

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

October 26, 2017
Start: 10:13 a.m.
Recess: 12:30 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Daniel R. Garodnick
James Vacca
Margaret S. Chin
Stephen T. Levin
Deborah L. Rose
James G. Van Bramer
David G. Greenfield
Costa G. Constantinides
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Alex Keating, Director of Special Projects
Transportation Planning and Management
Department of Transportation, DOT

Edward Pincar
Manhattan Borough Commissioner
Department of Transportation

Hannah Roth, Assistant General Counsel
Department of Transportation

Scott Hanover, Inspector
Bureau of Transportation
New York City Police Department

Bob Barrows, Managing Attorney
Legislative Affairs Unit
New York City Police Department

Joseph Fucito, Sheriff
Office of the Sheriff of New York City

Dennis Fulton, Inspector
NYPD Transportation Bureau

Judy Ricthhimer, Chair
Government Relations Committee
Guides Association of New York City, GANYC

Andy Sedore, Tour Guide, Sightseeing Bus

Jeff Rosenberg, Amalgamated Transit Union
International Office, Washington, D.C.

Christine Berthet, CHEKPEDS

Chelsea and Hells Kitchen

Mark Henry, President

Local 1056, Queens

NYC Transit Operators in Southeast Queens

Sue Shabbat(sic), Director

Community Affairs

Free Synagogue of Flushing

2 [sound check, pause]

3 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good morning and
4 welcome to today's hearing of the New York City
5 Council Transportation Committee. I'm Ydanis
6 Rodriguez, the Chair of the committee. First, let me
7 recognize—as I recognize my colleagues here, Council
8 Member Koo and Constantinides. Today, the committee
9 will be examining—examining the private bus industry
10 in New York City. This industry includes traditional
11 intercity bus companies like Greyhound that operates
12 from the Port Authority Bus Terminal in Midtown and
13 luckily now they already started serving from George
14 Washington Bus Terminal in my district to Philly and
15 Baltimore in D.C. and very soon probably to also New
16 York. So, we had good companies obtaining others who
17 offer both services to other cities throughout the
18 region, and across the country. There are also many
19 companies who provide similar service, but make the
20 stops right on the street of the city using the curb
21 instead of traditional bus stations, which often—
22 which often offer low cost tickets. There are also
23 charter buses that individuals and groups hire to—for
24 customized trips to a wide variety of destinations
25 throughout the city and beyond. Curbside intercity

2 buses from so-called Chinatown buses to big players
3 such as Megabus and Boltbus can be a great option for
4 New Yorkers and visitors alike from convenient
5 transportation to other cities at a reasonable cost.
6 However, we are also well aware that as these
7 services have become more popular in recent years,
8 they have sometimes generated congestions, pollutions
9 and safety concerns from local communities where
10 these buses tend to operate most, and will it be like
11 an epidemic every three or four years there's a crash
12 where many New Yorkers are living their lives
13 involving some of those buses. The city must
14 recognize the real burden and destruction that large
15 numbers of these buses constantly coming and going
16 can create for the residents and local businesses of
17 these neighborhoods. These concerns led to the
18 creation of the intercity bus permit system in 2012.
19 We look forward to hearing from the Department of
20 Transportation today about the success and challenges
21 they have in contrast, they have implemented today's
22 needs and assistance. We want to hear from the
23 administration, from the bus industry, from the
24 advocates and from local residents about the extent
25 to which the permit system has achieved its stated

2 goal of mitigating the destructive impact to—that too
3 many buses using our streets and sidewalks can have
4 in giving local communities more of a voice in
5 deciding where these bus stops are located. We also
6 recognize that there are other types of bus services
7 such as buses that run between the city and area
8 casinos that in some ways operate like curbside
9 intercity buses, and in other ways resemble charter
10 operations, which some—which and—I'm sorry—with some
11 having the added application of never actually
12 leaving the city limits such as those buses that
13 serve the casino or aqueduct, [door bangs] but we
14 hope to find out more about the regulatory framework
15 governing these bus-buses today. The safety of this
16 industry is, of course, a top concern for everyone.
17 There have been too many tragic crashes involving
18 private buses in our city. On September 18 in
19 Flushing, Queens a private bus collided with an MTA
20 bus killing three great New Yorkers including the
21 drivers of the private and bus—and injuries assisting
22 other. And, of course, we all remember the horrific
23 crash in 2011 in the Bronx that killed 15 people, but
24 these are just two examples of some things that
25 happens far too often on our streets. Although we

2 know that the administration cannot discuss in
3 details the crash in Flushing because it is the
4 subject of ongoing investigation, we do hope to learn
5 more about ways in which the city can take action to
6 make this industry safer and protect the riding
7 public. We also know that this is an industry-
8 industry in which regular-regulations and oversight
9 are largely in the hands of the federal and the state
10 government. For the most part, outside of the scope
11 of this hearing I would like to footnote that this is
12 an industry-industry in which regular-regulation and
13 oversight are largely in the hands of the federal and
14 state government. For the most part outside of the
15 scope of this hearing, I would like to footnote that
16 these safety concerns stand toward insight seeing
17 buses in the city. That is also something we must
18 pay attention to. As elected officials, who
19 represent the people of the city and as the agency
20 that serves them, it is our responsibility to stand
21 up for the people of the city, shine a light on where
22 the problems are, and then work together with our
23 colleagues at the state and federal level as well as
24 our partners in the industry itself to come up with
25 meaningful solutions. We know the city, state and

2 federal government have established rules, and
3 regulations and rating tools to assess the safety of
4 these companies operating our roads, but how can we
5 strengthen current rules and regulations and further
6 enforcement? I am calling for the Charter Bus
7 enforcement unit dedicated to making sure that
8 companies abide by the law. They will ensure that
9 drivers are registered with the DMV, monitor rules
10 for a speed violation, and other laws and regulation.
11 Today, I'm also calling for drivers and companies in
12 areas not authorized to be fined up to \$10,000 in New
13 York City. I would like to welcome the members of
14 the administration who are here with us today. Thank
15 you for being here. I look forward to hearing from
16 our—from you about how the city is approaching this
17 important issue. We also welcome and look forward to
18 hearing from the representatives of the industry,
19 advocates and members of the public about their ideas
20 for improving the way in which this industry operates
21 in our city. I would like to also welcome Council
22 Member Chin, and now give Council Member Koo the
23 opportunity also to say a few words since the last
24 crash happened in his district.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Chair
3 Rodriguez, and thank you for the administration to
4 come here to testify. I want to start by saying
5 there's a place for the charter bus industry. It's
6 popular service. It is a popular service that brings
7 visitors, workers and tourists to and from my
8 district, and my district is one of the most busy
9 districts in terms of transportation. We are more
10 than like 24 buses in the downtown area, and with the
11 Long Island Railroad, with the—and we have 7-Train,
12 we have all these taxis and driving around. So,
13 there's a—my district has also experienced serious
14 problems with the charter bus industry for years. In
15 general, they come and go as they please causing
16 traffic—causing traffic congestion and safety issues
17 with little consequence. The next federal, state and
18 local jurisdiction has made it difficult to enforce
19 and regulate and like it—make it possible for them to
20 operate so freely. For example, (coughs) I
21 personally saw a casino bus parked in the newly
22 created bus only lane on Main Street. I has a framed
23 advertisement right in front of the—the door on the
24 sidewalk. I watched a traffic agent approach the bus
25 and write a ticket, look at the driver and rode away.

2 The whole time the bus driver was reclining in the
3 driver's seat waiting for customers. He had his feet
4 kicked up on the steering wheel, and he was watching
5 the ticket agent giving the ticket, but he couldn't
6 dare less, you know. It was the cost of doing
7 business. Last month's accident highlights the most
8 serious problems of safety in the industry, and we
9 are here today to explore how the private bus
10 industry can be better regulated, and to see how we
11 can prevent such devastating crashes from happening
12 again. Thank you. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I now ask the
14 committee counsel to administer the affirmation and
15 then invite the administration to deliver their
16 testimony.

17 LEGAL COUNSEL: Please raise your right
18 hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
19 truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony
20 before this committee, and to respond honestly to
21 Council Member questions?

22 PANEL MEMBERS: [off mic]

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

24 ALEX KEATING: Good morning, Chair
25 Rodriguez and members of the Transportation

2 Committee. I'm Alex Keating, Director of Special
3 Projects for Transportation Planning and Management
4 at DOT. I'm joined today by DOT's Deputy Manhattan
5 Borough Commission Ed Pincar, and Assistant General
6 Counsel Hannah Roth. We are also joined today by
7 Inspector Scott Hanover of the NYPD's Transportation
8 Bureau; Bob Barrows, Managing Attorney of the NYPD's
9 Legislative Affairs Unit; and New York City Sheriff
10 Joseph Fucito. Thank you for inviting us on behalf
11 of Mayor de Blasio and our respective commissioners
12 to discuss the private bus industry. Private buses
13 of all kinds play an important role in New York
14 City's transportation system. They bring numerous
15 visitors and commuters a year to our city fueling our
16 economy. At the same time they're an effective
17 choice for out-of-town transportation for many New
18 Yorkers. Additionally, certain types of private
19 buses complement other transportation options for
20 various trips within the city itself. Buses are a
21 space efficient travel mode, transportation-
22 transporting far larger numbers of people than
23 private cars on our finite street space. As our
24 entire transportation network nears the limits of its
25 capacity, DOT has a strong interest in promoting the

2 most space efficient travel modes. Safety is our top
3 priority, and recent—in recent high profile bus
4 crashes are concerning. With the Vision Zero goal of
5 eliminating traffic deaths and serious injuries for
6 all street users, pedestrians, cyclists, occupants of
7 vehicles including buses, DOT's continually working
8 to improve street design and traffic holes.
9 Consistent public education programming and
10 enforcement efforts undertaken in partnership with
11 the NYPD are also critical. As you know, many
12 aspects of the bus industry including driver
13 licensing, equipment and operations are highly
14 regulated by the state and federal governments. The
15 city's role in regulating the private bus industry is
16 primarily related to authorizing curbside bus stop
17 locations as well as promulgating traffic rules and
18 posted regulations that buses and other vehicles must
19 follow. Additionally, sightseeing buses, which
20 operate entirely within city limits are subject to
21 DCA licensing requirements. Buses are defined by
22 federal, state and local laws in slightly different
23 ways, but generally any vehicle seating more than 15
24 passengers is considered a bus. First, there are
25 three types of buses that operate between New York

2 City and locations outside of the city: Intercity,
3 public transportation and charter buses. For bus
4 stop permit purposes, intercity buses are defined as
5 buses that travel between New York City and anywhere
6 outside the city on a regularly scheduled service.
7 However, this does not include buses operated by
8 public authorities or by any county, city or town
9 either directly or through a contract. In order to
10 load and unload a curb, intercity buses are required
11 to utilize designated stops as well as have and
12 prominently display a DOT bus stop permit, which I'll
13 discuss in great-greater detail in a moment. In
14 contrast, charter buses are hired by a private person
15 or group under a contract to travel to a set location
16 or locations and are not required to utilize
17 designated stops. Intercity buses and charter buses
18 can be hard to tell apart from their appearance or
19 destinations alone with more information about the
20 specifics of this service. Finally, there are few
21 types of buses that travel among destinations
22 exclusively within the city including sightseeing
23 buses, franchise buses, and free shuttle buses. Three
24 entities are primarily responsible for regulating bus
25 operations: The United States Department of

2 Transportation, the Motor Carriers Safety
3 Administration within the USDOT, and state DOTs such
4 as New York State DOT. Each entity has a series of
5 regulatory requirements including limitations on
6 driver licensing, hours a driver may operate vehicle,
7 and regulations on the bus equipment. To enforce
8 these requirements, they require logs and reporting
9 and conduct inspections for safety and compliance.
10 Federal law broadly preempts the state and city's
11 authority to regulate bus schedules, routes and rates
12 or any operator's authority to provide charter bus
13 transportation. [door bangs] Because of this legal
14 framework and the nature of bus operations, cities
15 must rely on the state and federal authorities to
16 regulate many aspects to of the industry. Locally,
17 DOT has the responsibility to manage curb access on
18 New York City streets including designating official
19 bus stops. Providing curb space for intercity buses
20 has been a challenge as the sector of the bus
21 industry has grown dramatically over the past
22 decades. In 2012, New York City worked with state
23 representatives to add Section 1642-A to the New York
24 Vehicle and Traffic Law, which gives the city
25 authority to issue on-street bus stop permits to

2 intercity buses and to issue significant fines for
3 non-compliance with those rules. As described in the
4 law and the city's rules, DOT issues bus stop permits
5 on the basis of traffic flow, pedestrian flow and
6 safety. The Bus Stop Permit Program has helped DOT
7 address some persistent community concerns about this
8 class of bus loading and in locations detrimental to
9 the health and safety of city residents. However,
10 the law does not give the city authority to regulated
11 driver licensing or any other aspect of intercity bus
12 operations, elements, which are appropriately
13 regulated at the state and federal levels. For most
14 types of—most other types of buses, even though they
15 are not covered by the Intercity Bus Stop Law, DOT's
16 Traffic Rules, specifically Section 4-10(c) prohibit
17 bus operators from picking up or dropping off
18 passengers on a street except at a bus stop
19 designated by the Commissioner. Charter buses are an
20 exception to this rule. Regarding bus routes,
21 franchise buses are the only private buses in New
22 York City that must follow designated routes. All
23 other buses section—for all other buses, Section 4-10
24 (e) of DOT's Traffic Rules requires empty buses and
25 buses that do not have specifically designated routes

2 to stay on truck routes except to arrive and depart
3 from their destination. Also at the local level DOT's
4 Traffic and Highway Rules apply to all buses as does
5 New York State's Vehicle and Traffic Law, and NYPD
6 enforces those laws including speed limits, parking,
7 stopping and standing regulations, idling and general
8 traffic regulations including failure to yield.

9 Under the command of Chief of Transportation Thomas
10 Chan, the NYPD has dedicated personnel trained on
11 developing and implementing strategies to expedite
12 the movement of buses and to enforce laws and
13 regulations related to the operation of buses in the
14 city. NYPD personnel enforce traffic regulations in
15 around bus stops and bus lanes, and respond to
16 complaints from the public concerning traffic safety
17 issues related to buses. Year to date, personnel
18 from the NYPD Transportation Bureau have written
19 nearly 2,000 moving summonses that are attributed to
20 buses, and NYPD personnel have issued over 22,000
21 parking summonses that are attributable to buses, up
22 34% from last year. [door bangs] New York City—the
23 New York City Department of Finance and the New York
24 City Sheriff also play a crucial role in enforcement.
25 Once violations are in judgment, the Sheriff can

2 seize vehicles or business proceeds to satisfy unpaid
3 judgments. Finally, DOT is committed to work more
4 closely with the bus industry to provide drives,
5 especially drivers coming from out of the state with
6 all of the information they need to drive safely and
7 legally within the five boroughs. We are currently
8 revising our printed materials to clarify the Rules
9 of the Road here in the city with special focus on
10 truck routes, permitted layover areas, and idling
11 limits. [door bangs] We also plan to hold a series
12 of webinars with bus companies in the near future to
13 explain these laws in greater detail. We appreciate
14 the willingness of the bus industry to collaborate
15 with us in this effort, and the leadership of the
16 Council Member Johnson in bringing the parties to the
17 table. DOT would welcome opportunities to partner
18 with additional Council Members in this effort.
19 Thank you for the opportunity to testify before you
20 today. We are now happy to answer any questions you
21 may have. [pause]

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. I
23 have a few questions. I know that my colleagues also
24 they will have other questions. [background comment]
25 Let me also give—let me give a chance to Council

2 Member Koo. He has also to go to another hearing.

3 [background comment, pause]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Chair

5 Rodriguez. So, I want to know is how is it possible

6 for someone with such a poor driving record to be

7 allowed to get behind the wheel, and do you think the

8 private charter industry should be subjected to the

9 same safety standards as MTA or school buses?

10 Drivers—the driver was fired from MTA for a DUI, but

11 still able to driver a private bus. So, are routed

12 and intercity buses held to different safety

13 standards? Please describe.

14 ALEX KEATING: So, safety is our top

15 priority, and these crashes are very concerning. As

16 discussed in the testimony given the city's role in

17 regulating the—the bus industry, we can look at the—

18 whether folks are obeying the posted traffic

19 regulations and using the bus stop permitted spaces

20 correctly. All other aspects of driver licensing and

21 operations and inspections fall to the state and

22 federal level.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Well, it all depends

24 for routed and intercity buses making unlicensed

25 stops?

2 ALEX KEATING: So, I'll—I'll turn that
3 over to a colleague.

4 HANNAH ROTH: Can you repeat the
5 question?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: What are the
7 penalties?

8 HANNAH ROTH: Oh, what are the penalties?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [off mic] For the
10 intercity buses making unlicensed stops?

11 HANNAH ROTH: So, the penalties for
12 violating any of the intercity bus stop permit rules
13 are \$500 for an offense, and the other kinds of
14 violations that these buses will receive are—are
15 parking or traffic tickets. So, a normal parking
16 [door bangs] ticket is often \$115.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [off mic] Why are
18 city or intercity bus stops listed on the DOT website
19 for all intercity? (sic) These soft walls (sic) has
20 at least six buses traveling in the bus lane, but it
21 doesn't seem to work okay now, right?

22 ALEX KEATING: I'm unaware of the exact
23 service that you're mentioning. All buses that are
24 utilizing dedicated curbspace to pick up and drop
25 off should have a—should have permission to do so,

2 and should be listed on our website I believe. Fair
3 enough?

4 HANNAH ROTH: The intercity—all the
5 intercity bus stops are listed on the website, and we
6 at DOT do have information on where all of the bus
7 stops that are utilized by any type of bus are
8 located.

9 ALEX KEATING: We will certainly look at
10 adding additional information to our website and
11 discuss it further.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Okay, yeah. So—so,
13 Dahlia, the company that has the crash last time the
14 company wasn't listed in the DOT website. How do we
15 stop these companies from operating illegally? Who
16 is in charge of enforcing? Does the city coordinate
17 with state or federal enforcement agencies? Those
18 are the three questions I have.

19 ALEX KEATING: So, just to start,
20 obviously given the ongoing investigation, we won't
21 be discussing anything specific to that incident. I'm
22 going to turn it over to our colleagues from PD to
23 discuss the broader enforcement issues you brought
24 up.

2 SCOTT HANOVER: We enforce—we—every bus
3 unit, I'm in command of, and what we do is we support
4 the precincts throughout the city, and we provide
5 them back-up and assistance in enforcing bus
6 regulations. So, we go out into different locations
7 where we receive community complaints or observations
8 by us, feedback from the Council Members, feedback
9 from precincts, and we go to those locations and
10 we'll inspect the buses to ensure that they have the
11 proper paperwork. Also, I have a truck unit.
12 They'll do a rudimentary inspection on the bus to
13 ensure that it's safe to operate. If it's not safe,
14 we do have the ability to take it out of service and
15 force the company to tow it away, which is quite
16 significant financial hit plus we also issue Criminal
17 Court summonses with terminal to the local borough
18 Criminal Court. [pause]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So, does DOT
20 communicate with NYPD—NYPD which buses are licensed
21 to start or it's—it's just up to the NYPD to check
22 themselves?

23 SCOTT HANOVER: We communicate all the
24 time. Their website is excellent, but we communicate
25 on a daily—not a daily basis, but we communicate

2 quite often in regards to intercity buses, charter
3 buses, hop on, hop off buses. They give us their
4 issues with complaints that they received, and if we
5 have a complaint about a particular bus company that
6 may be violating laws on a regular basis, we provide
7 that information to them.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Okay. I just—I have
9 a few more questions and this is it. (sic) So, does
10 DOT check with state of federal government before
11 issuing permits? They have background checks for
12 drivers or companies?

13 ALEX KEATING: So, if—if any—any company
14 that is applying for intercity bus stop permit has to
15 include information that they are licensed—I mean
16 that they have insurance. We—we do check that, but
17 that's all sort of included at the state level in
18 terms of actually overseeing that—that process of
19 issuing the—the insurance and such.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: But you don't check
21 the drivers?

22 ALEX KEATING: Not the individual
23 drivers. No.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So, I think the DOT
25 is undergoing a Smart Truck Management Plan to

2 coordinate—to coordinate deliveries for the city.

3 Are buses also being considered?

4 ALEX KEATING: Currently that—that
5 program is focused specifically on commercial
6 delivery at the curb. So, buses would not fall under
7 that but, of course, as we mentioned in the testimony
8 a bus that is utilizing our streets outside of the
9 franchise does need to be on dedicated truck routes
10 at all times unless it's making it's pickup or—or
11 dropoff.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: My last question is
13 why is Lower Manhattan the only area the city has a
14 specified bus map? What was involved in crafting it,
15 and could be one be created for other parts of the
16 city mainly Flushing, which is already a
17 transportation hub with over 20 bus lines.

18 EDWARD PINCAR: Council Member, good
19 morning. I was here as the—Council Member Chin knows
20 while the part of the map was created, but I
21 understand it was due to the bus issues related to
22 the World Trade Center site and the 9/11 Memorial.
23 We're certainly happy to work with you and your
24 colleagues if there are other areas that need to be
25 culled out.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Okay, yeah. That's
3 reasonable.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I think that we
5 have to do better. I believe that we have shown that
6 we're weak when it comes to enforcements in New York
7 City. While I understand all the limitations we
8 have, but I believe that with the—with the tools we
9 have, we should be able to make the bad actors
10 accountable. I believe that, you know, as many
11 hardworking drivers and companies and the provider
12 services sometimes efficiencies and safety. But this
13 is like an epidemic. Like it's like every three or
14 four years, and the consequences is at like three
15 individuals being killed in his district. A few
16 years ago there was 15. How many bus stops—how many
17 drivers were stopped last year by the NYPD.

18 SCOTT HANOVER: How many drivers were
19 stopped?

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
21 Yes.

22 SCOTT HANOVER: I wouldn't have that
23 information.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How many—can you
25 show me—share some data like when it comes to

2 enforcement give me something that I can—that I can
3 say I can share with my colleagues this is how much
4 we are doing law enforcement?

5 SCOTT HANOVER: Chief Chan, Chief of
6 Transportation for 2018 under the guise of Vision
7 Zero, we are going to focus on bus and truck
8 violations, and that's one of our goals coming down
9 in the future. Already what I've done is I've
10 changes the mission statement of our bus unit.
11 They're going to concentrate solely on bus
12 violations. In the past, they've also addressed bus
13 lane violations, and traffic flow. I've transferred
14 that responsibility over to a different unit within
15 my command so the bus unit could concentrate on bus
16 violations committed by the bus drivers themselves.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I have a lot of
18 respect, and Chief, I've been your partner with you
19 guys when it comes to Vision Zero, but I would like
20 to know how frequently are private buses stopped in
21 New York City because of traffic infractions. One
22 violation of the most commonly that those drivers are
23 getting let's talk about last year, and please, if we
24 don't have the number, just say we don't have it
25 because sometimes we go around saying, you know,

2 going around. I would like to know again the
3 question is how frequently are private buses stopped
4 by the NYPD?

5 BOB BARROWS: Well, I think—so my name is
6 Bob Barrows. I'm from the NYPD. I think to look at
7 data, for moving violations year to date, we—the Bus
8 Unit has written 2,000 moving summonses, which is up
9 significantly from the prior year?

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 2,000?

11 BOB BARROWS: 2,000.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And last year?

13 BOB BARROWS: Over—a little bit over
14 2,000. Not this is year to date.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I see, that's '17
16 to '18?

17 BOB BARROWS: No, from January 1, 2017 to
18 October 23, 2017, year-to-date numbers.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: To private bus
20 drivers?

21 BOB BARROWS: To all buses. Moving,
22 silent.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But can you—can
24 you—

25 ALEX KEATING: It's private bus drivers.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Can you give me
3 the breakdown of who are those buses? You're
4 supposed, you know, if you have a 2,000 I hope that
5 you have the breakdown.

6 SCOTT HANOVER: They're--they're all
7 private bus drivers. They could be intercity bus
8 drivers, they could be charter bus drivers, tour bus
9 drivers.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And can--can you
11 give me something. This is about a crisis where
12 people--three people died. What is the breakdown that
13 you have that you can share? How many of those were
14 in charter buses?

15 SCOTT HANOVER: I--we don't keep stats
16 based on particular bus classes. We just overall how
17 many we've written to private bus drivers.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But you just said
19 right now that that includes charter buses and other
20 buses. Like--

21 SCOTT HANOVER: [interposing] Yes sir.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --it doesn't
23 happen up there. You have this information. \

24 BOB BARROWS: The--the 2,000 moving
25 violations include all classes of buses. So, it's

2 written to the conveyance not the, you know, this is
3 a charter bus. This is an intercity bus. If—we
4 would need to do a—a—a deeper dive into the data to
5 see which, you know, which type of bus it is. We
6 write the summons to the bus.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You can make the
8 change, right in the form—in whatever electronic of
9 paper format, you know, the members of the NYPD use.

10 BOB BARROWS: Right.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: To be able to
12 identify those buses are charters, if they are not
13 charter. You can do that, right?

14 BOB BARROWS: We would have—so—so the
15 number that I have today is just total bus summonses.
16 I would have to get back to you on whether we can
17 break it down further by, you know, what type of bus
18 it is.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, and what is
20 the common violation of those 2,000?

21 SCOTT HANOVER: The common violations for
22 the movers would be—we don't get many speeding
23 violations. A lot of times what we get is spillback,
24 failure to yield to pedestrians in crosswalks, red

2 lights, illegal turns, disobeying signs, disobeying
3 pavement markings. Things of that nature.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Do you also give
5 tickets for those who do pick up and drop off in an
6 areas that they are not authorized?

7 SCOTT HANOVER: Yeah, that would be a
8 parking violation.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How often are
10 those tickets given to those--[background comment,
11 pause]

12 BOB BARROWS: So, year-to-date, NYPD
13 personnel and the Transportation Bureau have written
14 a little bit over 22,000 parking violations.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: What about buses?

16 BOB BARROWS: Two buses, yes, two buses,
17 22,000, two buses.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 22,000?

19 BOB BARROWS: Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And what--do you
21 have any or can you share with us like what
22 percentage are for those drivers who pick up and drop
23 off in a non-authorized area?

24 BOB BARROWS: So, the number again is the
25 aggregate of all types of different summonses that

2 have been issued to buses. So, I would have to get
3 back to you on a breakdown of each specific offense.
4 That's just the total parking summonses that have
5 been issued to buses.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: That's--that's
7 important.

8 BOB BARROWS: Yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I know that
10 we have the same interest, but we need to, you know,
11 deal with this epidemic.

12 BOB BARROWS: Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I think that
14 again we don't control a lot of things that is
15 happening from the city and the state level--

16 BOB BARROWS: Right.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: -but at least
18 with enforcement in areas that they are not supposed
19 to be allowed, I think that that's where we can
20 control.

21 BOB BARROWS: And Council Member, I would
22 just like to add to the--to--to your inquiry that, you
23 now, the 22,000 parking violations that are issued
24 and the 2,000 moving violations that have been issued
25 to buses, that doesn't necessarily represent the

2 entire gamut of enforcing. Many times, you know, we
3 could be issuing—our personnel could be pulling
4 somebody over and giving them a warning or in some
5 cases like with idling a TA will approach the—the
6 driver who's in the car at the moment and say please
7 turn off your vehicle, and we get compliance that way
8 as well.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Are busses
10 allowed or drivers or bus drivers allowed to drive
11 through the Hudson River Drive? [background comment]

12 SCOTT HANOVER: To the best of my
13 knowledge, no.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How much do you
15 enforce that?

16 SCOTT HANOVER: (coughs) That would be
17 the Highway Division would enforce that.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I drive everyday
19 to that area.

20 SCOTT HANOVER: And your—your vision—

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: There's buses
22 everyday using that area.

23 SCOTT HANOVER: I'm not absolutely
24 positive that they cannot use the buses on that
25 highway. I would have to find out.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I'm almost sure
3 that in some area because I know that we're dealing
4 with (coughing) it at the city area. Are there some
5 areas that buses are allowed and others are not?
6 However, if we look from 84th Street all the way to
7 Dagman Street, George Washington Bridge, there's
8 buses going there everyday, and-and-and to be clear,
9 those are not only charter buses. That also includes
10 many of the buses company, and I think that I'm
11 calling also to the good one, that I know that
12 they're here to be sure about it, but they also make
13 their drivers accountable not to drive in areas that
14 they know they aren't allowed to just to cut traffic
15 to get into the George Washington Bridge.

16 SCOTT HANOVER: I will find out whether
17 that is a violation and I will notify the highway-
18 highway district.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

20 ALEX KEATING: I want to just add on I
21 think that's a great point, and it speaks to how
22 important education is as well. The-the truck routs
23 are posted on our website and available and getting
24 them into the hands of all of the drivers and all the
25 companies important, and I'm just making sure that

2 everyone at the table is aware of where these buses
3 should and should not be. It also speaks to the-to
4 the complexity of the issue when a bus can be making
5 a pickup or a dropoff, the final bit of it's either
6 or, you know, destination. It does not need to be on
7 a truck route. So, it adds some complexity to what
8 my colleagues at PD have to do, but it's clearly
9 marked and available on our website.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, and-and
11 again and four-with my colleagues we're able to get
12 \$5 million for the Education Initiative for Vision
13 Zero and for Vision Zero, but I think that this is
14 more than educational. Those companies and those
15 drivers they know that they're not supposed to be
16 driving. And I just bring hopes that we would last-
17 one that I know. I'm pretty sure that that's the
18 same situation in each of the council districts.
19 (sic). It's about drivers trying to cut traffic, and
20 I think this is about besides education enforcements
21 is like one of the key elements there. My last
22 question, and I don't have any other, but my
23 colleagues also has questions is on-right now I also
24 was reading on the DOT website on the consequences
25 for drivers who doesn't who pick up and drop off in

2 unauthorized area. The tickets go up to \$3,000. I
3 don't recall the maximum amount, but--

4 ALEX KEATING: Oh, yes, I'll turn that
5 over to my colleague.

6 HANNAH ROTH: Yes, there--for summonses
7 that are issued to OATH or the Environment--formerly
8 Environmental Control Board, the second violation can
9 be up to \$2,500.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And this is
11 something that we can legislate, right? This is
12 something that the city because DOT, DOT made it a
13 rule, right? It's they're allowed to do it so we can
14 legislate that one, too?

15 HANNAH ROTH: It's authorized by the
16 State Law. The--the penalties are set forth in the
17 State Law and they are duplicated in our City Rules.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Can we increase
19 that amount?

20 HANNAH ROTH: Up to the limits of the
21 state law, but beyond that, we're limited by the
22 State Law.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, because I
24 know that working together also as we keep standing
25 with PD's administration we increase the penalty for

2 those drivers who leave the scene the hit and run up
3 to \$10,000 because that's the maximum that we are
4 allowed to. So, I'm looking to work with you guys
5 and the administration and my colleague with the
6 potential legislation to increase to the maximum that
7 the state will allow to increase those penalties, and
8 I believe that those penalties should be going to the
9 drivers and to the company.

10 ALEX KEATING: Council Member, that's a
11 fine suggestion, no pun intended, and we'll be happy
12 to take it back to leadership at DOT.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Thank you.
14 Now, I have Council Member—yeah, we're joined by
15 Council Member Richards and Council Member Menchaca.
16 Now we have Council Member Chin that has questions.
17 [pause]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair.
19 Thank you for your leadership on this issue. First,
20 I wanted to thank DOT and NYPD for working with us in
21 Lower Manhattan on our Intercity Task Force—Intercity
22 Bus Task Force. We've been dealing with this issue
23 for many, many years now. We thought we got a handle
24 on it when we fought for the permitting system, and
25 we got some—the private bus company to work with us,

2 and we were beginning to identify who some of these
3 companies are, and when the permit system started,
4 people we encouraged them to come in and apply, and
5 we thought it was going well. Now, it's still like
6 the wild, wild west. All of a sudden there are a lot
7 of these bus companies that are either one bus or two
8 bus, and they are just not following the rules again
9 and this is the intercity bus part. I know that in
10 the town hall meeting that we had with the mayor, one
11 of the constituents raised the question about one
12 company just rented the little parking lot right next
13 to their storefront, and a bus would go in and out of
14 there, and there are times when two buses are parked
15 in there, and I've seen when the bus pulled out. It
16 just blocked the whole street. Now NYPD, is that
17 legal for them to utilize a parking lot as a bus
18 stop for dropoff and pickup?

19 SCOTT HANOVER: I can't speak about the
20 inside of the parking lot, but if the person is
21 blocking the sidewalk, that's obviously a violation
22 that we would address. As far as being able to use
23 it as almost like a bus depot inside that empty lot,
24 I don't know what regulations that would cover.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay, what about
3 also the idle youth because when they're in there
4 often times the engine is running, and you have
5 people living right in the back of it, you know.
6 There's a building, there's a residential building
7 right there in the back of the-of the lot, and people
8 are smelling fumes.

9 ALEX KEATING: Yeah, so I would say
10 regarding the intercity bus stop permits from DOT's
11 perspective we're dealing with on-street parking and-
12 and stops for these buses. I think that it's a very
13 good point that the idling should be enforced
14 regardless.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: So, that's
16 something that we could work with NYPD for at least
17 the residents to be able to call 311 or-or the NYPD
18 precinct.

19 SCOTT HANOVER: 311 or the precinct, and
20 then the precinct would address it. If they needed
21 help from us we would gladly go down there and help
22 them. We're down there quite often.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: And then the other
24 issued is that when it came up in-in the task force
25 meeting, was suggestion to really help NYPD have more

2 information, and one of the—the issues that came up
3 at one of the meetings that we had this week was like
4 for officers to know exactly what that permit looked
5 like because one of the issues is that there are
6 buses that are, you know, you think permits, right.
7 So, NYPD officers if they know exactly what the
8 permit looks like, then they can check on the bus.
9 That's one thing. Another suggestion that I think
10 the NYPD, the precinct was asking for was that was it
11 possible to really post on the bus stop the company
12 that—this entitled to stop there and also their
13 schedule. So, they know that hey if there's no one
14 scheduled to do a job offer and pickup at 12:00, I
15 mean you have a bus parked there. Because there are
16 other bus companies that are using the same stop that
17 don't have the permit, but they're using the stops.
18 So, in order for the police officer to know exactly
19 which one is violating the rules, if a schedule
20 somehow is posted at the stop that also would be
21 helpful.

22 ALEX KEATING: I think that's a good
23 suggestion and obviously the schedules are posted on
24 our website, and the buses are required to have them

2 on hand as well, but we can look into what you're
3 discussing.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: And one—one last
5 question relating to but also Council Member Koo
6 talked about, casino bus. Some casino bus companies
7 got smart and went and applied for intercity permits,
8 and the owner were, you know, saying that they paid a
9 lot of money and now they got they got the permit and
10 the—and their sign is on there. This is the one
11 Times Square in Chinatown. So the signs are up there
12 for these companies, and these are tour companies,
13 whatever, but objectively, they are a casino bus that
14 are using that bus stop. I mean this is the one that
15 I guess they're paying these tour companies whoever
16 they are that were—that got around the system and got
17 the stop and they're doing a great business because
18 there are times I see more than one casino bus parked
19 there, and at the same time we have other casinos bus
20 that park wherever they want, right. So, it is—it is
21 a lot of burden on NYPD to have to keep, you know,
22 coming and—and giving tickets and a ticket is the
23 cost of doing business. It really doesn't serve the
24 purpose, but they still keep coming back unless we
25 tow the bus, right, take it out of service. That

2 will hit them harder, but the casino bus I mean you
3 see the sign on the side where they're taking them
4 to, they're not an intercity bus, and so they figure
5 a way to do that, and that is something that we
6 really have to not be outsmarted by them. We really
7 have to figure a way of enforcing them to follow the
8 rules, because yes, they could just stop at a bus
9 stop because they could consider a commuter bus. But
10 you have to stop at a bus stop, right. Okay, because
11 in your testimony you said that they're allowed to do
12 that, but they don't do that. I mean they park in
13 the middle of the street and then often times they
14 double park. Come on, you know, you could just—
15 legally you could go park in front of a bus stop for
16 five minutes, but they don't do that. So, I mean
17 that is something that we are asking for more
18 enforcement, and a way to sort of let these companies
19 know these are the rules. If you don't follow them,
20 if you don't follow the rules, there are consequences
21 and it's not just increasing the fine. That's one
22 step, but I think we really need to seriously look at
23 towing the bus to make them pay, right?

24 EDWARD PENCAR: Council Member, first of
25 all, thank you, as always, for your continued

2 partnership on this and other issues. Some casino
3 buses can be approved through the existing Intercity
4 Bus Law [door bangs] to operate with a bus stop. So,
5 as a first step, we should identify whether those
6 buses have a permit or not, and then if they don't we
7 are happy to work with you, and NYPD to target
8 enforcement.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: How do you consider
10 them as intercity bus when they pick up a passenger
11 and they drop them off in front of the casino? It's
12 not that they're dropping off them in Connecticut, a
13 street on Connecticut, but it's right in front of the
14 casino. I mean how do they skirt the rules?

15 ED PINCAR: Well, I guess it would depend
16 on where the casino is, but if there is, you know, an
17 out-of-state casino out-of-city casino and they have
18 regular service then the state law would require them
19 to classify as an intercity bus, and that's just how
20 the law is written because of the charge.[door bangs]

21 HANNAH ROTH: I just—I think this is what
22 speaks again to this. This is a really complicated
23 problem, and I do think the way that these different
24 kinds of buses are defined makes it a little hard to
25 tell them apart when just looking at them, and it-it-

2 as Alex said in his testimony, it goes beyond often
3 what the typical bus looks like, and it is about the
4 destination and the type of service. So, we're happy
5 to, you know, look at any particular spot that, you
6 all have identified.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: And I think what I
8 would request, Chair, is that we also want some
9 suggestions from you how do we get the federal
10 government? I mean what--what should we do to
11 advocate on the federal level, the state level
12 because at the task force meeting, right, the Sheriff
13 was there. Most of these buses are registered in
14 another state. They're not registered in our state,
15 but they come in here, and they cause [door bangs] a
16 lot of havoc in our community. So, we have to look
17 at this thing nationally and on a federal level how
18 do we control that or regulate that? Because I was
19 like surprised, none of the bus companies were
20 registered in New York State. So, that is not good.
21 Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.
23 Council Member Richards has a question, but before he
24 has a question, I want to interject with this

2 question on what can be the consequences for
3 companies that use another company's permit?

4 ALEX KEATING: So, an intercity bus
5 permit is issued to a specific company the one who
6 applies, and no other company's buses should be
7 utilizing that—that pickup or dropoff location. That
8 would be a ticketable offense, and whenever we are
9 aware of that, PD is—is out enforcing.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But is there a
11 consequence like can—can you—can a company lose that
12 permit if they allow another company to use the
13 permit without DOT authority.

14 ALEX KEATING: Oh, maybe Hannah can speak
15 to the specifics.

16 HANNAH ROTH: So, in the criteria for
17 revoking or denying a permit are laid out in our
18 rule, which is 4-10 of DOT's Traffic Rules and in
19 those rules a couple of the ways that they lose their
20 permit is by violating the intercity bus stop permit
21 rules. So, if the company had an adjudicated
22 violation of the Intercity Bus Stop Rules, a number
23 of them or if they're in arrears to the City of New
24 York, those things we can take into—into
25 consideration.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I just think that
3 again this is like—this is about time [door bangs]
4 and—and as you are aware there's like one of the main
5 TV stations that they are doing the investigation
6 report on that particular company that they were
7 using a permit of another company, and I have that we
8 have to example. We need to show that we have zero
9 tolerance. I mean enforcement is a key issued and as
10 I say, we don't have the power of those regulations
11 established by the federal or the state that when it
12 comes to enforcement, there's much more that we can
13 do. Council Member Richards.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you, and
15 thank you, Chair, for holding this important hearing.
16 I wanted to touch on truck traffic a little bit
17 because this is the issue of the day Southeast
18 Queens, and I know the Police Commissioner had
19 committed to a certain amount of additional boots to
20 Southeast Queens. So, I wanted to know where we're
21 at with the additional boots for the Police
22 Department to boot a lot of these trucks, and you
23 spoke of a special enforcement wing in the department
24 that deals with trucks. So, can you speak to a
25 little bit about what the resources are in that

2 particular department. And—and one thing I've said
3 to the Police Commissioner being that we're so close
4 to the airport, we have JFK so trucks really impact
5 not just my district but Council Member Miller, and
6 soon to be Adrian Adams's district. So, I'm
7 interested in knowing is the NYPD open to having
8 additional units out in Southeast Queens to deal with
9 this issue. The Mayor's heard it at the town hall
10 last week again. He's heard it at my town hall.
11 Every town hall he goes to, he seems to hear about
12 this issue, but we have not seen the level of
13 enforcement that, you know, we believe is suitable to
14 really addressing the truck issue in Southeast
15 Queens.

16 INSPECTOR FULTON: Good morning.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Good morning.

18 INSPECTOR FULTON: I'm Inspector Fulton.

19 I work for Chief Chan in the Transportation Bureau.

20 So, we have bought more boots.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]

22 Sorry. Could you please identify yourself for the
23 record?

24 INSPECTOR FULTON: Oh, yeah.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Restate your
3 name for the record.

4 INSPECTOR FULTON: Inspector Dennis
5 Fulton.

6 LEGAL COUNSEL: [off mic]

7 INSPECTOR FULTON: And I do. Yes, so,
8 we—we did purchase more boots and we are very aware
9 of Southern Queens and some of the truck traffic in
10 the—the unlicensed commuter vans. I know that the
11 commanding officer worked with Councilman Miller and
12 yourself, and so we also have like Scott, Inspector
13 Hanover. If the precincts need help, he will send
14 his people over to do operations with TLC, but we did
15 get the boots that you referred to.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And can you
17 just speak to—so you have units. Specially, I think
18 I heard you say that--

19 INSPECTOR FULTON: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --you have
21 unites dedicated to this issue?

22 INSPECTOR FULTON: Dedicated--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: What do those
24 units look like? How many people are in them, and
25 it's not just about the boots. It's really about

2 being able to have the heavy duty tow-two trucks to
3 actually tow these particular--

4 INSPECTOR FULTON: [interposing] Right.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --vehicles.

6 INSPECTOR FULTON: Right. So, our
7 traffic enforcement district is composed of 3,000
8 traffic agents, and of these, we have Level 3 Traffic
9 Agents who are specifically assigned to operate our
10 tow trucks. So, we have some heavy duty tow trucks
11 that come our way.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]
13 And how many?

14 INSPECTOR FULTON: I-I can get you that
15 number. I don't know the exact number.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright. So, I
17 probably know the answer to this because my-my-and
18 let me not blow my precinct up, but they do have
19 enough [laughs] resources in this area, and this has
20 been a continuous issue. I mean I've been at the
21 Council going on 15 years now. Every year the same
22 issue keeps coming up and JFK is obviously becoming
23 busier and busier in the cargo area. So, when can we
24 anticipate on having a specific unit committed to
25 Southeast Queens to deal with this issue? I know the

2 issue is buses, you know, today, but for us it's
3 trucks. So, there, and we could have this
4 conversation offline, but I-I just would love to see
5 a commitment by PD-NYPD on this issue. Not to say
6 you're not. I think the commanding officers are
7 doing as much as they can, and they send us the
8 notifications when they do actions. But since the
9 issued is-is-is grand in Southeast Queens, why don't
10 we figure a way to put together a specific unit, get
11 back and just deal with this issue or enhance
12 resources there? If you want to talk offline, that's
13 fine. You don't have to commit now.

14 INSPECTOR FULTON: We-we-we have like a
15 citywide unit that's--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]
17 We don't need a citywide unit. We need a specific
18 unit for Southeast Queens.

19 INSPECTOR FULTON: Okay, we-we can
20 discuss that another time.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yeah. [laughs]
22 Citywide is not working out as consistently. So,
23 yeah. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: We were joined by
25 Council Member Reynoso, now Council Member Vacca,

2 too. So, I—since my colleague doesn't have any more
3 questions, I would like to [pause] if it's possible
4 can you show me the area in the—the thing that you
5 say that you have there, which is the area on the map
6 in the Hudson River Drive that we're not supposed to
7 be having buses there? [pause] [off mic] So, I would
8 like to go home tonight and that's the day we knew
9 your support. (sic) [on mic] You know that there's
10 buses going through the Hudson River Drive, right?
11 [pause]

12 INSPECTOR FULTON: Could you repeat that
13 again, sir?

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You know that
15 there's buses going along everyday through the Hudson
16 River Drive.

17 INSPECTOR FULTON: I did not know that,
18 and I—I guess we found out that they're not allowed
19 to do that.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

21 INSPECTOR FULTON: I will notify our
22 Highway Division to make sure that they're enforcing
23 that.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, and again
25 like first of all thank you for—this is the

2 information that, you know, is important for us a
3 lot, and we—again, we understand business. The Mayor
4 is leading the Vision Zero. Chief Chan and we're
5 working together very close. You know, we are
6 dealing with, you know, a hit and run. This is
7 another area that I know that it is important. All
8 I'm saying is about all—the only thing that reporter
9 ought to do in media or newspaper stand around 72nd
10 Street and count the number of buses going through
11 that area, and as I said, this is only one particular
12 corridor that I know. I'm pretty sure that when look
13 at the same map through the whole—the whole city,
14 there's going to be other areas. So, for me this is
15 about if there's anyone here who are representative
16 sitting in the audience for the charter buses, we
17 applaud and congratulate, you know, that you are
18 hiring working class drivers, that you are providing
19 good services. We are here to support the good ones,
20 but those that they are—and I'm not going to be
21 mentioning, and I—I can tell you that I have photos
22 in my cell phone of—of those buses because when I'm
23 on the highway, this is something that I've been
24 looking at it. So, I'm not going to be mentioning
25 because some of those drivers belong to companies

2 that on average they are good ones. So, what I'm
3 calling is for those companies to please do the
4 educational. Make your drivers accountable, and for
5 we together, in this case NYPD, you know, let's get—I
6 know that we have limited resources. We are asking
7 for so much in different areas, and I know that we
8 need to at some point talking about increasing the
9 funding so that you can have the largest numbers of
10 men and women, you know in the NYPD dedicated to
11 investigate those cases. So, that—which is my
12 proposal. I believe that, you know, when they get
13 familiar the city stop having an investigation unit.
14 I think we have to bring that investigation unit back
15 to the city, focusing not only on those charter
16 buses, but in other areas that is important for all
17 to investigate those, you know, bad actors in—that we
18 have in our streets. If any of my colleagues has
19 questions, then—

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [interposing] I—I
21 just have a comment. Recently I want to thank DOT
22 the Commissioner, Commissioner Trottenberg and—and
23 also our Manhattan Commissioner Sanchez who is with
24 me and my staff who was standing on Hudson Street and
25 Lake Street and the commuter bus that, you know, came

2 in morning and dropped workers off, it went back over
3 to the Jersey side, and in the afternoon, they come
4 back to pick people up, and they were not supposed to
5 do that exit that's coming off the tunnel on Lake
6 Street. There were signs further. So, right now I
7 think we're trying to get the Jersey, you know, New
8 York, New York, New Jersey Port Authority to get them
9 to also help with the enforcement. There are signs
10 telling them not to come this way, but they still
11 come this way. We're standing there. We were
12 counting how many buses came out and they go down
13 Lake Street, and they block the traffic Hudson,
14 blocking the blocks. They're not following the
15 rules. So, there is something that we all need to
16 work with our partners on the other side of the river
17 to sort of manage, you know, the commuter bus that's—
18 that's coming back into the city

19 INSPECTOR FULTON: I know that's been an
20 issue and it's been complained about several times.
21 I know the First Precinct does a lot of enforcement
22 there.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: No, I mean if, you
24 know, we don't have enough, you know, we don't have
25 enough resources.

2 SCOTT HANOVER: I—I think one of the
3 issues, too, and I think you hit it right on the head
4 when you said a little assistance from the Port
5 Authority. When buses are in that right hand lane
6 for them to make the—if they see that last sign right
7 there that says you can't like to Light Street, it's
8 kind of dangerous for them to go and exit off the
9 other exit. So, I think you might be headed in the
10 right direction as far as we need the Port Authority
11 to do some kind of signage or maybe forbid buses and
12 trucks [background comment] from being in the right
13 hand lane of the tunnel.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
15 Once again—

16 INSPECTOR FULTON: So, I think you're—
17 you're going in the right direction, yeah, involving
18 them.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Well, that's—that's
20 what the Commissioner also kind of suggested to us
21 that we need to get them, and we're working on that.
22 Thank you. [pause]

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Council
24 Member Koo.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Chair,
3 for your ask. Thank you all really. Since you guys
4 who are here, I might as well ask you this question
5 to. Yeah. In my area we have too many like consumer
6 buses who stop in there—in front of churches, in
7 front of synagogues being the bad neighbor, you know.
8 They leave a lot of garbage. They're not supposed to
9 stop there, but there's an enforcement issue, you
10 know. So, how are you guys going to solve it because
11 these buses they don't apply it to specific locations
12 to be there. If they stop, they just go there and
13 pick up, you know, and not just one a time, you know,
14 three or four or five times a day. So, the
15 neighborhood has been really mad with them, and I
16 have a church, a synagogue, but, you know, they—they
17 have to pick up their garbage all the time, you know,
18 and they're also causing a traffic problem. I want
19 to know how you would enforce this.

20 SCOTT HANOVER: I will confer with
21 Inspector Harrison about those locations and what the
22 prevailing times are, and we'll give her some
23 assistance out there with that issue.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, yeah.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Like buses
3 operated the scheduled services between like for
4 example the aqueduct in neighborhoods within the city
5 subject to the Intercity Bus Permit system, and if
6 not, does the city regulate them or the placement or
7 other stops in any way?

8 ALEX KEATING: So, if they're operating
9 entirely within the city of New York they would not
10 fall under the intercity permit regulations. Any bus
11 that is making a pickup or dropoff at our curb does
12 need approval to do so aside from, of course, the
13 charters we discussed before. Also, if-if it's a
14 regular service that includes payment that falls
15 under a franchise regulation in the trade. (sic)

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
17 And-and does the city have an estimate on how many
18 such companies operate, and how many trips they
19 provide?

20 ALEX KEATING: Beyond the applications
21 for curbside pickup and dropoff that we get, we-we
22 wouldn't have an estimate on the total universe that
23 I-that I can discuss today We can certainly look
24 into it and get back to you. [door bangs]

2 HANNAH ROTH: The city and then in terms
3 of franchise buses so buses that operate percent of
4 franchise, we have—there's the airport shuttles have
5 a franchise with the city of New York as does one
6 commute bus line in Brooklyn. [door bangs]

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Do you think that
8 there's some area that they are oversaturated or
9 buses companies, charter buses that you already have
10 granted pickup and dropoff permits? [door bangs]

11 ALEX KEATING: I mean we can certain
12 review the schedules and the—the sort of frequency of
13 service at the various stops that are permitted or
14 approved, and we do so whenever we add a bus or—or
15 renew an application to make sure that we're taking
16 into account safety, street width [door bangs],
17 congestion all those issues. So, well, we can
18 certainly take a look and—and continue the
19 conversation with you.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, I—I just
21 know listening to my colleagues, you know, I know
22 that those some areas that they are more, but they
23 have to deal with this reality in a larger scale than
24 us, than others. And the other thing is and we do
25 stand together with Council Member Koo, and City

2 Controller Stringer, the days after the crash that
3 killed those three individuals in Northern Boulevard
4 in Queens. While we know there's a day as we're
5 holding-getting ready to all the press conference,
6 there was like ten vehicles that they were stopped in
7 that intersection. Like how much in this case-and
8 what we heard from other people, residents there is
9 that that didn't happen-that doesn't happen often in
10 that particular intersection, enforcements. Like are
11 you after the crash in that intersection do you have
12 another plan on increasing the level of enforcement
13 as-before the crash happened?

14 SCOTT HANOVER: I-I can't speak for what
15 the Precinct is doing out there, but we were always
16 enforcing speed regulations over there just for the
17 simple fact you have that stretch coming off the
18 overpass from the City Field Area. So we did
19 enforcement there beforehand and we've increased the
20 enforcement since then and we continue to go back
21 even when this comes further and further in the past,
22 we'll still keep going back there.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, my
24 suggestion again on closing these, you know, let's
25 increase enforcements. Enforcement at this level is

2 weak. Yes, they find again I just know that Hudson
3 River Drive buses going there, and I'm not an NYPD
4 person. I'm just a common citizen, and I assume that
5 the same that happened there is happening in other
6 places. Buses get into areas out of the route that
7 they authorize. So, my message to you let's work
8 together. Let's increase enforcement. Let's talk
9 about increasing the penalty to \$10,000 to those
10 companies and drivers that they do pickup in areas
11 that they are not authorized, and I would to end
12 asking you on what is the message that DOT and NYPD
13 would like to send to the bad actors of the charter
14 bus company? [pause]

15 SHERIFF FUCITO: I wanted to make sure
16 that the full enforcement picture was presented to
17 the Council. I met Council Member Chin yesterday.
18 We talked about issues on the Lower East Side. So,
19 the NYPD handles the enforcement process in the—the
20 beginning. Think of it as the first and second
21 batter up to—in the lineup. They issue the
22 summonses. They do the—the street level enforcement,
23 and part of the process is the people who don't obey.
24 That's where the Department of Finance rolls into the
25 picture, and that process is resolved through the

2 Scofflaw process. Many people are unaware that the
3 tickets that are issued by parking violations they
4 become a form of a court order. That's why the
5 Sheriff is involved. So, these tickets and they're
6 quite substantial get entered judgments and the
7 Sheriff has a very aggressive process. We have a
8 Scofflaw Patrol throughout the city to enforce the
9 summonses that are issued by the New York City Police
10 Department and we have very, very large numbers as
11 far as the entire enforcement, and we have a subset
12 involving buses. So, last year for the fiscal year
13 we seized 115,000 automobiles. That generated \$53
14 million in revenue for the city. Of that subset
15 (coughs) 352 were New York State registered buses,
16 and that's only buses that fall back to New York
17 State registrations, and as discussed, there's a
18 large population that are from out of state. We have
19 an aggressive process where we look for vehicles
20 including buses that have excessive judgment debt. We
21 had a particular issue on the Lower East Side
22 concerning one bus company that had hundreds of
23 thousands of dollars in debt, and we took enforcement
24 action by seizing the buses, as you had requested
25 just a few moments ago that that's the type of

2 enforcement you're looking for. We do carry out that
3 level of enforcement. Once a debt threshold goes
4 over \$2,500, the Sheriff will seize the vehicle, and
5 as the Inspector mentioned, it is a very, very costly
6 process because it's a court process, and all of the
7 costs associated with the seizure must be borne by
8 the person we seized the property from. So, the
9 particular case of the Lower East Side, we seized six
10 buses, which generated \$250 million in unpaid fines,
11 and I believe that the bus company has been more--has
12 been a better actor in your community because of the
13 enforcement we have taken. And just yesterday we
14 seized another bus for \$18,000 in unpaid parking
15 violations. So, the Department of Finance is very,
16 very proactive looking for the bad actors in our
17 lane. We don't have the structure that NYPD has.
18 I'll tell you our numbers. We have 12 city marshals
19 and deputy sheriffs that constantly patrol the city
20 during the business days, and those officers seized
21 115,000 vehicles last year. That's a significant
22 amount of property to be taken.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] What is
24 there--what is there to--[on mic] make on the
25 effectiveness of increasing the enforcement from your

2 side if there's an increase of men and women power in
3 your unit?

4 SHERIFF FUCITO: Well, I've been before
5 you before. You've never been shy to say that we're
6 very, very strong in our enforcement efforts, and we
7 will certainly continue to with the enforcement. We
8 specifically looked at buses this entire week. The-
9 the population of buses, we scanned hundreds of
10 buses. Many of them had been ticketed before, and
11 they paid their violations, and the ones that did not
12 we seized, and that's the process we're looking for.
13 WE have a hypersensitivity to this bus issue. We-we-
14 we're looking to-to devote our enforcement strategies
15 towards buses and other commercial motor vehicle
16 traffic that's out there. That's long-term plans.
17 Right now we have a very aggressive program that
18 address scofflaw.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Well, I'm
20 happy to hear those numbers the 115,000 and the-and
21 the 350. I think that this is something that the New
22 Yorkers they need to hear. You know, sometimes we
23 cannot do what the federal government is doing right
24 now. Like I was surprised to hear that the person
25 from the media who is doing the story she's

2 requesting a FOIL, the information to the federal
3 government on how many drivers being fined, bus
4 drivers. She said that she had to wait—she was told
5 that she had to wait eight months, and this I guess
6 a—to elected officials. This is not something being
7 told to another average New Yorkers. This is about
8 to the group of individuals who do the job, looking
9 for information to educate and enforce what's going
10 to happen. How someone for an immense media being
11 told you need to wait eight months to get this
12 information in the time of technology. Like—and how
13 much of those information does the federal government
14 and DOT and New York City—New York State Department
15 of Transportation share with the city? Do they share
16 some of this information or they don't have to share
17 the information?

18 HANNAH ROTH: Well, from DOT's
19 perspective [door bangs] we wouldn't get—we
20 coordinate with our state and federal partners in a
21 lot policy ways. In terms of specific companies, we
22 leave enforcement up to our partners at PD. So, they
23 may have some systems. I know that the Sheriff has
24 mentioned [door bangs] some systems of how different
25

2 states communicate with one another, and how the city
3 communicates with the state and federal government.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Do they share
5 those information with you?

6 HANNAH ROTH: What information?

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Number of—from
8 those bus companies that become connect, drop off and
9 pickup in New York City, how many of other drivers
10 who work for those company get fined tickets every
11 year for a different reason?

12 HANNAH ROTH: Not that I'm aware of.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. So like,
14 you know, my last thing is about what is the message
15 that you want to send to the charter busses? Not to
16 everyone. Everyone just keeping doing their job—
17 their good job. They're a roll model, but to those
18 bad actors that every three or four years are part of
19 the problem where we're losing 3 lives, 15 lives a
20 few years ago, and we don't know how many more lives
21 we will lose in another crash three or four years
22 from now.

23 ED PINCAR: So, I—I think the message is
24 that safety is our top priority, and one thing that I
25 just want to underscore and Council Member Chin has

2 brought up as well is that all of the agencies
3 involved in this DOT, the Sheriff's Office, Finance,
4 PD, we're all working together to address many of the
5 issues associated with private buses, and
6 specifically for the PD as Inspector Hanover has
7 mentioned, we have really refocused the mission of
8 the bus unit, and that's why I think you're seeing a
9 real increase in moving violation enforcement and
10 parking violation enforcement, and I think that's
11 something will be continuing as we take a very—a very
12 comprehensive look at bus enforcement strategy as we
13 enter 2018.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I want to
15 acknowledge that we were also joined before by
16 Council Member Van Bramer and Garodnick, and the
17 last—and Council Member Miller he has questions.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Mr.
19 Chair. Good morning to the members of the panel.
20 So, this is difficult because this is difficult
21 because this is an industry that I spent about 30
22 years of my professional life in, and I know that—
23 that while your testimony says that this is an
24 industry that is highly regulated by the federal
25 government, that is just not the case at all. We

2 have seen decades of diminishing of regulations in
3 this industry, which have really contributed to what
4 we've--what we're seeing now. So, we realistically
5 want to focus on this, and be able to address the
6 problems that we see. More--more importantly, as the
7 Chair just said, that we are not experiencing a loss
8 of lives every few years that we need to
9 collaboratively address the realities of this
10 industry, and understand that the safety mechanisms
11 that are in place are woefully insufficient, and that
12 the city has a responsibility to address
13 transportation, all forms of transportation that are
14 operating on the streets of here in New York. And,
15 while you say that you are aggressively--have an
16 aggressive bus unit, I would dismiss that. I would
17 dismiss the fact that this--that these unregulated or
18 often unregulated buses are operating here in the
19 city of New York, they're not the only industries
20 that--that are doing so within the transportation
21 industry. And--and so, I want to focus on what we can
22 do as a city considering that we have a lack of
23 authority in terms of regulating and authorization
24 of--of these vehicles because it's quite obvious that
25 those who are operating here even we just spent a lot

2 of time regulating the commute van industry and-and-
3 and bringing them up to snuff to make sure that they
4 operate under the same guidelines or close to the
5 guidelines as others that are regulated by TLC and-
6 and others, but yet we allow these folks and others
7 to operate on our streets without a-kind of a
8 universal standard. How do we get to that standard,
9 and as-as the Council Member also mentioned, what is
10 the collaboration that-that we can ensure that we are
11 taking unsafe drivers off the street? Now, we know
12 that there is a process that all of these carriers
13 including the MTA (coughs) has to submit affidavits
14 of certification for their operators [door bangs] bi-
15 annually or whatever that-what-whatever that time
16 period is. How do we know how we are coordinating to
17 ensure that we have (coughs) properly credentialed
18 and certified drivers on the road? What are we doing
19 to ensure to-to audit these companies to make sure
20 that the companies are in compliance to whatever we
21 can do? Obviously, we don't have the authority to do
22 some of the thigs that the federal government does,
23 but in terms of coordinating with those agencies that
24 are responsible for putting people on the streets of
25 New York City including the DMV, quite frankly,

2 right, the DMV should have this type of information
3 when licenses are revoked for any reason at all.
4 And, there should be a centralized data base, and-and
5 if we're not aggressively pursuing that, I don't know
6 how do we get to the ends, or how do we say that
7 we're being safe? For someone who continues to be
8 aggressively addressing safety, transportation safety
9 as a member of the Council and in particular this
10 committee here, and-and we've had this dialogue with-
11 with TLC and DOT time and time again really trying to
12 get our hands around precisely what are we doing to
13 ensure that-that these rogue companies are off the
14 road? And I'll just say that I spent some time in-in
15 Councilman Koo's district around the area of
16 Roosevelt and Prince, and-and the folks and the
17 residents of that area are so disappointed that they
18 can't have these buses that are illegally parked
19 there. Rarely just seeing those removed from there
20 that-that-that they are illegally parked 10 or 15 at
21 a time. They're-they're running-they're-they're
22 actually-have their engine running. It is congested.
23 It is unsafe, and I can't see that we say that we're
24 aggressively going there. I assure you that if we
25 went down there right now, there's at least 10 busses

2 parked there illegally in that location. And so,
3 not--that's--that's not the--and that is--mind you, that
4 is less than four blocks from where the accident
5 occurred. What are we doing specifically that--that
6 would--that we can take with us to say that we are
7 trying to create a safer environment for the
8 residents of New York City.

9 ALEX KEATING: I mean I can Council
10 Member Miller thanks for the question. On DOT's
11 side, we've been working with--with you and other
12 council members at looking at specific areas that do
13 requires treatments at the curb in terms of
14 dedicating space to try to rationalize the way that
15 the curb and the road are used, and we appreciate the
16 opportunity to continue looking at specific examples
17 that we can try to address through our curb regs,
18 through design, and street improvement projects.
19 Safety is the top priority, and we are dedicated to
20 making sure that all of the existing traffic laws and
21 curb regs are obeyed through education. In some
22 cases it does involve working with the drivers, and
23 with newcomers to the city especially if they're
24 bringing service from out of state, but also through
25 enforcement, through targeted enforcement, [door

2 bangs] and we'll continue to work with our partners
3 at PD, and City Council members and the community to-
4 to better target enforcement where possible.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: It's proven (sic)
6 the community doesn't want these buses parked outside
7 of their homes, but they're there. How do we not
8 just move? You know, how do we allow that to happen?
9 So, and—and I'll let us ponder that, but enforcement,
10 enforcement, enforcement, and I know that from a TLC
11 perspective there are a very limited number of-of
12 enforcement officers out there. So, it requires for-
13 for PD and all the agencies work collaborative, but
14 it's been a stretch. It's-it's really been a
15 stretch. Now, in the case of this particular company
16 here, [door bangs] now only was the-the operator of
17 this vehicle here, Mr. Mooney (sic) not on their-on
18 their roll of certified operators, they had
19 themselves not submitted the proper affidavit
20 identifying who their employers were, and who were to
21 be on the road. [door bangs] How do we prevent that
22 from happening? How do we as—does it require
23 legislation that gives us the authority to say that
24 if you were going to operate within the City of New
25 York the City of New York has to have some say-so

2 and—and who these folks operating these vehicles are.
3 Now, whether or not we are—it's the licensing. You
4 know, we know that's different. We know that
5 there's—there's the commercial driver's license and—
6 and—and others that we're not asking to play a role
7 in, but certainly we need to know that everyone who's
8 operating a vehicle within the city of New York, a
9 commercial vehicle for profit that—that they are
10 meeting certain standards. Is there anything in
11 place, or is anything by virtue of this latest
12 accident, unfortunate accident, that has propelled us
13 to think along those ways?

14 ALEX KEATING: I—I think that's a really
15 good question.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: How do we know
17 that—that these companies that—that are required to—
18 to submit affidavits—davits to—to at least the DMV,
19 have certified drivers on the road? This is our
20 road. This is—this is our city. How do we protect
21 our citizens?

22 ALEX KEATING: Of course, we can't speak
23 to the specifics of—of the—the crash in Flushing
24 right now given the ongoing NTSB investigation, but
25 in general we—we do look to work with our state and

2 federal partners to understand how-how legislation
3 can be put forward to-to move that along and to get-
4 get a better system in place.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, I don't
6 want-I'll just say, again I've spend 30 years in the
7 industry, and-and there's a lot of information
8 available and a lot of research available and to say
9 that we look forward to, we should have been doing
10 that already, and that if there are experts I this
11 room I would suggest that-that we all kind of put our
12 heads together, and whether that means that we
13 formulate some-some actual committees around this,
14 and-but this is certainly something that we don't
15 want to revisit when the next tragedy occurs saying
16 that we're going to do something. But I would submit
17 that everyone in this room certainly has a role to
18 play, and because those from the federal government
19 that are responsible for-for really diminishing the
20 type of standards that we hear in New York City have,
21 are not here and other folks that-that authorizing
22 agencies are not here, it's a little difficult to
23 have this conversation, but what we need to say is
24 what can we do? We understand that his is an
25 industry that is [door bangs] in comparison woefully

2 under-regulated in terms of the responsibilities of
3 the drivers that are on the road. They don't have
4 labor standards that allow them and cause them to
5 spend many, many more hours than the average
6 commercial driver would on the road. So, in this the
7 majority of the accidents and over road over the past
8 few decades since the industry standards have been
9 diminished have been because of driver fatigue. And—
10 and so how do we seriously address that if these
11 folks are going to be on our road? And mind you that
12 this is a very specific hearing about an industry,
13 but we've had many hearings about transportation
14 alternative industries in this city, and I would
15 submit that we're not doing our very best to ensure
16 the safety of our passengers. And so, I'm—I'm asking
17 everyone to—to kind of take that back to—to your
18 principals, and I'm asking the Chair that we figure
19 out what it is that we can do collectively to ensure
20 the safety of the workers. Thank you so much, Chair.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, and
22 definitely we will. I went to the hospital to visit
23 one of the families who their wife she was only aware
24 that her husband was taking to the hospital like 12
25 hours after the crash happened in Queens. We also

2 know that what happened at the Boulevard also took
3 the life away of--you read in the newspaper a person
4 although for the first time he decided to wake up
5 early that day to do exercise. Many years ago there
6 was 14 or 15 people who died in the[--across Bronx.
7 You know, we cannot wait for the next crash to
8 happen. We agree we don't control many of those
9 rules because they are ruled by the federal
10 government. We do control the pickup and dropoff.
11 We do control speeding. We do control buses not to
12 be in an area that they're not allowed to be. We do
13 control for companies not to use the permit of
14 another company, and I hope that they should be the
15 strongest penalty in those cases. So, I even heard
16 that Dahlia was still around these days, and I think
17 that it should alarm all of us for a company with a
18 bad record like Dahlia to still be doing business
19 around here. So, again we don't---I understand the
20 limitation from the federal and the state, but it is
21 a shame that a bus company that hire drivers with
22 that bad record still is around through Queens and
23 other places putting the lives at risk not only of
24 the passengers, but of pedestrians. So, with that,
25 thank you for your presentation, and we're going to

2 be taking like a three-minutes break to go to the
3 other hearing, and then be back in ten minutes.
4 Thank you. I would like to recognize that we've also
5 been joined—we're joined by Council Member Levin,
6 Rose and Greenfield. [background comment, pause]
7 Okay, let's continue, and if by any chance I have to,
8 you know, stop with two minutes it's because I have
9 to go back and go vote on the Land use. The next
10 panel is Judy Ritchheimer [background comment]
11 Ritchheimer [background comment] Andrew Sider
12 [background comment]. Mary Harry, Jeff Rosenberg-
13 berry. [background comment, pause] Public Rights,
14 Association. [background comments, door bangs] And To
15 Protect. So nobody is from the public right. This
16 is the last panel just in case that I missed someone.
17 [background comment] Okay, you can sit down. You may
18 start. We will put the clock in two minutes.

19 JUDY RITCHHEIMER: Hello. [off mic] I
20 just—sorry. Hello, my name is Judy Ricthhimer. I'm
21 representing the Guides Association of New York City.
22 I'm the Chair of their Government Relations
23 Committee, and incidentally signed onto the same bill
24 I'm going to discuss is the Chelsea Reformed
25 Democratic Club. The Guides Association of New York

2 City known as GANYC represents professional tour
3 guides in New York, and we're here with my colleague
4 Andy Sedore. I'm here to first thank you for allow
5 us to speak and especially for authoring the bill
6 Intro 1657, which promotes safety on double decker
7 buses by requiring double decker bus companies to
8 have live presences specifically tour guides on top
9 of the buses.

10 Tour guides on double decker buses save
11 lives. Example: A tour guide saw that one of his
12 passenger's kids got—the kid got her head stuck in
13 the—the metal bars and was able to down to bus driver
14 to stop the bus so the kid's head could be extricated
15 from those bars. They were about to go through a
16 tunnel or something like that that would have put the
17 kid's head in extreme danger, and possibly have been
18 decapitated.

19 Tour guides on top of buses are good not
20 only for our visitors, but also for New Yorkers.
21 Example: A tour guide stopped a passenger from
22 throwing a suitcase off the top of the double decker
23 bus to his friend down below, which could have hit
24 anyone on the street.

2 When I worked on double decker buses, I
3 managed to pull up—it must have been a 200 or 250
4 pound man [bell] who was jackknifed over the side the
5 railing. So, we—should I continue or--? No. Thank
6 you.

7 ANDY SEDORE: Hi, I'm Andy Sedore, and
8 while I'm not currently working on double decker
9 buses, I did work on them for many years and was also
10 for long time a union representative of tour guides
11 at Gray Lines New York Sightseeing that was Transport
12 Workers Union 225. Again, to reiterate the—the tour
13 guides saving lives, it's also a thing of the city's
14 right to regulate. Theses are buses operating
15 entirely within the city. Because that they're able
16 to prescribe their routes and prescribe their
17 conduct, we already had existing laws banning the
18 driver from giving a tour. What happened was as the
19 technology comes along, and the companies were saying
20 we could have recorded tours instead of that's—that's
21 not getting—given by the driver, and then also
22 arguing we'll put a camera so the driver could see
23 what's on top of the bus. But, you've got to
24 understand that creates more distraction for the
25 driver. You know, we're talking about problems with

2 bus drivers. The problem of exhaustion is one issue.
3 The problem with distraction is another, and as new
4 technology comes along, we find we have greater
5 distractions. Cell, you know, Smart Phones came out.
6 We had to pass a law saying bus drivers cannot use
7 Smart Phone while giving a tour. So, the idea of
8 letting the technology pick up the slack is not the
9 case. And so, what we were—have been proposing is a—
10 really a tweak to already existing law that exists
11 within the city. The city has the authority. Cities
12 use the authority. This authority has stood up
13 legally for decades, but with Intro 1657 to basically
14 ensure that a driver, that a licensed guide licensed
15 so the city has tabs on who this person is. Now,
16 it's important to his license because the—licensing
17 requires that the guy knows things. For instance,
18 because I have a guide license. I have to know you
19 can't take a bus on the Henry Hudson Parkway. It's
20 kind of like I was just stifling when you were
21 saying, when you were asking that question because I
22 have to know that. If I'm doing step-on guide and
23 I've got a bus driver from Alabama, which I still do
24 that kind of stuff, my first question: Have you ever
25 driven in New York before, and if the answer is no, I

2 got to very prescriptive [bell]. I have to do that.
3 I have to make sure he goes on the right road. Both
4 to protect him from getting a ticket, but also to
5 keep things safe and legal. That's something you can
6 only get with a licensed guide, and that's why we
7 need to keep this requirement—that we need to put
8 this requirement where we have that kind of city
9 regulated personnel on the top of the bus.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Thank you.

11 [off mic]

12 JEFF ROSENBERG: Good morning. I'm Jeff
13 Rosenberg wit the Amalgamated Transit Union, the
14 International Office in Washington, D.C. We represent
15 workers of Greyhound, Peter Pan, and other over-the-
16 road bus companies as well as several thousand people
17 here at New York City Transit. As Council Member Chin
18 had stated the over-the-road bus industry is like the
19 wild west. No question about it, and with all due
20 respect to the discussion that happened earlier, it's
21 not just an enforcement issue here. Mr. Chairman,
22 you were talking about—you were asking lots of
23 questions about the number of buses that were pulled
24 over in recent years. I can tell you it's an
25 exercise in futility trying poll ever bus that you

2 think has a problem here. A national study indicated
3 that there's more than inspector for every 1,000 bus
4 and truck companies nationwide. It's a game of
5 guacamole. (sic) You're not going to be able to snuff
6 out this problem simply by pulling these buses over.
7 There's much, much deeper issues here. We have buses
8 that are crashing all over the country. The major
9 issue here is fatigue, fatigue, fatigue, fatigue. In
10 my testimony there's a chart from the National
11 Transportation Safety Board. Thirty-six percent of
12 over-the-road bus crashes resulting in fatalities
13 over the last ten years have been the result of
14 fatigues. We know this. It's driver fatigue. Why
15 are the bus drivers falling asleep at the wheel?
16 Several reasons but one of the major reasons is the
17 fact that they are exempt from the Fair Labor
18 Standards Act's Overtime Provision, which 85% of the
19 U.S. population gets as a result of not getting
20 overtime when they go over 40 hours. Bus operators
21 work insane number of hours. By the time they get
22 behind the wheel, they're exhausted. They're working
23 two and three other jobs. Not really an issue for
24 this committee, by the Fair Labor Standards Act is a
25 major issue. The—overall we have—we have an

2 industry, which is plagued by fatigue, fatigue,
3 fatigue. We have low wages throughout the industry.
4 We know exactly what the problem is. Nobody is
5 addressing the issues. You can certainly push people
6 across Jersey by enforcing the laws [bell] the best
7 you can, but all you're going to do is have laws—all
8 you're going to do is have crashes that are occurring
9 over state lines. New Yorkers are going to continue
10 to die whether it be in New York or North Carolina.
11 Wherever it might be, we want to stop the crashes
12 from happening.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And thank you,
14 and definitely we would like to work you and the, you
15 know, all New Yorkers, especially also those
16 representing the voices of a grassroots community
17 group and also as the unions who represented the
18 workers. I need to excuse myself another five
19 minutes again because that again we have with this
20 bill, we are voting on this rezoning project, but I
21 didn't caught that. When I get there, I'll vote and
22 be back. Okay. Next, person please. Your turn.

23 Is it on? Right.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

2 CHRISTINE BERTHET: Thank you, Chair
3 Rodriguez and Council Members for convening this
4 hearing. We know that, you know, we are from. I'm
5 Christine Berthet from CHEKPEDS in Chelsea and Hells
6 Kitchen. We have 8,000 bus trips per day including
7 adding 400 for long distance and about 300 tour and
8 charter buses parking in our neighborhoods. So, I
9 think we know something about buses, and two months
10 ago unfortunately charter bus drivers killed two
11 cyclists in our neighborhood because they were
12 traveling on an illegal route and it was very, very
13 emotional. So, I think we applaud this initiative,
14 and I think we can do better as you said. First, on
15 safety. I think first and foremost, there is today a
16 safety screening before stops are granted. You know
17 the Federal Highway Administration set for bus
18 applications provides all necessary information to
19 determine whether the driver he picked enough feet
20 (sic) for safety, and then currently many are not and
21 they are not being tested. Subcontractors, Council
22 Member Chin talked about that, and today permits in
23 our neighborhood are given to companies where the
24 buses and the drivers belong to other companies, and,
25 in fact, the companies are charging other companies

2 to use the stop. So, there is a nice little racket
3 going on there, and I think we need to have something
4 in the permit that says the buses and the drivers
5 need to belong or be employed by the company rather
6 than having this loose subcontracting environment.
7 While it's on location, today the operators apply for
8 a stop instead of the DOT selecting what stops are
9 good for Vision Zero and for, you know, safety.
10 [bell] It should be there for the--the--the contrary.
11 Fatigue, we have a 350 company that want to park in
12 the neighborhood, and they don't have any place to
13 park. We need a bus garage to park the buses and
14 have a room where the drivers can rest, and can get
15 cool and can be in the good shape for driving again
16 in the evening. And finally, I have other things,
17 but I want to talk about renewals, and I think we
18 should start with that because we started that
19 process about three years ago, and now come the
20 renewals, and the renewal process is not really
21 designed at all. The renewal process should be one
22 where you check the summonses and where you checked
23 parking tickets, et cetera and it should be really
24 designed immediately so that we don't start renewing
25 for three years, people which have not been good

2 operates for three years. I'll let you read the rest
3 of it. Thank you.

4 MARK HENRY: Good morning Chairman and
5 invited guests. My name is Mark Henry. I'm
6 President of Local 1056 in Queens and I represent New
7 York City Transit Operators in Southeast Queens where
8 that incident happened in Downtown Flushing. First,
9 my condolences to the family and their lives and also
10 to applaud the bus operator for saving those
11 individuals' on that bus lives. Commuters,
12 taxpayers, and—and visitors in New York do deserve
13 the most safe commute across the city. Illegal vans,
14 Dahlia style companies must be regulated. Budget
15 cuts and—and bringing reductions in enforcement cause
16 incidents like this to occur more frequently. It's
17 badly needed that we need a coordinated effort
18 between DOT, TLC, Traffic, NYPD and the Department of
19 Motor Vehicles and—and their presence needs to be
20 also out there in the streets in order to curtail
21 some of these activities. The New York City Transit
22 Authority and those who—who ride buses and subways we
23 are sent through a battery of testing, a battery of
24 physicals, a battery of recurrent training. There
25 are so many things that has to come into play, and

2 should come into play with this type of industry
3 whether it's the illegal vans trying to eliminate
4 them and get them regulated, ore in these Dahlia
5 style companies that need to be regulated as well.
6 These things need to be put in place, and I applaud
7 this—you know, I implore on this Council to do just
8 that. Don't just certify that the vehicles can be on
9 the street, but to certify the operators of these
10 vehicles. I think the public deserves that type of
11 public safety. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Thank
13 you. [on mic] Well, Council Member Miller has a
14 question.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay. So, there
16 is a few things, and I'm wondering, you—I caught the
17 end of your testimony. You were talking about
18 renewals. Will you talk about what the current
19 renewal process is?

20 CHRISTINE BERTHET: Requiring an approval
21 meeting?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: For renewal.

23 CHRISTINE BERTHET: Oh, renewal. It's—
24 it's very ill-defined. There is only that I know
25 when I asked the question of DOT that, you know,

2 buses, which have police, which have had police
3 action against them will not be renewed, but it's not
4 codified in any way, and the second thing is that the
5 community input is not take in action-in-in
6 consideration. So, first of all, we know there is
7 not enough enforcement. So, most of the people are
8 not going to have a ticket. Then the tickets, the
9 flow of tickets from the police to the DOT is not
10 organized yet, and then there is a question of, you
11 know, what are you going to be not renewed for? Is
12 it a parking ticket? Is it how many tickets? You
13 know you have to define--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing] So-
15 -

16 CHRISTINE BERTHET: You know, you have to
17 define some limits probably to be fair.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing] So-
19 -

20 CHRISTINE BERTHET: So, I think this
21 whole process is-is probably rubber stamped except--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing] Are
23 they-are they-do you know if they certify equipment?
24 Do they certify the operators? What portion of the-
25 the renewal--

2 CHRISTINE BERTHET: [interposing] No.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: --what goes into
4 this renewal?

5 CHRISTINE BERTHET: No.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay.

7 CHRISTINE BERTHET: It doesn't.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Mr. Rosenberg,
9 could you speak of--

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing] I'm
11 sorry, Council Member, since are you--do you still
12 want to take a turn? Let me first answer it. He--he
13 didn't know if he wanted to speak before Council
14 Member Koo is here. So, let's give you your two
15 minutes. Then we will continue with the questions.

16 SUE SHABBAT: Hi. My name is Sue
17 Shabbat(sp), and I'm Director of Community Affairs at
18 the Free Synagogue of Flushing. My problem stems from
19 the casino buses. One of the services we provide at
20 the synagogue is Gamblers Anonymous, and one day the
21 casino bus just randomly started parking in front of
22 our--our synagogue and for six months, I mean I called
23 the 109 Precinct. I call the Traffic Agents to see
24 what they could do. They said they were--they were
25 just flip-flopping back and forth. So, for six months

2 I went out and I started taking pictures. There are
3 three license plate numbers, and they were operating
4 for a casino that deems themselves Resort World
5 Casino, New York Casino, but they're using third-
6 party-third-party buses to operate their shuttles.
7 Is that legal? That's one of the questions I have,
8 and—and how many tickets per day can be issued per
9 bus? Because these buses operated seven days a week.
10 Fortunately they left, but they only moved across the
11 street. So, I'm—I'm lost as to who is supposed to
12 respond to these types of complaints. You know, at
13 the 109 Precinct, the traffic agents say it's out of
14 my hands. I can just only issue ticket violations,
15 but how much? They get them almost every day if
16 they're operating seven days a week. But we can't
17 provide these types of services to the community no
18 one is enforcing the fact that that area is a loading
19 zone, and when the bus doesn't make it there in time,
20 they put orange cones out. I have pictures. I've
21 taken pictures. I had to document this, and then
22 I've taken it to Councilman Koo's Office and worked
23 with his Director of Community Relations Stella Chan
24 to get it resolved, but still they just moved right
25 across the street.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes, and that's
3 why [bell] that, you know, the reason why we put this
4 hearing together was a lot with Council Member Koo
5 bringing to my attention that it was important to all
6 the hearings because of what happened, and this was
7 not only with Dahlia, but other behavior, other
8 companies there. So, you hear also from the DOT that
9 the permits at least they one related to the pickup
10 and dropoff, which is the one that the DOT provides
11 that those permits are not transferrable. That no
12 company should allow a second company to use those
13 permits, and as you heard, that's one of the factors
14 that they consider and it's time for them to give
15 another of those permits to those companies. So,
16 today's, you know, it's a call and following I'm
17 pretty sure your suggestions and your frustration
18 that you shared with Council Member Koo and what
19 happened also on Norther Boulevard. [door bangs] If
20 you don't mind.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah, yeah.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Let me turn—

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [interposing] May I
24 just continue. Just two minutes. So, we—we know
25 about this now. We have—we—we have been working

2 with DOT and the local precinct. Like everyone said,
3 it's just a matter of enforcement, right. You know,
4 so they can only write so many tickets in a day, but
5 also we will—we'll still work with them seeing what
6 else can we do to like relocate this process. Yeah.

7 SUE SHABBAT: Okay.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
9 Miller.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yep, and I thank
11 you, and—and Council Member Koo, you had stepped out,
12 but I was talking about our experiences as you and I
13 were traveling through the Bland Houses together, and
14 a number of your constituents was concerned or
15 complaining about the number of buses that were
16 idling and just running around the building there and
17 what could be done about that, and that has a greater
18 impact even if they're just sitting with congestion
19 on-on traffic and on safety as well. So, certainly,
20 you know, we want to address that. So, Mr.
21 Rosenberg. So what I wanted to—to—for you to explain
22 was some of—some of the—the over-the-road regulations
23 and—and—and how they've been diminished over the past
24 decades, and the impact that they've had on industry
25 and—and safety throughout the country and

2 particularly here in New York City if any impact that
3 they've had on some of the accidents, the more
4 egregious accidents that we've seen over the past few
5 years here in the city, and base on those regulations
6 or the lack thereof, what would be your—your insight
7 on that? I'm sorry. This was for Mrs. Rosenberg.

8 JUDY RITCHHEIMER: Oh, okay, that was
9 good to say, you know.

10 JEFF ROSENBERG: I appreciate the
11 question Council Member—Council Member Miller. The
12 long and short of it is that the industry has not
13 been regulated significantly over the last 30 years.
14 There was a major move to deregulate the intercity
15 bus industry, the over-the-road bus industry back in
16 1982 by Congress, and ever since then, it has been a
17 snowball downhill because the—it's been a race to the
18 bottom. It used to be that if a bus company wanted
19 to get into business they had to petition the
20 Interstate Commerce Commission, which is no longer
21 around, and they had to get specific permission to
22 get—for particular routes, for particular fares that
23 they wanted to be charged. Nowadays since they do
24 regulate the industry, it's-it's, you know, we have
25 these two and three mom and pop bus companies all

2 over the country. Some of them are quite legitimate.
3 Others are not. It's hard to keep an eye on all of
4 them. They—they offer these whopping low fares. The
5 reason that we're able to do that is because they pay
6 their operators very little, very little and working
7 conditions are horrific, horrific. We go into detail
8 in our testimony. If you are fortunate enough to get
9 a hotel as an operator for one of these, companies
10 when you're on the road, chances are you're sleeping
11 with bed bugs, and chances are that you're in a place
12 that is not going to give you a lot of rest. These
13 drivers never sleep. They drive—they two and three
14 jobs when they're not behind the wheel because of the
15 fact that they can't make ends meet. Is there any
16 wonder why these buses keep crashing? So, while I
17 totally appreciate what's—and the discussion here
18 today as far as regulating Southeast Queens and
19 whatever it might be on the FDR Drive, you know,
20 you're just going to push people over to another
21 place where the accidents are going to continue to
22 happen until they get at the core issues of wages and
23 conditions in the intercity bus industry. We know
24 that when wages increase that it's going to have a
25 direct impact on safety. We have studies which we

2 cite in our testimony, which directly point to that.
3 The truth is that there's a limited amount of things
4 that the city can do even the state can do. It's a-
5 it's -it's a federal issue and Congress just today
6 we're very pleased that Congress is introducing the
7 fair the Driver Fatigue Prevention Act once again.
8 It was previously a bill introduced by Senator
9 Schumer. Now, it's going to be introduced by Senator
10 Casey in the House in the Senate and-and
11 Representative Speier from California in the House to
12 get at the issues of fatigue in the intercity bus
13 industry by simply allowing drivers to earn overtime
14 like the rest of the population. But as far as the
15 city is concerned, as far as the State is concerned,
16 there are small things we can do here. You know, you
17 look there are lessons that can be learned from
18 places like Boston and Washington, D.C. which have
19 curtailed curbside bus operations significantly.
20 They-they use the, you know, the intermodal
21 facilities in their cities and there's not many
22 accidents that are happening those particular areas
23 compared to here in New York. But ultimately it's a
24 federal issue and-and I really encourage the Council
25 to get in a coalition with other cities throughout

2 the Eastern Seaboard particularly to demand that
3 Congress do something about this issue. Demand that
4 the—the drivers be paid appropriately. To demand
5 that the working conditions improve. Otherwise,
6 we're going to continue to see the same problems. We
7 don't have enough resources to pull these buses over
8 here in the city or anywhere else in throughout the
9 country. It's just going to continue to happen if
10 you don't stop the drivers from falling asleep at the
11 wheel.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Very good, and—
13 and Mr. Henry, could you—could you explain some of—
14 some of what you talked about, the plethora of
15 certification regulations and re-certifications and
16 training that happens, that takes place within the
17 bus operators. Could you kind of speak to the
18 different including the amount of hours that you are
19 able to operate over the road as well.

20 MARK HENRY: Sure. Thank you,
21 Councilman. We go through a battery of physical
22 tests, sight, hearing, reflexes and it's 19-A
23 Standard that's—that's provided by the state and
24 certified to every operator that works for the New
25 York City Transit Authority. In—in that battery of

2 tests we have to do that periodically, once a year.
3 If you're below a certain age twice and there's
4 mandatory rechecks involved with that as well. So,
5 these operators are—are scrutinized to the enth level
6 that I can—that I know of. I've been a part of this
7 process for some 30 odd years. So, I know that the—
8 the standards that are done by Transit Authority are
9 of a high level, and it's something that this
10 industry definitely needs.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: What—what may be
12 some of the instances in which certification or a
13 person would—the certification would be revoked not
14 just from a physical standpoint? Is there anything
15 else that would cause someone to lose their
16 certification on their licenses in this point, and
17 what mechanism is in place to know that a person has
18 lost their license or been decertified or
19 disqualified?

20 JEFF ROSENBERG: Well, under—under the—
21 the 19-A Certification, say if an individual has a
22 number infractions, speeding tickets, drunk driving
23 something of those major incidents, you can be
24 decertified and—and basically be pulled off the bus.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: But-and-and
3 because this is a national data base that-that with
4 that 19-A someone in another state or another agency
5 would automatically know? Is that correct?

6 JEFF ROSENBERG: I'm sorry. Repeat your
7 question.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Because this is a
9 national database that-that with the 19-A
10 Certification, they would-they would automatically
11 know that the CDL had been revoked?

12 JEFF ROSENBERG: Correct, that is-that is
13 absolutely correct. It is a national data base. All
14 the operators that work for the Transit Authority
15 are-are built do this, and if they have any type of
16 major traffic infraction anywhere in the country, it
17 is driven through this data base, and they can be
18 removed from service.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And does anybody
20 know why that the over-the-road drivers are not held
21 to the same standards? And-and you did say major,
22 and I also know if you have a lapse in your insurance
23 that will also disqualify you, if you have a lapse of
24 that.

2 JEFF ROSENBERG: [interposing] That is
3 true as well.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Is there any
5 reason why the over-the-road drivers aren't held to
6 the same standards?

7 JEFF ROSENBERG: Is there any reason why
8 people who ride on buses are not treated with the
9 same amount of respect as people who ride trains or
10 ride in planes? Until any of that changes, we're
11 going to see the same problems happening, right, but
12 we have seen a total-looking the other way by the
13 federal government from one administration to the
14 next.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, thank you.
16 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Right and think
18 that it is so great to end this hearing with this
19 panel because you are bringing those suggestions
20 concerning, you know, from the union perspective. We
21 know that, you know, there's a difference between
22 those companies that are represented by the union.
23 You work hard to be sure that your drivers also
24 follow all the rules and regulations. Presenting
25 someone that represents like a major bus company, we

2 always expect—expect that you continue being the good
3 one in this conversation, and I'm happy to see how
4 their voices after what happened in Council Member
5 Koo's for those three great hardworking individuals
6 that lost their life, you know, immediately brought
7 all the elected officials from Senator Schumer to
8 Congressmen and members of the House of
9 Representatives, the private and the public sector.
10 This is our time for which we learn from other
11 previous experience and I hope that we can be able to
12 learn from what is happening in New York City and the
13 surrounding area, but also in other city or
14 municipality or this section, and let's see how we
15 can, you know, make those few percentage bad actors
16 more accountable, and let's take them out of
17 business. You know, that should be our business. We
18 should encourage the good ones to continue their
19 business, but someone again that goes out and print a
20 permit or use the permit of another company or the
21 company that allow a second and third one to use
22 their permit to make a small percentage of the
23 profit, their permit should not be renewed but DOT if
24 we can do it. So, thank everyone and let's continue
25 this conversation, and with that, this hearing is

2 adjourned, and the next thing I'm going to be doing
3 is I'm going to be doing a tour with Council Member
4 Koo to some of those areas, too, very soon. Thank
5 you. [gavel]

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 14, 2017