

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

December 19, 2017  
Start: 2:30 p.m.  
Recess: 6:13 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES  
Public Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO  
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Barron  
Joseph C. Borelli  
Fernando Cabrera  
Margaret S. Chin  
Andrew Cohen  
Costa G. Constantinides  
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.  
Elizabeth S. Crowley  
Laurie A. Cumbo  
Chaim M. Deutsch  
Inez E. Dickens  
Daniel Dromm  
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.  
Mathieu Eugene  
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland  
Daniel R. Garodnick  
Vincent J. Gentile  
Vanessa L. Gibson

David G. Greenfield  
Barry S. Grodenchik  
Corey D. Johnson  
Ben Kallos  
Andy L. King  
Peter A. Koo  
Karen Koslowitz  
Rory I. Lancman  
Brad S. Lander  
Stephen T. Levin  
Mark Levine  
Alan N. Maisel  
Steven Matteo  
Darlene Mealy  
Carlos Menchaca  
Rosie Mendez  
I. Daneek Miller  
Annabel Palma  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan J. Richards  
Ydanis A. Rodriguez  
Deborah L. Rose  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.  
Ritchie J. Torres  
Mark Treyger  
Eric A. Ulrich  
James Vacca  
Paul A. Vallone  
James G. Van Bramer  
Jumaane D. Williams

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Rev. Dr. T. Kenjitsu Nakagaki  
Buddhist Council of New York  
Delivered Invocation

2 [sound check, pause]

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I think we've got  
4 to get started with the ceremonials.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
6 [shushing for quiet]

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I think we'll  
8 start with Council Member Crowley since she's up  
9 here. [laughs] So, Council Member Crowley. Those  
10 that are here for the photo can stay up I guess,  
11 right? These are the honorees? Council Member  
12 Crowley is posthumously honoring Julia Elizabeth  
13 Roman for the groundbreaking achievements as a  
14 Dominican immigrant and U.S. citizen who became the  
15 first woman maintainer of elevators and escalators  
16 and whose life helped inspire a local law on maternal  
17 mortality, and with that, I want to ask Council  
18 Member Crowley to speak on behalf of this  
19 proclamation. [applause]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you, Madam  
21 Speaker. Today, we posthumously honor a trailblazing  
22 woman who was taken from us far too soon. Julia  
23 Roman. We are honoring her for her dedication to the  
24 city of the New York and for her leadership. As a  
25 young working woman, Julia started a non--started a

2 non-traditional employment for women and became a  
3 skilled electrician and elevator repair mechanic. She  
4 proudly joined the ranks of New York City Transit as  
5 the first female maintainer of elevators and  
6 escalators. She was also the first female elected by  
7 her peers to become shop steward at TWU Local 100.  
8 We are grateful to her family for joining us today,  
9 her husband Victor, her children Valerie, Duane,  
10 Victoria, Isabella and Grace and her sister-in-law  
11 Nadia. [background comments] She was a devoted  
12 parent and a true role model to her children. She  
13 died after child birth complications. Her untimely  
14 passing is a painful reminder for all of us that  
15 maternal mortality still happens today despite all of  
16 the modern medicine and medical advances we have made  
17 over the years. It is our responsibility to Julia's  
18 life. She did not die in vain, and that we as a city  
19 will address maternal mortality head on. Recently,  
20 this Council passed a bill, Local Law 55 requiring  
21 the Department of Health to not only report annually  
22 on maternal mortality, but also to make  
23 recommendations on steps that could be taken to avoid  
24 this tragedy. Unfortunately, the sad truth is more  
25 American women are dying of pregnancy related

2 complications than in any other—than in any other  
3 developed country. More mothers are dying in New  
4 York City than in other major cities in America.  
5 The United States has a rate of maternal mortality  
6 that has been rising, and our hospitals have found—  
7 have been found to be woefully unprepared to for  
8 maternal emergencies and not enough federal and state  
9 funding goes to the health of mothers. We must do  
10 more. [pause] To Victor and to the rest of Julia's  
11 family, we could never fully comprehend your loss,  
12 but we are so inspired by Julia's life, the leader  
13 she was as a working woman, and remain fully  
14 committed to doing everything we can to prevent  
15 others from a death related to child birth. Now, I'd  
16 ask for a moment of silence in her memory. [moment  
17 of silence] Thank you and I'd ask for the proc, the  
18 Committee Clerk to read the proc. Thank you.

19 CLERK: Council, City of New York  
20 Proclamation:

21 The Council of the city of New York is  
22 proud to posthumously honor Julia Elizabeth Roman for  
23 her groundbreaking achievements and the legacy, which  
24 inspires others today; and  
25

2           Whereas, Julia Elizabeth Roman was born  
3 on August 11, 1974 in the Dominican Republic and  
4 later moved to the United States to become a citizen.  
5 Eventually, she joined NEW, Non-Traditional  
6 Employment for Women, an organization that prepares,  
7 trains and places women in careers and the skill-and  
8 skilled construction, utility and maintenance trades,  
9 helps women achieve economic independence, and the  
10 secure future for themselves and their families.  
11 Before long she had learned the electrical trade and  
12 joined the International Brotherhood of Electrical  
13 Workers Local Union No. 3. In her-earlier in her  
14 career, she began working for Century Elevator where  
15 she honed her skills as an elevator apprentice before  
16 being promoted to elevator mechanic; and

17           Whereas, when Ms. Roman left the private  
18 sector to join in New York City Transit, she became  
19 the first woman maintainer of elevators and  
20 escalators. Her peers also elected her to be the  
21 first woman shop steward for Transport Workers Union  
22 Local 100; and

23           Whereas, like countless women, Ms. Roman  
24 worked tirelessly to juggle all the responsibilities  
25

2 of career and family to secure a better life for her  
3 children.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
5 down, please, keep it down.

6 CLERK: On November 16, 2017, she gave  
7 birth to beautiful fraternal twins. The celebration  
8 of birth, however, was interrupted by tragedy. Just  
9 a short time after bringing two lives into the world,  
10 Ms. Roman died from an Amniotic Fluid Embolism; and

11 Whereas, Ms. Roman's death is a painful  
12 reminder that maternal mortality still happens in the  
13 21<sup>st</sup> Century. In fact, more women are dying of  
14 pregnancy related complications in America than any  
15 other developed county. Only in the U.S. has the  
16 maternal mortality rate been rising; and

17 Whereas, this year Council Members  
18 Elizabeth Crowley, Laurie Cumbo, Corey Johnson and  
19 Helen Rosenthal sponsored Local Law 55. Enacted in  
20 March, Local Law 55 required the Department of Health  
21 and Mental Hygiene to report to the Council annually  
22 on maternal mortality. This annual report will  
23 include maternal mortality numbers and rates  
24 disaggregated by race and borough. It will also lead  
25 to recommendations on steps that can be taken by the

2 Department and others to reduce maternal mortality;  
3 and

4           Whereas, Julia Roman is survived by her  
5 devoted husband Victor, her 26-year-old daughter  
6 Valerie Rosario; her 19-year-old son Dwayne Little  
7 who will soon join the Air Force; her 5-year-old  
8 daughter Victoria and her newborns Isabella and  
9 Grace. While we could never fully comprehend their  
10 loss, we will remain fully committed to doing  
11 everything we can to prevent others from death in  
12 child birth.

13           Now, therefore, be it known that the  
14 Council of the City of New York honors the life and  
15 indelible memory of Julia Elizabeth Roman for her  
16 outstanding achievements and her service to her  
17 fellow New Yorkers. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker  
18 for the Entire Council; Elizabeth Crowley, Council  
19 Member 30<sup>th</sup> District, Queens; Ydanis Rodriguez, Chair  
20 New York City Council Transportation Committee;  
21 Laurie A. Cumbo, Co-Chair Women's Caucus; Helen  
22 Rosenthal, Co-Chair Women's Caucus.

23           COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you. I  
24 want to recognize Rosario Polante who's here as the  
25 Division Vice Chair for TWU Local 100 joining the

2 family. I want to thank the family for being here  
3 today, and—and we will never forget. This Council  
4 will do all we can to reduce maternal mortality in  
5 the future. Thank you.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [Speaking  
7 Spanish] [applause] [background comments, pause]  
8 Okay, okay. I think the next one is Council Member  
9 Rose. Council Member Rose is honoring the 2017 TCS  
10 New York City Marathon Race Week Youth Grand  
11 Marshals. It's a long title. [laughs] So the Youth  
12 Grand Marshals of the 2017 TCS New York City Marathon  
13 Race. Five special students representing each of New  
14 York City's boroughs and their peers while  
15 inspiriting 50,000 runners as they completed the 26.2  
16 mile marathon run. So, congratulations and I'm going  
17 to hand it off to Council Member Debbie Rose,

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. We are  
19 really glad to honor the first time that the New York  
20 City Marathon has had youth—youth grand marshals, and  
21 these young people are participants in their New York  
22 Rising Road Run—Road Runners program. These are  
23 [laughs]—these are inspiring young runners and they  
24 have had the opportunity to work with TCS and we're  
25 joined here today by Peter Ciaccia, who is the New

2 York Road Runners President of events and race,  
3 Director of the TCS New York Marathon and Michael  
4 Capiraso, who is the New York Road Runner's President  
5 and CEO, and these very important young people who  
6 are a part of the New York Road Runners Free Youth  
7 Fitness Program, Rising New York Road Runners, and I  
8 thought it was really fitting that since the marathon  
9 goes through all five boroughs that they have one  
10 young person from each borough be a grand marshal.  
11 This is the first time, and they were able to  
12 participate in all of the activities, and so, with  
13 that, we'd like to recognize these young—these five  
14 young people and I'm going to try not to butcher the  
15 names too bad, Speaker.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] No, no  
17 just the first names.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Just the first  
19 names?

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay. I get a  
22 reprieve. We get the first names only. Oluwaseni  
23 Jaylyn, Peter, Hope and Emma, and so thank you.

24 [cheers/applause] [laughter]

2 STUDENT: Thank you. You could call  
3 Oluwaseni, Sheni.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I could call  
5 Oluwaeni, Sheni? Okay. [background comments] Okay,  
6 and so now, would the City Clerk please read the  
7 proclamation.

8 CLERK: Council City of New York  
9 Proclamation. The TCS New York City Marathon is the  
10 premier event of the New York Road Runners. Since  
11 the event began in 1970 with 127 entrants running  
12 laps around Central Park, it has grown into a five  
13 borough affair, and the largest marathon in the  
14 world. More than one million people have finished  
15 the race. Held annually on the first Sunday of  
16 November, the race features over 50,000 runners  
17 including the world's top professional athletes, and  
18 a vast range of competitive recreational and charity  
19 runners. Participants from roughly 125 countries for  
20 the city starting on Staten Island, running through  
21 the neighborhoods of Brooklyn, Queens and the Bronx  
22 before ending in Manhattan. More than a million  
23 spectators and thousand of volunteers line the city  
24 streets to support the dedicated runners in person

2 while millions around the world do so as they watch  
3 the race on TV; and

4                   Whereas, in 2017 the New York Road  
5 Runners launched its enhanced Free Youth Fitness  
6 Program, Rising New York Road Runners, which is  
7 designed to help students in our city and across the  
8 nation develop positive and lasting attitudes towards  
9 health and fitness through running. Five special  
10 Rising New York Road Runners were chosen ad the  
11 first-

12                   SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
13 down please. Keep it down.

14                   CLERK: --ever youth grand marshals  
15 representing each of New York City's boroughs and  
16 their peers while inspiring the 50,000 runners as  
17 they complete their 26.2 mile run. They are:  
18 Oluwaseni from Staten Island; Jaylen from Brooklyn;  
19 Peter from Queens, Hope from the Bronx and Emma from  
20 Manhattan. This is one and this is only the fifth  
21 time in New York City marathon history that the event  
22 has featured a grand marshal; and

23                   Whereas, during the 2017 TCS New York  
24 City Marathon Race week, the Youth Grand Marshals  
25 accompanied by Olympic Metalists and teen New Balance

2 athlete Jenny Simpson, Ambassador and Special Advisor  
3 to Rising New York Road Runners, participated in Race  
4 Week festivities including the opening of the TCS New  
5 York City Marathon Expo and the TCS New York City  
6 Marathon opening ceremony. On Marathon day, the  
7 group rode in the official Grand Marshal vehicle  
8 through the 26.2 mile marathon course with Ms.  
9 Simpson and Peter Ciaccia, President of Events for  
10 New York Road Runners and the race director of the  
11 TCS New York City Marathon; and

12           Whereas, each of the youth grand marshals  
13 has excelled in their roll, and has earned the esteem  
14 of their fellow New Yorkers.

15           Now, therefore, be it known that New York  
16 City Council is proud to honor Peter Oluwaseni,  
17 Jaylen, Emma and Hope for their outstanding service  
18 to New York City and the nation and congratulates  
19 them upon being named TCS New York City Marathon  
20 Youth Grand Marshals. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker  
21 for the Entire Council; Deborah Rose, Council Member  
22 49<sup>th</sup> District Staten Island; Helen Rosenthal, Council  
23 Member, Council Member 6<sup>th</sup> District Manhattan; Rafael  
24 Salamanca, Council Member, Jr. Council Member 17<sup>th</sup>  
25 District the Bronx; Eric A. Ulrich, Council Member

2 32<sup>nd</sup> District Queens; Laurie A. Cumbo, Council Member  
3 35<sup>th</sup> District Brooklyn.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I want to thank you  
5 so much. [cheers/applause] I want to thank the—the  
6 New York Road Runners for recognizing the need for  
7 exercise and—and positive activities for young people  
8 and in so doing, they have the New York Road Runners'  
9 free Youth Fitness Program, and these young people  
10 are a part of the program called Rising New York Road  
11 Runners, and although we can't pronounce their names  
12 here today, I—I assure you that you will see them in  
13 some marathon as winners crossing that—that finish  
14 line in the future, and so now Madam Speaker, would  
15 you--?

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: No, no, no, I  
17 just wanted to congratulate our young people in  
18 particular as Council Member Rose said and what  
19 you're doing in terms of inspiring them. This is a  
20 leadership program as well. We should always see  
21 these types of programs not just as a recreational  
22 and athletic program, but it is a leadership building  
23 program as well. So, congratulations to all of you.  
24 I'm sure you'll be running the marathon soon, right?

2 [laughter] I don't know if somebody wants to speak  
3 on behalf of the group? [background comments, pause]

4 FEMALE SPEAKER: Right. I think a lot of  
5 what's been said is what I would I say here today,  
6 but in New York City we serve over 135,000 young  
7 people in over 800 schools, and that's of the 267,000  
8 total across the United States. So, we're—and all of  
9 our programs are free, and you can see the results  
10 standing here in front of you. These young grand  
11 marshals represent our children from all those  
12 schools in every borough, every community district,  
13 every City Council District. So, thank you very much  
14 for having us here today. [cheers/applause]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. Thank  
16 you. [background comments, pause] Okay. [applause]  
17 [background comments]

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, where's  
19 the last description? Alright, Council Member  
20 Williams. [background comments] Honoring Carolyn A.  
21 Butts for 20 years of outstanding achievements and  
22 contributions with the Real Sisters Film Festival an  
23 internationally respected film festival that  
24 showcases films by women of color from Brooklyn to  
25 Brazil. [laughter] Do we have others that are being

2 recognized? [background comments] There it is.  
3 They're coming up. They're coming up. Alright, so  
4 I'm going to pass it off to Council Member Williams.  
5 Welcome, congratulations and I'll have Council Member  
6 Williams talk about all the great work that you've  
7 been doing. [background comments]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you so  
9 much, and thank you Carolyn Butts for allowing us to  
10 celebrate you. Most folks know my first love is  
11 acting. I was a film production minor and the reason  
12 I switched from dram to film production was that the  
13 auditions that were going-

14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
15 down. Keep it down.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --we always for  
17 murderers and drug dealings and type casting. So, I  
18 said I have to figure out a way to tell my own story.  
19 So, when I found Carolyn Butts who was doing just  
20 that, telling the story of people who weren't being  
21 told in the right way. She's been helping to elevate  
22 and amplify the voices of women of color in the arts.  
23 She's the founder of African Voices for 25 years, and  
24 the Real Sisters of the Diaspora Film Festival for 20  
25 years. She has also spread her love of story telling

2 to low-income areas with her Get Up Get Your Read On  
3 for 15 years, a program, and we're just so excited  
4 that you allowed us to be here. It's close to my  
5 heart. It's close to everyone's heart here and  
6 please continue the great work. Thank you so much.

7 CAROLYN BUTTS: Thank you. [applause]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Would you  
9 please read the proclamation?

10 CLERK: Council City of New York  
11 Proclamation.

12 Whereas, the Council of the City of New  
13 York is proud to honor Carolyn A. Butts for 20 years  
14 of outstanding achievements and contributions with  
15 the Real Sisters Film Festival; and

16 Whereas, in 1996, Ms. Butts co-produced a  
17 short film called Underground Voices, which Reg E.  
18 Gaines. Although footage from the film was broadcast  
19 on PBS, the filmmaker was still unable to raise money  
20 to produce a full length documentary. During this  
21 time, she learned of the scarcity of prospects for  
22 African-African-American women filmmakers and  
23 committed to correcting that. In 1997, she founded  
24 the Real Sisters of the Diaspora Film Festival, a  
25 lecture series. The first Annual Brooklyn based

2 festival that highlights opportunities for women of  
3 color in the film industry; and

4           Whereas, under the leadership of Ms.  
5 Butts, Real Sisters has grown into an internationally  
6 respected film festival that showcases the films by  
7 women of color from Brooklyn to Brazil. Each year  
8 the festival fosters dynamic and rewarding dialogues  
9 about the ways women of color are portrayed in film  
10 and about the expansive definition of feminism in  
11 today's society. Since its debut 20 years ago, the  
12 film festival has presented more than 3,000 films and  
13 given over \$25,000 in scholarship money to aspiring  
14 filmmakers, and

15           SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
16 down, please.

17           CLERK: Whereas, the Real Sisters Film  
18 Festival owes much of its success to the vision and  
19 passion of its founder, yes, it is also only one of  
20 Ms. Butts' many endeavors to increase the visibility  
21 of African-American artists over the last three  
22 decades. In 1992, Ms. Butts became the Founder,  
23 Publisher and Executive Director of African Voices, a  
24 leading not-for-profit Arts Magazine devoted to  
25 presenting fine art and literature by artists of

2 color. Now in its 25<sup>th</sup> year, African Voices not only  
3 publishes a quarter magazine with poetry, visual  
4 arts, fiction and features from artists across the  
5 nation, but also sponsors community forums, literary  
6 readings and artistic programs for youth as well as  
7 the Real Sisters Film Festival; and

8           Whereas, Ms. Butts also has a lengthy  
9 history of supporting arts education for young  
10 people. In 2002, she launched Get Your Read On, an  
11 initiative to bring the love of writing, reading and  
12 story telling to young people in low-income  
13 communities. Between 2002 and 2007, she worked as  
14 the Associate Director of the Restoration Youth Arts  
15 Academy. In that role she managed arts training in  
16 dance, theater, visual arts, and writing for more  
17 than 1,500 students in public schools and on-site  
18 workshops. Ms. Butts has truly distinguished herself  
19 in all of her endeavors, and has—and has earned the  
20 esteem of her fellow New Yorkers.

21           Now, therefore, be it known that the  
22 Council of the city of New York gratefully honors  
23 Carolyn A. Butts in celebration of the 20<sup>th</sup>  
24 Anniversary of the Real Sisters of the Diaspora Film  
25 Festival and Lecture Series. Melissa Mark-Viverito,

2 Speaker for the Entire Council; Jumaane D. Williams,  
3 Council Member, 45<sup>th</sup> District Brooklyn; Laurie A.  
4 Cumbo, Co-Chair Women's Caucus; Helen Rosenthal, Co-  
5 Chair Women's Caucus and many other council members.  
6 [cheers/applause]

7 CAROLYN A. BUTTS: I just want to thank  
8 everyone, Jumaane Williams, who has been the  
9 ambassador for Real Sisters for the last seven years,  
10 Laurie Cumbo and Tish James, and all of the City  
11 Council Members. But I would like to say especially  
12 with Laurie Cumbo before she was City Council she  
13 opened up her doors in Mikado (sp?) for the Real  
14 Sisters. She also—we were standing in line getting  
15 out ramps together, and she's like, let's come here  
16 at 12:00 midnight because—So I mean I just want to  
17 thank all of the City Council members. I'm very  
18 touched by this honor. You know, I'm a child of the  
19 Red Hook projects. This is very important to me  
20 because, wow, when I started out at 10 years old  
21 wanting to be a journalist, I never, never, ever  
22 could imagine--

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
24 down, please. Keep it down.

2 CAROLYN A. BUTTS: --that I'd be here  
3 accepting this proclamation at the City Council, and  
4 I just want to say that the power of the arts, you  
5 know, if you--when you read a good book or magazine  
6 you are moved. When you see a good film, you are  
7 moved. Conversations you have never had before  
8 emerge, and I wanted to just say one, my dad whose  
9 up in heaven will be very proud that I'm doing this.  
10 The meaning of the power of the arts happened when I  
11 was visiting him at the hospice. He had was--  
12 prostate cancer he had, and a nurse--he said give the  
13 nurse your magazine, and I was like she doesn't want  
14 that, you know, she doesn't care, you know. So, I  
15 gave it to her and I--I figured that she would not  
16 read the magazine. Then the next day she came up to  
17 me very excited and she said oh I love the magazine.  
18 There was this one poem there about a dad, a  
19 daughter waiting for her dad who never came, and she  
20 said this was the first time ever that we opened up  
21 and had a really difficult conversation about her  
22 father, and she just said thank you. And, the power  
23 of the art, as you all know here can change the  
24 world one poem at a time, one film at a time, one  
25 painting at a time. So, I just want to thank

2 everyone, and I'm really proud of the young people  
3 who were honored before me. That's the reason why  
4 I'm inspired to keep everything I do going, and  
5 just, you know, like I said, as a working class  
6 daughter of Brooklyn's Red Hook Projects, I  
7 represent all the young dreamers and visionaries in  
8 neighborhoods that people sometimes describe as  
9 undesirable places to live. There are dreams here,  
10 too, people with vision and talent. It is important  
11 from children-for children everywhere to see the  
12 limitless opportunities available. To the young  
13 people in Red Hook and everywhere I say you are a  
14 publisher, a software engineer, an architect and  
15 artist. Thank you, the City Council for fighting  
16 the good fight to make sure children have safe  
17 places to sleep by preserving affordable housing,  
18 working to improve our public school, and  
19 healthcare. Thank you for this award. [cheers/  
20 applause] [pause]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --ask all the  
22 women in the Women's Caucus to come forward and all  
23 the department members of the Council. So, Dan  
24 Garodnick that means you, Vinny, David, Crowley, Liz  
25 [background comments] Karen. Adrienne, if you could

2 join us up here. Liz. [background comments] Well,  
3 we're doing depart--everyone can come up. Of course,  
4 everyone should be up here. We're thinking the  
5 department members of the Council and the Women's  
6 Caucus in particular, the department members of the  
7 Women's Caucus. No everyone is up here. So, maybe  
8 step back just a little bit.

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
10 down please. Keep it down please. Keep it down  
11 please.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Just step back  
13 just a little bit. Anyone who's departing maybe be  
14 in the front. Alright, Melissa, I'm afraid you're  
15 coming up here, which is very upsetting to me.  
16 Rosie. [background comments] Julissa. Do you want  
17 to do the flowers? Laurie and I think-- Do you  
18 want to do flowers, too, Monica? Monica, let's do  
19 the flowers. Let's give the flowers as well. So,  
20 is everyone--? Oh, Annabel.

21 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,  
22 please.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
24 [shushing for quiet]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, I'm gong  
3 to cry.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
5 down, please.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, everyone  
7 has their own proclamation, of course, that thanks  
8 you for your specific contributions to the city and  
9 to this City Council, but as Co-Chair of the Women's  
10 Caucus, and for all the departing members, the—the  
11 good men, and Laurie, I want you to say a few words.  
12 I, you know, the number of women in the Council is  
13 going down from 15 to 11. Of the people who were—  
14 who were term limited or there was another race, 60%  
15 of those women left, and—and we didn't pick up any.  
16 [background comments] No, no, pick up. Pick up  
17 would have been, you know, but anyway. So, the  
18 point is—the point is that—the point is we're really  
19 going to miss you. I mean if I can just say having  
20 Melissa and Julissa as leaders in the Council it  
21 really was quite a moment when the two of you stood  
22 up there with Latonia McKinney and—and spoke about  
23 negotiating the City's Budget. That was very  
24 powerful for a lot of women and, of course, women of  
25 color in particular and I admire all of you. I'm

2 going to turn it over to Laurie because she's great.  
3 [laughter] Better at this.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Helen and I are so  
5 proud of what this Women's Caucus has been able to  
6 accomplish. As women leaders we rock. We are  
7 dynamic, we are battle tested. We have shown that  
8 we can do it, and we can do it better than anybody  
9 can. We have held positions of leadership. We have  
10 been chairs of some of the toughest committees in  
11 the New York City Council. We passed monumental  
12 legislation, and we're going to keep rising to the  
13 top, and anybody who thinks that because we're women  
14 that they can just run against us and run all over  
15 us, they have another think coming. Because of this  
16 body right here, and we're going to continue to  
17 raise up the next generation of women leaders  
18 because our voice is so important and so necessary  
19 to this body, to this state and to this nation. It  
20 has been an honor to be chair, co-chair with my co-  
21 chair Helen Rosenthal, and to be chair of the  
22 Women's Issues Committee, and every issue is a  
23 woman's issue, [cheers] and we're going to continue  
24 to rise to the top. And as I always say to my male  
25 leaders, you are so much more powerful and so much

2 more dynamic when under the leadership of women.  
3 So, keep supporting us. Keep raising us up, and  
4 we're going to continue to rise as a body. Thank  
5 you so much. [cheers/applause] Yay. You're great,  
6 too, and--[background comments] No, we're going to  
7 have--

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
9 You're great too, but she has the mic. [laughter]  
10 Alright, with that, we end ceremonials, get ready  
11 for our last session. [background comments, pause]

12 CLERK: Okay, could I have your  
13 attention, please for the last time this year. Can  
14 I have your attention, please? Can I have your  
15 attention, please? At this time, please place all  
16 electronic devices, all electronic devices to  
17 vibrate. Will all non-Council employees, non-  
18 Council employees please leave the main floor of the  
19 Chambers. We have additional people on the floor so  
20 we have a lot more staff than anticipated so if we  
21 could please not block the doors, exits and  
22 entrances. Please stand clear of the doors. It  
23 would be appreciated. Madam Public Advocate.  
24 [applause]

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Everyone please  
3 find a seat. Please find a seat. Please clear the  
4 aisles. Please close the doors. Quiet in the  
5 Chambers. Everyone please be seated. [background  
6 comments] Quiet in the Chambers. All members  
7 please be seated. Quiet in the Chambers, please.

8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
9 down, please.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May we please  
11 close that back door.

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,  
13 please. Keep it down.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise for the  
15 Pledge of Allegiance.

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

17 COUNCIL MEMBERS: [in unison] [Pledge of  
18 Allegiance]

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.  
20 Roll call. Quiet in the Chambers, please.

21 CLERK: Adams.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

23 CLERK: Barron.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

25 CLERK: Borelli, Cabrera.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

3 CLERK: Chin.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

5 CLERK: Cohen.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

7 CLERK: Constantinides.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

9 CLERK: Cornegy.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Here.

11 CLERK: Crowley.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

13 CLERK: Cumbo.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

15 CLERK: Deutsch.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

17 CLERK: Dromm.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

19 CLERK: Espinal.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

21 CLERK: Eugene.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.

23 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland. Garodnick.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

25 (children's voices] [background comments, laughter]

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

30

2 CLERK: Gentile.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: For the last time  
4 here.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oh. [laughs]  
6 Quiet in the Chambers including myself.

7 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND:  
9 Present. [background comments]

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay, guys.  
11 Okay, okay, we've got a long agenda. Quiet in the  
12 Chambers.

13 CLERK: Gibson.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Oh, you guys.  
15 I'm here.

16 CLERK: Greenfield.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.

18 CLERK: Grodenchik.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

20 CLERK: Johnson.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.

22 CLERK: Kallos.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

24 [shushing for quiet]

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

31

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
3 down, please.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

5 CLERK: King.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

7 CLERK: Koo.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

9 CLERK: Koslowitz.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

11 CLERK: Lancman.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

13 CLERK: Lander.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Lander. [pause]

15 CLERK: Levin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

17 CLERK: Levine.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

19 CLERK: Maisel.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here. Can I

21 explain my answer?

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: No.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Sorry. [laughter]

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Not at all.

25 Continuing with roll call.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

32

2 CLERK: Mealy.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

4 [shushing for quiet]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present.

6 CLERK: Menchaca.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

8 CLERK: Mendez.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Present.

10 CLERK: Miller.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: No?

12 CLERK: Palma.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oops.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.

15 Clerk: Perkins.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Here.

17 CLERK: Reynoso.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Present.

19 CLERK: Richards.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

21 CLERK: Rodriguez.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.

23 CLERK: Rose.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

25 CLERK: Rosenthal.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

3 CLERK: Salamanca.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

5 CLERK: Torres.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Present.

7 CLERK: Treyger.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

9 CLERK: Ulrich.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.

11 CLERK: Vacca.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

13 CLERK: Vallone.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

15 CLERK: Williams.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

17 CLERK: Lander.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

19 CLERK: Matteo.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

21 CLERK: Van Bramer.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

23 CLERK: Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Here.

25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. All  
3 quiet in the Chambers, please. All rise for the  
4 Invocation.

5 CLERK: All rise.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The Invocation  
7 will be delivered by Reverend Dr. T. Kenjitsu-  
8 Nakagaki from the Buddhist Council of New York.  
9 Quiet in the Chambers, please.

10 DR. T. KENJITSU-NAKAGAKI: As we celebrate  
11 the holiday seasons, let us keep the holiday spirit  
12 of hope, wisdom, love, compassion and peace in our  
13 mind. Hanukkah for Jews, Christmas for Christians  
14 celebrated widely, Muslim friends celebrate the  
15 birthday of Prophet Mohammed on December 1<sup>st</sup> this  
16 year and Buddhists celebrate the Day of the  
17 Enlightenment on December 8<sup>th</sup>. December is, indeed,  
18 a special month for many religions. As the New York  
19 City is filled with many lights in this season,  
20 which can represent a light of hope, a light of  
21 wisdom, a light of love, and a light of compassion  
22 and a light of peace. Each of us should nurture  
23 such lights within, which—which eventually brighten  
24 our city. Join me in meditation. So, close your  
25 eyes and breathe in and out slowly and deeply using

2 your lower stomach. As I offer the moment of  
3 silence, let us nurture the light of hope, light of  
4 wisdom, light of love and compassion, and the light  
5 of peace within ourselves, and as I ring this bell,  
6 you turn on mind lights. [bell rings multiple  
7 times] May these lights become the source of our  
8 wholesome actions for the true benefit for New  
9 Yorkers. [Chanting] Peace and blessings to all of  
10 you, and have happy holidays. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.  
12 [background comments] Quiet in the Chambers, please.  
13 Quiet in the Chambers, quiet in the Chambers. A  
14 motion to spread the invocation in full upon the  
15 record.

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
17 down, please.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May we have quiet  
19 in the Chambers, please. We are in session. I  
20 would urge everyone to take your conversations  
21 outside. Council Member Garodnick.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you,  
23 very much, Madam Public Advocate, and good afternoon  
24 everyone. I would like to welcome and extend my  
25 deepest gratitude to Reverend Dr. T. Kenjitsu-

2 Nakagaki for joining us today. Reverend Nakagaki is  
3 President of the Buddhist Council of New York a 32-  
4 year-old organization whose mission is to foster  
5 dialogue, cooperation and unity within the Buddhist  
6 community of our city. Reverend Nakagaki is not  
7 only a leader in his own community, he's also  
8 reached out across religious lines and has been a  
9 remarkable civic leader on behalf of all New  
10 Yorkers. Reverend Nakagaki is past Vice Chair of  
11 the Interfaith Center of New York, and currently  
12 serves as the Community Clergy Liaison for the New  
13 York City Police Department. Since 1994, he has  
14 organized an interfaith peace event to commemorate  
15 the Hiroshima and Nagasaki Atomic bombings and  
16 previously organized the World Trade Center Memorial  
17 Floating Lantern Ceremony.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
19 [shushing for quiet]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: As part of his  
21 research for his Doctor of Ministry Program at the  
22 New York Theological Seminary, he visited Poland  
23 touring the Auschwitz and Treblinka death camps.  
24 Reverend Nakagaki's actions from diving into  
25 interfaith work to strengthening his own spiritual

2 community show New Yorkers concrete steps we all can  
3 take to make our city the best it can be. With  
4 leaders like Reverend Nakagaki we have a shining  
5 example of what we can do strengthen our beautiful  
6 mosaic of a city, and I'm so glad that he has joined  
7 us at our City Council Stated Meeting today, our  
8 final one of the term. Also, on a personal note, I  
9 just want to recognize because you couldn't possibly  
10 avoid noting it, the presence of my family, my wife  
11 Zoey and my two sons, Asher almost age 7 and Devin  
12 who is age 4, as well as my father David Garodnick  
13 and we're so glad that they are all able to be here  
14 for this final meeting, and in this spirit, I would  
15 like to make a motion to spread the Invocation in  
16 full upon the record. Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: So be it. I want  
18 to thank Reverend Dr. T. Kenjitsu-Nakagaki for that  
19 beautiful prayer and we also want to welcome to the  
20 Chambers Zoey, Asher, Devin and Mr. Garodnick.  
21 Welcome. Adoption of Minutes. Council Member  
22 Torres. [pause] Motion that the minutes of the  
23 Stated Meeting of November 16, 2017 be adopted as  
24 printed. Messages and papers from the Mayor.

25 CLERK: None.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication  
3 from City, County and Borough Offices.

4 CLERK: None.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and  
6 Communications.

7 CLERK: None.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-  
9 Ups.

10 CLERK: None.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
12 Chambers. Quiet in the Chambers, please as we now  
13 hear from the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam  
15 Public Advocate and good after. Buenos Tardes to  
16 all my colleagues and everyone here in the Chamber.  
17 As this legislation session draws to a close, I want  
18 to thank all of my colleagues for their invaluable  
19 support and friendship throughout all of these  
20 years. Under this Council we were able to pass a  
21 record a record of over 700 bills, and I'll speak a  
22 little bit more towards the end of speaker time. I  
23 also want to recognize the recent death of former  
24 Assembly Member and Manhattan Representative Michael  
25 Brian Hertaug (sp?) who passed away last week. We

2 will all miss him and remember him fondly. And as we  
3 all saw yesterday, tragedy struck in Brooklyn. The  
4 Azan Family had been celebrating Hanukkah when the  
5 unthinkable occurred and a menorah went on fire. The  
6 Azans lost their mother and three children. Our  
7 hearts go out to Yossi Azan and the entire Azan  
8 family during this very difficult time, and I would  
9 like to ask Council Member Chaim Deutsch to say a  
10 few words.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you, Madam  
12 Speaker. Early yesterday morning my district  
13 suffered the tragic loss of a mother, Aliza Azan and  
14 her three young children in a house fire. Moshe was  
15 11, Vitzchak was 7 and Henrietta was on 3 years old.  
16 Their father, Yossi heroically saved the lives of  
17 two of his teen-age children Shilat and Daniel. He  
18 made every effort to attempt to charge back into the  
19 burning home to rescue the others. The three are  
20 still in critical condition receiving treatment for  
21 injuries sustained during the fire. Our community  
22 and our city has been stricken with grief at this  
23 horrific loss. Yesterday's events is stark  
24 reminder of the importance of fire safety. Please  
25 remind your constituents to be—your constituents to

2 be extra careful with the candles and lights during  
3 the holiday season. Once again, I want to express  
4 my heartfelt condolences to the Azan family and the  
5 entire community for this terrible loss. I ask you  
6 all to join me in praying for a full recovery of  
7 Yossi, Shilat and Daniel.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,  
9 Council Member Deutsch, and let's take a moment of  
10 silence for our fellow New Yorkers.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: A moment of  
12 silence, please. [moment of silence observed]

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Than you Madam  
14 Public Advocate. Thank you to my colleagues.  
15 [pause] Okay, now on a much lighter note we are--this  
16 is something that I did not know until we came in  
17 today. We want to congratulate our colleague  
18 Council Member Antonio Reynoso and his wife.  
19 [cheers/applause] [laughter] Everybody knows by  
20 now? Yes. But Antonio and his wife Iliana welcome  
21 their first child--

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
23 [shushing for quiet]

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --Alejandro--

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Please  
3 keep it down.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --over the  
5 weekend. So, to Antonio and to Iliana  
6 congratulations. A really, really happy moment.  
7 So, congratulations. Before we jump into the docket  
8 for today, I wanted to just mention that I'm really  
9 excited to announce that we are launching a new New  
10 York City Council Legislative website located at  
11 laws.council.nyc.gov. New York City Councilmatic  
12 allows the public to more efficiently search the  
13 Council's legislative information and pulls its data  
14 directly from our legislative API. You can now sign  
15 up for notifications about specific issues,  
16 notifications from individual members or meetings  
17 and this new site is iterative, which--iterative,  
18 which means that the Council will continue to  
19 improve it--improve it based on user feedback. So,  
20 definitely we need people to give us feedback. I'm  
21 proud to say that in my tenure as Speaker we have  
22 transformed every single one of the Council's  
23 digital assets. We have continued to focus on  
24 people over products and this new tool aims to make  
25 it easier for everyday New Yorkers to access the

2 Council's legislative information. By adopting  
3 Councilmatic as an official government tool, we are  
4 continuing to demonstrate our commitment to  
5 transparency access and digital inclusion. I want  
6 to thank Council Members Kallos, Vacca and Lander  
7 for their dedication to these issues and to our  
8 partners David Moore of the Participatory Politics  
9 Foundation and Beta NYC and DataMade for pushing  
10 this project forward. Then jumping right into the  
11 docket, the Council is going to vote on a number of  
12 land use items including the development of all  
13 National Black Theater or the National Black Theater  
14 in Manhattan, the rezoning of 1965 Lafayette Avenue  
15 in the Bronx and the Self-Storage Text Amendment  
16 that applies to various districts throughout the  
17 city. I want to thank Raju Mann really much for his  
18 work on this. Next, the Council will vote on  
19 legislation concerning runaway youth. Intro 1705-A  
20 sponsored by Council Member Rafael Salamanca will  
21 require DHS and DYCD to create and maintain a  
22 process while taking intake and assessments for any  
23 runaway or homeless youth who are seeking to enter a  
24 DHS shelter. Intro 1619-A sponsored by Council  
25 Member Corey Johnson would require DYCD to provide a

2 biannual report on the number of runaway youth and  
3 homeless youth who are not able to access runaway  
4 and homeless youth shelters. For staff, I want to  
5 thank Jeffrey Baker, Andrea Vazquez, Michael  
6 Benjamin, Jessica Ackerman and Kiru Gishuru (sp?).  
7 While Kiru is no longer at the Council, we want to  
8 acknowledge and thank him for his work. I hope I  
9 pronounced the last name correctly. Moving on we  
10 will vote on a few transportation bills: Intro 1658  
11 sponsored by Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez would  
12 require the Department of Transportation and the  
13 Parks Department to report annually on the number of  
14 bollards installed throughout the city. I want to  
15 thank on staff Jeffery Baker, Gafar Zaaloff, Malak  
16 Nasser Rudeen (sp?), Jonathan Masserano, Emily  
17 Rooney, Terzah Nasser and Andrea Vazquez. Intro  
18 1397-A sponsored by Council member Steve Matteo  
19 would set out conditions, which may apply when a  
20 permit is issued to cut open a street within five  
21 years or less after completion of a city capital  
22 construction project, which required resurfacing or  
23 reconstruction of the street. On staff, I want to  
24 thank Jeffrey Baker, Balkese (sp?) Murad, Malak  
25 Nasser Radeen, Jonathan Masserano, Emily Rooney,

2 Terzah Nasser and Andreas Vazquez. Next, the  
3 Council will vote on Intro 1466 sponsored by  
4 Majority Leader Jimmy Van Bramer. It would require  
5 the Department of Parks and Rec to clean the  
6 playground equipment after the spraying of  
7 pesticides. On staff I want to thank Jeffrey Baker,  
8 Chris Sartori, Patrick Mulvihill, Chima Obichere,  
9 and Kenneth Grace. Moving on, we're going to vote on  
10 a number of bills sponsored by Housing and Buildings  
11 Committee Chair Jumaane Williams. Intro 1120-A  
12 would require that the Department of Environmental  
13 Protection be notified whenever excavation or  
14 drilling to a depth greater than 50 feet is proposed  
15 in the Bronx or north of 135<sup>th</sup> Street in Manhattan or  
16 greater than 100 feet elsewhere in the City, and  
17 Intro 1039-A would require the Department of  
18 Housing, Preservation and Development to report on  
19 the vacant buildings that may be suitable for the  
20 development of affordable housing. I want to thank  
21 on staff Jeffrey Baker, Megan Chin, Jose Conde and  
22 Sarah Gastelum, and Introduction 1269-A sponsored by  
23 Council Member Donovan Richards, which would require  
24 the Department of Housing and Buildings to enter  
25 into regulatory agreements with community land

2 trusts. I want to thank Jeffrey Baker, Megan Chin,  
3 Jose Conde and Sarah Gastelum. Next, Council Member  
4 will—next the Council will vote on Intro 1036-A  
5 sponsored by Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez, which  
6 would require the Department of Housing,  
7 Preservation and Development to conduct an analysis  
8 of vacant residential buildings and vacant lots. I  
9 want to thank Jeff Baker, Megan Chin, Jose Conde and  
10 Sarah Gastelum. Also, vote on Intro 1015-A  
11 sponsored by Council Member Ben Kallos, which would  
12 require HPD to establish a Housing Portal. I want to  
13 thank Jeff Baker, Megan Chin, Jose Conde and Sarah  
14 Gastelum. In addition, we'll be voting on  
15 legislation by the Public Advocate Tish James, Intro  
16 1009-A would require HPD to create an online  
17 database for registered dwellings containing and  
18 owner's information. Again, the same staff Jeff  
19 Baker, Megan Chin, Jose Conde and Sarah Gastelum.  
20 Moving on the Council will vote on Intro 385-C  
21 sponsored by Council Member Rosie Mendez, which  
22 requires dwelling owners to annually inspect units  
23 for indoor allergen hazards. Also, vote on bills  
24 sponsored by General Welfare Committee Chair Steve  
25 Levin. Intro 1739-A would require HRA to issue an

2 annual report on the number of individuals and the  
3 number of families who exit domestic violence  
4 emergency shelters. I want to thank Jeff Baker,  
5 Andrea Vazquez, Tonya Cyrus, Dohini Sompura, and  
6 Amira Newzat. Intro 1714-A requires educational  
7 continuity materials and information be provided to  
8 families with children applying for shelters, and  
9 Intro 1577-A, would require the Mayor's Office of  
10 Operations to complete a study on client information  
11 management systems. I want to thank Jeff Baker,  
12 Aminta Kilawan, Andrea Vazquez, Terzah Nasser, Tonya  
13 Cyrus and Amira Newzat. Also, Intro 855-B sponsored  
14 by Council Member Ben Kallos would require the  
15 Mayor's Office of Operations to produce a study  
16 regarding the feasibility of notifying individuals  
17 who apply for public assistance about other  
18 assistance opportunities. I want to thank Jeff  
19 Baker, Andrea Vazquez, Tonya Cyrus, Dohini Sompura  
20 and Amira Newzat. Also Intro 572-A sponsored by  
21 Council Member Liz Crowley, which would require the  
22 Department of Homeless Services to post a daily  
23 report Monday through Friday on its website with  
24 information on the daily shelter census. The same  
25 staff as before, Jeff Baker, Andrea Vazquez. Tonya

2 Cyrus, Dohini Sompura and Amira Newzat. The Council  
3 will also vote on Intro 1632-A sponsored by Council  
4 Member Dan Garodnick, which would require that  
5 property owners post the information about a  
6 building's energy efficiency in a conspicuous place.  
7 I want to thank Jeff Baker, Megan Chin, Samara  
8 Swanston, Nadia Johnson and Jonathan Seltzer. Next,  
9 the Council will vote on a couple of bills sponsored  
10 by Environmental Protection Chair Costa  
11 Constantinides. Intro 54-A would ~~the~~ the use of  
12 alternative fuels and alternative fuel technologies  
13 in the city ferry fleet. It's going to log and  
14 register the use of alternative fuels. Jeff Baker,  
15 Samara Swanston, Nadia Johnson and Jonathan Seltzer,  
16 and Intro 1629-A would require the Department of  
17 Buildings to submit proposed amendments to make the  
18 City's Energy Code match the model stretch code  
19 created by the New York State Energy Research and  
20 Development Authority. I want to thank Jeff Baker,  
21 Megan Chin, Samara Swanston, Nadia Johnson and  
22 Jonathan Seltzer. We're also going to be voting on  
23 Intro 1465-A sponsored by Council Member Ritchie  
24 Torres, which would accelerate the timeline for such  
25 plants to shift from using higher grade fuel oil.

2 Intro 978-D also sponsored by Council Member Ritchie  
3 Torres would establish minimum standards for  
4 carrying out mold assessment, mold abatement and  
5 mold remediation for certain buildings. Jeff Baker,  
6 Samara Swanston, Nadia Johnson and Jonathan Seltzer.  
7 Moving on, the Council will vote on Intro 717-A  
8 sponsored by Council Member Helen Rosenthal, which  
9 would require reporting on idling complaints and  
10 their dispositions. We're going to also vote on  
11 another bill sponsored by Council Member Rosenthal,  
12 Intro 880-A, which would require a review of the use  
13 of the biodiesel fuel in school buses. Next, we're  
14 going to vote on Intro 1653-B sponsored by Council  
15 Member Ben Kallos, which would require DEP to review  
16 responses to noise complaints, and also Intro 1616-A  
17 sponsored by Council Member Danny Dromm would create  
18 a temporary task force to address reentry issues  
19 that older adults face when returning from state  
20 prisons and local jails, and then I think Danny  
21 might give a very compelling case about a 65-year-  
22 old person been in jail 20 years. Imagine what, you  
23 know, having to try to reintegrate, how do you do  
24 that successfully if there's no assistance. So,  
25 very important legislation. Thank you for that.

2 Also, Intro 1185-A sponsored by Council Member Chaim  
3 Deutsch would require DFTA to regularly provide  
4 written materials from OEM to senior centers and  
5 NORCs on how to register with the utility company if  
6 they use life-sustaining medical equipment or are an  
7 individual for whom a disruption in electrical  
8 services would create a medical emergency. I want to  
9 thank Jeff Baker, Caitlin Fahey, Emily Rooney,  
10 Andrea Vazquez and Terzah Nasser. In addition, the  
11 council will vote on Intro 1399-A sponsored by  
12 Council member Debbie Rose, which will protect  
13 employees who seek temporary changes to work  
14 schedules for persona events and certain other  
15 scheduled changes. I thank Jeff Baker, Terzah  
16 Nasser, an Annie Decker, Matthew Carlin, Alexis  
17 Wazenberg-Wanzenberg and Kevin Kotowski. Next we  
18 vote on legislation sponsored by Council Member  
19 Laure Cumbo, Intro 1615-A. It would require SBS to  
20 develop and make available to all contracting  
21 agencies a subcontractor resource guide. Jeff  
22 Baker, Alex Paulenoff, Nadia Johnson, and Alia Ali.  
23 Next, we're going to vote on Intro 1486-A sponsored  
24 by Council Member Ben Kallos, which would require  
25 the DOE to report the number of students who applied

2 to, received and offer of admission for and enrolled  
3 in schools in grades Pre-K, Kindergarten, 6 and 9 in  
4 schools in each community school district as well as  
5 the anticipated number of school seats available in  
6 each school. Jeffrey Baker, Smita Deshmkh, Andrea  
7 Vazquez, and Terzah Nasser. Thanks for working on  
8 those bills. The Council will also vote on Intro  
9 1497-A sponsored by Council Member Rafael Salamanca,  
10 which would require DOE to publish an annual report  
11 on students in temporary housing. The Council will  
12 then vote on Intro 1604-A, sponsored by Council  
13 Member Rosie Mendez, which would require the Mayor's  
14 Office of Operations or other agencies designated by  
15 the Mayor to review the official forms of certain  
16 designated city agencies to determine whether they  
17 are eligible for updating to be updated to include  
18 voluntary questions regarding individuals' gender  
19 pronouns and if so, eligible to update such forms.  
20 Intro 804-A sponsored by Council Member Inez Barron  
21 who would require reasonable accommodations for  
22 individuals with disabilities under the New York  
23 City Human Rights Law. Jeff Baker, Emanuel Halu  
24 (sp?), Annie Decker and Rachel Cordero. I'm proud  
25 to discuss the final bills of which I sponsored,

2 Intro 1499-A would require the Commissioner of  
3 Sanitation and DCA to study the feasibility of  
4 penalty mitigation program. Jeff Baker, Sylvester  
5 Yavana, Nicole La Bien, Jennifer Wilcox, Megan Chin,  
6 Michael Kurtz, Terzah Nasser, and Andrea Vazquez.  
7 Thank you and Intro 1419-A would allow the city to  
8 recover penalties for construction site safety  
9 violations that result in or accompanied by death or  
10 serious physical injury. And Intro 1012-A would  
11 amend the New York City Human Rights Law to improve  
12 its organizational structure and enhance its  
13 clarity. Jeff Baker, Annie Decker, Michelle Lee,  
14 Juanita John, Emanuel Hailu, and Malak Masur Radeen.  
15 (sp?) And finally, the Council will vote on what is  
16 commonly known as the Right to Know Act. Intro 182-  
17 D sponsored by Council Ritchie Torres would require  
18 that all sworn police officers employed by the NYPD  
19 offer a business card to an individual during  
20 certain police interactions, and give reason for the  
21 law enforcement activity. Intro 541-C sponsored by  
22 Council Member Reynoso would require the NYPC to  
23 develop and provide guidance to its officers with  
24 respect to obtaining voluntary knowing and  
25 intelligent consent prior to conducting a search

2 that is based solely on an individuals' consent. I  
3 want to thank Deepa Ambekar, Casey Addison, Steve  
4 Riester, so many people that worked on this. I  
5 really appreciate it, and that completed the  
6 highlights of the docket. So, again just  
7 reiterating as we all know today is the last Stated  
8 of 2017, and my final Stated as Speaker of the New  
9 York City Council. Twelve years ago when I was  
10 first sworn in as the first Latina, the first Puerto  
11 Rican to represent my district of El Barrio East  
12 Harlem and the Bronx. I tried to process what that  
13 all meant. I was a labor organizer, a community  
14 activist of Museo Del Barrio not a politician. But  
15 I knew as a council member I had a real chance to be  
16 a voice for all those in our city. For-for too long  
17 having cast aside and silenced the poor, the  
18 undocumented [speaking Spanish] and every single New  
19 Yorkers who felt that there was more to be done to  
20 make our great city more responsive, fair, and just  
21 for our people. Above all else, justice has been  
22 the driving force behind every significant step or  
23 decision I've made as a Council Member as Speaker,  
24 and it's that quest for justice that has driven this  
25 Council to act as it never has before. We provided

2 free legal services to those who would otherwise not  
3 have representation in immigration court. We  
4 invested in our youth, our immigrant communities and  
5 all vulnerable New Yorkers, and not only did we kick  
6 ICE off Rikers Island, we got the Mayor to agree to  
7 close it. That is the legacy I am proud and I'm  
8 hoping to leave behind. By now—by now everyone knows  
9 who I am and where I came from, and I can't say  
10 enough about how incredibly honored and grateful I  
11 am to have the privilege to lead this body. All of  
12 our success could not have been done without your  
13 support. I am a defender of this institution. I  
14 understand its value. I believe in its value, and  
15 in this—in governing the city of New York. You all  
16 understand that as well, defended members and stood  
17 up against criticism for that, and I will continue  
18 to do that. So, I've been honored and grateful and  
19 it's a privilege to lead this body, and really  
20 incredible that coming here at the age of 18 really  
21 not having any networks in this city, and not really  
22 understanding how this city worked or how it was  
23 governed, but I've been able through hard work to  
24 and commitment been able to arrive at this position  
25 is definitely truly what come and strive to the

2 country for, and I'm really proud of that. So,  
3 that's [bell] who we are. That is who I am, and  
4 because this legislative body will be nothing  
5 without all of you who have been at my side for  
6 eight and now twelve year. We turned a Speaker  
7 driven institution into one where members have had a  
8 real say in things. Even when we didn't always  
9 agree, we always listened. Visiting our  
10 communities, visiting your communities, meeting your  
11 constituents and learning about the challenges  
12 facing your districts has made me a better person  
13 and a more compassionate legislator. So for that I  
14 want to thank each and every one of you. To my  
15 colleagues, to the staff, and to all those who held  
16 us accountable by testifying at hearings, to aiding  
17 complaints, a rally on the steps of City Hall, I  
18 thank you, and I thank my colleagues, but obviously  
19 the staff of this institution is incredibly  
20 professional. You have made us proud, and we  
21 definitely want to salute each and every one of you.  
22 I think we can all say right that we thank the staff  
23 for all the work [cheers/applause] that they've done  
24 in this session. [cheers/applause] You know, and  
25 I—you know I could go on and on, you know, talking

2 about stuff, but look I obviously I'm supported by a  
3 very strong team. I deeply, deeply appreciate  
4 everyone in the Speaker's Office, all of our  
5 division heads who have demonstrated incredible-  
6 incredible leadership in your own right. Latonia  
7 coming in to being the Finance Director, right.  
8 [cheers/applause] You know, having--you know,  
9 having Camille in that Administrative Division,  
10 having Robin in our Communications Division,  
11 [applause] having Erica in--in the division that she  
12 leads, and having obviously Ramon and Joey and Joe.  
13 [cheers/applause] They've all--they've all seen my  
14 growth in many ways as well, and--and I'm really  
15 proud to have worked alongside each and every one of  
16 you. So, I don't--people ask me what are your  
17 regrets. I don't have regrets because we have to  
18 use every opportunity as growing experience, and  
19 maybe you're not 100% thrilled. You're not 100%  
20 happy with a particular issue, but those are  
21 alerting opportunities and this has been the most  
22 productive legislative session and we should all be  
23 proud of that because we're making the city a better  
24 city for all New Yorkers for every single New  
25 Yorkers who often times feels invisible or feels

2 disrespected or-or disenfranchised. That is not who  
3 we are as a city. And so, our work has been to  
4 really make it a more equitable city, and-and we've  
5 done an incredible amount of work in four years.  
6 So, thank you for your partnership and to all of  
7 those that are leaving office as well, term limited,  
8 we'll all be civilians as of January 1<sup>st</sup> and excited  
9 about the new Latin life and the opportunities that  
10 will bring. So, thank you all very much. This  
11 place, this City Hall would be nothing without each  
12 and every one of you. So, thank you so much.  
13 [cheers/applause] Thank you all. So, I-I didn't-I  
14 didn't write my last comments down. So, obviously  
15 told that make sure we-Laura Popa, where are you,  
16 Laura. Oh, you're right here. [cheers/applause]  
17 When-and Rob Newman and everybody else that this  
18 incredible number of bills that we have passed oh,  
19 my God it's just incredible. So, you guys have been  
20 the driving force behind all of that and Jeff Baker  
21 and everyone else. So, I could name names, but you  
22 all have been deeply important to me personally and-  
23 and this is just a dream job, and a dream  
24 opportunity and I look forward to exploring other  
25 opportunities in the future as well. So, with that,

2 I will end Communication from Speaker. [applause]

3 The last communication from the Speaker.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Discussion of  
5 General Orders beginning with Council Member Torres.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [off mic]

7 FEMALE SPEAKER: Your microphone.

8 [background comments]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [on mic]

10 Perfect. Okay. [background comments]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Can you switch  
12 seats? Yeah, right. [background comments, pause]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Divine  
14 intervention. [laughter] I want to -first I'm-I'm  
15 internally grateful for the Speaker. You know, this  
16 has been the most challenging week of my political  
17 life and you have stood with me unwaveringly at  
18 every turn, and so from the bottom of my heart I  
19 want to thank you. I love you and it's been an  
20 honor to serve under your leadership. I'm the  
21 youngest elected official in New York City. The  
22 humiliation of a street encounter is no extraction  
23 to me. It is a pain that I have felt deeply and  
24 repeatedly in my own life. I know from my own lived  
25 experience as well as from years of negotiation that

2 Intro 182 will improve the kind of street level  
3 policing that I painfully experienced as an  
4 adolescent and as an adult. Intro 182 is the most  
5 comprehensive police reform that the City Council  
6 has ever undertaken. Never before has the City  
7 Council set standards of accountability and  
8 transparency aimed at improving the everyday street  
9 encounters between police and civilians. Intro 182  
10 once enacted will require every single officer to  
11 have a business card. The business cards will  
12 include the name, rank, shield number, and command  
13 of the officer. It will include the number to 311  
14 where a civilian can go to express concerns,  
15 compliments or complaints about the conduct of an  
16 officer. It will include the website where a  
17 civilian can go to require video footage of the  
18 street encounter. Every officer will be required to  
19 provide a business card upon request in every single  
20 interaction. Every officer will be required to  
21 provide a business card proactively regardless of  
22 request. In every Level 2, Level 3 and Level 4  
23 interaction. Level 2 interactions consist of  
24 investigatory questioning based on the suspicion of  
25 criminal activity. Level 3 interactions consist of

2 stop, question and frisk. Level 4 interactions  
3 consist of searchers as well as arrests. These are  
4 the most intensive and intrusive interactions that  
5 have been the subject of most civilian complaints.  
6 Asking for an ID card in the midst of an escalating  
7 encounter runs the risk of deepening tensions. The  
8 point of Intro 82 is to demand proactive  
9 identification as a means of deescalating the very  
10 street encounters that do escalate. When a street  
11 encounter escalates to the level of accusatory  
12 questioning, or escalates to the level of stop,  
13 question and frisk, or escalates to the level of a  
14 search, that encounter immediately will become  
15 subject to a proactive ID requirement. Intro 182  
16 proactively deescalates that which escalates. The  
17 historical context here is worth considering. The  
18 Right to Know Act was originally part of the  
19 Community Safety Act, which emerged against the  
20 backdrop of Stop and Frisk policing. At the height  
21 of Stop and Frisk policing, there were 700,000 stops  
22 in the City of New York. If Intro 182 had been the  
23 law back in 2011, every single one of those 700,000  
24 stops would have been subject to the proactive ID  
25 requirement. By way of further illustration,

2 compare Intro 182 to the famous federal court  
3 decision in *Floyd versus New York City*. In *Floyd*,  
4 the Federal Court required the NYPD to provide tear-  
5 offs for Level 3 encounters. By contrast, Intro 182  
6 will require the NYPD to provide pre-printed cards  
7 which are more reliable than handwritten tear-offs  
8 and it will require those pre-printed cards to be  
9 distributed not only at Level 3 but Level 2, Level 3  
10 and Level 4 interactions. We'll compare Intro 182 to  
11 the Community Safety Act. The Community Safety Act  
12 established new office, which is something the  
13 Council has done before. It created a private right  
14 of action in court, which is something the Council  
15 has done before. By contrast, Intro 182 regulates  
16 the day-to-day street encounters between police and  
17 civilians which is something the Council has never  
18 done. It is historic, it is unprecedented, it is  
19 real reform in the truest sense of the word. Well,  
20 compare intro 182 to Intro 541. Intro 541 only  
21 applies to consent searchers, which makes up a  
22 narrow subset of enforcement actions. By contrast,  
23 Intro 182 affects every single police-civilian  
24 interaction, and it has the greatest deescalating  
25 effect on the very police-civilian interactions that

2 end up escalating. There are those who might be  
3 wondering why I've chosen to proceed with a  
4 compromise. Why did I not discharge or why did I  
5 not delay the bill until the next legislative  
6 session. Here is the reason I chose compromise.  
7 Progress in the present does not foreclose the  
8 possibility of even more progress in the future. If  
9 there are imperfections in Intro 182, there is  
10 nothing in the compromise that prevents a new  
11 Council Member from introducing a new bill aimed at  
12 correcting those very imperfections. Progress is a  
13 floor, not a ceiling. It is a foundation on which  
14 to build deeper reforms in the future. Here's the  
15 reason I decided against delaying Intro 182. Young  
16 people of color who live the reality of street  
17 encounters every day cannot afford to wait. Young  
18 people of color I know cannot afford to be delayed  
19 by the purity of politicians and advocates who can  
20 afford to wait. We owe it to those young people to  
21 forge ahead in a progressive, but pragmatic spirit  
22 that recognize what Dr. Martin Luther King calls the  
23 fierce urgency of now. The next City Council will  
24 likely be more conservative than the present one.  
25 The political landscape will likely be more hostile

2 to police reform. I have concluded in good faith it  
3 is better to legislate as much progress as we can in  
4 the immediate term and to let police reform languish  
5 at the mercy of a more conservative City Council.  
6 Here is the reason I decided against discharging  
7 Intro 182. If we had gone forward with a discharge  
8 over the vehement objections of the Administration,  
9 the Mayor would have refused to implement the law,  
10 which is his legal right. The NYPD would have sued  
11 us. We would have embroiled ourselves in years of  
12 litigation, and since we are admittedly legislating  
13 an uncharted territory, there is a real risk that a  
14 court would have struck down these laws. I have  
15 concluded in good faith it is better to guarantee  
16 progress in the immediate term than to risk emerging  
17 empty handed in the long run. And finally, here is  
18 the reason I chose cooperation rather than  
19 confrontation with the NYPD. Real reform not only  
20 requires a change in law, it requires a deeper  
21 change in culture. A culture shift is most  
22 successful when it commands the buy-in and the  
23 cooperation of the very institution whose culture  
24 you seek to change. We have searing memories of  
25 2014 when an open revolt broke out in the rank and

2 file of the Police Department. If we can pursue a  
3 path to police reform without provoking an upheaval  
4 in the NYPD, then why not do so? Why not pursue  
5 police reform zealously but responsibly? The  
6 reality of the City Council is that we can only  
7 change the status quo at a rate that the system can  
8 absorb, and the reality is that we as Council  
9 Members cannot implement our own laws. We are  
10 inevitably dependent on agencies like the NYPD for  
11 the implementation of our laws and that inevitable  
12 dependency demands compromise and cooperation. The  
13 need for a deep change in culture rather than a  
14 surface change in law demands compromise and  
15 cooperation. Traffic Stops: Here is the risk of  
16 covering traffic stops. With the Criminal Justice  
17 Reform Act we have been moving the city in the  
18 direction of fewer arrests and fewer summonses,  
19 fewer coercive interactions between police and  
20 civilians. When it comes to traffic violations,  
21 officers often have the discretion to issue warning  
22 in the place of summonses. If you require officers  
23 conducting traffic stops to proactively provide a  
24 business card that contains a number that you can  
25 call to complain about them, the PBA will likely

2 direct their officers to issue formal summonses  
3 instead of informal warnings in order to main an  
4 official—maintain an official paper trail that  
5 protects them from litigation. And so, I had to ask  
6 myself a hard question as a legislator: Should I do  
7 what the advocates have demanded of me and derail a  
8 hard fought and historic compromise over something  
9 that could have the unintended affect of generating  
10 hundreds of thousands of summonses in New York City.  
11 I concluded the answer should be no. Even though  
12 about a year ago I stood firmly and forcefully in  
13 opposition to the administrative agreement that the  
14 Speaker negotiated, I've come to realize the wisdom  
15 of the Speaker's long gain. She has taken an  
16 approach that in the words of Theodore Roosevelt  
17 speaks quietly but carries a big stick, an approach  
18 that eases the NYPD, an entrenched institution if  
19 there ever was one into and ever greater acceptance  
20 of reform. The city is better and fairer because of  
21 the Speaker's patient but persistent advocacy, and  
22 when the Speaker brokered the Administrative  
23 Agreement, there were those who predicated at the  
24 time that proceeding with the agreement would make  
25 it harder to pass the Right to Know Act, but

2 experience tells us that this simply has not been  
3 so. The Administrative Agreement made it easier to  
4 pass the Right to Know Act, and passing the Right to  
5 Know Act even in the present form will make it  
6 easier to progress even further in the future. I  
7 will end on—on these final notes: Advocates for  
8 police reform have every right to expect a seat at  
9 the table. Advocates have every right to make their  
10 voices heard even loudly and vitriolically, but no  
11 advocate should ever have veto power over the  
12 legislative agenda of the New York City Council.  
13 And like the Speaker, I, too, have no regrets. I  
14 stand by what I've chosen to do even if it means  
15 standing alone, even if it means straining in  
16 severing political relationships, even if it means  
17 I'm no longer beloved in progressive circles. Even  
18 if it means I have no future in progressive  
19 politics. I remain convinced as I have ever been  
20 that I'm doing the right thing in moving the ball  
21 forward and I am at peace with the path that I have  
22 chosen. Thank you, Madam Speaker. [cheers/applause]

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
24 Chambers, please. Quiet in the Chambers.

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
3 down.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
5 Reynoso.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Hello.

7 [laughter] Try-try to follow that up. [background  
8 comments] Well, mine is going to be a lot shorter  
9 and sweeter because I actually want to get out of  
10 here laughter] as soon as possible so I can be with  
11 my newborn son. [applause] [background comments]  
12 Before I begin, I want to personally recognize Laura  
13 Popa and Deepa Ambekar for their hard work that they  
14 put together to have these two bills move forward  
15 here in the City Council. I also want to thank  
16 Ramon Martinez, and Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito  
17 who will always-always have my back when I was  
18 fighting against the Administration to make sure  
19 that these bills happened. I also want to thank our  
20 Speaker for the great that she's done over the last  
21 four years. It truly is a model and a lesson to  
22 leadership on how she conducted herself and how she  
23 has pushed us forward in what I consider the most  
24 progressive Council in the history of our Council,  
25 which is not too long, but still important. I also

2 want to give a farewell to all my outgoing  
3 colleagues. We love you very much. This Council  
4 has been an amazing place and your leadership and  
5 our wisdom has been extremely helpful. Working with  
6 all of you in my first terms has at times been  
7 challenging, but always a rewarding experience. I  
8 wish you all the absolute best in the future  
9 endeavors. The road to bring the Right to Know Act  
10 to a vote has not been easy. Since being introduced  
11 in 2014, we have faced multiple roadblocks and  
12 challenges. However, we have persevered and pushed  
13 police reform to bring about true justice. Intro  
14 541 will increase transparency and accountability  
15 regarding unconstitutional searches or ones that  
16 have no legal basis. It will require consent to  
17 search their non-emergency encounters. New Yorkers  
18 are often unaware that they have the right to refuse  
19 a search when an officer does not have legal  
20 justification for it, and even if they do know their  
21 rights, they can often be uncomfortable or  
22 prohibited from exercising it because of fear of  
23 escalation by the officer. There is a power  
24 imbalance when you are being asked to empty out your  
25 pockets by someone with a gun. However, by

2 increasing NYPD accountability and transparency we  
3 can build trust between communities and the NYPD.  
4 For communities of color that are disproportionately  
5 affected by increased policing, this bill empowers  
6 us. It protects us and prevents discriminatory  
7 based interactions with the Police Department. We  
8 have to defend ourselves against an administration  
9 and their attacks on immigration—on immigrant  
10 communities who are often the target of abusive  
11 policing. As local officials, we must enact reforms  
12 at the local level like this that help reduce  
13 unnecessary and abusive police interactions  
14 everyday. This is what it means to be a true  
15 sanctuary city. I want to thank the Speaker and her  
16 legislative team as well as the Mayor and his team  
17 for their support in the last two months to get this  
18 bill over the finish line. I would like to thank  
19 the Progressive Caucus and their Director Zara  
20 Marcias (sp?) for their early support of the bill as  
21 well as Council Members Williams and Lander who in  
22 2013 set the bar with the Community Safety Act. I  
23 want to thank my staff and my former Legislative  
24 Director Lacey Tauber who left my office just last  
25 week. Her work on this bill was instrumental. I

2 would also like to recognize all of my Council  
3 colleagues who co-sponsored this bill to advance  
4 social justice in the city of New York as well as  
5 Ritchie Torres my partner in crime, no pun intended  
6 [laughter] [coughs] for his-- We're not real  
7 criminals. For his partnership in this process.  
8 Finally, I must recognize Communities United for  
9 Police Reform and its members and partners and 200  
10 plus organizations in the Right to Know Act  
11 Coalition. I'll be as quick as possible here. It's  
12 not 200. Make the Road New York, Malcolm X  
13 Grassroots Movement, Picture the Homeless, New York  
14 City Liberties Union, Legal Aid Society, Justice  
15 Committee, Jay Fledge (sp?), Moms Rising, Bronx  
16 Defenders, Arab American Association for New York,  
17 Brooklyn Movement Center, Center for Popular  
18 Democracy, Drug Policy Association; Girls for Gender  
19 Equity, Fierce, Latino Justice, Pro Deaf, NAACP,  
20 Legal Defense Fund, New York City Anti-Violence  
21 Project, Rockaway Youth Task Force, Vocal New York,  
22 National Action Network, Justice League, New York  
23 State Conference of NAACP, Color of Change, New York  
24 Communities for Changes, CAAAV, Organizing Asian  
25 Communities, Youth Represent, The Close Rikers

2 Campaign, 32BJ and 1199, New York Working Families  
3 Party, Faith in New York and many other  
4 organizations. And to all of the families of those  
5 who have lost loved ones unjustly—unjustly in police  
6 incidents who have been fighting for the Right to  
7 Know Act, somewhere here in chambers for the vote  
8 today including the families of Eric Garner, Darren  
9 Small, John Corrado, Chantel Davis, Anthony Biaz,  
10 Anthony Rosario, Hilton Vega, Amadou (sp?) Diallo or  
11 Marty Graham, Akai Gurley, Sean Bell, Yonson Vaughn  
12 (sp?), Kamanni Gray, Mohammed Bah, Kenny Lazzo,  
13 Jason Thiallo (sp?) and Rio Orumadin (sp?). I am  
14 proud of this bill. As a father who has welcomed my  
15 son to this world just four days ago, I cannot tell  
16 you how much this bill personally means to me. The  
17 work that I do and the district that I represent.  
18 So, I want to thank you all and encourage you to  
19 vote aye on all. Thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Alejandro would  
21 be proud. Council Member Deutsch.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you.  
23 Today, we are voting on Intro 1185, my bill to  
24 require the Department for the Aging to conduct  
25 outreach in multiple languages to educate seniors

2 who rely on life sustaining equipment about how to-  
3 how important it is to register their home address  
4 with their utility company.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
6 [shushing for quiet]

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
8 down, please. Keep it down. Quiet please.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
10 [shushing for quiet]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: This information  
12 will be posted on the Department for the Aging's  
13 website on DFTA's website as well as shared with  
14 senior centers and NORCs throughout the city.  
15 Having their home address registered ensures that in  
16 the event of a power outage emergency services are  
17 immediately aware of homes that may require a  
18 generator or transportation to a medical facility.  
19 The utility company will also prioritize these homes  
20 for repair. For example, when phone lines were down  
21 after Hurricane Sandy, many were trapped in their  
22 homes without any means of alerting first responders  
23 to their location. Those who relied on medical  
24 equipment to help them breathe were in particular  
25 danger this would not be the case if these older

2 adults were registered with their utility companies.  
3 The more you know the better off you are and I urge  
4 my colleagues to vote in support of Intro 1185, a  
5 bill that can truly save lives. I want to thank  
6 Caitlin Fahey and Emily Rooney for their work on  
7 this bill. Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet  
9 in the Chambers, please. Council Member—

10 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,  
11 please.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
13 Garodnick.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [coughs]  
15 Thank you very much. I want to ask my colleagues to  
16 support Intro 1632-A, which is a bill that would  
17 require large buildings to post their energy  
18 efficiency scores and associated grades near their  
19 public entrances. New York's buildings account for  
20 two-thirds of the energy that our city consumers and  
21 are our biggest contributors to global warming.  
22 Since we passed local 8—Local Law 84 in 2009, a law  
23 that I'm proud to have authored. New York buildings  
24 over a certain size have been required to annually  
25 measure their energy and water consumption in a

2 process called benchmarking. The law standardized  
3 this process by requiring building owners to enter  
4 their annual energy and water use in the U.S.  
5 Environmental Protection Agency's online tool Energy  
6 Start Portfolio Manager and to use the tool to  
7 submit data to the city. The scores generated by  
8 this tool indicate how efficient a building is  
9 relative to comparable buildings. Originally, the  
10 requirement applied only to buildings over 50,000  
11 square feet and we broadened it to include those  
12 over 25,000 square feet. With Intro 1632-A we are  
13 taking the next step. Going forward, buildings will  
14 be assigned a letter grade based on their energy  
15 score, and will be required to post that grade along  
16 with the energy score in a conspicuous location near  
17 their public entrances. This will make information  
18 about building energy use easily available to  
19 tenants and visitors including prospective tenants  
20 and building purchasers and presented in the easily  
21 understood form of a grade. This transparency  
22 initiative will promote interest in, and better  
23 understanding of energy use by our city's buildings.  
24 Tenants and buyers who value energy efficiency will  
25 push building owners to improve. They will reap the

2 financial benefits, and all of us will reap the  
3 environmental benefits. I'm pleased to help New  
4 York move toward a more sustainable future, and I  
5 hope you will all join me in supporting this  
6 legislation. Madam Public Advocate, I see I have  
7 nine seconds and perhaps I'm the first on a clock  
8 today, but I just want to take a point of personal  
9 privilege for my final meeting. It will take about  
10 30 seconds.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I just wanted  
13 to say thank you to my constituents for the  
14 opportunity to have served in this City Council over  
15 the past 12 years. It has been a tremendous honor  
16 for me to represent the community where I was born  
17 and raised, and Madam Speaker, to you and to all of  
18 my colleagues, thank you for your years of  
19 friendship and collaboration. I have truly enjoyed  
20 it. I have learned from all of you, and I know that  
21 there will be many opportunities for further  
22 collaboration, and I look forward to that. To my  
23 staff, some of whom are here and some of whom have  
24 moved on to other things, I thank you for being just  
25 so good at what you. I'm eternally grateful for

2 your time and person sacrifices. I expect great  
3 things of all of you, and I am here to support you  
4 in whatever you need. And of course to my family,  
5 my wife Zoey, my dad David Garodnick, my two boys  
6 Asher and Devon, I love you all very much. I'm so  
7 happy to be on this journey with you. I also want  
8 to mention my mom Barbara who was here on my first  
9 day 12 years ago, but passed away nearly four years  
10 ago. Mom, I miss you everyday and I know that you  
11 are watching over all of us. So, on the occasion of  
12 this final meeting, again, please do accept my  
13 thanks and appreciation and also, please do join me  
14 in voting for Intro 1632. [laughter] [applause]

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May your mother  
16 rest in peace and Mr. Garodnick, Senior, you should  
17 be very proud of your son. Council Member Kallos.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Residents call my  
19 officer everyday seeking affordable housing. Thanks  
20 to a hero whistleblower at Department of Housing,  
21 Preservation and Development, Steven Warner. We  
22 learned through Propublica that at least 50,000  
23 units of affordable housing were not being  
24 registered with the state, which meant landlords  
25 receiving an estimated \$100 million in taxpayer

2 dollars might not be offering them as they promised.  
3 Introduction 1015-A requires all new and existing  
4 city subsidized affordable housing to register  
5 annually or face escalating fines, offer new and for  
6 the first time existing units through Housing  
7 Connects and provides transparency around these  
8 affordable Housing units and who manages them.  
9 Thank you to Propublica, whistleblower and HPD  
10 Analyst Steven Warner, OSC President Robert Cron for  
11 protecting his members' whistleblower rights,  
12 Housing Chair and co-sponsor Jumaane Williams and  
13 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, Jeff Baker, Ed Atkin  
14 and Megan Chin for a very tough, but successful  
15 negotiations. New York City may be the city that  
16 never sleeps, but that shouldn't be because of after  
17 hours construction noise waking you up. Noise is a  
18 top complaint in New York City with booming  
19 construction surrounding residents who complain only  
20 to see their concerns go unaddressed for days, or  
21 met with a small fine paid developers as a cost of  
22 doing business. After hours noise will be targeted  
23 by Introduction 1653-B with new rule for responding  
24 when noise is still happening or likely to happen  
25 again. Turning down the volume on after hours

2 construction noise in residential neighborhoods over  
3 the next two years and empowering the Department of  
4 Environmental Protection to shut down equipment  
5 that's too loud. Thank you to the Department of  
6 Environmental Protection Commissioner Vincent  
7 Sapienza for his agency's partnership, Environmental  
8 Committee Chair Costa Constantinides for his co-  
9 sponsorship and support and Speaker Melissa Mark-  
10 Viverito for standing up for residents and Jim  
11 Wilcox and Samara Swanston for their hard work  
12 drafting and negotiating this legislation. Please  
13 also vote for Introduction 855-B and the school  
14 tracking legislation.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
16 Council Member Richards.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I want to talk  
18 on community land trusts. Today, we take a critical  
19 step toward taking power away from speculators and  
20 giving land back to local communities and non-  
21 profits that serve them. Intro 1269 will not only  
22 define community land trust for the first time in  
23 New York City law, but it would also require that  
24 the community land trust enters into a 99-year  
25 ground lease agreement ensuring land will remain

2 affordable for generations. In order to fully grow  
3 in force with the city, we need to not only build  
4 affordable housing, but we must also increase  
5 opportunities for affordable homeownership. I'd  
6 like to thank our Speaker, Jim Wilcox and Megan Chin  
7 and the New York City Community Land Initiative and  
8 my Legislative Director--

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
10 [shushing for quiet]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --Jordan  
12 Gibbons and Matt Dan-Danbar (sp?) as well. I'm  
13 going to take the liberty of speaking on Intro 182.  
14 First off, I would like to commend Council Members  
15 Reynoso and Torres for their courageousness in  
16 taking up these bills known as the Right to Know  
17 Act. I must admit over the last few days I've  
18 struggled on the ID bill Intro 182 because I'm one  
19 who truly believes that we must not let--

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --perfect be  
23 the enemy--

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
25 down, please.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: -of good, but  
3 in this circumstance, my own personal interactions  
4 as a young black man and even as a Council Member  
5 with DWB driving, Driving While Black and Stop and  
6 Frisk has me concerned that this compromise won't  
7 lead to addressing the underlying causes have sown  
8 mistrust between communities and the Police  
9 Department. Let's be clear. The most common  
10 interactions between police and my constituents are  
11 Level 1 and traffic stops whether the data shows it  
12 or not. And while I applaud all the stakeholders  
13 who put in countless hours to arrive at this  
14 compromise, as a father of a two-year-old black boy,  
15 who will one day encounter a Level 1 stop, I cannot  
16 support this bill in its current form. If you can  
17 give me a few more minutes, Madam Speaker. You  
18 know, when I was--Madam Public Advocate. When I--when  
19 I was elected in 2013, there was mother who called  
20 my office because her 12-year-old--

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
22 Council Member--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I'm going to  
24 speed it up.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: If you can bring  
3 your comments to a close, we would appreciate that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And--and his  
5 experience being stop and frisk coming out of a  
6 vehicle forced me to--

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
8 Council Member, I apologize.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --not  
10 compromise on this issue today.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
12 Council Member, I apologize. You're--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]  
14 I'm going to--I'm going to shut up--

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: --out of order at  
16 this point.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --but-but this  
18 bill does not resolve the issue. We--we have--

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
20 Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --a long way to  
22 go in the city--

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
24 Thank you, Council Member.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --and Level 1s  
3 are still the interaction most common in our  
4 communities.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
6 Council Member--

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]  
8 We're not--we're not--we still--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: With that I-I  
10 vote. [applause]

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: -- we're not  
12 going to--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I vote no on--

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: You're not voting  
15 yet.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Oh, we're not  
17 voting. Okay.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: But we are going  
19 to stick to the two-minute clock here. You  
20 obviously have an opportunity when you vote to speak  
21 again, I would ask. Thank you.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
23 Council Member Williams.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you,  
25 Madam Public Advocate. My comments with all due

2 respect to Council Member Reynoso and Council Member  
3 Torres who have spent countless hours in here, they  
4 are not in opposition to the sincerity that Council  
5 Member Torres spoke. I will not be a part of any  
6 tactics that attack him personally. I believe that  
7 he actually is sincere in what he is saying and  
8 believes is the right thing to do, and I want to  
9 respect that. A few years ago four bills of the  
10 Community Safety Act would have been here, and  
11 there's a precedent set of us taking two of those  
12 bills and laying them aside simply because we  
13 thought it had not gone far enough, and that is what  
14 we were asking for it to happen here. Just to  
15 dispel a few myths, the advocates are not asking for  
16 100%. The people who are voting no are not asking  
17 for 100%. This is not about compromise. This is  
18 about compromise that is worth it, and we should not  
19 let the perfect be the enemy of the good, but we  
20 should not let the good be the enemy of what's  
21 necessary when we have the ability to do it. Case in  
22 point: Three of the bills have passed. One of them  
23 were passed today. It is not what all the advocates  
24 wanted, but it is a compromise that met the  
25 threshold of the capital colloquial that put in

2 already, and the difficult discussion that we have  
3 to have going forward. Intro 119 is a bill I passed  
4 that the advocates did not agree with. Just for  
5 an example: If a police officer asked me for my ID,  
6 and asked where I am going, that is not an  
7 investigatory—it doesn't—so that is not a criminal  
8 stop in my ID when they will not give me a card  
9 under this bill. That is a majority of stops that  
10 are included. The fact that traffic stops are not  
11 included means also that the majority of stops are  
12 not included in this bill. What was asked for was  
13 an investigatory stops to be included. It is  
14 correct that any of the bill we could have taken  
15 away Level 2 stops. It still would have moved the  
16 ball forward, but not enough to pass the bill now  
17 amending a bill is not as easy as folks are making  
18 it seem. It's been four years since we passed this  
19 bill. We waited for the last possible moment for a  
20 zero sum game. Madam Public Advocate, because  
21 others were given more time [bell] I'm asking for an  
22 additional minute. I'm going to take a minute.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]  
24 We're not going to entertain that. I have—I have the  
25 benefit. I—I asked and I gave both sponsors of the

2 bill extra time. People have time when they vote to  
3 again discuss this issue. I'm going to ask that we  
4 maintain the two minutes here in General Orders.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]

6 So, why did you put that two minutes--?

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing] The  
8 general discussion. When you vote--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]

10 The vote has started.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --you can feel  
12 free. The sponsors of the bill--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]

14 I'm understand that.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --had to have the  
16 time.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]

18 We didn't make that a rule.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I'm going to ask  
20 everyone else to maintain the two minutes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'm asking for  
22 an additional minute.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. I'm--  
24 I'm saying no. I appreciate it.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Alright, I'm  
3 going to keep talking.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I appreciate it.  
5 Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'm going to  
7 keep talking then.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We do--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]  
10 Amending a bill is a very big move--

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]  
12 We're going to move on.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --to do what  
14 we've seen here.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]  
16 We're going to move on.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: And so the best  
18 thing to do--

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]  
20 We're going to move on.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
22 Council Member.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --is to pull  
24 this forward.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We ask that you  
3 please-

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
5 Williams, you're out of order.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Advocate, the  
7 advocates got us here.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
9 Mendez.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: The advocates  
11 have got us here, and many of us in leadership have  
12 gotten here.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We're going to  
14 move on. Thank you. Council Member Mendez, please.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] You  
16 made those people wait, and they should go on. (sic)

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, if  
18 Council Member Mendez doesn't want to speak, who's  
19 the next on the list?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] Both  
21 of us. We want to speak. (sic)

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Who's the next?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] And  
24 put them in fear. (sic)

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Well, I'm going  
3 to—I'm going to accede my time to Council Member  
4 Williams and I'll speak about my bills later.  
5 [cheers/applause]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] Well,  
7 I told you they won't—

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
9 Council Member Mendez, the rules do not allow that.  
10 Council Member Rose.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Um, you know,  
12 I'm—I'm term limited. So, I just am asking. This  
13 is my last and I'm asking for a little discretion.  
14 So, okay, I'll--

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member,  
16 go ahead.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: --I'll speak. I  
18 was going to speak about 385, and I really do need  
19 to do that because, you know, it has been more than  
20 ten years that we've worked on this bill.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAM: [off mic]  
22 [interposing] We need to change things. We need a  
23 change.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: And today, we  
25 will be codifying mold abatement and integrated pest

2 management. After ten years of diligently working  
3 on this issue with—with the advocates the Asthma-  
4 Free Homes Act also known as Intro 385-C. After  
5 much negotiations we are passing this crucial bill  
6 that will go a long way to eradicating mold, taking  
7 preventative measures to address mold and asthma  
8 triggers, and asthma has a debilitating effect on an  
9 individual's quality of life, and here in New York  
10 City there are approximately one million individuals  
11 who have been diagnosed with asthma. This  
12 legislation will go a long way to benefit tenants  
13 and their health, and it will allow the city to  
14 recapture funds that they may expend through  
15 Emergency Repair Program. There is a portion of the  
16 bill that—that's the position referral. I refer to  
17 this as the Hurley Provision. Dr. Matthews Hurley  
18 was part of our Coalition for Asthma-Free Housing.  
19 He passed way December 9, 2016, and we fought hard  
20 to keep that provision in because of him, and there  
21 are 30 members of the Coalition. So, I can't  
22 mention all their names, but I want to give a  
23 special thank you to Cecil Corbin Mark, Matt Sasheer  
24 and Harvey Epstein who worked very closely with me.  
25 Ramon Martinez, thank you for helping me get here.

2 Megan Chin, Jim Wilcox, Jeff Baker. I-I also want  
3 to say I'm going to be voting no on 182-D. You know  
4 traffic infractions are-should be covered by this  
5 bill. I was topped by the cops the other day while  
6 driving, and when I asked why I was being pulled  
7 over, they would not tell me why. They said they  
8 will tell me afterward and they explained it to me  
9 when they handed me a summons for running a red  
10 light. [bell] I am clear that as a white skinned  
11 Puerto Rican woman--

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
13 Council Member Mendez, could you bring your comments  
14 to a close?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I would-a-a-a  
16 black man in that situation would have been under  
17 the danger of driving while black.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,  
19 Council member.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: And it my have  
21 been lethal. It wasn't for me, but this bill  
22 doesn't cover that, and that is a shame-

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
24 Thank you.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: --and I will not  
3 vote for it.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
5 Rose.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. Intro  
7 1399 the right to temporary changes in work schedule  
8 and the right to request flexible work without  
9 penalty. Unfortunately, emergencies happen to all  
10 people in all walks of life. While many New Yorkers  
11 are fortunate enough to have employers who  
12 understanding this and make reasonable  
13 accommodations, a 2015 survey of New Yorkers  
14 revealed that 45% of respondents have no access to  
15 flexible work arrangements.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
17 [shushing for quiet]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And 58% of them  
19 feel uncomfortable or very uncomfortable asking for  
20 such changes. Intro 1399 would give all employees  
21 working in New York City the right to a temporary  
22 change in schedule twice a year to attend certain  
23 specific personal needs such as family caregiving  
24 situations, family offense matters or sexual  
25 offenses, and the right to request any other changes

2 in schedule without risking retaliation from their  
3 employer. This bill is especially important for  
4 early career low-income workers, nearly 70% of whom  
5 cannot change their schedule start time or stop time  
6 if needed. Low-wage workers, female workers and  
7 workers of color disproportionately lack access to  
8 flexible work arrangements. No one should lose  
9 their livelihood for asking for an unpaid day to  
10 tend to an emergency and that is what this bill  
11 assures. The results of this bill should be  
12 positive for employees and employers alike leading  
13 to a more satisfied and productive workforce.  
14 Employees with workplace flexibility are more likely  
15 to report better overall job satisfaction, increased  
16 engagement with their job, fewer life interferences  
17 with job performance, improved physical health,  
18 improved mental health status and a higher  
19 likelihood of remaining with their current employer.  
20 Many hours went into making this legislation, which  
21 will ultimately help improve working conditions for  
22 thousands of low wage working women and men in New  
23 York City a reality. I want to thank just a few of  
24 them: Annie Decker [bell] the Deputy Director of

2 Legislative Drafting; Terzah Nasser, Alexis  
3 Weinberg--

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
5 Council Member, bring your comments to a close.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yes. Sherry River  
7 and my Deputy Chief of Staff. Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
9 Council Member Lander.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Than you, Madam--

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
12 Quiet in the Chambers, please. [shushing for quiet]

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
14 down, please. Keep it down.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam  
16 Public Advocate. I have the greatest respect and  
17 admiration for Council Member Torres, and I'm a  
18 long-standing ally of both the Speaker and the  
19 Mayor. So, it pains me to part ways from them on  
20 Intro 182-D, but I cannot support this bill as it  
21 has been amended over the opposition of the  
22 Coalition of 200 civil rights groups, community  
23 based organizations and advocates who have been the  
24 champions of police reform in New York City over the  
25 past decade. As amended, as you've heard, the bill

2 would not cover Level 1 encounters at traffic stops.  
3 The majority of non-arrest interactions that people  
4 have with police officers where a law enforcement  
5 action is taken there's little need for a business  
6 card since individuals will have the summons or be  
7 in custody. It is precisely in the interactions  
8 where no enforcement action is taken that the  
9 business card is needed, and it is too many of those  
10 that his bill exempts. As for the argument that  
11 NYPD officers would make up or needlessly elevate  
12 charges rather than hand New Yorkers a simple  
13 business card and explain the reason for a traffic  
14 stop because their union told them to, I have much  
15 more faith in our officers than that. But perhaps  
16 even more than these substantive disagreements my no  
17 vote today reflects a different belief on how social  
18 change happens. Real change especially on  
19 challenging issues like police reform in a country  
20 with a deep history of racial injustice does not  
21 happen primarily because of the bills we pass in  
22 this chamber. It happens because people who  
23 experience injustice, organize, build organizations,  
24 building coalitions, build an insistent movement for  
25 justice that must be heard and that partnerships are

2 built between activists and legislators.

3 Communities United for Police Reform has built a  
4 coalition like that over the past six years, which  
5 has given people a powerful way to come together to  
6 make change. Of course, they do not get to dictate  
7 what we do here. Compromises must, indeed be  
8 reached, which reflect a balance of idealism and  
9 pragmatism as we're seeing on Intro 541-C, Council  
10 Member Reynoso's bill. But it is not a compromise  
11 if the entire coalition of community based  
12 organizations, advocates and civil rights group who  
13 fought for it are opposed to it, and that is why  
14 despite my high regard for Council Torres--

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

16 Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: --I must vote no  
18 today.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,  
20 Council Member. Council Member Van Bramer.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you  
22 very much, Madam Public Advocate. I am really proud  
23 of Intro 1466, a bill that I have put forth, and  
24 that I hope my colleagues will support today. It is  
25 incredibly important that when the city of New York

2 sprays pesticides including for West Nile Virus,  
3 that they clean appropriately the playground  
4 equipment, and this is a matter that was brought to  
5 me by constituents who were worried that their young  
6 children we playing playground equipment shortly  
7 after the city sprays but not cleaning down the  
8 equipment. So, 1466 will require the Parks  
9 Department in coordination with the Department of  
10 Health to clean playground equipment in city parks  
11 within 24 hours of an aerial spraying of pesticides  
12 by any city agency. There is nothing more important  
13 than keeping young people safe, and making sure that  
14 parents have peace of mind when their children are  
15 playing on playground equipment in the city of New  
16 York. So, I'll talk about some of the other bills  
17 later when I vote, but I certainly want to recognize  
18 the importance of this bill that my staff and I  
19 worked on very, very hard and for a long time. So,  
20 I want to thank my Chief of Staff Matt Wallace, my  
21 Deputy Chief of Staff and Legislative Director Andre  
22 Sveja (sp?) and all of the staff members, the  
23 central staff who helped make this possible. So,  
24 with that, I say thank you and we're really, really  
25 thrilled that we're going to make sure that parents

2 have peace of mind taking their children to  
3 playgrounds and that every child including in  
4 particular the smallest children will be safe when  
5 doing so. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
7 Council Member Rodriguez.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.  
9 Thank you, Speaker for all your support. As someone  
10 that, as I said before in these past four years I've  
11 been able to be prime or co-prime to close to 50  
12 bills. I can say that it never happened in my first  
13 10. Today, I would like to speak about Intro 1658  
14 that will require the Administration to report to  
15 the Council every year for all the installation of  
16 sidewalk bollards throughout the city. You know, it  
17 doesn't make sense that we have so many bollards, as  
18 they should, in front of Bank of America at Sixth  
19 Avenue and 42<sup>nd</sup> Street, but there's no pedestrian  
20 bollards protecting the theaters at 42<sup>nd</sup> between 7<sup>th</sup>  
21 and 8<sup>th</sup>. In the same place where terrorists killed  
22 eight people there were pedestrian bollards in the  
23 other side of the street, but not in the area where  
24 the cyclists were using those lanes. So, today we  
25 are voting to mandate DOT to provide every year a

2 report to the Council on where are we installing  
3 those bollards so that we can have a better policy  
4 to plan to install bollards in any arear, in any  
5 sidewalk that we have high volume of pedestrians and  
6 cyclists. I also would like to speak about  
7 Introduction 1036-A, and I would like to thank the  
8 Public Advocate for also being a partner. It will  
9 require—this law will require the Mayor or an agency  
10 designed by the Mayor to conduct an analysis of  
11 vacant properties in New York City. What I hope is  
12 that New York City will be using every single vacant  
13 land to build 100% affordable housing, but we need  
14 to know where do we have those vacant lands.

15 [Speaking Spanish] [bell] Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Gracias. Council  
17 Member Salamanca.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you,  
19 Madam Public Advocate. Today, I speak in support of  
20 Intro 182 and it's lead sponsor Council Member  
21 Ritchie Torres who has worked diligently to fight to  
22 bring this bill to the floor, creating what I  
23 believe will bring greater accountability from our  
24 police officers, the that I and many in my  
25 communities like mine believe is needed. I stand

2 strongly beside my colleague Council Member Torres  
3 and to say that many of the unfounded attacks that  
4 have been leveraged against Council Member Torres  
5 recently regarding this bill including from members  
6 of this body are preposterous and shameful. No one—  
7 no one can second guess Council Member Torres'  
8 leadership as a progressive leader for the city and  
9 someone who will always stand up for the people of  
10 our beloved Bronx. Council Member Torres  
11 understands the plights of the impoverished. He  
12 understands the importance of creating positive  
13 community and police relations and needed police  
14 accountability. And finally, certainly more than  
15 most in this Chamber, he understands what it's like  
16 to be a young black and Latino man unfairly profiled  
17 just because of his color and age. So, the basis of  
18 attacks against Council Member Torres should not go  
19 unanswered, and the grandstanding that's happening—  
20 that has happened in the past few days should not  
21 stand in the way of incremental changes that will  
22 help thousands of New Yorkers across the city  
23 notably those of color. Enough is enough and with  
24 that said, I urge my colleagues to support Intro 182

2 sponsored by Council Member and my brother Ritchie  
3 Torres. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. That  
5 concludes General Order. [background comments]  
6 Council Member Barron.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam  
8 Public Advocate. I just want to speak briefly about  
9 182-D. For years, for decades the activists, the  
10 advocates, the victims, the family of the victims  
11 who have been subjected to police brutality and  
12 organizations have indicated that there's a problem.  
13 This problem is one that the advocates brought to a  
14 representative of this body asking that person to  
15 bring their issue forward. The issue that was  
16 brought forward at that time was one that was widely  
17 supported by members in this body. When there was  
18 some resistance, there were certain members  
19 including myself who said, Listen, this is stuck.  
20 We need to get it to the floor and I among others  
21 signed for a motion to discharge for what the bill  
22 was at that time. The bill that we have now is not  
23 the bill that the persons who came forward as the  
24 voice in this issue want to have on the record, and  
25 I cannot see how we can go forward and bring this

2 bill for a vote. When we talked about it was  
3 extracted from the Community Safety Act because it  
4 had not yet gotten there, we could keep it here  
5 still until we can get it to the point where it  
6 addresses and includes Level 1 offenses because that  
7 certainly is one of the areas where we talked about  
8 black and Latino communities being  
9 disproportionately involved in that. So, based on  
10 the fact of my having been involved in these kinds  
11 of issues for more than 55 years, I think that we  
12 need to move forward in terms of making this  
13 holistic and including all of that. So, with that,  
14 I will not be voting in favor of this bill, and I'll  
15 have further comments when I make my vote. Thank  
16 you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
18 Council Member Johnson.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam  
20 Public Advocate. [coughs] I just want to mention  
21 to colleagues that today we're voting on  
22 Introduction 1619, which is a bill that's going to  
23 protect runaway homeless youth in New York City.  
24 They are some of the most vulnerable New Yorkers,  
25 and during this holiday season, which is a very

2 difficult time for them, I want to just highlight  
3 the work that this Council and this Administration  
4 has done for Runaway and Homeless Youth. This is  
5 one of the most difficult times of the year for them  
6 because of familiar rejection, parental rejection,  
7 the holidays. It's very, very difficult. In the  
8 package of bills we're passing today with Council  
9 Member Salamanca and my bill looks to protect these  
10 young people even further. I also want to add that  
11 I'm extremely proud of Council Member Reynoso, and  
12 I'm extremely proud of Council Member Torres. I  
13 know there are disagreements. I know there is  
14 disappointment, but I also know that there is good  
15 intention on all sides here. I respect their  
16 character. I respect their integrity, and I respect  
17 how they negotiated these bills, and I look forward  
18 to voting in favor of them. Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
20 Council Member Greenfield.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you  
22 very much. I'm mindful of the clock and the fact  
23 that I'd like to make some thorough (sic) remarks  
24 earlier, I just wanted to first note that we are  
25 hopefully going to be passing 38 pieces of

2 legislation today. Spending a lot of time on one  
3 particular piece, but I do want to acknowledge folks  
4 have asked about that. I think deadlines are a good  
5 thing and the end of the year was coming, and there  
6 were a lot of great things that we wanted to do, and  
7 I want to congratulate all of my colleagues who are  
8 passing bills here today. I also wanted to thank  
9 the staff. They literally have worked night and day  
10 over the last few weeks to get all of this done and  
11 to wrangle us all together. It was quite  
12 challenging over the last 48 hours to be at multiple  
13 committees at once, but I think we pulled it off.  
14 And so I want to thank them as well. I want to say  
15 I—I think it's great and a true testament to this  
16 body that we can have robust and respectful debate  
17 on issues, and I think that's what you're seeing  
18 happening here today, and I admire that. And I did  
19 just want to take a moment considering I'm only  
20 going to have two minutes later just to thank my  
21 recent staff who worked with me specifically. I  
22 want to thank Danny Paulson who is my Chief of  
23 Staff, Elena Sytcheva who's my Council, Ben Segal my  
24 Deputy Chief of Staff, and I want to thank folks who  
25 were with me in the last year, Seth Campagna and

2 Steven Snowder and Becky Stern and Fannie Lynn who  
3 does my schedule and Eva Kachi, who is my District  
4 Director and Guy Lee Fulmer who is a Constituent  
5 Services Rep and Yule Schoenfeld who does  
6 Constituent Services and Dave Kenser (sp?) who does  
7 my communications. I think all of us here recognize  
8 that we're just one person, and it really is thanks  
9 to our personal staff, our district staff and the  
10 amazing central staff that we're able to get things  
11 done, and I wanted to just take a moment and  
12 acknowledge that and, of course, yesterday I thanked  
13 the incredible Land Use staff that I've had the  
14 privilege of working with for the last four years as  
15 the chair as well. So thank you all, and you'll hear  
16 my other two minutes in a little bit.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Any  
18 others? Seeing none, Report of Special Committees.

19 CLERK: None.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Report of  
21 Standing Committees.

22 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Aging  
23 Intro 1185-A, information to users of life  
24 sustaining equipment.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
3 coupled on General Orders.

4 CLERK: Intro 1616-A, Post Incarceration  
5 Reentry for older adults.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
7 coupled on General Orders.

8 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Civil  
9 Rights, Intro 804-A reasonable accommodations.

10 Amended and coupled on General Orders.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO:

12 CLERK: Intro 1012-A New York City Human  
13 Rights Law.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
15 coupled on General Orders.

16 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Civil  
17 Service and Labor Intro 1399-A Employee Work  
18 Schedule.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
20 coupled on General Orders.

21 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
22 Economic Development, Intro 1615-A, Subcon-  
23 Subcontractor Guide.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
25 coupled on General Orders.

2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
3 Education Intro 1497-A, Students in Temporary  
4 Housing.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
6 coupled on General Orders.

7 CLERK: Intro 1604-A Gender Pronoun  
8 Information.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
10 coupled on General Orders.

11 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
12 Environmental Protection, Intro 54-A, City Ferries.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
14 coupled on General Orders.

15 CLERK: Intro 717-A, Idling Infractions.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
17 coupled on General Orders.

18 CLERK: Intro 880-A, Biodiesel Fuel in  
19 School Buses.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
21 coupled on General Orders.

22 CLERK: Intro 978-D, Mold Abatement.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
24 coupled on General Orders.

2 CLERK: Intros 1629-A and 1632-A, Energy  
3 Efficiency for certain buildings.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
5 coupled on General Orders.

6 CLERK: Intro 1653-B, Noise Complaints.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
8 coupled on General Orders.

9 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
10 Finance, Preconsidered Reso 1780-A, Organization  
11 Funding.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
13 General Orders.

14 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 834 and Reso  
15 1785, Tax Exemption.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
17 General Orders.

18 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
19 General Welfare, Intro 572-A, Shelter Census Data.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
21 coupled on General Orders.

22 CLERK: Intro 855-B, Public Assistance  
23 Eligibility.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
25 coupled on General Orders.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

107

2 CLERK: Intro 1577-A, Client Information  
3 Management Systems.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
5 coupled on General Orders.

6 CLERK: Intro 1714-A, Educational  
7 Continuity.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
9 coupled on General Orders.

10 CLERK: Intro 1739-A, Domestic Violence  
11 Emergency Shelters.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
13 coupled--Amended and coupled on General Orders.

14 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
15 Housing and Buildings, Intro 385-C, Indoor Allergy  
16 and Hazards.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
18 coupled on General Orders.

19 CLERK: Amended and coupled on General  
20 Orders.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Intro 1009-A,  
22 Report of Registered Property Owners.

23 CLERK:

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
25 coupled on General Orders.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 108

2 CLERK: Intro 1015-A, Housing Portal.

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
4 coupled on General Orders.

5 CLERK: Intros 1036-A and 1039-A, Vacant  
6 Properties.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
8 coupled on General Orders.

9 CLERK: Intro 1120-A, Foundation Work.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
11 coupled on General Orders.

12 CLERK: Intro 1269-A, Community Land  
13 Trusts.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
15 coupled on General Orders.

16 CLERK: Intro 1419-A, Construction Site  
17 Safety Violations.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
19 coupled on General Orders.

20 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land  
21 Use, LU 512 and Reso 1786, Affordable Housing.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
23 General Orders.

24 CLERK: LU 797 and Reso 1787, Tax  
25 Exemption.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 109

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled to be  
3 filed pursuant to letter of withdrawal.

4 CLERK: LU 816 and Reso 1788, Property  
5 Tax Exemption.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
7 General Orders.

8 CLERK: LU 831 and Reso 1789, Landmark  
9 Designation.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
11 General Orders.

12 CLERK: LU 832 and Reso 1790 and LU 833  
13 and Reso 1791, Tax Exemptions.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
15 General Orders.

16 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Parks  
17 and Recreation, Intro 1466, Clean Park Playground  
18 Equipment.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
20 General Orders.

21 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Public  
22 Safety, Intro 182-D, Officer Identification.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Intro 182-D. I'm  
24 sorry. Amended and coupled on General Orders.

25 CLERK: Intro 541-C, Consent Searchers.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 110

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
3 coupled on General Orders.

4 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Small  
5 Business, Intro 1499-A, Penalty Mitigation Program.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
7 coupled on General Orders.

8 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
9 Transportation, Intro 1397-A, Opening of a Protected  
10 Street.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
12 coupled on General Orders.

13 CLERK: Intro 1658-A, Installation of  
14 Bollards.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
16 coupled on General Orders.

17 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Youth  
18 Services, Intros 1619-A and 1705-A, Runaway Youth.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
20 coupled on General Orders.

21 CLERK: On the General Order Calendar,  
22 Intro 1465-A, Use of Residual Fuel Oil.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
24 coupled on General Orders.

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 111

2 CLERK: Intro 1486-A, Department of  
3 Education Reports.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
5 coupled on General Orders.

6 CLERK: LU 828 and Reso 1768, and LU 829  
7 and Reso 1769, Property Tax Exemptions.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
9 General Orders.

10 CLERK: LU 800 and Reso 1792 and LU 801  
11 and Reso 1793, Lafayette Avenue Rezoning.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
13 General Orders.

14 CLERK: LU 802 and Reso 1794 through LU  
15 804 and Reso 1796 on the next page, 1776 East  
16 Chester Road Rezoning.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
18 General Orders.

19 CLERK: LU 805 and Reso 1797 through LU  
20 807 and Reso 1799, National Black Theater Zoning  
21 Amendment.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
23 General Orders.

24 CLERK: LU 817 and Reso 1800, Subservice  
25 Storage Facilities.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
3 General Orders.

4 CLERK: Resolution Appointing Various  
5 Persons Commissioner of Deeds.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
7 General Orders, and I ask for a roll call on—a roll  
8 call vote on all items on today's General Order  
9 Calendar.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Beginning with  
11 Alejandro's daddy, Council Member Reynoso.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I proudly vote  
13 aye on all, and thank you to Speaker Melissa Mark-  
14 Viverito and all our veteran colleagues. Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The next person  
16 to vote is Council Member Lancman.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Thank you. I  
18 apologize for leaving early, but I need to  
19 participate in a judicial swearing in ceremony back  
20 in Queens. To all my departing colleagues, all the  
21 best. I especially want to thank the speaker for  
22 giving me the opportunity to chair the committee  
23 that I chair and I hope that she's found out  
24 collaboration is meaningful and worthwhile as—as I  
25

2 have. With that, I vote aye on all except Intro  
3 1419. I vote nay on that.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
5 Vallone.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you, Madam  
7 Advocate. I vote aye on all with the exception of  
8 182 and 541. Merry Christmas, Happy Holidays and  
9 God Speed everyone.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
11 Dromm.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote aye on all.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
14 Rodriguez.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye on all.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Back to the  
17 general-to the order.

18 CLERK: Adams.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Permission to  
20 explain my vote?

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I sit here today-

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

24 [shushing for quiet]

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: --in conflict with  
3 a vote. You know, I live walking distance to where  
4 Sean Bell was murdered. Over the years I have come  
5 to know his parents. As a member of Community Board  
6 12 since 2009, the first vote that I said I, too,  
7 was a vote to rename a street Sean Bell Way. With  
8 Intro 182-D some say it goes too far. Some say it  
9 doesn't go far enough. I sit here today in support  
10 of the mothers. I sit here today in support of the  
11 families who have lost loved ones. I sit here today  
12 in support of those who are stopped needlessly  
13 because of the color of their skin, yes, I do  
14 respect my colleague. He is brilliant, but the bill  
15 doesn't go far enough for the mothers. It doesn't  
16 go far enough for the families. It doesn't go far  
17 enough for those that look like me. For that, I  
18 vote aye on all except Intro 182-D I vote no.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Continue.

20 CLERK: Barron.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to  
22 explain my vote.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

25 Congratulations on 541-C and then as it relates to

2 182-D. It has been substantially diminished from  
3 its original presentation at the time that I saw the  
4 form to the form that it now exists and is asking to  
5 be voted on. Some people say that what's lacking  
6 can be added later. We could do this little by  
7 little, but I would quote for you what Martin Luther  
8 King said.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
10 [shushing for quiet]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: For years I  
12 struggled with the idea of the reform of the  
13 structure of institutions in the South. A little  
14 change here a little change there. Now, I feel  
15 quite different. I think you have a lot—you have  
16 got to have a radical reconstruction of the entire  
17 system, a revolution of values. So, I'm not  
18 concerned that the culture that you might find in a  
19 police precinct is one that's motivated by love. I  
20 don't want them to be motivated by love. I want  
21 them to be constrained by the law, and I want them  
22 to follow the law. [applause]

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
24 down.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
3 [shushing for quiet] Quiet, please.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I want our  
5 children to not be subjected because there are still  
6 numerous stops for no reason. I see them in my  
7 community in East New York. So, now we're saying  
8 that those stops that children are subjected to on a  
9 daily basis don't get the dignity. Our witness was  
10 stopped two years ago where the cop stopped him. I  
11 said why did you stop that teenager and yanked him  
12 by the book bag, Oh, we were trained at the precinct  
13 that we can do that and we might find some  
14 contraband or some weapons. So, I say no. I don't  
15 want to be motivated by love. I want police to be  
16 constrained by the law, and just as the  
17 investigatory stops don't include the--nor does that  
18 include the provision for the card to be given, I  
19 think it's a major flaw. It should have been  
20 withdrawn I think, and I'm not making any kind of  
21 personal decisions about the sponsor or any of that,  
22 but it should have been withdrawn to make it fuller.  
23 So, for that, Madam Speaker, Madam Public Advocate--

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --I vote aye on  
3 all with the exception of 182-D and with the  
4 exception of Land Use 512.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

7 CLERK: Borelli.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I would like to  
9 wish the Speaker and my colleagues who are departing  
10 a farewell and good luck in the future, and for  
11 those of us who are returning, I'm looking forward  
12 to the more conservative Council [laughter] that--  
13 that honorable Mr. Torres so vividly depicted  
14 earlier today. I'll keep it short because my list  
15 of no's are quite long.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
17 [shushing for quiet] Quiet in the Chambers, please.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
19 down, please. Keep it down.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all  
21 except 182, 541, 385, 717, 804, 1012, 1015--

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
23 [shushing for quiet]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: --1013 or 1039.  
25 Excuse me. 1265, 1399, 1419, 1629, 1632--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: --1604, 1465,  
5 and Land Use 817 and I'll give you a list.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
7 [background comments, laughter]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
9 [shushing for quiet] Continuing on with the vote.  
10 Quiet please.

11 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
12 down, please.

13 CLERK: Cabrera.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Permission to  
15 explain my vote.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. Please,  
17 please there's a lot of bills. We need to make sure  
18 we get the vote correct.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Council Member  
20 Borelli, I think you have a record for the no's  
21 today. First, I want to wish the Speaker and  
22 departing colleagues, I wish you truly the best.  
23 The smiley is the future smiling at you. You had  
24 truly served this city. What a privilege literally  
25 to be one of the 51. I was just talking to Council

2 Member Mealy that we truly do have a position of  
3 privilege to be here and to work with you alongside  
4 with you, especially if I constitute (sp?) those in  
5 the Bronx as well. Council Member Palma, thank you  
6 for being the dean of delegation. You led us well.  
7 Council Member Vacca, thank you for all your advice  
8 when I first came in, for all the ladies right here  
9 in the row I'm going to truly miss you. Your-your  
10 advice was-and your-and your example and all the  
11 talks and support has been amazing and Council  
12 Members on the other side like Dan Garodnick and  
13 Julissa-Ferreras, and David-David Greenfield. I  
14 just wanted to mention you all because you do  
15 matter. You do matter in what you have done here.  
16 It truly matters. I vote no on Intro 182-D and  
17 Intro 541-C and vote aye on the rest. Thank you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 CLERK: Chin.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to  
21 explain my vote?

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. First,  
24 I wanted to congratulate and thank our Speaker  
25 Melissa Mark-Viverito for a successful and historic

2 four years as our leader in the City Council.  
3 Together this Council passed more pieces of  
4 legislation than any other, many of which have made  
5 the city more progressive, more livable, and more  
6 just for all New Yorkers. Under the leadership of  
7 our Finance Chair, Council Member Julissa Ferreras-  
8 Copeland, we have achieved a new level of  
9 transparency on our budget process. One of that has  
10 encouraged unprecedented engagement with Community  
11 based organizations that do such good work for our  
12 city. Whether it's pushing for more funding for a  
13 growing number of seniors, jobs for our youth or  
14 critical support for caregivers—

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
16 [shushing for quiet]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --these fierce and  
18 wonderful women have show us all what leadership  
19 looks like and they will be missed. As I look  
20 towards the next four years as a member of this  
21 great body, I must point to the fact that we will  
22 enter the new term with few number—fewer woman as  
23 members, just eleven total in the City Council.  
24 While I'm excited to welcome new woman colleagues  
25 who are strong fighters for their communities, this

2 city is home to more than 50% women. We must work  
3 together to ensure that women have an equal seat at  
4 the table and that the Council of the greatest city  
5 in the world reflects the wonderful diversity that  
6 is its greatest Strength. So, to all my departing  
7 colleagues, especially to my sister Rosie Mendez and  
8 all of you—

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
10 [shushing for quiet]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --thank you so much  
12 for your service to the city.

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
14 down, please.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: It's been an honor  
16 and privilege to serve alongside all of you, and I  
17 wish all a wonderful holiday and a happy and healthy  
18 New Year. I have to abstain on 182-D and I will  
19 vote aye on all. Thank you.

20 CLERK: [pause] Cohen.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you. I'm  
22 going to vote no on 541-C and I'm going to vote yes  
23 on all other items on the General Orders Calendar.  
24 Thank you.

25 CLERK: Constantinides.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Madam  
3 Public Advocate, may I be allowed to briefly explain  
4 my vote?

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I really  
7 want to thank and congratulate our Speaker and wish  
8 her well, for her myriad of accomplishments. When  
9 New York City is talked about as an environmental  
10 global leader, it's because of her leadership. So,  
11 I really want to thank Melissa Mark-Viverito for  
12 being an environmental Champion, and someone whose  
13 fought to make our city greener and more  
14 sustainable. And to all my colleagues who are  
15 leaving office today it's been an honor and  
16 privilege to work with you all. Thank you for your  
17 leadership and friendship and being the great  
18 leaders of New York City, and I really want to thank  
19 my first boss in the City Council, Council Member  
20 Darlene Mealy who hired me as a Legislative  
21 Director, 11-1/2 years ago and so I really  
22 appreciate you giving me the opportunity to enter  
23 this body and-and be, you know, work in this  
24 institution and-and give me the opportunity. So,  
25 thank you very much Council Member Mealy for your-

2 the opportunity, and I wish you all the best. Thank  
3 you. [background comments]

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Who would have  
5 knew that? Hm. [pause]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Oh, aye  
7 on all. [laughter]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: My  
10 apologies.

11 CLERK: Cornegy.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Madam Speaker,  
13 permission to explain my vote?

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: So, to all my  
16 colleagues who I've had the pleasure of working for  
17 the last four years in particular and especially the  
18 Speaker, I thank you for the Chairmanship of the  
19 Small Business. I just want to point out, though,  
20 that under your leadership I want to thank you for  
21 increasing minority employment in the Council and  
22 sometimes doubling the numbers that we had before we  
23 came in. I think that that's important and  
24 something to look forward to building on. So, I

2 want to vote no on 182-D, no on LU-Land Use 817 and  
3 Reso 1800, and aye on all the rest.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Crowley.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Madam Public  
7 Advocate, if I could have a minute?

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you.  
10 Today is my last stated meeting as a New York City  
11 Council Member. I want to thank the speaker for her  
12 leadership, and my colleagues for their continued  
13 friendship and support. I want to thank my staff  
14 who has been so dedicated and has gone above and  
15 beyond to meet all the demands of the office. The  
16 last nine years have been some of the most rewarding  
17 and fulfilling of my entire life. I want to thank  
18 the communities that I represent for both believing  
19 in me and for the good work that we did together to  
20 improve our city. I remain committed to public  
21 service and whatever the future holds, I will bring  
22 the same passion and dedication to fighting for our  
23 city that I brought to my work as a Council Member.  
24 Thank you to you also Madam Public Advocate--

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: --and I vote aye  
3 on all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Congratulations  
6 to both of my colleagues who have the Right to Know  
7 Act, Antonio Reynoso and Ritchie Torres and best of  
8 luck to all of my colleagues over the next four  
9 years and to those who are serving their last year  
10 this year. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 CLERK: Cumbo.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to  
14 explain my vote?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I want  
17 to begin by thanking Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito  
18 as Co-Chair of the Women's Caucus as well as the  
19 Chair of the Women's Issues Committee. You have  
20 changed the dynamics of how we see women throughout  
21 city politics, and because of you, women all over  
22 the city and this nation and the world are going to  
23 know what they can aspire to be. So, for that, I  
24 thank you. You have been an incredible speaker.  
25 Your legacy is going to be one that is going to

2 inspire people for generations to come. The Young  
3 Women's Initiative is something that I'm  
4 particularly proud of as it's a perfect example of  
5 the way your leadership has made a difference for  
6 New Yorkers everywhere. When we talk about more  
7 women in office, this is something that we all have  
8 to champion, men and women because our voice is so  
9 critical, and for us four years from now in 2021, we  
10 want to see at least 21 women sitting in these  
11 seats, and we're not going to stop until we make  
12 that happen. To the women that are leaving us we  
13 are so proud of you. Council Member Ferreras-  
14 Copeland, you've been an incredible Chair of the  
15 Finance Committee, a leader for women on the  
16 menstrual equality act, incredibly progressive  
17 budgets that put women's needs front in center. As  
18 I said earlier, you taught me how to have a baby,  
19 run for office, do a land use deal and look fabulous  
20 all at the same time. [laughter] I thank you for  
21 that. [cheers/applause] Council Member Mealy you  
22 have been an incredible leader, labor routes, a  
23 trailblazer for women in the labor movement coming  
24 from TWU. You took that experience into the Council  
25 and fought for priorities like the living wage and

2 prevailing wage protection for workers. You have  
3 successfully beat off challenges for the last 12  
4 years, and for that, I celebrate you and I'm going  
5 to miss you, and I look forward to continuing to  
6 work with you. Council Member Mendez, you have  
7 chaired the Women's Caucus, Black, Latino and Asian  
8 Caucus and LGBT Caucus. You are a legend as it  
9 pertains to women's issues and the fight for LGBT  
10 equality. You have continued to put in safeguards  
11 such as the asthma protection bill and many other --

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
13 Council Member, can you bring your comments to a  
14 close?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I'm coming to a  
16 close on these dynamic women [laughter] dynamic  
17 Public Advocate Letitia James. [cheers/applause]

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs] Well,  
19 keep going, honey. No. [laughter]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member  
21 Crowley, you have been an incredible chair of the  
22 Women's Caucus advocating for greater gender equity-  
23 -

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
25 Council Member, please.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: --at the FDNY and  
3 outstanding leadership on closing Rikers Island, and  
4 when you're ready to get back on the saddle, we're  
5 going to saddle up with my baby and knock doors for  
6 you. [laughter] Council Member Palma, you have rose  
7 from so many challenges to become a leader  
8 representing equity, women's rights and responsive  
9 government. Coming from a labor organizer at 1199,  
10 you are a mom, a wife and so many things. You've  
11 been on this journey with me. You have organized  
12 workers and let walk-outs over unfair working  
13 conditions. You are awesome. I proudly vote aye  
14 and we are going to fill these seats in 2021 with  
15 dynamic women just like you. [cheers/applause] To  
16 all my sisters, I vote aye.

17 CLERK: Deutsch.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you, could  
19 I get four minutes, too?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Are you going to--  
21 are you going to clap it up for women?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yeah.  
23 [laughter] Permission to explain my vote.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shush.  
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Permission to  
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, at first, I  
6 was considering to—to vote in favor of 182 for  
7 officers to distribute business cards, but honestly  
8 at that time I thought they were PBA cards. So,  
9 since then I changed my vote, but that's a joke.  
10 [laughter] I vote no on 182, 1604 and 541. Thank  
11 you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughing]  
13 Continuing.

14 CLERK: Espinal.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote aye.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We love you.

17 [laughs]

18 CLERK: Eugene.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye except  
20 on Intro 182-D, I abstain.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND:

24 Permission to explain my vote.

25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, Council  
3 Member.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: To my  
5 parents, their unquestionable trust and faith in me  
6 made me the confident offensive woman I am today. I  
7 thank you, Mom. You're just-mom, my desire to help  
8 others comes from you. Thank you for showing me  
9 that the most important quality that a leader should  
10 always be compassionate empathy. To my husband,  
11 thank you for supporting me throughout the years  
12 even when we were in different states, but guess  
13 what baby, I'm coming home tonight. [cheers/  
14 applause] To my son Julian you are my greatest  
15 achievement and my biggest inspiration. To my staff  
16 past and present thank you. I am who I am because  
17 of you. To our wonderful Director Latonia McKinney,  
18 four budgets wasn't enough. I wish we could have  
19 had more time together. To Mayor de Blasio, we work  
20 together to make New York a more welcoming and  
21 progressive city and I am proud of our  
22 accomplishment and forever grateful for your  
23 friendship. To our Speaker [Speaking Spanish] thank  
24 you for your leadership and support. Thank you for  
25 your amazing—for this amazing opportunity you gave

2 me to serve as your Finance Chair. To my fellow  
3 members, I have enjoyed working with each one of you  
4 in this Council. Success is a result of our work  
5 together, our accomplishments together and now the  
6 end is near and so I face the final curtain.  
7 Regrets I've had a few, but then again too few to  
8 mention. I did what I had to do and saw it through  
9 without exemption. I planned each chartered course,  
10 each careful step along the byway, and more, much  
11 more than this, I did it my way. [cheers/applause]  
12 [background comments] I vote aye.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs] She did  
14 it my way.

15 CLERK: Garodnick.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

17 CLERK: Gentile.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: May I have  
19 briefly explain my vote?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. What song  
21 are going to sing. [laughter]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Let me just say  
23 as I finish with my last vote that it has taken me  
24 14 years to get my diploma and graduate from the  
25 City Council [laughter] but, I-I-I've done it slowly

2 over 14 years because this is an amazing place. As  
3 shown by today's meeting, this is an amazing place  
4 that does amazing things and has amazing people in  
5 it both members and staff. So, I am so pleased and  
6 honored to be part of this Council. Madam Speaker,  
7 thank you for your confidence in me, and everything  
8 you've done for me over the years, and we were  
9 together when--when many other weren't in the last  
10 Council in the last mayoral election, but certainly  
11 I want to thank all of you, wish you the best and I  
12 will stay in touch. I'm not sure what I'm doing,  
13 but I will stay in touch, and it's almost--looking  
14 over 14 years is almost as if we just got started,  
15 and before you know it, comes the time to say so  
16 long, and with that, I will vote aye on all.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay, Carol  
18 Burnett. [laughter]

19 CLERK: Gibson.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to  
21 explain my vote?

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam  
24 Public Advocate, and certainly I want to join all of  
25 my colleagues in congratulating and wishing all the

2 very best to all of our outgoing members, to our  
3 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, it's been an honor  
4 and a privilege to work with you so many issues of  
5 importance to every New Yorkers. You and I are both  
6 graduates from the Baruch College School of Public  
7 Affairs, and you are the first to run for office,  
8 and I am the second, and you have been a roll model  
9 and a champion and a woman who rocks. So, it's been  
10 an honor working with you and I wish you all the  
11 best. And to all of our colleagues who are leaving,  
12 Council Member Vinny Gentile, Darlene Mealy,  
13 Elizabeth Crowley, David Greenfield, Jimmy Vacca,  
14 Dan Garodnick, Julissa Ferreras-Copeland, Rosie  
15 Mendez and Annabel Palma. Thank you for serving  
16 your districts so well and the city of New York. I  
17 wish God's Speed and continued blessings to each and  
18 every one you. Colleagues, thank you. To the  
19 members of the Public Safety Committee, it's been an  
20 honor to serve as your chair, the first woman and  
21 the first person of color, and while I am the first,  
22 I should not be the last. We have worked together  
23 on the Criminal Justice Reform Act, crisis  
24 management work, anti-gun violence, alternatives to  
25 incarceration. We have done our best to make young

2 black and Latino men and women success stories and  
3 not statistics. Summer youth, all year-round youth  
4 employment program I am so proud of this Council.

5 To my public safety team to Deepa--

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
7 [shushing for quiet]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --to Beth, Casey  
9 and Steve. Thank you. To Ramon, to Laura, and  
10 Latonya and all of my district office staff I am so  
11 proud to work with you. To the Women's Caucus, what  
12 we lack in quantity, we make up in quality, and I  
13 look forward to work with all of my colleagues.  
14 Congratulations to every member who has passed  
15 significant legislation today. I especially want to  
16 recognize Council Members Reynoso and Torres for  
17 staying true to their word, for keeping the faith  
18 and standing firm in your values and your  
19 principles.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
21 Council Member--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: It is my honor to  
23 work with you and I vote aye on all. Happy Holidays  
24 to all of my colleagues. May God bless you and keep  
25 you.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Greenfield.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you and  
7 happy holidays as well. Madam Public Advocate, may I  
8 have a couple of minutes to say farewell?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Two.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Two. Okay.

11 [laughter] Okay, I will take it. You know, I was  
12 thinking how do you sum up eight years in two  
13 minutes? So, I'm going to share a story, but I-I  
14 don't think I've actually ever shared it before.  
15 Fifteen years ago my wife and I went on our  
16 honeymoon. We went to Italy. It was very nice. As  
17 luck would have it on Shabbat we were staying in a  
18 hotel and we bumped into some folks who were from  
19 Inwood and the community, and one of them came over  
20 to me, and at the time I was working behind the  
21 scenes and one of them came over to me and said, you  
22 know, some of us elders (sic) can be terminated in  
23 seven years. You should really think about running  
24 for City Council, and I laughed and I actually said  
25 to my wife I that's ridiculous. Why would I want to

2 do that? And I'll tell what's interesting is we  
3 have a saying in Yiddish it's called: *Mentsh planz*  
4 *aun Got lafs*, which means that, Man plans and God  
5 laughs, and eight years ago when I came in if you  
6 would have told me that I was leaving in eight years  
7 to run one of the largest Jewish Charities in the  
8 New York, I would have laughed as well. And the  
9 reason for that is that Ramon Martinez can tell you  
10 then I came into the City Council I thought I was  
11 going to change the world. And I really did believe  
12 this and I think a lot of us believe it and what the  
13 Council really taught me and Ramon helped teach me  
14 this as well is that it's not about changing the  
15 world. It's really about helping people. It's the  
16 people in our district. It's our friends, our  
17 neighbors, the people that we're never even going to  
18 meet, and quite frankly, it was the people in this  
19 Council who I never would have met who taught me  
20 those lessons as well. When Laurie Cumbo, who I've  
21 sat next to for the last four years, when she told  
22 me that she was expecting it was like my sister that  
23 I never had was expecting. When Julissa told me  
24 that she was leaving to spend time with her family,  
25 I was so happy for her and for Aaron and for Julian.

2 I was really—I came to tears. When my friend Matteo  
3 told me of the loss of his father, it actually moved  
4 me and I rushed out to Staten Island to be there at  
5 the wake because I felt a closeness to him. Jumaane  
6 Williams when he lost his intestines—intestines and  
7 God know I don't know how the heck he did that, but  
8 when he lost his intestines, I went to visit him in  
9 the hospital because who would I kibbutz and debate  
10 with about race and policy in the members lounge?  
11 All of this really came from the people that work  
12 here in the City Council. [bell] And finally, I  
13 just want to state that Melissa taught me the value  
14 of her homeland, the value of Puerto Rico. I was  
15 proud to partner with her to raise funds for the  
16 relief effort. I didn't think we would raise over  
17 \$100,000 but we did and that was something I learned  
18 from her as well. I want to thank all of my  
19 colleagues. I want to thank all of the amazing  
20 staff Raju and Amy, Ramon, Joey and Joe, Latonia,  
21 and Nathan and Paul and my former Chiefs of staff  
22 Danny Pearlstein and Janey Carey. And I just want  
23 to say that this is really—

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
25 Council Member--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER -this is really-I'm  
3 wrapping up, ten seconds.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: This is  
6 really an amazing place. The people of New York  
7 City if they knew how much time and effort and  
8 passion and commitment and devotion that the people  
9 of this body had for the people of New York, they  
10 would be proud and I am proud as well, and with  
11 that, I will conclude by voting no on 541-C, yes on  
12 182-D and yes on all the other items on the agenda.  
13 Thank you and very happy holidays and a happy  
14 Hanukkah to my constituents who gave me this  
15 amazing opportunity. Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I didn't lose  
18 all of my intestines.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Intestines, huh?  
20 [laughter] That's a new one. [laughter]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I lost about  
22 eight inches but not all of them.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: That will ever go  
24 down in the annals of history. [laughter]

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I swear I  
3 still don't understand what happened.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
5 [shushing for quiet] Continuing the roll call.

6 CLERK: Grodenchik.

7 [background comments, laughter]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Madam Public  
9 Advocate.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: May I follow  
12 my distinguished colleague from Brooklyn and explain  
13 my vote?

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you so  
16 much. To my colleagues who are leaving the Council.  
17 I can promise you that there is life after  
18 government and politics. I've been there. I've done  
19 it. I've come back more. You will find that there  
20 is life after politics. It's a been an honor and a  
21 pleasure to serve with each and every one of you and  
22 Madam Speaker, I want to thank you for your many  
23 kindnesses to me personally and for your leadership  
24 here in this Council. To my colleague Ritchie  
25 Torres, your eloquence and your gentle good nature

2 will take you very far in this life, and don't give  
3 in. Never give in. To my partner in the Garodnick,  
4 Grodenchik Caucus, Dan Garodnick [laughter] please  
5 be assured I will continue to fight the good fight  
6 for our caucus once I figure out exactly what it  
7 does. [laughter] And finally to all, I leave you  
8 with the words of my dear Uncle Julius a blessed  
9 memory. He was the first born of our family in the  
10 new world. He was a gentle soul, a teacher, a  
11 graduate of Columbia University when it was not easy  
12 for a Jewish person to get into that school. He was  
13 also a Bronx person through and through and a  
14 published author and a poet. His words as we  
15 approach a new year: "Thought picking friends makes  
16 a wonderful thesis, don't overdue the job and pick  
17 them to pieces." With that, I wish you all a merry  
18 Christmas, a happy New York and with that I vote aye  
19 on all except Intros 182-D and 541-C. Thank you for  
20 indulging me, Madam Public Advocate, and may I say  
21 you look absolutely marvelous up there.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oh, thank you.  
23 Thank you so much. He's the only one that's  
24 mentioned me. Thank you. [laughter]

25 CLERK: Johnson.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I want to thank  
3 Public Advocate Letitia James. [laughter] No,  
4 thank you, Madam Public Advocate. I want to just  
5 say the thing I'm most proud of over the last four  
6 years, and each one of us come here with our unique  
7 life experiences that brought us into the madness of  
8 running for office, and serving in this body. Each  
9 one of us have faced adversities, and challenges,  
10 and for me I'm sitting in the same seat. I don't  
11 think it's the exact same seat, but the same exact  
12 Council seat as Tom Duane who served in this Council  
13 as the first openly gay member of this body. Was  
14 the first openly HIV Positive elected official in  
15 the United States of America, came out about his HIV  
16 status in 1991 at the height of the HIV and AIDS  
17 epidemic when there were on drugs and Protease  
18 Inhibitors, when gay men were dying in droves when  
19 it was called GRID and not AIDS. He won in the  
20 early '90s as an openly gay, openly HIV Positive  
21 man, and today I am here in the same seat as an  
22 openly gay, openly HIV Positive man. I am here  
23 because of the people that came before me.  
24 Christine Quinn and Tom Duane and Larry Cramer and  
25 Audrey Lord and Michael Cowan and all the folks that

2 laid the foundation for all of us LGBTQ members to  
3 be in the Council today. And the thing I am most  
4 proud of is the over \$40 million we have gotten to  
5 end the epidemic in New York City. Two weeks ago  
6 the Health Department announced HIV—new HIV  
7 infections are at the lowest level ever recorded in  
8 the history of HIV and AIDS and Melissa Mark-  
9 Viverito deserves an enormous amount of credit.  
10 She has been a champion, a staunch ally and a  
11 supporter to the HIV and AIDS community and to me  
12 when I have come to her on these issues I am proud  
13 of her speakership, and I am proud of all the  
14 members that I have served with. Happy holidays and  
15 I vote aye on all.

16 CLERK: Kallos.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to us  
18 into double overtime after 5:00? [laughter] Two  
19 minutes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: On the Right to  
21 Know Act I'm an attorney and the Fourth Amendment  
22 matters to me. I carry it in my pocket along with  
23 the Bill of Rights, and on a purely academic level,  
24 it's interesting that folks who would want to  
25 protect the Fifth Amendment with Miranda Rights

2 because we see it on TV where the Fifth Amendment  
3 provides no such protections, and the Fourth  
4 Amendment, which is arguably stronger, doesn't. And  
5 that is just from an academic level why this package  
6 is so important. The next piece is just if you grow  
7 up in the City of New York, as I did, and you go to  
8 high school in the Bronx, as I did, you're going to  
9 get stopped and searched against your consent, and  
10 that—that is just a lived experience for myself and  
11 so very many New Yorkers. And it's part of why I  
12 fought so very hard for this legislation both with  
13 my colleagues asking folks to sign onto the bill and  
14 being fairly forceful with the sponsors about being  
15 aggressive as possible to make sure we got it done.  
16 I've received all sorts of pushback including from  
17 the Mayor Office, but I continue to stand strong for  
18 it, and after everything we've done, it would be  
19 hard to vote against it. I understand that there's  
20 a lot left to do, and I'm committed to getting it  
21 done next year. I also just wanted to take a moment  
22 to say that some people say they are progressives,  
23 but some people actually act like it, and that is  
24 most Melissa Mark-Viverito who passed rules reforms  
25 and actually followed them. Eliminated LULUs, made

2 the body full-time. It's been member driven or a  
3 place that people who are independent like me are  
4 able to still get things done. Time and time again,  
5 the Speaker has stood up for residents over special  
6 interests, and the big question has always been is  
7 this good policy. No one is like you, Melissa, and  
8 no one will be able to replace you. I vote aye on  
9 all.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 [coughs]

12 CLERK: King.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I just want to say  
14 congratulations to everyone who has passed  
15 legislation over the last four years and done all  
16 they've done to improve the lives of all of us here  
17 in the City of New York. It's been a pleasure and  
18 congratulations to all of those who are starting a  
19 new chapter in their lives, and I will be voting yes  
20 on all and abstaining from 1604-A and 182.

21 CLERK: Koo.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Madam Public  
23 Advocate, I will save my remarks for future  
24 meetings. [laughter] I will vote aye on all except  
25 541.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
3 [shushing for quiet] Thank you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you for  
6 that.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, and I  
8 want to wish everyone a happy holidays, and all the  
9 Council Members, and all the central staff, and all  
10 of us.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Happy holidays to  
12 you, too.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: And everyone, yeah.  
14 Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, sir.

16 CLERK: Koslowitz.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank you.

18 May I please be excused to explain my vote?

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, Council  
20 Member.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I want to  
22 thank our Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito for the last  
23 four years on a great job. I also look forward to  
24 seeing the Public Advocate for the next four years  
25 facing us during Council meetings.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oh, thank you.

3 [laughter]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I also want to  
5 address my colleagues who are leaving who are term  
6 limited. I know what it feels like to be term  
7 limited, but four years from now you can return.

8 [laughter] [cheers/applause] I waited eight, but  
9 here I am and I have another four years. So, to all  
10 of you good luck and as I walk out the door in four  
11 years, I look forward to seeing some of you walk in  
12 the door in four years. Thank you and have a great  
13 holiday.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

15 CLERK: Lander.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request  
17 permission to explain my vote?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam  
20 Public Advocate. To Annabel, Dan, Darlene, David,  
21 Jimmy, Julissa, Liz, Rosie and Vinny, I have learned  
22 from you, been inspired by you, argued with you, had  
23 you plastic bags on my door, but nothing in them.  
24 To be clear, the roomers that they contained  
25 Jumaane's intestines are entirely false [laughter]

2 and grown a lot from working with you. Really,  
3 deepest thanks for our friendships, which have grown  
4 and for your service to our city, which has been  
5 powerful. Melissa, it has been an extraordinary  
6 privilege to serve in this Council under your  
7 speakership thanks in very large part to your  
8 leadership. We are on a path to close Rikers. We  
9 are setting the model nationally for what a  
10 sanctuary city looks like for a right to counsel for  
11 low-income tenants facing eviction, for a fair work  
12 week, for fast food and retail workers, protections  
13 against freelancers against getting stiffed. The  
14 largest participatory budgeting program in North  
15 America except for Paris and we're going to catch  
16 them. Comprehensive reform that have made the body  
17 more fair, effective and transparent in a way that  
18 has served us extraordinarily well this term, and I  
19 believe will carry us strongly into the future.  
20 Unlike some others, I hope it's an even more  
21 progressive Council next term, but whatever comes  
22 next this one has been extraordinary. Thank you.  
23 With that, I vote aye on all with the exception of  
24 Intro 182-D on which I vote no.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 [coughs]

4 CLERK: Koslowitz.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 [background comments]

8 CLERK: Levin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to  
10 explain my vote.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam  
13 Public Advocate. I want to also acknowledge our  
14 great colleagues who are leaving the Council this  
15 being their last stated meeting. Darlene Mealy who  
16 is one of the most extraordinary negotiators that I  
17 know who has done such an amazing job for her  
18 constituents over these last 12 years. Darlene,  
19 congratulations. I wish you all the best. Jimmy  
20 Vacca who has brought so much Joy to this job. I-I-  
21 I know of nobody else that takes whatever that he's  
22 working on with that it occupies—it could be the  
23 most—whatever it is, it's the most important thing,  
24 and—and Jimmy you've just been an inspiration to  
25

2 everybody that's worked with you. Dan Garodnick is  
3 such a wealth of ideas, and has taken-

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
7 down please.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: --every issue with  
9 plumbing the depths to make sure that this city is  
10 working for every single resident of New York City.  
11 David Greenfield who is one of the most brilliant  
12 people I've had the opportunity to serve with.  
13 David Greenfield has-is always striving to make sure  
14 that-that everybody gets the services that they  
15 deserve. Julissa Ferreras-Copeland led this Finance  
16 Committee and this amazing finance staff through  
17 four of the most progressive budgets that this has  
18 ever seen and maybe will ever see.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
20 [shushing for quiet]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So, Julissa, thank  
22 you. Rosie Mendez.

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
24 down, please.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Rosie, you have  
3 been like a big sister to me since before I was a  
4 Council Member. I think you'll continue to be a  
5 like a big sister to me, and just your commitment  
6 even just in the last couple of days to the  
7 legislation that you've advanced over the years has  
8 been totally inspiring. Thank you. Liz Crowley,  
9 who is amazingly courageous and took stands that may  
10 have cost her politically, but have—have—will—will  
11 stand the test of time as major courageous stands.  
12 Thank you, Liz. Vinny Gentile whose love of  
13 Brooklyn has been evident every single day that he  
14 has been in this job. Thank you Vinny. Annabel  
15 Palma who really is the heart and soul of this  
16 council, and Annabel since I first met you, you have  
17 continued to be an inspiration. I wish you all the  
18 luck in the future. I can't wait to work with you  
19 when you're with the Administration, but really  
20 truly the heart and soul of this council, and last—  
21 last but not least, Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito  
22 who has been such an amazing steward of this body  
23 and as an institution, we have grown and become more  
24 democratic and stronger under leadership, and I want  
25 to thank you and wish you all the best and with

2 that, I vote aye on all. Happy holidays to  
3 everybody. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Levine.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Madam Public  
7 Advocate, permission to briefly explain my vote?

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Alright, well,  
10 I'll be voting aye on all today including Intro-

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
12 [shushing for quiet]

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
14 down please.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please.

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
17 down or take it outside.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: --including Intro  
20 182, and I have to say that the remarks offered by  
21 Council Member Torres earlier were the most eloquent  
22 and powerful I've heard on the floor of this body,  
23 and I want to thank him for a bill, which will help  
24 thousands of constituents in my district and New  
25 Yorkers around the city ensure that their rights are

2 protected in the midst of encounters with police.

3 I'm just so proud of what this body has accomplished

4 over the past four years under the leadership of our

5 incredible Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito who's rock

6 solid commitment to social and economic justice

7 never waivered. Who made this term the most

8 productive in history and whose openness and

9 fairness made this an incredible time to be a

10 Council Member, and I want to thank the other nine

11 colleagues whose last stated is today. Unlike

12 Laurie, if it's okay, I'm going to have pity on the

13 men and include them as well, and I'll start with

14 Dan and thank him for being an unfailingly-

15 unfailingly thoughtful and insightful voice. Thank

16 you Rosie for your passion and for your

17 fearlessness. Thank you, David, for applying your

18 searing intellect to the cause of making the city a

19 better place and for destroying the low-carb diet of

20 all of us on every Jewish holiday. Thank you Vinny

21 for never being afraid to fight for the causes you

22 believe in. Thank you, Annabel for your commitment

23 to the people so often left behind in the city.

24 Thank you Julissa for being an inspiring model of a

25 strong and passionate and effective leader. Thank

2 you, Darlene for your friendship, for your inspiring  
3 life story and for nurturing young Costa  
4 Constantinides into the great leader that he is  
5 today. Thank you Elizabeth for never backing down  
6 from a fight no matter the odds, and thank you Jimmy  
7 for never hesitating to say the one thing everyone  
8 else in this room was thinking, but didn't have the  
9 guts to say. [laughter] I will miss all of you  
10 terribly and I look forward to many years of  
11 friendship and partnership with you, and wish you  
12 all the best. Thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

14 CLERK: Maisel.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: In favor of all  
16 except no on 182-D and 541-C.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 CLERK: Mealy.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: May I explain my  
20 vote?

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I just want to  
23 vote no on Intro 182-D, aye on all. I just want to  
24 thank all my previous co-leaders of the Brooklyn  
25

2 Delegation, Martin Deman, Public Advocate Tish  
3 James--

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
5 Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: --David  
7 Greenfield, Carlos Menchaca, and the one I must say  
8 Mark Treyger for--for supporting me even when I'm not  
9 here or here and giving me the encouragement to go  
10 further. I want to thank you so much. I want to  
11 thank Annabel Palma for keeping me off the edge at  
12 times. I just want to thank Mark-Viverito for all  
13 that she have done as our Speaker. I want to thank  
14 the Woman's Caucus, Laurie Cumbo a fearless woman.  
15 I want to thank Elizabeth Crowley who was co-leader  
16 in our Woman's Caucus. I want to thank Helen  
17 Rosenthal for doing--passing the torch onto us, and I  
18 want to thank all the ladies in this Caucus, Karen  
19 Koslowitz, Annabel Palma, Debbie Rose, Rosie  
20 Martinez, Margaret Chin, Inez Barron--

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
22 [shushing for quiet]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: --warrior, our  
24 achiever warrior. I want to thank Vanessa Gibson of  
25 Bronx for all that you do, and I just want to let

2 everyone know I must say being an elected official I  
3 never in my wildest dreams thought I would become an  
4 elected official. Sometimes I even pinch myself.  
5 Only by the goodness of God that I am here today,  
6 and I am glad that I'm not a politician. I am a  
7 servant of the people, and I thank Costa  
8 Constantinides for all that he have done with her,  
9 and we have to go back and reach that and bring  
10 young people into this body, because we need new  
11 vision. We need new strong vision for this and not  
12 all conservatives. I want to thank—all the things  
13 that I've done in Brownsville, Imagination  
14 Playground the second in the world, the historic  
15 land use of Stone Avenue Library, the first  
16 children's library in the world in Brownsville, and  
17 I want to thank all the things I've done in  
18 Breevoort (sp?) State of the Art, and one thing I  
19 want all my colleagues who are leaving to know, my  
20 motto is: The best is yet to come, and I'm  
21 Councilwoman Darlene Mealy. [laughter] [background  
22 comments]

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,  
24 Council Member. Please be mindful that we still

2 have two resolutions to vote for those who are  
3 leaving. We need to meet—maintain a quorum.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] And  
5 to our Public Advocate.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you so  
7 much, Council Member.

8 CLERK: Menchaca.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to  
10 explain my vote?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 CLERK: I want to thank Speaker Melissa  
13 Mark-Viverito and her entire staff for the work that  
14 we've done together. The work that we've done  
15 around sanctuary cities out of the beautiful honor  
16 of being the chair of the Immigration Committee has  
17 been something I'll never forget. I don't think  
18 that we'll have this kind of alignment when you  
19 include our incredible Finance Chair Julissa  
20 Ferreras-Copeland. When we three got together, and  
21 decided that something was going to happen, it  
22 happened from adult literacy at the highest levels  
23 we've seen in recent history over a \$12 million  
24 initiative to really commit to our adults who need  
25 education.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --to the  
5 incredible public defender program NYFUP. We-we did  
6 it. We did it together, and I cannot wait to  
7 continue to do that in-in that spirit in the next  
8 term. Thank you to all the members who are termed  
9 out, for your incredible service to this community.  
10 You have left a wake for us, and all of you from the  
11 Speaker to-to all of the members will leave us with  
12 a lot of to do for this next term. But we have done  
13 a lot already, and I want to say that one of the  
14 things that I'm lifting up today is the concept of  
15 participatory democracy. When we put our people in  
16 our districts first, beautiful thing happens. This--  
17 these last four budgets have been passed with a lot  
18 more in the millions of dollars of participatory  
19 budgeting project, the most we've ever seen and I  
20 hope we can continue to grow that. Each of these  
21 projects means that somebody in our community was  
22 connected to it, and also legislation--

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
24 [shushing for quiet]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --legislation  
3 that was born and grown out of our districts is  
4 important to me because those people who are right  
5 now thinking about the work that is important in  
6 their neighborhood on their block in their schools  
7 will one day become future Council Members and we  
8 will have an incredible diverse especially with more  
9 women in this council. And so I want to thank  
10 Ritchie Torres and Antonio Reynoso who have pushed  
11 this work together in the Right to Know Act, but I  
12 will voting no on 182-D and aye on the rest. Thank  
13 you.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

15 CLERK: Mendez.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you. I'd  
17 like to say a few thank yous. I want to say when I  
18 first entered the Council there were 21 women.  
19 We're going to be going down to 11, but also with my  
20 departure we now will have no out Lesbians in the  
21 Council. [background comments] In order to  
22 summarize my 12 years, all I want to do is say thank  
23 you to my staff. I am only as good as you are, and  
24 I have to say names. Thank you Vanessa Diaz Lopez,  
25 Lisa Kaplan, Shiela Rodriguez, Greg Taylor, Chris

2 LaBarge, Jasmine Torres, Carlina Rivera, Matt Giano,  
3 a Alta Aloveria, Iraq Sohoski, Silica Galvez Malan,  
4 Jasmine Askew (sp?), Michael Schweinberg (sp?)  
5 Alicia Martin, Tricia Ramsharik, Georgian Chris,  
6 John Felt, Darrio Quinset, Jorge Jaminez, Michelle  
7 Burger, Rose Marie Diaz, Victoria Herbus, Kate  
8 Mikuliak, Jessica Nopomiachi and Barbara Sherman.

9 Thank you for your years of service to Council  
10 District 2. I want to thank the BLAC Caucus staff  
11 that I worked with, Alex Riashum Ahakam (sp?) and  
12 Susanna Davis and my then Public Housing Committee  
13 staff Baaba Halm and Ben Goodman. Thank you is not  
14 enough for your service to my district to my  
15 community and to this city. Thank you very much.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, Rosie.  
17 [pause] Council Member Mendez, how do you vote?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you. I'd  
19 like to vote no on 182-D and yes on all the rest.  
20 Thank you very much, Madam Public Advocate.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Palma.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Madam Public  
24 Advocate, permission to explain my vote.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I want to take  
3 this moment to recognize all my colleagues former  
4 and current who I have had the privilege and-and  
5 honor to serve with. You all have been-worked with  
6 knowledge, support, your compassion and-and your  
7 commitment and the commitment that you bring to this  
8 body has always inspired me, and has always made  
9 this job a little bit easier to do. I want to thank  
10 my-the staff that I've had Team Palma. So, I'd like  
11 to refer to them. My former Chief of Staff has  
12 joined me here today and Maria Salazar. I want to  
13 thank her for taking time out to come to what is now  
14 my last Stated Council meeting as a member, but my  
15 entire staff: Avi, Tonya, Jason, Kenny, Sharee.  
16 Without you guys, we are not able to do the work  
17 that we do, but I'm all-I think you and I met twelve  
18 years ago. Well, not I think. I know we met 12  
19 years ago under very a very distressed situation  
20 [laughs] and I-I want to say that the friendship  
21 that we have developed I will take with me for the  
22 rest of my life, and-and you will forever be part of  
23 my life and forever be part of someone that I will  
24 call for advice when I see myself in a certain  
25 situation. The Bronx Delegation has been my system

2 in the Bronx. I thank each and every one of the  
3 members that have served with me previously and—and  
4 today. Vanessa, thank you for always stepping in  
5 when I needed someone to—to co-chair, to chair the—  
6 the meeting for me. You've never hesitated as any  
7 of the members did. Ritchie, stay goals, stay  
8 strong. I am so proud of you today for the pieces  
9 of legislation that you're voting but most proud for  
10 your stance for not letting anybody rock your  
11 foundation, and for know that at the end of the day  
12 when you go to sleep today, your conscience will be  
13 clear in knowing that you did the right thing. You  
14 make me proud, my brother, and lastly, I just want  
15 to say thank you to my loving husband who's here  
16 with me for being my rock, for being most of all my  
17 sounding board when a lot of things in this place  
18 didn't go the way I thought they would. You—you  
19 were there to give me a sound voice. Thank you so  
20 much for your support, and thank you to the people  
21 of District 18 who had the courage to—and I say  
22 courage and I don't mean that lightly, but courage  
23 sort of like me, four times to the City Council. I  
24 thank you for the privilege. Thank you. I vote  
25 aye.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 [applause]

4 CLERK: Perkins.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you, Madam  
6 Public Advocate and to my colleagues, it's great to  
7 be back at the City Council.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. [laughter]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: And I—I want to  
10 vote aye on all with the exception of Intro 182-D. I  
11 vote no.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank  
13 you.

14 CLERK: Richards.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to  
16 explain my vote?

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alrighty. I  
19 will not be long, but I—I just want to pick up where  
20 I left off in saying that, you know, we're having a  
21 debate about giving a card to people who are—who are  
22 stopped, and I don't think that this is earth  
23 shattering. I think--I have faith in our Police  
24 Department and the men and women in the Police  
25 Department that they would be able to give the

2 people a card. We're not talking about anything  
3 earth shattering. So with that, I vote no on 182.  
4 I also want to give a ton of credit to Council  
5 Member Ritchie Torres, who I-I call the Donovan  
6 Richards of the Bronx [laughter] Because he's  
7 endured an immense amount of attacks from both  
8 allies and enemies alike while he's worked  
9 honestly—honestly and diligently to negotiate the  
10 best bill he could deliver for the residents of New  
11 York City and I want to add to the statement and  
12 then say may we save our attacks for the very system  
13 that resists reforms and not our allies in the  
14 struggle. I'll move on and say we're passing self-  
15 storage today, which has certainly been overlooked,  
16 and some work around that. I want to thank all of  
17 the individuals who—who worked on this issue,  
18 Industrial Jobs Coalition, Raju Mann, Brian Paul and  
19 all of our colleagues who worked in the IBZ  
20 Coalition, ANHD. We are making good on our first  
21 promise in the industrial Action Plan by preserving  
22 good paying jobs for high skilled workers who are  
23 mostly from communities of color that have a lack of  
24 access to high paying job opportunities or adequate  
25 education. And one of the best parts about this

2 offer as well is that we are also empowering members  
3 to have more control over the projects that get  
4 built in their districts. So, with that being said,  
5 I vote aye on everything except 182. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thanks.

7 CLERK: Rose.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to  
9 explain my vote?

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I've always  
12 supported comprehensive police reform--

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
14 [shushing for quiet]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: --that protects the  
16 civil rights of all New Yorkers--

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Please  
18 keep t down.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: --while ensuring  
20 that the public is safe and that police officers can  
21 do their jobs effectively. These are common goals  
22 shared by almost all New Yorkers, and I believe  
23 today's Right to Consent bill brings us closer to  
24 these goals. The final version of Intro 182-D,  
25 however, is not something I can vote for today.

2 While I support its principles, and its intentions  
3 of supporters—of the sponsors, after close reading  
4 of the bill and conversations with constituents and  
5 advocates, I believe it is better to start this  
6 conversation in the next term. I look forward to  
7 continue to work with my colleagues to what our  
8 shared goal of public safety and civil rights for  
9 all. I want to commend Council Member Torres for  
10 his tenacity and courage, and my vote today is not  
11 personal. It's emotional. I cannot in all good  
12 conscience vote for this being the home district of  
13 the death of Eric Garner and it still hasn't been  
14 resolved. So, I'd like to also say it's been an  
15 honor and privilege to having served—to having  
16 served with my departing colleagues. I want to  
17 thank you all for making this the most productive  
18 Council in the City Council history, and to Speaker  
19 Melissa Mark-Viverito you have left and indelible  
20 blueprint, and I will miss you, and with that I vote  
21 aye on all except Intro 182-D.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

23 CLERK: Rosenthal.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I proudly vote  
3 aye on all. Madam Speaker—Madam Public Advocate,  
4 can I explain my vote?

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay. Listen,  
7 I respect those in my district who have called  
8 asking me to vote no on 182-D, but I'm very proud to  
9 stand with Council Member Torres, and thank him for  
10 all of his hard work and the work that he's done I  
11 believe to move the ball forward. I think that your  
12 analysis of the situation is spot on. I think you  
13 have the long view in mind. I think that what this  
14 will do is begin to make the PD feel very  
15 comfortable about what you're asking them to do, and  
16 with much admiration for getting the Administration  
17 on board. And as you say, much admiration to the  
18 Speaker for starting the negotiations in good faith.  
19 I'm just—I learned from you everyday, colleague and,  
20 you know, your wisdom I think will prevail in this  
21 one, and I thank you for that. It's so sad to see  
22 my female colleagues go. Yes, my male colleagues,  
23 too, but mostly my female colleagues. I've learned  
24 from all of you and, you know, hope that some of you  
25 run for office again in 2021 just move somewhere

2 else of something and come back. You've been  
3 incredibly inspirational, and especially, of course,  
4 to Council Member Melissa Mark-Viverito who's been  
5 an extraordinary speaker and has set the bar high  
6 for whichever male follows her. Thank you so much.

7 CLERK: Salamanca.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I proudly vote  
9 aye on all. Thank you.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 CLERK: Torres. [pause]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Permission to  
13 explain my vote?

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I'm going to miss  
16 all of my colleagues who are leaving, but I-I do  
17 want to note that I would not be where I am today,  
18 but for Council Member Jimmy Vacca who is one of the  
19 most honorable and decent public servants I know.  
20 Jimmy, I'm speaking about you. [laughter]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I wanted to be  
22 here to listen to this.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Even when—even  
24 when he disagrees with you, he has a way of  
25 disarming people with his sense of humor. The Jimmy

2 Vacca Comedy Hour is the highlight of leadership  
3 meetings. [laughter] And there's no public servant  
4 to whom I owe a greater debt than Council Member  
5 Jimmy Vacca. The first campaign for which I ever  
6 worked was Jimmy Vacca's 2005 campaign for the City  
7 Council. The first legislative office in which I  
8 ever worked was the Office of Council Member Jimmy  
9 Vacca. The first speech I ever gave was delivered  
10 at Jimmy Vacca's inauguration in 2006. I was an  
11 anxious 16-year-old speaking in front of 700 people.  
12 To say that Jimmy has had a profound influence on my  
13 life is an understatement. He has dedicated nearly  
14 four decades of his life to public service. He  
15 spent 26 years as a District Manager for Community  
16 Board 10 in the East Bronx, and in 12 years in the  
17 New York City Council, and as a District Manager he  
18 was such a force of nature that he earned a profile  
19 in the New York Times. The title of the New York  
20 Times article reads: *James Vacca: The King of*  
21 *Clean*. The article begins with the following  
22 passage: Spotting an abandoned car on a Pelham Bay  
23 side street, James Vacca stomps on the brake, whips  
24 out a pen and scribbles the location and license  
25 number on a take-takeout menu. Later, driving

2 solely through a housing project in Throggs Neck,  
3 his normally cheerful face looks chagrined as he  
4 sees candy wrappers and newspaper flutter along the  
5 sidewalks. Jimmy Vacca, the District Manager of  
6 Community Board quickly assures the passenger: My  
7 streets are 90% clean. The article continues. Not  
8 too long ago, he says he saw a man toss a cup from a  
9 car. Mr. Vacca tapped on the window and hurled the  
10 cup back inside. [laughter] Excuse me. You've lost  
11 something. [laughter] That moment—that moment is  
12 Vintage Vacca. If I could have just 30 more.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Sure.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Early in the  
15 week, I was touring the Urban Assembly School for  
16 Wildlife Conservation where the tragic stabbing took  
17 place, and toward the end of the tour the principal  
18 asked me, How did you enter politics? And I replied  
19 I actually went into politics at the urging of my  
20 high school principal Robert Leader who at the time  
21 was the longest serving principal in the public  
22 school system. The principal then said, Robert  
23 Leader is a legend, and I replied, Robert Leader  
24 introduced me to then District Manager and now  
25 Council Member Jimmy Vacca, and that principal said,

2 Jimmy Vacca is another legend. And it struck me at  
3 that very moment how blessed I have been. How  
4 blessed my life has been by the guidance and  
5 generosity of legendary public servants from Robert  
6 Leader to Jimmy Vacca. Jimmy, I will miss you  
7 dearly. I love you like family and I will forever  
8 be proud to be an alumnus in the Jimmy Vacca School  
9 of Public Service. Thank you for serving the City  
10 of New York and thank you for mentoring those or us  
11 who proudly carry your mantle long after your  
12 service in this body. Thank you, Jimmy.

13 [cheers/applause]

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Eloquent.  
15 [background comments] Continuing on with roll call,  
16 Jimmy Mac.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Oh, oh. I  
18 definitely—I want to be clear. I might be the  
19 deciding vote. So, I definitely vote [laughter] for  
20 all including Intro 182-D. Thank you.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excellent. Thank  
22 you.

23 CLERK: Treyger.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Why do I have to  
25 follow Ritchie Torres?

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Rules reform  
4 change. [laughter] Public Advocate may I please be  
5 excused to explain my vote?

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I would like to  
8 congratulate all of my colleagues who are passing  
9 bills today, and to extend my gratitude to Speaker  
10 Melissa Mark-Viverito who led us through an  
11 incredibly productive Council session-

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
13 [shushing for quiet]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: --the leadership  
15 on immigrant rights including expanding language  
16 access and improving police-community relations has  
17 made an indelible mark on our city. She also helped  
18 create the recovery and resiliency committee and  
19 some folks question what could that committee do?  
20 Well, thanks to my Speaker and my colleague Ritchie  
21 Torres, we had the first hearing ever in a NYCHA  
22 complex in Coney Island. We secured \$3 billion for  
23 NYCHA from FEMA. That is a victory we could all be  
24 very-very proud of. I'd like to particularly also

25

2 congratulate Council Members Ritchie Torres and  
3 Antonio Reynoso—

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: --on the passage  
7 of the Right to Know Act, which constitutes a  
8 significant step forward in further  
9 professionalizing and restructuring encounters  
10 between police and civilians. I am grateful to  
11 Council Member Reynoso for working with me to  
12 strengthen the language access requirements in the  
13 bill to ensure that Right to Know is universal  
14 regardless of English language proficiency. I'm  
15 equally grateful to Council Member Ritchie Torres,  
16 whose steady advocacy convinced me of the pressing  
17 importance of these reforms, and while I appreciate  
18 many advocates' concerns about the scope of 182  
19 including advocates for victims of sexual harassment  
20 and assault, I firmly believe that this bill is a  
21 step in the right direction towards increasing  
22 transparency and police encounters. As with many of  
23 our efforts to undo systemic issues in our society,  
24 which were built up over decades, these bills are  
25 imperfect, but they are not the end of this body's

2 dedication to criminal justice reform. In this  
3 Council—in this Council and in the previous Council  
4 we as a body have been committed to pursuing  
5 criminal justice reform. In the next Council I am  
6 confident that we'll continue to engage in serious  
7 dialogue about the issues of public safety that will  
8 work to implement innovative policies that advance  
9 justice and equality for New Yorkers. I just want  
10 to also give a shout out to some of the members who  
11 are leaving, my dynamic colleagues Rosie Mendez, Dan  
12 Garodnick, our awesome and dynamic Speaker, whose  
13 had—whose had my back, Council Member Jimmy Vacca,  
14 Council Member Annabel Palma who is so  
15 compassionate, has a heart of gold and has the best  
16 recipe for Sofrito anywhere in New York. [laughter]  
17 Council—Council—the Chair of the Finance Committee  
18 Julissa Ferreras-Copeland, who has been so  
19 supportive including helping get Teacher's Choice to  
20 record levels. My courageous colleague Elizabeth  
21 Crowley, my awesome Co-Chair of the Brooklyn  
22 Delegation Darlene Mealy, and my—my—my—my colleague,  
23 my neighboring colleague—Actually both of my  
24 neighbors Vinny Gentile and David Greenfield are  
25 both leaving, but I'm still here in Southern

2 Brooklyn with Chaim Deutsch. With that, I vote aye  
3 on all. Thank you Public Advocate. [applause]

4 CLERK: Ulrich.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Okay, let's get  
6 this show on the road. [laughter] I'm voting yes on  
7 everything except Intro 1182-D--

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
9 [shushing for quiet]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: --385-C, 541-C  
11 and 1399-A, and a happy and a healthy New Year to  
12 everyone. Thank you very much.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Alright.

14 [background comments, pause]

15 CLERK: Vac-- [coughs] Excuse me,  
16 Vacca. [background comments]

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
18 [shushing for quiet]

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
20 down, please.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
22 Chambers, please. We're still in session.

23 [background comments] Council Member Vacca.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Yes, thank you. I  
25 can explain my vote.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May we have quiet  
3 in the Chambers, please.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
5 down, folks. We need to have it quiet.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
7 [shushing for quiet]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: It's very hard to  
9 fully respond or fully appreciate Councilman Torres'  
10 statement and his faith in me. I have been lucky  
11 over my life, and I'd have to thank my staff. I  
12 have to thank my daughter. I thank my daughter so  
13 much. For 12 years, I've had great people, and I've  
14 tried to mentor them and they have achieved  
15 fantastic heights all of them. We've worked  
16 together and we have disagreed and I we have been--  
17 I've encouraged that, and we've learned all together  
18 and seeing my staff grow has meant the world to me.  
19 Hearing Ritchie Torres speak today was an amazing  
20 moment of pride, and that I've made a contribution  
21 to that is just overwhelming to me. I want to thank  
22 everybody here. You know I love you all, and I do.  
23 I say that from my heart. I love you all. I'm in  
24 awe of this institution. I've been involved in  
25 government as Ritchie said. I don't know how many

2 of you know these stories. I've been involved since  
3 I'm 12 years old. I—I came to the steps because I  
4 was in the 8<sup>th</sup> Grade at Junior High School 101 and  
5 the buses never came. So, I went to an anti-MTA  
6 demonstration [cheers/applause] on the steps of City  
7 Hall, and I most take—I most times take the train  
8 here today, and I want you to know that not all  
9 demonstrations were successful [laughter] because we  
10 still have fighting to do, and I realize that very  
11 much. But, boy, do I value this institution. We  
12 have such a great body. We have a Chamber that  
13 every time walk in here I know I'm privileged. I'm  
14 a kid from the Bronx. I grew up in modest—modest  
15 means—with parents of modest means who did the world  
16 for me, and I've—I've loved giving back. I give  
17 back when these people walk in my office, and they  
18 don't know where to go, and they think that Jimmy  
19 Vacca knows where to get them. I'm so honored by  
20 that. I love them. When they yell at me, I hug  
21 them and I tell them it's going to be okay, and that  
22 has been my reward in life. So, God bless you all.  
23 I'm not going anywhere, and I'm going to be involved  
24 somehow, and—and I know that my life will continue  
25 to be full. So, God bless. [applause]

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I do--Ritchie, I  
5 love you, but I--I do vote no on 182-D [laughter]  
6 [cheers/applause]

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
8 [shushing for quiet]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I do vote no on  
10 182-D and 541 and 717 as well. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
12 [shushing for quiet] Thank you.

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
14 down, please.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Jimmy Mac, I'm  
16 going to miss him.

17 CLERK: Williams.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be  
19 excused to explain my vote?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

22 Just to finish my speech I was giving before, the  
23 advocates got us here. They're the reason that many  
24 of us are in leadership--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --and so to  
5 cast them aside now doesn't really make particular  
6 sense. When I was listing to the speeches on the  
7 Speaker rout, I heard many people say that movements  
8 are created not by elected officials, but by  
9 advocates, by activists. Yet, we're pushing them  
10 aside. Every advocacy group all of them, CPR, NAN,  
11 NWAACP, legal groups, Black and Latino law  
12 enforcement organizations.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
14 [shushing for quiet]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Everyone. Not  
16 just the crazy lefts, but everyone who helped bring  
17 us here. All the people we go to for cover, all the  
18 people we've asked for advice are against 182. Most  
19 importantly the families of the movement, the people  
20 who have lost people like Nicole Bell's and Sean  
21 Bell's mom, Eric Garner's mother, Ramarley Graham's  
22 mother and Anthony Biaz's mother, Delrawn Small's  
23 sister and family. All of them including the youth  
24 that were spoke about today--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --have asked us  
5 to vote no, not in opposition to Ritchie Torres, who  
6 I believe is very sincere and I congratulate what he  
7 did today and not take away that sincerity. But, so  
8 that when the tape is replayed we can say we stood  
9 with them when they stood with us, and that was what  
10 I wanted to complete. I do want to say just in the  
11 eight years I've been here, I called a lot of things  
12 generally not dishonest and generally not  
13 disrespectful. I have never been cut off. That was  
14 my most—I've felt the most disrespected in the eight  
15 years that I've been here simply because I follow  
16 the rules, and I have never pushed forward when  
17 asked not, but there seemed to be a mismatch in what  
18 the rules were here and who was allowed to speak  
19 further and who wasn't depending on what was—folks  
20 wanted to hear say. So, I felt personally  
21 disrespected. I am proud, however, to say that I'm  
22 been led by women in this body particularly the  
23 Public Advocate, Madam Speaker, the Finance Chair  
24 who all made history, and I would never do anything  
25 to disrespect any one of you. I think it's a great

2 day when we can look at this body and say we've  
3 accomplished so much in the years we've been here,  
4 and we've been led by women. Even though [bell] I  
5 have nuts in places, when come in the bird side view  
6 under the leadership that was present here, I think  
7 we've moved the city in the right direction. With  
8 that, I am going to vote aye on all with the  
9 exception of 182-D where I vote no, and Land Use  
10 802, 803, 804 and accompanying resos where I  
11 abstain.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 CLERK: Matteo.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Madam Public  
15 Advocate, may I be excused to explain my vote?

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: To my good friend  
18 Ritchie, Ritchie you pull out all the stops today,  
19 but you are going to give into Jimmy and you  
20 certainly are not going to give into me. [laughter]  
21 I want to begin by wishing my colleagues who are  
22 leaving all the best. I've been in this building for  
23 quite some time as a staff and now as an elected  
24 official. You all have a certain warm place in my  
25 heart to—I—I do want to mention to the Speaker we

2 certainly don't agree on a lot. Okay, we don't  
3 agree on much, but we have worked well together—

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: --on the things  
7 that we can agree with, and we've passed come good  
8 piece of legislation together. I thank you for  
9 that. I thank you for your friendship. I wish you  
10 nothing but the best. To my good friend David  
11 Greenfield on my left, you have been a great  
12 confidante and friend, and during my toughest time  
13 this year with dad, you—you certainly were there.  
14 Ill neve forget that, and I wish you nothing but the  
15 best. I think Mark Levine talked about Jimmy Vacca  
16 and—and what he says here. You should see him in  
17 Leadership. He really—we're going to miss you in  
18 Leadership and B&T. Jimmy, you have been such a  
19 great council member, such a great friend to me.  
20 You're going to do great in anything that you do.  
21 Please make sure that you keep in touch with all of  
22 us and we love you. To the rest of my colleagues,  
23 we wish you nothing but the best. I do want to  
24 thank all of my colleagues for—for—it was a tough  
25 year for me, and you're all there on a personal and

2 on a friendship level, and I thank you for that.  
3 Back to business, I have a lot of no votes. I'm  
4 going to vote no on 182-D-

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
6 [shushing for quiet]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: --385-C, 541-C,  
8 717-A, 804-A, 1012-A, 1015-A, 1039-A, 1269-A, 1399-  
9 A, 1419-A, 1465-A, 1604-A, 1622-1629-A, 1632-A,  
10 Land Use 817 and Reso 18--and Reso 1800. So, with  
11 that I will vote yes o the rest. I wish everybody a  
12 Merry Christmas, Happy Hanukkah, a safe and happy  
13 New York, and I will see the rest of my colleagues  
14 in January.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
16 Continuing.

17 CLERK: Van Bramer.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to  
19 explain my vote?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So, I wasn't  
22 expecting to say these remarks when I got up this  
23 morning, but I have to tell you that when I got up I  
24 was incredibly torn about this vote. But watching  
25 Ritchie Torres today at the Pre-State press

2 conference reminded me of something I had been  
3 thinking a lot about, and that is during the Speaker  
4 debates over the last couple of months, I've heard  
5 Corey Johnson talk about his depression as a young  
6 man. I've heard Ritchie Torres talk about his  
7 depression as a young man. I, too, have talked  
8 about that, and I've sat there some of those nights  
9 and remarking to myself how awful the homophobia  
10 that drove these three young men to those places.  
11 And as I watched Ritchie today at the Pre-Stated  
12 press conference defend himself, defend his  
13 positions, I very much identified with that young  
14 gay man who was trying to do something that he  
15 thought was right, and that he thought was best  
16 where there were lots of people pushing incredibly  
17 hard on him forcefully. In some cases unfairly  
18 because I believe that Council Member Torres wants  
19 the best result here, and wants justice and I  
20 thought where am I a much older gay man who's seen a  
21 lot more in this. Let me be clear, the bill is not  
22 all that I wish it was, and I wish it went further,  
23 but I want to stand with Council Member Torres, and  
24 I want to speak in favor of this piece of  
25 legislation, which is not all that we need but that

2 is a step forward. And while it is frustrating to  
3 some, I am not going to join the chorus of those  
4 attacking this young man. I want to support this  
5 today, support him today and then hope we can all  
6 come back and do something even more profound in the  
7 next Council. So, with that, I vote aye on all.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 [coughs]

10 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Again as we are  
12 taking our—our final votes for this session, I again  
13 just want to extend the deepest appreciation to all  
14 of the staff here, and at my district office. I'm  
15 very happy that we're joined by Diana Ayala who will  
16 be succeeding me to represent District 8, someone  
17 that I believe in, I reached out, I've mentored and  
18 thankfully she's—the same way I'm hearing the story  
19 of empowered mentorship of Ritchie with Jimmy, the  
20 importance of us taking the time to invest in the  
21 future generations and in the next—in the next  
22 generation of leadership. I have to say that today  
23 I've been extremely proud. I think that today has  
24 been a defining moment for my colleague Council  
25 Member Torres. I've seen a level of courage that is

2 exemplary. This is what to me leadership is about.  
3 That is what our job as legislators is that we  
4 evaluate, we are pushed yes by advocates. We are  
5 pushed by our experiences, but we look at a lens, a  
6 wider lens when we have to make decisions in this  
7 body and he took a tough decision and he knew—he  
8 knew that he was going to get knocked, and as many  
9 have mentioned, unfairly so. Anyone that would try  
10 to question his integrity or his reasons for  
11 arriving at that choice, really should do some self-  
12 reflection. This is a young man who truly and  
13 passionately believes in what it is that he stands  
14 up for, what he chooses to do, what direction he  
15 decides to take, and I'm proud of him today because  
16 I have seen a level of maturity also in being able  
17 to understand that it's not about going with which  
18 way the wind goes, it's about being principled in  
19 your decision, understanding that you may still be  
20 criticized. I'm really, really proud today in  
21 everything that's been said, and Ritchie, I consider  
22 you a friend. I hope that you can consider me a  
23 friend and a mentor. I can always be available to  
24 you, be a partner to you in all that we do, and  
25 again, I've tried to lead this body in the most

2 collegial way, and we're not going to agree every  
3 single time. I hope that when we close this chapter  
4 here today, that we can all fondly look at the work  
5 that we've accomplished and fondly look at the  
6 direction that we've taken this Council in, and I  
7 have no regrets. Again, thank you all as we take  
8 our final vote, and I know we have some other  
9 matters here, but the final vote, which I proudly  
10 vote aye on all.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. I,  
12 too, want to recognize and congratulate Council  
13 Member-Council Members Torres and Reynoso. They  
14 have both profiles in courage, and I want to thank  
15 the Speaker and all of the members of the Council  
16 for allowing me to Chair this body. It's been an  
17 honor and a privilege and I, too, want to say not  
18 goodbye, but I am confident that I will see them  
19 again, the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, Council  
20 Member Miller-Mealy, Gentile, Greenfield, Garodnick,  
21 Ferreras-Copeland, Vacca, Crowley, Mendez and Palma.  
22 When one door closes, another door will certainly  
23 open. All items on today's General Order Calendar  
24 were adopted by a vote of 50 in the affirmative, 0  
25 negative and 0 abstentions with the exception of

2 Intro 182-D, which was adopted by a vote of 27 in  
3 the affirmative-- [applause] I'm not finished.  
4 [laughter, background comments] 27 in the  
5 affirmative—I got six pages. 27 in the affirmative,  
6 20 negative and 3 abstentions, and Intro 541-C,  
7 which was adopted by a vote of 37 in the  
8 affirmative, 13 negative, and 0 abstentions;  
9 [cheers/applause] Ah-ah, I'm not finished. I'm not  
10 finished. [applause] Silencio. Thank you.

11 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
12 down, please.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And Intro 385-C,  
14 which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the  
15 affirmative, 3 negative and 0 abstentions, and Intro  
16 1419-A, which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the  
17 affirmative, 3 negative and 0 abstentions, and Land  
18 Use 512 and Resolution 1786, which was adopted by a  
19 vote of 49 in the affirmative, 1 negative and 0  
20 abstentions, and Land Use 817 and Resolution 1800—We  
21 are still in session.

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
23 down, please. Keep it down, please.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We're still in  
25 session. Which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the

2 affirmative, 3 negative and 0 abstentions and Intro  
3 717-A, which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the  
4 affirmative, 3 negative and 0 abstentions; and Intro  
5 804-A, which was adopted by a vote of 48 in the  
6 affirmative—

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
8 down, please.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: --2 negative and  
10 0 abstentions. Quiet in the Chambers, please. And  
11 Intro 10—and Intro 1012-A which was adopted by a  
12 vote of 48 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0  
13 abstentions; and Intro 1015-A, which was adopted by  
14 a vote of 48 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0  
15 abstentions and Intro 1039-A, which was adopted by a  
16 vote of 48 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0  
17 abstentions, and Intro 1269-A, which was adopted by  
18 a vote of 48 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0  
19 abstentions, and Intro 1399-A, which was adopted by  
20 a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 3 negative and 0  
21 abstentions, and Intro 1465-A, which was adopted by  
22 a vote of 48 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0  
23 abstentions, and 1604-A, which was adopted by a vote  
24 of 46 in the affirmative, 3 negative, and 1  
25 abstention, and Intro—

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
3 down, please. [shouting] Keep it down, please.  
4 Keep it down.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
6 [shushing for quiet]

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
8 down, please.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And Intro 1629-A,  
10 which was adopted by a vote of 48 in the  
11 affirmative, 2 negative and 0 abstentions, and Land  
12 Use 802, 803, 804 and accompanying resolutions,  
13 which was adopted by a vote of 49 in the  
14 affirmative, 0 abstentions and 1-0 negative and 1  
15 abstention. Excuse me, and that concludes the tally  
16 for today's vote. All items--

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
18 down, keep it down, please.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We still have  
20 resolutions to vote for. Can we please have quiet  
21 in the chambers? [background comments] I think  
22 that's it. Introduction and reading of bills.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: For what it's  
24 worth. I don't know how far it will go. Hold on.

2 All items have been referred to committee as  
3 indicated on the agenda.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet  
7 down, please. Quiet, please.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We're still in  
9 session. We still have resolutions. If you're  
10 exiting, please exit quietly. The first resolution  
11 is Resolution 792-A, a resolution establish-  
12 establishing January 30<sup>th</sup> annually as Fred T.  
13 Karamatsu, of Civil Liberties and the Constitution.  
14 Seeing no speakers, all of those in favor say aye.

15 COUNCIL MEMBERS: (in unison) Aye.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All those  
17 opposed. Any abstentions. The ayes have you-have  
18 it, and Resolution 1484-A, a resolution denouncing  
19 the termination [interposing] [shushing for quiet].

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
21 down, please.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: A resolution  
23 denouncing the termination of the DACA Program, and  
24 calling the state and federal government to extend  
25 protections for undocumented youth by passing the

2 New York State DREAM Act of 2017 as well as the  
3 Federal DREAM Act of 2017, and the speaker—the first  
4 speaker on that resolution will be Council Member  
5 Menchaca. We are still in session. [shushing for  
6 quiet]

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
8 down, please. Keep it down, please.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
10 Chambers as we now hear from Council Member  
11 Menchaca.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you so  
13 much, Public Advocate James. This has been a long  
14 year resistance in action, and I'm proud that our  
15 accomplishments have been so—of so many in our city,  
16 and I stand in solidarity with all the DREAMers of  
17 New York City and of our nation. Congress must pass  
18 a clean DREAM Act before the end of the year. The  
19 DREAMers, which include business leaders and—

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --al those who  
23 are supporting like elected officials and  
24 immigration advocates. We heard from you yesterday  
25 on the steps of City Hall, and dem—you demonstrated

2 how DREAMers mean—how much they mean to us and our  
3 communities. New York City has consistently  
4 demonstrated its full commitment to protecting  
5 immigrants. We passed legislation and set policies  
6 that forced the city agencies to protect personal  
7 data of all New Yorkers--

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
9 [shushing for quiet]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --empowered our  
11 Department of Education to keep ICE away from our  
12 school children, prohibited ICE agents from entering  
13 many city-owned buildings and properties and funded  
14 legal services, adult literacy programs, mental  
15 health and job service immigrants. I say pass the  
16 Clean Act—Clean DREAM Act now in Congress in the  
17 federal government and also pass the New York State  
18 DREAM Act of 2017. Justice must be served. Thank  
19 you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
21 Seeing no other speakers, all of those in favor of  
22 Resolution 1484-A say aye.

23 COUNCIL MEMBERS: (in unison) Aye.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All those  
25 opposed. Any abstentions? The ayes have it, and

2 General Discussion and the only—oh, two speakers.

3 Council Member Jumaane Williams whose mother is in  
4 the balcony. [background comments]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: My mother is in  
6 Grenada.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: She was there.  
8 [laughs]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: No, she's in  
10 Grenada. [background comments]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: You know I'm  
13 taking my time.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay, okay.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very  
16 much. Just for the advocates here, we should be—

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
18 down, please.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
20 [shushing for quiet]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Quiet. I do  
22 congratulate Ritchie Torres, but we got a long way  
23 on this in very—in just a few days. So, no one  
24 should leave here with their heads hung high. As I  
25 said, I do want to say that I'm proud of the

2 leadership that I was allowed because of this  
3 Speaker. I'm proud of being the Housing Chair. We  
4 got a lot done. Honestly, I was thinking we could  
5 get more, gut on a bird's eye view, we did a lot,  
6 and we want to say thank to Council Member Mendez,  
7 who was the first elected official to endorse me  
8 against an incumbent. So, I'm always so proud to  
9 have her. Ferreras-Copeland, Garodnick, Vacca,  
10 Palma, Greenfield, Mealy, Gentile, Crowley and the  
11 Speaker, and I-it's just been an incredible time  
12 with these folks. I really believe we've moved the  
13 needle forward. I want to thank the Housing and  
14 Buildings staff including Megan Chin, Jose Conde, Ed  
15 Atkin, Jim Wilcox, Sarah Gastelum, and formerly  
16 Guillermo Patino. Also, thank you, Ramon Martinez  
17 for helping-

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
19 [shushing for quiet]

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
21 down, please.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --move so many  
23 thing, and I think I helped push you sometimes, and  
24 Nick Smith who was stolen from me by the Mayor's  
25 Office. I am chasing some big dreams, but I don't

2 know where I'll be when I come back, but I really  
3 think in this Housing and Buildings Committee we did  
4 a fantastic job. Look, King disagreed with Malcom  
5 who disagreed with Farma who disagreed with Hamo,  
6 who disagreed with Randolph, who disagreed with  
7 King. They all were moving in the right direction.  
8 Tomorrow is another day. There will always be time  
9 for discussion. There will always be time for  
10 debate. When we come back next session I know we'll  
11 be ready to move forward in the legacies that we  
12 were able to do today, and I say than you all. God  
13 bless everyone. See you on the flip side.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
15 Mendez.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you, Madam  
17 Public Advocate. When thanking all of my current  
18 and former staff, I left out someone that the office  
19 always calls the favorite, my current Director of  
20 Communications--

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
22 [shushing for quiet]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: --John Blasco.  
24 So, I apologize, John--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: --and I'm going  
5 to take the moment to thank Annabel Palma and Felix  
6 for letting me officiate their wedding, and to may  
7 sister Margaret Chin and my brother Dan Garodnick,  
8 thank you for being more than colleagues, and always  
9 being there for me, and thank you, Madam Public  
10 Advocate.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, and I  
12 would be remiss if not to give my regards and my  
13 sympathy to the former Assembly Member Roger Green  
14 on the loss of his mother, Theopia Green, as well as  
15 the Kirkland Family and Council Member--no, no? Oh,  
16 Treyger. [laughs]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,  
18 Public Advocate. Public Advocate, I-I rise today as  
19 well. Our city needs more common sense legislation.  
20 I'm proud to work with my colleagues Council Member  
21 Adams and--and Levine on Legislation Intro 1836 to  
22 building positive police community relations.  
23 Today, I've introduced a bill that would make sure  
24 all of our police precincts have social workers  
25 stationed at the precinct 24 hours a day, 7 days a

2 week. Police precincts don't have the resources to  
3 help individuals with their social emotional needs.  
4 This bill would help make sure that no one's needs  
5 would fall through the cracks. My bill again,  
6 Council-co-sponsored by Council Member Adams and  
7 Levine, would also provide valuable resources to  
8 police precincts that allow officers to focus more  
9 on energy-on law enforcement rather than entangling  
10 complex social issues and navigating bureaucracy.  
11 Thank you so much for your time. I'm very happy and  
12 blessed. Happy-Merry Christmas, Happy Hanukkah,  
13 Happy Kwanzaa, Festivus and a happy and healthy to  
14 my colleagues. Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, and  
16 continue to pray for Council Member Domenic Recchia  
17 on the death of his mother as well, and Council-  
18 Speaker for the very, your very last comments as the  
19 Speaker of this City Council. Quiet in the  
20 Chambers.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We are adjourned.

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
23 down, please.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: For the Speaker  
25 Melissa Mark-Viverito.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]  
3 here final time. Thank you all and we are  
4 adjourned. [laughter] [cheers/applause] [gavel]

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Madam Speaker-  
6 [pause]

7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 13, 2018