

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

June 15, 2017
Start: 12:43 p.m.
Recess: 1:22 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
The Speaker of the Council
VINCENT J. GENTILE
The Acting President Pro Tempore

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Daniel R. Garodnick
Vincent J. Gentile

COUNCIL MEMBERS: (CONTINUED)

Vanessa L. Gibson
David G. Greenfield
Barry S. Grodenchik
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Bill Perkins
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

4

[sound check]

[background comments]

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,
can I have your attention, please? Quiet on the
floor, please. Quiet on the floor, please. Quiet on
the floor, please. In the back, quiet on the floor.
Shhhh. At this time, please place all electronic
devices, all electronic devices to vibrate. Will all
non-Council employees please leave the main floor of
the chambers? We do have additional seating upstairs
in the balcony. Quiet, please. Thank you.

[pause]

[gavel]

ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Calling
the recessed meeting of June 6, 2017 to order, held
on today, June 15, 2017. Please stand for the Pledge
of Allegiance.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

[background comments]

[Pledge of Allegiance]

ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Roll call.

CITY CLERK: Barron. Borelli. Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

CITY CLERK: Chin.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 5

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

3 CITY CLERK: Cohen.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

5 CITY CLERK: Constantinides.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

7 CITY CLERK: Cornegy.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

9 CITY CLERK: Crowley. Cumbo. Deutsch.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

11 CITY CLERK: Dromm. Espinal.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

13 CITY CLERK: Eugene.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.

15 CITY CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

16 Garodnick. Gentile.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Here.

18 CITY CLERK: Gibson. Greenfield.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Good to be

20 back.

21 CITY CLERK: Grodenchik.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Present.

23 CITY CLERK: Johnson.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.

25 CITY CLERK: Kallos.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

CITY CLERK: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

CITY CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

CITY CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

CITY CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

CITY CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

CITY CLERK: Levin. Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

CITY CLERK: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

CITY CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

CITY CLERK: Mendez. Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

CITY CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.

CITY CLERK: Perkins.

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Present.

CITY CLERK: Reynoso.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Present.

CITY CLERK: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

CITY CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

CITY CLERK: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

CITY CLERK: Salamanca.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

CITY CLERK: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.

CITY CLERK: Treyger. Ulrich. Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

CITY CLERK: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

CITY CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

CITY CLERK: Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Presente.

CITY CLERK: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

CITY CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

CITY CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Here.

ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: We have a quorum. Thank you, Mr. Clerk. The invocation today will be given by our colleague, Council Member Fernando Cabrera. Please stand.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

[background comments]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Let's pray. Our Father, which are in heaven, hallowed by your name in this place, your kingdom come, your will be done. In light of what we saw in Virginia yesterday, we first pray for your peace to come up on our land. Today we stand against every form of destructive violence, we pray for special hedge [sic] of protection upon all elected officials. In today's agenda we beseech you for your wisdom and guidance in all matters which affect our communities. And last, we declare a blessing of your love and grace to befall upon our Speaker, upon my colleagues and staff. In the wonderful name of Jesus we pray. Amen.

[collective amen]

[background comments]

ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you, Council Member. Supplement to

messages and papers from the Mayor.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered M 520,
speed violation monitoring systems.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Next page. I'm
sorry, [crosstalk, background comments] state and
federal legislation.

ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE:
Supplemental communication from city, county and
borough offices.

COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Supplement
to petitions and communications.

COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE:
Supplemental land use call-ups. None?

COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Okay.
Supplement to communication from the Speaker.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Do we do this for
the... do it now? [background comment] Okay.
Alright. Give me one second.

Alright. So good afternoon to everyone.
Buenos tardes to my colleagues as I ask you to please
rise. Before we begin, I want to take a moment for

1
2 us to recognize the passing late last month of FDNY
3 Officer Ray Pfeifer. Officer Pfeifer retired from
4 Engine 40, Ladder 35 in 2014 after serving the City
5 of New York for nearly 28 years, including as a
6 member of the response team on 9/11 and in the months
7 following. Officer Pfeifer was a tireless advocate
8 for the passing of the Zadroga 9/11 Health and
9 Compensation Act, which works to protect and provide
10 for first responders like himself who suffered and
11 continued to suffer from the ill health effects of
12 having working on-site at Ground Zero. We thank
13 Officer Pfeifer for his years of service and our
14 thoughts are with his family at this time, so I would
15 like to us to join in a moment of silence.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, my
17 colleagues.

18 So today hopefully will be a fairly short
19 Stated Meeting as we review one item of legislation
20 and several resolutions regarding home rules and
21 happenings at the state level.

22 As our legislative calendar ends next
23 Wednesday, we are moving to provide our partners in
24 the state government with an opportunity to pass
25 these bills in a timely manner.

1
2 First, Introduction 1263-A, sponsored by
3 Council Member Danny Dromm, which would require the
4 results of school cafeteria inspections to be posted
5 online on the Department of Education website. This
6 is the one piece of legislation that we will be
7 considering today. So these inspections would be
8 posted online on the Department of Education website
9 for public schools or the Department of Health and
10 Mental Hygiene website for private schools. Council
11 Member Dromm, who also chairs our Education
12 Committee, is the lead sponsor of this bill and he
13 will say a few words.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very
15 much, Madam Speaker, and I deeply appreciate all the
16 work that you've done to move this legislation
17 quickly and swiftly. This legislation would provide
18 information, vitally important information to parents
19 about the quality of the food and the conditions of
20 the school cafeterias. As the number one prepared
21 food vendor in the City of New York, the Department
22 of Education should be required to present parents
23 with information about the conditions in those school
24 cafeterias. And I am also pleased that we are moving
25 this legislation here in our City Council and where

1
2 we have a say in what happens in our New York City
3 Department of Education as opposed to having
4 outsiders come in and tell us how to run our schools
5 or how to inspect our cafeterias, or what information
6 our parents should have about the conditions of those
7 cafeterias.

8 So again, I am thankful to you, I'm
9 thankful to Chair Corey Johnson as well for passing
10 this legislation and to the members of the Committee
11 [background comment] and I look forward to the
12 passage of this legislation today so that the parents
13 may know the condition of school cafeterias. Thank
14 you very much.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
16 Member. And next the Council will vote on six state
17 legislation resolutions and one communication from
18 the Mayor.

19 State Legislation Resolution 0005-17
20 requests the New York State Legislature to pass bills
21 introduced by State Senator Martin Golden and State
22 Assembly Member Herman Farrell, an act to amend the
23 real property tax law, in relation to the
24 determination of adjusted base proportions in special
25 assessing units which are cities for the fiscal year

1
2 2018. The effect of this change will be to reduce
3 the amount by which the current base proportions for
4 any class is allowed to grow.

5 State Legislation Resolution 0006-17
6 requests the State Legislature o pass bills
7 introduced by State Senator Golden, State Assembly
8 Member Abate, an act to amend the administrative code
9 of the City of New York, in relation to providing
10 awards to spouses of emergency medical technicians
11 and advanced emergency medical technicians who are
12 killed while engaged in the discharge of duty. This
13 bill would create a death benefit for the surviving
14 spouses of EMTs employed by the FDNY who are killed
15 while engaged in the performance of their duties.

16 State Legislation Resolution 0007-17
17 requests the State Legislature to pass bills
18 introduced by Senator Golden and Assembly Member
19 DenDekker, an act to amend the retirement and social
20 security law and the general municipal law, in
21 relation to pension benefits of widows or widowers of
22 sanitation workers. This bill would make the widows
23 and widowers of sanitation workers who are killed in
24 the line of duty due to accidents eligible to receive
25

1
2 accidental death benefits as are afforded to the
3 surviving spouses of other uniformed services.

4 State Legislation Resolution 0008-17
5 requests the State Legislature to pass bills
6 introduced in the Senate and in the Assembly, an act
7 authorizing the City of New York to discontinue
8 parkland for the purpose of construction -- give me
9 one second -- [background comment] okay, got it;
10 sorry -- an act authorizing the City of New York to
11 discontinue parkland for the purpose of construction
12 and operation of a pre-kindergarten center with a
13 focus on instruction in science, technology,
14 engineering, and mathematics. This legislation will
15 provide New York City the authority to discontinue
16 the use as parkland of certain parkland in Flushing
17 Meadow Park in order to permit the construction of a
18 new pre-K facility in the proximity of the New York
19 Hall of Science.

20 State Legislation Resolution 0009-17
21 requests the State Legislature to pass bills
22 introduced by State Senator Jose Serrano and Assembly
23 Member Latoya Joyner, an act to authorize the City of
24 New York to discontinue the use as parkland of a
25 portion of Corporal Fischer Park in the borough of

1
2 the Bronx and to sell and convey such land upon terms
3 and conditions to facilitate the construction of
4 affordable housing. This legislation will provide
5 New York City the authority to discontinue the use as
6 parkland of Corporal Fischer Park in the Bronx for
7 the purposes of creating a housing complex where 100%
8 of the units will be classified as affordable
9 housing.

10 State Legislation Resolution 0010-17
11 requests the State Legislature to pass bills
12 introduced by State Senator Serrano and State
13 Assembly Member Benedetto, an act in relation to
14 authorizing discontinuance of the use as parkland of
15 land in the City of New York commonly known as Marx
16 Brothers playground -- this is actually in my
17 district. This legislation will provide New York
18 City the authority to discontinue the use as parkland
19 of Marx Brothers playground and to transfer such land
20 to the New York City Educational Construction Fund to
21 permit the construction of a combined occupancy
22 structure that will include several schools, and the
23 parkland will be replaced.

24 Finally, the Council will vote on Mayor's
25 Message 0520-17, requesting the State Legislature to

1 pass bills introduced in the State Senate and in the
2 Assembly which relate to amending several laws in
3 order to allow for the expansion of the school speed
4 safety cameras program. Seeing this legislation pass
5 is a vital public safety measure. Speed cameras make
6 our streets safer and help save lives. Over the next
7 three years installing 150 more speed cameras along
8 school zones throughout the city will protect
9 drivers, shield pedestrians and safeguard young
10 people from the dangers of unchecked speed. From
11 lowering speed limits to spearheading critical Vision
12 Zero legislation, this Council has made strengthening
13 street safety a top priority. I am proud of this
14 resolution; I really want to thank the leadership of
15 my colleagues; in particular, our chair of
16 Transportation, Ydanis Rodriguez and our Majority
17 Leader, Jimmy Van Bramer, who is sponsoring this
18 resolution; really proud of everyone in this Council
19 for championing our successful efforts by working to
20 bring more oversight to the streets of New York City
21 through the installation of additional cameras.

22
23 I do want to recognize that we have here
24 in the balcony Amy Cohen, who lost her son Sammy, and
25 Hank Miller, who lost his sister Victoria Nicodemus;

1
2 there's other families here represented and advocates
3 who supported this measure who are strong, strong
4 advocates, they're here with us in the balcony, if we
5 could recognize them. [clapping, background
6 comments] Obviously incredible advocacy on their
7 behalf, very painful obviously any time that they
8 have to talk about this tragic situation and so we
9 thank them for that; it really means a lot that
10 they're here with us today.

11 So again, I thank my colleagues and ask
12 for support on all of these measures. And with that,
13 I end communication from the Speaker.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you,
15 Madam Speaker. Discussion of general orders. Going
16 once, going twice. Okay, seeing none. Supplemental
17 report of special committees.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE:
20 Supplemental reports of standing committees.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
22 on Health, Intro 1233-A, exotic animal circus
23 performances.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and laid
25 over.

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1263-A,
3 [background comments] good service inspections in
4 schools.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
6 coupled on general orders.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
8 on State and Federal Legislation, Preconsidered
9 SLR 0005, adjusted base proportions.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
11 general orders.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered SLR 0006,
13 awards to spouses of emergency medical technicians.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
15 general orders.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered SLR 0007,
17 pension benefits.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
19 general orders.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered SLR 0008,
21 parkland repurposing.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
23 general orders.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered SLR 0009,
25 Corporal Fischer Park.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 19

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 general orders.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered SLR 0010,
5 Marx Brothers playground.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
7 general orders.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered M 0520,
9 school speed cameras.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
11 general orders.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: On the supplemental
13 general order calendar, Intro 0709-A, Youth Workforce
14 Development Program.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Laid over.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Roll call...
17 [crosstalk]

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Resolution appointing
19 various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
21 general orders and I ask for a roll call on all items
22 on the general order calendar.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
25 explain my vote.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 20

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Yes. Go
3 ahead.

4 [background comment]

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Yes. Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very
7 much. I'm concerned about some of the preconsidered
8 legislation that we're voting on today. I see that
9 Preconsidered SLR 0010 does in fact have provision
10 that that parkland will be transferred to another
11 location. I understand that SLR 0009 is two lots,
12 one of which will be developed and the other will be
13 given up as parkland, and in SLR 0008, I don't see
14 that there's any provision to maintain it parkland.
15 I'm very concerned about loss of parkland; I think
16 that there should have been provisions so that we
17 don't lose any of our parkland, so I'm voting aye on
18 all, with the exception of Preconsidered SLR 0009 and
19 Preconsidered SLR 0008. Thank you.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
22 except M 0520.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 21

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye on all.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on

7 all.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: No on 0520-17

12 and aye on the rest.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all with

15 the exception of Preconsidered SLR 0008 and I vote no

16 on SLR 0008.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote aye.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye on all.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye on all.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye on all,
3 with the exception of M 0520.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all,
6 with the exception of M 0520.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I want to
9 congratulate Danny Dromm on the legislation today for
10 cafeteria inspections; I'm glad that the Council is
11 doing this and not the State Legislature, and I vote
12 aye on all.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to
15 explain my vote on M 0520. Permission?

16 [background comments]

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: I'm sorry.
18 I'm sorry. Yes, go ahead.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I support M 0520
20 at PS 158 at York and 78th Street; I've had
21 fatalities in 2014, 2016, and 2017; at York Avenue
22 and 79th Street, just a block away, another fatality
23 in 2011. Within a block of Middle School 114 in my
24 district we've had fatalities in 2011, 2012, 2013,
25 2016. We need to pass this legislation and we

1
2 actually need to put these speed cameras in my
3 district; for those reasons, I support this
4 legislation. I made comments regarding the other
5 legislation in the committee vote, and I vote aye on
6 all.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: King.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Abstain on
13 M 0520 and aye on all.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on all.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: May I explain my
18 vote?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Yes you
20 may.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: There is a role
22 for speed cameras and I voted for the original round
23 of speed cameras, but before we expand the number of
24 speed cameras significantly in this city, I do
25 believe there needs to be a thoughtful examination of

1
2 the current program, the need for expansion, and how
3 that expansion will be implemented. It is an issue
4 that has raised a number of concerns in my district,
5 particularly regarding the placement of some of the
6 speed cameras, and the nature of the Administration's
7 negotiations with folks up in Albany has not given,
8 in my view, this Council an ability to have that
9 thorough and open examination. So I will be voting
10 no on M 0520, with the hope that down the road we can
11 have a serious conversation about the best way to
12 implement and potentially expand the speed camera
13 program. With that I vote aye on all except for
14 M 0520, and I vote no on that.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: With deep
17 gratitude to the advocacy for Families for Safe
18 Streets in helping win something that will truly save
19 lives, I vote aye on all.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
22 explain my vote.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Yes, go
24 ahead.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
3 much. So I want to vote aye on all and with regard
4 to M 0520, the fact of the matter is that speeding
5 kills and without effective enforcement people will
6 continue to speed here in New York City. I ask
7 anybody that drives a car that's listening right now
8 to conduct an experiment; try going the speed limit,
9 look at your speedometer as you're driving, go 25
10 miles an hour on an artery -- in my district on
11 Meeker Avenue, on Atlantic Avenue, on McGuinness
12 Boulevard -- and see what drivers behind you do --
13 they honk at you, they go around you. We need to
14 slow down in New York City. We are all gonna get to
15 where we need to go, but the fact of the matter is
16 nobody needs to go 35 miles an hour, 45 miles an
17 hour, 55 miles an hour on New York City streets, it's
18 unnecessary, it's over the speed limit, it is
19 dangerous and it kills; that needs to be the message
20 -- speed kills. So I enthusiastically support
21 M 0520, I vote aye on all and I wanna thank my
22 colleagues at Families for Safe Streets for their
23 important advocacy on this. Thank you.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye on all except
for SLR 0008 and 0009; I'll be abstaining.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Perkins.

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to
explain my vote.

ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: First of all,
congratulations to Majority Leader Jimmy Van Bramer
and thank you for your work and thank you to the

1 Families for Safe Streets, MTA. And Speaker Melissa
2 Mark-Viverito, you and the Mayor have been great
3 leaders on many issues, but especially when it comes
4 to Vision Zero. With your leadership we are doing
5 the home rule, something that is so critical, because
6 a speed camera is not about making money; speed
7 camera is about saving lives and we have seen how
8 speed cameras have been so important for our children
9 going to school, and I am so happy to see this home
10 rule pass with your support and your leadership, and
11 I know that this is only one of more than 25 laws
12 that we have passed at this Council with your support
13 and leadership related to Vision Zero. Thank you.
14 And with that, I vote aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to
18 explain my vote. I'm voting aye on... [crosstalk]

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Yes... Yes,
20 you may.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. I'm
22 voting aye on all items on today's agenda and I would
23 like to amend my vote on M 0499 and Resolutions 1534
24 and 1535 from the June 6 agenda, from a no to a yes
25 vote. Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to explain my vote.

ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I vote aye; I very proudly vote aye on all, and in particular, support M 0520. I wish my last name started with A so I could have said this before my colleagues spoke, but I will tell you, as an alum of OMB, having worked there for seven years, in no way is this a revenue-generating proposal. AT OMB, when we talk about these things and we talk about revenues that could come in from stuff like this, it doesn't count toward an agency's savings goal. So the cynical point of view that this is simply to generate revenue for the City is not true. And secondly, I would like to say that we know this is about getting people to slow down because not only will there be a speed camera; there will also be a sign placed in front of the camera well in advance to tell people that there's a speed camera. If this were some sort of hoax to raise money for the City, why would they put up a sign saying slow down? And I would like to add that to those who are listening to the noise out there

1
2 about, you know how the Mayor handled this, whether
3 in Albany or with us, I'm not impressed with his
4 behavior either, but that is noise. The point of
5 this bill and this home rule is to make sure that we
6 keep people from getting killed by cars; that's it,
7 it's a simple, simple idea. I am so relieved that
8 the State is finally going to allow us more speed
9 cameras [bell]; it's outrageous that we have to go to
10 the State to ask for speed cameras.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Council
12 Member.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah, I vote
14 aye on all, proudly. Thank you.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I'm pleased that
21 Albany and our leaders have heard us; that no
22 children cross highway exit ramps, and I vote aye on
23 all.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Yes, go
5 ahead.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye on all
7 and I want to add my consensus to what my colleague,
8 Council Member Rosenthal was saying. You know I've
9 lost a few school children in my district, near
10 schools or walking to an after school program, and so
11 speed cameras will save lives. There will be signs
12 advising the public about it; there are signs
13 advising when you're near a school building; this
14 will go a long way to making our city safer and I am
15 proud that we are voting on this bill today. Thank
16 you very much.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all
21 except abstain on M 0520 and no on SLR 008, 009 and
22 0010.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be
25 excused to explain my vote?

1
2 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Yes, go
3 ahead.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I came here
5 with the intention of voting no 0520; I'm going to
6 change my vote to an abstention based on some of the
7 things I heard here and some data that was presented
8 to me, but I still am not convinced that we have done
9 the right efficacy research on the ones that exist
10 versus revenue and the types of deaths that have
11 occurred. My prayers are with the victims' families
12 and many people are going to portray this as some of
13 us who are voting against don't care and that's just
14 absolutely not true. I just wanna make sure what
15 we're doing is having the proper impact versus
16 possible revenue-raising. I don't think that
17 occurred here, and I hope the Mayor in the future
18 does a better job of engaging this Council with
19 what's going on in this entire city and has a better
20 discussion. I abstain on M 0520 and aye on all the
21 rest.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: May I explain my
24 vote?

1
2 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Yes you
3 may.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Listening to
5 Council Member Rosenthal eloquently state her
6 position, I do support the legislation, but
7 Councilman Lancman and Jumaane Williams also have
8 points; I think there should be more input with the
9 Council, so I vote aye on all, but I abstain from
10 M 0520.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 0520; aye
13 on the rest.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to
16 briefly explain my vote. I... [crosstalk]

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: You may.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: just wanna
19 thank our Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito for her
20 courage in seeing this through; this is a resolution
21 that I've been proud to sponsor and along with our
22 chair, Ydanis Rodriguez, this Council has really been
23 at the forefront of the Vision Zero movement. I too
24 have lost children in my district who were killed in
25 crashes, and in Woodside, Queens, just a couple of

1
2 years ago, Noshat Nahian was 8 years old when his
3 sister was walking him across the street on Northern
4 Boulevard; he was run over by a truck and killed. We
5 should never have to do what I did, which is to look
6 at his mother and listen to her talk about her son,
7 who she will never see again; that's what this is
8 about, pure and simple, saving lives of children in
9 our city and our state and I'm very, very proud.
10 Thank you. I vote aye on all.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: All items
14 on today's general order calendar were adopted by a
15 vote of 47 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and
16 0 abstentions, with the exception of M 0520, which is
17 adopted by a vote of 37 in the affirmative, 6 in the
18 negative and 4 abstentions, and SLR 0008, which was
19 adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative, 3 in the
20 negative and 1 abstention, and SLR 0009, which was
21 adopted by a vote of 44 in the affirmative, 2 in the
22 negative and 1 abstention, and M 0499 and Reso 1534
23 and Reso 1535, which is revised by a vote of 49 in
24 the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0 abstentions,
25

1
2 and SLR 0010, which was adopted by a vote of 48 in
3 the affirmative, 1 in the negative and 0 abstentions.

4 Introduction and reading of bills.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All items are
6 attached and sent to the appropriate committees as
7 indicated on the agenda.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE:

9 Supplemental resolutions. Seeing none. Okay. We
10 have one more? [background comment] Okay. A
11 correction on the vote tally for SLR 0010. SLR 0010
12 was adopted by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, 1 in
13 the negative and 0 abstentions. [background
14 comments] General discussion. We have first on our
15 list Council Member Espinal.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I'll make this
17 brief so we all can get out of here. But this is
18 very important. Nightlife in New York City has been
19 under attack for a very long time, to the point where
20 we're really losing the cultural capital that has
21 created, for New York City, you know everyone who
22 looked at New York sees it as a city that never
23 sleeps because of all the bars and the music venues
24 and all of the artists that came out of this city and
25 they feel that the City has been imposing a lot of

1
2 legislation and a lot of rules that have been onerous
3 on their businesses, which is why I am introducing
4 Intro. I am very excited to introduce this bill; it
5 will create the Office of a Night Mayor; not
6 nightmare, Night Mayor and the Night Mayor will be an
7 office that will be solely in charge of working with
8 the communities, working with the night venues and
9 working with the City in finding ways where we all
10 can co-exist without putting a burden on the cultural
11 institutions that we have in our city. This is
12 something that I've been working on for over a year
13 and I hope there will be a time where we can talk
14 about what really makes this city breathe and it's
15 the nightlife venues in our city. So I really ask
16 all my colleagues to please sign on to Intro 1648 in
17 order for New York City to be the city that it has
18 been for decades. We have to step up and do
19 something to protect our night venues, and you know,
20 it's something that I'm very, very proud of,
21 introducing something that is very personal to me,
22 you know, is place where I spent a lot of my time,
23 being someone who's very introverted, these spaces
24 gave me an opportunity to express myself in ways that
25 I haven't been able to, and we have a lot of New

1
2 Yorkers who feel the same exact way and they are
3 counting on the support from our city to keep these
4 venues alive. Thank you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you
6 Council Member Espinal. Any others for general
7 discussion? [background comment] Council Member
8 Barron.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I
10 wanna call my colleagues' attention to Preconsidered
11 Reso 1559, which calls on the State Legislature to
12 pass and the Governor to sign [background comments]
13 Assembly Bill 6811; Senate Bill 5120, an act to
14 establish a private student loan refinance task
15 force, and this task force would bring together the
16 State Comptroller, the Higher Education Service
17 Corporation and private lending institutions in New
18 York State to study and report the ways in which
19 those lending institutions can be incentivized to
20 create student loan refinancing programs. The rising
21 costs of college education and the rising debt that
22 students have incurred is continuing to rise, from
23 2009 to 2014 the federal rate has more than doubled;
24 in New York State the student loan debt has more than
25 doubled between 2006 and 2015. So in light of this

1
2 astronomical burden which can prevent students from
3 completing school, from becoming homeowners, from
4 qualifying for auto loans and starting small
5 businesses and saving for the future, it's unclear
6 how we can expect the younger generation to...

7 [crosstalk]

8 [background comment]

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Let's have
10 some order, please. Let's have some order.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: thank you... to be
12 prepared to be able to claim their position in the
13 future. So I invite my colleagues to read the bill
14 and to sign onto Resolution 1559. Thank you.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you
16 Council Member Barron. Council Member Williams.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I
18 just wanna ask my colleagues to continue... [background
19 comment]... [crosstalk]

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Let's have
21 some order, please; have some order.

22 [background comments]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: keep Sergeant
24 Veve in their prayers; that is the officer who is
25 still in serious condition in Kings County. He does

1
2 have a Go Fund Me page, so if people can take the
3 time to spread that Go Fund Me page around and as
4 well, help the family out. Also, my continued
5 thoughts and prayers with Representative Steve
6 Scalise, two members of the Capital Police and a
7 congressional aide who were shot yesterday in
8 Alexandria. There was an innocent bystander shot at
9 Barclays and also a mass shooting at a UPS package
10 sorting facility in San Francisco and we just passed
11 the one-year anniversary of the Orlando Pulse
12 shooting. This year alone we have 159 mass
13 shootings; that is just this year alone, and more
14 than 27,000 shooting instances; that is just this
15 year alone; it makes me wonder what will have to
16 happen for Congress to push back against the NRA --
17 and there are many, many NRA members who agree with
18 the commonsense legislation that is before Congress
19 --and realize that access to guns, coupled with this
20 country's penchant for violence, and actually, almost
21 demonic resolve that they must have access to any and
22 every kind of firearm is a recipe for disaster,
23 **[inaudible]** scene played out yesterday and so many
24 times previously; the time is to act right now; there
25 are bills that may get passed in Congress and make it

1
2 worse -- one of them that got postponed is to make it
3 easier to access silencers -- I do not understand
4 what part of the Second Amendment means that you have
5 to have a silencer on your gun; it is going from bad
6 to worse; the time to act is now. We are the City
7 Council; we are very good on these issues; my hope is
8 that the rest of the country will catch up to us very
9 soon.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you
11 Council Member Williams. Any others for general
12 discussion? Seeing none; we turn it to our Speaker
13 for concluding remarks.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, and
15 just as I was gonna close out and I thank Council
16 Member Williams for reminding us of these unfortunate
17 incidents in this day of the Virginia shooting and
18 San Francisco, where three are dead as a result of an
19 action taken by an individual with access to a gun.
20 Obviously we all know that violence in any type is
21 unacceptable and the issue of gun violence continues
22 to be pervasive and an epidemic and we need to do
23 something about it. Keeping everyone in our thoughts
24 and prayers; hoping for the best for everyone, and
25

1
2 obviously thoughts to those that have lost loved
3 ones, and particularly in the San Francisco shooting.

4 So we're going to wrap up and just to
5 know that we will still be in recess and thank all my
6 colleagues for their diligence today, and with that,
7 we are in recess.

8 [gavel]

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: This
10 meeting is recessed till further notice.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date July 10, 2017