

1 Centre Street, 19th floor, New York, NY 10007 (212) 669-8300 p (212) 669-4306 f 431 West 125th Street, New York, NY 10027 (212) 531-1609 p (212) 531-4615 f www.manhattanbp.nyc.gov

Gale A. Brewer, Borough President

April 16, 2018

Gale A. Brewer, Manhattan Borough President
Testimony before the New York City Council
Committee on Justice System
On the Investigations and Prosecutions of Low Wage Theft

My name is Gale Brewer and I am the Manhattan Borough President. Thank you, Chair Lancman, for holding a hearing on the important issue of wage theft.

A report released on January 28, 2010 by the National Employment Law Project (NELP) found that, in New York City alone, unscrupulous employers deprive workers of over \$1 billion of their rightful wages annually. Manhattan District Attorney Cyrus Vance breaks this down further into \$20 million in unpaid wages in New York City each week.

Among this figure are millions of dollars not paid to the city's construction workers, particularly those who fall outside of union protection and those whose immigration status make them vulnerable targets to wage theft. In most cases, workers put in the hours and the labor while their pay is "delayed." Afraid that they may not find another job, they continue to work for no pay even when it becomes clear that the promised wages will never materialize.

Wage theft exists across all industries and jobs. But today I want to primarily focus on wage theft of construction workers because this concerns an industry that we can do something about through proper oversight of regulations.

We know through the comprehensive work of District Attorney Vance and his Construction Fraud Task Force and Wage Theft Initiative that wage theft and unsafe working conditions in the construction industry are tied. Companies cited for workplace safety violations are often the same companies engaging in wage theft. These companies falsify insurance and tax documents. They do not pay workers for the work they do and do not cure safety violations at their sites or even report incidences that do occur. Far too many construction workers have died because of construction site conditions that could and should have been rectified.

In 2016, in response to a series of construction-related deaths that could have been prevented if proper safety procedures were followed, Council Member Jumaane Williams and I co-sponsored what is now Local Law 196 of 2017, also known as the Construction Safety Law. This law requires all who work on construction sites to undergo 40 hours of OSHA training or complete 100 hours of safety training. The law prescribes penalties for violations and requires demonstrated cure before the violations can be rescinded. Beyond the monetary penalty,

incurring a record of noncompliance with the law is a black mark on the developer that can impact the company's future projects.

The Construction Safety Law complements the recommendations made in the Manhattan DA Office's Construction Fraud Task Force to monitor OSHA training and to create an OSHA card database. In conjunction with OSHA training non-compliance, the task force also recommended "barring building permits for a period of 5 years" for companies "convicted of a felony related to worker safety." This barring of permit can very well be applied to companies that have been convicted of wage theft.

Wage theft occurs in other industries as well. The Freelancers Union estimates that there are 1.3 million freelancers in New York City and 53 million nation-wide. The union also estimates that 77% of these workers, who span the workforce from technology to fashion to design industries, have experienced wage theft at some point in their career.

After much advocacy on this issue, I am pleased that the City Council passed Local Law 140 of 2017 last spring. This new law, spearheaded by Council Member Brad Lander, requires companies who hire freelancers to execute written contracts that describe work to be performed, rate, method of payment, and when payment is due. It also requires payment within a reasonable amount of time. Currently, the Department of Consumer Affairs is promulgating rules and an outreach program. I will continue to monitor this.

The 2010 report by NELP, mentioned above, details an array of worker violations. From minimum wage violations to those that use overtime and off-the-clock work to defraud workers, it is clear that there is much to do to prevent worker abuse, particularly for those workers who are undocumented or not represented by a union. But the practice of out and out theft — such as what occurs when a construction worker completes work and does not get compensated at all, should be an initial target. I thank the DA's office for focusing on this illegal practice and the City Council for taking this up today.



Richmond County District Attorney's Office Testimony before City Council Committee on the Justice System Investigations and Prosecutions of Wage Theft April 16, 2018

Good morning, Chairman Lancman and members of the Committee on the Justice System. I am Jeffrey Curiale, Chief of the Economic Crimes Bureau, and I am honored to be here today speaking on behalf of District Attorney Michael McMahon and the Richmond County District Attorney's Office. I would like to thank you for allowing the District Attorney's offices an opportunity to discuss the pervasive problem of wage theft in our City, our efforts to curb it, and specifically what my office is doing on Staten Island to investigate and prosecute employers who exploit workers.

Earlier this year, with funding and support from the City, DA McMahon created RCDA's first Economic Crimes Bureau to focus solely on investigating and prosecuting all forms of financial crime. This includes the growing problem of wage theft in Richmond County. To better achieve our goal, RCDA participates in the Manhattan DA's Construction Fraud Taskforce which includes a joint Statewide Wage Theft Initiative. Within this taskforce we work together with the offices here today, the Department of Labor, and other law enforcement partners across the State to root out these crimes and hold bad actors accountable.

Staten Island is currently experiencing a building boom with major commercial developments happening throughout the borough. This opens the door for potential abuses — particularly against our growing immigrant population, which can be vulnerable to wage theft on construction sites and other types of financial fraud. We are working diligently to combat and prevent these crimes, and I am proud to say that our investigations have already led to several successful prosecutions.

Recently, RCDA was referred a case of a subcontractor, Construction Directions Group LLC, against whom there were allegations of not paying prevailing wages or not paying wages at all, in some instances. The work site was the Lighthouse Point, on Staten Island's North Shore. Following an investigation, we determined that \$15,676 was not paid out to five carpenters on this site. As a result, the corporation pled guilty to Petit Larceny and was required to repay the wages in full with a penalty.

In a separate investigation into a construction site at a public school on Staten Island, we arrested a contractor for failing to pay five victims' prevailing wages totaling \$75,000. The defendant, Ali Syed, pleaded guilty to Grand Larceny in the Second Degree, a felony, and was required to repay the wages to the victims.

While we have made progress against wage theft on Staten Island, the office still faces challenges in pursuing these types of crimes. As I mentioned already, our borough's immigrant population has exploded in recent years, and often have been a target for wage theft and other types of workplace fraud.

Unfortunately, RCDA is the only DA's office in the City that does not have its own dedicated Immigrant Affairs Unit to better address these issues. While DA McMahon has made requests to the City to fund such a Unit, those requests have been denied in the past, leaving us without the resources and staff needed to safeguard these vulnerable immigrant populations at this critical point in time.

An RCDA Immigrant Affairs Unit would be tasked with investigating crimes that target these communities, liaising with immigrant groups, and developing programming to establish trust and communication that helps address each community's unique issues and concerns. Surely, these initiatives would help us to build more significant wage theft cases and better protect the rights of workers throughout Staten Island.

Still, wage theft continues to be a priority for RCDA. Currently, my bureau has opened several investigations into potential illegal activity at different job sites, and we are confident these cases will result in prosecutions and ultimately restitution for the victims of these crimes. At the same time, our joint efforts with our partner agencies and the Department of Labor will continue to produce positive results for the people of Staten Island.

With these prosecutions, we are sending the message that denying proper wages and benefits is an unacceptable practice, and that RCDA remains dedicated to holding unscrupulous employers accountable. We will continue working to prevent employees from being cheated out of an honest day's pay, and prosecute those who commit serious prevailing wage violations in our borough.

Thank you for your time and consideration. District Attorney McMahon and the Richmond County District Attorney's office look forward to continuing to work with all of you to better serve the people of the City of New York.



New York County District Attorney's Office Testimony before City Council Committee on the Justice System April 16, 2018

Executive Assistant District Attorney Michael Sachs:

Good afternoon Chairman Lancman and members of the Committee on the Justice System. I am Executive Assistant District Attorney Michael Sachs, Chief of the Investigation Division. I am here with Assistant District Attorney Diana Florence, who is the Attorney-in-Charge of the Construction Fraud Task Force. We are presenting testimony on behalf of Manhattan District Attorney Cyrus R. Vance, Jr. Thank you for the opportunity to speak today about our investigation and prosecution of wage theft.

According to Cornell University's Worker Institute, wage theft in New York accounts for nearly \$1 billion in lost wages each year and affects tens of thousands of workers – that's close to \$20 million per week. Conventional wisdom suggests that wage theft solely affects low income workers who are cheated through subminimum wage or unpaid overtime schemes. However, the reality is that the problem is much larger in scope and much more pervasive, especially within the construction industry in New York. This is because the very same companies who steal from their workers also routinely falsify their records with respect to workers' compensation insurance policies and state tax returns. Furthermore, these unscrupulous companies often subject these same workers to worksites that are rife with safety violations.

By committing wage theft and associated frauds, these companies unfairly lower their costs, making it nearly impossible for law-abiding businesses to compete. And every taxpayer shoulders the effects of wage theft because when the workers are underinsured, it forces government to step in and incur costs that should have been borne by their employer.

Recognizing the vital importance of the role construction plays in our dynamic city, but also knowing that the industry is susceptible to corruption, District Attorney Vance created the Construction Fraud Task Force in August 2015. Through this Task Force, we collaborate with city, state, and federal agencies, workers' advocacy groups, and academic scholars on a wide range of issues. Following several successful prosecutions related to health and safety in the construction industry, the Task Force organized the Wage Theft Initiative.

As evidenced here today, the Wage Theft Initiative includes collaborations between seven local District Attorney's Offices (which includes all five New York City DA's, plus

Westchester and Nassau Counties), the Department of Investigation, the New York City Comptroller's Office, the New York State Department of Labor, and the New York State Attorney General's Office. Since December 2017, this partnership has resulted in ten criminal cases and accounted for more than \$2.5 million in stolen wages affecting over 400 construction workers. Our collective priority is to target unscrupulous employers who cheat and endanger the hard-working men and women of New York City and State.

Wage theft is a form of worker exploitation, akin to labor trafficking and other violations of employees' rights. Its perpetrators take advantage of some of our communities' most vulnerable populations, including undocumented immigrants and low-income workers. In addition to the Wage Theft Initiative, the Manhattan District Attorney's Office has a robust Human Trafficking Unit whose mission includes prosecuting labor traffickers.

Before I turn the microphone over to my colleague, I would like to emphasize a point that is very important to District Attorney Vance and our entire Office. Many of the victims of wage theft and other workplace abuses are undocumented New Yorkers, and are not always empowered to stand up for themselves. So, we want to speak directly to them: We are here to protect your safety and your rights, and we encourage you to work with us to achieve justice without fear of being deported.

To achieve this goal, District Attorney Vance invested \$1.6 million in a new program managed by the New York Committee for Occupational Safety and Health (NYCOSH). The program aims to assist the disproportionate number of immigrant workers who become victims of workplace crimes by making it easier for them to document and report unsafe work conditions, wage theft, discrimination, and exploitation. NYCOSH will provide victims with referrals and access to support services, regardless of immigration status. This program is expected to benefit tens of thousands of workers in the first three years. We hope that the program will be up and running in a few months.

I now want to introduce my colleague Assistant District Attorney Diana Florence. Diana is the Attorney in Charge of the Construction Fraud Task Force.

Assistant District Attorney Diana Florence:

Thank you, Mike, and thank you Council Members for inviting us to provide testimony today. Before I go further into detail about our wage theft cases, I want to begin today by telling you the story of a construction worker named Carlos Moncayo because the investigation surrounding his death is what ultimately led to the creation of the Wage Theft Initiative.

Carlos Moncayo was born in Cuenca, Ecuador and came to New York after high school in 2012. On Monday morning, April 6, 2015, 22-year old Carlos awakened at his sister's house in Queens, grabbed a quick breakfast, kissed his 2-year old nephew goodbye and headed to work as a carpenter at a construction site in the heart of the glittering Meatpacking District. Carlos had much to look forward to that morning. His 23rd birthday was just four days away and his mother was planning a visit soon after. But Carlos never got to celebrate his birthday. Instead, he died

before lunch, less than two miles away from this chamber. Carlos died an utterly preventable death when the 14-foot trench he was working in collapsed without warning, raining 3,000 pounds of dirt upon him, and crushing him to death.

Making matters not only criminal but profoundly tragic, the subcontractor Sky Materials and the general contractor Harco Construction had been warned repeatedly that morning by a structural engineer on site about the extremely dangerous conditions at the site, and that no worker should be working in or around them. The engineer repeated his entreaties to stop the work over the course of two hours until the moment of the trench collapse. But the superintendent and foreman in charge of the project disregarded the engineers' warnings, and Carlos paid with his life. Why? Because the supervisors and the companies they worked for were more interested in completing the project on budget than protecting their workers.

We obtained justice for Carlos's family by convicting the supervisors and companies responsible for his death, but the case did not end there. While examining Sky Materials' documents in the course of the homicide investigation, we found suspicious records revealing that the company was not paying proper overtime wages to its employees, as well as providing false information to its workers' compensation insurance carrier. I am proud to say that we were also able to obtain justice for Carlos' coworkers by obtaining guilty pleas from Sky Materials on wage theft and insurance fraud violations, and perhaps more importantly, full restitution for the workers of a half million dollars.

Sadly, Carlos's case is neither unique nor an isolated incident. As we continue to investigate wage theft, we see time and time again that wage theft and unsafe work conditions go hand in hand. Among an unscrupulous subset of the construction industry, wage theft and unsafe working conditions have become the norm – not just in New York City and but across the country. Another example of this health and safety/wage theft correlation can be found in our case against City Metro Corp. Earlier this month—on the eve of the three-year anniversary of Carlos's death—we secured guilty pleas from City Metro Corp. and its principals for orchestrating a scheme to steal tens of thousands of dollars from workers hired to perform construction work in Manhattan. The defendants pleaded guilty to Scheme to Defraud in the First Degree, and that same day, repaid more than \$95,000 in stolen wages to 20 workers. Like Sky Materials, City Metro had numerous workplace safety violations, including several accidents that were not reported to authorities as required by law.

To be clear, wage theft is not about poor business management or incompetence. We believe that it is a deliberate tactic, integral to the business model of dishonest corporations whereby they defraud workers of their wages and deprive cities and states of millions of dollars in tax revenues.

These businesses exploit the trust that workers have in the system – that if they put in an honest day's work, they will be paid what they were promised. And when they are not paid, they believe their employers who tell them, "Come back at 3 pm or next week, don't you worry, I will pay you." In the meantime, workers continue to work, hoping that their employer will pay them

the following week. And the cycle continues until the workers finally get fed up and quit, often leaving behind thousands of dollars in unpaid wages in the pockets of their employers.

Until recently, wage theft as a business model made economic sense because rarely were there consequences for such conduct, and when there was enforcement, it was merely civil. With the Wage Theft Initiative, DA Vance—working alongside prosecutors from around New York State—changed the calculus. Our goal is to make profiting from the unpaid blood, sweat, and tears of one's workforce too costly to bear. We believe that our efforts have begun to achieve that goal.

The cases we have brought underscore DA Vance's commitment to protecting all workers from employers who fail to address the safety and security of their workers. I am here to affirm that the prosecution of wage theft and unsafe conditions will not end with the recent conviction of City Metro. Through the work of the Task Force, we have started developing a trusting relationship between law enforcement and workers, many of whom are undocumented. We have received numerous phones calls from workers complaining of wage theft, and we are following up with each of these complaints, as well as complaints received by the New York State Department of Labor. Our Office maintains a WhatsApp account for the specific purpose of allowing workers to anonymously report wage theft and other construction crimes. That WhatsApp number is 646-712-0298.

In the coming weeks and months, the Manhattan DA's Construction Fraud Task Force will unveil several other investigations against individuals and companies that both steal from their workers and put their physical well-being at risk. And the Task Force has uncovered yet another scheme that unscrupulous companies utilize to steal millions of dollars in wages and orchestrate a large-scale workers' compensation insurance fraud. Based on the discovery of this scheme, the Task Force plans to spearhead a new collaborative initiative to tackle these problems across city and county lines.

In addition to supporting our prosecutions, there are steps that the City Council can take to improve conditions for New York's construction workers. In February 2017, DA Vance sent a letter to the Council with recommendations aimed at strengthening enforcement of existing health and safety rules with respect to OSHA training. The letter included the following recommendations:

- 1. Creating an OSHA-10 and OSHA-30 card database to help prevent workers from obtaining OSHA safety training cards if they have not actually taken the required safety training course.
- 2. Barring building permits for a period of five years for a company, its subsidiaries, and its successors (determined by common ownership of the two companies) that have been convicted of a felony related to worker safety.

We believe that implementing these recommendations to not only worker safety convictions, but also to wage theft, would provide a powerful deterrent to companies who

victimize their workers, and would go a long way towards destabilizing the wage theft business model currently in place.

Thank you. We're happy to take any questions.

Legal Services NYC 40 Worth Street Suite 606 New York, NY 10013



Testimony of Legal Services NYC, Christine Clarke Oversight Hearing of Committee on the Justice System Investigations and Prosecutions of Low Wage Theft, April 16, 2018

I would like to thank the Committee and the Chair, Councilmember Lancman, for holding this important oversight hearing on the crucial work of investigating and prosecuting the wage theft suffered by so many low wage workers.

I am the Director of the Civil Rights Justice Initiative at Legal Services NYC (LSNYC). LSNYC submits this testimony in support of the ongoing work of both the New York Department of Labor and the New York Attorney General's Office in investigating wage theft, collecting stolen wages on behalf of workers, and prosecuting wage thieves, particularly repeat offenders in lowwage industries such as construction and the care and service industries.

LSNYC is the largest civil legal services provider in the country, serving over 100,000 individuals annually, and is dedicated to fighting poverty and seeking justice for low-income New Yorkers. We represent clients in fighting for their workplace rights whenever our resources allow, but we know from experience that the epidemic of wage theft in low-wage fields affects many more people in our client population than we have the current capacity to serve. In fact, between 2013 and 2015, minimum wage violations in New York State added up to an estimated \$965 million per year, constituting nearly 23% of the wages of the workers affected.¹

Because of the broad range of legal services we provide, we also know that wage theft, along with a host of other employer violations, can have long-lasting and devastating consequences for families. It affects a family's ability to pay their rent and find safe, affordable housing and it affects one's ability to sustain oneself in old age, as it deprives people of the full social security benefits their years of work have earned them. As the City Council understood when it passed Intro 1253, one underpaying job can lead to another, as underpayment by one employer gives other employers leeway to engage in a race to the bottom, seeking to reduce their bottom line on the backs of workers. That is why wage theft enforcement is so crucial – because it creates a non-negotiable floor below which wages cannot fall.

We are delighted to hear of some of the great gains made in recent years by both the AG's office and the Department of Labor. Robust public enforcement of these laws is crucial for our clients. We rely heavily on the assistance of civil enforcement by the DOL and criminal enforcement by



¹ New York City Department of Consumer Affairs, *The State of Workers' Rights in New York City* (September 2017), *available at* https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/dca/downloads/pdf/workers/StateofWorkersRights-Report-2017.pdf, *citing* David Cooper & Teresa Kroeger, *Employers Steal Billions from Workers' Paychecks Each Year*, Economic Policy Institute (2017).

the AG's office, both to increase our capacity to serve our clients and also to send a message to employers throughout the state – our wage laws *must* be followed.

However, agencies can only do as much as they have the resources to accomplish. There is certainly more wage theft actually occurring than people formally filing DOL complaints, yet nevertheless the number of actual complaints received by DOL each year is staggering. We have heard it to be in the range of 7,000 complaints per year. In order to properly investigate 7,000 wage theft complaints, the Department needs substantial resources and a strong commitment by the State to ensuring that all complaints can be fully and fairly investigated.

Moreover, complaints that are meritorious need to be fully resolved and workers made whole, which often requires substantial collection efforts. It is well known that employers who steal wages from their workers with impunity, often also engage in various other shenanigans to hide their assets from collection after a civil money judgment is secured. I have seen these practices first hand—employers "closing" their business only to reopen under another name, assigning assets to family members, selling off assets for cash which then disappears, presumably under someone's mattress. While there will likely always be those recalcitrant employers who try to hide from the law, there are steps which, if taken, would dramatically increase the likelihood that our clients may, at some point, actually collect the wages unlawfully stolen from them.

This includes passage of the SWEAT bill (Securing Wages Earned Against Theft), A.628/S.579, which would dramatically increase the ability of our advocates, as well as both the DOL and AG, to collect wages owed before a wage thief has the opportunity to hide or dissipate their assets. The law currently does not have good mechanisms to deal with employers who do not play by the rules. The SWEAT act would even the playing field, permitting early attachment of employer assets as well as wage liens on property owned.

Similarly, it is crucial that the DOL and AG's offices have the resources they need to not only fully investigate complaints that come before them, but also to fully collect on all wages found to be owed so that wage theft victims can be made whole again and receive all the damages, liquidated and otherwise, that the law provides.

If fully resourced, our government agencies, together with advocates and organizers across the City and State, can work collectively to roll back the tide of wage theft in New York, ensuring that our clients, our communities, and we can count on being paid a full and fair wage for the hours we work. Together, we can make New York State a place where stealing wages from low wage workers simply is not tolerated.

I thank the Committee and Councilmember Lancman for holding this hearing and for supporting the rights of low wage workers.

Respectfully submitted, Christine Clarke Director, Civil Rights Justice Initiative Legal Services NYC cclarke@lsnyc.org



Make the Road New York Testimony on Oversight - Investigations and Prosecutions of Low Wage Theft

April 16, 2018 New York City Council, Committee on Justice System

Good afternoon. My name is Elizabeth Sprotzer, I am a Staff Attorney on the Workplace Justice legal team at Make the Road New York (MRNY). Thank you for the opportunity to share this testimony regarding wage theft in low-wage industries and the critical importance of criminal investigations and prosecutions of the most egregious violators.

Make the Road New York is a non-profit community-based membership organization with over 22,000 low-income members dedicated to building the power of Latino and working class communities to achieve dignity and justice through organizing, policy innovation, transformative education, and survival services. Our Workplace Justice legal team represents hundreds of low-wage immigrant workers each year to enforce their rights under labor and employment laws. The vast majority of the cases we see are wage theft.

Every year, an estimated 2.1 million workers in New York State are victims of wage theft, robbed of a cumulative of \$3.2 billion in wages and benefits they are owed. In New York City alone the figure is nearly \$1 billion per year stolen from low-wage workers in the form of wage theft. Wage theft remains rampant throughout the City – in construction, restaurants, warehouses, delivery, domestic work – where despite strong laws on the books enforcement lags behind. We see employers steal wages in many ways, including failing to pay the minimum wage, failing to pay the prevailing wage or overtime compensation, stealing tips, requiring employees to work off the clock, and making illegal deductions from pay. These same employers often fail to pay their share of unemployment insurance and workers' compensation contributions.

Employers typically fail to provide accurate wage statements or notices of pay to their employees and maintain false business records in order to evade compliance with the law. Not only do workers face huge losses on their pay, but employers often threaten them, retaliate against them, or fire them for trying to recover their lawfully earned wages. Further, immigrant workers in low-wage jobs face additional obstacles in coming forward to enforce their rights, including threats that their employer will retaliate against them by contacting immigration authorities.

We have seen countless cases of construction industry employers who fail to pay workers any wages

at all for several weeks of work. For many construction companies in New, York, their business model includes shortchanging workers out of their hard earned wages. Recently, a group of ten construction workers came into our office to seek help recovering their stolen wages. First, their employer began to delay payments or pay them less than they were owed, promising to pay them later. Then the employer refused to pay them any wages at all for two weeks of work. Two weeks of wages can mean the difference between being able to pay rent and support their families that month for low wage workers. All together, this employer stole thousands of dollars from the workers and continues to run construction projects across the city.

Our office has successfully referred several cases to the Labor Frauds Unit at the Kings County District Attorney's Office for prosecution. We are seeking to refer other particularly egregious cases to the Manhattan District Attorney's Construction Task Force. It is critical that employers across the City see that the risks of stealing wages far outweigh the profits. Criminal sanctions against employers who steal from their workers send a strong message of deterrance to all employers that wage theft is a crime and they will be held accountable. Further, at this critical moment when immigrant workers are increasingly under attack, we hope that the City continues to demonstate its commitment to protecting the rights of all workers, regardless of immigration status.

We commend the City for its commitment to tough enforcement against wage theft in low-wage industries, and we urge the New York City Council to expand resources for criminal enforcement of New York's strong protections against wage theft.

Thank you for the opportunity to testify before you today.

i Center for Popular Democracy, "By A Thousand Cuts: The Complex Face of Wage Theft in New York," available at https://populardemocracy.org/sites/default/files/WageTheft%2011162015%20Web.pdf

THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Appearance Card I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _ in favor in opposition Date: 4/15/19 (PLEASE PRINT) Address: I represent: Address: THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK Appearance Card I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _ in favor in opposition Date: 4/16/2018 (PLEASE PRINT) I represent: Address: THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK Appearance Card I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _ in opposition in favor (PLEASE PRINT) Address: I represent: Address:

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Appearance Card
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No in favor in opposition
Date: 4/16/18
(PLEASE PRINT)
Name: Ruben Colon + Tames Makin
Address: 395 Hydson St, NY, NY
I represent: MYC District Council of Carpenters
Address: 395 Hudson St, NY NY 10014
Plant and beautiful and all C
Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms
THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK
Appearance Card
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No
in favor in opposition
Date: 4/16/18
(PLEASE PRINT)
Name: Elizabeth Sprotzer
Address: 92-10 Roosevelt the Jackson Heights, Ny 11372
I represent: Make the Road New York
Address: 92-10 Poosevelt Ave.
Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

THE COUNCIL THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Appearance Card
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No
in favor in opposition
Date: 41444 172
(PLEASE PRINT)
Name: Jeffrey Gunale ADA
Address: 395 Addson 57, 14 44
1 represent: District Atomog Michael & McMahon
Address: 375 Judson St NY NY 13014
Address:
Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms
THE COUNCIL
THE CHAIL OF MENT MODIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK
Appearance Card
Appearance Card
Appearance Card I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No in favor in opposition
Appearance Card I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No
Appearance Card I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No in favor in opposition Date://
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No in favor in opposition Date:
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No in favor in opposition Date:
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No in favor in opposition Date: 4/18/ (PLEASE PRINT) Name: Christing Classes, Legal Series NY(Address: 40 Lord Series NY(Address: Legal Series NY(
I intend to appear and speak on Int. No Res. No in favor in opposition Date: