CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITION AND CONCESSIONS

----- X

October 24, 2017 Start: 1:21 p.m. Recess: 12:20 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm. 14th Fl.

B E F O R E: RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

DARLENE MEALY

YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ ANDREW MCINTYRE COHEN

MARK TREYGER

I. DANEEK MILLER

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jordan Press

Executive Director for Planning and Development In HPD's Governmental Affairs Unit

Gene Schneur

Co-Managing Director and Co-Founder of Omni New York

David Beer

Vice President, Real Estate Development at Breaking Ground

Matthew Okebiyi

Executive Director of African American Planning Commission

Andrew McIntyre

Architect, Project Manager of Robert Stern Architect

Olivia Wilkins

Resident at Redwood Senior Living in East New York

Angela Thomas

Resident at SUS, Services for the Under Served

Donna Bruno

Member of Concern for Independent Living East New York and on Advisory Committee Board

Reverend Dexter Henderson

Testifying on behalf of Pastor, Reverend David K. Brawley from the St. Paul Baptist Church

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITION AND

1	CONCESSIONS	3
---	-------------	---

_	
2	[gavel]

3	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, good
4	afternoon everyone. I am Council Member Rafael
5	Salamanca, Chair of the Subcommittee on Planning,
6	Dispositions and Concessions, welcome to today's
7	hearing. Today we are joined by Council Member Andy
8	Cohen. We are going to be hearing LU 797, the Archer
9	Green tax exemption. HPD seeks approval of the
10	Article XI tax exemption pursuant to Section 577 of
11	the private housing finance law for a term of 40
12	years. Archer Green Apartments Housing Development
13	Fund Corporation at HDFC will acquire the property
14	and Archer Green Apartments LP, a limited partnership
15	will be the owner and operator of the property.
16	Collectively these two organizations will acquire the
17	property at 92-33 168 th Street in Queens and
18	construct a building with loans from New York City
19	HDC and HPD as well as low income housing tax
20	credits. The approval will facilitate a mixed
21	building a mixed-use building with a residential
22	tower above a base with commercial and community
23	facility uses. The residential tower is expected to
24	include 387 units, this site is in Council Member
2.5	Miller's district. I am now opening up the public

2

3 yourself.

4 JORDAN PRESS: Good afternoon Mr.

5 Chairman, my name is Jordan Press, I'm the Executive

6 Director for Planning and Development in HPD's

7 Government Affairs Unit. I'm joined if we do need

8 questions by both the sponsor of the project as well

9 as HPD Development Staff. Land Use Number 797

10 consists of an exemption area located at 92-33 168th

11 Street in Queens's council district 27 Now known as

12 Archer Green the site is comprised of an

13 | underutilized two-story parking garage that is

14 partially occupied by the New York Police Department.

15 The project area was awarded to the sponsor in 2016

16 as part of a request for proposals issued in 2015 by

17 | the New York City Economic Development Corporation,

18 | EDC. Redevelopment of the site entails the

19 | construction of two residential buildings above a

20 commercial and community facility base. Disposition

21 \parallel of the site is being handled by EDC and the sponsor

22 | is developing this site through HPD's mix and match

23 program. Currently the plan is to construct one 19

24 \parallel story building and one 23 story building that will

25 total 387 units of 100 percent affordable rental

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND

CONCESSIONS
CONCESSIONS

Τ	CONCESSIONS
2	housing with a mixture of unit types including 38
3	studios, 160 one bedrooms, 100 and 164 two bedrooms
4	and 24 three bedrooms plus a superintendent's unit.
5	Under the mix and match program household income
6	targets range from 40 percent to 130 percent of AMI
7	for a family of three with rents ranging from 37
8	percent AMI to 100 percent AMI. The building will be
9	constructed to meet Enterprise Green Communities
10	Certification. As the committee… [cross-talk]
11	[off-mic dialogue]
12	JORDAN PRESS: Yeah, so the income
13	targets, the income that the residents earn is from
14	40 to 130 but the rents are set at 40 to 100 meaning
15	that the highest in… [cross-talk]
16	[off-mic dialogue]
17	JORDAN PRESS: Yes
18	[off-mic dialogue]
19	JORDAN PRESS:meaning that the for
20	the… for the higher income tiers the, the rent will
21	be set at the lower part of that tier, but the
22	incomes can range from in the case of the top tier
23	from 100 percent AMI up to 130 percent of AMI even
24	though the rent is at 100. The building will be

constructed to meet Enterprise Green Communities

CONCESSIONS

Certification. As the committee is aware our term
sheet requires a set aside of units for formally
homeless households through our, Our Space Program,
we're continuing to have conversations with the
Council Member about the inclusion of these units.
The commercial space will be comprised of 69,000
square feet and community facility space will be
comprised of 16,000 square feet. Commercial
businesses anticipated for the site include a grocery
store slash supermarket. The community facility space
is expected to be occupied by an adult day care or
domestic violence center. Additionally, amenities
include roughly 206 underground parking spaces, of
those 206 spaces 60 will be reserved for NYPD, 77
reserved for tenants and 69 commercial spaces. Other
amenities planned for the project is a community room
with shared kitchen facilities and roof terrace. In
order to facilitate long term affordability of the
rental units HPD is before the Planning Subcommittee
seeking Article XI tax benefits. The commercial and
community facility spaces are excluded from the
exemption area. Finally, I'd like to add that it is
our hope to close on this project utilizing bond

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

24

25

financing in December which makes the timely passage of this request all the more important, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you Mr.

Press, we've been joined by Council Member Daneek

Miller and Council Member Darlene Mealy. So, I am

going to refer to you Council Member Miller, do you

have any questions on your project?

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Let me just start by saying this is a project that obviously is, is, is this RFP that was out in 2008 and kind of found this life about three years back and certainly was, was not without its challenges myself and, and, and my colleagues and, and the state government and, and community board and other community stakeholders have, have really invested a lot as well as the developer and I think that we've gotten to the point that we... that, that this project will be reflect the values and the needs of the community. We had ... certainly we had some concerns about the AMI's and I... and I think that we've worked through those and continue to do so and then the last caveat of the, the homeless population is something that we are willing to address as well and I'm, I'm... and, and I know it's going to be... we're going to be... this is

1
T

2 going to be held over for a few and, and allow us to

3 kind of work through those last kinks but it's

4 certainly that... this, this is a project that needs to

5 get up and running sooner than later and, and

6 everybody involved seems to be willing to do the work

7 | that, that will get us there. So, I appreciate your

8 support and all the support that Committees and land

9 use has given and look forward to continuing to work

10 | with the developer and HPD on this project. But I'm

11 here to make sure that all goes well, be sure of

12 | that, we, we absolutely have a... we're going to have a

13 | lot invested so we want to make sure it gets right.

14 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Awesome, thank

15 you... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Mr.

17 | Chair... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: ...Council Member

19 | Cohen has some questions.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I just want to

21 understand the rent for my own, so the rent is fixed

22 | at 100 percent of AMI on certain units, but I could

23 | earn up to 130 percent?

CONCESSIONS

2.2

	1	JOR:	DAN	PRE	SS:	You	u	would	be	you	would
qualify	for	it	if	you	earn	ned	b	etween	100	and	130
percent	of A	IMA									

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: But the rent is fixed at 100... [cross-talk]

JORDAN PRESS: The fixed rent... the rent is fixed... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Calculated offer... [cross-talk]

JORDAN PRESS: ...at a... at a 100 percent of AMI and the reason that we do that on the highest income tier is to create a bigger pool of potential candidates with the concern usually coming from the financial institutions that possibly those highest income renters might be more difficult to locate.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: If, if I... if I make... in, in this example and, and again I, I, I have great confidence in Council Member Miller and I'm, I'm just sort of educating myself in terms of the... if, if I make 45 percent... my income is 45 percent of AMI do I end up in a unit that's based on 37 percent or based on 57 percent or can... am I eligible for the project, can I live in the project?

	302001111112 01 1211111110, 2101001110110 11112
1	CONCESSIONS 10
2	JORDAN PRESS: You are eligible, give me
3	one second I, I, I need to check on the exact way
4	that the marketing bands versus AMI income tiers
5	work, and I will get back to all members [cross-
6	talk]
7	COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: In light of the
8	fact that this item is being laid over at the next
9	[cross-talk]
10	JORDAN PRESS: Absolutely [cross-talk]
11	COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: That would be
12	great… [cross-talk]
13	JORDAN PRESS: Okay well before then.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you. That's
15	it Mr. Chair.
16	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: A, a few
17	questions on this project, is there going to be a
18	community preference?
19	JORDAN PRESS: Yes.
20	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Yeah and that's
21	50 percent… [cross-talk]
22	JORDAN PRESS: the typical 50 percent
23	community preference.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND

1	CONCESSIONS 11
2	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright and the
3	homeless set aside, how many units was HPD you know
4	or how many units were you, you… [cross-talk]
5	JORDAN PRESS: Right [cross-talk]
6	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA:you were trying
7	to implement in this [cross-talk]
8	JORDAN PRESS: So, so… [cross-talk]
9	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA:project?
10	JORDAN PRESS: This project was
11	negotiated well before any; any term sheet changes
12	took place and before the ten percent requirement
13	took place and we want to be respectful of the fact
14	that the Councilmen and the community and the
15	developer went through very long and difficult
16	negotiations to make this a project that works for
17	everyone. again, our term sheets require ten percent
18	but we, we need to have continuing conversations with
19	the Councilmen and the community to make sure that
20	we're, we're doing the right thing by everyone.
21	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: In terms of local
22	hiring, can you explain that process how that's going
23	to work?

JORDAN PRESS: I'm going to have to ask the developer to join us for that if, if he could.

24

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

12

2 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Come right ahead.
3 If you can just, please state your name and the… your

name of your company.

GENE SCHNEUR: Hello, my name is Gene Schneur from Omni New York. The, the local hiring I, I, I don't have the breakdown in front of me but we have a very extensive local hiring preference both... you know obviously the city Queens and we've even narrowed it down to the zip code here and you know we spend extensive time with Council Member Miller making sure that the local hiring is, you know reflective and what is needed in the community, I... honestly I don't have it, we put it in our RFP and then we negotiated afterwards and we signed an agreement with the Council Member and the local stakeholders so there is a very extensive local hiring including getting down... narrowing down to the ... to the zip code.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: And so you're going to be working hand in hand with the Council Member's office and the local community board to ensure there's local hiring, is there going to be a reporting mechanism back to both the Council Member and the local community board... [cross-talk]

2.2

		GENE	SCH	NEUR:	Yes,	we,	we	hired	a	I
guess	an	advisor	or	consul	ltant	in t	the	proces	s h	ere
Cresce	n†	[cross	-ta	lkl						

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Yes... [cross-talk]

GENE SCHNEUR: ...and they're, they're...

that's one of their responsibilities.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright and then my, my last two questions is... so, I guess working with Crescent I know them well, they're also going to ensure that you're complying with the MWBE's in terms of ensuring that women and minority business owners are getting these local contracts?

GENE SCHNEUR: Correct, that's part of their scope of work that they're... that they have to follow through with us.

if you can just explain to me a plan on ensuring that that residents in that community actually have access to those units, are you going to have any housing forums where, you know you, you will help individuals in the community apply online, many... any forums where individuals that have any credit issues they can go and seek some type of financial help so when that

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

development is completed they, they're prepared to 2 3 apply and then hopefully be approved?

GENE SCHNEUR: Yes, I mean and also we've discussed this with Crescent about them being kind... the community outreach and we may work also obviously with the Council Member's Office, I mean look there's going to be... there's obviously there's local ... you know there's preferences and community preferences, you know most of these units are going to end up in a lottery... in, in a lottery system here and I'm sure there's going to be, you know tens of thousands of applicants for it but we will work with local tenants to make sure that, you know they're part of the lottery, they know when to sign up for the lottery so that we get a... you know a lot of representatives from the local community.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, thank you. Just... yes, go ahead Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, on, on that issue we, we do have part of our... as well is that there are forms around financial literacy and, and, and credit for the ... so that we have ... to, to make sure that our 50 percent of our applicants qualify so that we reach the number of our, our set aside, 50

2 percent, set aside as well as the… so, so we're

are in place.

3 sa

satisfied with that, that, that we're, we're sending applicants that we can reach that number as well as the MWBE's that group participated yesterday in a MWBE contractors forum as well so aside from the local hires and local contractors as well and, and, and we've met with Crescent and so we're confident now but I'm sure that, that with the council's oversight that all of this will, will, will happen but those are great questions and, and those things

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, thank you. Alright, so with that are there any more members of the public who wish to testify? Oh, I'm sorry Council Member, I want to... I was going to recognize... please recognize Mr... Council Member Mark Treyger, do you have... do you have any questions Council Member? Alright, are... so are there any more members of the public who wish to testify? Alright, seeing none I will now close public hearings LU 796.

GENE SCHNEUR: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, so... I'm sorry, now we're actually closing LU 797. So, now next we're, we're opening up the public session on LU

1
2

790, the Angelou Court tax exemption. HPD is seeking
approval of an Article XI tax exemption for a period
of 40 years pursuant to Section 577 of the Private
Housing Finance Law. The property consists of an
existing five story building and contains 23 occupied
rental units in Council Member Perkins's district.
The building's ownership will transition from Angelou
Associates LP to Angelou Court Association Housing
Development Fund Corporation to HDFC. The HDFC is
expected to obtain approval of a corporation offering
plan and current residents will be offered the
opportunity to purchase shares of the HDFC. The HDFC
will also finance a rehabilitation with loans from
HPD and HDC. I would also like to recognize Council
Member Ydanis Rodriguez who has joined us. So, now I
am opening up public hearings LU 796, Mr. Speaker?
JORDAN PRESS: Thank you once again, my
name is Jordan Press from HPD. Land Use Number 796
consists of an exemption area located at 516 to 520
Manhattan Avenue in Manhattan in Manhattan in
Council District nine and is known as Angelou Court.
On July 15 th , 1997 the City Council approved Angelou
Court as a low income residential project under the
New York State Housing Trust Fund Program The

remediation, façade repair, roof and window

25

1	CONCESSIONS
2	replacement, boiler system replacement, trash
3	compactor replacement, installation of energy
4	efficient lighting in common areas and apartments an
5	installation of energy efficient plumbing fixtures.
6	In order to help preserve affordability of the… of
7	the units HPD is before the Planning Subcommittee
8	seeking full Article XI tax benefits that will
9	coincide with the 40-year regulatory agreement.
10	Council Member Perkins has been briefed and is
11	supportive of moving the project forward.
12	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you Mr.
13	Press. Are there any questions on this project from
14	Council Members? No, are there anymore members of th
15	public who wish to testify? Alright, seeing none I
16	will now close public hearings LU 796. We will now
17	move to a vote on one item, the Angelou Court tax
18	exemption which has the support of Council Member
19	Perkins, all of the other… I'm sorry. I will now cal
20	on a vote for LU 796, the Angelou Court exempt
21	exemption, Counsel please call the vote.
22	COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca?

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Aye.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy?

23

25

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND

1	CONCESSIONS 19
2	COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen?
3	COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.
4	COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger?
5	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.
6	COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of four in
7	the affirmative, zero in the negative with zero
8	abstention
9	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Rodriguez.
10	COMMITTEE CLERK: Oh you're still here,
11	Rodriguez?
12	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.
13	COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of five in
14	the affirmative, zero in the negative with zero
15	abstentions the item is recommended for approval and
16	referred to the full Land Use Committee.
17	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, thank
18	you. So, now we will move to LU's 792 through 795,
19	the Edwin's Place applications are applications by
20	HPD for a zoning map change from R6 to R7-2/C2 to C3
21	a zoning text amendment to establish a mandatory
22	inclusionary housing area, a zoning special permit to
23	allow community facility floor area to apply to non-
24	profit supportive housing in an urban development

action area project, UDAAP designation. Project

2.2

2.3

approval in this position approved for city owned property at 3 Livonia Avenue in Brooklyn. These actions will facilitate the development of a new eight story building with 125 supporters and affordable housing units and ground floor retail or community facility space. The project is in Council Member Mealy's district. I am now opening up the public hearings on LU 792 through 795, Edwin's Place and Council Member Mealy would you like to... Council Member, would you like to make an opening statement?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY:

Thank you

Chairman. I just want to say I have talked to this development numerous... well a couple of times and asked them to change from a majority of studio apartments into at least two and three bedrooms apartments, everyone does, does have children, a lot of people have children, a lot of people does not but I would prefer to make sure that families who live in the neighborhood could afford and stay in the neighborhood and the studio apartments are great but we tried... East New York and Brownsville we put a moratorium on studios, we're asking for much more than just studios and they came back twice with the

same as that thing and that's why I was against this

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

project. So, I would love to hear what they are saying, Mr. Bryant said they would take it off the calendar and they were here next year but it's here today so I'm willing to listen. Thank you Chair.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you Council Member. If you... the Speakers if you can please introduce yourselves.

JORDAN PRESS: So, I'll begin the testimony and then turn it over to the development team. Land Use Number 792 through 795 are related ULURP actions regarding a project known as Edwin's Place located at 3 Livonia Place in Brooklyn Council District 41. Land Use Number 792 consists of a zoning map amendment that will change an R6 district to an R7-2 district to increase the maximum allowable floor area ratio from 4.8 to 6.5. as planned the proposed developed will reach a total FAR of 4.94. Also, a zoning map amendment will map a C2-3 commercial overlay which will expand retail opportunities along this portion of Livonia Avenue. Land Use Number 793 consists of an amendment to the zoning resolution in order to establish mandatory inclusionary housing area. Land Use Number 794 seeks UDAAP designation, project approval and disposition of vacant city owned

comprised of eight stories with a total of 125 rental

units plus a superintendent's unit. As a roll... as a

result of the input that we received the sponsor is

2.3

24

25

state of the art security camera system, a

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

multipurpose room for tenants and community events, landscaped courtyard for resident use and a fitness room with exercise equipment, a digital library and onsite laundry room. Services that will be provided by the African American Planning Commission will include job readiness training, financial literacy and money management classes as well as substance abuse counseling, mental health services and benefits assistance. The project also includes approximately 3,000 square feet of ground floor retail space. The ground floor retail space will support the city's efforts to activate the Livonia Avenue corridor which is a, a goal identified in HPD's recently released Brownsville Plan. At this time the sponsor is continuing to work to identify a tenant for the space and is taking into account this... the, the suggestions that the Council Member has made regarding who that tenant might be. Again, the project has received unanimous support from the community board, strong support from the Borough President and letters of support from other local... elected officials and community stakeholders so we're before the committee asking for your support. I'd like to turn it over now

to the developer who has a presentation.

 \sim

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

13

12

1415

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

24

25

DAVID BEER: And... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Sorry, can you just repeat your name again, the mic was not on.

DAVID BEER: My name is David Beer from Breaking Ground. Just very briefly about Breaking Ground, Breaking Ground is a developer and operator of affordable and supportive housing, we operate about 3,500 units in Brooklyn, Manhattan, the Bronx, Connecticut and upstate New York. Breaking Ground has two previous affordable and supportive housing projects in Community Board 16, the Domenech and the Hegeman. Our local partner, East Brooklyn Congregations their support for those two projects was instrumental in being able to move forward and EBC also strongly supports this project. Next. This is... this is the, the site map, the project is on Livonia Avenue between Grafton Street and Howard Avenue. It is about two blocks away from the Saratoga Avenue number three train stop. This is a, a few photographs of the site, it's 20,000 square foot city owned vacant land and you can see the elevated number three train tracks going along Livonia Avenue. Next. So, as Jordan mentioned Breaking Ground and African American Planning Commission will jointly develop the 1 CONCESSIONS 26

project, 47 units will be for low income community 2 3 residents, a total of 78 units will be for homeless individuals and families, 53 of the 78 units will be 4 studios and 25 will be family apartments and again Breaking Ground will be the property manager and 6 7 African American Planning Commission will provide the onsite services. This is the breakout of the unit 8 mix, as you can see most of the supportive units are... most of the studios rather are supportive units and 10 11 most of the community affordable units are family 12 units. In fact, over 50 percent of the community 13 units are two and three-bedroom apartments. This is a, a, a breakdown of the 47 community units which are 14 15 a portion between three affordability tiers, 40 16 percent AMI, 50 percent AMI and 60 percent AMI. So, 17 for an example in the 40 percent AMI tier a two-18 bedroom apartment will rent for 718 dollars a month, 19 a two-bedroom apartment in the 50 percent tier will 20 rent for 933 a month and a two-bedroom apartment in 21 the 60 percent AMI tier will rent for 1,148 dollars a 2.2 month.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: I'm, I'm sorry,

24 just to go back… [cross-talk]

2.3

25

DAVID BEER: Yes... [cross-talk]

	SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
1	CONCESSIONS 2
2	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA:this proposed
3	residential program this… these graphs that you're
4	showing us, this is not for the supportive housing,
5	right, this is just for the affordable housing?
6	DAVID BEER: Yes, this is just… [cross-
7	talk]
8	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: The 48 and the
9	47 [cross-talk]
10	DAVID BEER:the 47 [cross-talk]
11	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA:units?
12	DAVID BEER: Yes, for the… all 78 of the
13	homeless units will have project based Section 8
14	rental assistance. Next. So, Breaking Ground and
15	African American… [cross-talk]
16	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: I'm sorry sir I'm
17	just… [cross-talk]
18	DAVID BEER: Yes… [cross-talk]
19	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA:Council Member
20	you have questions?
21	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Seventy-eight
22	units is project based Section 8?

DAVID BEER: Correct.

2.2

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, if the city... because sometimes the city stops Section 8 for a while what would happen to these units?

JORDAN PRESS: I would say that the city is committed to providing all of these projects based Section 8, I can think of a time including during sequestration where we had to effectively kill a project because we had to pull back on project based Section 8, I suppose if the situation were truly dire we would find another source of rental assistance in order to keep the project to be the same one that we've... we're presenting today.

DAVID BEER: So, with respect to the history of the project Breaking Ground and African American Planning Commission first met with Community Board 16 in 2015 and at that time we were proposing a 100 percent studio with no retail space. In May of 2016 we met with the Borough President staff, they made the suggestion of creating the three affordability tiers for the community units which we incorporated into our plan then in the fall of 2016 we went back to community board 16 and proposed a project that has the mix of studios and family units that we, we're presenting today, there is also a

3,000-square foot store front which will be for
either retail or accessory community facility use. Ir
January of this year the community board 16 issued a
letter to support the project, in June of this year
the community board 16 voted unanimously to support
the project, the next the following month the
Borough President gave his recommendation to support
the ULURP application. As I mentioned before East
Brooklyn Congregations is also a strong supporter of
the project, we also have a letter of support for the
project from State Senator Jesse Hamilton. At this
time, I'd like to ask Matthew Okebiyi from the
African American Planning Commission to briefly talk
about his organization and the onsite services and
amenities.

MATTHEW OKEBIYI: Good afternoon, my name is Matthew Okebiyi, I am the Executive Director of African American Planning Commission. We are partnering with Breaking Ground to develop Edwin's Place and AAPC's role would be to provide onsite services to both supportive... to families and adults in the supportive housing units and to those who do not have supportive services. African American Planning Commission was incorporated in 1996, we

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CONCESSIONS 30 currently provide domestic violence services both in Brooklyn and in the Bronx. We develop and operate the largest transitional tier two shelters in, in Brooklyn and the Bronx. We also provide services to homeless individuals with mental health issues, substance abuse issues and things of that nature. Part of the services as Mr. Beer mentioned part of the services that African American Planning Commission is going to provide at this facility came about as a result of our meetings with the Community Board. For example, we noticed that one of the concerns of the community board and the other elected officials was security in the neighborhood and therefore we do not have in this particular facility 24 hours a day, seven days a week security camera and also lighting because this particular neighborhood is kind of dark at this present time and because of the overhead trains. There's going to be an onsite multipurpose room for the tenants and community events can be held within the building. Part of our design that the community board desired was to have a landscaped courtyard which we are presenting. In addition to such a beautiful building we are also

going to provide many amenities that we have seen in

2.2

2.3

many Manhattan buildings such as the fitness room and the exercise rooms, exercise machines, a library, an onsite laundry room. African American Planning Commission is particularly adept at providing services and therefore we are providing services on site that would include job readiness training, financial literacy and money management classes, we recently at the beginning of this project received funding from the Department of Health to provide substance abuse counseling, mental health services and benefits assistance. Thank you. At this time, I'd like to ask our architect to talk about the building design.

ANDREW MCINTYRE: Hello everyone, my
name... can, can you hear me, sorry... going to get a
little closer. My name is Andrew McIntyre from Robert
Stern Architects. I'll first note Robert Stern
Architect is very proud to be involved with Breaking
Ground and AAPC on this development and very excited
about the prospect for this project. The building
design is... you can see here in this image a view from
the corner of Livonia and Howard Avenues, it's a
blend of beige brick and metal accents and bay
windows. You can see at the corner here the resident

2	entry, all the residents share a, a single entry.
3	Separately on Livonia Avenue you can see the
4	storefront space sorry. Alright, is it better? Okay
5	Separately down Livonia Avenue you can see the
6	storefront for the proposed commercial use or retail
7	tenant. As Matthew noted and you saw in the site
8	photos this is immediately adjacent to the elevated
9	three train, so this is what you would actually see
10	in that photo, we've removed here just to show the
11	building. A closer view at the entry you can see
12	again the resident entry here on the corner with a
13	beige brick blend, there's a custom brick pattern
14	that we've designed for the, the ground floor as well
15	as the façade that faces Livonia. Looking the other
16	way on Livonia Avenue here you can see the
17	storefronts and the way the retail space would
18	activate the, the street, we feel livening an
19	otherwise empty part of Livonia Avenue. The ground
20	floor layout as Matthew mentioned is available for
21	community use, there are there's a multipurpose room
22	that could be used by various groups within the
23	building and from without amenities as again as
24	Matthew mentioned a fitness center, laundry, computer
25	space, bike storage as well as the social service

CONCESSIONS

2	office suites and then a commercial space fronting
3	Livonia Avenue. Also, as, as Jordan mentioned this
4	building has many green features that we're very
5	proud of to meet. The Enterprise Green Communities
6	Standard; green roofs, solar panels that will provide
7	a portion of the building's power, triple glazed
8	windows that will help insulate acoustically as well
9	as thermally and super insulated building envelop
10	that is part of that system, energy efficient system
11	throughout, and water conservation features. And I'll
12	hand it back to David if or Jordan if there are
13	further questions from the committee and council.
14	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, are we
15	done?
16	JORDAN PRESS: We're happy yeah, happy
17	to answer any questions.
18	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, Council
19	Member Mealy has some questions regarding the
20	project.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: When I met with
22	you at I, I are you what let me see which one
23	Breaking Ground is a homeless shelter program?
24	JORDAN PRESS: No

Τ	CONCEDETONO
2	DAVID BEER: No, Breaking Ground is
3	primarily an operator and developer of permanent
4	affordable and supportive housing. We do operate two
5	safe havens which are transitional housing programs
6	for street homeless persons, but we do not operate
7	any shelters.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, so you will
9	be taking the individuals from those programs into
10	these housing?
11	DAVID BEER: Yes, our goal is to do in-
12	reach in Browns shelters for the, the homeless
13	[cross-talk]
14	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Do you not know
15	[cross-talk]
16	DAVID BEER:units [cross-talk]
17	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY:Brownsville have
18	its fair share of shelters and I'm not the
19	demographic here… when I asked you… I asked you
20	before is there any training, you're putting

house... well affordable housing in which now they have to pay rent, they have to pay their light bill, they have to pay if it's gas included or if it's not they

individuals from a, a shelter straight into public

21

22

23

24

25

will have to pay these bills, how are you putting

2	people in positions like that with no training, no
3	real support to let them know how to now transition
4	from a shelter into your own apartment, do you thin
5	that's fair to a community and I asked you did you
6	all train people and you said no?

DAVID BEER: Well... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Could you put a component in there?

2.2

DAVID BEER: The, the onsite services are designed to help homeless people make the transition to permanent housing. Every homeless family or single adult will have a case manager to help make that transition and in addition to the case management services there's an array of support services onsite that every homeless family or individual will be able to avail themselves of.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Security at the front desk?

DAVID BEER: Yes, there will be a 24/7 attended lobby.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Could you see why

I'm not supporting this project, you have so many

studios, but I have about five different pages that

say one is studios 53 supportive, affordable three, a

36 CONCESSIONS 1

2	total of 56. One bedroom, three supportive,
3	affordable 31, that's people who is in the
4	neighborhood that can now say alright I live in
5	Tilden Howard Houses I could get an apartment now.
6	So, affordable you say 31 of one-bedroom apartments,
7	then you say two bedrooms was apartments 15
8	supportive, 11 affordable, that's 26. Three-bedroom
9	apartments, seven supportive, two affordable, I would
10	have loved that to come up. Then I get another one 53
11	supportive, three affordable. One-bedroom apartments
12	15 to… 19 affordable apartments, 34. Then I got two
13	bedrooms where it used to be 15 now it's seven and 19
14	affordable of affordable housing. Then with three-
15	bedroom apartments supportive you say only three of
16	them and six now affordable. Then I have another I
17	could keep going on, I have an issue with this
18	demographic that we're dealing with we need to make
19	sure that we have people who lived in the
20	neighborhood want to get into affordable housing now
21	have that opportunity and by these numbers you could
22	just keep giving me back and forth numbers. I want
23	something concrete, I said I wanted more three-
24	bedroom apartments, we need people who they have
25	children in Brownswille and not even thinking about

1	CONCESSIONS 3'
2	that area we have a fair share of homeless shelters,
3	we have hotels now that are becoming shelters, that
4	the city sometimes has to shut down because it's
5	overran. So, with these supportive homeless studios
6	I'm asking to bring that down a little and let some
7	people with children live in there that they can be
8	a, a real melting pot of Brownsville and affordable
9	housing and supportive housing together.
10	DAVID BEER: Yeah, again Council Woman
11	this is not a shelter or emergency housing [cross-
12	talk]
13	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I don't want it to
14	become a shelter either… [cross-talk]
15	DAVID BEER: Right [cross-talk]
16	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY:but [cross-talk]
17	DAVID BEER: And in, in response to your
18	concerns about the, the numbers and the mix of the
19	affordable units, when we met with you, you expresse
20	concern about that what is in today's proposal
21	represents [cross-talk]
22	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: It's different
23	DAVID BEER: It's different from what we

proposed to you because our understanding is that you wanted more two-bedroom apartments and more three-

1	CONCESSIONS 3
2	bedroom apartments in the affordable category and,
3	and that's what we did, we added eight two-bedroom
4	apartments in the affordable category and four three
5	bedroom apartments and that was we did that after
6	meeting with you.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But you still
8	didn't take down any of the studio.
9	DAVID BEER: Well… [cross-talk]
10	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: And that's my
11	major issue really.
12	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: I have a
13	question, let's, lets', let's get to it, is there a
14	possibility that you could reduce the amount of
15	studio units that you have and increase the amount o
16	three, two and one-bedroom units?
17	DAVID BEER: No, that's not financially
18	feasible for the project each [cross-talk]
19	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: This was a project
20	with 100 studios so how could it it's not a
21	feasible? Let's think about that.
22	[off-mic dialogue]
23	JORDAN PRESS: So, the total number of
24	units was reduced when we responded to that, that

so, when the concern was raised first by the

CONCESSIONS 39

2	community about it being 100 percent studios the
3	overall unit count was reduced so that we could
4	accommodate more large bedrooms and as, as I
5	testified and, and I just want to reiterate the point
6	that many of our proposals that we bring forward to,
7	to the council in the supportive housing category are
8	100 percent studios or vast majority studios. This,
9	this is absolutely not the case here, the, the
10	majority, 55 percent of the units are family sized
11	units both in the supportive and in the affordable
12	category and, and you're right that there are that
13	the majority of the vast almost all of the studio
14	units are for supportive but the majority of the
15	project is still not, not studio units, they're
16	family sized units and that's an that's an
17	aberration from how we normally do these projects to,
18	to respond to that very concern you're raising, we're
19	trying to, to respond to that.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I'm not for the studios.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, are there... do you have any more questions Council Member?

Alright, is there anyone from the public who wishes

CONCESSIONS

2.2

2.3

2 to testify? Thank you, thank you gentlemen. So, we have Miss Olivia Wilkins...

OLIVIA WILKINS: Yes...

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Okay, we have

Angela Thomas, Angela please come, come up. We have

Donna Bruno, Donna Bruno, please come up and we have

Reverend Dexter Henderson, alright. So, we will... yes,

he's testifying...

[off-mic dialogue]

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: So, we will start with Miss Olivia Wilkins and Sergeant of Arms if you can set the timer for two minutes and if you can just say your name and you have two minutes. Yeah, make sure you press the button. Is it red? No, press it again.

OLIVIA WILKINS: My name is Olivia
Wilkins, I am here to testify in support of Breaking
Ground's proposal to develop Edwin's Place in
Brownsville. Anyone who is against Edwin's Place has
got to have something wrong with them. I currently
reside at Redwood Senior Living located at 890 Skank
Avenue in East New York. Redwood was so developed by
Breaking Ground and East Brooklyn Congregation on an
empty NYCHA parking lot across from Boulevard Housing

2	where I used to live and raise two kids. When
3	Breaking Ground and East Brooklyn Congregation
4	started constructing Redwood I was eager to leave my
5	NYCHA building which had become unsafe and dirty. I
6	didn't want to spend my golden years being scared all
7	the time. Moving into Redwood Senior Living it was
8	like moving to Paris, the building is so clean you
9	can eat off the floor. Breaking Ground provides our
10	licensed social secure sorry, social worker and an
11	active coordinator, we get help with financial
12	resources, social security, food banks and health
13	care, we go on museum trips, shopping, movies,
14	cooking classes, monthly birthday celebrations and
15	health care symposiums. We should build 200 more
16	Redwoods throughout the city. Most importantly
17	Breaking Ground's staff treats us with respect, we
18	feel like family. I understand that the Councilwoman
19	Darlene Mealy is opposed to letting Breaking Ground
20	develop Edwin's Place which will be just as nice as
21	where I live. Councilwoman Mealy you are either with
22	us or against us, you are either with Breaking
23	Ground, East Brooklyn Congregation and Edwin's Place
24	or you are against providing quality affordable

Place or step off and get out of the way. Thank you.

housing in our community. Step up, get behind Edwin's

4

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, the ...

5

we're going to have Angela Thomas, Angela just turn on the mic and you'll have two minutes. And I'm just

6 7

going to ask the speakers to please be respectful.

8

ANGELA THOMAS: Yes, my name is Angela

9

Thomas, I'm a resident at SUS and I just recently came from the shelter about five years... and about

1011

five years there in the shelter and I can only say

12

that being there with, with SUS has given me my life

13

back. I now am going back to school and doing the

14

things that I couldn't have done when I was in a

1516

shelter and especially becoming a vegetarian, I can now prepare my own meals because I was practically

17

dying over there because I lost a lot of weight

18

because I couldn't eat their food, now I can prepare

19

my own meals, I'm back in school, I feel like I'm $\,$

20

back personally. I feel like I got my life back, my $% \left(1\right) =\left(1\right) \left(1\right) +\left(1\right) \left(1\right) \left(1\right) +\left(1\right) \left(1\right) \left(1\right) \left(1\right) +\left(1\right) \left(1\right$

21

mental state back and it's a very beautiful

22

apartment. I'm good with the security being there, I,

23

I'm, I'm... I feel... I feel safe there and it's

24

beautiful. We have a washing machine there, I do my

25

homework on the computer downstairs so everything's

CONCESSIONS

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2	there including my case manager, I suffer with
3	depression so… you know I just wish everybody car
1	come out of those shelters and be where I'm at

5 because they do give you your life back.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, thank you. Next up we have miss Donna Bruno.

DONNA BRUNO: Yes, good afternoon. My name is Donna Bruno and I come from Concern for Independent Living East New York, Crown Heights. I've been living there five and a half years, I am also on the Advisory Committee Board for five and a half years as well. I live in a studio apartment and our building interacts with supportive housing and nonsupporting houses, families, children, people with physical disabilities, mental disorders, homelessness, people from shelters and it seems that we all get together very well. When you live with people for a long time and you get to know people it works. When you get to walk around your community and you interact with the people in your community the community interacts with you and the only way a community interacts if we have the support and the backing from Council people and supportive housing and people who can actually do something for us. We

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND

44

CONCESSIONS	
-------------	--

-							
2	shouldn't have just because sometimes the numbers						
3	don't add up right and sometimes the buildings don't						
4	add up right but why should people be subjected to						
5	being in a shelter or homeless or because they have a						
6	mental disability being in, in a psychiatric ward or						
7	in a transitional living because why because there's						
8	not too many studios and not enough one-bedroom						
9	apartments, that's petty. The most important thing is						
10	the people, it's the communities and yes, you are						
11	right, there are a lot of shelters and there are a						
12	lot of hotels						
13	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: You can just wrap						
14	up.						
15	DONNA BRUNO: Okay, you, you are right						
16	about one thing, but the bottom line is, is that with						
17	more supportive housing you will have less of that						
18	problem.						
19	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright [cross-						
20	talk]						
21	DONNA BRUNO: Thank you.						
22	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you very						
23	much. Next up we have Mr. Reverend Dexter Henderson.						
24	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Wait, you ladies						

can stay there because I'm just going to… after the

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

REVEREND DEXTER HENDERSON: Good afternoon. My name is Reverend Dexter Henderson and I'm here on behalf of my Pastor, Reverend David K. Brawley from the St. Paul Community Baptist Church. I'm also here representing all the churches, schools and leaders of East Brooklyn Congregations. Edwin's Place and our partners, Breaking Ground have EBC's and St. Paul's full support to develop 125 urgently needed units of affordable housing in Brownsville. Breaking Ground is the city's best supportive housing developer in the city and we worked with them on Redwood, the Hegaman, and Irving Domenech buildings in Ocean Hill and Brownsville. Two weeks ago, I joined more than 6,000 fellow New Yorkers and leaders from East Brooklyn Congregations and Metro IAF downstairs to push Mayor De Blasio to develop more senior housing, fix NYCHA from the top to bottom and build more developments just like Edwin's Place. We rallied in the pouring rain and humidity because we were so angry that life long black and Latino New Yorkers are being thrown out of their homes like trash so that their rents can be raised. Then we come

($\neg \cap$	TA	CF	C	C	Т	\cap	N	2	

2	to find out that Councilwoman Darlene Mealy, not the
3	Mayor, is trying to stop Breaking Ground and East
4	Brooklyn Congregations from developing Edwin's Place
5	and two other smaller sites in Brownsville and Ocean
6	Hill. Here the Mayor and the city are doing their
7	job, they provided the land, the subsidies and the
8	support, we are on the same side on this issue. So,
9	leaders of the Brooklyn East Brooklyn Congregations
10	have been trying to get a meeting with Councilwoman
11	Mealy for two months and we have been ignored, EBC
12	does not tolerate that type of disrespect. So, I'm
13	here to send a message to you Councilwoman Mealy,
14	your colleagues and the Mayor. To you Councilwoman
15	Mealy, you're going to get behind Edwin's Place and
16	our plans also to develop two smaller sites nearby.
17	My Pastor and I will be bringing 50 leaders to your
18	Brooklyn office this Thursday at 10:30 a.m., you're
19	going to meet with us and get behind Edwin's Place
20	and if you don't believe me all you have to do is as
21	around. To the other Council Members [cross-talk]
22	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Sir, I'm going to
23	ask… [cross-talk]
24	REVEREND DEXTER HENDERSON:we need your

support... [cross-talk]

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND

	,
1	CONCESSIONS 4
2	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA:I'm going to ask
3	you to please wrap up.
4	REVEREND DEXTER HENDERSON:sometime
5	very soon and you're going to have to vote on this,
6	please do not make the same mistake of voting no
7	because we'll be at your offices as well. And to the
8	Mayor finally, we're in this fight to save our city
9	all the way, you're going to see that we are very
LO	capable if you decide to partner with the EBC and
11	build more places like Redwood Senior Living and
L2	Edwin's Place. If you continue to provide the land
L3	and subsidies… [cross-talk]
L 4	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Sir, I'm going to
L5	ask you to… [cross-talk]
L 6	REVEREND DEXTER HENDERSON:like you
L7	done here… [cross-talk]
L8	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA:wrap up please
L 9	[cross-talk]
20	REVEREND DEXTER HENDERSON:we will help
21	you take care of the Darlene Mealy's and anyone else
22	who chooses to stand in the way of real affordable

Council Member Mealy, do you have any questions?

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you.

housing in this city. Thank you.

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes, I do. Just
for our young lady, you said that you were in NYCHA
you were in NYCHA housing and then you went to Red
development Senior Housing that's a totally different
thing from this development. So, I I'm glad that you
went into senior housing, if we had more senior
housing like that I would be jumping up and down but
for this right now Brownsville has its fair share of
homeless and studios, if you could give me more
because we have people who have been in Brownsville
want to get out of public housing into affordable two
and three and one-bedroom apartments also. So, Pastor
or Reverend [cross-talk]
REVEREND DEXTER HENDERSON: Yes [cross-
talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: ...I'm looking forward because I know I've been doing right by this district, we have more than enough affordable housing in the 40... 41st council district, I fight more than enough so therefor if you feel you want to come visit me please I'm looking forward to you.

REVEREND DEXTER HENDERSON: Thank you... [cross-talk]

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

11

12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

49

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But right now I, I

disapprove this project, I need more affordable three

bedrooms, two bedrooms and less studios. If you want

I sent you my letter that I... I'm not in support of

this and I hope you put it in the record. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: I got that.

there any more members of the public who wish to

Alright, thank you very much Council Member. Are

10 testify? Alright, seeing none I will now close the

public hearings on LU 792 through 795. LU 792 through

795 Edwin's Place seven... LU 797 Archer Green, LU 746

Elton and NCP Park have been laid over. I would like

to thank the Council and Land Use staff for preparing

today's hearing and members of the public and my

colleagues for attending. This Meeting is now

adjourned.

[gavel]

$C \ E \ R \ T \ I \ F \ I \ C \ A \ T \ E$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

November 14, 2017