 DORITA GIBSON: So, let me start with
14 Langston Hughes and, and we'll... we have to look into
15 that, they should be getting their video conferencing
16 in... and all of their media center up and running, I,
17 I don't know why that is but, but I will look into
18 that and I'll talk to the superintendent right after
19 this hearing today on... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you...
21 [cross-talk]

22 DORITA GIBSON: ...that, definitely should
23 be happening. CTE, we are looking to certify teachers
24 on, on... more and more working with the universities
25 to make sure that we can find licensed CTE teachers

1
2 and we're building more and more CTE programs across
3 the city, so we have someone who is working with
4 that, John Woodland in our office... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Has there been a
6 change in the state requirement that would facilitate
7 getting that done, my understanding is... [cross-talk]

8 DORITA GIBSON: We've been working with
9 the state.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, so if you
11 were a firefighter and you wanted to teach at the
12 firefighter high school in my district, there was a
13 roadblock to that.

14 DORITA GIBSON: Right, because, because
15 they didn't have a license to teach... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-
17 talk]

18 DORITA GIBSON: ...they didn't have a
19 teacher's license... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Correct... [cross-
21 talk]

22 DORITA GIBSON: ...so we've been working
23 with the state to see if we could have a waiver and
24 what we can do to work with that but... [cross-talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

DORITA GIBSON: ...it's not been rectified.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, thank you so much Council Member... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: No, I have a lot of questions that I need answers to.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And once they follow up we... to complete the answers then we'll turn to the next Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, on... and on the principal... sorry, I'm trying to make sure I track all the questions which is a little bit more difficult than I thought. On... your, your opt out question yes, we would love... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes... [cross-talk]

URSULINA RAMIREZ: ...the principal's name and this is the first I've heard of it when Council Member Lander said it as well so I'd love to see that language so we can make sure that we are sending clarifying language out and to your question around if a student will get a, a one if they don't take the

1
2 test there... no... they will not be... since they're not
3 taking the test they will not be... have any score.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, so perhaps
5 you can... I'll give you the... [cross-talk]

6 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Yes... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...information and
8 you can let the teachers know... [cross-talk]

9 URSULINA RAMIREZ: And then we will send
10 you... I'll get you information around the results for
11 AP, I don't have that on me, but we'll definitely get
12 that to you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And teachers out
14 of license?

15 DORITA GIBSON: Yeah, we have to look
16 into that as well to, to give you the accurate number
17 of our middle school teachers you're asking...

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And declining
19 black teachers?

20 URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, we have an
21 initiative called NYC Men Teach where we are trying
22 to aggressively recruit black and Latino teachers, we
23 have seen an uptake I believe of two percent that is
24 not... we're not necessarily satisfied with that number
25

1
2 we want to see more, we're working on both retention
3 and recruitment.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, I think the
5 problem is that you're getting black teachers in but
6 black teachers are leaving so you're not seeing an
7 increase, so I think we need to do that. Thank you,
8 Mr. Chair.

9 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Agreed, thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Sure, thank you,
11 thank you Council Member. Next, we'll hear from
12 Council Member Mark Levine.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you Mr.
14 Chair and great to see all of you. The current
15 Chancellor to her credit she has a passion of mine
16 which is foreign language education. I want to ask
17 you a couple questions about the state of this work,
18 we generally do it backwards in this city and in this
19 country where most people get... most kids get foreign
20 language in high school when it's much tougher to
21 acquire a native speaker fluency and most children
22 when they are younger and can easily absorb new
23 languages do not get. Can you tell us what percent of
24 elementary school kids are receiving foreign language
25 education?

1
2 DORITA GIBSON: I, I cannot give you the
3 percentage, I can get back to you with that but we do
4 have some of our elementary schools that do teach,
5 teach foreign language in our schools, the, the goal
6 is that by the time they reach ninth grade that
7 they've had some hours of foreign language, most of
8 it happens in the middle school but there are some
9 elementary schools that do teach foreign language.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Right, like the...
11 so, so is it that the... does the DOE lack good stats
12 on this or you just don't have it at your fingertips?

13 DORITA GIBSON: Well here, it's... 50
14 percent of all... our elementary school students that
15 are in dual language programs, but I know you're not
16 talking about dual language programs... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: So, you're right
18 I do want to ask about that, so you said what
19 percent?

20 DORITA GIBSON: 50 percent of all
21 students in our dual language programs are getting a
22 foreign language.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: 50 percent of all
24 students... [cross-talk]

25 DORITA GIBSON: That are... [cross-talk]

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Well, well if...

3

[cross-talk]

4

DORITA GIBSON: ...that are in the dual

5

language... [cross-talk]

6

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: ...by, by

7

definition, yes.

8

DORITA GIBSON: Correct.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Well I would like

10

to know the number of students who are in dual

11

language in elementary school or at any grade but I'd

12

also like to know beyond that children who are not

13

lucky enough to be in such an emergent program how

14

many are getting substantial foreign language

15

education in elementary school, do you have any of

16

those numbers... [cross-talk]

17

DORITA GIBSON: I will... I will have to

18

get numbers back for you to, to tell you the number

19

of elementary schools that are actually teaching

20

foreign language, but I can tell you that by the time

21

they reach ninth, ninth grade they have already taken

22

some form of foreign language and most of that

23

happens in the middle schools.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Right... [cross-

25

talk]

1
2 DORITA GIBSON: And by the time they
3 reach... and, and it's a requirement that middle
4 schools do teach foreign language and it's a
5 requirement of the... to get a regular diploma that you
6 have to have a, a unit of foreign language, there are
7 three exams that you have to take; the checkpoint A,
8 the checkpoint B and checkpoint C for foreign
9 language that does not just happen starting in high
10 school it starts usually in middle school but as I
11 said there are some elementary school students that
12 do get foreign language, the work does start in
13 elementary school because by the time they reach high
14 school they had to have had some units of foreign
15 language...

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Got it, so I,
17 I've... I ask this question every year... [cross-talk]

18 DORITA GIBSON: Do you... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: ...and I've been
20 very frustrated at what doesn't appear to be a global
21 vision of the system in asking and answering some
22 very basic questions about how many children are
23 getting it at the age in which people can absorb with
24 native speaker fluency which is when they're young
25 and middle school is better than high school but

1
2 there's no substitute for giving children this gift,
3 it's an incredible gift... [cross-talk]

4 DORITA GIBSON: Absolutely... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: ...they absorb it
6 effortlessly and I walk into schools which are dual
7 language French or, or Mandarin or Russian and
8 children who are not even of those ethnic backgrounds
9 are speaking almost without even knowing they've done
10 something heroic with perfect native speaker fluency.
11 I think that we have three percent of elementary
12 school kids who are in emerging and six percent
13 overall who are getting any foreign language at all
14 which means that the other 94 percent are missing out
15 on this incredible opportunity in the most global
16 city in the world at a time when employers are
17 demanding multilingual schools... skills and it opens
18 up cultural horizons and, and there's so many other
19 benefits so I, I implore you to come back to the
20 committee, to the Chair and myself as a member of the
21 committee with numbers on this important sector of
22 our system.

23 DORITA GIBSON: I will but I will let you
24 know that the... there's 244 students that are in our
25

1
2 dual language programs right now, so we have... [cross-
3 talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: 244 schools...
5 [cross-talk]

6 DORITA GIBSON: ...244... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: ...and that I've
8 seen on the website which is wonderful and that's
9 increased... [cross-talk]

10 DORITA GIBSON: Absolutely... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: ...under this
12 current Chancellor but what I can't tell is how many
13 students are enrolled and some of these are one
14 little classroom with 20 kids, so we shouldn't
15 extrapolate that to think that these are hundreds of
16 thousands of kids, many of those are very, very small
17 so we, we need to know the number of children.

18 DORITA GIBSON: Yes, we'll get that to
19 you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Okay, thank you,
21 thank you Mr. Chair.

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Council
23 Member and next we have Council Member Brannan.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you Chair,
25 it's good to see all my old colleagues, I give you

1
2 guys credit for carrying on without me I don't know
3 how you did it but I'm proud... I'm proud of you all.
4 I'm going to do the lightning round thing too. The
5 Governor has called for the school by school budget
6 breakdown to be approved by the state, I wanted to
7 know what you guys think of that, if you think its's
8 reasonable, if you're prepared for that. Second one,
9 trying to summon a little of the frustration of the
10 special ed parents in my district who have issues
11 with the impartial hearings and how long it takes to
12 get paid their settlement, I hear that quite a bit
13 and would love to get some clarity on that. Thank
14 you.

15 DORITA GIBSON: It's up to Ray.

16 RAY ORLANDO: Hi, on the impartial
17 hearings first, so the... our policy is changed two and
18 a half years ago to make determinations about whether
19 to settle a case that's brought or to adjudicate a
20 case that's court... a, a case that's brought in a more
21 expiated fashion. This has led to much faster
22 decision making about whether to if you will settle
23 or fight, the... once a, a... an agreement is made to
24 settle a case the... there's actually a fair amount of
25 detailed information that parents and their attorneys

1
2 are required to provide to us in order for us to
3 approve... make a final and approved settlement. Once
4 that final an approved settlement occurs 98 percent
5 of parents... or payments are made within 30 days of
6 that final settlement so it... there isn't so much a
7 hiccup on our paying folks there's a hiccup on the
8 collection of the data necessary to finalize the
9 settlements once a settlement... once a, a decision has
10 been made to settle so... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: And is that
12 handled in house or is that... [cross-talk]

13 RAY ORLANDO: Yes, that's in the Office
14 of Legal Services, yeah. We can tell you more about
15 that, I don't... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: I think we, we...
17 [cross-talk]

18 RAY ORLANDO: ...I don't know much more
19 about that but... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Yeah... [cross-
21 talk]

22 RAY ORLANDO: ...others can... OLS can...
23 [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: That's my
25 favorite... that's my favorite office... [cross-talk]

1
2 RAY ORLANDO: Yeah, there you go, yeah
3 exactly, you can ring up those old friends, yeah, put
4 the band back together. On the question of what we
5 publish, I would suggest that we are the most
6 transparent school system in America, no one
7 publishes the volume in information we publish, no
8 one publishes in detail as much as we publish and in
9 fact you can go right now today to the department's
10 website look, look up a school's budget and see every
11 single line item funding resource that that school
12 has been provided with, it's a long list of stuff. In
13 addition, you can see exactly how a principal has
14 scheduled the expenditures for the entire year and
15 that information is updated on a daily basis, I
16 repeat a daily basis. I assure you that no one else
17 in this country with 1,800 schools is updating on a
18 daily basis, expenditures made in school systems. So,
19 we believe that we are as transparent as anyone could
20 ask us to be and we take very seriously our
21 obligation to this council, the public, advocates,
22 families, parents, and taxpayers to be accountable
23 for all of the information that folks require.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, thank you
25 very much Council Member Brannan and I, I have some

1
2 additional questions to ask. The DOE provides full or
3 half fare metro cards to students who ride the bus or
4 subway to school depending upon their age and
5 distance from the school, if a student's quickest
6 route to school includes a New York City ferry does
7 DOE cover the cost as they do for bus and subway
8 rides?

9 ELIZABETH ROSE: This is something that
10 has not come up to us or to me before, it's a good
11 question, we provide metro cards obviously and the
12 yellow bus service, we do not have a... an arrangement
13 for ferry service for our students other than those
14 attending the harbor school of course. It's, it's
15 something to... that we can talk about.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Well because that
17 was my next question, why doesn't the DOE provide
18 passes to use the New York City ferry, you know we...
19 this has been a, a very successful program to the
20 credit of the administration and I believe very
21 strongly that our students should be a part of it and
22 should have access to it and be able to utilize the
23 ferry system to get to school as well and so do we
24 hear a commitment from the DOE to see if we can
25

1
2 incorporate the transportation discounts into the
3 ferry system for our students?

4 ELIZABETH ROSE: So, we are certainly
5 happy to have a conversation with you and we'll have
6 a conversation with the EDC, our metro cards are
7 provided... we, we pay the MTA, we have an annual MOU
8 in which we pay the MTA and that's how we receive the
9 metro cards, clearly anything related to the ferry
10 becomes additional expenditures so we're happy to
11 have a conversation but it would of course be
12 additional expenditures.

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: We, we will
14 certainly follow up on, on that. In... fiscal year 2019
15 preliminary budget includes 30 million dollars in
16 funding in the fiscal 2018 from New York City's
17 school support services known as SSS, the non-profit
18 DOE contracts with supervised custodial services New
19 York City school support services were created in
20 2016 with the goal of more efficiently providing
21 custodial services to New York City schools is
22 unclear if additional funding will be required in, in
23 this fiscal year. On March 19th the DOE sent a
24 circular to all custodian engineers notifying them of
25 cuts to custodial budgets for the current fiscal

1
2 year, local 891 of course is vehemently opposed to
3 these budget cuts and believes they will negatively
4 impact the ability of custodial staff to complete
5 necessary facilities work, can you describe how the
6 custodial budgets for schools are determined and why
7 were cuts imposed?

8 ELIZABETH ROSE: So, the goal of, of the
9 school support services one of them is to provide us
10 the information so that we have greater understanding
11 of how our budgets are being spent and so that we can
12 operate as efficiently as possible, the circular all
13 it does is it reduces the surpluses that schools are
14 currently running so they are running the staff that
15 the custodial has scheduled and we are reducing the
16 amount the surplus in those budgets and that's
17 exactly what the purpose and goal of moving to this
18 new system would allow us to do is to ensure that we
19 are operating our system as well and as efficiently
20 as possible.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: But we are... we are
22 hearing from school communities that some schools
23 were sharing custodians and that they did not have
24 adequate maintenance staff in, in those schools and
25 actually quite frankly the council's made aware of

1
2 the recent circular because an educator shared it
3 with, with me most other details related to school
4 budgets are made public like we mentioned the school
5 allocation memo going forward will the DOE share all
6 circulars that have budget implications with this
7 council?

8 ELIZABETH ROSE: So, we are continuing to
9 work through... we... actually I do want to speak about
10 custodians for a moment, we've actually hired a
11 significant number of additional custodians into the
12 system and that has been a part of this transition.
13 In the past we had a number of buildings that were
14 under temporary care for a very long period of time
15 which meant that they had custodians who rotated for
16 three months at a time and in the past also a number
17 of buildings were operated by third party companies
18 who are not employees of the Department of Education
19 and we have in fact transitioned so that every school
20 building to the extent possible has a custodian
21 assigned to it and... we're not 100 percent there
22 because as custodians retire it sometimes takes a
23 little while until our next class comes in but in
24 fact every building has a custodian assigned, many of
25 those... some of our smaller buildings do share a

1
2 custodian with a larger building and that is one of
3 the systems that we worked very closely with our
4 union partners in moving to this new system.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, just to be
6 clear you, you... the DOE is saying that they have not
7 heard from any school communities about a lack of
8 resources for maintenance and cleaning and custodial
9 support, is, is that... is that what I'm hearing?

10 ELIZABETH ROSE: I... we, we certainly have
11 needs across our system, there are things that we
12 cannot do everything that we would like to do in our
13 buildings but we are... we have not asked custodians
14 to... in this latest circular all we were doing is
15 taking funding that is not scheduled to be spent and
16 recognizing that custodians are staffing their
17 buildings and have a staffing plan for their
18 buildings and that they had excess funds beyond that.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright, we, we
20 will... we'll, we'll follow up on this discussion
21 because there, there is information that I think that
22 we'd, we'd like and quite frankly I think that if a
23 circular goes out to schools that has budget
24 implications to those school's communities this
25 council should be made aware especially before a

1
2 budget adoption, I think that that's why we're here
3 to fight for every resource for our schools. I want
4 to just... give me one, one moment, I'm sorry. Council
5 Member Gjonaj who actually had to leave the country
6 temporarily raised an issue that he... in his... in his
7 committee that he believes does pertain to our, our
8 committee dealing with an, an issue that was raised
9 at his SBS hearing if the DOE can respond. So, this
10 is a, a question from Council Member Gjonaj that I'd
11 like for the DOE to respond, responding to a question
12 on the school bus grant program in this year's SBS
13 budget hearing Commissioner Bishop testified that all
14 procurement questions should be directed to the
15 Department of Education and when the council was
16 originally considering the school bus grant program
17 the DOE testified that there were 16 school bus
18 companies that were eligible for enrollment yet for
19 the three years that the program has been in effect
20 only one company Reliant has successfully applied for
21 and been accepted into the program, who wrote the
22 parameters of the RFP and what is... what is it about
23 Reliant that has made it the only company that has
24 been able to meet the terms set in the RFP?

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ELIZABETH ROSE: So, the purpose of the grant program was to enable a grant to companies that would bring bus drivers compensation up to a level that they had had under a prior employer, if, if they switched employers to a new bus company. Some of the bus companies that were eligible chose not to apply for the program because they felt that it would be better for them as a company for all of their bus drivers to be receiving the same compensation rather than differentiate the compensation based on prior employment.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And I, I, I believe that the, the council did receive some information in recent days with regards to an issue that was outstanding about the number of total employees that have been able to utilize or to benefit from that grant because, you know it, it... we, we do support workers and, and it just... it, it was uncertainty and lack of clarity about how many workers actually were benefiting from that... from that program and I, I do think that... we're still dealing with the aftermath of some of the past administration's approach and their quite frankly disdain for labor and I think that clearly we need a better mechanism to kind of move

1
2 this forward rather than create grants through SBS
3 when quite frankly the DOE should be handling this..
4 [cross-talk]

5 ELIZABETH ROSE: Well and.. [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ..quite frankly..
7 [cross-talk]

8 ELIZABETH ROSE: ..and we do.. [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ..right, so.. [cross-
10 talk]

11 ELIZABETH ROSE: ..in fact have a busing
12 bid out now for some of our contracts that are
13 expiring and that that bus bid now includes some
14 employee protections that we hope will achieve some
15 of those similar goals as the current SBS program.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Very, very good. I
17 know it.. I just have a couple more but Councilman
18 Lander just.. I'll, I'll turn to you briefly then
19 I'll, I'll close up, go ahead.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Mr.
21 Chair, I appreciate it. So, I, I just went down and
22 ran off these letters and I'll point out to you the
23 changed that I observe and if you haven't seen them
24 before then I... you know I, I, I can't necessarily ask
25 for a response right now but it's a... I think as

1
2 you'll see it's a pretty significant change and I, I
3 think... we all know that DOE wants students to take
4 the test so like that's not a secret and DOE has made
5 arguments for why students should take the test and I
6 respect that but I understood that there was a
7 commitment to let parents know about their right to
8 opt out and the 2017 guide which is the one that has
9 2017 at bottom left does that, on the top of page two
10 there's the question is there a provision for parents
11 to opt out their children of the state test or
12 request an alternative evaluation and it's not
13 enthusiastic language, it doesn't say we think it's a
14 great idea but it says you've got the right and an
15 alternative educational opportunity will be arranged
16 and then it says what happens if a student refuses to
17 take the test and it's fairly neutral language, I, I
18 think the 2017 language... no one in the opt out
19 movement is saying the 2017 guide is like great but I
20 think from a council point of view on like what the
21 rights are and what the legal obligations are, okay
22 but the 2018 guide does not contain that question at
23 all, there's no language that indicates that there's
24 a right to opt out. Where it says what happens if a
25 student does not take the state exam it has this new

1
2 language, it is important to prioritize taking the
3 test, please do all you can to support your child and
4 ensure they are at school when these tests are
5 administered and then I'll note at the bottom of that
6 page three it has much sharper language on the
7 potential negative consequences for schools not
8 necessarily for parents if a school doesn't meet the
9 95 percent participation. So, just side by side these
10 are pretty different documents and who... how, however
11 they got prepared they really reflect to shift away
12 from letting parents know about what their... what
13 their rights are that I found troubling.

14 URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, you are correct,
15 we are contisent in our message that yes, we do want
16 our students taking the test I will say that but with
17 that being said, you know this is the first time I'm
18 seeing this in the email that you sent me, we are
19 going to alter the language that is reflective of the
20 2017 language, I'm not sure how that passed the
21 clearance process but we will update the language.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And provide an
23 updated guide to parents so that they're... you know
24 they have the 2017... [cross-talk]

25 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Correct... [cross-talk]

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...language before
3 the test.

4 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Correct.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Great, thank you.

6 URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, we're working on
7 that right now.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay, thank you
9 very much.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: That's a wrap...
11 [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Productive
13 hearing..

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: See, we, we get
15 things done Councilman. Councilman Lander we, we cut
16 to the chase, is that correct? Right. Some closing
17 questions and then we'll... we might here from
18 stakeholders. We understand that some third-party
19 outreach is conducted through vendors who the DOE
20 contracts with who send information about educational
21 options to DOE students, are parents able to opt out
22 of receiving these mailings?

23 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Currently no there,
24 there is not an opt out option.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And why is that the
3 case?

4 URSULINA RAMIREZ: I'm going to have to
5 get back to you on some of the historical context of
6 why that is the case, it has been a practice for a
7 long-standing period of time, we're looking into it.

8 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah, this, this
9 has been a concern and a, a point of contention for
10 many families particularly we've heard anecdotally
11 from families that have more than one child and it
12 seems that the child without an IEP gets a number of
13 certain mailings and a child with the IEP doesn't get
14 a certain number of mailings and that is an issue
15 that we have especially if we're talking about equity
16 and fairness and justice and if families do not want
17 to receive this information in general period I think
18 that they school be empowered to make that decision
19 so I'd like to follow up with the DOE about this
20 issue because I do think it, it hits on privacy
21 rights, equity and fairness in many different
22 respects. I'd like to go back just in closing with
23 regards to our individual school budgets. We've
24 talked quite a bit and... well... you're going to hear me
25 talk more about fair student funding but talk about

1
2 it being the right measure in determining how much
3 funding a school requires for their instructional
4 needs, are there other measures that DOE should be
5 looking at to assess whether the schools are
6 adequately funded?

7 RAY ORLANDO: Sure, and I will once again
8 thank you for your continued FSF advocacy, sometimes
9 it feels a little lonely out there on that island, so
10 I very much appreciate it personally. So, we believe
11 in the formula actually, we believe that the formula
12 is meeting its goals of driving resources based on
13 the needs of students and their unique
14 characteristics located in school buildings. The
15 formula funds students not the schools, we are very
16 comfortable with the existing weights that we have
17 which address poverty, AIS needs, ELLs, students with
18 disabilities, many other factors as well and we
19 believe that these weights are driving resources
20 towards our neediest students wherever they may be
21 located. So, we very much support the formula however
22 we miss... when the formula was created the formula had
23 anticipated that the money to fund it would go along
24 with it and that has been in many ways the great
25 failure that we all face today is the state's failure

1
2 to live up to its commitment to New York City school
3 children. I imagine if you looked back historically
4 in 2007, 2008 when the formula first was derived and
5 you told the folks back then by the way the money's
6 not going to show up, I'm not sure what, what school
7 budget allocation methodologies would look like
8 today. With that said we do actually believe that the
9 formula itself is doing what it's designed to do in
10 driving resources to needy students located in
11 schools, but the funding is sadly been not apparent
12 to us.

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I would say
14 that, you know when the Governor stated that he
15 doesn't believe that poverty is accounted for in our
16 schools I again mentioned that we... the existence of
17 school allocation memos which actually does talk
18 about poverty I, I will just say that I believe that
19 the amount that I saw there was about 400 dollars or
20 so and that's not adequate, that's not sufficient and
21 this has been just, just to make it clear when I've
22 visited schools the community renewal schools that,
23 that become Rise schools these funds have been used
24 to hire social workers, hire critical people to build
25 trust, to build a sense of safety, you know another

1
2 item that we negotiate during budget times an item
3 that frustrates me as a former teacher, the issue of
4 teachers choice something that quite frankly the
5 administration should be paying for, something that
6 educators have extraordinary amount of expenses that
7 they incur out of pocket and this funding stream hits
8 on so many different things, on hiring more social
9 workers, hiring more guidance counselors, hiring more
10 teachers, paraprofessionals, more supplies for a
11 school, there is such flexibility with this funding
12 but just to... just to make clear I agree with you that
13 the state of New York has failed in it's obligation
14 to the city of New York when it comes to our public
15 schools but leaving it to the state is a decision not
16 to fund our schools as well and that is a decision
17 that I cannot accept and we have to do everything
18 within our power to increase fair student funding
19 across the board to all of our public schools because
20 the schools I visited have been in the South Bronx,
21 Central Brooklyn, some of the most overcrowded parts
22 of Queens this has been a difference maker so I
23 applaud the decision to make all of the community
24 school... the, the renewal schools 100 percent FSF but
25 every school should be a community school, every

1
2 school should receive 100 percent FSF that is the
3 obligation that we have and again while I recognize
4 the state has to do more leaving it to the state is a
5 decision that you've made, you made a decision not to
6 increase FSF in our schools now and that's something
7 that we're going to have to work on in budget to make
8 sure that all of our schools across the board see
9 that increase and with that I thank the first panel.
10 I'd like to welcome the President of CSA, Mark
11 Cannizzaro, that's a good name; the Vice President of
12 Elementary Schools, United Federation of Teachers,
13 Karen Alford and the Vice President Local 372, DC37,
14 Donald Nesbitt. Okay, so we'll turn... okay. So, we'll
15 turn to Mr. President.

16 MARK CANNIZZARO: Good afternoon and
17 thank you and thank you for staying. I was a lot...
18 there's a lot of people I was going to thank and
19 congratulate but I will just congratulate you for
20 becoming the Education Committee Chair and, and we
21 certainly appreciate your thoughtfulness and, and
22 your understanding of education, it's, it's, it's
23 quite refreshing and, and also it was wonderful to
24 have Mr. Dromm, Council Member Dromm also for the
25 last several years. Just a couple of... a couple of

1
2 things, you have my testimony so there's really no
3 reason for me to read that to you but one of the
4 things regarding fair student funding that I need to
5 disagree with Mr. Orlando is on the formula, he feels
6 that the formula is a... is a good formula and I would...
7 I would agree with him provided the formula is
8 applied after minimum staffing and basic needs were
9 met for every school in this city. The problem with
10 the, the formula as it is now at times it leaves
11 schools in a deficit before they're able to make any
12 decisions about discretionary spending and just some
13 examples of, of... one thing we call breakage, there
14 are a certain number of students that are supposed to
15 be in a class and the funding formula is somewhat
16 based on the number of students in a class and if a
17 school has just too many students for one class but
18 nowhere near enough for two classes they're obligated
19 to have two classes which is... which is smart, too
20 many students in a... in a class will affect the
21 education however the school is left to worry about
22 funding those open seats because we fund students and
23 not schools. When it comes to classroom funding and
24 the number of classes that are needed there should be
25 no question regarding fair student funding or an

1
2 allocation on how those classes and the salaries are
3 funded. In addition to that the funding formula is
4 based on the average teacher salary in New York City,
5 schools that have high average teacher salaries do
6 not necessarily control that fact so again if you
7 have a large number of teachers and they're at a
8 higher teacher salary you're at... you're in a deficit
9 and there's a third piece that is a difficult
10 situation for schools to handle financially. Schools
11 that have a large number of classes, special classes
12 12 to one to one those schools are, are charged to
13 the paraprofessional and, and... or, or I should... what
14 I should say is they're funded exactly as a class
15 that is just 12 to one and doesn't need a
16 paraprofessional so schools with large numbers there
17 are, are in a deficit. And we also have to be
18 concerned about the fact that yes, the state hasn't
19 made... fulfilled their obligation but that was... been
20 happening since 2008 and yes, we have increased from
21 82 percent floor to an 87 percent floor but that,
22 that certainly does not do nearly enough. There are
23 schools in every Council Member's district at 87
24 percent and schools in very similar situations at 100
25 percent or 95 percent, that disparity shouldn't

1
2 happen. We talked about... we talked about the... I... Mr...
3 Council Member Dromm asked what the average school
4 would be losing, and I can't answer the average
5 school but if 91 percent is the average you're losing
6 nine percent of their funding, in my school that
7 would have been about 720,000 dollars a year. So,
8 what we're asking is, is what you just asked, we
9 think the, the... at the very least we think the
10 formula needs to be reworked first so that we have
11 minimum staffing, that's number one but that's,
12 that's a long conversation and a different
13 conversation, what we're asking for immediately is
14 for the floor to increase this year to 95 percent and
15 the following year to 100 percent and if cuts need to
16 be made elsewhere then they need to be made elsewhere
17 but, but that has to happen so schools get the money
18 that they need and finally I'm sorry that, that I'm
19 going a little bit over but you guys have been so
20 generous with our ELI, Executive Leadership Institute
21 funding and our ELI is very similar to the, the UFTs,
22 great teacher center program and we're one of the few
23 places in the country that actually devotes resources
24 necessary for school leader professional development
25 and, and we're asking for your continue support

1
2 there, we're asking that the council fund us at one
3 million dollars this year which is 230,000 dollars
4 above our previous ask. We have done so much, we have
5 an advanced leadership institute that prepares
6 assistant principals to become principals, we have
7 mentoring for our new assistant principals, we have a
8 workshop on budgeting which is wonderful, it's, it's
9 ironic that we here at this... at this and talking
10 about the budgeting but we have also just started a
11 micro credential program which is becoming very
12 popular throughout the country and we've completed
13 our first micro credential in culturally responsive
14 education which is certainly timely and, and
15 important here in New York City where we're the most,
16 most diverse city school system in the country. So,
17 with that said I, I, I will cut myself a little bit
18 short but the title two federal funds that are coming
19 or not coming have us even more concerned so if, if
20 the council would be so generous to continue to
21 support that program we would be much... most
22 appreciative. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank, thank you
24 Mr. President.

25 MARK CANNIZZARO: Yes.

1
2 KAREN ALFORD: Good afternoon everyone,
3 congratulations again on being the Education Chair.
4 We are very concerned at the UFT, I, I am a product
5 of labor, my mother and father are... were both union
6 members and so with the notion that the Janus supreme
7 court case is going to be decided very soon it makes
8 us very concerned about the plight of the middle
9 class and so we will certainly ask for your support
10 going forward as we know that decision doesn't seem
11 like it's going to work in favor of labor. With that
12 said we need more resources and certainly not guns in
13 our schools and we want to make sure that, that this...
14 the conversation around how we protect our schools
15 happens, but we certainly want to be on record to say
16 that it certainly not via guns but the conversation
17 has to happen because too... in too many of our
18 schools, too many of our communities our students are
19 surrounded by violence and so while thank goodness
20 knock on wood we haven't experienced a massacre like
21 Florida we do have too many students that are living,
22 living in neighborhoods plagued by gun violence so
23 we'd certainly like to see that as part of the
24 conversations we talk, talk about school safety and
25 school climate and in regards to school climate we

1
2 think that we have some suggestions to help propel
3 that discussion in some of our budgetary ask and one
4 is around community learning schools. we've grown to
5 29 schools, the schools are seen as the hub, it is
6 where you bring parents, community, teachers together
7 and it is more than just an academic approach,
8 there's certainly an integrated wraparound services
9 approach of which many of our children need and we've
10 found that in the UFT models where we have put in a
11 community school director at 100,000 dollars the
12 resources between in kind and grants that, that
13 they've been able to bring in it's a six to one
14 return and so we would ask that you please help
15 support that as we'd like to grow that initiative.
16 We'd also like to see more schools in the positive
17 learning collaborative also DOE, UFT approach that's
18 been working in schools particularly around this time
19 as we're talking about violence and school discipline
20 and school climate and we have found that PLC has
21 been excellent at deescalating and making sure that
22 teachers and all adults in the building are equipped
23 to handle some of the behaviors that are being
24 displayed by our students. We'd also like support
25 around our antibullying initiative, our brave

1
2 initiative as we'd like to increase the number of
3 social workers that we have dealing and, and working
4 with our students. Also our Dial-a-Teacher program,
5 we are... we are entertaining a little over 60,000
6 calls a year and it's something as we know that some
7 parents are so taxed and the curriculum is changed to
8 be able to provide that caring adult there on the
9 phone to help our students would be helpful if we
10 could expand that initiative and of course teachers
11 choice is that conversation that's come up, we know
12 how much teachers spend, how much they go into their
13 pockets to make sure that their students have what
14 they need. In addition so much of the cost is now
15 also being put onto parents and supply lists are
16 growing and growing and growing and too many parents
17 are under resourced and can't afford supplies so we'd
18 certainly ask that you please think about enhancing
19 the teachers choice allotment and then lastly as a
20 mom of three children who certainly had to come back
21 to work much sooner than I probably should have we'd
22 certainly like for the city council to, to consider
23 and to help push for paid parental leave, we think
24 that it's so necessary in our profession not just for
25 moms but for moms and dads and for anyone with a new

1
2 child to be able to take care of that child to bond
3 as we are taking care of our 1.1 million school
4 children we also want to be, be able to take care of
5 our children too. So, thank you so much for your
6 time.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much
8 and I'll... we'll go back after I hear from the... from
9 the entire panel but you're next, thank you.

10 DONALD NESBIT: Good afternoon
11 Councilman, congratulations on your appointment as
12 the Education Chair. I'm Donald Nesbit, Executive
13 Vice President for Local 372 and before I go any
14 further we want to thank the Mayor, the Chair and the
15 members of your committee, the city council for
16 recognizing the importance of investing money in New
17 York City's children whereas the kids are 20 to 25
18 percent of our population, they're 100 percent of
19 everyone's future and Local 372 members in particular
20 are a pipeline within the school system, they support
21 the administrators, they support the teachers within
22 schools. It starts from the school crossing guard
23 when kids cross the streets they get to school
24 safely, they go in the school to be greeted by a
25 school aid, parent coordinator, they go in the

1
2 lunchroom after that to eat a nutritious breakfast
3 and then if they have any problems within a day there
4 are family workers to assist, we also have our SAPIS
5 counselors who assist with things around antibullying
6 and things of that nature. They then return back to
7 the school crossing guard who crosses them and make
8 sure that they return home safely that is what Local
9 372 members do. Today I'd like to speak about three
10 of our titles in particular; our school lunch
11 employees I'll just start with that. We know that
12 when kids eat there's a coordination between eat,
13 eating and learning and so if they're eating a
14 nutritious meal the likelihood of them learning
15 increases. We have programs like breakfast in the
16 classroom which certainly has produced an increased
17 participation from the children's standpoint. We want
18 to talk about staffing levels being adequate to, to
19 make sure that those programs move smoothly. We also
20 had the kitchen enhancements that have popped up
21 around the city and we thank the city for investment
22 in that, but we want to ensure that there's staffing
23 levels around that. Our members within the kitchen
24 sometimes deal with conditions like intense heat
25 within the kitchens. Councilman Lander in 2017 issued

1
2 a report on some of those conditions and the Mayor
3 and the city council was gracious enough to pass a
4 bill that ensured that we would have AC in schools, a
5 five year plan but we want to ask that those nine
6 classroom areas that the kitchens be considered
7 because a lot of our members endure conditions where
8 it reaches far above the 100 degrees that it's in a
9 classroom, if it's 100 degrees in there it's
10 certainly much hotter within our school kitchens. I
11 also want to talk about the SAPIS counselors who I
12 said earlier they were antibullying, today they are
13 about 300 of them there that service 1,800 schools
14 throughout the city, some years back there were about
15 1,200 with the increase in the opioid addiction, drug
16 addiction we ask that instead of doing a decline that
17 we increase those numbers of SAPIS counselors
18 throughout the city. Last, we'll... I want to speak
19 about the community titles within schools, we have
20 community titles that unlike any other title within a
21 school system they, they fight, we're, we're
22 protected by a collective bargaining agreement, they
23 operate sort of as at will employees, they're job
24 security is always up in the air, we give various
25 different reports about our community titles and we

1
2 ask that we look into job security for those titles
3 as well. We want to thank you President Francois
4 under the leadership of President Francois we want to
5 thank you and the education committee members. Thank
6 you.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Certainly, thank
8 you and make sure that you come back Monday at ten
9 o'clock because on the... at the capital hearing you're
10 going to hear a lot of conversations about wiring and
11 air conditioning in, in schools as well which must
12 extend into cafeterias because as someone who used to
13 utilize school cafeterias and I cannot thank
14 cafeteria workers enough they do endure unacceptable
15 conditions, it is very hot in there and, and this is
16 something that we will definitely discuss at our... in
17 our Monday... [cross-talk]

18 DONALD NESBIT: Monday... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...Monday capital
20 hearing and I just want to... just to kind of circle
21 back to the rest of the panel with regards to teacher
22 recruitment and teacher retention you heard my
23 exchange with the DOE with regards to teachers who
24 five plus years in the system we are seeing a steady
25 decline of them leaving and there are a number of

1
2 factors for that but I do believe as, as... finances
3 play a critical role, it, it... just the day to day
4 life, the fact that we don't have paid parental leave
5 in the most progressive city so to speak is, is, is
6 really... I think it's a stain on our record and, and I
7 think that this is an issue why some educators choose
8 to pursue careers that might provide this
9 accommodation and, and this is a, a significant loss
10 to our... to our system and so this is something that
11 the council does take very serious and we will be
12 having further discussions with the administration
13 about and I want to just state with regards to
14 whether it's teachers choice, whether it's with
15 regards to more social supports in our... in our
16 schools. I want to credit President Cannizzaro
17 because in our... in our meeting in our discussions you
18 really effectively made the case how critical fair
19 student funding is and thanks to the amazing staff
20 here in city council, they, they, they gave a great
21 breakdown of the school allocation memo and I agree
22 with you that their formula for FSF needs a lot of
23 tweaking, a lot of work because according to what
24 I've read the only accounted with regards to students
25 below the poverty line about 400 dollars or so below

1
2 the 3rd grade which is grossly insufficient because
3 the needs are so far greater. We saw the Comptrollers
4 report about over 100,000 of our children who are
5 either homeless, temporary housing, transitional
6 housing how their needs are not being met, the need
7 for additional support staff, social workers,
8 guidance... [cross-talk]

9 DONALD NESBIT: The assistant principals.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Assistant
11 principals, that's correct, yes of course, yes you
12 need... you need leaders, sure, this hits at that, this
13 is... it... because when I visited these schools these,
14 these Rise schools now or whatever the lingo is these
15 days that has been one of the biggest difference
16 makers, that's how you hire additional support staff,
17 how you hire maybe an AP to oversee a certain area in
18 the school that has been a critical part of their
19 turnaround so when folks in Albany need an education
20 about where's the money going when you're actually
21 funding schools the way you should we're seeing
22 progress and when you actually address the needs of
23 the kids that you claim to care about we're going to
24 see progress as well. The evidence is there and, and
25 so I, I just... I can't thank all of you enough for

1
2 your great work and I just want to echo your comments
3 with regards to the school safety issues in, in our
4 schools as a former teacher and now as a Councilman
5 when you hear requests from educators about the needs
6 of their buildings they want to be equipped with more
7 resources, they want to be equipped with adequate
8 social emotional support staff to better meet the
9 needs of their kids, they want to be equipped with
10 programs that, that I know that both the UFT and CSA
11 and other... and DC37 support in our schools these are
12 the issues because I say this respectfully to, to
13 those who have called for the militarization of
14 schools, where does it end? When, when folks say that
15 they want more... they want guns in schools and the
16 shooter might move to a park and now... are we... now
17 going to have folks in the parks, if it moves to the
18 movie theatre are we going to now discuss guns in the
19 movie theatre, if it moves to the shopping mall guns
20 there, are we calling for a militarization of our
21 society... is that the society, that is not what we're
22 about and so this is about addressing the actual
23 needs of our buildings and needs of our kids and I
24 cannot thank all of you enough for the work that you...
25 that you do every day, I think educators are also

1
2 first responders to a whole host of social challenges
3 and issues every single day and we thank all of your
4 members for their... for their service day in and day
5 out. Thank you all so much.

6 MARK CANNIZZARO: thank you very much...

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you.

8 KAREN ALFORD: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I'd like to welcome
10 Randi Levine, Advocates for Children of New York;
11 Grant Cowles, Citizens Committee for Children;
12 Gregory Bender, United Neighborhood Houses; Brooke
13 Wallace, Generation Citizen NYC and Emily Larcher,
14 Student alright, Generation Citizen NYC. Yes, and I
15 think we, we have a two-minute clock. Okay, sure.

16 RANDI LEVINE: Thank you for the
17 opportunity to testify about the fiscal year 2019
18 preliminary education budget. My name is Randi Levine
19 and I'm Policy Director of Advocates for Children of
20 New York. I will focus my limited time today on the
21 need for more funding for school climate, support for
22 students in temporary housing and busing for students
23 in foster care. First every child deserves to attend
24 a safe high-quality school where students, teachers
25 and staff are treated with dignity and respect, yet

1
2 we know from ample research and our work with
3 numerous AFC clients that exclusionary punitive
4 discipline and school policing do nothing to create
5 school environments that reduce violence in our
6 communities and address the mental health and social
7 emotional needs of New York City students. You can
8 read additional background information on the request
9 I'm about to make in our written testimony to provide
10 schools with evidence-based tools to address
11 challenging behaviors we recommend that the fiscal
12 year '19 executive budget include and baseline
13 funding for the following two recommendations of the
14 Mayoral leadership team on school climate and
15 discipline. First, a mental health support continuum
16 pilot at 2.875 million dollars per year which uses a
17 medical model to help ensure that students in 20 high
18 needs schools in Brooklyn and the Bronx have access
19 to direct mental health services when needed and
20 second whole school collaborative problem solving for
21 one million dollars per year which helps schools move
22 away from a punitive model to a problem solving skill
23 building approach to assist students with challenging
24 behaviors. Students in temporary housing, thank you
25 for asking questions about the omission of the 10.3

1
2 million dollars from the preliminary budget for
3 support for students living in shelter. Given the
4 record number of students in temporary housing and
5 the barriers they face to school success we recommend
6 that the fiscal year '19 budget restore and baseline
7 the 10.3 million dollars and add and baseline an
8 additional 20 million dollars to establish a deputy
9 chancellor's office for highly mobile students, hire
10 field support center directors for highly mobile
11 students, increase the number of DOE bridging the gap
12 school based social workers for students in shelters
13 from 43 to 100 social workers and hire 50 DOE social
14 workers to provide intensive supports at shelters to
15 address education related needs. No child in New York
16 City should be homeless but we as a city have an
17 obligation to mitigate the impact of homelessness on
18 these children, ensure they can go to school every
19 day and that they have the support needed to succeed.
20 Our written testimony has additional information
21 including about the need for busing for students in
22 foster care. Thank you and I'm happy to answer any
23 questions.

24 GREGORY BENDER: Thank you Chair Treyger
25 for holding this hearing and for the opportunity to

1
2 testify. My name is Gregory Bender and I'm from
3 United Neighborhood Houses, we are the federation of
4 New York City Settlement Houses which are
5 multiservice, multigeneration community centers and
6 the Settlement Houses are really deeply engaged in
7 DOE's work at every level really throughout the life
8 span from early childhood, after school programs,
9 support for youth such as the learning to work
10 program where they are community partners and they're
11 also the community partners in renewal schools so we
12 really do as much as we can to support the education
13 system and to support the education of children and
14 adults. I wanted to talk today on just two topics,
15 one was about salaries in the early childhood system
16 and then also about adult literacy and I know that
17 you Chair Treyger have been a, a champion on both of
18 these issues and appreciate it. As you know in
19 September 2019 what's now the ACS early learn system
20 is going to transfer over to the Department of
21 Education in what's really exciting work to finally
22 have a unified system of early childhood education
23 but we're not going to have a unified effective
24 system if we don't address the huge disparities in
25 salaries between staff who are working in public

1
2 schools and staff who are in the community based
3 settings. Most of the programs, most of the services
4 for Pre-K are in community based organizations and
5 all of the early learn programs, the only programs
6 that work for working families who need a full day of
7 care in community based settings and yet their staff
8 and teachers are earning on the whole just around 60
9 percent of what they would make in community based
10 organizations and in the written testimony I'll
11 actually have a testimonial you can read from a
12 teacher talking about how much she loves her work in
13 working with young children in the CBO but that she
14 simply can't afford to live in the city on it. I also
15 just wanted to briefly touch on issues around adult
16 literacy to sort of come on the other end of the age
17 spectrum. The Mayor has zeroed out 12 million dollars
18 that came in through both the administration and city
19 council, we believe it's incredibly important that
20 this money be baselined so that it can be put into a
21 new procurement and ultimately provide programs that
22 meet the true need costs. Thank you again for the
23 opportunity to testify and we really look forward to
24 working with you.

1
2 GRANT COWLES: Good afternoon, my name is
3 Grant Cowles and I'm with Citizens Committee for
4 Children which is an independent multi-issue child
5 advocacy organization. We appreciate this hearing
6 today. Our recommendations include analysis and
7 recommendations along, along seven issue areas. I'm
8 going to blitz through just a couple of highlights to
9 keep it in this timeframe. First, we urge that the
10 administration maintains all funding for community
11 schools in that would particularly ensure that the
12 Rise schools don't lose any of their community school
13 funding and that the 20 seats... schools that have been
14 funded through the state's community schools grant
15 initiative don't lose any of their funding. Second
16 supporting homeless students as my colleague Randi
17 mentioned, we worked with her organization to create
18 a, a, a set of recommendations that highlighted many,
19 many of... all the things that she mentioned and so we
20 link to that in our written testimony. Supporting the
21 needs of transportation in foster care as also Randi
22 mentioned, we urge... the... we have written
23 recommendations but... that includes five million
24 dollars in the executive budget to ensure all foster
25 children in need of busing can have access to school.

1
2 We also echo my colleague Gregory's mention about the
3 salary parody for early educators in particularly
4 around this transition of early, early learn from ACS
5 to DOE and this is a critical time to finally address
6 this which causes a lot of challenges in the field
7 and for families too. We also support the, the
8 Mayor's school leadership on climate.. school climate
9 and those recommendations and so we particularly
10 highlight two of them that, that Randi also
11 mentioned, and we also make note and, and do support
12 the preliminary budget's proposals that do address
13 some school climate issues. We, we are grateful for
14 the expansion of universal school meals and we.. but
15 we do provide some recommendations about how some of
16 the communications around those can be improved and
17 we also as always recommend restoring and we're,
18 we're in... baselining the city council initiatives.
19 Thank you.

20 BROOKE WALLACE: Thank you for the
21 opportunity.. [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Just make sure your
23 mic is on, yeah.

24 BROOKE WALLACE: Right here? Thank you.
25 Thank you for the opportunity to testify today on

1
2 behalf of Generation Citizen, GC about the New York
3 City council education committee budget. Our
4 Executive Director DeNora Getachew regrets that she's
5 unable to be here today. GC is a seven-year-old
6 national nonpartisan, non-profit dedicated to
7 bringing civics education back into the classroom
8 through a new engaging pedagogy, action civics.
9 Action civics is a student centered, project-based
10 approach to civics education that develops the
11 individual knowledge and dispositions necessary for
12 21st century democratic practice. Students learn
13 about democratic structures and process by directly
14 engaging with them as well as with each other to
15 address community issues they care about. GC is the
16 largest action civics education organization with a
17 national model. Last year GC educated approximately
18 9,000 students through our work in New York and five
19 additional sites. GC partners with teachers and
20 students to help them implement our action civics
21 program twice weekly over the course of a semester
22 often added to history, social studies and
23 participation in government classes. We deploy two
24 models to implement our action civics curriculum, a
25 college volunteer or democracy coach model and a

1
2 teacher led model. GC has helped over 18,000 New York
3 City middle and high school students find their voice
4 and advocate for systemic local policy reform. We are
5 incredibly thankful that the city council renewed
6 funding for GC in fiscal year 2018 to enable us to
7 educate approximately 3,750 students. GC has placed
8 125 community college volunteers as democracy coaches
9 in our classrooms, we're thankful for the city
10 council funding which allows GC to provide stipends
11 to our democracy coaches at our five community
12 college partners. GC is excited about Mayor De
13 Blasio's civics for all initiative, as the largest
14 action civics education provider in New York City GC
15 would welcome the opportunity to partner with the
16 administration to share its expertise in creating and
17 implementing engaging student led project-based
18 programming that increases student's civic knowledge
19 and skills. We respectfully recommend that the
20 administration utilize all action civics framework
21 for this initiative, our very rough estimate is that
22 it will cost the administration approximately
23 4,755,000 dollars to implement action civics. And I
24 now would like to have Emily Larcher, a student from
25 Generation Citizen come and speak a little bit about

1
2 how the experience was for her. Unfortunately, we're
3 unable to comment at the moment.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: No worries but I
5 have to say I used to teach participation in
6 government in... [cross-talk]

7 BROOKE WALLACE: Oh, wonderful... [cross-
8 talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...high school civics
10 so you are speaking to me... [cross-talk]

11 BROOKE WALLACE: Your language... [cross-
12 talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...directly and I...
14 [cross-talk]

15 BROOKE WALLACE: Excellent... [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...cannot agree with
17 you more on how important this work is... [cross-talk]

18 BROOKE WALLACE: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and it's
20 frustrating that the state's curriculum, the state's
21 DOE, regs and guidance that oversees this has... is
22 very blurry and very unclear and uncoordinated but I
23 in my classes we made civics a priority and some of
24 the lessons we learned in that class and, and in the
25 field I think were more important than anything that

1
2 they probably see on the regents and other, other
3 classes as well so I, I cannot thank you enough for
4 your advocacy and I just want to thank this entire
5 first panel because your research, your work is based
6 on real things happening on the ground not in some
7 abstract theory, it's, it's based on the real needs
8 of our kids and I, I think you heard my question
9 before about the... first of all we didn't even see the
10 money in the budget which is not acceptable with
11 regards to dealing with students in temporary
12 housing, our students that are mobile, how many
13 mobile students. We heard that they are continuing
14 that but I think that's insufficient, that number of
15 10.3 million is grossly insufficient, the needs are
16 far greater and I... and I appreciate your, your call
17 for additional social workers and I think I agree
18 with you when I... if you heard my questioning with
19 regards to placing them in the locations... not just in
20 the school but in the locations because to leave it
21 to the family to figure it, it... there's too much
22 bureaucracy here and, and they're already dealing
23 with day to day issues of... I just... I can't even
24 imagine what they're dealing with on a day to day
25 basis, they need help and support right there and

1
2 then. So, I... and I cannot thank all of you for your
3 work and a lot of follow up for us to do here in the
4 budget. Thank you so much, thank you. Okay, Lucas
5 Lie; DeJohn Jones; Victor Almanzar; and Maria Gill.
6 No one's here, okay. Okay, we'll call up Michael
7 Rodgers; Robin Vitale; Sante [sp?] Latimer and Marcel
8 Braithwaite, yes. Okay, you may begin.

9 MICHAEL RODGERS: Thank you. Good
10 afternoon Council Member Treyger, Chair Treyger. My
11 name is Michael Rodgers, I serve as Vice President
12 for Youth and Community Runner Engagement at New York
13 Road Runners. Thank you for the opportunity to
14 testify. Our mission at New York Road Runners is to
15 help and inspire people through running. While New
16 York Road Runners is best known for producing the TCS
17 New York City marathon our organization is the
18 largest nonprofit providing free youth fitness
19 programs in New York City. New York Road Runners has
20 been providing free education... physical education and
21 fitness programs to our city's youth since 1999. In
22 the 2016, 2017 school year our school-based programs,
23 fitness events and resources touch 115,000 students
24 in over 810 schools in New York City in all 51
25 council districts. Although the city has been... has

1
2 made significant progress in recent years there's
3 still a long road to make quality physical education
4 and fitness accessible to all children. New York Road
5 Runners is devoted to making that happen, our free
6 programs are designed to help kids of all ages from
7 Pre-K through grade 12 build their confidence,
8 motivation and desire to be physically active for
9 life hence developing their physical literacy. We're
10 in the midst of a health crisis, an obesity crisis in
11 New York City especially for children and physical
12 education in schools lays the groundwork for a
13 healthy life, as not an extra, as a crucial service.
14 Last year the city responded to this crisis by
15 announcing a universal PE initiative that promises a,
16 a designated physical education space in all New York
17 City schools by 2021. I note that City Comptroller
18 Stringer put a report out that 28 percent of our
19 schools do not have physical education spaces. This
20 initiative also acknowledges the importance of
21 physical activity and New York Road Runners is how...
22 willing to help provide that programming for the
23 schools. New York Road Runners is requesting 500,000
24 dollars in initiative support for our signature youth
25 programing, rising New York Road Runners which again

1
2 is on track to serve over 800 schools and 115,000
3 students. We have submitted our testimony and happy
4 to answer any questions that you may have but know
5 that we are here and happy to provide the services
6 that we do free of charge to all of the students on...
7 in our programs.

8 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much
9 for your work and for your advocacy, thank you, next.

10 ROBIN VITALE: Thank you Chair Treyger.
11 My name is Robin Vitale, I serve as the Vice
12 President of Health Strategies for the American Heart
13 Association here in New York City and we're here to
14 echo some of the words that my colleague has just
15 mentioned specifically around the success of the city
16 focusing on physical education. we are absolutely
17 thrilled with the progress that's been made around PE
18 works which is a program that originated out of
19 council several years ago however we do want to
20 remind you that that funding was meant to only
21 sustain the program for a few years and we are
22 heading into year three with this next budget. We are
23 concerned about the sustainability of the program and
24 how some of the, especially the central staffing
25 structure out of DOE will be maintained without those

1
2 dollars. Obviously the impact, making sure that we
3 have certified PE teachers in every school cannot be
4 underestimated, we are very hopeful that we will be
5 able to sustain that program for years to come for
6 the next generations of New Yorkers and since
7 universal PE was also mentioned we want to thank the,
8 the city for their great leadership helping to focus
9 in on infrastructure, we commend the report that you
10 all just issued, planning for schools making sure
11 that, that gym space is a top priority as you're
12 looking at all of those concerns around the build
13 environment for the school setting, anything that can
14 be done to continue that type of investment helping
15 to build new gym spaces that provide for effective
16 physical education in all of our schools is
17 definitely a worthy goal. And lastly, I do want to
18 also remind the city schools that there is a state
19 requirement in the PE or health curriculum around CPR
20 education. We want to make sure that every high
21 school student is educated in hands only CPR and the
22 use of an AED, that is a Chancellors regulation.
23 Unfortunately, we hear anecdotally that a lot of
24 schools are not in full compliance with that standard
25 so we are recommending a... an investment of one

1
2 million dollars for the DOE to provide support and
3 resources, the FDNY has s a wonderful program that
4 they're able to provide some education to the schools
5 free of charge but obviously that needs to be
6 expanded as well so we recommend a, a small amount of
7 investment to help reach all of those high school
8 students.

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: You know I just
10 want to say that your, your words and advocacy just
11 reminded me when I visited a school in Queens in
12 Chair Dromm's district Pan International High School,
13 a school that's on the rise, over 80 percent of the
14 children there English language learners showing
15 progress the one request they made of us was many of
16 the kids wished to play soccer but don't have a field
17 and so there is a, a relationship between obviously
18 creating a safe space in a school but also respecting
19 and meeting their needs, meeting the needs of the
20 whole child... [cross-talk]

21 ROBIN VITALE: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and, and this,
23 this is a big part of it so I, I thank you for your
24 work and for your advocacy.

25 ROBIN VITALE: Thank you... [cross-talk]

1
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much,
3 please.

4 MARCEL BRAITHWAITE: Good afternoon. Good
5 afternoon Council Member. My name is Marcel
6 Braithwaite, I'm the Director of Community Engagement
7 for the Police Athletic League. The Police Athletic
8 League is one of New York City's largest independent
9 youth development non-profit organizations. For over
10 100 years PAL has successfully inspired countless
11 youth to become productive citizens of society. PAL
12 in fact was one of the first federally funded
13 organizations to deliver early education programming
14 and has been providing early child care services for
15 over 50 years. We urge the Education Committee to
16 take immediate action to achieve salary parity for
17 the early education childhood workforce. The early
18 childhood professionals at the Police Athletic League
19 have an exceptional track record of providing care
20 and education to children in New York City.
21 Unfortunately, our staff are paid much less than
22 their similarly qualified counterparts in public
23 schools. these salary disparities are causing
24 instability in our programs as we have started to
25 lose qualified staff to the Department of Education.

1
2 the turnover crisis has been particularly acute at
3 the level of certified head teachers that can earn a
4 starting salary of 62,000 versus a starting salary of
5 47,000 at a community-based organization like PAL,
6 this impacts families we serve who need the child
7 care services provided by the Police Athletic League.
8 The New York City council can have a tremendous
9 impact on the 3-K for All and the Pre-K for All
10 programs by addressing the salary parody for the
11 early childhood workforce. We urge the Education
12 Committee to take immediate action to address this
13 issue so that we can continue to provide quality
14 services that New York City families deserve.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very much
16 and I think this critical issue hits an issue that we
17 discussed earlier about teacher... how to get... recruit
18 teachers and then keep teachers and this applies to
19 teachers across the board and this is a, a major
20 issue, you know many folks have said... you know talk
21 about the, the success of the rollout of the UPK and
22 others we want to continue that success and I think
23 this... the issue that you're talking about is critical
24 to continuing that success so thank you very much for
25 your work... [cross-talk]

1
2 MARCEL BRAITHWAITE: Absolutely... [cross-
3 talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and for your
5 advocacy... [cross-talk]

6 MARCEL BRAITHWAITE: We support it, we
7 just... we, we think the initiative is great we just
8 don't want to cannibalize the... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: That... [cross-talk]

10 MARCEL BRAITHWAITE: ...organizations that
11 are doing the work in order to expand.

12 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, thank
13 you for your service. I'd like to call... the student
14 is here, Emily Larcher, Generation Citizen NYC.

15 EMILY LARCHER: Good afternoon, thank you
16 for the opportunity to testify at today's hearing. My
17 name is Emily Larcher and I'm currently a freshman at
18 Baruch College. I participated in Generation
19 Citizen's Action Civics program during the first
20 semester of my senior year at my high school, the
21 Young Women's Leadership School of Astoria which is
22 located in district 22 of Council Member
23 Constantinides. That following summer I participated
24 in the fourth cohort of Community Change Fellowship
25 or CCF as an intern in the of then Council Member,

1
2 now Speaker Corey Johnson. At present I am a part of
3 the GC's Student Leadership Board or SLB. In SLB I
4 work together with middle school and high school
5 students from various GC locations in order to
6 brainstorm ways to elevate student's voices in civics
7 education. After much debate, the issue that my class
8 and I decided to focus on was the issue of
9 snowplowing in our community of Astoria, Queens. We
10 felt that this was an issue that affected us all
11 since we would often see each other as well as
12 students from different schools struggling to get
13 through icy sidewalks to get to school. Our primary
14 objective in identifying this community issue was to
15 ensure that students, as well as parents and, and
16 elderly residents, were able to remain safe during
17 the winter. Subsequent to identifying our issue, we
18 decided to research further and found several
19 articles detailing the complains issued by Astoria
20 residents in regard to snow-plow time. Once we had
21 our evidence established, we then turned to the next
22 step contacting our local community officials. Aside
23 from contacting our local Councilmember we decided to
24 contact the Department of Sanitation, who did pay a
25 visit to our classroom. During.. throughout the

1
2 semester, my class was able to identify a community
3 issue, research it and speak to local officials, and
4 finally we... sorry, excuse me, we presented our
5 findings on Civics Day. Although I did not attend
6 Civics Day myself, I did attend one last December,
7 and they are absolutely essential to showcasing all
8 of the hard work our young leaders have done to
9 effect change on issues impacting their community.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Please finish.

11 EMILY LARCHER: Oh, please finish.

12 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I'm, I'm never
13 going to cut off a student.

14 EMILY LARCHER: Oh, no, no. Thank you,
15 sorry. I'll wrap it up. In retrospect, I felt that
16 participating in Generation Citizen did have a
17 profound impact to my classmates and me, especially
18 in the way we became civically engaged. At the end of
19 2016, beginning of 2017 proved to be a hectic time
20 politically, since so many of my Muslim classmates
21 had to endure watching the travel ban placed by
22 Trump. As a result, we decided to participate in
23 different protests in both Astoria and Manhattan.
24 Even though we are not of voting age, Generation
25 Citizen taught us that we can still be civically

1
2 engaged, which my classmates and I did, when we
3 advocated against the travel ban. As I do conclude
4 this speech, I would like you all to keep in mind
5 that it is important to encourage our youth to be
6 civically engaged. Over this past year, I have had
7 the pleasure to come across a number of children from
8 various New York City schools, who have the
9 wonderful... who has so many wonderful and nuanced
10 ideas on how they can improve their own communities.
11 These very children are our future, and we need to
12 ensure that they have the knowledge and skills on how
13 our democracy works and ways that they can
14 participate in it. Thank you so much for giving me
15 the incredible opportunity to speak to you all today
16 and as GC says, don't talk about change, lead it.

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: A, A plus.

18 EMILY LARCHER: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And I'm, I'm, I'm a
20 graduate of Brooklyn College and I remember a saying
21 that many of my classmates would say, think globally
22 act locally.

23 EMILY LARCHER: Yeah, I've, I've learned
24 that one in my business classes.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: That's right and,
and change all starts at home.

EMILY LARCHER: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And so, I know some
folks... I say this with, with my students in my class
that everyone watches CNN, FOX news well I'm not sure
what, what news you call these days but make sure you
know your community.

EMILY LARCHER: Yeah... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Because that's where
it all begins and, and so I, I cannot thank you
enough and I am a big, big supporter of civics
education and empowerment and also making sure that
you run for office one day.

EMILY LARCHER: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Because we need you
up here too.

EMILY LARCHER: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very much
and I thank the entire panel, thanks.

MARCEL BRAITHWAITE: Thank you... [cross-
talk]

EMILY LARCHER: Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, I'd like to
3 call up Melissa Aase from University Settlement;
4 Carl... Carolyn, Carlyn Cowen, Chinese American
5 Planning Council; Allen Ross and Chloe Peshmen.

6 MELISSA AASE: Like that, okay. Thank you
7 so much. I'm Melissa Aase, I'm the Executive Director
8 of University Settlement. We have been around for 132
9 years and now serve over 40,000 New Yorkers across
10 Manhattan and Brooklyn with multiservice civic
11 engagement and the arts. University Settlement serves
12 over 500 children in our four early learn centers as
13 well as over 1,000 more children ages zero to three
14 in home based mental health and early intervention
15 programs and as you know in very short order the
16 system of care in education for working families and
17 our youngest New Yorkers will be moved from ACS to
18 the DOE and to the oversight of this committee. We
19 want this committee to understand the inequity in pay
20 for teachers and staff in the ACS funded centers are
21 putting us at crisis. This is the single most
22 important topic that this committee should understand
23 as it moves to have oversight over this part of our
24 system and we are strongly urging this committee to
25 call for a hearing solely on this topic, we will

1
2 come, we will bring parents and teachers and our
3 peers to tell you much more about this, that's... that
4 was my main request in coming to testify today. I
5 want to describe a little bit more about what it
6 means when teachers leave our system for DOE jobs
7 which pay from 20 to 100 percent more. We understand
8 why they leave, we understand they're struggling
9 economically, we understand their choices. What it
10 means in our centers is that sometimes it takes... it's
11 taking us an average of five months to rehire for
12 those positions, we have substitutes when we can find
13 them and we... when we cannot find them we have to move
14 children from room to room to stay in ratio, some
15 centers have closed classrooms and some entire
16 centers have closed. Teaching teams are constantly
17 changing, and they cannot form their partnerships,
18 they can't design and deliver lessons, they cannot
19 form bonds of trust and consistency with children and
20 families which is the fundamental basis for all of
21 early childhood education. May I continue? Okay,
22 thank you. ultimately having a constantly changing
23 fluctuating stretched substitute team means that our
24 centers are also at grave risk for health and safety
25 mistakes, oversights, and incidents. It is up to the

1
2 council to stand up for working families who need
3 this system of care which is full day and full year,
4 it's up to the council to stand up for the children
5 in our centers and for our staff, a largely women of
6 color workforce who despite having the exact same
7 credentials as their peers in the DOE cannot make as
8 much money in our centers. It's a fundamental equity
9 issue, a racial equity issue, gender equity and
10 economic equity issue and it has to be addressed by
11 the council because we have talked to the
12 administration and the agencies over and over again
13 for four years. We're urging the council to stand up
14 in this budget season and take care of this issue and
15 we'll come to the general welfare council and talk
16 about that with folks that oversee ACS as well, we'll
17 come back as many times as you need us to, to
18 describe what's happening in our systems. Let's not
19 squander all that we have built, let's not squander
20 all that we know about early childhood education and
21 the importance and let's not squander our city's
22 goals around equity, let's do something.

23 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very much,
24 thank you.

1
2 CARLYN COWEN: Good afternoon, thank you
3 very much Chair Treyger and the members of the city
4 council for the opportunity to testify today and your
5 leadership on these incredibly important issues. My
6 name is Carlyn Cowen, I'm the Chief Policy and Public
7 Affairs Officers at the Chinese American Planning
8 Council. The Chinese American Planning Council or
9 CPC's mission is to promote the social and economic
10 empowerment of Chinese American immigrant and low
11 income New Yorkers and we do so by serving over
12 60,000 individuals through all five boroughs in all
13 of our programs every year including over 300 low
14 income children and families through our early
15 childhood education programs. As is a popular topic
16 today the transition to the Department of Education
17 and we are encouraging and urging your leadership on
18 the very important issue of salary parity for our
19 workforce. The early childhood workforce in our
20 organizations provide critical care and education to
21 children throughout New York City including many of
22 the city's poorest children and many children whose
23 classes are their first introduction to the English
24 language as they are in our centers. Our teachers
25 across our six centers work incredibly hard to

1
2 provide high quality, culturally competent,
3 linguistically sensitive programming for the children
4 that they serve. In our Queens based center for
5 example, we do dual language reading in eight
6 different languages. Not just serving our children
7 the teacher helps the parents with language access to
8 critical information about how the school system
9 works and how to best support their children through
10 it, yet these teachers make so much less than the
11 public-school counterparts do and as the cost of
12 living increases it becomes harder and harder for us
13 as organizations to keep them. This is heartbreaking
14 not only for the teachers but for the children, the
15 families and us as an organization. In order to
16 ensure a quality education system for all of New York
17 City's children we urge immediate action to achieve
18 salary parity for this critical workforce. We also
19 support the request of holding a hearing specifically
20 on these issues and we'd be happy to provide all of
21 the information you need; the teachers, the
22 providers, the families to give you the information
23 you need to push this through. Thank you very much.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you as well.

25

1
2 CHLOE PESHMEN: Okay, ready? Hello, I was
3 not originally scheduled to testify so I had to throw
4 something together pretty quickly. I thank Mr. Bender
5 for asking me and thank you for listening. I am a
6 CBO, a Preschool Director in the Bronx, our school
7 has been there for over 60 years and many of our
8 teachers and staff there for many, many decades and
9 again I echo everything that everyone has said here.
10 I think a hearing specifically on this topic would be
11 amazing and much appreciated and very necessary. I
12 just started a petition online a couple of days ago,
13 I have almost 200 signatures just from me, little old
14 me doing it so I think you've heard all the facts I
15 just wanted to read some comments that people have
16 written on this petition and it's just getting
17 started. It's going to the Mayor, leaders of
18 congress, Governor, hopefully you'll be able to see
19 it as well, I'm sure you will. So, this is just a
20 few... these are just a few of the comments that people
21 have written online. CBO Pre-K teachers are not
22 second-class educators with less important and less
23 difficult jobs so stop treating them like they are, I
24 say this as a sister of a DOE teacher. I'm signing
25 because I still believe that people can make a

1
2 change. I'm signing because I believe that if
3 teachers are better rewarded that will motivate them
4 even more to complete their responsibility and
5 commitment to shape all future professionals. I
6 believe this is awesome and an important job to help
7 these children nowadays. Let's see if we have
8 anymore, I'm an experienced early childhood educator
9 with a masters degree and NYS, New York State
10 certification who has been teaching at a CBO
11 preschool for over 20 years, I love my children and
12 families but I deserve fair compensation for my hard
13 work and so do my colleagues and I want to emphasize
14 quickly, I know I don't have too much more time, that
15 it's not just the teachers I know you mentioned staff
16 as well it's the custodians, it's the bookkeepers,
17 it's the food service professionals, it's everyone in
18 our building, it's also the directors and CSA was
19 here before and I hope they'll be back but we're also
20 in CSA. The early childhood directors earn what we
21 call a... if you don't mind if I continue, stepchild
22 part of CSA so when the early child... you know the DOE
23 directors, you know principals, assistant principals
24 get raises and, you know their insurance paid for and
25 everything great pensions, all the time off that they

1
2 have we do not get any of that so... and we have the
3 same credentials and anyone who doesn't now is
4 working towards to get the SBL and other, you know
5 certifications that they need to be on par but we're
6 not even close so I think that's really important and
7 also there are many other disparities in addition to
8 salary such as no full time school nurses, security
9 issues and I... Mark was talking about school security
10 there's... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I think... these are
12 issues... yeah, I... [cross-talk]

13 CHLOE PESHMEN: ...literally none... [cross-
14 talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I hear you and I...
16 there are... there are... just like these early learn
17 centers and there are schools that want nurses too
18 and... [cross-talk]

19 CHLOE PESHMEN: Right... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...they deserve them
21 and... [cross-talk]

22 CHLOE PESHMEN: That's where I am... [cross-
23 talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...so I... [cross-talk]

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHLOE PESHMEN: ...I'm in an early learn center... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, right and, and so... [cross-talk]

CHLOE PESHMEN: So, right... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...this is a very valid issue, I, I just have one quick question just... because I... as, as you've noted this is all being transferred from ACS to the... to the DOE and we are... [cross-talk]

CHLOE PESHMEN: Right... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...going to be fully briefed on all what that... what those changes mean and what they look like but just a quick question just for my own knowledge, with regards to the requirements of an... of an educator in early learn... [cross-talk]

CHLOE PESHMEN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...what, what are the requirements, can you shed... [cross-talk]

CHLOE PESHMEN: Exactly the same... exactly the same.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, they're exactly the same... [cross-talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHLOE PESHMEN: Yes... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...so, so of a... of a
DOE public school... [cross-talk]

CHLOE PESHMEN: Yes... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...exactly the same...
[cross-talk]

CHLOE PESHMEN: Yes, Pre-K in the DOE and
Pre-K in our centers exactly the same.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Exactly the same,
all those exams, the LEST... [cross-talk]

CHLOE PESHMEN: Yes, yes, exactly... [cross-
talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...all my favorite
tests they have to... [cross-talk]

CHLOE PESHMEN: Yes... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...take LEST, CS...
[cross-talk]

CHLOE PESHMEN: Its all the same.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, so there's,
there's a legitimate... this is a very, very serious
issue and, and so... [cross-talk]

CHLOE PESHMEN: Oh yes... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and where... we will
be following up because again as you've noted this is

1
2 being transferred over, but we will be doing some
3 follow up work on this as well.

4 CHLOE PESHMEN: And I know my appearance
5 may be a little deceiving but I'm the only one who
6 looks like me in my center and that's, you know
7 generally true all around and I think the reason
8 we're talking about it right now and that's very,
9 very serious and very concerning.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Well I thank you for
11 your advocacy.

12 CHLOE PESHMEN: Thank you, thank... [cross-
13 talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and your time here
15 today... [cross-talk]

16 CHLOE PESHMEN: ...you for listening.

17 ALLEN ROSS: Yes, I'd... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes.

19 ALLEN ROSS: I'd like to start out saying
20 though I'm older, I'm a student of life and I hope to
21 get the same that... yeah, right, right... thank you
22 Chairman Treyger and the members of your staff, I
23 know it's a long afternoon. My name is Allen Ross,
24 I'm the Executive Director of Samaritan Suicide
25 Prevention Center. We operate the only community-

1
2 based organization devoted to preventing suicide and
3 saving lives in New York City. As you know the
4 increase in incidents of violence, self-harming and
5 suicidal behavior involving students is of growing
6 concern to all of us working in schools today. The
7 CDC tells us that 18 percent of New York City high
8 City high school students consider suicide each year
9 and as many as eight percent attempt, the highest
10 rates being among young female Hispanics and Asian,
11 adolescent members of the LGBTQ community and youth
12 living in poverty and when you add the highest rates
13 of hospitalizations tied to self-inflicted injuries
14 and opioid abuse are found in 15 to 19 year olds and
15 that one in five New Yorkers experiences a mental
16 health disorder each year we have a problem that is
17 severely impacting our youth, their families and the
18 school communities. I'm proud to say that Samaritans
19 which runs the city's 24-hour suicide prevention
20 hotline has had a significant role in addressing this
21 problem in our schools going back over 30 years. As a
22 letter from the New York City DOE Coordinator of
23 Child Abuse states, the reality is that Samaritans
24 are responsible for the advancement of suicide
25 prevention at the DOE for making it a priority for

1
2 ongoing professional development and training, it's
3 not exaggeration to say that your workers help save
4 lives. So, with this history and experience training
5 over 40,000 guidance counselors, social workers, and
6 other DO staff that we say there is still much work
7 to be done to reduce student self-harming and
8 suicidal behavior that is not being addressed in the
9 current programs and those... many of these programs
10 are valuable, there's a big difference between
11 teaching people what to do and addressing the issues
12 that make it difficult for them to do it. Most of the
13 available programs fail to do that, if you were to
14 talk directly to a school guidance counselor they
15 would tell you nothing scares them more than a
16 student saying they're feeling suicidal, they feel
17 they're under a microscope, a camera showing at them
18 and everything they do is wrong. Samaritans is
19 seeking to address this issue with our caring
20 community suicide prevention public education
21 project, we've submitted it to the council for
22 funding in 2019 and hope you'll consider prioritizing
23 it on the Speaker's list. When you talk about finance
24 we're talking for the price of one teacher's salary
25 providing programs and services and filling in the

1
2 gap throughout New York City. We hope you'll consider
3 it, we look forward if we could to meet with you and
4 express... go into more details.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Absolutely and I...
6 you know I shared before with my visits to schools I,
7 I make it a priority to visit as many schools as I
8 can, I don't just stay here in city hall I go out in
9 the field and we had students share such painful
10 stories of just, just trauma just being afraid to go
11 outside because of the anti-immigrant climate that,
12 that we're experiencing now in this country and
13 there's so much other types of trauma that many of
14 our kids are facing and there is also a direct
15 correlation between the increasing reliance on
16 standardized tests and the stress kids are feeling. I
17 will not forget during the testing times how a number
18 of kids would need to speak to a guidance counselor,
19 need to speak to social workers and just so we need
20 more of them and we need more of these types of
21 support services for our kids because again I believe
22 in teaching to the whole child meeting their all...
23 meeting all their needs and so I... again I, I thank
24 you for really advocating on a critical, critical
25

1
2 issue that is very real in our school system. Thank
3 you, sir, thank you so much... [cross-talk]

4 ALLEN ROSS: Thank you, if I could just
5 add one very small point, there's so many programs
6 out there but they're not drilling down, they're not
7 getting into the... you know you have educated and
8 capable people but they're uncomfortable talking
9 about suicide, they have their own fears and
10 concerns, they're afraid of saying the wrong thing so
11 we're teaching them all these assessments models and
12 warning signs but not how to be comfortable, you're
13 not comfortable, the people aren't going... young
14 people aren't going to be comfortable talking to you
15 so that's something that really is missing and, and
16 we're hoping to address and I thank you for... [cross-
17 talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Agreed, thank you,
19 thank you so much. Thank you all for, for your
20 excellent leadership, thank you. Okay, we have Kylynn
21 Grier, Jane Golden, Elizabeth Adams, Laura Cavalier
22 and Esante Latimer. You, you may begin as soon as
23 everyone is seated. Great.

24 KYLYNN GRIER: Good afternoon Committee
25 Chair and Council Member Levin. My name is Kylynn

1
2 Grier, I work as the Policy Manager at Girls for
3 Gender Equity, an organization challenging the
4 structural forces that work to obstruct the freedom,
5 full expression and rights of girls, transgender, and
6 gender non-conforming youth of color. We are also
7 proud members of the dignity in school's campaign,
8 the sexuality education alliance of New York and
9 communities and I for police reform. Thank you for
10 the opportunity to speak today. GGE has been in the
11 movement to end gender-based violence and push out in
12 schools for 16 years. As the New York City council
13 calls on the NYPD to fund a public safety response in
14 light of the events at Parkland, Florida through the
15 investment of 3.5 million in bullet proof, proof
16 vests we call on New York City council to reframe an
17 understanding of safety that does not further
18 criminalize students of color. We strongly support
19 continued investment in additional support staff and
20 such, such as restorative justice coordinators,
21 guidance counselors and social workers. We also call
22 for the expansion of the number of title nine
23 coordinators in New York City, better regulations and
24 guidance require every school to designate at least
25 one employee who's responsible for coordinating the

1
2 school's compliance with title nine. Currently New
3 York City has one title nine coordinator for over 1.1
4 million students and families. Through a
5 participatory action research project, we worked with
6 over 100 girls and TGNC youths of color throughout
7 New York City to identify the barriers in their
8 education. Through this process we learned that one
9 in three participants reported experiencing some form
10 of sexual harassment in schools by peers, staff,
11 teachers and school resource officers. We must move
12 urgently towards the vision that... of safety that does
13 not complacently accept sexual harassment and gender-
14 based violence as a normal part of the school
15 experience. We are requesting funding to designate at
16 least one title nine coordinator in every field
17 support center responsible for coordination,
18 compliance and carrying out the responsibilities
19 outlined under title nine. Title nine coordinators at
20 the field support centers would ensure that all
21 people affected by sex discrimination in schools;
22 students, parents, and employees are aware of their
23 legal rights working to foster preventative cultures
24 of consent in schools, this would require an
25 investment of 150,000 per title nine coordinator in

1
2 each of the seven field support centers in New York,
3 this totals to one million and 50,000, less than a
4 quarter of the 3.5 million proposed by Council to
5 fund bullet proof vests. As a city we must ensure
6 that there are comprehensive in school support for
7 students who are survivors to sexual violence, you
8 must urgently expand and understanding of safety that
9 holistically supports all young people. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much
11 for that, thank you, next. Make sure the mic is on,
12 thanks.

13 JANE GOLDEN: Thank you for the
14 opportunity to testify. My name is Jane Golden, I'm
15 the Chief Program Officer at Sheltering Arms Children
16 and Family Services. Sheltering Arms serves more than
17 20,000 low income children in some of the highest
18 need communities in this city. We provide services at
19 11 New York City Administration for Children Services
20 funded early childhood education programs.
21 Unfortunately, the future of these ACS funded
22 programs is at risk because the city contracts are...
23 because city contracts pay our teachers tens of
24 thousands of dollars less per year than teachers in
25 DOE run programs. This unconscionable disparity has

1
2 become a crisis for Sheltering Arms and as you've
3 heard today from many other community-based
4 organizations. I'm here to urge the committee and the
5 city council to require this administration to
6 deliver salary parity for ECE teachers in ACS funded
7 early learn centers so they're treated the same as
8 teachers in public schools. There has been no
9 response and no action from the Mayor to our
10 consistent call for equal pay for equal work, we now
11 urge the Committee on Education to hold hearings into
12 these disparities and to hold the administration
13 accountable. The families and teachers impacted by
14 these inequities deserve a solution. Honestly, we're
15 often surprised we have any teachers, we've asked
16 this women of color led workforce to shoulder a
17 financial burden that the city that prides itself on
18 being the fairest big city in America should cover.
19 Without correction CBOs will continue to invest in
20 new teachers who then leave for the DOE, this
21 inequitable system impacts not only the teachers in
22 our centers but the low-income communities of color
23 we have a mandate to serve. It's time for New York
24 City to step up and pay all its early childhood
25 education teachers fair salaries and provide

1
2 equitable education to all of it's children. The city
3 council has proven itself an ally of the human
4 services sector, we urge you to take a leadership
5 role to hold a hearing on this inequitable system and
6 to demand that the Mayor provide the necessary
7 funding to eliminate these salary disparities. Thank
8 you.

9 ELIZABETH ADAMS: Good afternoon, I'm
10 Elizabeth Adams, the Director of Government Relations
11 at Planned Parenthood of New York City. Thank you to
12 the Chair, Council Member Levin for the opportunity
13 to speak today to our Education Services for New
14 Yorkers across New York City. We are grateful for the
15 council's longstanding support in providing health
16 education and resources to over 25,000 New Yorkers
17 each year. This year we face new federal cuts to our
18 ability to provide care and we respectfully turn to
19 the council for increased support. The title ten
20 family planning program funds both our low to no cost
21 health care services as well as many of our education
22 programs for New Yorkers which we offer to young
23 people, parents and caring adults across the city. In
24 2017 we provided sexuality education workshops to
25 over 4,300 young people at schools and community

1
2 sites funded in part by grants by the title ten
3 program. The Trump administration just released new
4 title ten guidelines that radically shift the
5 programs priorities away from medically accurate
6 contraceptive care making it much more difficult for
7 providers like PPNYC to offer the quality care and
8 education our patients depend on. These guidelines
9 also open funding to abstinence only anti-abortion
10 providers like crisis pregnancy centers taking our
11 country's public health and public education
12 backwards. As such we respectfully request an
13 enhanced 500,000-dollar initiative through the
14 reproductive and sexual health services initiative.
15 In this political moment the need for medically
16 accurate services and education is more important
17 than ever. We are proud to be a leading health
18 educator in New York City and we urge the council
19 help us continue to meet the need for comprehensive
20 sex education citywide. We also know that in this
21 political moment we need to do more to fight back
22 against the tax on immigrant communities and so we
23 also request your support for a promontory safe
24 allude health outreach worker program. Promontories
25 bridge the gap between immigrants and the health care

1
2 system and provide education and workshops to connect
3 Spanish speaking residents to care directly at our
4 health centers. Lastly, I would just like to echo the
5 call and the respectful request for additional title
6 nine coordinators at each center. Thank you for your
7 consideration of our requests, happy to answer any
8 questions.

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much
10 for your leadership, thank you.

11 ELIZABETH ADAMS: Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Sure.

13 LAURA CAVALIERI: Thank you. Good
14 afternoon, my name is Laura Cavalieri and I'm so glad
15 I came. First, I'd like to add a little piece right
16 here that I learned today from Kelly Vilar, CB1
17 Staten Island, did you know Staten Island has more
18 homeless students than Bestuy according to the
19 institute of Children, Poverty and Homelessness
20 Report on student... on student homelessness,
21 homelessness New York City August 2017. What I'm
22 referencing from Kelly is because I'm involved with
23 the North Shore and we're all looking for affordable
24 housing so when I hear about teachers not getting
25 high quality pay I'm going to lose that and I'm

1
2 learning now too that we have high homelessness and
3 those students on the North Shore so I'd like to
4 speak about dyslexic I like to share current events
5 and dyslexia news. Now dyslexia news there's a law
6 upstate in New York right now that's asking for
7 dyslexia guidelines, as of Friday they were writing
8 or met to meet to start writing these guidelines for
9 dyslexia, that law was signed last year. There's also
10 a bill up there that we're going to go lobby for, for
11 teacher training, sorry teachers I have to tell you
12 all now, none of you have the training to teach
13 dyslexics, they all fail, I'm a dropout, I'm the high
14 school dropout. Dyslexia is hereditary, my two sons
15 are dyslexics, get to them in a minute. Alright, so
16 also New York City council I believe that you also
17 heard about dyslexia plus task force because two
18 years ago there was a dyslexia oversight committee
19 hearing here and as of today what's going on with
20 that because like it says all dyslexics are failing.
21 We obviously know teachers are not trained and I need
22 the early teachers trained too, to identify this
23 because what's worse now is that I have a stigma, I,
24 I... and figuring out what the fellow was saying before
25 about... the last gentleman here... how... suicide, how do

1
2 you make kids... dyslexics feel comfortable take that
3 stigma out of school because school is where I
4 learned that negative stigma and there's nothing
5 wrong about dyslexics; we're bright, we're talented
6 and who has the right to tell us that, that we're
7 wrong just because we learn differently. So, let me
8 go because I'm adding onto this, don't reinvent the
9 wheel, make it bigger, put the pride... put dyslexics
10 in with that pride and LGB because us dyslexics can
11 help each other. My son Lars is now a graduate of
12 Marquee high school this year, the first dyslexic
13 honor student graduating from our public schools.
14 Let's hear it for our public schools because they did
15 it, right, they did it with dyslexic student, he's
16 graduating with advanced regents all that wonderful
17 stuff. Anyway, like I say his comment when we spoke
18 at the CEC 31 this month, I says Lars what would have
19 made your experience better, if I had known other
20 dyslexics just like me, they can support each other,
21 I don't need all the teachers trained right now but I
22 need dyslexics to know to be comfortable, to share
23 each other so they don't start abusing each other in
24 school, suicide, drug addiction, homelessness and
25 worst of all like I say dyslexia plus they're here to

1
2 advocate because how many dyslexics are in jail.

3 Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank, thank you as
5 well for, for your very passionate advocacy and
6 leadership and just to quickly note, one of the
7 things that I plan to do during... because I, I... this
8 is my first year as chair of this committee and one
9 of the things that I'd, I'd like to do is to meet
10 with the teaching preparatory institutions, colleges
11 that are preparing our future teachers to make sure
12 that the, the curriculums include strategies on, on
13 how to address the needs of all kids and that's
14 something that... it's, it's more of a systemic issue
15 that we... that we have to address but I thank you for
16 your passionate leadership and I, I just... I also just
17 want to note that we've been joined by Council Member
18 Levin who has done an outstanding job leading the
19 General Welfare Committee and as we've heard the
20 passionate testimony how the early learn is being
21 shifted over to, to DOE there, there's going to be a
22 conversation we're going to have with DOE about this,
23 this is a very serious issue especially hearing that
24 educators are being asked of the same requirements
25 and there's not parody that's just not acceptable so

1
2 that's something that we will... I know that there's
3 adjustments being made with the DOE absorbing this,
4 but we will be meeting especially with a new incoming
5 Chancellor this is a very serious topic and I thank
6 you for your passion and advocacy and we'll close
7 just by a final comment and we'll have to turn to the
8 next panel. Sure.

9 LAURA CAVALIERI: May I just ask that you
10 call me by my name... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Wait, I'm sorry...
12 [cross-talk]

13 LAURA CAVALIERI: Oh, gentleman... [cross-
14 talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: This young man did
16 not speak... [cross-talk]

17 LAURA CAVALIERI: Yes... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, we have to hear
19 from you so why, why don't we just very quickly and
20 then I want to hear from, from this young person.

21 LAURA CAVALIERI: Please refer to us as
22 dyslexics...

23 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Sure... [cross-talk]

24

25

1
2 LAURA CAVALIERI: ...not just learning
3 disability because it really means a lot to hear that
4 word, thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Absolutely, thank
6 you again, sure. Please, the floor is yours.

7 ESANTE LATIMER: Alright. Good afternoon,
8 my name is Esante Latimer, I'm a current student at
9 Canarsie High School and an intern for the Children's
10 Defense Fund of New York. Its my pleasure to testify
11 today. Just two weeks ago I spoke before the Mayor at
12 his student town hall and called for more counselors
13 and social workers instead of police.. instead of
14 focus on police and punitive school safety.. schools
15 safe, safety policies that pushes students out of
16 school. The Mayor and others look, look at our
17 schools from the outside in but I go to school every
18 day and I know firsthand what's effective in
19 resolving a, a conflict and restorative justice and
20 engaging students in school. In my testimony.. my.. in
21 my testimony today I want to highlight the need for
22 city.. for the city to invest in more opportunities
23 for students and, and stop the school to prison
24 pipeline. I see every day that students are being
25 isolated and only a selective few are actually being

1
2 noticed. Throughout all my years in school I've
3 noticed... I seen students they feel uncomfortable in
4 their environment, they don't know how to express
5 themselves and they have... and they face with staff
6 enforcement rules without really understanding how
7 the students feel. I believe that if our resources
8 were invested more counselors there, there, there was
9 a less focus on police interventions in school than
10 the school to prison pipeline would separate.
11 Counselors make students feel welcome, welcome and
12 comfortable and serve a much different role than
13 school safety who, who make students feel controlled
14 and watched. Guidance counselors are supposed to
15 connect students with opportunities to further our
16 education however my guidance counselor... my guidance
17 counselor is overwhelmed, and they need help. There
18 are too many students in every school, every student
19 needs help. When guidance counselors don't have time
20 for us it makes us feel like we're not worth their
21 time. The... this, this discouraged me from applying
22 myself in areas where I know can benefit me. I'm one
23 of many who feels left out. As the city works on the
24 next budget I'm asking you to focus on what makes
25 students want to better their future. Over, over... to

1
2 make... to make the school more safe and restorative
3 for the city we must fund more counselors and social
4 workers instead of criminalizing students by
5 enhancing school safety and police.

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: A plus for you as
7 well. Esante is that correct?

8 ESANTE LATIMER: Yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I cannot agree with
10 you more about the impact that guidance counselors
11 and social workers and support staff have in schools.
12 I, I witnessed... I witnessed that firsthand as a
13 teacher in a high school and I witnessed that in my
14 field work of visiting schools... I visit schools as
15 much as I can, and you are... you are correct and that
16 is where we need resources paid to and I think that
17 you will be very successful in your advocacy because
18 we're not going to stop until, until this happens.
19 So, thank you very much, great job today.

20 ESANTE LATIMER: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Great, thank the,
22 the entire panel. Okay, we'll call up Lucas Liu;
23 Maria Gill; Victor Almanzar and DeJohn Jones. Okay, I
24 think you may, may begin.

1
2 LUCAS LIU: Thank you. Good afternoon and
3 thanks for the opportunity for allowing me to speak
4 today about funding for dual language programs in our
5 public schools. my name is Lucas Liu, I'm from CEC3
6 and the Chair of the CEC3 Multilingual Committee.
7 CEC3 overlaps with council district six, seven and
8 nine so Council Member Rosenthal, Levin and Perkins
9 but... however there are dual language schools in all
10 Council Member's districts and you know we live in
11 this... in a global environment and I think as you
12 mentioned earlier Councilman Treyger technology is a
13 literacy skill that is necessary for the 21st century
14 and I also think in that is dual language, knowing a
15 second language, given the global environment that
16 we, we live in and again Council Member Levin's
17 comments earlier on dual language education I think
18 we're, we're right on target, you know and so when
19 our kids currently... you know kindergarten through 12th
20 grade when they hit the workforce in the next, you
21 know 15, 16... you know up to, you know this year and
22 into the next 15, 16 years, you know knowing a dual
23 language... knowing a second language will be a
24 critical skill, it may not put them at an advantage
25 but it won't leave them at a disadvantage because I

1
2 think the world is moving that quickly and last year
3 we began an initiative to raise awareness on the need
4 for funding for bilingual education programs in our
5 schools across the city and we met with Council
6 Member Helen Rosenthal, Mark Levine, Daniel Dromm,
7 Karen Goldmark in the Mayor's Office, Deputy, Deputy
8 Chancellor Milady Baez and this year we're looking
9 for the city council's support and hopefully funding
10 support, you know currently there are 389 DOE public
11 schools across our five boroughs that offer 544
12 bilingual education programs in 14 different
13 languages however the DOE and the fair student
14 funding formula which got talked about extensively
15 today does not provide any funding support for dual
16 language programs and specifically... I mean there is
17 ELL funding and that is definitely a necessity but
18 for students that are not ELL students there is no
19 funding allowed to that and so what we're looking for
20 is to get that, that type of support and based on the
21 limited information we were able to get it costs
22 approximately 11,400 dollars more to operate an
23 elementary school dual language classroom versus a
24 regular gen ed classroom and if you'd just assume
25 half those students are ELL students and that means

1
2 5,700 dollars is the shortfall that a school has to
3 come up with per classroom and if you do the weights
4 that number changes from middle schools and, and high
5 schools but in looking at that average and across the
6 district all the schools the, the 389 schools, the
7 544 dual language programs and you multiply that by
8 the number of classes that comes out to about two...
9 26.9 million dollars that the schools have to come up
10 with themselves and that's sort of the starting point
11 that we're asking the city council to think about as
12 we go through the budgeting process. You know we, we
13 just started a dual language Russian program in
14 district three this year so... and it's doing...

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: [speaks Russian],
16 that means good.

17 LUCAS LIU: Good and it's doing great but
18 the problem is they will have no... they've... they got
19 startup funding but they had... they get no funding to
20 continue next year, right so... and the school has to
21 do... and the school is struggling school financially
22 so, you know they could use that 5,700 dollars per
23 class to help with all the supplies, the extra
24 teacher work, the extra books, you know the books in
25 the, the targeted language so on and so forth,

1
2 translation all those types of expenses and you know
3 this is something, dual language is something that we
4 can do within our public schools, K through 12
5 there's dual language classrooms... classes, CUNY and
6 SUNY all have a dual language... you know a foreign
7 language instruction including study abroad and if
8 you look at... I will... I... just yesterday before... while
9 I was working on this I went onto the job boards, you
10 know online job boards and I just punched in Spanish
11 and on one of the job boards over 6,000 jobs came up
12 that required Spanish within a ten mile radius of New
13 York City, those are jobs that kids... that kids that
14 be... hit the workforce will not have access to if they
15 couldn't speak a... you know Spanish and I did the same
16 for Russian and if you look at page, I think it's
17 five in here, page seven I, I showed you what I did,
18 did a search on Spanish over 6,000 jobs, Chinese over
19 1,000, Russian over 580 jobs all within a ten mile
20 radius of New York City that required that, that
21 language or preferred to have someone with that
22 language, different job boards, you know depending on
23 you get different numbers but New York City dot gov,
24 Spanish 75 jobs required... jobs required Spanish, six
25 Chinese, five Russian, 18 French, 11 Creole...

1

2

3

4

5

6

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I'll tell you I'm going to use your data to continue to make the case to the Board of Elections to hire more folks that speak different languages at poll sites as well because... [cross-talk]

7

LUCAS LIU: Yes, absolutely... [cross-talk]

8

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...that... your data reinforces things that we've learned in, in other areas and I would just... I will just mention to you that we asked the DOE earlier about their efforts which really have not been up to par with regards to recruiting and attracting and hiring bilingual educators and there's a variety of reasons for this, financial and I think... I think one issue that I think you heard me elicit out of the Deputy Chancellor was the issue we can't look at this issue just as simply bilingual teachers we need bilingual leaders because it is... it is very difficult for a supervisor that doesn't speak the language to observe and provide constructive feedback when they don't know what's being discussed in that classroom... [cross-talk]

23

LUCAS LIU: Exactly... [cross-talk]

24

25

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and, and, and that teacher doesn't feel supported, it doesn't... they,

1
2 they feel that they have to go through hoops to kind
3 of get feedback and make modifications to their
4 instruction so we have to look at this issue bigger
5 not just through the teacher lens but even... through
6 the leadership lens, I would say school leaders, APs,
7 Principals, Superintendents, folks who are key
8 decision makers vertically within, within the DOE and
9 I... but I thank you for your passionate advocacy. I
10 just want to get through the rest of the panel
11 because time... [cross-talk]

12 LUCAS LIU: Yep... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...is soon running out
14 but... [cross-talk]

15 LUCAS LIU: Sure... just, just really quick
16 we... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Very quickly...
18 [cross-talk]

19 LUCAS LIU: ...actually have a meeting on
20 the 17th be talking more on the 17th... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I look forward...
22 [cross-talk]

23 LUCAS LIU: ...put that on your schedule...
24 [cross-talk]

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...to it, thank you,
3 thanks, thanks for your excellent research as well.

4 LUCAS LIU: Thank you... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you.

6 DEJOHN JONES: Hello, good afternoon
7 Council Members. My name is DeJohn Jones and first
8 let me just say thank you very much at the last
9 hearing thank you for hearing my testimony and thank
10 you for reading my testimony and thank you for trying
11 to address as many of the issues that we brought to
12 you before, thank you. I'm a parent leader with the
13 New Settlement... New Settlement Parent Action
14 Committee in the Bronx and the new... excuse me, the
15 NYC Coalitions for Educational Justice. I'm here
16 today to talk about why the Mayor's education budget
17 must include additional funds dedicated to the
18 implementation of culturally responsive education and
19 restorative justice in our schools. as a PA President
20 in district 12 I saw how a student was bullied for
21 his perceived sexuality turned to violence as a
22 solution and another student died as a result. Over
23 the past few months I have also seen multiple
24 examples of racism in schools reported in the news
25 and in our community. If these schools and others

1
2 across New York City adopted culturally responsive
3 education... thank you and restorative practices our
4 school environments could improve for both the staff
5 and students alike and I believe teachers in schools
6 desperately need culturally responsive competency
7 training and coaching, multicultural curriculum in
8 order to provide effective support for students of
9 color, LBGTQIA and gender non-conforming students,
10 immigrant students, Muslim students as well. To teach
11 the diverse population... oh excuse me, as you can see
12 on that I have like bullets, okay. To teach the
13 diverse population of NYC schools effectively
14 teachers and school staff must have awareness of
15 their own racial and cultural identity and how it
16 impacts their teaching, have a consciousness about
17 the cultural backgrounds of their students and be
18 able to be... excuse me, to connect academic learning
19 to those identities. I'm just going to... faster here.
20 We need our Mayor and city councils to dedicate funds
21 in this year's budget to greatly expand cultural,
22 cultural competency training for NYC teachers,
23 diversity and curriculum create... and to create an
24 office of culturally responsive education to lead
25 this work across the school system. Without this

1
2 investment of funds and effort we can meet the goals..
3 excuse me, with this... without this investment of
4 funds and effort we can meet the goals that the
5 Mayor's set for himself... oh that was a question,
6 excuse me. I was rushing. So, I'm going to read the
7 quote that Bill De Blasio wrote, we face an
8 achievement gap today that is rooted in the
9 enslavement of Americans and pervasive discrimination
10 against people of color over centuries, we know
11 exactly where the problem comes from but to defeat
12 structural racism and to overcome this achievement
13 gap we have to flip the script, we have to do
14 something different when it comes to education. Thank
15 you.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, thank you
17 for your great work, thank you so much.

18 VICTOR ALMANZAR: Hi, my name is Victor
19 Almanzar. Thank you for giving me the time to speak.
20 Good afternoon, my name is Victor Almanzar and I'm a
21 leader with New Settlement Parent Action Committee
22 and I would like to... I would like to share with you
23 my story. My mom and I arrived here on May 4th of
24 1994, we needed help funding... finding our way around
25 and not everyone was nice. Since I was a little... I

1
2 was little I had problems with speech and when I came
3 to the United States for the first time I still have
4 the same problems. My mother said that when she got
5 here she didn't know where to go or who to ask for
6 help that she... sorry, that she was afraid she will be
7 laughed at if she reached out. I was in school in the
8 Bronx and... at PS114 around that... around that time I
9 was in the limbo class English and Spanish, the
10 teacher Miss Garcia when she was giving me a lesson
11 and she wanted me to pronounce a, a word she noticed
12 that I have trouble, trouble, sorry after that she
13 called my mom and made an appointment with her. When
14 my mom went in and heard her concerns my mom was so
15 relieved and finally opened up and shared what she
16 had been seeing for years. My... Miss Garcia explained
17 to her how to get speech services for me, she helped..
18 she helped us get a violation at the school and then
19 she helped my mom find a specialist for me in... after
20 that I went... sorry, after that I was... I went there
21 every Saturday till I was in middle school. My mom
22 still talks about how she is really grateful for what
23 Miss Garcia did for us, my mom says in, in Spanish
24 [Spanish dialogue] she is a teacher who has, has
25 already had... really has a good heart and, and knows

1
2 what she's doing. Miss Garcia understood my mother
3 could identify with us and made a connection between
4 the school and my family, without the cultural
5 connection I'm not certain if more time will be have
6 passed before I got the services that I needed. I'm
7 likely... like my experience there are too many
8 examples of racism and biases in our public school
9 many of our teachers don't know our cultures,
10 cultures and don't know how to connect with two
11 families who don't share their language or culture,
12 we need teachers, principals, school staffs to get
13 ongoing biased training, we need the books and
14 courses, courses books that our students... more of the
15 worse... sorry, the... diverse and multicultural or..
16 sorry, our students should be able to see their
17 families and their history as part of their studies.
18 We need... we need an office of cultural response
19 education these things aren't free, the Mayor must
20 invest funds to this change, without the funds to
21 support this effort racism and biases will continue
22 and black and brown students won't get the education
23 they need. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: You did a great job
25 delivering your testimony.

1
2 VICTOR ALMANZAR: Oh yeah, I was little
3 nervous.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I couldn't tell,
5 great... you did a great job.

6 VICTOR ALMANZAR: Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, thank you
8 very much.

9 MARIA GILL: [Spanish dialogue]

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Just make sure the
11 mic is on and close... speak into the mic, yeah.

12 MARIA GILL: Good afternoon, I'm going to
13 read in Spanish and then... going to read it in
14 English. My name is Maria Gill. [Spanish dialogue]

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: That was excellent
16 thank you.

17 MARIA GILL TRANSLATION: I'll be very
18 quick in this. Good afternoon, my name is Maria Gill,
19 I'm the mother of six girls, two in college, two in
20 high school, one in middle school and one in
21 elementary school. I'm a member of Make the Road New
22 York and the Coalition for Educational Justice. I'm
23 here to advocate for a culturally responsive
24 education because the Department of Education has
25 failed us for many years. My daughters have been

1
2 educated in an environment where they are not
3 included or reflected in their classrooms and that
4 has been an obstacle to their educational development
5 because they haven't been recognized for their
6 academic skills only as girls who didn't cause
7 problems. Also, 90 percent of their teachers have
8 been white and are not familiar with our culture or
9 our community. One of our... my daughters also had an
10 experience with a teacher who because of a lack of
11 training would say that girls are better than boys
12 and would make fun of a boy for liking the color pink
13 causing one boy to attempt suicide. This is why we
14 need the Department of Education to offer trainings
15 for teachers, principals and school staff on how to
16 educate children from diverse communities, we need
17 diverse curriculum, books and courses, we need
18 experts on culturally responsive education working
19 inside the Department of Education. The Mayor and
20 city council must put funds in the budget to support
21 these changes. Today a student can graduate from New
22 York City schools without ever learning anything
23 about their own history and culture, without having a
24 teacher from their same ethnicity and many students
25 are facing racism in their schools daily. This is not

1
2 acceptable, it cannot be fixed by a one-time token
3 workshop, we can address these problems, but we need
4 support from the Mayor and city council. We ask you
5 to dedicate funds in the budget for culturally
6 responsive education.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you all for
8 your excellent advocacy and your work, I, I look
9 forward to following up on some of these discussions
10 here, here as well and I cannot agree more with
11 regards to folks that for example speak the same
12 language, it is a valid dating experience, it is a
13 welcoming experience, it, it is something that is
14 necessary for instructional purposes for societal
15 purposes. I, I observed in one school where most of
16 the kids in the school are... speak Spanish but the
17 school safety officer did not and that led to the
18 student being asked to show paperwork and asked... and
19 they asked for another student to translate so two
20 kids were losing instructional time because someone
21 needed to show ID, that's unacceptable and I did
22 raise that with the DOE as well so I think that your
23 work is very much appreciated and I look forward to
24 our work together and I look forward to commuting
25 with your shortly as well. Thank you so much.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MARIA GILL: Thank you sir.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Sure, thank you.

[Spanish dialogue]. Alright. Alright, final panel;

Stephanie Bolara; Arlynn Leach, Leach; Brian Adjew;

Roberto Cabanas; Irma Barrios; Andrea Colon and Jamal

Burgess So, yeah you can decide who goes first.

IRMA BARRIOS: Hello, my name is Irma

Barrios. I am a Youth Leader with Urban Youth

Collaborative and Make the Road New York. I'm also a...

[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Irma, don't... [cross-

talk]

IRMA BARRIOS: ...senior... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...worry you, you,

your... [cross-talk]

IRMA BARRIOS: ...at Curtis High School in

Staten Island... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: You're doing great.

IRMA BARRIOS: As a person who struggles

with mental health issues I can say with firsthand

experience that our public schools are not supportive

for someone with mental health issues. Many teachers

are not trained to support students with mental

health issues and it often feels like they failed to

1
2 listen to our needs. While our guidance counselors
3 are overworked and have no time to support students
4 with mental health issues... needs and counselors... and
5 schools lack social workers and school psychologists,
6 students are forced to either push through it or find
7 a way to get someone to help them to listen to them
8 or if lucky enough find outside resources to assist
9 them. in New York City outdated and misguided
10 responses to mental health issues continue to use the
11 New York... the NYPD as first responders to emotional
12 and mental health crisis within the school community.
13 In just one year, 2017 the NYPD responded to 3,175...
14 74 children in crisis incidents. NYPD officers should
15 never be called to support a student during mental
16 health crisis and in many circumstances, they only
17 succeed in escalating the situations. While students
18 with disabilities are 19.4 percent of the school
19 population... of the student population they are 42.8
20 percent of all students that receive long term
21 suspensions. Students of color make up 95 percent of
22 all mental health emergencies in which the NYPD
23 responded and 95.6 percent of those in which students
24 ended up in handcuffs. NYPD officers should not be
25 responding to mental health crisis within public

1
2 schools, trained mental health workers should. NY...
3 New York City must design a network of mental health
4 services to support students along the spectrum of
5 mental health needs, the network should provide the
6 resources and infrastructure necessary to bring
7 intensive support services to students within
8 schools. As recommended in the Mayor's leadership
9 team on the school climate and discipline report
10 released on July 2016 this continuum would connect in
11 school services with more intensive external services
12 including existing hospital based mental health
13 clinics. Instead of spending eight million dollars on
14 bullet proof... bullet proof vests for school safety
15 agents the school should invest eight million in life
16 changing mental health services that are vital for
17 New York City public school students like me.

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Great job, next.

19 STEPHANIE BOLARA: Good afternoon, my name
20 is Stephanie and I'm a Youth Leader and Make the Road
21 New York and the Urban Youth Collaborative. I'm here
22 once again to call up the harm experience by black
23 and brown students in public schools and the impact
24 the budget has on continuing harmful policies and
25 practices. This time however I'm a senior in high

1
2 school, I can say that in the 12 years that I've been
3 enrolled in high... in school I've seen it all from
4 students being suspended for, for talking back to
5 teachers to students being mistreated by SSAs, I've
6 also seen young people come together and mediate
7 conflicts with other young people and I realize
8 responses in how we are treated is directly connected
9 to our budget priorities. I have seen the effects of
10 restorative justice and it... and how it creates a safe
11 environment for students. Restorative justice is an
12 alternative to punitive discipline and means for
13 prevention. Currently out of 1,800 schools only a
14 small number of them practice it and with a 400-
15 million-dollar budget allocated to policing us that
16 number isn't too surprising. What we as young people
17 are calling for is a divestment from the 400 million
18 dollars and reinvest at least 66 million dollars into
19 restorative practices. Schools that practice it have
20 noticed a decrease in suspensions, reduction in
21 discipline incidents and an improvement in school
22 climate and academic outcomes. Young people deserve
23 to talk openly about what they need without having to
24 be forced into jail cells and courts. Just as we have
25 learned that mass incarceration does nothing to

1
2 create safer communities, we have learned that
3 similar approaches to discipline in schools does
4 nothing to create safer schools. in the words of
5 Assata Shakur, the schools we go to are reflections
6 of the society that created them. To elaborate
7 further if students attend classrooms where they are
8 being treated with disrespect for a variety of
9 reasons including race and age, if students are being
10 quickly shoved out of their desks and into jail cells
11 then that is a reflection of the morals this society
12 has, and the efforts made in order to uphold these
13 values. The same legal and financial efforts being
14 used to police students should be reinvested in
15 alternatives to school discipline so that before
16 forcing young people into jumpsuits every student is
17 seen graduating in caps and gowns. We are living in a
18 moment where policies are being created and
19 implemented in our schools that will further hyper
20 criminalize us without asking us for any of the
21 input, we are the ones who go to school while
22 witnessing our peers get pushed out and most
23 importantly we are the ones who have the solutions to
24 the problems that are present. A few weeks ago, I
25 participated in a town hall held by Mayor De Blasio

1

2 and although the majority of the students in the room
3 called for alternatives like restorative justice we
4 feel like it fell on death ears. I'm hoping that it
5 is different this time around city council and hope
6 you are listen to here. Thank you.

7

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I am so proud of, of
8 all of you I again... you might have heard or some of
9 you just came in recently, I, I am a former high
10 school teacher and taught high school civics,
11 government and to hear students and young people take
12 ownership of, of such a critical issue that impacts
13 you is... it's so personal and so I more than hear you
14 but politicians have to act and that's why I'm known
15 in the city council... I, I don't have a lot of
16 patience for people with... who don't like to act and
17 lead and we have to call them out on that and so I
18 just want to again just commend you for your courage
19 and for being here, speaking up because I remember
20 some of my students in my class were sometimes shy to
21 raise their hand but you are... you're leaders and I, I
22 cannot thank you enough and I want to hear from the
23 rest of the panel as well. Thank you.

24

25

ARLYNN LEACH: Good afternoon, my name is
Arlynn Leach and I'm a Youth Leader with Future of

1
2 Tomorrow and the Urban Youth Collaborative, I'm a
3 senior in high school at the moment and this fall I
4 will be attending college as a first-generation
5 student. Though I am a hardworking student I would
6 not be able to make that statement if it were not for
7 my school's student success centers. In support...
8 sorry, though I am a hardworking student I would not
9 be able to make that statement if it were not for the
10 help and support I received from my school's student
11 success center. I received assistance with the time
12 consuming and personally unfamiliar application
13 process and understanding financial aid all while
14 establishing a connection with my college counselor.
15 My dream is to be a journalist and thanks to my
16 school's student success center I'm going to college
17 to make my dream a reality. UIC's youth, youth
18 leaders designed and launched New York City's very
19 first student success centers. The first one was
20 launched at Bushwick's campuses through Make the Road
21 and the second one was launched at Franklin K. Lane
22 campus for FOT and Cypress Hills. More students
23 continue to graduate but many of them talk about the
24 lack of support they need to choose and attend
25 college after graduating. Unfortunately, my school's

1
2 campus is one of the only high school campuses in the
3 neighborhood where there's a student success center.
4 With many New York City student who will have parents
5 like mine that did not get to experience college I
6 can only imagine how stressful it may be to
7 successfully get into college without the support of
8 an... of college access counselor. Circumstances are
9 this way because there is currently not enough money
10 being invested into our schools for resources like
11 student success centers and we must change this now.
12 There is over 400 million dollars spent yearly on
13 heavy surveillance, policing and harsh
14 criminalization that do not support young people, we
15 need that money to go to things that truly help
16 students succeed like college access, summer bridge
17 programs and SSCs. There is not enough money being
18 invested into students and their futures and we are
19 the future. Students are... students are struggling and
20 more will struggle without true investments in their
21 success. As children and simply as people we all have
22 dreams and aspirations and there... and every single
23 student in New York City should be given the
24 opportunity to work towards their dreams. Without
25 college I will not be able to become a journalist and

1
2 without the student success center I would not be
3 going to college. I'm asking that the city increases
4 funding for the student success centers, so all
5 students have an equal chance at higher education and
6 succeeding. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you and we
8 need you as a journalist because journalism more than
9 ever is being attacked unfairly and journalism...
10 journalists are defenders of the truth and to hold
11 government leaders accountable so we, we need you and
12 we... [cross-talk]

13 ARLYNN LEACH: Thank you... [crops-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...thank you very
15 much, thank you.

16 ANDREA COLON: Good afternoon, my name is
17 Andrea Colon and I'm the Community Engagement
18 Organizers with the Rockaway Youth Task Force and
19 Youth Leader with the Urban Youth Collaborative. I'm
20 asking that het New York City Council Education
21 Committee to request the Mayor to include a 60-
22 million-dollar investment from the DOE into
23 culturally responsive education. culturally
24 responsive education also known as CRE is a method of
25 student centered education that cultivates critical

1
2 thinking instead of just testing skills, relates
3 academic study to contemporary issues in student's
4 experiences, develops student's ability to connect
5 the cross cultures and empowers students as agents of
6 social change. Given the toxic political climate it
7 is critical that the New York City Department of
8 Education become a national model of equity by
9 embracing culturally responsive education to
10 eradicate racial disparities in public education. In
11 order to implement CRE the New York City Department
12 of Education must do the following three things;
13 staff at all levels of New York City schools must
14 represent the diversity of the student population and
15 be skilled in culturally responsive education and
16 anti-discriminatory practices, this can be done by
17 creating a, a more... a more diverse pipeline of
18 teachers through the expansion of programs to recruit
19 and retain an additional 1,000 teachers and 250
20 school leaders of color by the year 2020, require
21 that staff at all levels of the DOE be skills in CRE
22 from the DOE cabinet and leadership teams to school
23 instructional and operation staff, by providing an
24 extensive ongoing CRE training with expert providers.
25 All of New York City public schools must offer a

1
2 variety of classes, curriculum, projects and
3 resources that are grounded in the rich diversity of
4 New York City's student population, convene and
5 support teachers to collaboratively, collaboratively
6 develop resources such as specialized Pre-K through
7 12 courses that focus on the histories and cultures
8 of African, Latin, Asian, Middle Eastern and native
9 heritage people in New York City schools and the
10 intersections with gender, LGBTQ and religious
11 diversity, expand curriculum and materials that
12 schools can purchase with DOE funds to include more
13 diverse, contemporary and culturally accurate text
14 and resources, require and fund training on
15 culturally responsive discipline practices for staff,
16 parents and students including full time restorative
17 justice coordinators, eliminate arrests and summons
18 for all non, non-criminal violations and remove metal
19 detectors which disproportionately affect students of
20 color. You cannot expect students to learn in an
21 environment and with a curriculum in which they do
22 not feel comfortable or identify with, the city of
23 New York must hold themselves accountable to ending
24 the militarization of our schools to punitive
25 measures, school safety officers and metal detectors

1
2 instead focus on making sure our schools are a safe,
3 supportive, and inclusive space by listening to the
4 voices of young people when we express what safety
5 looks like for us. New York City currently invests
6 357 million dollars into the NYPD school safety
7 division and the Mayor wants to increase that amount
8 to 373 this year, now if the Mayor divested about 16
9 percent of that money and used the 60 million dollars
10 to implement culturally responsive education the
11 public-school system of New York City will become a
12 more supportive environment for students of color.

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: That was powerful
14 and excellent and I, I have a quick, quick question
15 which career are you considering pursuing?

16 ANDREA COLON: I... public service.

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: You're considering
18 public schools?

19 ANDREA COLON: Oh, I said public service.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Oh, public service,
21 public service, excellent, yes kudos to that, you
22 mentioned journalism, that's great, which career are
23 you, you considering?

24 STEPHANIE BOLARA: Either social workers
25 or community organizer.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes, excellent and...

IRMA BARRIOS: journalism as well.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And we need more teachers, this is something we, we need to work on and I know we need a lot of work to do to, to address this but yes, excellent. To... close out the panel.

ROBERTO CABANAS: Yes, before, before my time starts I just wanted to acknowledge how many young people are in the room... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes... [cross-talk]

ROBERTO CABANAS: ...Friday after this hearing... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: That's right... [cross-talk]

ROBERTO CABANAS: ...being rescheduled for an issue they care so deeply about, so kudos to the young people here.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes, echo that.

ROBERTO CABANAS: Good afternoon, my name is Roberto Cabanas and I'm the Coordinator for the Urban Youth Collaborative, a coalition of youth led organizing groups in New York City that continue to advocate for restorative justice, the expansion of mental health services, a culturally responsive

1
2 education, more counselors in schools and access to
3 college. For years UYC and other youth of color led
4 organizations across the country have been fighting
5 to create nurturing, supportive and safe schools for
6 themselves and their community. We find ourselves in
7 a moment and a history where youth leadership is
8 being noticed and young people all across the country
9 are organizing to build power and influence to
10 address their school's needs. We've seen this through
11 the publicized, well publicized national moments like
12 the national walkout that happened on March 14th, we
13 will see more of it tomorrow during the national day
14 of action plan in Washington D.C. and New York City
15 and other places across the country and with the
16 upcoming national day of action on April 20th to
17 remember the lives lost during the Columbine mass
18 shooting. Lastly, we see it here today in this
19 council chamber with all these brilliant young people
20 that continue to call for supportive rather than
21 criminalized schools. What we know is that would
22 create safe and supportive schools is listening to
23 the cries of these young people when they are being
24 bullied and isolated within their schools. schools
25 need to provide mental health services that can

1
2 address student needs immediately. Sitting here
3 before you today you have a group of young leaders
4 who have made a plea to this council to not only
5 invest in their schools but also to divest from the
6 system that continues to harm them every day.
7 Recently Councilman Donovan Richards proposed a six
8 to eight-million-dollar investment in bullet proof
9 vests for SSA's in every school and the Mayor has
10 proposed instituting random mental detector checks at
11 all the middle and high schools, these are dangerous
12 proposals that further militarizes our schools and
13 the SSAs and fail to create strong relationships
14 between students and supportive school staff,
15 teachers and guidance counselors. The argument that
16 the current administration is making to support cops
17 in schools is that they are working to build better
18 relationships between schools safety agents and, and
19 public school students but I just have one question
20 to ask, if you were being bullied in school would you
21 feel comfortable going up to a SSA with bullet proof
22 vest to talk through the issues that you're having in
23 your community? We must not continue to react to
24 tragedies happening across the country and stop
25 proposing legislation that proliferates more policing

1
2 and militarizing of cops in schools, investments in
3 heavy policing like arresting and issuing summonses
4 to New York City students should be redirected to
5 support a youth driven vision for inclusive
6 supportive safe and successful schools. My last part,
7 the school safety division of the NYPD has a budget
8 of over 357.8 million and has proposed to increase it
9 to even higher, 373.7 billion... million. The proposals
10 to add bullet proof vests and metal detectors
11 throughout our schools will cost even more. Imagine
12 what the city could do with that amount of money if
13 it... all, all... if kid... had all reinvested it in
14 supporting young people included through restorative
15 justice, the expansion of mental health services, a
16 culturally responsive education, more counselors in
17 schools and access to college. Young people are
18 demanding these changes, we urge the city council to
19 please listen and consider. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I thank you and just
21 to share with you I used to teach high school at 7:30
22 in the morning was my first class and sometimes there
23 would be random scanning... scanner days unannounced
24 and I would see the impact of that in my classroom
25 when many of... or most of my students would come very

1
2 late to class, the period was about 48 minutes long
3 and started at 7:30 in the morning and many of my
4 students would come after eight a.m., they would come
5 very angry, upset, agitated that they felt they were
6 being violated, they felt that they could not get
7 into the... into, into their own schools in a timely
8 manner and they were being searched and so I know
9 that there is a, a call for a review of our safety
10 procedures in plans but I just want to share with the
11 public what many of the kids here know and experience
12 if... there is... there are impacts to this,
13 instructionally I was teaching a regents class so my
14 students lost over a half hour of instructional time
15 in a class that was preparing them to take a state
16 mandated exam and so there are impacts to this and I,
17 I agree that more resources have to be dedicated to
18 meet the needs, all the needs of, of our... of our kids
19 and so I, I cannot thank you... I can't thank you
20 enough for your passion and advocacy, I am so
21 impressed to see the turnout here on a Friday
22 afternoon, that is extraordinary, I want to credit
23 each and every single one of you for being here. It
24 is... it is not easy to sit up here and... or to be in a
25 city government chamber like this and your courage

1
2 speaks volumes and, and just know that this former
3 teacher hears you, I, I, I'm not in the charge of the
4 school system but I... part of my responsibility is to
5 hold our school system accountable to you because
6 we're here for you that's what this is all about and
7 when we're fighting for more resources for New York
8 City schools this is what we're fighting for right
9 here not to go to some consultants, not to go to, to,
10 to... back to these punitive ways that really do not
11 solve issues and I just cannot thank you all enough
12 for your courage, for your time and we have a lot of
13 work to do and I just wanted to note for the record
14 that I was so heartened, I, I joined the students of
15 Merrill High School who did a... who participated in
16 the national walkout and some people... are, are... you
17 know are saying wow this is... this is new phenomena,
18 this is not a new phenomenon, what's new is that
19 there are more people paying attention because I
20 remember my students in my classroom who were
21 impacted by super storm Sandy and they were displaced
22 and some of them were living in shelters and how
23 students were helping kids get back up on their feet,
24 helping them with homework, helping to rebuild their
25 homes and lives, students are powerful, powerful

1
2 people, your voice is so powerful it... just now
3 there's, there's more television cameras paying
4 attention and now the next step is to make sure that
5 we register all of you to vote because you are our
6 leaders and this former teacher will pick up a
7 clipboard and knock on doors for you to help get you
8 elected as well. So, I cannot thank all of you enough
9 for your leadership and for your courage and you, you
10 have a partner here in the city council. Thank you
11 all so much.

12 ROBERTO CABANAS: You still have one...
13 [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Oh, one more, oh
15 great... [cross-talk]

16 ROBERTO CABANAS: Yeah... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay.

18 ROBERTO CABANAS: And we'll, we'll, we'll
19 follow up with a meeting, we sent a request this week
20 so... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: We, we will... we will
22 meet, yes.

23 BRIAN ADJEW: Good evening everyone. my
24 name is Brian Adjew and I'm a sophomore at the high
25 school for Energy and Technology, a Youth Leader at

1
2 Sistas and Brothas United and the Urban Youth
3 Collaborative. I'm here because my school doesn't
4 have enough guidance counselors, we have one guidance
5 counselor for every 409 students with no social
6 worker, we share a social worker for an entire campus
7 which houses more than 1,000 students. NYC has 2,800
8 full time guidance counselors while we employ more
9 than 5,500 SSAs, that's not right. Myself and other
10 students seek our guidance counselors for academic
11 support, emotional support and college access and
12 many other things yet one guidance counselor we have
13 is overwhelmed with the amount of students she has to
14 work with in my experience. Guidance counselors have
15 much better approach to discipline because they talk
16 to us with such compassion while SSAs further
17 alienate us from schools. I have... I've had many
18 negative encounters with SSAs in this year yet alone
19 with one and the outcome being handcuffs. The DOE and
20 city council members need to divest the nearly four
21 million from cops and metal detectors as it doesn't
22 help students in any way except criminalize us and
23 dehumanize us especially youth like myself who are
24 queer, black or Latin X. Metal detectors do not
25 detect my emotional needs, nor does it detect my

1
2 career goals and challenges. An investment in police
3 or militarization of SCAs will only add to the school
4 to prison pipeline. We want safe and supportive
5 schools which means you have an obligation to
6 responsibly invest in our success by increasing the
7 number of full time guidance counselors. We want at
8 least one full time guidance counselor for every 100
9 students and one social worker for every 15 students..
10 50 students in schools like mine and areas like mine,
11 education is a human right and not just for the rich
12 and white.

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I'm telling you this
14 is very, very good public speaking today, thank you
15 so much, next sir.

16 ONYX WALKER: Hi, I don't have a testimony
17 prepared but I'm Onyx Walker with Future of Tomorrow
18 and the Urban Youth Collaborative. I'm just here to
19 support the speakers and answer any questions you may
20 have.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I... again I just
22 want to... want to commend all of you for your courage
23 for speaking up on something that I think you, you
24 heard some of you who got here late because you were
25 in class so you were in school today we made I think

1
2 a very effective case to the DOE today about the need
3 to hire more guidance counselors, social workers,
4 support staff in schools, every single public school
5 should be a community schools with providing adequate
6 supports. I shared with you before how, how proud I
7 am of the movements that is not new that just more
8 folks are paying attention to that you're leading,
9 and government officials do have to respond and it's
10 very clear that the NYPD has a lot more work to do to
11 build trust and to further establish relationships,
12 positive relationships. One of the things that I
13 think the NYPD needs to consider doing is, you know
14 many times that they are measured their officers are
15 measured by the amount of arrests or number of
16 tickets or summons they issue but I wonder why they
17 don't also monitor the positive relationships, the
18 positive interactions as well and that extends
19 through communities and schools, we should not just
20 call you out for the bad times but we need to also
21 commend you for the good things and I think that
22 there is a lot more work to do to build
23 relationships, to establish trust and I think it, it
24 starts and begins right here and, and I think that
25 we, we need to reflect these priorities into, into

1
2 our budget and I just want to note that we have
3 actually been joined by the most key member of this
4 body of city council who has enormous, enormous
5 passion and support for our, our schools system for
6 our students, someone who has also enormous clout and
7 say in shaping our city budget who has been very,
8 very supporting, I want you to know very supportive
9 of fighting for more resources for support staff in
10 schools, he led us in the city council to go up to
11 Albany to meet with the Governor to demand our fair
12 share, to, to get more guidance counselors, more
13 social workers and support staff for kids, I'd like
14 to acknowledge we've been joined by City Council
15 Speaker Corey Johnson.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you Chair Treyger,
17 I was downstairs and it's been a long week and I put
18 the TV on to see what hearings, if there were any
19 hearings and then I said oh my god the Education
20 Committee is still meeting and it is... what time is
21 it, it's, it's 5:30 on a Friday afternoon and when I
22 looked at the panel I saw a view I thought it is so
23 moving to have you all here and I really just want to
24 thank you, I want to thank you for being here and for
25 being patient on a long day, I want to thank your

1
2 contemporaries and friends who are here for support
3 and to let you know that we really, really, really
4 care about your voice, that it's one thing of course
5 to hear about... hear from the Chancellor and top DOE
6 staff but to hear from actual students and young
7 people who are effected by our city's budget, who are
8 effected by the decisions that are made is very
9 crucial to us and if you don't know this our Chair
10 Mark Treyger is a former teacher before he was
11 selected to the city council and he is a bulldog when
12 it comes for education funding and also to ensuring
13 that students see the benefits. So, I know you all
14 have testified on restorative justice and the need
15 for more guidance counselors and the ideas that you
16 all have which is very, very important to us to hear
17 that and so I after a long stressful week you gave me
18 a little bit of life this afternoon, a little bit of
19 hope and inspiration to see you all here to testify
20 on this and then I just want to say one more thing
21 which is, you know tomorrow in New York City is the
22 March for our lives about gun violence which comes
23 out of the tragedy in Parkland, Florida at a high
24 schools and every movement in this country has been
25 led or had been started by young people whether it be

1
2 the civil rights movement or the LGBT rights movement
3 or the anti-war movement or the movement for
4 restorative justice or the movement to end gun
5 violence young people were always really the, the,
6 the glue that kept it together and so you've given me
7 some inspiration and hope to see you all here, I hope
8 you'll come tomorrow to the march for our lives
9 because it's going to be a march that's led by young
10 people and as Speaker of this body I really just want
11 you to know that I am really heartened and grateful
12 for your participation here today so I just wanted to
13 come up before I leave city hall to say thank you.
14 Thank you for being great New Yorkers and thank you
15 for being engaged in civic leadership and government
16 at an early age you are the future of our city and I
17 don't mean that in a hokey way, I mean that because
18 it's really, really true and so thank you all very,
19 very much, your parents should be very proud, we here
20 at the city council are proud of all of you. Thank
21 you Chair Treyger.

22 ANDREA COLON: Thank you, we were
23 wondering if we could also set up a meeting with you
24 just to talk more about...

25

1
2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes, I'm glad you're
3 very shy about asking for things that, that, that you
4 need, absolutely and of course I want Chair Treyger
5 to be part of that meeting as well... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I was going to ask
7 if I'm invited... [cross-talk]

8 ANDREA COLON: Yes... [cross-talk]

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Is, is the Chair
10 invited?

11 ANDREA COLON: Thank you.

12 ONYX WALKER: Is the Chair invited?

13 ANDREA COLON: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, yes. Well she...
15 by the way Mr. Speaker she has a future career in
16 public service and we, we were... we, we will work hard
17 to get you up here one day leading this body as well,
18 we have future journalists, future public servants,
19 these are the leaders and I, I just want you to just
20 to know I'm putting my high schools civics teacher
21 hat back on for a second, having the city council
22 speaker here is a big deal and your testimony and
23 your presence got, got him here and, and to hear his
24 devotion, dedication to you it... that's a tremendous,
25 tremendous accomplishment so just being here today

1
2 speaking up and, and hearing from our speaker and I
3 just have to tell you we're... we can only go as far as
4 having the support of our leaders and to have a
5 speaker that cares deeply about public schools is a
6 big deal so give yourselves a, I guess round of
7 applause or a round of snaps for, for the work that,
8 that you... that you've done and I want to give a round
9 of snaps for our speaker for having our back as well.
10 Thank you, Mr. Speaker, and if, if that... if there are
11 any further questions or comments?

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Have a good weekend, be
13 safe. Everyone be safe... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes... [cross-talk]

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: ...okay, thank you very
16 much.

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Enjoy your weekend.
18 This hearing is adjourned.

19 [gavel]

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

April 28, 2018