

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

----- X

March 29, 2017
Start: 10:50 a.m.
Recess: 11:19 a.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E:
David Greenfield
Chairperson

- COUNCIL MEMBERS:
- Brad Landers
 - Jumaane D. Williams
 - Andrew Cohen
 - Peter A. Koo
 - Debbie Rosen
 - Rafael Salamanca
 - Ben Kallos
 - Mark Treyger
 - Annabel Palma
 - Ruben Wills
 - Rosie Mendez
 - Antonio Reynoso
 - Inez Barron
 - Donovan Richards
 - Vincent Gentile

1
2
3 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Good morning
4 Brad Landers. Good morning Jumaane Williams.
5 Good morning Andy Cohen. Good morning Peter
6 Koo. Good morning Debbie Rose. Good morning
7 Rafael Salamanca. Thank you the rest of you
8 for --what? I'm going to acknowledge you in a
9 minute. I was pointing out the people who were
10 actually making noise first.

11 [off mic]

12 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Oh, you
13 have been using that for years. Do you have a
14 note to prove that condition? Okay. Very
15 good. Thank you very much, thank you very
16 much. Good morning Council Member Kallos.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Can you say
18 poke your toe?

19 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: No, we
20 don't do request here in the Land Use
21 Committee. Good morning Council Member
22 Treyger. Good morning Council Member Palma.
23 Good morning Council Member Wills and good
24 morning Council Member Mendez. How are you?
25 Wonderful. All right. We are here relatively
bright and early by Land Use standards because

1
2 we are going to be having an additional hearing
3 afterwards on the budget. It is important to
4 note that these are two separate hearings. So,
5 you need to vote at this hearing and then you
6 need to return in some fashion for the next
7 hearing in order to be present for both of
8 these hearings. I want to welcome everyone
9 today. My name is David Greenfield and I the
10 Council Member from the 44th Council District
11 and privileged to serve as Chair of the Land
12 Use. I want to welcome my esteemed colleagues
13 who are members of the Committee. I would also
14 like to recognize Chair Donovan Richards, Chair
15 Peter Koo and Chair Rafael Salamanca for the
16 leadership and work with Zoning, Landmarks and
17 Planning Subcommittee respectively. Today we
18 will be voting on LU #579, 580, 581, 582 and
19 583 all landmark application pursuant to
20 Section 3020 of the New York City charter and
21 Chapter 3 of Title 25, the administrative code
22 to the City of New York. We will be voting to
23 approve LU 579, the designation of the Young
24 Men's Christian Association, West 135th Street
25 Branch, now known as the Jackie Robinson YMCA

1 Youth Center as a historic landmark. According
2 to the LPC, the Italian Renaissance Revival
3 style building is one of the first African
4 American YMCA buildings constructed in New York
5 City and became the center of intellectual and
6 social life for African Americans in the first
7 half of the 20th century. The building is
8 notable for its strong association with many
9 prominent literary, artistic, political and
10 sports figures including Paul Robison, James
11 Weldon Johnson, Alain Locke, John Henrik
12 Clarke, Claude McKay, Langston Hughes, Richard
13 Wright, Ralph Ellison and Jackie Robinson.
14 Council Member Perkins supports this
15 designation. We will be voting to approve LU
16 580, the designation of the United Palace also
17 known as Loew's 175th Street Theater as a
18 historic landmark. This building located at
19 4140 Broadway in the Washington Heights
20 neighborhood of Manhattan is according to the
21 LPC, one of a select handful of venues built by
22 Loew's as it "wonder theaters" which were among
23 the most lavish ever constructed in New York
24 City. Council Member Rodriguez supports this
25

1 designation. We will be voting to approve LU
2 581, the designation of the Protestant Reformed
3 Dutch Church of Flushing also known as the
4 Brown Street Community Church as a historic
5 landmark. The building located at 143-11
6 Roosevelt Avenue is an excellent example of
7 Romanesque revival style with an especially
8 notable prominent corner tower, decorative
9 brick work, stone details, arched openings and
10 opalescent stained glass windows. In fact,
11 several of the windows were designed by Agnes
12 Fairchild Northrup of Tiffany Studios. The
13 church denominations roots are linked to the
14 founding of New Netherland also known as the
15 Dutch Colony. Information provided to us
16 thanks again to the Landmarks Preservation
17 Commission. The Landmarks Subcommittee Chair
18 Peter Koo also represents this particular
19 church and he supports this designation. We
20 will be voting on a resolution to disapprove LU
21 582, the Lakeman Cortelyou-Taylor House located
22 at 2286 Richmond Road in Staten Island in
23 Council Member Matteo's District. A yes vote
24 just to be clear will be a vote to disapprove
25

1 the designation of this building as a historic
2 landmark. So you can still vote aye on all.
3 We will be voting to approve LU 593, the
4 designation of the first floor interiors of the
5 New York City charter of United Nations Hotel
6 located at One and Two United Nations Plaza as
7 interior landmarks. The hotel lobbies are
8 considered important examples by the LPC of
9 late 20th Century modern and post-modern
10 design. Council Member Garodnick supports this
11 designation. Are there any questions or
12 remarks on any of these applications? Hearing
13 none, I want to welcome Council Member Reynoso
14 and I'd like to welcome Council Member Andy
15 Cohen upon joining the bearded caucus. Council
16 Member Salamanca and I are very pleased to have
17 you join our caucus. We have meetings on
18 alternate Wednesday in the basement and
19 refreshments are provided. We will now move on
20 to a vote. Council Member Wills is like how do
21 I get on that. You've just gotta grow a beard.
22 It's pretty simple. In accordance with the
23 recommendation of the subcommittees to approve
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE LAND USE

LU 579, 580, 581 and 593 and to disapprove LU 582, will the Clerk please call the roll.

CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk, roll call vote Committee on Land Use. Chair Greenfield?

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: I vote aye on all.

CLERK: Palma?

COUNCIL MEMBER: Aye.

CLERK: Mendez?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

CLERK: Koo?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

CLERK: Lander?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [off mic - inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council Member Lander to explain his vote.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [off mic - inaudible]

CLERK: Rose?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

CLERK: Williams?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Wills?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [INAUDIBLE]

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Sure,
welcome to abstend or you can go with the
Chair's brilliant recommendation and vote aye
on all. No pressure. And, we can invite you
to join the bearded caucus on alternate
Wednesday in the basement and get free
refreshments.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Fair
enough.

CLERK: Cohen?

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

CLERK: Kallos?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission
to explain my vote?

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council
Member Kallos with his very nice new haircut to
explain his vote.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you.

I will say that I get the Justin Trudeau
reference much less with shorter hair. So I
vote aye on all with the exception of -- sorry,

1
2 I vote aye on all. I do want to express --
3 explain my vote on Land Use #582. I am
4 generally a supporter of landmarks. In this
5 case, the City is a very big place and as local
6 members we rely on the expertise of our
7 colleagues. In this case, this landmark
8 despite a lot of work from the LPC to try to
9 work with the landlord to accept the landmarks
10 designation was not able to convince the
11 landlord that this was a good thing to happen
12 and at the same time the council member was
13 also against this and Council Member Matteo has
14 also given an assurance that if at any point
15 the landlord chooses to try to sell the
16 property or to engage in any behavior that
17 would harm the landmark in any way, shape or
18 form that he would personally put in a request
19 for evaluation and move forward with the land-
20 marking of the site so in deference to my
21 colleague and their expertise, I vote with
22 them.

23 CLERK: Reynoso?
24
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I am going
3 to vote aye on all with the exception of Land
4 Use Item 582 and I vote no on that.

5 CLERK: Treyger?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

7 CLERK: Salamanca?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: [off mic
9 - inaudible]

10 CLERK: Council Member Barron?

11 [cross talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Yeah, I
14 want to correct -- yes, I thought I was
15 supporting Matteo by voting no. I vote aye on
16 all.

17 CLERK: By a vote of 11 in the
18 affirmative, 0 in the negative and 1
19 abstention, all items have been adopted with
20 Land Use Item 582 -- excuse me, excuse me.
21 Revision. By a vote of 12 in the affirmative,
22 0 in the negative and 1 abstention, all items
23 have been adopted on today's agenda with Land
24 Use Item 582 being adopted by a vote of 11 in
25

1
2 the affirmative, 0 in the negative and s
3 abstentions.

4 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Just to be
5 clear folks, we are going to keep the vote open
6 for 15 minutes. We are then going to close
7 this hearing. We will then open a new hearing
8 on budgetary land use issues and so if you are
9 going to leave we ask that you please come back
10 in 15 or so minutes and we look forward to see
11 you then and thank you.

12 [Pause]

13 CLERK: Continuation roll call,
14 Committee on Land Use?

15 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council
16 Member Richards?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I vote
18 aye. Thank you, Mr. Chairman for your patience
19 with me.

20 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.

21 CLERK: Final vote, Committee on
22 Land Use, all items have been adopted in
23 today's agenda by a vote of 13 in the
24 affirmative, 0 in the negative and 1 abstention
25 with Land Use Item 582 being approved by a vote

1
2 of 12 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and
3 2 abstentions. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council
5 Member Rodriguez has asked that I note for the
6 record once again that he is in support of the
7 application to landmark the church in his
8 district. Unfortunately he is uptown in a
9 meeting and will not be able to make it down
10 here. We will now conclude, we will conclude
11 by finalizing the vote count and then we will
12 close out the hearing and start the new budget
13 hearing. Clerk, after you.

14 CLERK: Final revision on the vote,
15 Committee on Land Use. All items have been
16 adopted by a vote of 14 in the affirmative, 0
17 in the negative and 1 abstention with Land Use
18 Item 582 being adopted by a vote of 12 in the
19 affirmative, 0 in the negative and 2
20 abstentions.

21 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.
22 This concludes the Land Use Committee for March
23 29, 2017. This hearing is hereby adjourned.

24 [gavel]
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council

Member Vincent Gentile has decided to use his card as the most senior member of the New York City Council to reopen the hearing so that he can vote. As a courtesy to him, we will allow him to vote.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: It is one of the things on the short list that you can do as a senior member.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: I think it might be the only thing.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: The only thing I can do as a senior member, yes. Thank you very much, Mr. Chairman, and I vote aye on all.

CLERK: All items on today Land Use calendar have been adopted by a vote of 15 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 1 abstention with Land Use Item 582 being adopted by a vote of 14 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 2 abstentions.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: We mean this for real this time. This concludes the

Land Use Committee Hearing for March 29, 2017.

This hearing is adjourned.

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: We invite whoever is testifying from the Landmarks Preservation Commission to please sit at the dais as we prepare the tape to begin the next hearing. Thank you very much.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is no interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 25, 2017