

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

----- X

April 24, 2017  
Start: 10:14 a.m.  
Recess: 1:27 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E:  
LAURIE A. CUMBO  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:  
Darlene Mealy  
Elizabeth S. Crowley  
Karen Koslowitz  
Ben Kallos  
Daniel Dromm

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Aletha Maybank, M.D.  
Deputy Commissioner  
Center for Health Equity  
Department of Health and Mental Hygiene

Matthew Klein  
Executive Director  
Center for Economic Opportunity  
Mayor's Office of Operations

Beverly Neufeld  
President  
PowHer New York

Megan Jean Louis  
Representative  
Young Women's Advisory Council  
Girls for Gender Equity

Nicole Triplett  
Policy Counsel  
New York Civil Liberties Union

Julie Nelson  
Senior Vice President  
Center for Social Inclusion,  
Director  
Government Alliance on Race and Equity

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Gloria Malone  
Representing Tanya Gumbs  
Young Women's Advisory Council  
Gils for Gender Equity

Doreen Odom  
Representative  
Legal Service NYC

Alexis Posey  
Senior Policy Analyst  
FPWA

Dr. Danielle Moss Lee  
President and CEO  
YWCA of New York City

Sheila Katzman  
President  
International Association of Women in  
Radio and Television, USA  
Co-Chair  
New York City for CEDAW

Ericka Dixon  
Policy Programs Coordinator  
Black Women's Blueprint

Leslie Wright  
Advocacy Chair  
Zonta Club of NY

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Mary Luke  
President  
Metro NY Chapter  
UN National Committee for UN Women

Dina Bakst  
Co-Founder and Co-President  
A Better Balance: The Work and  
Family Legal Center

Merble Reagon  
Executive Director  
Women's Center for Education and  
Career Advancement

Lorraine Stephens  
Vice President  
Programs and Strategic Learning  
New York Women's Foundation

MaryBeth Bognar  
Representative  
Center for Women's Global Leadership

Martha Kamber  
President and CEO  
YWCA of Brooklyn

Natasha Lycia Ora Bannan  
Associate Counsel  
LatinoJustice PRLDEF

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Debjani Roy  
Deputy Director  
Hollaback!

Allegra Fishel  
Executive Director and Founder  
Gender Equality Law Center

Laura Redman  
Director  
Health Justice Program  
New York Lawyers for the Public Interest

Ruth Lowenkron  
Director  
Disability Justice Program  
New York Lawyers for the Public Interest

Namasha Schilling  
Program and Communications Coordinator  
Day One

Ashe McGovern  
Legislative and Policy Director  
Public Rights/Private Conscience Project  
Columbia Law School

Sobeida Cruz  
Vice President  
The 100 Hispanic Women National, Inc.

[sound check]

[pause]

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Good morning, I'm Council Member Laurie Cumbo and I'm now calling this hearing to order. Thank you all for being here. I'm going to begin with my opening statement.

Good morning, I am Council Member Laurie Cumbo, Chair of the Women's Issues Committee. I would first like to thank Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito for her leadership and support on these very important herstorical [sic] issues. Her commitment to women's equality has been instrumental in moving New York City in the right direction. I'd also like to thank the sponsors of the legislation, particularly Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, as well as Council Members Dromm and Lander, and, of course, thank you to the members of the Committee on Women's Issues that are part of this very historical moment. I wanna thank committee staff, Counsel Aminta Kilawan and Policy Analyst Joan Povolny. And last, but not least, thank you to all of you who are here today, because this is such an important day in the advancement of women's equality and you are certainly part of the "herstory" that we're making today and I

1  
2 thank you for your time and your energy and this is  
3 certainly going to be a hearing for us to remember.  
4 Your participation and voices are a vital part of  
5 government.

6 The legislation being heard today could  
7 help provide tools for the City to better combat  
8 racial and gender inequity. For while we know  
9 disparities exist, it is hard to implement real  
10 change without document that measure and provide a  
11 blueprint for change; today we are going to begin the  
12 process of changing and dismantling a process that  
13 has been not so transparent for so very long.

14 Intro No. 1500 in relation to gender and  
15 racial equity assessments and Intro No. 1520 in  
16 relation to measuring and address gender and racial  
17 inequality in New York City help address these by  
18 capturing information; information is key to making  
19 sure that we are able to make the strides that women  
20 all across this city and nation have been fighting  
21 for.

22 City workers, like all human beings,  
23 carry their own familial, cultural, religious, and  
24 other life experience and therefore see the world  
25 through a lens of these experiences. These implicit

1  
2 biases are sometimes subtle and many people are  
3 unaware they even have them. Council Member Dromm's  
4 bill, Intro 1512 in relation to training for City  
5 agencies to promote gender and racial equity seeks to  
6 address this.

7           Lastly, Resolution 542, which I sponsor,  
8 calls upon the United States Senate to ratify the  
9 United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All  
10 Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW). CEDAW  
11 has been ratified by numerous countries around the  
12 globe. CEDAW commits ratifying states incorporate to  
13 the principle of gender equality and law, abolish  
14 laws that interfere with gender equity, create gender  
15 equity enforcement mechanisms, and pursue the  
16 elimination of discrimination of women by persons,  
17 organizations and enterprises, and yet, the United  
18 States, while a signatory since 1980, has yet to  
19 formally ratify as a government.

20           So today we will talk about equality and  
21 equity for all and how we can move the needle  
22 forward. I look forward to hearing from all involved  
23 on those pieces of legislation.

24           And I just want to add as well that the  
25 Women's March that happened here in New York City and

1 Washington D.C. and all across the globe has  
2 certainly set the stage for us to be able to be here  
3 today, because first we raise our voices and then we  
4 have the opportunity to create legislation that  
5 actually changes those very things that brought us  
6 together to march in the first place.

7  
8 I'd like to now turn the floor over to  
9 Council Member Danny Dromm, who will give a statement  
10 about his legislation. Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you Chair  
12 Cumbo for holding this hearing and for the Speaker  
13 for putting equality equity front and center of the  
14 Council's agenda. I'm very proud of our city during  
15 these trying times for taking the national lead in  
16 areas such as protecting immigrants, ensuring women  
17 have a fair shot in the job market and creating an  
18 environment where lesbian, gay, bisexual, and  
19 transgender individuals feel secure.

20 We need to ensure all our diverse  
21 communities feel they are being served by City  
22 government and one of the best ways we can do this is  
23 by continuing to improve their interaction with City  
24 agencies. Frontline supporting and supervisory  
25 agency employees need to be proficient in cultural

1 competency aimed at promoting equity; this is  
2 especially true with the Department of Health and  
3 Mental Hygiene, the Administration for Children's  
4 Services and the Human Resources Administration which  
5 deal with sensitive issues around families and  
6 individuals. Intro 512 [sic] would require that  
7 employees of these agencies receive training on  
8 implicit bias, discrimination, cultural competency,  
9 and structural inequity with regard to race, gender,  
10 and significantly, sexual orientation. Such training  
11 will give these already hardworking public servants  
12 an enriched perspective on the populations they serve  
13 while making these communities feel the way they  
14 should; that government is working for them.  
15 Training will also increase understanding among  
16 employees in increasingly diverse work environments.  
17 Finally, employment at DOHMH, ACS and HRA will become  
18 even more attractive to prospective job applicants  
19 from all backgrounds. Workplace policies that  
20 encourage and promote diversity make sense and my  
21 hope is that these three agencies will become models  
22 for every City agency.

24 I look forward to hearing from both the  
25 Administration and the advocates, many of whom I have

1 worked with for many years on these issues, and I  
2 thank you. And just by way of explanation,  
3 simultaneously we're holding an Education Committee  
4 hearing and I'm Chair of Education, so I'm gonna need  
5 to leave to take a vote and I'll be back and forth.  
6 Thank you Chair Cumbo.

8 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you; we're  
9 happy to have you here today. At this time we are  
10 going to have Mr. Matthew Klein, who is from the  
11 Mayor's Office of Operations and the Center for  
12 Economic Opportunity, and we are gonna have Aletha  
13 Maybank, who is New York City Department of Health  
14 and Mental Hygiene, who are going to testify before  
15 us today. Aminta Kilawan will swear you in and then  
16 we will hear your testimony.

17 [background comment]

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Will you both please  
19 raise your right hand? Do you affirm to tell the  
20 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in  
21 your testimony for the Committee and to respond  
22 honestly to council member questions?

23 ALETHA MAYBANK: Yes.

24 MATTHEW KLEIN: I do.

25 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

[background comments]

ALETHA MAYBANK: Good morning Chair Cumbo and members of the Committee. I am Dr. Aletha Maybank, Deputy Commissioner over the Center for Health Equity at the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene. On behalf of Commissioner Bassett, I would like to thank you for the opportunity to testify on these bills and I'd like to also recognize Speaker Mark-Viverito, Chair Cumbo and Council Members Johnson, Dromm, Lander, Levin, and the Committee on Women's Issues for being champions for racial and gender equity.

The Health Department has made a commitment to protect and promote the health of all New Yorkers. However, not all New Yorkers have the resources and opportunities they need to attain optimal health. This is both unfair and unjust. We cannot fully live up to the commitment of our city work and our city without first taking a stand against injustice in all of its forms.

Structural racism is at the root of the health gaps we see by race. Structural gender inequity also results in health gaps between men and women, as well as transgender and gender

1 nonconforming, lesbian, gay, and bisexual  
2 communities. Historical, unjust policies and  
3 practices across our institutions have led to worse  
4 health outcomes. For example, discriminatory housing  
5 policies in the early 20th century created racially  
6 segregated neighborhoods and concentrated poverty in  
7 cities all across this country. The results of these  
8 policies are visible today in limited resources and  
9 opportunities in low-income areas, which are largely  
10 communities of color. Also, historical  
11 categorization of jobs by sex, and the undervaluing  
12 of what are considered gendered careers have  
13 contributed to the wage gap for women. But the  
14 policies and practices that perpetuate racism, sexism  
15 and heterosexism were created by people, which mean  
16 they can be undone by people. We have the power and  
17 the responsibility to create more inclusive and  
18 equitable institutions.

19  
20 Under Commission Bassett, equity, justice  
21 and inclusion have formed the Health Department's  
22 guiding principles. In 2014, the Health Department  
23 formed the Center for Health Equity to strengthen and  
24 amplify our work to eliminate health inequities  
25 rooted in these historical and contemporary

1 injustices and discrimination. The Center utilizes  
2 five key approaches to advance health equity, which  
3 are: 1.) to invest in key neighborhoods through  
4 place-based in neighborhood efforts; 2.) to make  
5 injustice visible through how we share our data and  
6 tell our stories; 3.) advance a health equity in all  
7 policies approach; 4.) amplify community power and  
8 voice through collective action and partnerships; and  
9 lastly, we work to support the Health Department's  
10 internal reform efforts to become a racial and gender  
11 justice organization. Today, I want to present to  
12 you our internal efforts to enhance racial and gender  
13 assessment trainings across the agency.  
14

15 Last year, the Health Department launched  
16 Race to Justice, an internal reform effort for  
17 advancing racial equity and social justice. Through  
18 this internal reform effort, we are learning how  
19 racism operates within our institutions and  
20 structures, and how structural racism shapes social,  
21 economic and health inequities across our city.  
22 Secondly, we are examining how structural racism  
23 impacts our work, our decisions, interactions, and  
24 policies. And thirdly, we are collaborating  
25 differently with communities we serve to identify and

1  
2 implement strategies to address these structural  
3 issues.

4 We are engaging staff in conversations  
5 about race, power and privilege. and facilitating  
6 trainings to improve staff capacity to undo racism  
7 and gender bias, understand how implicit bias affects  
8 us all, and use facilitative leadership to enhance  
9 organizational change. To accomplish these goals,  
10 the agency is working collaboratively with experts in  
11 the field from across the country, with Health  
12 Department staff members, and other cities engaged in  
13 similar efforts across the country.

14 In March 2016, the Department conducted  
15 an all-staff survey to explore attitudes and  
16 perceptions about race, racism and racial equity  
17 efforts within the agency. Survey analysis surfaced  
18 a need for greater urgency, alignment and action to  
19 center racial equity, both internally and externally.  
20 Survey results also indicated that most respondents  
21 did not feel racial equity and social justice  
22 activities were part of their daily work, while many  
23 suggested they would be interested in engaging  
24 further. In particular: 75% of Department staff  
25 strongly agree or agree that racism is a major

1  
2 problem in New York City and 84% strongly agree or  
3 agree that it is critical to discuss issues of racism  
4 within the Department. This is a good sign -- staff  
5 find this issue important and have been responsive to  
6 new training efforts.

7           A key part of implementing Race to  
8 Justice is normalizing conversations among staff  
9 around race, gender and sexual orientation, as well  
10 as power, privilege and equity. Our reform efforts  
11 include several different training pathways;  
12 therefore, many staff will be trained and will  
13 receive training over the years. Since we began this  
14 effort last year, over 1,000 staff out of our 6,000,  
15 have received some form of training. This includes  
16 over 350 staff receiving in-person training on  
17 implicit bias and over 70 senior staff, including the  
18 Commissioner's cabinet, who received three days of  
19 in-person leadership training on racial equity. We  
20 anticipate 900 additional staff in receiving a full  
21 day in-person training by the end of 2017. And in  
22 addition to our in-person trainings, over 700 staff  
23 have taken an online interactive module that was  
24 created in collaboration with Columbia Training  
25 Institute.

1  
2 We anticipate that all 6,000 Department  
3 staff will be trained over the next three years on  
4 racism, gender equity, LGBTQ inclusion, implicit  
5 bias, power, privilege and other systems of  
6 oppression. Each staff member will receive a one and  
7 a half day in-person Core Workshop on these  
8 foundational principles. To support training  
9 efforts, we have recently recruited 28 staff to  
10 become volunteer facilitators of these training  
11 sessions, and under our current plan, trainings will  
12 be held three times a month, with a goal of training  
13 150 staff per month.

14 In order to ensure dissemination and  
15 sustainability of this effort, we have organized a  
16 diverse group of staff champions from across the  
17 Department. This group was assembled in February  
18 2016 to guide the planning process, and to establish  
19 goals that will steer the work over the next several  
20 years. In addition, a Steering Committee and  
21 workgroups were established to guide development,  
22 implementation and evaluation of this process. The  
23 work is focused on four key areas: communications and  
24 organizational identity, community engagement and  
25

1  
2 partnerships, workforce equity and development, and  
3 equitable contracting and budgeting practices.

4 To strengthen our collaborations within  
5 New York City and across the country, the Department  
6 will continue its partnership with the Government  
7 Alliance on Race and Equity, a national network of  
8 local and regional jurisdictions that have made a  
9 commitment to advance racial equity across agencies.

10 Parallel to Race to Justice, we have  
11 concurrent internal reform efforts specifically  
12 relating to gender equity. In 2016, we adopted an  
13 agency vision statement on sexual and reproductive  
14 justice that specifically addresses how structural  
15 racism impacts sexual and reproductive health. It  
16 says, "We envision a world where All New Yorkers can  
17 safely express their sexuality and gender identity  
18 with dignity, possessing the knowledge, skills and  
19 resources to support healthy and fulfilling lives."  
20 In line with this goal, we have developed a number of  
21 initiatives that support women and teens of color:  
22 the New York City Birth Equity Initiative, The NYC  
23 Teens Connection, and the Sexual Reproductive Justice  
24 Community Engagement Group, each of which work with  
25

1  
2 local statewide partnerships to advance just and fair  
3 outcomes for all New Yorkers.

4 We have also launched the Gender Justice  
5 Initiative, which works to transform gender and power  
6 relations, norms, and structures as a core strategy  
7 for challenging health inequity. As with our Race  
8 for Justice work, we seek to improve our agency  
9 through training and strategic planning to reform  
10 internal policies and structures. The Gender Justice  
11 Initiative also enhances LGBTQ coordination among  
12 City agencies, including the Office of the Mayor  
13 Community Affairs Unit LGBTQ Taskforce, Deputy Mayor  
14 Palacio's office, and the Commission on Gender  
15 Equity. This work has also enabled us to start a  
16 number of intersectional efforts like leveraging City  
17 Council Gender Equity funds to enhance the capacity  
18 of our Cure Violence program, which is a  
19 neighborhood-based health intervention program, to  
20 ensure that those men and women working tirelessly to  
21 decrease gun violence can also address gender norms,  
22 gender roles, racism and social norms that contribute  
23 to violence in our neighborhoods. The Gender Justice  
24 Initiative is led by the Department's LGBTQ and  
25

1  
2 Gender Equity Liaisons that were recently hired  
3 through generous support of the Speaker.

4 Furthermore, the Department has a robust  
5 LGBTQ Employee Resource Group, known as ERG, that  
6 aims to support our LGBTQ employees and advance the  
7 agency's ability to meaningfully work and support  
8 with LGBTQ communities. Thanks to the work of the  
9 ERG, our health surveillance -- including the  
10 Community Health Survey and the Social Determinants  
11 of Health Survey -- are now more inclusive of  
12 transgender persons. These surveys, critical to the  
13 Department's data collection efforts, now include a  
14 standard two-step question that asks individuals both  
15 their gender identity and sex assigned at birth.

16 Our agency is made up of over 6,000  
17 employees who possess a wide array of identities,  
18 life experiences and skill that reflect the diversity  
19 of our city. We have learned that advancing racial  
20 and gender equity does not have to involve conflict,  
21 shame, or taking something away; it is about building  
22 bridges, exploring new solutions and honoring the  
23 full humanity of us all, in order to create a better  
24 agency. Through open and honest communication, we  
25 are developing the skills and tools to examine our

1  
2 practices with a racial and gender justice lens and  
3 to determine opportunities for improvement. This is  
4 not an easy task, but as New Yorkers and as employees  
5 of one of the largest, most visible health  
6 departments in the world, we are up for the  
7 challenge. We are excited about these evolving work  
8 streams within our Department, and look forward to  
9 sharing progress and impact with you in the future.

10 My colleagues in the Mayor's Office will  
11 speak more about Intros 1500, 1512 and 1520, but as  
12 you have heard in my testimony, the Department is  
13 committed to advancing racial and gender equity as  
14 central tenants of our public health mission. We  
15 have embarked on an internal reform and training  
16 effort to advance this work within our Department and  
17 we are very glad that the Council is considering ways  
18 to further racial and gender equity, and we look  
19 forward to discussing the details of the legislation  
20 with you in the future.

21 Thank you again and for the opportunity  
22 to testify, and I am happy to answer any questions at  
23 this time.

24 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you so much for  
25 your testimony and we look forward to asking

1  
2 questions. I want to recognize that we've been  
3 joined by Council Member Elizabeth Crowley from  
4 Queens, Council Member Karen Koslowitz, also from  
5 Queens, and we are now going to hear your testimony.  
6 Thank you.

7 MATTHEW KLEIN: Thank you. Good morning  
8 Chairwoman Cumbo and members of the Committee. My  
9 name is Matt Klein and I am the Executive Director of  
10 the Center for Economic Opportunity, part of the  
11 Mayor's Office of Operations. I am also a Senior  
12 Advisor within Operations and I will be speaking on  
13 behalf of both the Center and Operations today.

14 I want to start by thanking Speaker Mark-  
15 Viverito, the Chair and members of the Committee for  
16 the opportunity to testify, and to acknowledge your  
17 steadfast commitment to equity and your efforts to  
18 keep our city at the forefront of inclusive,  
19 progressive leadership. I would also like to thank  
20 Council Member Lander for his similar tireless  
21 attention to social justice. I will speak today in  
22 support of Intros 1500 and 1520. Together these  
23 bills help New York City continue and strengthen its  
24 practice of identifying disparities and holding  
25

1  
2 itself accountable for responding to the needs of  
3 residents.

4           As this Committee knows, the de Blasio  
5 Administration has embraced equity as an explicit  
6 guiding principle -- a lens through which we view all  
7 of our planning, policymaking and governing. In  
8 defining social equity in the context of the public  
9 sector, the National Academy of the Public  
10 Administration points to a number of dimensions: "The  
11 fair, just and equitable management of all  
12 institutions serving the public directly or by  
13 contract; the fair, just and equitable distribution  
14 of public services and implementation of public  
15 policy; and the commitment to promote fairness,  
16 justice, and equity in the formation of public  
17 policy." We adopt this approach, and consider  
18 "equitable distribution" to include access to  
19 opportunities, services, and resources across New  
20 York City's diverse populations and neighborhoods.  
21 Our commitment to reducing inequality and poverty and  
22 to ensuring that services, support and opportunity  
23 are available to all New Yorkers on inclusive basis,  
24 is broadly and deeply reflected in our policy and  
25 programmatic priorities.

1  
2 Before I elaborate on our support for  
3 this legislation I would first like to tell you a  
4 little bit about our work at the Center for Economic  
5 Opportunity and Operations and how it relates to the  
6 central work of the administration and the goals of  
7 these bills.

8 The Center helps the City use evidence  
9 and innovation to reduce poverty and increase equity.  
10 We promote the use of research, data and design in  
11 all aspects of this work, from program design to  
12 budget decisions. We also analyze existing anti-  
13 poverty approaches and develop new ones; facilitate  
14 sharing of data across agencies; and support the  
15 rigorous assessment of key initiatives, including,  
16 for example, Pre-K for All, IDNYC and Community  
17 Schools. Each year we issue an annual Poverty  
18 Report, which provides a more accurate picture of  
19 poverty in the City than the official federal rate.

20 The Center is well situated in the Office  
21 of Operations, which works to make government more  
22 effective, efficient and coordinated, and to increase  
23 equity by ensuring services are accessible to all.  
24 Operations monitors the performance of all City  
25

1 agencies, holding each agency accountable for  
2 delivering high-quality services fairly.

3  
4 The Center and Operations work in tandem  
5 to support the administration-wide commitment to  
6 equity and to ensure that data, evidence and  
7 accountability are brought to bear in our collective  
8 work.

9 Let me turn now to Intro 1500; it would  
10 require DOHMH, ACS, HRA, and potentially any other  
11 agency designated by the Mayor to complete gender and  
12 racial assessments of their services and programs,  
13 employment and contracting practices, and budgeting,  
14 and to set goals to address the findings of the  
15 assessments.

16 We endorse the concept of systematically  
17 identifying disparities and establishing plans to  
18 address them. Creating specific metrics, taking  
19 action, and measuring progress is critical to  
20 achieving equitable outcomes. We believe Intro 1500  
21 would provide an additional support mechanism for  
22 this work.

23 As the bill recognizes, a critical  
24 foundation for progress is to collect, track and  
25 analyze disaggregated data.

1  
2 We recognized this in OneNYC: The Plan  
3 for a Strong and Just City, the planning and policy  
4 roadmap that the Administration released in 2015.  
5 OneNYC included equity as one of its four "lenses,"  
6 and we stress that it must be inseparable from  
7 concepts of growth, sustainability and resiliency.  
8 OneNYC expressly noted the importance of collecting  
9 data disaggregated by traditionally disadvantaged  
10 groups in order to support policy decision-making.

11 To this end, the Center for Economic  
12 Opportunity and Operations revived the City's Social  
13 Indicators Reports and presented data from 45  
14 indicators across multiple domains. Our purpose in  
15 the report is to guide the City's effort to reduce  
16 disparities and advance equity by disaggregating data  
17 by race, gender and community district to reveal,  
18 where possible, how topline trends differ from those  
19 of individual groups, making it easier to identify  
20 populations in need of specific attention. We  
21 published this standalone Social Indicators Report in  
22 2016, and will be issuing an update later this year.

23 We have also begun to incorporate equity  
24 analysis into performance management practices where  
25 it was not explicitly considered previously. Since

1  
2 2014, the Mayor's Management Report, the annual  
3 review of the City agencies' effectiveness and  
4 efficiency, has required agencies to submit equity  
5 statements, articulating how their work advances  
6 equitable outcomes.

7           We have also incorporated an equity lens  
8 into agency rulemaking. Operations, in close  
9 collaboration with agency partners, oversaw a  
10 retrospective review of more than 5,000 existing  
11 rules, to identify those that could warrant  
12 modification for a variety of reasons, including  
13 reduced regulatory burdens and social equity  
14 considerations, to the extent permitted by law. As a  
15 result of this collaborative process with agencies  
16 and the Law Department, select rules are being  
17 proposed for modification, repeal, or subject to  
18 further review.

19           Additionally, we have been facilitating  
20 the collection of demographic information --  
21 including race, ethnicity, gender, and sexual  
22 orientation -- from residents seeking social  
23 services. My colleagues in Operations are working  
24 closely with Council Members Dromm and Chin to ensure  
25 that the proper information is collected.

1                   The Center and Operations also  
2  
3 collaborate with cross-agency bodies working to  
4 promote equity, including the Commission on Gender  
5 Equity, the Young Men's Initiative and the New York  
6 City Commission on Human Rights. These entities  
7 convene City staff and other stakeholders and provide  
8 guidance to agencies and to the Administration as a  
9 whole to improve our internal practices and achieve  
10 more equitable outcomes for residents.

11                   The assessments and plans called for by  
12 Intro 1500 would complement this work by helping  
13 ensure that agencies' equity efforts are codified and  
14 institutionalized. Having agencies consider the  
15 disparities in social conditions that their work  
16 could plausibly address, reflect on the potential  
17 actions within their control that might make a  
18 difference, and set specific measurable goals adds an  
19 important new element to the City's existing  
20 processes [sic].

21                   We do think some changes to the bill  
22 would improve our ability to carry out its intent.  
23 First, we certainly associate ourselves with the  
24 written testimony submitted by the First Lady.  
25 Second, we think the bill should provide the Mayor

1 flexibility to include considerations beyond gender  
2 and race -- for example, to require agencies to  
3 examine economic or neighborhood-based disparities.  
4 The bill currently gives this kind of flexibility to  
5 the Mayor to include agencies beyond those named.  
6 And indeed, we have a strong interest in looking  
7 beyond these agencies only, as well as to the issues  
8 of equity beyond gender and race. And finally, we  
9 recommend that the reporting timelines follow a two-  
10 year cycle, which we believe will lead to more  
11 ambitious goals and give agencies adequate time to  
12 see the results from their actions.

14 Let me turn now to Intro 1520, which  
15 would require the inclusion of information on gender  
16 and racial equality in the Social Indicators Report,  
17 and change the Charter to call for a Report on social  
18 indicators and gender and racial inequality. This bill  
19 is also consistent with, and would lend additional  
20 support to, the work we have been doing, and we  
21 strongly endorse a charter mandate to disaggregate  
22 data by race and gender.

23 As with Intro 1500, however, our view is  
24 that the bill should more directly encourage  
25 disaggregation of more than gender and racial data.

1  
2 We suggest that the revision of the Charter language  
3 call for a Report on Social Indicators and Equity, and  
4 rather than specifying only gender and race,  
5 explicitly offer flexibility for the Mayor to consider  
6 at least gender and race inequalities, but also  
7 potentially others when reporting these broad indices.

8 Our Administration's goal is to create a  
9 more inclusive and equitable city, and we appreciate  
10 the opportunity to partner with this City Council  
11 toward this aim, including on these bills.

12 Thank you for the opportunity to testify  
13 about our equity work, and about the legislation under  
14 consideration, and I look forward to answering any  
15 questions that you may have. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you so very  
17 much for your testimony, and although you stated --  
18 and I always prefer to just have it restated, from  
19 both of you -- is the Administration in support of  
20 Intro 1500?

21 MATTHEW KLEIN: Yeah.

22 ALETHA MAYBANK: Yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Perfect; always wanna  
24 start off with that; want to make sure we're on the  
25 same page.

1  
2 One of the things that I thought was very  
3 interesting, because we're beginning this work, but a  
4 lot of it has been done, particularly in your agency  
5 as well; do you believe that current disparities exist  
6 among racial groups or by gender with regard to the  
7 City services and programs, the City's employment  
8 practices, and the City's contracting practices, and  
9 budgeting? In other words, do you feel from your own  
10 experiences, and working with different agencies, that  
11 what so many women, people of color, and immigrants  
12 are experiencing and they're vocalizing in terms of  
13 the disparities, in terms of promotion, wage gaps; do  
14 you believe that this is a systemic issue that has  
15 been impacting our workforce?

16 MATTHEW KLEIN: The workforce of the City  
17 as a whole?

18 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Correct.

19 MATTHEW KLEIN: Yes. I think clearly it  
20 has, I think -- as Chairwoman, you pointed out -- the  
21 importance of data, of capturing data; looking at  
22 data, and the data about some of the issues that  
23 you've spoken to clearly show disparities across race  
24 and gender, and so the importance of both identifying  
25 those disparities, being clear about them,

1  
2 acknowledging that they exist, and then, as these  
3 legislations ask us to do, being clear about how we're  
4 gonna respond to them I think is critically important.

5 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: So we started off  
6 with only a few agencies that we're going to be  
7 looking at; what do you think in terms of a timeline  
8 it would take for all City employees to have to  
9 release this type of informative data that gives us  
10 the information and the tools that we need to make  
11 sure that all City workers, all of our agencies, are  
12 in compliance with this type of transparency?

13 MATTHEW KLEIN: Well as I mentioned in my  
14 testimony, we do wanna look seriously beyond the three  
15 named agencies. I don't have a specific timeline of  
16 what it would take to include all, but I am eager to,  
17 and I know the Administration is eager to work with  
18 the Council on thinking about a timeline that expands  
19 not only to these three but beyond also.

20 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: What would you say  
21 ballpark?

22 MATTHEW KLEIN: I would aim to include  
23 within the broad timeframes that you've laid out for  
24 these three agencies, but I'm hesitant to commit to  
25 that for all of the agencies at this point, but I

1  
2 think the timeline you've laid out for these agencies,  
3 for these three named agencies, would be appropriate  
4 for additional named ones as well.

5 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Can you talk about --  
6 just for everyone that's here; myself -- can you talk  
7 a bit about how capturing this type of data is going  
8 to be done? How is it going to be implemented? Will  
9 there be an independent agency that's going to review;  
10 is there going to be an RFP of sorts; will there be an  
11 outside auditor that's going to specifically have the  
12 job and the task of looking at this information,  
13 collecting it, and how it will be presented? So more  
14 of the nuts and bolts of it and the... because in  
15 theory, in concept; in legislation, this is powerful,  
16 but in the real sense of it, we wanna understand how  
17 is it actually really going to be implemented and what  
18 will that look like?

19 MATTHEW KLEIN: So I can talk a little  
20 bit about the broad outlines of how we see this  
21 working, and I think initially, certainly for the  
22 first round, Operations would play a role in  
23 promulgating guidance, in collaboration with some of  
24 the other cross-agency bodies that I've talked about  
25 that have been focusing on equity, particularly racial

1  
2 and gender equity -- this guidance would go to the  
3 agencies included. I think we would direct them first  
4 to look at the data that they hold internally, look  
5 also to the data that we collect as part of the Social  
6 Indicators Report, and also think specifically about  
7 the items in the Mayor's Management Report which  
8 currently may not be disaggregated but which the  
9 agencies may internally hold disaggregated data  
10 related to the MMR. What I think 1500 allows us to do  
11 is draw that connection between the agencies' own  
12 work, the social conditions that are broadly examined  
13 in the Social Indicator Report, and also the areas of  
14 direct accountability that they hold that are  
15 reflected in the MMR. So initially we would look for  
16 the agencies to identify those areas where their data,  
17 the Social Indicator Report data, show either large  
18 disparities or to look even more carefully at areas  
19 that are core to their missions to look for any  
20 disparities within them; report that, both through  
21 their commissioners, obviously, and the Deputy Mayors'  
22 staff; Operations would be available to provide  
23 guidance throughout that process, and then both Deputy  
24 Mayors and Operations would review for a depth of  
25 seriousness to both that review and that plan. I

1 think you also just raised a question of -- well what  
2 if we don't have the data; what if... [interpose]

3  
4 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: 'Cause I was just  
5 going to ask you that. Has there been data previously  
6 collected that... collected information based off of  
7 race; based off of gender; has that type of  
8 information been collected previously but that it just  
9 was not transparent?

10 MATTHEW KLEIN: Well certainly there's  
11 data that's been collected by race and gender, and I  
12 think this process would lead to more of that becoming  
13 transparent. I think some of it is quite transparent;  
14 we, as I testified, made deliberate effort to make  
15 race and gender disparities, among others, transparent  
16 in the Social Indicators Report; that really was the  
17 underlying motivation for that report to say let's  
18 look at broad indices where previously we've only  
19 reported at a topline, but then underneath disparities  
20 by race and gender may be more present, and my  
21 colleague from the Department of Health can speak to  
22 this, but I know that, particularly the case in issues  
23 of say infant mortality, where the topline is looking  
24 good, in terms of trends, but when you look underneath  
25 at racial disparities, the trends are not as good.

1  
2 But I do think we encountered, and this process would  
3 lead to further identifying areas where we just don't  
4 have the data that we wish we had, and I think it'll  
5 take a first round to really reveal where those high  
6 priorities are, but I would imagine we're certainly  
7 gonna come up against that as a challenge.

8 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Have you seen cities...  
9 oh did... you wanna add in on that -- definitely.

10 ALETHA MAYBANK: Just build off of what  
11 Matt was saying; that we at the Health Department have  
12 been collecting and looking at data based on race  
13 ethnicity, as well as gender, for many years now and  
14 our latest strong example is just looking at our  
15 community [sic] health profiles and really  
16 disaggregating data by neighborhood; looking at  
17 gender; looking at social indicators, you know all at  
18 the same time, so we have models to build upon in New  
19 York City, at least from the Health Department's  
20 perspective **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

21 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: And just to add on  
22 that, 'cause I was going to follow in with that -- are  
23 there cities, states; countries that we're looking at  
24 as models in terms of that level of data collection,  
25 transparency; how it's presented to the public;

1  
2 accessibility to that information? Are there areas  
3 and places that we could model so that we could then  
4 become the ultimate model in that way?

5 MATTHEW KLEIN: Yeah, we always wanna  
6 lead, New York City... [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: That's right.

8 MATTHEW KLEIN: always wants to lead.  
9 But we are impressed by some other municipalities; I  
10 will admit Seattle, King County; Portland, especially,  
11 have race and social justice initiatives where  
12 collecting data and reporting on it has been  
13 impressive.

14 ALETHA MAYBANK: In addition to the  
15 training aspects of the work as well are also pretty  
16 impressive and they have models -- and actually,  
17 that's the model that we're using -- Center for Social  
18 Inclusion, who worked with Seattle, who put  
19 legislation forward in 2008, that required all city  
20 agencies within Seattle to do racial action plans and  
21 training for their staff; we have been using that  
22 model as a way and implementing it here in New York  
23 City.

24 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Once we collect all  
25 of this, get the data in place; it's transparent; how

1  
2 do we right the wrongs that have been systematically  
3 implemented for generations? We've got the  
4 information, we've got the data; has there been  
5 thought in terms of how do we then correct this  
6 dynamic that has systematically become our norm and  
7 people have just been working in jobs with that level  
8 of inequality all of their lives; how do we then  
9 address that?

10           ALETHA MAYBANK: Well this is where  
11 training is extremely important, and one; it has to be  
12 an intentional effort, as what these bills will allow  
13 us to do in New York City, to say that we have to do  
14 this, and we have to name these issues and the key  
15 part in the key start racism, gender inequity, sexual  
16 orientation inequities all impact the work that we  
17 have, and the history that we have within this  
18 country, impacted decisions and the choices that we  
19 make. And then, second to that, the training that  
20 staff get will help them better understand their own  
21 biases that they have, as you mentioned earlier, about  
22 implicit bias -- oftentimes it is invisible; people  
23 don't understand the systems in which we live in and  
24 how they impact the decisions that they make on a day  
25 to day basis in our jobs as government employees. And

1  
2 so when we go through an intentional process of  
3 learning and seeing that better, we have the  
4 opportunity to make our choices better and different  
5 than we have in the past. And we in the Health  
6 Department have definitely seen, since we've gone  
7 through this work in the last one and a half year to  
8 two years, have seen changes with staff in their  
9 attitudes, but also in the work that they're doing and  
10 how they're doing their work, and answering and asking  
11 questions in a way that they wouldn't have before, as  
12 a result of the training pieces of it. So it's  
13 important that we collect the data and we share the  
14 data, but it's also important that we take it to the  
15 internal part of the agency and make sure that we're  
16 able to practice the equity that we preach.

17 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: The trainings that  
18 you did; was this internal or was this that you  
19 brought in an outside entity in order to do this level  
20 of training, and what have you seen have been the  
21 immediate outcomes of that level of staff training and  
22 the ability to understand workplace environment and  
23 racial and gender biases?

24 ALETHA MAYBANK: Sure. So we have really  
25 relied upon and worked with several consultants across

1  
2 the country -- Center for Social Inclusion being one  
3 of them -- to help us think about how we do three  
4 things within our agency, and one of them is to  
5 normalize conversations around race, power and  
6 privilege; how do we organize our teams within our  
7 Health Department in order to disseminate this  
8 information and learn more, and then how do we figure  
9 out what are the tools. And so we've consulted with  
10 several organizations -- Center for Social Inclusion,  
11 Perception Institute, Race Forward -- to help offer  
12 trainings on implicit bias, undoing racism; we've also  
13 worked with the People's Institute Beyond Survival  
14 [sic], to provide training for our senior level staff,  
15 so all deputy commissioners have received three days  
16 of training, actually, on Undoing Racism, as well as  
17 Facilitative Leadership and Racial Equity; all of our  
18 deputy commissioners and assistant commissioners --  
19 there's about 70 senior staff across the agency --  
20 have received training in Facilitative Leadership and  
21 Social Change, and then another 350 staff, which are  
22 like all senior level managers, have received Implicit  
23 Bias training by the Perception Institute.. [interpose]

24 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Hm.

25

1  
2 ALETHA MAYBANK: And then we have worked  
3 in creating a full-day training that explains what the  
4 Race to Justice initiative is; teaches about the  
5 different levels of racism; how it impacts their work,  
6 and so there's a full-day training now that we're  
7 getting ready to launch for the rest of the agency and  
8 for our other staff. And then the other piece of  
9 training that we've done, and we've co-created an  
10 online interactive model, it's about 15-20 minutes, on  
11 just Health Equity 101, so folks can have a basic  
12 understanding when you come into the agency; when we  
13 say equity, what do we mean... [interpose]

14 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Right.

15 ALETHA MAYBANK: and how do you do that,  
16 in a very short sense -- now there's still the full-  
17 day training that's needed as well.

18 As far as what we've seen in terms of  
19 change, there are two examples that I could provide:  
20 one is with our sexual and reproductive justice, our  
21 health unit; we initially were going to release a  
22 campaign and we had some great ideas and intention  
23 around the campaign as a health department, but we  
24 were really pushed by our advocates to really better  
25 understand the historical injustices that exist for

1  
2 women, and especially women of color when we go and  
3 promote contraception and how that can be perceived,  
4 and it was really through their guidance and then  
5 bringing on other consultants and doing co-training  
6 together with our advocates that we were able to  
7 evolve ourselves and expand this campaign, and so now  
8 we actually have a Sexual and Reproductive Community  
9 Engagement Workgroup made of 35 organizations that  
10 actually inform us and advise us on how to do our work  
11 better around sexual and reproductive justice, and  
12 that's a core tenet of equity that we are working with  
13 those who are very closely rooted and connected to the  
14 issues and that we create the space and we allow that  
15 to happen.

16 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: That's fantastic and  
17 it's a great model that we can utilize and those great  
18 partners that we can perhaps, throughout its entire  
19 implementation, utilize that experience and the  
20 experiences that come from that. I just want to just  
21 close when it comes to 1500; does the Administration  
22 have any additional concerns about Intro 1500 that  
23 have not been expressed? Because you don't wanna get  
24 into the implementation of this without knowing fully,  
25

1  
2 are there additional concerns that exist in relation  
3 to this.

4 MATTHEW KLEIN: None beyond what we've  
5 mentioned in testimony.. [background comment] oh,  
6 right, and I'm reminded just to flag the First Lady's  
7 testimony related to whether or not a new committee is  
8 required, given the existence of the Commission on  
9 Gender Equity, the Commission on Human Rights,  
10 Operations, and Why Am I [sic], all of which worked  
11 together on these issues already.

12 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Okay. Alright, thank  
13 you. Going on to Intro 1512, a local law to amend the  
14 Administrative Code of the City of New York in  
15 relation to training for City agencies to promote  
16 gender and racial equality. Many of these questions  
17 have been already asked; want to know; is the  
18 Administration in support of Intro 1512, for clarity  
19 sake?

20 MATTHEW KLEIN: On 1512, we're evaluating  
21 the impact of what it would be to implement for all  
22 agencies, so I know that we're in discussions and  
23 we'll be in discussions with the Council around that.

24

25

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: What would determine  
3 if you think that an agency should be part of this or  
4 not part of it?

5 MATTHEW KLEIN: Well one of the questions  
6 that we're here to discuss with the Council is the  
7 interplay between this bill and say 1500, where 1500,  
8 a first step is an assessment and we think an  
9 assessment done deliberately would provide more  
10 insight into what kind of training would be most  
11 appropriate within the agency. There are -- the  
12 Health Department is obviously a shining example of  
13 the kind of comprehensive work; there's other --  
14 probably, you know, on a range, a continuum of kind  
15 of work on this, and so we just think it probably  
16 makes sense to think about how this training could be  
17 tailored agency by agency, and wanna engage in  
18 discussions with you about that.

19 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: In the interest of  
20 time, I'm just going to turn it over to my colleague,  
21 Council Member Ben Kallos from Manhattan, who has  
22 joined us, and just wanted to open up the floor to  
23 him to ask a question.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you Chair  
25 Cumbo for your leadership on this and so very many

1  
2 issues and trailblazing on the issues of equality in  
3 this city... [interpose]

4 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: where women still  
6 do not make as much as men do.

7 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: That's right.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And so along  
9 those lines, what can the -- this is directed to Matt  
10 Klein -- what can the City do in terms of providing  
11 resour... so as you're doing these assessments and  
12 getting a better picture of items -- the Women's  
13 Center, the WCECA, has been a trailblazer on self-  
14 sufficiency and they created the Self-Sufficiency  
15 Calculator aimed at helping women in poverty to see  
16 what additional resources the city and state and  
17 federal government might have that might help them  
18 become self-sufficient and lift them out of poverty  
19 and what types of resources does the City have as an  
20 outgrowth of that and how can we make sure that every  
21 single person who needs assistance gets it  
22 automatically?

23 MATTHEW KLEIN: [laugh] Councilman  
24 Kallos, it's great to be in conversation with you  
25 about this topic; as you know, we talked often about

1  
2 our shared interest in making sure that information  
3 about benefits and services that are available is as  
4 broadly accessible as possible. You know we're  
5 making strides, particularly where it comes to the  
6 eligibility information related to the 40 some odd  
7 benefits in ACCESS NYC to make sure that information  
8 about those benefits is not only accessible through  
9 the City website, but that the underlying data is  
10 made open so it can be discoverable, utilized by the  
11 Self-Sufficiency Calculator or any other tool that  
12 folks are developing, like **[inaudible]** and others to  
13 help enhance and spread information about eligible  
14 benefits. I think we're gonna continue to work with  
15 you; with our agencies to make the process of not  
16 only getting eligibility, but then the process of  
17 applying for benefits much more seamless than it has  
18 been, and so continue to talk to you and get your  
19 ideas on that.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And what is the  
21 impact on the benefits that the City provides on  
22 providing gender and racial equity in this city...  
23 [crosstalk]

24 MATTHEW KLEIN: Well we think...  
25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: especially with  
3 regards to income?

4 MATTHEW KLEIN: Right. We think it would  
5 be a powerful benefit. We know, just for example,  
6 from the Center for Economic Opportunity's Annual  
7 Poverty Report that SNAP access by itself in current  
8 form reduces probably the overall poverty rate by  
9 about 3.5% in the City, and we know that there's  
10 still a gap that we're actively working to close. So  
11 as we look benefit by benefit, we know it has a  
12 tangible impact on folks when they're able to claim  
13 benefits that are already intended for them.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And do you  
15 believe that the work that you're doing in other  
16 parts of government would be reflected in  
17 Introduction No. 1500 report so that we can see how  
18 the \$84 billion that we're spending as a city with  
19 the stated goal of reducing inequality actually  
20 impacts?

21 MATTHEW KLEIN: We do. I was saying  
22 earlier; we think 1500 really draws a nice bridge  
23 between the agency-specific accountability of the MMR  
24 and the social conditions expressed in the Social  
25 Indicator Report and asks agencies to reflect

1 specifically on their own work and how it might  
2 related to broader social conditions, even if they as  
3 an individual agency aren't specifically accountable  
4 for that social condition. Dr. Maybank spoke to the  
5 importance of intentionality, and 1500 asks agencies  
6 to be intentional about that analysis and then we're  
7 also, in implementing 1500, intending to ask agencies  
8 to articulate specific indicators that they'll track  
9 over time that reflect on the connections between  
10 their work and broader racial, gender equity.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: You had me at  
13 MMR. Thank you.

14 MATTHEW KLEIN: Thank you.

15 [laughter]

16 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you. Thank you  
17 Member Kallos.

18 Wanting to get back to 1512; does the  
19 Administration anticipate costs associated with  
20 requiring that the relevant City agencies conduct  
21 these trainings? So do you anticipate costs; have  
22 those costs been identified in the budget; are you  
23 seeking those funds; is this funding that you would  
24 be looking for in this budget cycle or the following  
25 budget cycle?

1  
2 MATTHEW KLEIN: I think my colleague from  
3 Department of Health can speak to the costs  
4 associated with the Race to Justice initiative, and  
5 I'd defer -- I don't have numbers in front of me on  
6 what we would anticipate the costs to be if the bill  
7 were implemented as is.

8 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Because it would be  
9 very important to have those resources there if we're  
10 going to begin this work in the next fiscal year.

11 MATTHEW KLEIN: Right.

12 ALETHA MAYBANK: Right. And for us as  
13 the Health Department, I mean in FY17 we allocated,  
14 you know designated about \$600,000 to carry forward  
15 all this work with Race to Justice and we anticipate  
16 the same for FY18, but this covers and allows us to  
17 actually have a full team, so four full-time people  
18 with a director, a coordinator and an evaluator and a  
19 lead trainer, as well as to help support the  
20 consulting that we've needed to help do some of the  
21 training that we're doing as well.

22 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thanks. Okay. Going  
23 on to Intro 1520, a local law to amend the New York  
24 City Charter in relation to measuring and addressing

1  
2 gender and racial inequality in New York City. Is  
3 the Administration in support of Intro 1520?

4 MATTHEW KLEIN: Yes.

5 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: 'Kay. How much  
6 expertise do you believe would be needed to implement  
7 this bill?

8 MATTHEW KLEIN: We welcome expertise from  
9 advocates, from researchers, from academics and  
10 others; I do think -- again, I'd -- we take some  
11 pride in the Social Indicators Report 'cause it did  
12 aim to carry out the intent of 1520 in many ways by  
13 disaggregating data by race and gender; we were able  
14 to do that with internal resources; we carry a fair  
15 amount through the city of internal expertise -- and  
16 Dr. Maybank's a prime example -- and so... [background  
17 comment] yeah, so it's something that we're doing and  
18 feel like we have good expertise in-house.

19 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: And then going on  
20 into -- does the Administration have any additional  
21 concerns about Intro 1520 that have not been  
22 expressed?

23 MATTHEW KLEIN: I expressed it in our  
24 testimony; we are -- and Council Member Lander knows  
25 this well -- we are very much in favor of being

1  
2 explicit about racial and gender disparities; I think  
3 we want the opportunity to be explicit about  
4 additional disparities and inequalities as well, and  
5 so to that extent, I think we'd recommend thinking  
6 about the wording, such that the Social Indicators  
7 Report isn't assumed to be limited to looking only at  
8 race and gender inequalities.

9 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Can you tell me, once  
10 this work has been done -- and you may have expressed  
11 it, but just so that I have more clarity on it --  
12 where will it live; where will it exist and how can  
13 the City of New York in its entirety be able to  
14 access it, but most importantly, employees of the  
15 City of New York?

16 MATTHEW KLEIN: Our thinking right now is  
17 that it would live within the Mayor's Office of  
18 Operations; that's because this is the office charged  
19 with accountability, and has seriously taken the  
20 mission of ensuring that equity is baked into all of  
21 core government operations so that an equity lens is  
22 applied to all of our thinking about accountability  
23 in governance, but certainly Operations would intend  
24 to be working very closely in collaboration on these  
25 bills with the Commission on Gender Equity and others

1  
2 that have cross-city function and working also  
3 closely with individual agencies that are leading  
4 exemplars, like the Department of Health.

5 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: 'Kay. Alright, well  
6 thank you, thank you so very much for your testimony  
7 today. Thank you for answer our questions; we  
8 certainly look forward to the implementation; I'm  
9 glad that we are on the same page in support of  
10 Intros 1500, 1512 and 1520, and would you like to add  
11 an additional comment? Please.

12 ALETHA MAYBANK: Thank you; I would.  
13 Thank you. So for 1512, the one area of concern that  
14 we do have, while we're totally onboard with training  
15 and understand it needs to happen and we believe in  
16 that, is the timeline of one year. The reality is  
17 for us; it's gonna take us three years to ensure that  
18 we train all 6,000 employees at the Health  
19 Department, so we would value being able to have more  
20 conversation around the timeline.

21 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: I'm glad that you  
22 brought that point up and so we will continue to have  
23 additional conversations, so... because at the end of  
24 the day we wanna get this right; we recognize that  
25 issues around racial, gender equality aren't solve

1  
2 overnight and that they are issues that we must  
3 address expediently, but we also have to do it in a  
4 way that allows for the right type of timetable to  
5 make sure that it's done effectively. And I wanna  
6 thank you all for your testimony; we look forward to  
7 further communication in order to make sure that this  
8 package of bills are reflective of the needs of the  
9 workers of the City of New York and hopefully that  
10 this can expand further beyond New York City and New  
11 York State, but all across the nation; this is going  
12 to be a huge opportunity for individuals of color,  
13 for women, for our LGBTQ community; this is going to  
14 be an incredible opportunity for our immigrant  
15 populations who have just not been able to claim  
16 their fair share of the American dollar here, as well  
17 as the challenges with promotion and moving up the  
18 ladder in that sense. So thank you all so very much  
19 for your testimony and we're going to call for the  
20 first panel or will be moving..

21 [background comments] [coughing]

22 [protestors]

23 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you.

24 [background comment] Yeah, but...

25 [pause]

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: We're going to  
3 actually switch over into the other chamber so that  
4 we have more room for testimony and for more  
5 individuals to be able to testify.

6 [background comments]

7 [pause]

8 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Alright, thank you  
9 all for moving; I just had to step outside and handle  
10 some things, so I appreciate your patience and I  
11 appreciate you remaining here for the remainder of  
12 this very important hearing and I apologize for the  
13 interruption; it has been addressed.

14 So if you could just state your name  
15 again. We are, unfortunately, gonna have to manage  
16 to a three-minute clock, so for each of your  
17 testimonies you'll hear a buzz; you have time to  
18 complete your thought and then I'll open it up for  
19 questions. So if you could just state your name  
20 before you present and we'll begin from my right to  
21 our left. Yes; if you'd turn your microphone on.

22 BEVERLY NEUFELD: Good morning..

23 [crosstalk]

24 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Good morning.  
25

1  
2 BEVERLY NEUFELD: I'm Beverly Neufeld and  
3 I am the President of PowHer New York (PowHerNY). We  
4 are 100 organizations across New York State working  
5 collectively on economic equality. I am also very  
6 proud to say that I am a member of the Commission on  
7 Gender Equity of New York City... [crosstalk]

8 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Wonderful.

9 BEVERLY NEUFELD: Thank you. Thank you  
10 for the opportunity to testify. PowHer's been one of  
11 the leaders in an ongoing decade-long campaign for  
12 stronger policies to close the wage gap, particularly  
13 here in New York, and we know that legislation is a  
14 critical means to accomplish that, so we have worked  
15 to pass the New York State Equal Pay Act, the Gender  
16 Equality Act; Paid Family Leave. Here in New York  
17 City we were very active; of course most recently, in  
18 the ban on salary history.

19 We are working for policy reform to  
20 promote wage transparency, pregnancy accommodation,  
21 sexual harassment, ending that; expanding family  
22 benefits because they help workers, and particularly  
23 women, succeed. New York has really been an  
24 effective model of progressive leadership in the  
25 country, but we all know more can be done and the

1  
2 bills that we're talking about today will do just  
3 that.

4           So I'm excited to say that PowHer New  
5 York network supports all three of the bills -- 1500,  
6 1512, 1520, and the Resolution 542, because they all  
7 will address gender and racial equity.

8           You know we've passed many laws in this  
9 country, started in the 1960s on gender equity, but  
10 New York still has a disparity that is quite  
11 shameful; although we have one of the smallest wage  
12 gaps in the country, for women of color we still have  
13 one of the largest wage gaps, and so I think we feel  
14 very strongly that this kind of legislation is really  
15 directed at some of the women who have not been part  
16 of the benefits of New York doing much, much better.

17           So I think the numbers we've all talked  
18 about, but just to put it into terms I think that  
19 people can understand, that women of New York,  
20 according to the Public Advocate, are losing about  
21 \$5.8 billion annually and if you just dial it down to  
22 an individual woman who happens to be a Latina woman,  
23 over the course of her 40-year career she's going to  
24 lose about a million dollars and so we all know that

1  
2 that has serious impact on what happens to her and to  
3 her family.

4 So interventions are especially important  
5 and I think what's really paramount about the  
6 following bills are that the employer, which in this  
7 case is a municipal government, is really making a  
8 statement about setting goals and fighting for gender  
9 equality... [bell] May I just have another moment...?

10 [crosstalk]

11 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Yes, please.

12 BEVERLY NEUFELD: Yeah. So on a macro  
13 level we are in favor of the Resolution 542 because  
14 it really is important to the United States to take a  
15 stand for CEDAW. I also want to say that we  
16 recommend that New York City move forward with Cities  
17 for CEDAW so New York City would be a member of that  
18 community that is pushing equity.

19 As an employer, we are particularly  
20 interested in 1500 because of the assessments that it  
21 would create; it measures, benchmarks and evaluates  
22 critical steps for New York as an employer, but New  
23 York is also a model for all the other employers in  
24 the city, so it's critically important that we do it  
25 right in order to call for other employers to do it

1  
2 right, and we are calling for other employers to do  
3 it right on the state level with our contracting  
4 process.

5 The 1512, very quickly, deals with  
6 unconscious... [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: I'm gonna have to  
8 have you wrap up. Uhm-hm.

9 BEVERLY NEUFELD: unconscious bias; we all  
10 know how important that is. And so we're excited to  
11 work for and to support all three bills and the  
12 **[inaudible]** resolution... [crosstalk]

13 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: And the resolution.

14 BEVERLY NEUFELD: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Awesome. And thank  
16 you so much for your great work that you do; it's  
17 felt all throughout City Hall and we certainly  
18 appreciate your service and pushing the envelope and  
19 breaking those glass ceilings. So thank you so much...  
20 [crosstalk]

21 BEVERLY NEUFELD: Thank you. Wonderful to  
22 work with you on it [sic].

23 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you. Our next  
24 speaker; if you could just reintroduce yourself.

1  
2 MEGAN JEAN LOUIS: Good morning, my name  
3 is Megan Jean Louis and I am a freshman at the  
4 Macaulay Honors College... [crosstalk]

5 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Wonderful.

6 MEGAN JEAN LOUIS: today I represent the  
7 Young Women's Advisory Council at Girls for Gender  
8 Equity; we are a part of the Young Women's Initiative  
9 that was launched by Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito  
10 and the New York City Council to identify the gaps in  
11 services for young women ages 12-24, with a focus on  
12 cis and trans women of color. YWI brings together  
13 leaders and organizers who work with teens and young  
14 adults and advocates for them in all aspects of our  
15 society, with the goal of crafting policy  
16 recommendations that address racial, gender and other  
17 disparities. This is being done with young women at  
18 the center of the conversation as active and  
19 consistent participants in discussions.

20 As an anti-violence and education, Girls  
21 for Gender Equity is committed to address issues  
22 experience by women and girls of color, knowing that  
23 when inequity is disaggregated by race and gender,  
24 disparities and outcomes in New York City are  
25 overwhelmingly concentrated in communities of color.

1  
2 Through our programming and advocacy, we are  
3 committed to the physical, psychological, social, and  
4 economic development of girls and women, and we  
5 support the need for the gender and racial equity  
6 assessments, as well as all three proposed bills.

7           The relevant City agencies that are being  
8 required to complete the racial and gender  
9 assessments play a large role in the lives of  
10 everyday New Yorkers. If we cannot say with  
11 certainty that these agencies have policies that do  
12 not cause disparate outcomes on the basis of gender  
13 and race, we have to rectify these issues. This  
14 includes adopting an all-inclusive definition of  
15 gender that accurately represents the spectrums of  
16 gender identities, particularly trans and gender  
17 nonconforming people.

18           It also includes adopting a fixed  
19 structure created by the City to oversee the  
20 implementation. Similar initiatives have been  
21 successful in other cities, such as Seattle,  
22 Washington and is the best way for the City and  
23 community to have a level of accountability when it  
24 comes to implementation.

1  
2 Another way to bridge the gap between  
3 City agency workers and the general public is to  
4 require City agencies to undergo trainings to make  
5 certain that everyone is treated fairly. New York  
6 City is the largest city in the United States and the  
7 most linguistically diverse city in the world. Due  
8 to the prevalence of stereotypes and biases, many are  
9 susceptible to perpetuating unconscious biases in the  
10 workplace.

11 In college, my intended majors are  
12 Bioethics and Cross-Cultural Psychology. It gives me  
13 an even more vested interest in making sure that  
14 relevant City agencies are receiving information on  
15 gender and racial equality in the proposed annual  
16 report on social indicators to be released by the  
17 Mayor. Social indicators, as we know, are numerical  
18 measures that describe the well-being of individuals  
19 and communities. If we are not taking this  
20 information and looking at it in racial and gender  
21 lenses, we are doing a disservice to New Yorkers.

22 I support all three proposed legislations  
23 -- 1500, [bell] 1512 and 1520 that strive to measure  
24 and assess gender and racial inequality across New  
25 York City and within City agencies. As reflected in

1  
2 the Young Women's Initiative Report that we co-  
3 created with City Council in May 2016, we must  
4 continue to implement key recommendations to monitor  
5 and actualize gender equity with an intersectional  
6 lens.

7 Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you so much and  
9 so proud to hear of all the work that you're doing in  
10 school and your major, and I'm happy to welcome you  
11 here to City Hall to testify. Thank you.

12 MEGAN JEAN LOUIS: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Our next speaker; if  
14 you could reintroduce yourself.

15 NICOLE TRIPLETT: Yes. Hi, I'm Nicole  
16 Triplett; I'm Policy Counsel with the New York Civil  
17 Liberties Union.

18 For nearly 100 years, the ACLU has worked  
19 in courts, legislatures and communities to defend and  
20 preserve the individual rights and liberties  
21 guaranteed in the United States Constitution. With  
22 over 210,000 members and supports, the NYCLU  
23 advocates on a broad range of civil rights and civil  
24 liberties issues, so we are very happy to have the  
25

1  
2 opportunity today to participate in this discussion  
3 on gender and racial equity.

4           The reality is; discrimination and  
5 inequality are defining characteristics of the lives  
6 of many women today. I'm not gonna get into the  
7 reported disparities, but when you look at the  
8 reported disparities, it no doubt illustrates how  
9 complex the causes of gender and race inequities are.  
10 We suspect that it is because of this problem that  
11 wide discrimination is so pernicious and resistant to  
12 remedy that the Committee today is exploring new and  
13 innovative ways to address its underlying causes.

14           The objective seems common to the bills  
15 and resolution that are the subject of today's  
16 hearing. These bills -- 1500, 1512, 1520 -- the  
17 NYCLU believes are well intentioned, with goals that  
18 are very important, but with initiatives that seem  
19 too narrow in scope and are likely to have limited  
20 effect.

21           We find it is unlikely that the data  
22 generated by these bills will provide a deeper  
23 understanding of the factors that cause inequities  
24 based on race and gender.

1  
2           However, we are glad that the Committee  
3 is also considering Resolution 542 that calls on the  
4 United States to ratify CEDAW. This resolution  
5 endorses human rights principles and a framework for  
6 their implementation.

7           The NYCLU supports this resolution, and  
8 just like my friends from the Columbia Law School  
9 Human Rights Institute and the YWCA of Brooklyn will  
10 testify today, the NYCLU calls on the members of this  
11 Committee to endorse the human rights framework as a  
12 model of the law and policy for addressing systemic  
13 discrimination.

14           What is the human rights framework?

15           The human rights framework incorporates a  
16 working model for institutionalizing fairness and  
17 equity in the operations of government in all levels,  
18 from its employment to delivery of services.

19           This idea was proposed more than a decade  
20 go, when City Council Member Bill Perkins sponsored  
21 the Human Rights Government Operations Audit Law (HR  
22 GOAL). HR GOAL incorporates the key elements of a  
23 human rights-based approach to promoting equality and  
24 fairness.

1  
2 In closing, it is clear that traditional  
3 approaches to addressing systemic discrimination are  
4 inadequate. As members of this Committee deliberate  
5 upon law and policy that will promote fairness,  
6 equality and dignity, the NYCLU recommends that you  
7 consider HR GOAL as a legislative model for advancing  
8 this most important undertaking.

9 Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you. You got  
11 it in under the buzzer. [laughter, background  
12 comment] Go ahead.

13 JULIE NELSON: Good morning. My name is  
14 Julie Nelson; I am the Senior Vice President of the  
15 Center for Social Inclusion and the Director of the  
16 Government Alliance on Race and Equity. I am also  
17 the former Director of the Seattle Office for Civil  
18 Rights.

19 Seattle was the first jurisdiction in the  
20 country to adopt a racial equity initiative, about a  
21 dozen years ago, really aimed at looking at the  
22 institutional and structural drivers of inequity.  
23 When I left the City of Seattle, it was to launch the  
24 Government Alliance on Race and Equity, looking at  
25 the leverage and power of local government.

1  
2 Over the course of the past three years  
3 we have seen more and more forms of local government  
4 -- cities, counties, and to some degree, states --  
5 step up to address historical inequities. We have to  
6 be able to recognize that racial inequities; gender  
7 inequities are not natural, they are not random; they  
8 have been intentionally created over the vast  
9 majority of our country's history. If we want to get  
10 to different outcomes in our communities, it is  
11 necessary for us to change the underlying  
12 institutions and structures that are creating racial  
13 inequities and gender inequities.

14 What we know is that right now an  
15 institutional approach is absolutely necessary. We  
16 need to have an inclusive and effective democracy  
17 that really does create a public sector for the  
18 public good; we can't have good government without  
19 government working on racial equity..

20 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uhm-hm.

21 JULIE NELSON: The Government Alliance on  
22 Race Inequity does have an effective field of  
23 practice that has actually already been mentioned  
24 earlier, but want to highlight a couple of things  
25

1  
2 especially that are relevant to the legislation under  
3 consideration.

4 We use a three-pronged approach:  
5 normalize conversations about race; operationalizes  
6 new policies and practices; and organize both inside  
7 the institution and in partnership with communities.

8 First, to normalize conversations about  
9 race we have to have understanding of what the  
10 institutional and structural drivers are. So we have  
11 to also recognize that having an intersectional  
12 approach so we can have the specific strategy that is  
13 designed to address the specific challenge is  
14 absolutely necessary. Strategies to address  
15 institutionalized sexism, institutionalized  
16 heterosexism; institutionalized racism are not the  
17 same, so we have to have a sophisticated enough  
18 analysis that we can understand those differences.

19 Training is good at laying out those  
20 definitions and it has to be a means to an end. Just  
21 saying that we trained X number of employees doesn't  
22 necessarily mean the institution is changing.

23 Operationalizing equity does mean that we're using  
24 data to develop strategies, not just data points and  
25 time measurements, but really using data to develop

1  
2 and implement strategies and to determine whether  
3 we're making a difference. [bell]

4 Organizing -- last thing -- working  
5 inside the institution, the number of employees  
6 working for New York City government, they're your  
7 biggest allies. People who on a day; day out basis  
8 are working for the public sector need to have the  
9 skills and competencies to do their jobs differently.

10 So thank you for the opportunity to  
11 testify and would encourage your adoption of this  
12 legislation.

13 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you. Wanted to  
14 just follow up with your testimony. Is there  
15 somewhere -- now that this work has been implemented  
16 for decades now in Seattle, is there an opportunity  
17 to see how that work has implemented wage gaps and  
18 disparities by gender as well as by race?

19 JULIE NELSON: Yeah, it might... I know  
20 you're limited on time and so the answer is yes, and  
21 I can follow up with you with some specific resources  
22 for that.

23 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: That would be great,  
24 but I guess just so that I can pull away, is Seattle,  
25 in terms of those disparities that we document in

1 terms of how much money an African-American woman;  
2 how much money a Latina; how much money a white woman  
3 makes in comparison to their white male counterparts;  
4 is Seattle leading because of this work as far as  
5 closing those gaps?  
6

7 JULIE NELSON: We think about the  
8 measurement piece at two levels, and so on the  
9 performance level, yes; improvements have been made;  
10 thinking specifically about WMB contracting -- women,  
11 minority business contracting -- we have moved the  
12 needle in WMB contracting, and thinking about that as  
13 it's applied to conditions in the community,  
14 unfortunately we do recognize the depth and  
15 pervasiveness of inequities that have been  
16 institutionalized over multiple centuries; the pace  
17 at which we're able to accelerate change, we do  
18 believe we're at a tipping point where we're seeing  
19 the implementation of policies and practices that  
20 will accelerate change, but from a moving the needle  
21 perspective, it's important that we have the data so  
22 that we can actually assess whether we're having  
23 impact, 'cause the ability to do so is a challenge.

24 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uh Mrs. Triplett, you  
25 spoke in reference to your support of these bills,

1  
2 but you also feel they don't go far enough. What do  
3 you think could be some of the ways to strengthen  
4 this legislation or additional legislation that would  
5 push this further so that we would see the results  
6 that we're all looking for?

7 NICOLE TRIPLETT: Sure. We offer this  
8 testimony to urge the Committee to look at this from  
9 a human rights perspective and we truly believe that  
10 the legislation that was most recently reintroduced  
11 in 2010 -- HR GOAL, which I mentioned -- did just  
12 that; it had far more stakeholders, it included more  
13 interagency participation; it required public  
14 participation. So looking at it that way, with more  
15 participation not only within City agencies, but also  
16 people in the community who are impacted by these  
17 disparities and more advocates would, in our opinion,  
18 allow for a great effect than trying to figure out  
19 the institutional root causes of some of these  
20 disparities facing young women, women and girls in  
21 New York City.

22 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uhm-hm. Mrs. Beverly  
23 Neufeld, can you talk to us a little bit about --  
24 same kind of question in terms of -- you've been  
25 doing a lot of work, for over a decade now, in

1  
2 regards to pay equity and the work that we're doing  
3 in pay equity; do you feel that the legislation  
4 that's been put forward goes far enough or do you  
5 feel that there is more that we could do to  
6 strengthen this legislation or create additional  
7 legislation that would really move the pay equity gap  
8 that we've been trying to close; are there measures  
9 that we could take to do more?

10 BEVERLY NEUFELD: Well I think the purpose  
11 of one of the bills is actually to look at the  
12 numbers and to collect those numbers so that we can  
13 respond and find the right solutions. I think many  
14 of us could guess at what they are, but without  
15 government really having the numbers at hand and then  
16 looking at it from year to year, you know we're  
17 working in the dark. So I personally feel -- and I  
18 mean I think we feel that the bill, which is 1500,  
19 you know, does collect reasonable data but it's what  
20 we do with it. So it has to be equal part of what's  
21 next...

22 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Right.

23 BEVERLY NEUFELD: and part of that is;  
24 like some of the other states have done -- New  
25 Mexico, they asked for pay equity evaluations by

1 department, and in the end, they found disparities.  
2  
3 And so then is the work of what is causing disparity  
4 in that particular department. And as you point out,  
5 you know each situation there might be different  
6 solutions; in different departments, actually. Why  
7 are there not more women in the non-traditional  
8 fields..

9 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uhm-hm.

10 BEVERLY NEUFELD: even in city government..

11 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Right.

12 BEVERLY NEUFELD: we know that's a  
13 problem, so let's get the numbers, but really what's  
14 important is what's stopping those women from being  
15 hired and succeeding.. [interpose]

16 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Right.

17 BEVERLY NEUFELD: you know, so I think  
18 it's on the right track; it's how long this goes out  
19 for in terms of finding the solutions to the  
20 problems.

21 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you so very  
22 much. Thank you all for your testimony. I think  
23 that what's so valuable is to also discover and find  
24 those cities that have implemented this and to learn  
25 from the work that you're saying in New Mexico,

1  
2 Seattle; Dallas was mentioned earlier. We need to  
3 continue to look at models that are working, because  
4 there's no reason to reinvent some wheels oftentimes  
5 if there are models that are already working and we  
6 can implement our own ideas to expand those. So  
7 thank you so very much.

8 The next panel we'll call forward is  
9 Gloria Malone, Girls for Gender Equity; Alexis R.  
10 Posey, FPWA; Doreen Odom and Meghan Faux, Legal  
11 Services NYC; and Dr. Danielle Moss Lee. Thank you  
12 and... oh... Thank you, and we'll begin from your left to  
13 your right; if you could just reintroduce yourself,  
14 and again, we'll have the three-minute timer.

15 GLORIA MALONE: Wonderful. Good morning;  
16 my name is Gloria Malone; [bell] I am with Girls for  
17 Gender Equity and today I'm reading testimony on  
18 behalf of one of our young people on the Young  
19 Women's Advisory Council named Tanya Grubs [sic].  
20 Alright.

21 Good morning. Her name is Tanya Grubs  
22 [sic] and she's a member of the Young Women's  
23 Advisory Council at Girls for Gender Equity. She's  
24 18 years old and currently a senior at the Life  
25

1  
2 Sciences Secondary School and was unable to get the  
3 day off school to come here today.

4 As mentioned before by another member of  
5 the Young Women's Advisory Council, we are part of  
6 the Young Women's Initiative launched by Speaker  
7 Melissa Mark-Viverito and we're from Girls for Gender  
8 Equity, and all of our programming is with the goal  
9 of removing disparities and barriers and create  
10 opportunities for young women and girls of color to  
11 live self-determined lives.

12 Tanya supports proposed legislation 1500,  
13 1512 and 1520 to amend the Administration's code of  
14 the City of New York in relation to training for City  
15 agencies to promote and measure gender and racial  
16 equity.

17 As a young woman of color, she feels it  
18 is very important and essential that the City  
19 agencies are held accountable for gender and racial  
20 inequities. City agencies need trainings that will  
21 ensure equities among genders and races. To keep  
22 track of such, a report of social indicators of  
23 gender and racial equality is needed annually. This  
24 impacts cis and transgender girls of color and gender  
25 nonconforming youth, because proposed Intro bill 1500

1  
2 would require certain agencies to complete gender and  
3 racial assessments of their services and programs,  
4 employment practices, contracting practices, and  
5 budgeting, and to set goals to address the findings  
6 of these assessments.

7           Proposed Intro bill 1512 would require  
8 certain agencies to provide all of their employees  
9 with trainings on implicit bias, discrimination,  
10 cultural competency, and structural inequity,  
11 including with respect to gender, race and sexual  
12 orientation, and how these factors impact the work of  
13 such agencies.

14           Lastly, 1520 would require the Mayor to  
15 include information on gender and racial equality in  
16 the annual report on social indicators, which would  
17 be retitled as the "Report on Social Indicators and  
18 Gender and Racial Inequality." Agencies should be  
19 held accountable so they know that treating people  
20 unfairly because of their gender or race is not  
21 tolerated and this act of inequality does not live up  
22 to New York City's values. Furthermore, trainings  
23 for City agencies should adopt language that is  
24 inclusive and affirming for spectrums of gender  
25 identities and sexualities.

1  
2 The proposed legislations are in  
3 alignment with the key recommendations from the Young  
4 Women's Initiative Report released by the Speaker's  
5 office in May 2016, and co-created with stakeholders,  
6 including Girls for Gender Equity. It is vital that  
7 City agencies implement and continue to uphold  
8 monitoring and assessing gender and racial inequity,  
9 particularly among low-income cis and transwomen and  
10 girls of color and gender nonconforming youth of  
11 color in New York City.

12 The Young Women's Advisory Council  
13 members believe that the voices and experiences of  
14 young cis and trans girls of color and gender  
15 nonconforming youth of color continue to be heard,  
16 uplifted, protected and treated equally through  
17 participatory governance. [bell] I thank New York  
18 City council for working with the Young Women's  
19 Advisory Council on making this a possibility through  
20 the Young Women's Initiative and look forward to  
21 working together to ensure youth of color are safe  
22 and well by living up to New York City's values and  
23 we respectfully request the passing of all three  
24 legislative bills to advance gender and racial  
25 equity. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you so much.

And I applaud the work that you all do with Girls for Gender Equity; it's a remarkable program that has really set the stage for the hearing that we're having right now, and I've been to many of your programs and they're very inspiring and life-changing.

GLORIA MALONE: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you. And our next speaker.

[background comments]

DOREEN ODOM: Good morning. My name is Doreen Odom and I work with Legal Service NYC. For almost 50 years, LSNYC has fought poverty and sought racial, social and economic justice for low-income New Yorkers. Our work brings us into contact with tens of thousands of New Yorkers each year, most of whom are people of color and women. We thank Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito and the members of the City Council for the opportunity to provide testimony on Introduction 1500.

A majority of our clients at LSNYC are women and people of color and live below the poverty line, and our experience shows that most of them rely

1  
2 on services provided by some type of city or state  
3 agency in order to survive. Their ability to  
4 survive, care for their families and live safe and  
5 healthy lives very much depends on the quality of the  
6 services they receive from these agencies, and to  
7 what degree these services take account of the  
8 systemic oppressions that so often stymie their  
9 attempts to leave poverty.

10 Every day our staff -- from intake  
11 officers to paralegals to attorneys -- listen as our  
12 clients tell us about their contacts with the City or  
13 State agencies and the services they receive. Too  
14 often these stories paint a picture of a model of  
15 service delivery that fails to account for the rich  
16 tapestry of who our clients are and the diversity of  
17 their lived experiences.

18 While we understand and commend the  
19 Council and the leadership of the Speaker for this  
20 important step toward ensuring that certain City  
21 agencies are being proactive and reflective about  
22 unintended consequences of their policies and  
23 procedures and some marginalized populations, we have  
24 a few suggestions.

1  
2 We urge the Council to consider the  
3 breadth of a similar equity and social justice  
4 initiative launched by King County in Washington  
5 State -- as was mentioned before -- which gathers  
6 within its purview every county agency and requires  
7 equity impact analyses to be conducted for every  
8 proposed department or agency business plan, policy  
9 guidance and budget decision. So the first step in  
10 formulating the County's strategic plan for achieving  
11 greater equity and social justice for its residents  
12 involved deep engagement with its own employees and  
13 with the community organizations who serve the  
14 populations that experience the most inequitable  
15 outcomes. Based upon the unique view into the lives  
16 of our clients, we think that the community-based  
17 organizations that serve them have valuable  
18 perspectives.

19 Just a couple more; then I'm gonna talk  
20 about recommendations.

21 Framework. The current legislation  
22 leaves wide discretion to the agencies to decide and  
23 design the assessments. While we acknowledge that  
24 the equity assessments and action plans must be  
25 tailored to the specific mandate of the agencies, we

1  
2 are concerned that the lack of guidance may allow the  
3 agencies to engage in some superficial evaluations of  
4 policies and practices. We propose creating an  
5 equity assessment toolkit with some baseline  
6 requirements such as the use of qualitative and  
7 quantitative data.

8 The second one is timeframe. In... [bell]  
9 so... I'm sorry; may I continue with a couple of  
10 recommendations...? [crosstalk]

11 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Yes, please continue.

12 DOREEN ODOM: The requirement for yearly  
13 reporting on agency action plans will provide the  
14 necessary oversight or agency activities, but the  
15 current legislation does not require ongoing  
16 assessment of existing or new agency programs or  
17 policies. As currently structured, agencies will not  
18 have to consider race and gender equity in new  
19 programming so long as it continues to implement the  
20 action plans based on the assessment that's conducted  
21 the one time in 2018.

22 Our recommendation about the Committee,  
23 is; we understand that the Committee will play a  
24 critical role; we encourage that the composition of  
25 the Committee, in order for it to be successful,

1  
2 include people experienced with working with  
3 organizations and municipalities on de-biasing  
4 initiatives, and in addition, that the Committee has  
5 a stronger role just in giving advice to the  
6 agencies.

7 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Okay.

8 DOREEN ODOM: Transparency and Community  
9 Input. And I... [crosstalk]

10 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: We're gonna just have  
11 to have your wrap up on that statement.

12 DOREEN ODOM: Okay. Just training -- we  
13 applaud the training and data collection -- we  
14 encourage data collection as well.

15 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Oh fantastic. Thank  
16 you. I appreciate your recommendations along, with  
17 discussing the issues as well and your testimony will  
18 certainly be on the record for how we can improve  
19 this, so I appreciate that very much.

20 DOREEN ODOM: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you. Next  
22 speaker.

23 ALEXIS POSEY: Hello. My name is Alexis  
24 Posey and I'm a Senior Policy Analyst at FPWA. On  
25 behalf of Jennifer Jones Austin, FPWA... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uhm-hm.

ALEXIS POSEY: would like to thank

Chairwoman Cumbo and the members of the New York City Council's Committee on Women's Issues for the opportunity to testify on behalf of Intros 1500, 1512 and 1520 which all address systemic inequality within government institutions and address racial and gender bias as a pathway to poverty. FPWA was proud to work with Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito in crafting these important pieces of legislation.

FPWA is an anti-poverty, policy and advocacy nonprofit representing a network of almost 200 human service and faith-based organizations, serving over 1.5 million low-income New Yorkers of all ages, ethnicities and denominations each year. This gives us a comprehensive view of the complex social problems that face New Yorkers today and allows us to identify common ground among our member agencies so that we can have a greater impact as we advocate for vulnerable communities.

With that said, we are excited to work with the City to remove institutional barriers that unintentionally marginalize and harm specific populations.

1  
2 New York City has an estimated population  
3 of 8.5 million, of whom more than half identify as  
4 persons of color, women, LGBTQIA. In order to  
5 achieve fairness and provide opportunities to all New  
6 York City residents, government must address racial  
7 and gender inequality, its positioning within  
8 government institutions, and the societal and  
9 economic barriers that are imposed upon residents as  
10 a result of institutionalized oppression and  
11 prejudice.

12 There is a direct link between  
13 discrimination and poverty. The majority of New York  
14 City's most vulnerable communities are comprised of  
15 minority populations who have been forced into the  
16 margins of society due to their race, gender and  
17 sexual orientation. A continued lack of targeted  
18 investment in these communities will increase poor  
19 health and education outcomes, further instances of  
20 unemployment, crime, incarceration, and ultimately  
21 perpetuate the cycle of poverty.

22 FPWA supports the proposed legislation --  
23 Intro No. 1500, Intro 1512 and Intro 1520 -- because  
24 we believe acknowledging institutional racism, gender  
25 bias, heteronormativity, and patriarchy within New

1  
2 York City government; assessing each selected  
3 agency's impact on community with regard to race and  
4 gender -- funding allocations to schools in  
5 communities of color, number of Workforce 1 centers  
6 in communities of color, childcare options in  
7 healthcare centers and workforce development centers;  
8 creating an interdepartmental framework and process  
9 that will ultimately eliminate racial and gender  
10 disparities across all New York City systems, and  
11 create policies that appreciate the concept of  
12 intersectionality and aid in the progression of  
13 intended populations is critical to the City's goal  
14 of an equitable and healthy environment.

15           The selected agencies have a large reach  
16 within New York City neighborhoods and because of the  
17 many ways in which their services intersect have the  
18 greatest impact on the lives of low-income New  
19 Yorkers.

20           In addition to eliminating the barriers  
21 and challenges many communities face when trying to  
22 assess resources, FPWA... [bell] okay, I'll finish up...  
23 FPWA believes the proposed legislation is a necessary  
24 component in our work of ending the criminalization  
25 of poverty in New York City. In know poverty's

1  
2 origins are rooted in the systemic oppression and  
3 marginalization of specific populations, and the lack  
4 of resources allocated to the communities in which  
5 they dwell, thousands of New Yorkers are criminalized  
6 for being poor. Many women and other minority  
7 populations are funneled into the criminal justice  
8 system as a result of scarcity within their  
9 communities.

10 We ask the City Council to pass this  
11 timely legislation and look forward to continue  
12 collaboration with the New York City government in  
13 ending poverty.

14 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you so much for  
15 your testimony and you're an excellent representative  
16 of Mrs. Austin. Thank you. Next presenter.

17 DR. DANIELLE MOSS LEE: Good morning. My  
18 name is Dr. Danielle Moss Lee; I'm the CEO of the  
19 YWCA of the City of New York. Good morning  
20 Chairperson Laurie Cumbo and good morning to all of  
21 the members of the Committee. I am currently Co-  
22 Chair of the New York City Council's Young Women's  
23 Initiative, and Commissioner for the Mayor's  
24 Commission on Gender Equity. Thank you for allowing  
25 me this opportunity to express how the current

1  
2 proposed laws pertaining to gender and racial equity  
3 would positively impact women, girls and people of  
4 color living in the New York City community.

5           The YWCA is one of the nation's oldest  
6 and largest membership organizations. While YWCA NYC  
7 is an independently owned and operated affiliate, we  
8 are connected to a worldwide network of sister YWCAs  
9 that serve 25 million people in more than 100  
10 countries. The YWCA stands for the elimination of  
11 racism and the empowerment of women and focuses its  
12 resources on helping communities in need, with three  
13 affordable high-quality childcare centers in  
14 Manhattan and Brooklyn, and after-school programs in  
15 Manhattan, Coney Island and Brownsville. We  
16 currently serve 2500 children and families through  
17 city and state government contracts and additional  
18 leverage from private philanthropy.

19           Intros No. 1500, 1512, 1520 and  
20 Resolution No. 542 each align with the policy agenda  
21 of the YWCA of the City of New York and reflect the  
22 work we are doing regarding racial justice and civil  
23 rights, empowerment and economic advancement, and  
24 health and safety. As an organization we continue to  
25 speak out against structural and racial injustices

1  
2 and pervasive gender inequality with the hopes of  
3 redefining what equity and equality look like in New  
4 York City. It is because of this that we fully  
5 support the following:

6 Intro No. 1500 in relation to gender and  
7 racial equity assessments.

8 Legislation committed to assessing gender  
9 and racial equity of programs and practices is  
10 exactly what we need in order to understand the  
11 economic gap between genders and across races in New  
12 York City. By identifying policies and practices  
13 that may cause disparate outcomes on the basis of  
14 gender or race, our city will have a greater  
15 opportunity of dismantling a system built on  
16 oppression and unequal treatment along gender and  
17 racial lines.

18 In relation to Intro. No. 1512, to  
19 training for City agencies to promote gender and  
20 racial equity.

21 Gender and racial equity training is also  
22 an essential factor in promoting fairness amongst all  
23 people. City agencies under this learn will learn  
24 how implicit bias, discrimination, structural  
25 inequality, and cultural competency impact their role

1  
2 in the workforce. [bell] This has a huge impact in  
3 maintaining effective communication, understanding  
4 and overall respect. Uh I'll... [interpose]

5 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: You can conclude.

6 DR. DANIELLE MOSS LEE: Oh okay. Lastly  
7 -- obviously we support the other intro -- I'm not  
8 only here today as an advocate for women all across  
9 the globe and a partner in the movement, I'm here to  
10 ensure that our laws here in the United States  
11 recognize and focus on the challenges that confront  
12 gender equality. Specifically, the acknowledgement  
13 of cultural and tradition as influences shaping  
14 gender roles and family relations as it pertains to  
15 the reproductive rights of women. Therefore, I urge  
16 the U.S. Senate to ratify Resolution 542.

17 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you. And just  
18 wanna add that the YWCA has been a strong advocate  
19 and component for CEDAW, and it's through their  
20 leadership and the work that you all doing that I  
21 believe we will be successful here in New York City  
22 and set a precedent for the rest of the nation.

23 Thank you all so much for your testimony  
24 today. Your testimonies will be on the record, which

1  
2 is going to continue to allow us the opportunity to  
3 strengthen this legislation. Thank you so much.

4 The next panel that I'll call forward is  
5 Leslie Wright; Sheila Katzman, New York City for  
6 CEDAW; Mary M. Luke, UN Women, Metro NY; and Ericka  
7 Dixon, Cities for CEDAW.

8 Thank you. So proud to welcome the  
9 dynamic women for Cities for CEDAW who have been  
10 incredible work; it's nice to welcome you here to  
11 City Hall. I've seen you mostly at the United  
12 Nations and so we're having a bit of a global  
13 experience today, so I'm so happy to welcome you.  
14 We'll begin from my right to your left, and if you  
15 could just reintroduce yourself.

16 SHEILA KATZMAN: My name is Sheila  
17 Katzman and I am President of the International  
18 Association for Women in Radio and Television, USA.  
19 I am also the Chair of New York City for CEDAW. We  
20 wanna thank you, Council Member Cumbo, for inviting  
21 us to comment on these pieces of legislation.

22 I speak today in support of 1500, 1520,  
23 1512, and Res. 542, with reservations.

24 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Wanna hear them.

25 [laughter]

SHEILA KATZMAN: [laugh] I know.

Overall, these pieces of legislation are really very interesting and just really grab us, most of us, you know, New York City for CEDAW. However, they seem, I would maybe say, unnecessarily complicated to enact, because they miss the basic framework, and you know the framework that I am pushing forward is the CEDAW framework.

In each of these proposals, race has been added to the issue of gender, so I want to question that, and we question it even though we think both are important. Race and gender are two separate issues; we think both are critical and elemental, and by combining them, it seems as if it would enforce solutions in common and, more importantly, defines them commonly, if you receive my meaning; difficult for our understanding of either. Of course, we got a lot this morning from the testimonies from the Mayor's Office, so some of that may be tempered [sic] a little.

I want to look at 1500, in relation to gender and racial equity assessments, which I just said some of that a while ago. Specific issues are defined as women's issues, along with relevant

1 agencies. This then determines that all other issues  
2 are then not women's issues.  
3

4 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uhm.

5 SHEILA KATZMAN: Yeah. Thus, issues such  
6 as finance are seen not as women's issues even though  
7 women comprise over half the population of New York  
8 City, as we heard up here before; I don't want to  
9 dwell on that. We advocate that all agencies answer  
10 basic gender questions when they are organizing a new  
11 project or anything to do with city operations.

12 We do not understand the need for  
13 creating a new committee for gender equity and to  
14 intertwine that with race also, because we don't  
15 really understand how that would work, given the  
16 framework for gender [bell] and given the... no way...  
17 and given the framework [laughter] for race, so  
18 they're two different things.

19 And five... I'm gonna run to 542, calling  
20 upon the United States to ratify CEDAW. While we  
21 believe the United States Senate, in order for the  
22 United States to be considered a fully civilized  
23 member of the world community, should ratify CEDAW,  
24 we understand that politically that is even less  
25 realistic now than any time in our history in the

1  
2 last 35 years, unlike the traditional trade and  
3 diplomatic treaties envisioned in the United States  
4 Constitution, a human rights treaty is fundamentally  
5 different. We are calling upon this Council, up on  
6 your office; you were part of that launch of Cities  
7 for CEDAW... [interpose]

8 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: That's right.

9 SHEILA KATZMAN: in 2014... [interpose]

10 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: That's right.

11 SHEILA KATZMAN: right? You are the like  
12 the mother of Cities for CEDAW, so we are calling  
13 upon you to look at the framework of CEDAW,  
14 **[inaudible]** the rights-based thing that you can use..  
15 [interpose]

16 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Right.

17 SHEILA KATZMAN: to help identify the  
18 issues of gender, I don't think it will be good to  
19 identify the issues of race and for me, I would like  
20 to have a framework to identify issues that affect me  
21 as a person of color.

22 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: No, I appreciate that  
23 very much; it's an interesting way of approaching it  
24 in terms of the division or separation or looking at  
25 things separate and apart from each other, and

1  
2 certainly something we'll consider. But one of the  
3 things that we wanted to do today with this hearing;  
4 we certainly wanted to put Cities for CEDAW and the  
5 opportunity to implement that along with these pieces  
6 of legislation, because they're very closely  
7 interrelated and we've gotta look at them  
8 collectively but also maybe not so collectively in  
9 terms of its implementation. So I appreciate your  
10 testimony today.

11 SHEILA KATZMAN: Good. Thank you very  
12 much.

13 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you. And we'll  
14 have our next speaker.

15 ERICKA DIXON: Good afternoon. My name  
16 is Ericka Dixon and I am the Policy Programs  
17 Coordinator for Black Women's Blueprint (BWB). I am  
18 very grateful for this opportunity to address the  
19 Women's Issues Committee on behalf of BWB and comment  
20 on the proposed gender and racial equity legislation.

21 Since 2010, Black Women's Blueprint has  
22 worked from our Crown Heights headquarters to secure  
23 the political, social and economic equality of all  
24 Black women, girls, and gender nonconforming people.  
25 In New York City and around the nation, Black Women's

1  
2 Blueprint has a demonstrated track record of working  
3 closely in coalition, especially with United Nations  
4 initiatives, to push policy agendas that seek to  
5 eradicate sexual violence in under-resourced and  
6 often forgotten communities.

7           In my role as Co-Lead of the Grassroots  
8 Organizing Subcommittee for New York City for CEDAW,  
9 of which Black Women's Blueprint is part of the  
10 Steering Committee, we urge the City Council to adopt  
11 coherent gender equity legislation couched in the  
12 rights-based framework of CEDAW. Black Women's  
13 Blueprint knows that we are a city not only in need  
14 of strong gender equity legislation such as what is  
15 proposed, but also legislation that is robust,  
16 coherent and grounded in a human race-based critical  
17 analysis of intersectionality, and which attends the  
18 multitude of identities that make up who we are and  
19 how we move through the world. We firmly believe  
20 that CEDAW is the answer.

21           To that end, while we appreciate the  
22 spirit of the City Council's symbolic gesture to take  
23 up Resolution No. 542 that urges the U.S. Senate to  
24 ratify the Convention, is it simply not enough.

1  
2 Black Women's Blueprint welcomes the  
3 critical reflection and analysis of City agencies  
4 through the gender and racial equity assessment  
5 proposed in Intro No. 1500. However, the proposed  
6 language which currently reads, "the term gender and  
7 racial equity assessment means a systematic process  
8 of identifying policies and practices that may cause  
9 disparate outcomes on the basis of gender or race"  
10 gives us pause.

11 Why, as a Black woman, must I always  
12 choose?

13 Black Women's Blueprint urges the Council  
14 to consider a reframing of this definition to one  
15 where gender and race are linked as concurrent, co-  
16 created, and interwoven factors that are constantly  
17 in relation to other forms of identities. Black  
18 women deserve policies in which we can see ourselves  
19 and we deserve to have policies that reflect our  
20 experiences as being both Black and women, as being  
21 Black and trans and women, as being Black and lesbian  
22 and immigrant and undocumented women -- frames that  
23 honor the wholeness of who we are and which impact  
24 the material and psychological conditions of our  
25 lives.

1  
2 In our pursuit to center those most at  
3 the margins, we are heartened to see that Intro  
4 No. 1512 identifies gender in the broadest of terms  
5 and names the significance of self-identity and  
6 expression. Yet, Int. No. 1520 contradicts that  
7 language by rendering gender as a binary ("between  
8 genders" as opposed to our recommendation of "among  
9 every gender"). I speak in solidarity of my trans  
10 and gender nonconforming sisters of color as I demand  
11 that their presence be fully felt [bell] and  
12 understood through broad and inclusive gender  
13 definitions in every relevant local law that is  
14 passed from now on. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you. Yes, our  
16 next speaker.

17 LESLIE WRIGHT: Thank you, honorable  
18 Council Member, and also I'd like to welcome those  
19 dignitaries, guests, and ladies and gentlemen who are  
20 here in the audience today. My name is Leslie Wright  
21 and I'm testifying for Zonta Club of NY. Thank you  
22 very much for providing us with the opportunity to  
23 testify on these bills. And for your information,  
24 the Zonta Club of NY is the 20th club that was  
25 organized back in 1920, so we're 97 years old; we're

1  
2 part of 1200 clubs that are international in 66  
3 different countries, so we have a long heritage and  
4 we've been around for a long time. We have a  
5 longstanding association with the human rights  
6 treaties ratified at the UN, and in particular,  
7 CEDAW, so we have a lot of experience in terms of  
8 dealing with CEDAW and what it stands for and  
9 certainly support this attempt and your leadership in  
10 regard to New York City. For example, the four  
11 women's World Conferences that were held by the  
12 United Nations, former International President, Helvi  
13 Sipila, was the Secretary General of the first World  
14 Conference on Women, which was held prior to CEDAW's  
15 adoption in 1979. So like I said, we have been  
16 around for a long time and we've been involved with  
17 this for a long time.

18 I personally, in New York City, have been  
19 representing our club with the City's for CEDAW  
20 Coalition and serving on its Steering Committee and  
21 as co-chair of its Policy Committee. So I endorse a  
22 lot of the things that my colleagues have already  
23 said and I think the way they talk about the  
24 intersectionality of the various components of  
25 women's lives in terms of what these bills represent

1 should be examined, and perhaps that word  
2 "intersectionality" is a good one to remember and to  
3 try to put into the bills.  
4

5 And rather than talk a lot about what  
6 they have already spoken about and what my colleague  
7 to my left is going to speak about next, I'd like to  
8 speak more specifically about what's in these  
9 particular pieces of legislation, because obviously  
10 we believe in a strong human rights framework and the  
11 modifications that we're suggesting for these  
12 upcoming bills are substantive, but they're  
13 relatively minor and I think they could be included  
14 fairly easily. One is to assure that gender and  
15 racial equity throughout City government should  
16 include, and I think it's worthwhile to specifically  
17 name some of the departments that probably have the  
18 most to gain in terms of gender equity, and that  
19 would be Police, Fire and Human Resources, for  
20 example, in addition to the ones that are already  
21 named. And you do have the caveat of others as well  
22 in the legislation, but I think that it's important  
23 to name some of those so that you specifically have  
24 recognition that there needs to be work done there.  
25

1  
2 We also recommend the following be added  
3 in terms of discrimination, the term  
4 "intersectionality" -- which I've also mentioned --  
5 and we recommend the approach used by New York Cities  
6 for CEDAW, which would be to add gender race from the  
7 perspective of [bell] culture, nationality and  
8 religion.

9 We welcome the fact that the City of New  
10 York has such outstanding legislation so far and that  
11 you've really moved us forward and we really see New  
12 York City being a leader not only Cities for CEDAW,  
13 but also in terms of this legislation, making these  
14 minor modifications. And I won't belabor the point,  
15 because I know we have a time constraint and I have  
16 more specific things to add that are in this  
17 testimony and you'll have copies of it, but we do  
18 have things that we've enumerated and relative to  
19 even the resolution that need to be taken a closer  
20 look at. Like I said, they're minor and I think they  
21 could be easily incorporated. Thank you.. [crosstalk]

22 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you for your  
23 testimony.

24 LESLIE WRIGHT: Sure.  
25

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: We'll take the next  
3 speaker.

4 MARY LUKE: Thank you. Thank you very  
5 much for your leadership and being such a champion  
6 for human rights and women's rights.. [interpose]

7 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you.

8 MARY LUKE: I'm Mary Luke and I'm the  
9 President of the Metro NY Chapter of the US National  
10 Committee for UN Women, and we are an NGO based in  
11 New York City.

12 First I want to thank New York for being  
13 such a leader already and being the first signator of  
14 the Safe Cities Initiative under the UN, and also  
15 being such a strong supporter of the Sustainable  
16 Development Goals which also fights to alleviate  
17 extreme poverty and fight injustices and promotes  
18 gender equality.

19 I just wanna say a few words about what  
20 CEDAW has already meant and done in other countries  
21 to provide a global perspective; it's really been a  
22 valuable tool for advancing women's rights and gender  
23 equality and provided the base for judicial  
24 decisions, constitutional, legal, and policy reforms  
25 at the country level. A number of countries have

1  
2 adopted equal opportunity acts to increase the number  
3 of women in elected office, new laws and actions to  
4 address violence against women, improve programs for  
5 marginalized women, young women, women living with  
6 HIV, and has even supported gender-sensitive Supreme  
7 Court justices in ASEAN countries. So we see that  
8 there has been impact by using CEDAW and human rights  
9 framework.

10 I want to comment on the legislation  
11 that's before us. We do support the proposed bills  
12 -- 1500, 1520 and 1520 and Resolution 542; again,  
13 with reservation, as the Chairperson has already  
14 stated. And that is because we really believe that  
15 we need to have an institutionalized and coordinated  
16 approach to gender policies, programs and allocation  
17 of resources and we feel that is best done by having  
18 a combined bill that is supporting women's  
19 comprehensive rights.

20 We think that training, monitoring and  
21 evaluation are all vital components of a  
22 comprehensive bill for gender equality. These  
23 components need to build on each other to enable  
24 trained managers to use a gender lens to analyze  
25 programs, propose action plans and make budget and

1 staffing decisions based on a human rights framework.

2 It's really all about action and it's all about

3 results; not just the process of training; not just

4 the process of gathering data. Of course, gender

5 disaggregated data is very important, [bell] as is

6 monitoring and evaluation. But probably as important

7 is funding... [interpose]

8 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uhm-hm.

9 MARY LUKE: we know that the Commission

10 on Gender Equality doesn't have any funding...

11 [interpose]

12 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Right.

13 MARY LUKE: and it's so important that

14 any of these bills and new legislation includes

15 funding or it really doesn't mean anything.

16 [background comment] And so, again, we just want to

17 support -- there's a need perhaps for additional

18 legislation or for all the three bills that is a

19 package to be packaged even further under one

20 umbrella that is a comprehensive and holistic bill

21 that includes gender analysis using a rights-based

22 framework, that includes training of managers, that

23 includes a public review mechanism, including

24 grassroots participation, and that includes funding

25

1  
2 to support salaries, gender analysis, training,  
3 action plans, monitoring, and oversight. And with  
4 such a bill, New York City can set an example and be  
5 a strong leader not just for other cities, but for  
6 the world.. [interpose]

7 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: That's right.

8 MARY LUKE: and that's what we want to  
9 see. So thank you so much.

10 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you. And I  
11 have so many questions, but in the interest of time  
12 -- we are on a room clock till 1:00, so [background  
13 comment] we have to get in as many speakers as  
14 possible, but I look forward to following up; part of  
15 us being able to be here as part of this legislative  
16 process was the meeting that we had, and we wanted to  
17 certainly advance the Cities for CEDAW during this  
18 particular time, because all eyes are on women all  
19 over the world and so it's certainly our time to make  
20 "herstory" and to continue to push the envelope, and  
21 I believe that we will be successful. Thank you.

22 [collective thank yous]

23 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: I'm gonna call the  
24 next panel, and as I do and you come forward, I'm  
25 going to step away to use the ladies room. We are

1  
2 going to have Lorraine Stephens from the New York  
3 Women's Foundation; Merble Reagon, Women's Center for  
4 Education; Dina Bakst, A Better Balance; and MaryBeth  
5 Bognar.

6 [background comments]

7 [pause]

8 [background comment]

9 [pause]

10 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: I go away for one  
11 second. Okay, we will start and continue from my  
12 right to my left; if you could just reintroduce  
13 yourselves, and we'll begin with the testimony.

14 DINA BAKST: Begin?

15 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uhm-hm.

16 DINA BAKST: Good morning. My name is  
17 Dina Bakst; I am Co-Founder and Co-President of A  
18 Better Balance. We are a national legal organization  
19 dedicated to promoting fairness in the workplace and  
20 helping workers across the economic spectrum care for  
21 their families without risking their economic  
22 security. Over the past decade, A Better Balance has  
23 been a leading advocate for state and local  
24 legislation here in New York to end discrimination  
25 against women and advance family-friendly laws and

1  
2 policies to Paid Sick Days here in New York City and  
3 Paid Family Leave on the state level. A Better  
4 Balance also hosts a free legal clinic which we  
5 assist hundreds of callers every year, from New York  
6 City and around the nation. The majority of our  
7 callers are women facing various obstacles at work  
8 related to pregnancy, personal illness, and family  
9 caregiving responsibilities. Many are low-income  
10 women of color who bear the economic brunt of  
11 inflexible and discriminatory workplace practices.  
12 We thank the Committee on Women's Issues for the  
13 opportunity to testify in support of legislation that  
14 will help advance gender and racial equality and  
15 justice for the New Yorkers we serve. Our testimony  
16 is certainly informed by our clients.

17 In the interest of time, I'd like to  
18 frame my remarks this afternoon on two bills under  
19 consideration today -- 1512 and 1500 -- which require  
20 City agencies to perform internal trainings and  
21 assessments with respect to gender and racial  
22 inequality. Why are these measures so important?  
23 And I just wanna take us back to a couple key  
24 reports. You know last year the Public Advocate's  
25 Office released a report finding that women employed

1  
2 in the New York City's municipal government face a  
3 gender wage gap that is three times larger than the  
4 gap faced by women in the for-profit sector. We know  
5 that the gender wage gap in the City is marked by a  
6 larger racial disparity compared to the rest of the  
7 country. And an earlier report by the Comptroller's  
8 Office revealed that women with children experience  
9 the biggest wage differential when compared to their  
10 male counterparts, and suggested that municipal  
11 policies and practices, such as the lack of flexible  
12 scheduling, could be a key factor constraining women  
13 in the municipal workforce. In fact, A Better  
14 Balance is proud to have provided input on this  
15 report almost seven years ago to Comptroller Liu;  
16 this is a huge problem, the wage gap that we face in  
17 the municipal workforce and we really need targeted  
18 solutions to try and get at the data information and  
19 assessment gap that we face, you know, looking at the  
20 City workforce.

21 So let me just, on these two bills, you  
22 know training is absolutely critical...

23 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uhm-hm.

24 DINA BAKST: we passed the New York City  
25 Pregnant Workers Fairness Act, the Caregiver Bill,

1  
2 but we know that City workers and City agencies are  
3 not necessarily informed, and line manager not  
4 necessarily informed of what their obligations are  
5 and this lack of training has really had devastating  
6 consequences for municipal workers, like one of our  
7 clients, today, Karina Flete, who is a single mother  
8 and the sole caregiver for her three-year-old  
9 daughter with special needs. She works for the New  
10 York City Department of Information Technology as a  
11 311 customer [bell] service agent, and to make a long  
12 story short, this woman has clear rights under the  
13 New York City Caregiver Law and the agency has not  
14 been adequately trained and her rights aren't being  
15 enforced. She's also a subject of rigid and  
16 inflexible work rules in this agency; a woman who  
17 wanted to modify her work schedule by one hour to  
18 care for her... [crosstalk]

19 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uhm.

20 DINA BAKST: special needs child, and  
21 instead of modifying her schedule, which was  
22 reasonable, given the 24-hour nature of the agency;  
23 they put her on the overnight shift, which set her up  
24 to fail... [crosstalk]

25 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Oh.

1  
2 DINA BAKST: So this is an example of  
3 why, one of the many reasons, we have a really  
4 significant gender wage gap problem in the municipal  
5 workforce and we need solutions. These are not a  
6 panacea, but they are important first steps --  
7 trainings; assessment are important measures that we  
8 need to take in order to get the information and as  
9 advocates, you know fight to strengthen the law.  
10 Thank you... [crosstalk]

11 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you so much and  
12 thank you for your work; you have certainly done so  
13 much for families, I'll say, because when we  
14 strengthen women, we strengthen an entire family and  
15 an entire community, so thank you for the work that  
16 you've done.

17 DINA BAKST: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Yes.

19 MERBLE REAGON: Thank you. My name is  
20 Merble Reagon; I am Executive Director at the Women's  
21 Center for Education and Career Advancement.

22 For 40 years, our Center has provided  
23 services to help more than 40,000 women prepare for  
24 jobs and careers that would enable them to earn  
25 incomes that would support their families adequately.

1  
2 We soon realized that many of those who continued to  
3 experience financial difficulties simply were not  
4 earning enough money to meet their most basic living  
5 expenses.

6           So in the year 2000, our Women's Center  
7 partnered with other New York City nonprofits to  
8 define what it actually costs for New York City  
9 families to make ends meet and what supports would  
10 help them to survive in the meantime. Since then, we  
11 have produced four self-sufficiency standard reports  
12 that measure how much income New York City working  
13 families actually need based on where they live, the  
14 number of people in their families and the ages of  
15 their children.

16           The most recent report is titled  
17 "Overlooked and Undercounted; the Struggle to Make  
18 Ends Meet in New York City." We have calculated what  
19 it costs for 152 working family types living in each  
20 of seven different geographic areas of New York City  
21 to meet all of their necessarily expenses without any  
22 public or private help.

23           So we know that there are various  
24 characteristics of the families that work full-time  
25 and yet earn money at the bottom of the spectrum. We

1 know that women of color are affected most  
2 dramatically. So we think it's long past time to  
3 shift New York City public policy discussions from  
4 just moving families above poverty to one that  
5 addresses in a more comprehensive way how to help  
6 working families achieve economic stability, based on  
7 a real and better understanding of what they really  
8 need to make ends meet. In early 2018, we'll release  
9 our fifth report.  
10

11 So how much income is enough in New York  
12 City? In 2015, a family of two adults, two young  
13 children in the Bronx needed \$80,000; in Northwest  
14 Brooklyn \$89,000; in the rest of Brooklyn \$82,000; in  
15 North Manhattan \$83,000; South Manhattan \$109,000; in  
16 Queens \$86,000; and on Staten Island \$82,000.

17 These are bare bones budgets. So if so  
18 many New York City families do not have enough income  
19 to meet their basic needs, what do we need to do?  
20 For many New Yorkers, having a job no longer  
21 guarantees the ability to pay for basic needs. We've  
22 determined that since the year 2000 basic expenses  
23 for families have increased by 48%, while the median  
24 earnings of working adults in New York City has  
25 increased by only 17%.

1  
2 We applaud the leadership of the New York  
3 City Council, the Speaker, the Committee on Women's  
4 Issues and the Council Members; we applaud their  
5 commitment to workplace equity [bell] demonstrated by  
6 the introduction of these bills.

7 We believe that the bills are consistent  
8 with the City's priorities and as the country's  
9 largest city, rich in resources and leaders, New York  
10 is in a unique position to set an important example  
11 not just for the City and the State but the rest of  
12 the country by ensuring that all City employees have  
13 a fair shake at jobs and career paths that provide  
14 opportunities for working families to move along a  
15 steady road to economic self-sufficiency.

16 So thank you for this opportunity..

17 [crosstalk]

18 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you.

19 MERBLE REAGON: and thanks to Council  
20 Member Ben Kallos for giving us... [crosstalk]

21 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Yes.

22 MERBLE REAGON: a shout-out earlier about  
23 our technology **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: [laugh] He's  
3 fantastic. He's the only male member on the Women's  
4 Issues Committee.. [crosstalk]

5 MERBLE REAGON: I would..

6 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: so we're happy to  
7 have him.

8 MERBLE REAGON: I would expect no less of  
9 him.

10 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: [laugh] That's right.  
11 Thank you so much for your testimony. We'll hear  
12 from our next speaker.

13 LORRAINE STEPHENS: Good afternoon. My  
14 name is Lorraine Stephens and I am the Vice President  
15 of Programs and Strategic Learning at The New York  
16 Women's Foundation.

17 First, I would like to thank Council  
18 Member Cumbo and the Committee on Women's Issues for  
19 the opportunity to give testimony today. We at The  
20 Women's Foundation greatly appreciate your ongoing  
21 efforts to promote gender and racial equity in New  
22 York City and support all the bills that you have  
23 brought forth this morning. But today I would like  
24 to talk about bill 1500.



CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uhm-hm.

LORRAINE STEPHENS: Introduction 1500

creates transparency in service provisions and allocation of resources of City agencies; determines the steps required to alleviate the problems and weaknesses of each agency as well as to strengthen competencies in addressing gender and racial inequality; allows for deeper understanding of the community needs to address gender and racial inequity; assesses the impact of provision of services on communities; and identifies priorities for programming or governmental improvements to practice regarding gender.

In New York City, one out of every four women is living in poverty. Twenty percent of women live below the poverty line, compared to 18.9% of men. In female-headed households, this number rises to 32%. In female-headed households with children under the age of 18, 41% are living below the poverty line. These burdens fall most heavily on women of color their families. We call on the City to invest more in dismantling all systemic barriers in our City agencies that prevent equal access to women of all genders and races, and see the proposed bill 1500

1 will include monitoring compliance and [bell]  
2 outcomes.  
3

4 To sum it up, one thing that we do wanna  
5 say; we do believe that this bill should be for all  
6 City agencies... [interpose]

7 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Right.

8 LORRAINE STEPHENS: including law  
9 enforcement agencies -- police, corrections,  
10 probation -- as well as the Department of Aging and  
11 the Department of Youth. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: I agree with you  
13 wholeheartedly.

14 LORRAINE STEPHENS: And you have my  
15 testimony.

16 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you. We're not  
17 gonna stop until this is implemented across the  
18 entire City of New York; we have to begin somewhere,  
19 but again, we can't stop here; we've gotta continue  
20 to expand, because this is too important just to be  
21 limited to a few agencies. Thank you. Next  
22 testimony.

23 MARYBETH BOGNAR: Good afternoon and  
24 thank you for your time and for this opportunity  
25 today. My name is MaryBeth Bognar and I'm with the

1  
2 Center for Women's Global Leadership, a feminist  
3 human rights organization working at the intersection  
4 of human rights, gender and economics and is engaged  
5 in local implementation of international human rights  
6 treaties such as CEDAW.

7 I would like to begin by thanking you for  
8 raising the important issue of gender and racial  
9 discrimination and inequality, for making it a  
10 priority and demonstrating your commitment by  
11 bringing forth these bills. With that said, I call  
12 on you to instead move forward with one overarching  
13 bill -- as was mentioned -- that encompasses human  
14 rights principles and standards. This bill should be  
15 grounded in human rights principles as its foundation  
16 including equity, equality and inclusion, and utilize  
17 rights-based definitions such as those laid out in  
18 CEDAW, and this inclusion would assess gender and  
19 racial discrimination where they converge rather than  
20 just separately, and as mentioned before, address the  
21 intersection of these with other identities as well,  
22 such as sexual orientation, religion, ability,  
23 ethnicity, nationality, class, age, legal status,  
24 among others. This bill should also contain a strong  
25 implementation plan that is funded, part of a City

1  
2 entity, and includes resources for positive results  
3 and an oversight body. And I believe there is  
4 written testimony from the Columbia Center for Human  
5 Rights on this further.

6 I bring this to you based on the  
7 successes of the San Francisco CEDAW Ordinance, with  
8 which our Center has a direct connection. The fact  
9 that this ordinance was based on CEDAW principles  
10 resulted in: 44 months without a single domestic  
11 violence homicide... [interpose]

12 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Wow.

13 MARYBETH BOGNAR: the gender equality  
14 principles initiative, which ranged from employment  
15 and compensation to supply chain practices, and  
16 support more productive workplaces for both women and  
17 men. It resulted in working parents having the right  
18 to request a flexible work schedule without fear of  
19 retaliation, because it was engrained as a right, and  
20 a gender analysis of City agencies where government  
21 agencies examine their workforce, programs and  
22 budgets to ensure that they are nondiscriminatory and  
23 fully serve all communities of women and girls. And  
24 I also want to add that there is a comprehensive data  
25

1  
2 collection model that has worked well for LA, who has  
3 done this as well.

4           These are examples specific to some of  
5 New York City's priority issues for women and girls,  
6 including violence against women, pay equity and  
7 employment equality, but are just a handful of the  
8 successes San Francisco has experienced.

9           A rights-based approach gives New York  
10 City the foundation to address these and other needs  
11 specific to this city, ranging from reproductive  
12 health to housing right, etc., in a way that meets  
13 international human rights standards, is proactive  
14 and results-driven.

15           In conclusion, I offer my appreciation  
16 that the issue of gender and racial discrimination  
17 and inequality is being made a priority and though we  
18 are in agreement of bringing about progress in these  
19 areas, I recommend doing so with one overarching bill  
20 that encompasses human rights standards and  
21 principles as they exist in CEDAW. [bell] This is  
22 what New York City's women and girls deserve in order  
23 to achieve their inherent right of dignity. Thank  
24 you.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you so much,  
3 thank you for your testimony. Thank you to all of  
4 you for being here today and for your patience. This  
5 is really historical, "herstorical" in the sense of  
6 us bringing about this type of change; not only for  
7 us, but generations to come; I hope that in future  
8 generations concepts of pay inequality won't be terms  
9 that they'll be even familiar with. So thank you so  
10 much. [collective thank yous]

11 The next panel that I'm gonna call  
12 forward is Martha Kamber from YWCA of Brooklyn;  
13 Lauren Betterers of the Gender Equality Law Center;  
14 Allegra Fishel, Gender Equality Law Center; and  
15 Natasha Lycia Ora Bannan from the LatinoJustice Pride  
16 Center. Okay. Then we will call Debjani Roy from  
17 Hollaback!

18 Alright, Martha, we'll begin with you;  
19 you've been so instrumental in pushing all of this  
20 legislation as well the Cities for CEDAW and I'm  
21 excited to have you and welcome you here.

22 MARTHA KAMBER: Thank you, Laurie and  
23 thanks for this opportunity; I'm gonna try to talk  
24 fast, because I know we only have a few minutes left.

1  
2 I'm Martha Kamber; I'm the CEO and  
3 President of the YWCA of Brooklyn. I'd like to thank  
4 Council Member Cumbo and the Speaker of the City  
5 Council, Melissa Mark-Viverito, and the members of  
6 the Women's Issues Committee for the opportunity to  
7 testify today.

8 The YWCA of Brooklyn is on a mission to  
9 eliminate racism and empower women in Brooklyn and  
10 citywide. As the largest and oldest organization in  
11 Brooklyn specifically serving women and girls, and  
12 the only YWCA representing New York City's most  
13 populous borough, the YWCA of Brooklyn is uniquely  
14 qualified to advance an agenda of gender equality and  
15 racial justice. For clarification, we work  
16 collaboratively with all of our YWCA sisters  
17 throughout the state and the city, but we are not  
18 affiliated with any other YWCA. I know that's a  
19 little confusing.

20 We further our mission by providing  
21 affordable, safe, permanent housing for over 300  
22 women, most of whom are survivors of gender-based  
23 violence; a college access program for over 250 low-  
24 income, high-potential girls of color; mentoring for  
25 women entrepreneurs; social justice advocacy,

1  
2 education and activism; subsidized office, event and  
3 meeting space for our nonprofits and civic partners  
4 in the Brooklyn community, including Girls for Gender  
5 Equity and Hollaback!; and our Social Justice  
6 Community Center that promotes events that bring  
7 together mission-aligned partners addressing issues  
8 at the intersection of gender, class and race, as  
9 well as provides an opportunity for extensive  
10 community education and social justice movement  
11 building.

12           The YWCA of Brooklyn's programs and  
13 advocacy strengthen and develop opportunities for  
14 underserved women and girls of color by addressing  
15 such structural and institutional racism.

16           We recognize that the bills and  
17 resolution at issue before this Committee are now  
18 offered in that tradition and spirit. Training of  
19 city government officials is essential, as is the  
20 need for more data to better identify and address  
21 racial and gender inequalities, and we welcome  
22 legislative attempts to do so. However, even in the  
23 aggregate these initiatives offer merely a starting  
24 point for fighting bias. In our opinion, the  
25 proposed legislation does not go far enough, does not

1 dedicate sufficient resources for long-term  
2 implementation, and fails to adequately engage  
3 community partners in their design and  
4 implementation. While these initiatives address bias  
5 within city government, they do not address the  
6 discrimination that exists in all other sectors that  
7 negatively impacts economic security for women, and  
8 especially for women of color.

10 The propose Resolution 0542 calls for  
11 federal action to ratify Convention on the Elimination  
12 of all Forms of Discrimination against Women.  
13 Unfortunately, such [bell] such federal action is  
14 highly unlikely considering the utter disregard for  
15 women's basic human rights and racial equity  
16 demonstrated by the current federal administration.  
17 We therefore encourage the Committee to consider ways  
18 to implement CEDAW effectively at a local level. The  
19 YWCA of Brooklyn was one of the first grassroots  
20 groups in New York City to embrace greater recognition  
21 of the human rights principles contained in CEDAW and  
22 as the former Vice-Chair of the US National Committee  
23 for UN Women, Metro Chapter and current board member  
24 of the World YWCA Council, my opinion is that our  
25 efforts would be best utilized working to get CEDAW

1  
2 adopted and implemented in New York City the way San  
3 Francisco, Los Angeles and other cities nationwide  
4 have begun to do.

5           Along with our nonprofit and academic  
6 partners, the YWCA of Brooklyn is eager to engage the  
7 Council to develop legislation that provides the  
8 resources to advance human rights initiatives in both  
9 the public and private sectors in New York City. An  
10 affirmative human rights approach is well suited to  
11 address the structural racism... [interpose]

12           CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: I'm gonna have to ask  
13 you to wrap up.

14           MARTHA KAMBER: Okay. Alright, I'm  
15 wrapping up [laugh]... [crosstalk]

16           CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uhm-hm.

17           MARTHA KAMBER: Such legislation can  
18 demonstrate the City Council's leadership in the  
19 human rights arena at a time when such initiative is  
20 gravely and dangerously absent at the federal level.

21           In conclusion, at the YWCA of Brooklyn  
22 our experience working with thousands of women and  
23 girls of color has shown that such a comprehensive  
24 human rights approach will not only have significant  
25 positive economic consequences but can reverberate to

1  
2 the benefit of the city as a whole. We have seen  
3 firsthand how the women in our programs struggle to  
4 survive economically; to find an affordable and safe  
5 place to live; to heal from trauma of gender-based  
6 violence; and to combat the racial and gender  
7 discrimination they experience as barriers to  
8 employment, education and healthcare. We know that  
9 when girls of color face systemic racial and sexual  
10 stereotyping throughout their public school education  
11 they are less likely to graduate, go to college or to  
12 rise out of poverty.

13 We thank you again for the opportunity to  
14 testify. We applaud and share the Council's interest  
15 in deepening its commitment to ending racism and  
16 empowering women. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you. We'll  
18 have our next presenter.

19 NATASHA LYCIA ORA BANNAN: Good  
20 afternoon, Chairwoman Cumbo. My name is Natasha  
21 Lycia Ora Bannan; I am Associate Counsel at  
22 LatinoJustice PRLDEF, formerly the Puerto Rican Legal  
23 Defense Education Fund, a national civil rights  
24 organization that's engaged in advocacy and impact  
25 litigation on behalf of underserved Latino

1 communities along the east coast. As a racial  
2 justice organization, we are excited to see these  
3 legislative initiatives that have been proposed by  
4 yourself, by the Speaker and by other Council Members  
5 that require certain agencies to conduct gender and  
6 racial equity assessments, as well as promote gender  
7 and racial equity. These are critical and necessary  
8 steps in ensuring that our city respects, protects  
9 and fulfills our human rights obligations for all New  
10 Yorkers, particularly those who have historically  
11 been exploited, marginalized or otherwise made  
12 invisible by our institutions.

14 Embedding an intentional racial and  
15 gender lens with which critical decisions are made in  
16 some of our most important agencies brings New York  
17 one step closer to truly being a city where human  
18 rights are not just spoken about as abstract policy  
19 goals, but where the decisions that are made daily  
20 that affect the lives of millions of people are made  
21 with an understanding of how they may  
22 disproportionately burden, harm or discriminate  
23 against women, gender nonconforming individuals, the  
24 LGBT community, and people of color. The importance  
25 of this for a city that is majority people of color

1 cannot be underestimated. As an example of how this  
2 legislation can help in addressing an issue like  
3 employment discrimination through the dual lens of  
4 race and gender, we requested, some years ago, data  
5 from City agencies concerning discrimination against  
6 Latina women in the workplace in the city and yet  
7 found out that at that time that agency didn't  
8 disaggregate data by both race and gender. So while  
9 we could see how many Latinos or how many women had  
10 filed complaints of employment discrimination or  
11 sexual harassment, we could not determine without an  
12 independent assessment how Latinas were uniquely  
13 qualified. This is just one example of many of how  
14 both a gendered and racialized assessment could  
15 assist agencies in looking at service delivery, as  
16 well as how training officials to recognize  
17 intersection identities may require more thoughtful  
18 attention and distribution of resources to our  
19 communities.  
20

21 As an organization that has litigate and  
22 defended Latinos and immigrants who have been  
23 discriminated in housing, educational settings and  
24 employment in New York City, who have been targeted,  
25 harassed and abused by law enforcement in all five

1  
2 boroughs and whose voting rights have been unlawfully  
3 interfered with as recently as last year's election,  
4 we cannot stress the importance of ensuring that City  
5 officials have a deep understanding of human rights  
6 principles and a commitment to ensure that city  
7 government is not intentionally or unintentionally  
8 treating our communities in discriminatory ways that  
9 place unequal burdens on them while showering  
10 benefits on others. This is particularly true in  
11 this era of anti-immigrant and misogynistic rhetoric  
12 and policies that target our communities with  
13 disastrous policies and clearly violate the purpose  
14 and intent of binding human rights obligations.

15 We applaud these proposals as a first  
16 step in creating accountability for policies and  
17 practices that may cause [bell] disparate outcomes..  
18 could I just finish this part around my  
19 recommendations...? [crosstalk]

20 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Yeah. Uhm-hm.

21 NATASHA LYCIA ORA BANNAN: And while we  
22 know that some policy decisions intend to direct  
23 resources to underserved communities, they may vary  
24 by administration; therefore we applaud the fact that  
25 these are amendments to the Administrative Code and

1  
2 City Charter. However, while it's a significant  
3 step, we hope to see that this will soon be extended  
4 to all agencies, regardless of function and we  
5 recommend that in addition to the Gender and Racial  
6 Equity Committee that's contemplated that the  
7 proposed committee or the sponsoring members hold  
8 public town hall forums or hearings throughout the  
9 city to solicit input from residents that can be used  
10 in recommendations by the Committee.

11           Lastly, it is our recommendation that the  
12 Committee not cease to exist after submitting its  
13 initial recommendations to the Mayor but rather that  
14 it retain a permanent nature in order to conduct  
15 periodic assessments of each City agency's compliance  
16 with racial and gender **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

17           CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: I'm gonna have to ask  
18 you to wrap up, just because the next hearing is  
19 going to begin soon... [crosstalk]

20           NATASHA LYCIA ORA BANNAN: I just  
21 finished. Thank you.

22           CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Yeah, thank you so  
23 much.

24           DEBJANI ROY: Great, thank you. Good  
25 afternoon. My name is Debjani Roy and I'm the Deputy

1  
2 Director of Hollaback!, an organization that fights  
3 for the right to equal access to public spaces, both  
4 in New York City and around the world.

5 I want to first begin by recognizing you,  
6 Council Member Cumbo, as well as Council Members  
7 Dromm, Levin, Johnson, Ferreras-Copeland, Chin,  
8 Espinal, Eugene, Richards, Rose, Rodriguez,  
9 Salamanca, Menchaca, Lander, and Rosenthal, along  
10 with Speaker Mark-Viverito, for their bold leadership  
11 on these critical issues and for inviting Hollaback!  
12 To speak today. We stand in solidarity with the  
13 efforts of these leaders to amend the New York City  
14 Charter in relation to measuring and addressing  
15 gender and racial inequality in New York City, to  
16 amend the Administrative Code of the City of New York  
17 in relation to gender and racial equity assessment,  
18 to amend the Administrative Code of the City of New  
19 York requiring training for City agencies to promote  
20 gender and racial equity, and to ratify an inclusive  
21 CEDAW.

22 Hollaback! Began our work in New York  
23 City in 2005, collecting stories of street harassment  
24 and advocating for change. Since that time, we've  
25 seen firsthand the impacts of harassment and

1 discrimination in public spaces on New Yorkers. Our  
2 research with Cornell has shown that 85% of women  
3 experienced street harassment before the age of 17,  
4 and 67% experienced it before the age of 14. Over  
5 50% of respondents reported being fondled or groped  
6 in the last year alone.

7  
8 Through our website and app, Hollaback!  
9 Has collected over 11,000 testimonies of harassment  
10 in public spaces, from comments like "hey baby, show  
11 me what you've got" to physical contact including  
12 groping, to public masturbation. We've heard stories  
13 of fear, anger, and some from those who identify as  
14 women, LGBTQ+ and/or people of color who have written  
15 to us, people who feel unsafe in their own  
16 neighborhoods, on public transportation, or on the  
17 way to school or work. Since November, we've seen a  
18 significant rise in hate incidents and requests for  
19 trainings; Hollaback! has trained over 1,560 people  
20 in bystander intervention over the last five months  
21 along providing them the tools to safety and  
22 effectively intervene when they witness harassment in  
23 public spaces, with additional requests coming in  
24 every day. Our trainings take on an intersectional  
25 lens, highlighting the many different ways people of

1  
2 different gender and racial identities are subject to  
3 harassment, and in some cases assault and violence.

4 This cannot be the new normal. We need  
5 to act now to ensure that New Yorkers have the tools  
6 they need to prevent and respond to these increased  
7 incidences of harassment that our City agencies are  
8 equipped to provide effective and informed support  
9 and that our City is leading in our commitment to  
10 racial and gender equity and inclusion.

11 For individuals experiencing harassment,  
12 discrimination and violence, it's crucial that the  
13 City is aware of the extent of the problem and that  
14 City institutions have the tools they need to respond  
15 with understanding, resources and cultural  
16 competency. We've had stories submitted to our site  
17 from people who identify as women, LGBTQ+ and/or  
18 people of color who have gone to the police, local  
19 businesses or their employer to seek support after  
20 being groped or followed, but have been told that  
21 there's nothing to be done -- some have even felt re-  
22 victimized [bell] or re-traumatized after  
23 experiencing further harassment from the very  
24 agencies built to protect them. Without ongoing  
25

1  
2 training for our City agencies, we run the risk of  
3 further entrenching... [crosstalk]

4 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: **[inaudible]**

5 DEBJANI ROY: violence and inequality,  
6 limiting who has access to public spaces as well as  
7 services in our city.

8 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you.

9 DEBJANI ROY: Thank you so much.

10 [laughter]

11 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you so much;  
12 love Hollaback! Thank you.

13 ALLEGRA FISHEL: Good afternoon, my name  
14 is... this on?

15 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: There we go.

16 ALLEGRA FISHEL: There we go; I could  
17 tell it wasn't **[inaudible]**. Good afternoon. My name  
18 is Allegra Fishel; thank you for very much for  
19 inviting us to speak today. I am the Executive  
20 Director and founder of the Gender Equality Law  
21 Center. Our mission is to break down barriers based  
22 on gender that limit individuals' ability to exceed  
23 economically and socially. I've also been a civil  
24 rights lawyer, litigating gender-based discrimination  
25

1 cases for over 25 years and have worked with many,  
2 many other lawyers also doing similar work.

3 I want to start out by really applauding  
4 the Women's Issues Committee and the sponsors of this  
5 bill for taking the broad, really leadership-oriented  
6 initiative. As someone who has litigated cases and  
7 understands how very hard it is to now provide  
8 discrimination... [crosstalk]

9 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: That's right.

10 ALLEGRA FISHEL: in courts of law, this  
11 is the next step towards eradicating structural  
12 racism and gender-based discrimination, and I feel  
13 really proud to be a New Yorker today.

14 I do have a couple of comments that we  
15 want to make, and I'm gonna try to race through them...  
16 [crosstalk]

17 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uhm-hm.

18 ALLEGRA FISHEL: as a lawyer it's very  
19 hard to contain your comments to three minutes. The  
20 first, as others have said, we believe that these  
21 initiatives should be broadened to include the  
22 intersectionality with other forms of discrimination  
23 -- disability, child care status, religion, national  
24 origin -- which all do intersection with race and  
25

1  
2 gender, and we think the scope of the law should be  
3 broadened. We also think it should be mandatory for  
4 all City agencies; we understand why you're starting  
5 with those relevant agencies, but it should be  
6 expanded; in addition to some of the others  
7 mentioned, the Department of Education should surely  
8 have extensive ongoing discrimination -- our cases so  
9 frequently involve bias in the classroom and we know  
10 that's the real place to make a difference with our  
11 young people.

12 I guess really, we are also very  
13 concerned about a real and robust budget to support  
14 these initiatives. We think, for instance, for bill  
15 1500, that the Committee should be expanded to be a  
16 larger committee; it should have real work  
17 obligations that should be able to retain and hire  
18 experts and consultants to design metrics to measure  
19 outcomes, to design implicit bias training; all of  
20 this will require the City to really put money behind  
21 its intent.

22 And I guess finally, with regard to  
23 money, because money is power and money creates  
24 change, in bill 1520 there really needs to be some  
25 serious thought put into that narrative portion of

1 the Mayor's report. Outcomes only tell us one thing;  
2 they tell us results, but what's gonna be [bell] in  
3 that narrative that leads to the Mayor's  
4 recommendations that interestingly enough is given in  
5 time for other entities to put in their two cents  
6 about budget is extremely important.

8 And just finally, we support the  
9 Resolution 542, particularly in today's political  
10 climate. New York should send a message to  
11 Washington that we support women's equality and  
12 women's justice. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you so much.  
14 Thank you all for your testimony today. We've made a  
15 lot of strides today and a lot of information has  
16 been gained, so we thank you so much.

17 We have our final panel... [background  
18 comment] [pause] Okay, we're gonna call up Ashe  
19 McGovern, Columbia Law School; Laura Redman, New York  
20 Lawyers for the Public Interest; Ruth Lowenkron, New  
21 York Lawyers for the Public Interest; Namasha  
22 Schelling, Day One. [pause] We'll begin from our  
23 left going to our right. Thank you.

24 LAURA REDMAN: Okay. Thank you. My name  
25 is Laura Redman; I am the Director of the Health

1  
2 Justice Program at the New York Lawyers for the  
3 Public Interest, but I actually come to you today to  
4 testify about my experiences as a Senior Legal  
5 Officer in the Enforcement and Public Duty Team of  
6 the Commission for Racial Equality (CRE) in London,  
7 England. I thank you, Chairperson Cumbo, for the  
8 opportunity to testify today and applaud the  
9 legislation related to race and gender impact  
10 assessments, cultural competency and implicit bias  
11 training, and adding race and gender to current  
12 assessment legislation. I, along with my colleague  
13 Ruth Lowenkron, who will speak shortly, encourage the  
14 inclusion of disability into these bills.

15 As a Senior Legal Officer at the CRE, my  
16 position was to enforce the Race Equality Duty, which  
17 was a "duty" or mandate placed on all public  
18 authorities to promote good race relations, eliminate  
19 racial discrimination and advance equality of  
20 opportunity. Additionally, specific entities were  
21 required to track employment data for greater  
22 transparency. The duty came into force in response  
23 to an investigation, which revealed deep  
24 institutional racism at the Metropolitan Policeforce.  
25 Shorter after I left my position and returned to the

1  
2 US in 2006, the equality duty was expanded to cover  
3 disability and gender, and in 2010, the duty was  
4 expanded to all, what are termed "equality strands"  
5 included in the Equality Act 2010 such as sexual  
6 orientation, gender identity, age, religion, and so  
7 on, and it also included an inclusion of human rights  
8 focus.

9           During my time at the CRE, the duty  
10 required all public authorities, from Parliament to  
11 local police forces and schools, to perform race  
12 equality impact assessments of all policies. The  
13 impact was demonstrable. The process was positive,  
14 but not always straightforward. For example, one of  
15 the first national policies to be revised after the  
16 race equality impact assessment was "Anti-Smacking"  
17 legislation, which declared a "smack" unlawful if it  
18 left a red mark on the skin. This was easily seen as  
19 violating the duty because, of course, a "smack" does  
20 not cause a red mark on a person of color, and the  
21 language was altered. More complicated from the  
22 national perspective were national policies regarding  
23 moving large government agencies outside of London in  
24 an effort to cut costs, but also to reinvigorate  
25

1  
2 struggling communities with new jobs and bring a more  
3 diverse workforce to these cities and towns.

4 Further, under the duty, every public  
5 authority was required to develop a race equality  
6 scheme that would be used to carry out these  
7 assessments and also review the entity's procedures.  
8 I reviewed Race Equality Schemes from local schools,  
9 fire departments, police authorities, planning  
10 bodies, and, of course, all the major federal  
11 agencies. Each scheme had to show that the entity  
12 had thought through their own structures and  
13 situation, and not solely use the same model. Some  
14 Schemes were well thought-out and highlighted easy  
15 solutions, such as schools considering language  
16 access for parent meetings or deconstructing a  
17 promotion policy.

18 As an entity, we had the power to enforce  
19 the duty through what I first called "finger wagging"  
20 letters, where we told them they had violated [bell]  
21 and second through litigation. What made all of this  
22 possible and not a hollow exercise is the advice I  
23 give you today; it's two-fold: first, detailed and  
24 expressed guidance on how to perform such  
25

1 assessments, in a substantive and useful manner; and  
2 enforcement and monitoring.

3  
4 I know I'm out of time, but seriously, I  
5 did this work; no one else in this chamber has done  
6 the work; let me get through it really, really  
7 quickly.

8 First, without detailed guidance and  
9 assistance, the exercise becomes hollow, I guarantee  
10 for you; it has so much potential, but users need  
11 help in how to navigate and incorporate these  
12 questions into their work. The training is really,  
13 really important and I am a co-chair of the HRA LGBTQ  
14 Working Group; I really applaud the training that's  
15 been done there, but it needs that. Second, however,  
16 without monitoring and required reporting, the  
17 exercise of the assessments and the training becomes  
18 hollow... [interpose]

19 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: I am so sorry...

20 LAURA REDMAN: I know.

21 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: because we're 12  
22 minutes over 1:00...

23 LAURA REDMAN: 'Kay.

24 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: and we have another  
25 panel after this one.

1                   LAURA REDMAN: Oh goodness; I'm sorry.

2                   CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: I'm in a lot of  
3  
4 trouble now.

5                   LAURA REDMAN: I will just say... the last  
6 thing I'll say is I really encourage you to read my  
7 testimony, because I support my colleague's inclusion  
8 of disability, but one of the things we saw is; the  
9 more things we put in, the more watered down it  
10 became and thus it becomes very important that you  
11 still address each of these individual issues and  
12 their intersections, and that's the only way it can  
13 be effective. So I encourage you to read my  
14 testimony and I'm happy... [crosstalk]

15                   CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you.

16                   LAURA REDMAN: to answer other questions.

17                   CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Certainly will.  
18 Thank you. Next testimony.

19                   RUTH LOWENKRON: Good afternoon, thank  
20 you so much. I'm Ruth Lowenkron; I'm the Director of  
21 the Disability Justice Program at New York Lawyers  
22 for the Public Interest, and as my colleague  
23 foreshadowed, my testimony is both to applaud the  
24 work that this Committee has done and to, of course,  
25 endorse the proposed legislation that's in front of

1 the Committee today, but to also ask that disability  
2 be included in it. And I am grateful that this is  
3 done initially by the Women's Committee; as women, we  
4 look out for everybody; we are especially concerned  
5 about the intersectionality -- that word has been  
6 used a lot today -- of course, we are not just one  
7 type of woman; we are women of color, we are women  
8 who have disabilities, and so on, and so it's hugely  
9 important for that perspective, but also again,  
10 because women, we look out for everyone and I think  
11 it's really important to include disability.

12  
13 If you take a look at the statistics of  
14 people with disability, first of all, they're not a  
15 small part of our population, and I think that's  
16 really important to note; you are addressing issues  
17 affecting over 11% of the population, by some of the  
18 most recent census statistics, so that's critical.  
19 You're also addressing a population that has already  
20 experienced intense discrimination over time. So if  
21 you take a look at some of the statistics in my  
22 report, you see that 31.1% of people with  
23 disabilities live in poverty; only 33.4% of people  
24 with disabilities are employed at all, and of that  
25 small, pathetic statistic, only 20.5% are employed

1 full-time. This is very clearly as a result of  
2 discrimination.  
3

4 And since I am pushing that we include  
5 disability, I will say something that I'm not asked  
6 to say, and that is a comparison, but I think it's  
7 important; we are concerned about the issues  
8 affecting women and these issues affecting persons of  
9 color, absolutely, but if you take a look at a  
10 Housing and Urban Development study I site here, they  
11 have clearly set out that there is more adverse  
12 treatment against persons with disabilities than  
13 against persons of color. So it's an astounding  
14 statistic and it's one that I absolutely think needs  
15 to be addressed here.

16 And as my colleague pointed out, in  
17 London, where they did this, they did take a look at  
18 the statistics, assessed the data, for people with  
19 disabilities. Article 31 of the UN Convention on the  
20 Rights of Persons with Disabilities -- I will add,  
21 another Convention that this country has not  
22 **[inaudible]** to endorse, and one that I strongly  
23 encourage this Committee [bell] to think further  
24 about -- they have also, of course, called for  
25 gathering of these statistics.

1  
2 So in conclusion, I would say please add  
3 people with disabilities and if it can't absolutely  
4 be added right now; please, at least make sure that  
5 while we're in the data gathering part that we are  
6 gathering the statistics and at least have those  
7 statistics to work with at some later point, and I  
8 say that especially because I endorse the last -- and  
9 what so many others have -- and that is that this  
10 should be also broader to include all agencies and  
11 also to make it meaningful, it should be a well-  
12 funded bill. So thank you very much.

13 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you. Thank  
14 you, and that's a very important perspective in terms  
15 of those with disabilities, because often they don't  
16 have the representation at many of these hearings and  
17 meetings and so you speaking forward for individuals  
18 of our communities with disabilities is so important  
19 and should certainly be a part of this legislation or  
20 an expanded version moving forward. Thank you.

21 RUTH LOWENKRON: Thank you so much.

22 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uhm-hm. Next panel  
23 [sic].

24 NAMASHA SCHILLING: My name is Namasha  
25 Schilling and I am the Program and Communications

1  
2 Coordinator at Day One. Day One is the only  
3 organization in New York City solely devoted to the  
4 issue of dating violence among young people. I'm  
5 just gonna skip to recommendations; keep this short  
6 and sweet.

7 Promoting gender and racial equity is a  
8 critical part of violence prevention. We applaud the  
9 City Council for trying to measure and address gender  
10 and racial inequality in New York City.

11 As these measures move forward, we would  
12 also like to stress the importance of the following  
13 things:

14 1. Including annual clear and concise  
15 goals in The Gender and Racial Equity Action Plan  
16 along with a system of accountability.

17 2. The Gender and Racial Equity Committee  
18 would benefit from the inclusion of a diverse group  
19 of nonprofits who work on various intersectional  
20 issues affecting women in the city.

21 3. Employee trainings provided for City  
22 agencies will be most successful if they are created  
23 by, or at least guided by, nonprofit experts in the  
24 field that are already doing these sorts of  
25 trainings.

1  
2 4. The Annual Report would benefit from  
3 an intersectional analysis: any examination of our  
4 institutions must be conducted with a close look at  
5 the intersecting identifies of their users,  
6 acknowledging race and gender identity but also  
7 language access, along with immigration and  
8 socioeconomic status as well.

9 Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you, and I  
11 appreciate the insertion of language access as well;  
12 that brings yet another perspective in terms of how  
13 to make the information more transparent and  
14 accessible to more people. Thank you.

15 NAMASHA SCHILLING: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: And the short and  
17 sweet was appreciated. [laugh]

18 NAMASHA SCHILLING: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Next panelist.

20 NAMASHA SCHILLING: Great.

21 ASHE MCGOVERN: I'll also try and be  
22 shortish. So my name is Ashe McGovern and I'm the  
23 Legislative and Policy Director of the Public  
24 Rights/Private Conscience Project at Columbia Law  
25 School. We're a think tank focused on bringing

1  
2 legal, policy and academic expertise to bear on the  
3 multiple ways in which religious liberty rights  
4 conflict with and undermines other fundamental  
5 rights, including rights for LGBTQ communities, those  
6 seeking access to reproductive healthcare, religious  
7 minorities, and communities of color.

8 On behalf of the Public Rights/Private  
9 Conscience Project, I am here to support the spirit  
10 and intent of bill 1512 and to express our particular  
11 concerns regarding who this bill will reach and who  
12 it might leave behind.

13 First, we believe strongly that City  
14 contractors, in addition to City agencies, should be  
15 subject to oversight, accountability and cultural  
16 competency training. As the primary providers of  
17 many City-funded services, it is just as crucial for  
18 private contractors... [interpose]

19 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Uhm-hm.

20 ASHE MCGOVERN: to be trained in  
21 discrimination, implicit bias and cultural competency  
22 as it is for City agencies. As you know, City  
23 contractors provide vital social and human services  
24 to New York City's residents, particularly to low-  
25 income communities; the Council should be sure to

1 address this concern. As you know, probably,  
2 according to the Mayor's Office of Contract Services,  
3 in 2016, the City agreed to fund nearly 4500 human  
4 services contracts valued at \$4.3 billion. So this  
5 is a really important issue.  
6

7 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Right.

8 ASHE MCGOVERN: LGBTQ people and people  
9 of color, by virtue of being more likely to live in  
10 poverty than their peers, benefit significantly from  
11 City-funded programs and services and are of  
12 particular concern to us. These communities  
13 experience a heightened vulnerability to  
14 discrimination, harassment and mistreatment in  
15 accessing these services through contractors, and in  
16 many areas of their lives.

17 Second, as a think tank focused on  
18 religious liberty and religious exemption, we believe  
19 strongly that all contractors, including faith-based  
20 contractors, should receive cultural competency  
21 training and oversight. There is a particular need  
22 for training and oversight of faith-based contractors  
23 due to their unique legal status. The New York City  
24 Human Rights Law prohibits discrimination on a number  
25 of several bases, but it also has a limited exemption

1  
2 for religious institutions and organizations that  
3 allows them to prefer co-religionists in hiring,  
4 firing and housing accommodations and to take such  
5 action as is calculated by their organization to  
6 promote particular religious principles. In New  
7 York, Courts have interpreted this provision in  
8 conflicting ways, making it essential that faith-  
9 based contractors receive clear guidance and training  
10 on their responsibility to provide nondiscriminatory  
11 and culturally competent services to New Yorkers.

12 While the religious exemption clearly  
13 does not permit faith-based contractors to  
14 discriminate in the provision of City-funded  
15 services, its application to employment  
16 discrimination within the organization is less clear,  
17 and it's very important for this Council to address.  
18 And I cited to some cases [bell] that I won't discuss  
19 in detail here, but I hope that you'll take a look at  
20 those.

21 The City has a responsibility to ensure  
22 that organizations that receive public funds to  
23 provide essential services are providing those  
24 services in a nondiscriminatory manner that reflects  
25

1  
2 the values and principles codified in City Human  
3 Rights Law and are prioritized by this Council.

4 Finally... [crosstalk]

5 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you.

6 ASHE MCGOVERN: one very brief

7 **[inaudible]**... Finally, all agencies should be covered,  
8 and that feels like an important point to address as  
9 well. Thank you... [crosstalk]

10 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Your point in terms  
11 of expanding this even beyond the agencies in terms  
12 of contracts...

13 ASHE MCGOVERN: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: and contract  
15 agreements and that sort of thing and all of those  
16 that are receiving City funding also expands this, so  
17 each panel has really brought something new and  
18 different to the table that we're going to continue  
19 to analyze and look at in terms of strengthening this  
20 package of legislation or also creating additional  
21 legislation to incorporate the changes that you all  
22 have brought forward. Thank you so much.

23 ASHE MCGOVERN: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: And our final panel  
25 -- Deborah Dickerson, Picture the Homeless; and

1 Sobeida Cruz, 100 Hispanic Women, Women for CEDAW.

2 Alright, I think we know where to begin. Please  
3 reintroduce yourself and you can begin your  
4 testimony.  
5

6 SOBEIDA CRUZ: Sobeida Cruz, Vice...

7 [crosstalk]

8 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you.

9 SOBEIDA CRUZ: Vice President of 100  
10 Hispanic Women and also part of the Coalition of  
11 CEDAW.

12 So I want to applaud our president of our  
13 City Council, Melissa Viverito and I'd also like to  
14 applaud you for taking on... [crosstalk]

15 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you.

16 SOBEIDA CRUZ: this cause...

17 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you.

18 SOBEIDA CRUZ: We talked about these  
19 issues back in the 19th century and here we are  
20 today, in 2017... [crosstalk]

21 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Right.

22 SOBEIDA CRUZ: still plowing and still  
23 talking about the same issues.

24 I represent The 100 Hispanic Women; our  
25 mission is to inspire Latinas to maximize their

1 strengths and potential in order to become equal  
2 partners in an empowered world of equal opportunity  
3 with equal justice, recognition, respect, and  
4 dignity.  
5

6 We are in support of all the legislation  
7 and the resolution. We are committed supports of the  
8 efforts being brought forward by the New York City  
9 for CEDAW Coalition. Women's rights go hand in hand  
10 with human rights. We should all be provided the  
11 same access to education and not just any education,  
12 but quality education, as stipulated in article  
13 employment, economic parity and the pursuit of  
14 happiness. To ensure these rights we must be  
15 guaranteed access to employment and compensation  
16 opportunities we have been excluded from; this being  
17 most pronounced in communities of color where some of  
18 the research indicates that hispanas earn 54 cents to  
19 every dollar earned by a white male in the United  
20 States. What does that say to the rest of the world?

21 We believe that once access has been  
22 attained in all parts of New York City, we will begin  
23 to see the impact in our city in the vast improvement  
24 of all measurable outcomes, whether that be in health  
25 care, higher educational attainment and economic

1 expansion simply by allowing access and no longer  
2 tolerating exclusion. 100 Hispanic Women supports  
3 the call for a holistic and comprehensive Bill of  
4 Rights for women and girls based on the principles in  
5 CEDAW. This will include a comprehensive gender  
6 analysis of all City programs and services and public  
7 review and feedback mechanism.  
8

9 We appreciate your attention to this most  
10 important issue that will build just and  
11 compassionate communities in New York City. Thank  
12 you very much.

13 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you so much for  
14 your testimony. Thank you so much to everyone that  
15 has testified today; so many different perspectives;  
16 so many dynamic men and women who have testified here  
17 today. I thank you for remaining here during the  
18 entire time, I thank you. This is going to be a  
19 powerful legislative package when it's finally voted  
20 out of Committee; I'm certain that the members of the  
21 City Council share your enthusiasm and we are  
22 certainly going to make "herstory," because as many  
23 of you said, we've been talking about these things  
24 from the beginning of time and we need to break that  
25 cycle and begin some new conversations so that we can

1  
2 begin to move forward. So thank you all again; this  
3 is wonderful "herstory" and like I said in the  
4 beginning, the Women's March that happened in the  
5 beginning of the year was not simply just a march;  
6 every single month it has been backed by powerhouse,  
7 hard-hitting legislation that is breaking the glass  
8 ceiling and is providing resources and opportunities,  
9 and most importantly, fairness and equality for  
10 women, men, children, the LGBT community, those with  
11 disabilities, and so many others. Thank you so much.

12 [applause] [background comments]

13 [gavel]

14 And this meeting is adjourned.

15 [background comments]  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 25, 2017