

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

March 28, 2016

Start: 10:11 a.m.

Recess: 3:03 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

DANIEL R. GARODNICK
COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES
JAMES VACCA
MARGARET S. CHIN
STEPHEN T. LEVIN
DEBORAH L. ROSE
JAMES G. VAN BRAMER
DAVID KELLER G. GREENFIELD
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES
CARLOS MENCHACA
I. DANEK MILLER
ANTONIO REYNOSO

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Polly Trottenberg
Commissioner of New York City Department of
Transportation

Joseph Jarrin
Executive Deputy Commissioner for Strategic and
Agency Services

Rebecca Zack
Acting Assistant Commissioner of
Intergovernmental and Community Affairs

Michael Chubak
Chief Financial Officer for New York City Transit

David Keller
Senior Deputy Director for MTA Budget

Stephanie DeLisle
Director of MTA Capital Funding

Meera Joshi
Commissioner and Chair of the New York City Taxi
And Limousine Commission

Dianna Pegnetti
Chief of Enforcement

Eric McClure
Executive Director of StreetPAC

Julie Kite
Policy and Research Manager for Transportation
Alternatives

Nick Sifuentes
Deputy Director of the Riders Alliance

Reverend Clayton Brooks
Director of Advocacy at Covenant House

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Melissa Del Valle Ortiz
Tenant Leader of Sunset Parks Project Based
Section 8 Housing for 411

Kiya Vega-Hutchens
Climate Justice Policy Organizer at UPROSE

Rich Conroy
Director of Education at Bike New York

Verna Duberry
Bedford Stuy Restoration

Omar Arias
Supporter of Citi Bike

Shaquana Boykin
New York City Public Housing Resident and Citi
Bike Member

Jeff Orlick
Resident of Queens, New York

David Beier
President of Committee for Taxi Safety

Mark Wiltshire
Community Engagement Associate at Per Scholas

Kweli Campbell
Citi Bike Member from Brooklyn, New York

Joanna Oltman Smith
Safe Streets Advocate in New York

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good morning

everyone and welcome to the city council

transportation hearing on the Fiscal Year 2018

Preliminary Budget and FY '17 Mayor's Management

Report. My name is Ydanis Rodriguez and I am the

Chair of this committee. We are joined by Council

Member Vacca and Menchaca. Today we are here to

discuss the budget of the Department of... Department

of Transportation, the Taxi and Limousine Commission

and the Metropolitan Transportation Commission.

Through this process, we hope to finish with, with a

budget that reflects our New York values, a budget

that is progressive, responsible and ensures all New

Yorkers have the... an opportunity to succeed

regardless of background or beliefs. We know that

recent conversations in Washington has sought to

humble cities across the country including our own,

they aim to cut services to, to our most vulnerable

and deprive us of important resources for standing up

for hard working immigrants coming here to find a

better life. The budget we forward this year must

reflect our desire to lift up those in need and bring

equity to communities across the five boroughs. I

stand ready and committed to support this goal and I know my colleagues in government feel the same especially with the leadership that we have in Mayor DE Blasio and Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

Transportation is unique in its ability to be a social equalizer, the ability for residents to move with ease from... ease from home to work, school, or doctor's office, museums, and more is what sets us apart, apart from cities across the country. We are so fortunate to have networks of roads, rails, bike lanes and soon over our water, water ways easing access to these great services for more New Yorkers can help boost our residents and their ability to compete in a growing economy. I'm eager to hear from our commissioner from the Department of Transportation, later on from Taxi and Limousine Commissioner as well as from the Head of the MTA, New York City Transit about what we are doing and what more we can do to move our New Yorkers in more and faster ways. We will start by hearing testimony from the City's Department of Transportation followed by the MTA, the Taxi and Limousine Commission and the public. The DOT Preliminary Operating Budget is for FY '18 is approximately 957 million along with 2.8

1 billion for the Departments Capital Program. We are
2 interested to hear today about the DOT's plans for
3 renovations to, to important infrastructures, the
4 ongoing progress being made with Vision Zero already
5 signed project and how the city is tackling some
6 persistent challenges when it comes to congestion and
7 road repairs. We are also interested in hearing how
8 discussions are going when it comes to expanding the
9 city's bike share program. As has been discussed and
10 majority of the council members are supporting of
11 public funding for a system growing in popularity
12 that brings an affordable efficient and healthy
13 option. In order to keep expanding into more areas
14 underserved by our public transit system. According
15 to a recent report by NYU Rudin Center we have
16 learned that bike share is ride... ridden most, mostly
17 by New Yorkers that is hoped to solve the last mile
18 problem when transit doesn't reach and it is
19 unfortunately remained... and it unfortunately remains
20 mostly concentrated in the city's more fluent areas.
21 Following in the footsteps about every city in
22 America providing public funding for this public good
23 can bring greater equity to the network and expand is
24 reached into more communities across the city. The
25

DOT has done a great job of growing our city's network of bike lanes including protected bike lanes so that more riders are safer from the speeding drivers. The goal of increasing the number of, of cyclists in our city are important and expanding city bike will go a long way towards achieving them. I urge the administration to get these in the budget this year so that we do not see a pause in plans for expansion. Following the DOT we will hear from the MTA whose operating budget for calling of year 2017 its balance and whose recently bought on 2015-2019 capital program it stands at 29 billion dollars however we remain concerned that recent changes in the state's proposed budget have removed 67 million dollars originally expected from the state commitment to replace funding for originally supporter by the mandate... amend payroll mobility tax. This important funding could have served to blunt the cost of... to riders from recent fear in increase or account for the uncertainty we face in Washington. We hope to hear from the agency if conversation with the governor's office has been taking place to ensure that this reduction is restored in the final budget as our riders are counting on it. It is my view that

the MTA can in short take advantage of, of new or improved revenue extremes to ensure a more sustainable budget and to cover the cost of mounting deaths with greater ease. Aside from the move New York Plan... sorry, the MTA can also look to its extensive real estate holding for development. Additionally, I have proposed developing a public private partnership in which private partners can adopt an extension... a station to cover the cost of station maintenance while returning as close safe advertising rights in this space. Other ideas include additional digital advertising and greater oversight of our capital projects to ensure fewer calls and a schedule of runs. We can and must do more to ensure budget and net balance on the backs of riders. I'm glad to hear that the MTA has begun to use this time build on its most recent construction project for station renovations. This is a proper method in saving time and funding and can ensure project that deliver more efficiently. I also hope the state legislature can continue to support this important procurement method and expand their authority to our city agency to use it as well. We are also interested in hearing from plans are coming along with some of

the MTA's major projects including Eastside Access Phase two or the 2nd Avenue subway, the train station access project and efforts to open new metro north station in the Bronx. Finally, we would like to hear about plans for a pilot program to modernize a troubled access, access ride program which cost the MTA half a billion dollars per year. I want to reiterate my call for the... to the MTA to ensure that yellow and green cars are considered for this pilot program as they remain the only accessible for hire vehicles on our streets crucial, crucial to our disabled riders who often rely on access ride services. Following the MTA we will hear from the Taxi and Limousine Commission whose preliminary budget sits at 58.2 million dollars for... in FY '18. We hope to hear about plans to implement the citywide accessible dispatch system and how, how efforts to issue a street hail liberate license for the outer boroughs are progressing. We are also interested in the commissions efforts to enforce against illegal... illegally operating vehicles on our streets, a perpetual concern for all TSE licensed drivers. I want to reinforce my earlier statement about the importance for the planned access ride pilots program

under discussion to include accessible TSE licensed vehicle rather than simply relying upon a non-accessible vehicle that will not serve the need of access ride users. Finally, we would like to hear about the commissions progress in getting more accessible vehicles on the road so that no New Yorkers are left behind in our transportation system. Lastly, an issue that has been at the forefront of my policy agenda is ensuring that this budget include funding for what is widely known as Fair right... Fares. This effort to support our poorest residents with a lifeline they need to move about, find work, attend classes and more is not only noble, it is necessary and the city has the opportunity to lead this initiative. We cannot continue to leave our most financially vulnerable residents disconnected from the service they are... they need the most. I know many of my colleagues share this sentiment and I want to work with all of... all of them and as also to work together with our friend, Mayor De Blasio who has said that he believed in the merit of this initiative. Now before we hear from the DOT let me make a, a moment to thank my committee staff, Shema Overture and Brandon Weise from the finance team,

Jonathan Mosarano, Emily Rooney as well as my staff
Jose Lewis, Chief of Staff Jose Lewis and my
legislative communication, Russell Murphy. Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Do you affirm to tell
the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
in your testimony before this committee and to
respond honestly to council member questions?

POLLY TROTTEBERG: You ready for me?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: If you don't mind
let me also recognize the other members who are here;
Lander, Chin and Rose.

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Okay, thank you Mr.
Chairman. Good morning Chairman Rodriguez and members
of the Transportation Committee. I'm Polly
Trottenberg, Commissioner of the New York City
Department of Transportation. With me today are
Joseph Jarrin, Executive Deputy Commissioner for
Strategic and Agency Services and Rebecca Zack,
Acting Assistant Commissioner of Intergovernmental
and Community Affairs. I am pleased to be here today
on behalf of Mayor Bill De Blasio testifying on DOT's
Fiscal Year 2018 Preliminary Budget and our Ten-Year
Capital Strategy. The Mayor's FY '18 Preliminary
Budget allocates resources for critical needs such as

protecting public safety, improving schools, increasing housing affordability, and investing in infrastructure. While maintaining unprecedented reserves, this budget makes targeted investments, some of which I will be talking about today. At the same time, the Mayor's Preliminary Budget also identifies 1.1 billion in savings with a goal of 500 million more in additional savings for the Executive budget. For DOT this builds on our agency's accomplishments over the last three years. It will enable us to continue executing our core goals of pursuing Vision Zero, enhancing mobility, and maintaining and investing in our infrastructure. While I walk through DOT's proposed budget this morning, I want to highlight our growing list of accomplishments over the past few years, as well as acknowledge the challenges we face as we grow. I'll also discuss our continuing efforts to find efficiencies and make the most out of every taxpayer dollar, whether we're rolling out neighborhood safety improvements or executing major infrastructure projects. DOT's workload is being expanded by two major forces. First, as our city continues to grow we are making historic investments in infrastructure,

with a focus on Vision Zero and state of good repair.

To do that we're upping our game, both in the sheer

volume of capital projects we are delivering and the

pace of all our work. For the first time ever we

committed over 1.1 billion from our capital plan for

two consecutive years. And the city has proposed a

10-year capital plan of 17.2 billion for DOT, for a

total increase of 7.2 billion under this Mayor. This

almost doubles the size of our plan for street

reconstruction from 1.7 billion to 3.1 billion,

allowing DOT to build out more street safety projects

and increases our plan for bridge reconstruction and

rehabilitation by 88 percent from 4.9 billion to 9.2

billion. And this past year we completed 105 street

improvement projects, doubled the pre-Vision Zero

annual average, and installed a record 18.5 miles of

protected bike lanes, nearly triple the pre-Vision

Zero average. The second factor in our growth in this

age of social media, with easy to use tools like web

forms and increased public engagement, we've seen

exponential growth in the number of incoming requests

of all kinds from the public and elected officials.

As an example, after typically receiving about 1,000

to 1,200 signal requests annually in the pre-Vision

Zero years, DOT now receives over 2,300 requests annually, a figure that continues to grow by about five percent each year. Each of these requests necessitates labor-intensive surveys and assessments by our engineering staff. At the same time, other, other public requests, whether they come by 311 or through our correspondence unit, have all grown dramatically as well. When it comes to participatory budgeting, in 2011, when the program began, just four Council Members participated. This year that number had grown to 31. The chance to educate and engage delegates about DOT's process is valuable, and of course we appreciate the public support and funding that projects receive. But here again, while the Participatory Budgeting process has improved every year, the sheer number of projects DOT must now scope and coordinate with delegates and Council Members to place on the ballots has skyrocketed. This year DOT conducted approximately 190 proposed project reviews. DOT operates and manages a transportation network that New Yorkers and visitors use each day; roads, sidewalks, bridges, bike lanes, street signs, signals, streetlighting, and the Staten Island Ferry. As the city's third largest capital agency, DOT's

proposed 17, 17.2-billion-dollar Capital Plan for Fiscal Year '17 through '27 includes; 9.2 billion for bridge reconstruction and rehabilitation, five billion for street reconstruction and resurfacing, 1.3 billion for sidewalk and pedestrian ramp repair and reconstruction, 704 million for the Staten Island Ferry, 668 million for streetlights and signals, and 399 million for the facilities and equipment needed to support DOT operations. Additionally, in DOT's FY '18 Expense Budget, the Mayor is proposing 957 million for operations, including some critical new funding; 252 million for traffic operations, including signals, streetlights, and parking; 206 million for roadway maintenance, 201 million for DOT operations, including sidewalk management and inspection; 104 million for bridge maintenance and inspection, 103 million for transportation planning and management, including installation of street signs and roadway markings, and 91 million for ferry operations and maintenance. I want to thank you Chairman Rodriguez and members of the committee for your leadership and support on Vision Zero. I was proud to stand with you Mr. Chairman and the Mayor at the foot of the Brooklyn Bridge last week as we

kicked off the spring construction season. It's hard to believe that three years ago this week, we were hosting the first Vision Zero Town Halls across the City, hearing from our constituents and setting ambitious goals. In the last three years, we've seen a 23 percent in traffic fatalities on our City streets and we're bucking the national trend, where fatalities tragically climbed 14 percent in the same period. New York's progress is a strong indication that our strategy is making a real difference and I'm grateful for our partnership, it has saved lives. DOT's proposed Expense and Capital Budgets include an unprecedented ten-year 2.4-billion-dollar commitment to Vision Zero. This includes 495 million in new capital funds and 7.2 million in new expense funds in the current fiscal year, rising to 21.1 million by fiscal year '21. This funding will enable us to better maintain our street markings, continue our left turn traffic calming initiative, upgrade key intersections in the bike network, and install streetlight enhancements. We are particularly enthusiastic about our funding for street markings growing from the current level of 28 million all the way to 43 million in fiscal year '21. With this

funding, DOT will implement a new high visibility crosswalk standard city-wide and refresh our markings an average of every four and a half years, up from six, while continuing our ambitious pace of safety projects. We will also continue crucial street reconstruction this year including two new phases of our Vision Zero Great Streets Program; Phase Three of the Grand Concourse, from East 171st Street to East 175th Street; and Phase One of Atlantic Avenue, from Georgia Avenue to Conduit Boulevard. And of course, the transformation of Queens Boulevard continues, the next phase of this Great Streets project will be implemented using temporary materials this year. Thanks to the Mayor for contributing the needed funds, we will be initiating capital construction along this corridor soon. The first phase of this work is currently in design at DOC. As I have told this committee, our speed-camera program has demonstrated clear results and has proven to be an important way to consistently change driver behavior. Mayor De Blasio and DOT strongly support legislation that will allow us to expand our data-driven program to more school zones and ensure that we're able to enforce speed limits at the most dangerous times of

day and in the highest crash locations. The Council's support is invaluable as we push to reauthorize and expand the program this session in Albany. As the city grows, so do the demands on our streets. DOT remains focused on balancing the needs of all street users, while at the same time maximizing the efficiency of our streets to carry the most people and goods possible. When it comes to keeping New Yorkers moving and expanding mobility for all, whether they're walking, biking, driving, taking transit or ferries, we have an exciting year ahead. The Mayor continues his remarkable record of investment in roadway repair in this budget. We are on... we are on track to pave 1,300 lane miles in fiscal year '17 and we, we plan to continue the pace by paving another 1,300 lane miles in fiscal year '18. Under Mayor De Blasio's leadership, from fiscal year '16 through '19 we will pave over 5,000 lane miles of our more... most poorly rated streets, more than a quarter of all the city's nearly 20,000 lane miles. And I'm happy to report that all these newly paved streets have contributed to a dramatic decrease in the number of potholes that DOT has had to fill. Pothole complaints have declined by 40 percent from

2014 to 2016 and year to date DOT has had to fill 72 percent fewer potholes compared to the same period in 2014. When it comes to transit, Mayor De Blasio has made a historic commitment of 2.5 million to the MTA's capital plan and working with our partners at MTA we've more than doubled the pace of rolling out new select bus service routes. This year we plan to add three more routes along 79th Street in Manhattan, across the South Bronx, and along Woodhaven Boulevard to increase bus speed, reliability, and pedestrian safety. By the end of 2017, we expect that SBS will carry over 380,000 daily riders or more than 15 percent of New York's 2.5 million average weekday bus ridership. We're also committed to working with the MTA to improve bus service throughout the system through additional bus lanes, queue jumps, traffic signal priority, contactless payment, and all-door boarding. And DOT is engaged over the last couple of months with New Yorkers to plan for future transit investments. Through our Citywide Transit Plan, which we were required... which we were required to undertake in part by legislation championed by Council Member Lander, we hope to identify underserved corridors and places where ridership is expected to grow and

1 evaluate potential modes that might work best to meet
2 those needs. At the same time, we'll be looking at
3 how improvements to our pedestrian and bicycle
4 infrastructure can further broaden transit markets.
5 We're collecting public input online through the
6 first week in April, so please, encourage your
7 constituents to take our survey to give us the
8 clearest picture of transportation needs in your
9 district. And we'd also be happy to host Town Halls
10 with interested Council Members in the coming weeks.
11 Turning to our bike network, after a year in which we
12 installed a record 18.5 miles of protected bike lanes
13 and 45 miles of additional bike lanes, New Yorkers
14 now enjoy a bike network of 1,125 miles in total.
15 With the completion of the Chrystie Street bike lane
16 last fall, cyclists can now ride from downtown
17 Brooklyn to the Bronx on nine miles of continues
18 protected bike lanes. And we have exciting plans this
19 year including a new protected bike lane on 4th
20 Avenue in Brooklyn. In the coming weeks, we'll embark
21 on a series of community discussions about making
22 changes to our original design for 4th Avenue with
23 the addition of protected bike lanes for four miles,
24 all the way from Boerum Hill to Bay Ridge. And we'll
25

be bringing a much overdue bike lane right, right here to Park Row to provide a safe connection to the Brooklyn Bridge. And our bikeshare network continues to grow. With expansions planned this year further into Harlem, into Astoria, Prospect Heights, and Crown Heights, Citi Bike will reach 12,000 bikes and approximately 750 stations by the end of 2017, making our network the largest in North America and on par with leading systems around the globe. When it comes to ferries, we are working with our partners at EDC on the rollout of the new citywide ferry service this summer while continuing to invest in the Staten Island Ferry, where ridership continues to grow. In February, we registered a 251-million-dollar contract for the three new Ollis class vessels. We are designing these state-of-the-art 4,500 passenger ferries with resiliency in mind; they will be able to operate in varying weather conditions and dock at a broader range of locations during emergencies and they will be environmentally friendly, meeting US EPA Tier IV emissions standards. And finally, along with our plaza program, our crosswalk enhancements and our many safety improvement projects, we are increasing our resources to upgrade important parts of our

pedestrian infrastructure such as pedestrian ramps and sidewalks. The Mayor's Preliminary Capital Plan proposes to add 480 million to DOT's pedestrian ramps program over seven additional years. This includes a 20 million annual commitment to installing new ramps and baselines a new program to upgrade existing ramps throughout the city. And we've increased sidewalk repairs for NYCHA developments. Since 2014 we've done 7.3 million in sidewalk work at 42 developments as compared to 4.4 million at 20 developments in the last term of the previous administration. And as you know we're looking forward to launching our car share pilot this year. We appreciate the legislation the council passed codifying this effort, now known as Local Laws 47 and 50 of 2017, which the Mayor signed just last week. We will encourage New Yorkers to have an open mind. We've seen in other cities that car share has resulted in people giving up their cars, making it easier, not harder, to find a spot for those who still need or choose to own cars and park on the street. Finally, the city is continuing with its own new rapid transit project, the BQX. Working with our partners at EDC we continue to plan for the route which will run along the Brooklyn-Queens

waterfront. We will be releasing our next study this spring, which will present further details on alignment and project features incorporating public outreach that DOT and EDC have undertaken over the past year. Now I want to discuss state of good repair for our transportation infrastructure and our efforts to improve project delivery. From the four East River crosses to over 780 other bridges, large and small, across the city, these important links require ongoing capital investment. A key highlight of Mayor De Blasio's budget is a commitment of 621 million in additional capital funds to ensure a state of good repair on our bridges through fiscal year '25. And as I've said, DOT is doing more capital projects than ever before. This level of increased investment can only be achieved through our focused efforts and ability to manage our growth. So far, we've risen to the challenge, though there's always room to improve. Last year, we committed an impressive 83 percent of our fiscal year '16 Capital Plan and a record amount in contract dollars. We're working with our partners in the administration and retooling our own internal procedures to streamline procurements and register more contracts on time. And as we strive to manage a

substantial increase in both the pace and scale of project... of capital project delivery, we're committed to pursuing the City's goals for awarding contracts to minority and women owned business enterprises. We're working closely with Deputy Mayor Richard Buery and Jennel Doris, the Senior Advisor for the City's M/WBE program, as well as our colleagues at SBS and MOCS. As you know, the Mayor set an ambitious goal in OneNYC to award a minimum of 16 billion in city contract dollars over the next ten years to M/WBE's and recently set a new goal of awarding 30 percent of all city contracts to M/WBE's. to contribute to that goal, DOT awarded nearly 43 million to M/WBE's in 2015 and nearly 82 million in 2016. As you can see we've nearly doubled our contract awards because we're now using a three-pronged approach to increasing M/WBE contracts; we're taking steps to increase access for M/WBE's, we're enhancing training and our own internal procedures, and we're increasing our outreach efforts. Turning to several large bridge projects that will be getting underway in the upcoming year, in the next few months we will register a contract to reconstruct Unionport Bridge in the Bronx, which carries an average of 63,000

vehicles daily over the... on the Bruckner Expressway over Westchester Creek. The Unionport Bridge will have a long-life span and a widened structure which will include a five-foot sidewalk and for the first time a ten-foot bike lane. And we will continue work on our iconic East River Bridges with two contracts scheduled for FY '18 registration. The next contract for the Queensboro Bridge is focused on replacement of the Upper Deck roadway. And for the Manhattan Bridge we'll be painting the south side of the bridge and the towers and rehabilitating or replacing numerous components of the bridge structure and anchorage as well as the south upper roadway. The discussion of bridges brings us to design build, as you mentioned Mr. Chairman, which would be a much-needed project delivery innovation, saving time and potentially millions of taxpayer dollars. For the last several years the city has worked closely with a coalition of stakeholders including the business community, organized labor, and industry, to advocate for state authorization for the city to use design-build. I was up in Albany just last week discussing our design-build legislation and I hope that the council will lend their voice to our effort. The

Mayor and the Council have challenged city agencies to identify ways to reduce expenses and build recurring savings as a safeguard against the future economic downturn. As we know this is even more important at a time of uncertainty about Federal funding. Here at DOT, we found significant savings in this expense budget from changes in our operations. New York's drivers have surely taken note of our new ParkNYC program that allows motorists to pay by cell. As you know, rollout of this new program began in December in Manhattan. I am happy to report that over 50,000 drivers have already downloaded the smartphone app and the number is continuing to grow. As we speak, ParkNYC, I believe installation was just completed in the Bronx and we will be rolling out to the rest of the city through the summer. We expect to save about 1.7 million dollars in personnel costs and credit-card processing payments through the efficiencies of this program. And the replacement of a movable bridge with a fixed bridge to carry the Belt Parkway over Mill Basin will produce operational savings and eliminate traffic delays caused by bridge openings, while still maintaining maritime access. The 75-year-old bridge has outlived its useful life

1 and we are nearing completion on the new structure
2 one year ahead of schedule. By eliminating the need
3 for bridge operations... bridge operators at this
4 location, DOT will realize over 300,000 dollars in
5 savings annually. While we pursue these savings and
6 efficiencies in our expense budget, we will continue
7 to find other ways to be the most effective stewards
8 of taxpayer dollars, including better project
9 delivery of our capital program. I want to again
10 thank you, Chairman Rodriguez, and this entire
11 committee for your strong support. As you have heard,
12 we are very excited to move ahead with our important
13 work in the year ahead. I look forward to partnering
14 with you and all the Members of Council, and other
15 stakeholders with all of these efforts as we endeavor
16 to keep New Yorkers safe and moving. I'd be happy to
17 take your questions.

18
19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
20 Commissioner, I have many questions but I'm only
21 going to be asking a few because I also know that my
22 colleagues they also have questions to ask. I would
23 like also to recognize Council Member Van Bramer and
24 also thank our lawyer here, the staff for her
25 contribution in this committee. And before asking a

question I'd also like to thank you and, and the Mayor and especially the great team from the DOT for everything that you do in planning with us for everything and I know that we will get good news in the next couple of days by the contribution by your team has been amazing as we are getting close for Saturday April 22nd where we're going to... going to be doing our second car free day. My first question is about how much is the city in this case DOT in having the great, you know opportunity to have you as a commissioner we are a lot of years serving from DC and living with, with a lot of uncertainty on how federal cut will have an impact in the DOT seeing it is good percentage of the funding for many projects that we've been doing and DOT also relies on federal government?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: Yeah, no it's a... it's a very good question Mr. Chairman and obviously something that's on all of our minds, you and the council and, and the Mayor and, and all us commissioners as well and look I think we, we've all discussed the fact that it's a very uncertain climate in Washington, you know the latest efforts to, you know penalize sanctuary cities I think is a very big

unknown although I think the Mayor feels very confident about the, the city having a strong legal stance there. The president's budget made some specific proposed cuts on the transportation front, which are worth discussing. Two programs that are of particular importance I think to big cities like New York, the first one is what's called the Capital Investments Grant or the New Starts Program which is funds for new transit projects at a time as, as we all know and cities are growing and there is such a growing demand to invest in transit this is a program that has been crucial for efforts like 2nd Avenue subway and so many of the projects in this city in this region. The, the projects that would be seeking funding in this program and you've heard them enumerated before, the next phase of 2nd Avenue subway, the Gateway Tunnel between New York and New Jersey, our own local buildout of our capital project for the Woodhaven select bus service routes. So, these are some major projects that would certainly, you know be in some jeopardy if this program is eliminated. The other program, the other transportation program the president has proposed to zero out is the Tiger Grant Program, which is one I

1 was very intimately involved in when I was at USDOT
2 and the city has taken great advantage of that
3 program as well. The city has won six Tiger Grants
4 over a period of about seven years, we've used them
5 for Vision Zero projects, for all kinds of terrific
6 projects; Fordham Plaza, a bunch of things all over
7 the city. I will say though that what the Mayor has
8 said and I think it's true is the president has
9 proposed these budget cuts but it's, it's start of a
10 long process up in... down in congress they will
11 probably be wrangling over the budget for a number of
12 months to come, the Mayor has pledged that he is
13 going to work with his allies, other mayors and I
14 know council members have, have also been speaking to
15 their counterparts around the country to, to be
16 united in working with our delegation senator Schumer
17 and others down in Washington to fight these cuts.
18 So, so we will see how it plays out but clearly, you
19 know the transportation cuts and obviously, the cuts
20 in other areas; social services and housing if they
21 go forward there, they're tremendously damaging for,
22 for cities like New York that are growing and you
23 know we've certainly relied on the federal government
24 to help us with that growth.
25

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, again since you were in... serving out the national level of Department of Transportation can we expect that... the same thing to happen to the Obamacare where, you know republican in the sunny state also they come in front also a... against the new plan that the president wanted to bring to the... to the house, to the floor that... are they... are the... are the Department of Transportation can we some expectation that republicans on the city also will... can be unified with some democrat from places as our city because any cut of the Department of Transportation will not only will hurt a city as New York but it also hurts some municipality which also is an important republican base?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: It, it's a good question and, and traditionally transit funding particularly the New Starts Program it's focused more on urban areas but in recent years a lot of smaller jurisdictions have started to use some of those funds and so it enjoys fairly broad bipartisan support and, and if you've looked at some of the comments of elected officials on both sides of the aisle I think there has been already some stated opposition to

eliminating it but look I think there, there's going to be a tough budget debate down there, the president has proposed cuts in a lot of different areas and you know I presume they'll be some, some give and take. Again, I think that, that we will be the city certainly and again all elected officials of the city we will be working very hard with our allies to send the message that we think these programs are crucial.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. So, have you started conversations with some of the members of the Department of Transportation on the... at the federal level?

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well the Mayor... the Mayor has been talking with his counterparts in the US Conference of Mayors and I think starting to line up certainly talking to members of our delegation and you know maybe beginning some of those discussions with the... with officials in the Trump administration and you know and I think... again you've, you've heard the Mayor on this, I think there's going to be quite a determined group of elected officials throughout the country and I do believe Mayors and elected officials on both sides of the aisle who work together to oppose these cuts.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. My second question is about congestion in Midtown, I think that you want a, you know the perfect person or, or commissioner to take us to understand what is... and, and we also heard that the Mayor's also working to, to put together a plan or... on, on congestion but for, for any information that you can share with us in your role in this case how the DOT Commissioner but also the leader together with Chief Chan and others when it comes to Vision Zero what I heard from experts in the field of transportation, some professors that only by doing better on enforcement we can reduce congestion by 10 or 15 percent, is it DOT, you know as a leader, leader in an entity not only working with Chief Chan and other, with Vision Zero but also in, in your role really signing some area in the congestion... Midtown, what is your plan, what can we expect to see, you know we will... we are addressing congestion in our city?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: There's no secret if you... if you look... we're, we're lucky now we have a lot of good data both data we get from taxi's and from buses about speeds and we can see that certainly travel speeds have been slowing in recent years in

1 Midtown and you know the, the administration has done
2 some analysis of this, looked at what are the
3 different factors and, and it turns out one of the
4 largest factors is actually the good news story of
5 what's happening in New York City and we've seen
6 tremendous population growth, tremendous economic
7 growth, we've added half a million jobs over the past
8 five years, we're seeing record tourism numbers. So
9 that has been... it turns out those have been some of
10 the largest contributing factors in congestion in
11 Midtown and I would say there's of course no easy
12 silver bullets, you are correct Mr. Chairman and one
13 of the things that we have been talking about is to
14 step up enforcement but to do it in a strategic way,
15 to particularly look at enforcement and keep
16 corridors and key hot spots and to try and work with
17 NYPD to deploy enforcement forces where they can be
18 the most useful. We're also looking at are there
19 things we can do in terms of changing curbside uses,
20 loading zones, looking at delivery policy, looking at
21 parking policy. So, you've heard of talk about some
22 of these things we'll be rolling some of it out in
23 more detail. I don't know whether through sheer
24 enforcement alone you can reduce congestion by 10 to
25

15 percent, I think we'll have to see as we roll it out, I think there will be some trial and error but, but I think there's no question that some bundle of these factors can help do something to reduce congestion. Again, against the backdrop of a city that does, I think something we're all very happy about continuing to grow and thrive economically.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: What about no delivering during rush hour?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: Well I think one thing we're going to do is take a look at delivery policy and how we can perhaps make it smarter. I think we want to be sensitive and careful when we talk about Midtown Manhattan or other key commercial areas around the city. We want to reduce congestion but we also want to make sure our businesses can get the goods they need and can, can thrive, it's already very expensive and complicated to do business in New York so I think part of this will be working with the business community, with the delivery industries to see if we can come up with some more rational policies and it's not only in commercial districts. One thing... you know we know now with the rise particularly this is phenomena perhaps with the

1
2 millennial generation and the rise of Amazon and, and
3 Peapod and FreshDirect, we're seeing a lot more
4 deliveries in residential areas as well and you know
5 at least in commercial areas we often have loans...
6 loading zones and commercial parking but now that
7 we're seeing a big rise in deliveries in residential
8 areas that are also causing congestion it's a new...
9 it's a relatively new phenomenon that we're also
10 starting to, to do some analysis and see if we can
11 put in some good policies.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. I have
13 other questions but I will now call my colleague,
14 Council Member Vacca.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you
16 Commissioner and Mr. Chair. I want to talk about
17 congestion, not just in Manhattan, come to the Bronx,
18 come to Brooklyn and come to Queens and I know your
19 testimony did not touch on that Commissioner but if
20 you drive your car in the outer boroughs and try to
21 go from one borough to another you're in a virtual
22 parking lot, I mean the ultimate parking lot is the
23 cross-Bronx Expressway, it is the worst highway in
24 the country, sited in national surveys. The FDR drive
25 every day is a disaster, the Brooklyn Queens

Expressway is another problem, it, it has... it, it encourages you to use mass transit but the reality is we have people who have to use their cars and there's never a discussion about what are we going to do about gridlock in this city and the gridlock is just not in Manhattan, the gridlock is in outer boroughs trying to go from one part of the borough to another, you cannot go on the cross Bronx Expressway from one part of the borough to another, you cannot get... I had to drive... I had a meeting yesterday morning, early and I had to go to speak about technology which is my committee to Staten Island, two and a half hours from the Bronx to Staten Island. The FDR Drive I've given up on, I take the train and that takes me an hour but the FDR Drive I've given up on but I think that we have some type of an attitude where we don't even have a discussion about what we're doing here, what... I... have we just thrown our hands up in the air and said this is going to be the way of life in this city because I refuse to do that, I'm looking for a plan, I'm looking for a pro-act... not... I shouldn't be proactive, the situation's been a disaster for years but I'm looking for some type of plan that people can

say we are looking at relief, we are looking at something and I don't see that.

POLLY TROTTERBERG: Well and I, I, I... it's a good question and the, the Chairman was focused on Midtown Manhattan but I think the Mayor has made it clear that the congestion proposals that we're going to roll out we will be looking at a, a five borough plan although I think there's been a lot of discussion about what we need to do in Midtown I think for the other four boroughs I want to make sure that we get a lot of input from local elected officials from businesses etcetera, hit... you know pick the key areas where we want to focus. It's interesting you mentioned the Cross Bronx because as you know the Mayor has described that I believe as... that he is like captain Ahab and that is his white whale. He... it is a state highway and as you know it's, it's, it's a Moses era highway that, that connects to the, the George Washington Bridge, it, it is notorious for being one of the most difficult routes in the city and you know right now is as you know unlike in some other places we don't have some of the traditional tools that we might use to address congestion which might be something like pricing so

1
2 we have to tackle it best we can which again is going
3 to be a combination of enforcement, of technology, of
4 hopefully working with businesses to see what we can
5 do about deliveries and doing everything we can to
6 try an ease back congestion.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: We, we seem to
8 talk... we, we, we talk the talk but we're not walking
9 the walk, to be honest we talk about transit deserts
10 and my community is a transit desert, you have to
11 take a car to the train or a bus to the train and
12 this leads me to my next discussion, we talk about
13 that how these neighborhoods are underserved yet when
14 it comes to ferry service the predominance of ferry
15 service in this borough... in, in this city and you've
16 talked about ferry service in your testimony, the
17 predominance of ferry service in this city is based
18 in communities in close proximity to Manhattan anyway
19 who have access to several trains to get to
20 Manhattan. So, in the previous administration what
21 was done is that ferry stops all around those
22 neighborhoods were set up giving them even better
23 access and then we want to know why we are having
24 gentrification or what are we going to do about
25 affordable housing, the real... the reality is it

exacerbated by making the neighborhoods even more attractive. When I asked for ferry service in Throggs Neck, New York a transit desert I'm told maybe tomorrow, maybe tomorrow which could be years away, there's no study on the books that, that the city has done that, that's, that's been... that's being implemented, I have EDC is working with DOT on ferry service but luckily the Bronx now has no ferry service, we're getting one stop..

POLLY TROTTERBERG: You're getting Soundview.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: We're getting Soundview, we're getting one stop, talk about inequality, talk about inequality, my community is a waterfront area, my community is bordered by water and north of my community is Co-op City, why we don't have access and I, I want that put on the front burner, I want to know when are we going to get ferry service.

POLLY TROTTERBERG: So we are, as I mentioned in my testimony we are right now doing our citywide transit study and we are certainly part of the focus of that transit study and something this committees talked about, the Chairman's focus is on..

1 is transit deserts and so really need to get that
2 input from all of you and your constituents, we've
3 heard a lot from Council Member Landers constituents...
4 [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: You've heard a lot
6 from me over the years... [cross-talk]

7 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...I know... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I've been all over
9 on this... [cross-talk]

10 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...I'd like to... [cross-
11 talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: ...we've heard a
13 lot, the issue is... [cross-talk]

14 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...I think I'd like to
15 hear... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: ...when are we going
17 to do something... [cross-talk]

18 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...I think I'd like to
19 hear from your constituents as well and look you know
20 the challenge we have in terms of big transit
21 investments, the city has put some money on the table
22 to do some transit vamps, we also need to work with
23 the MTA. Again, we've invested now 2.5 billion in
24 their next five-year capital plan and part of that
25

1
2 has been to direct them to start to take more of the
3 city's needs into account as they build out the next
4 generation of their transit system. Unfortunately, I
5 will say now I think the federal climate being a
6 little uncertain for them we'll have to see what
7 their next generation of transit investments is going
8 to look like... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well if I can say...
10 let me conclude quickly, I don't think the money with
11 the ferry service in the Bronx being denied, I don't
12 think the issue is money I just don't think the city
13 had the, the, the desire to do it and, and I think
14 that our community was passed up. Lastly I want to
15 ask you about Shore Road in my district, Shore Road
16 was left out of the capital budget and this goes from
17 the Bronx Westchester line to City Island Road, it is
18 falling apart, it's in desperate need of capital
19 improvement and, and I want to know why it was left
20 out and I want to ask you to reconsider before we
21 have a permanent... the final city budget, before the
22 executive budget is released and ask for a
23 reconsideration because of the flooding and surface
24 conditions there and the whole contour of that road
25 is extremely dangerous.

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Now, look I'm familiar, familiar with that road as you know that is one where we need also to work with DEP because there are major... there would have to be major drainage and sewer infrastructure and I think the challenge there is just it's an immensely costly and complicated project but certainly one we're reviewing, we're, we're very familiar with it.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, I'd like to remind the rest of my colleagues please stay at their five minutes since we also have MTA and we also TLC. Council Member Vacca... Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chair and thank you commissioner and your team for being here today. I'm going to start off with the 4th Avenue project and, and really again just commending the, the, the incredible work you all did to hear the community, take a pause, review everything and then come back with a, a better plan. That's something that I think we always need to highlight as, as a good moment of good government and so I just want to say thank you to that. I know there's a lot of work to go back to the communities with this re-thought and, and, and making it safer so I just want to say

POLLY TROTTEMBERG: Yeah and I'm going to have Joe Jarrin get into the details but, but I want to thank you and, and Council Member Lander and just say look it was... it was definitely a big decision to take a project that was fairly, you know well along in its planning and, and make a big change to it but as, as I have said publicly, you know having heard from so many members of the community and having seen particularly as cycling has continued to just grow exponentially in Brooklyn and knowing that when we did this capital project we would live with it for generations to come, 50, 60, 70 years, I think we concluded even though it's going to take some time and retooling and obviously working closely with the community and elected officials to work through everybody's questions that we, we really needed to

1
2 make this change. I'm, I'm happy to say since we've
3 announced it at least I have gotten a lot of good
4 feedback, there was a lot of good questions but you
5 know a general feeling like this was the right
6 decision so maybe Joe can walk you through and he has
7 been the one as, as our budget expert who was
8 definitely agonized a bit about making the changes
9 through this decision and working through the numbers
10 and the time table and what it means.

11 JOSEPH JARRIN: Council Member we're
12 actually currently finalizing the, the scope of the
13 revised design and, and going back to DDC to move
14 forward with the revised design. On the cost side, we
15 have estimated that we can probably do the project
16 with the same... close to the same amount of funding
17 that we already had but we're actually still
18 reviewing some of those details of the scope really
19 has to do with what we plan to do in the median of
20 the... of the Avenue but... and then also as you probably
21 know we, we had only been funded for phases one and
22 two which is certain sections of 4th Avenue, we're
23 now striving to do the entire stretch. So, thanks to
24 Mayor De Blasio's funding for Vision Zero that we got
25 as part of this January plan, we actually now have

1
2 some additional funding that we could also use to be
3 able to do the, the, the full stretch. So, we'll have
4 a decision soon on, on the final scope and, and we'll
5 be briefing the DDC and the Commissioner and, and,
6 and move forward with the project as soon as
7 possible. As, as you know because of this revised
8 design we had to put the design on hold, we
9 originally planning to have construction start next
10 year but now there will be a slight delay,
11 postponement to, to basically do this improved
12 design.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, I only
14 have two more minutes here so I'm going to just hit
15 you with a couple, couple questions then we can... we
16 can move through them. The first is the BQX and the
17 spring study, there's a lot of conversations and
18 concerns that I've had with the BQX, I'm hoping... I'm,
19 I'm, I'm hoping for some answers in the spring study
20 including how we juxtapose other options not the BQX
21 in solving some of the transportation issues, the
22 ferry's going to be an interesting one, two for Red
23 Hook that is a transit desert as well, the questions
24 around buses and there's, there's some work that
25 you're doing in SBS and some other bus, bus options,

I want to kind of hear DOT's response to possible Red Hook solutions for, for buses and where, where you're... where the spring study might be looking at that and then outside of the BQX on 3rd Avenue where the BQX is thinking about wanting to be in Sunset Park there are a lot of issues there as well. And so, thinking about how budget and, and, and little pilot projects like under the El at 36th Street and 3rd Avenue have made a big splash. A lot of folks are looking at that, I think we need to do a better job to get the word out about what that was, everyone's kind of associating it with Industry City, this is a... is a... this is a DOT project and what that means for the entire corridor; lighting, parking, meters, there's a lot of ideas that are, are kind of circulating from the community and the community board, I want to kind of get a sense from you about what that looks like for your BQE work in Sunset Park and then... and then finally the double parking issue on 5th Avenue has been a conundrum for us and that line, the 63 line, this is an MTA questions but DOT how do we think about double parking and the safety of our riders are, are... there's a... there's a shared bike lane there, there are commercial... there's a

massive commercial truck issue and what, what is DOT thinking about that as, as a holistic and, and is, is this present in the budget?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: Okay, that's a lot of questions, I hope I can... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah, well it... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...I hope I can remember... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: ...I only got two minutes... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...them all and answer... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: ...there you go... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...them. Let... I'll start with... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: ...and you can take it... your... you can take your time with the answers... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...I'll start with the BQX and, and hopefully get to the rest. Look and you know certainly the discussion of the BQX has I think spurned a useful discussion, you know about that

project specifically but also are there other things that can be done in the areas and then look as, as we're hearing from Council Member Vacca, what else do we need to do in this growing city, a lot of frustration about we need to be making big transportation investments all over the city and I, I think on that we can all agree, how we get there and where we find the funds and where we go obviously that's the... that's what we need to work through. So yeah, I think when we come back in the spring we're going to have a more refined proposal to talk through kind of getting closer to looking at potential alignments and certainly grappling with some of the issues that I think particularly apply to sunset park about how well does this project work there, you know how... where would it run and what would be the benefits. I think it will also be partially a discussion of are there other improvements that we can potentially do and that certainly when you look at Red Hook and other areas that's a very good question. Talking about... so hopefully again we're going to have that out in the next couple of months and I think that will spur a very good discussion both about the BQX but obviously fair enough about

1 some of the larger transportation questions that
2 we're grappling with around the city and what are the
3 best places to make investments, how do we decide in
4 an age of limited resources where we prioritize,
5 where we're going to invest and making sure that the
6 community gets a full airing of what is our latest
7 thinking and analysis and, and we hear from them. On,
8 on 5th Avenue, it's funny you mentioned part of why
9 we... you know we knew we had to do 4th Avenue is
10 because 5th Avenue is a challenging place, that bike
11 lane there, you know it is a busy commercial
12 corridor, there is a lot of double parking and you
13 know look we can always work with PD on enforcement
14 but I think, you know the good news if we... if we get
15 community buy in and we get our, our 4th Avenue
16 operational project up this summer then hopefully
17 that will be... you know that will be a terrific now
18 protected stretch that perhaps can help end the
19 aggravation of trying to bike on 5th Ave.
20

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: 3rd Avenue?

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member...

23 [cross-talk]

24 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah... [cross-talk]

25

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Lander following
by Council Member Chin.

POLLY TROTTERBERG: I apologize, tell me
again what your... the 3rd Avenue question, so many
avenues?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Under the El.

POLLY TROTTERBERG: Oh yes... so, so I'm
happy to say and I think you're right, perhaps we
didn't do quite as, as good a job as we should of in
getting the word out that we, we have actually
launched I think a very exciting effort called under
the El to do lighting and artistic and public safety
improvements under the elevated spaces around the
city and particularly we, we... you mentioned 3rd
Avenue, we're focusing on corridors where obviously
there, they're busy, pedestrian and cycling corridors
and we're going to be doing more of those treatments
throughout the city, we're also looking at something
that I've heard from a lot of council members about
just in general how do we improve lighting and public
safety under elevated highways and the elevated
subway structures, it's something that we have been
talking to the MTA a lot about and we're going to be
rolling out some good ideas there. So something we're

happy I think to partner with Council Members on, areas where they want us to come do some of these treatments and, and how we can get better public attention on them because you're right I think it's, it's perhaps not quite gotten the focus that it should but we're very excited about it, it's sort of one of the last frontiers in the city of areas that are just in a lot of neighborhoods, dark and gloomy and, and screaming out for, for better lighting, you know artistic improvements and, and a feeling of better public safety.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And Council Member Lander followed by Council Member Chin, I would like also to recognize Council Member Miller and Reynoso who are here with us.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Mr. Chair, thank you Commissioner. I, I have sort of a, a list of thank yous first, things that you guys are doing in ways that I feel good about so on the citywide transit plan which comes from legislation this council passed but that was just about a bus rapid transit plan and you guys took it and made it a full citywide transit plan which is great and I just want to urge my colleagues and the public to engage

1 with it, we... this council, it's true that I'm the
2 sponsor but this council passed a bill requiring them
3 to and they expanded on doing real good transit
4 planning of where we need it and so I would just urge
5 people, transit plan dot NYC, you still got a couple
6 of weeks to give your input, it's an encouraging
7 planning process and I would urge people to... [cross-
8 talk]
9

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: And, and we will...

11 [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...take advantage
13 of it... [cross-talk]

14 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...do Town Halls if
15 anyone would like to, to, to... you know to have an
16 actual engaged discussion with your constituents.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I want to thank
18 you for the continued investments in Vision Zero, all
19 of the capital ones here but I had a chance to go to
20 a smaller expense one, the Vision Zero Youth Council
21 a couple of weeks ago which was just a wonderful
22 outreach and education event and I would urge others
23 to try to bring it to their districts as well and it
24 was really... that meeting talking to these high school
25 kids trying to save the lives of their classmates

that I felt it was urgent to speak out against the state senate's effort to overrule our speed limit, another bill this council passed that has saved lives and the fact that Albany road by road is going to take the really outrageous and dangerous effort to try to increase the speed limit in the budget, it's ashonda [sp?]. Anyway, so I thank you for standing up on it and I encourage people to meet the Vision Zero Youth Council. I'm going to echo Council Member Menchaca's comments on 4th Avenue which... you know though I felt some investment in the work that we had done several years ago this is the right plan, I appreciate you taking the time to put it on the table, its big and bold, it's going to take a lot of work in the community but I'm glad to support it and I appreciate your pushing forward on it. And on Car Share, I know we were encouraged to kind of register our interest in letters but I'm registering my interest publicly here at this hearing, I think it's an exciting opportunity, I think it will actually address some of our parking issues, I already see it in our neighborhood where people are starting to use car to go and zip car in those ways and I think moving that forward as public policy is smart and,

1 and I hope we can... we can get to it. I have two
2 questions, first I'm enthusiastic about the street
3 markings increase which I know is a big issue to my
4 constituents, small, not at the level of street
5 reconstructions but I just wonder what you track on
6 that because I know I get it and I don't even know
7 how to evaluate where we don't have them or how long
8 we go without them, when they're needed so it's great
9 to increase the money, what is it that we're
10 reporting on in how that gets spent and... [cross-talk]

12 POLLY TROTTERBERG: Yeah... no and I
13 really... I want to thank the Mayor for this because
14 right... it seems like kind of a, a small issue but one
15 that clearly is of such importance and it, it's sort
16 of important in two ways which is maintaining the
17 markings of our existing infrastructure and then
18 continuing to do markings as we build out our Vision
19 Zero Project, our bus lanes, I mean we... the city is
20 now very in earnest in the markings business and like
21 any other piece of infrastructure you have to
22 maintain it and you know we had a couple of
23 challenges. Our average time for refreshing markings
24 is about six years... [cross-talk]

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Six years?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: Six years, yep.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Alright, seems like... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...and... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...we could reduce that.

POLLY TROTTERBERG: And... well we're get... well the good news is the funding in this budget will get that down to four and a half years, now that's an average, in some places we're doing... some places... markings can be very interesting, in some places they can wear out a lot more quickly than in other places and in some places, they're very crucial in terms of safety and busy intersections, some places... but we're also very proud that one thing we've announced in this budget we're now going to be going to what's called the high visibility crosswalk, that's going to be our standard around the city which is the crosswalk you've seen, very enhanced with the hatching which you know we've seen when we've looked at studies around the country really has proven results in terms of pedestrian safety. So, this is going to be for us a big new investment in markings and something that we're very enthusiastic about. I

1 will just one... add one other thing although marking
2 seems like a small area. The contracts are fairly
3 complicated to manage, it's work all over the city
4 and you want to make sure that its done to high
5 quality so we're also going to be increasing our team
6 of inspectors to make sure that we're keeping on top
7 of the work. I will say we certainly rely on hearing
8 from you all and from 311, you know things in the
9 city particularly markings that are always changing,
10 they're getting rubbed out. So, it is certainly
11 something where we always need public input to make
12 sure we're staying on top of it... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Alright, thank
15 you and then my last question and the conversation
16 around 4th Avenue and I want to thank you, you had a
17 good conversation with me about some of my
18 frustrations about longstanding capital projects and
19 the challenges getting them built on time and on a
20 reasonable budget and you mentioned some of those or
21 alluded to them in your testimony this is an issue
22 that Finance Chair Ferreras and I and other members
23 of the council feel very strongly about and this is
24 not just DOT, obviously DDC, Parks, DEP, there is
25 urgent need for capital projects management reform

1 and we are working hard to try to elevate that in the
2 council, make sure that the budget director and the
3 Mayor understand it and of course that would be a big
4 process but I just wonder if you have any reflections
5 on the things you know from your colleagues around
6 the country or your time in Washington and did... you
7 said design build so you can... you can say that one
8 but that can't be it, we can't only say Albany please
9 bail us out, do you have any thoughts on some things...
10 it's a big question but just teasers maybe on things
11 we could do to improve capital projects management?

13 POLLY TROTTERBERG: I certainly do and I...
14 look I, I, I said this before when I first came back
15 to New York from my time at the national level, I, I
16 think I can safely say that the... New York City is one
17 of the most complicated capital delivery processes in
18 the country if not the world. So, a certain of that
19 comes from the state and from the feds but a certain
20 amount frankly is, is self-inflicted and look it's,
21 it's grown up out of a history of a big city that's...
22 we're an old city and you know every time anything
23 has gone wrong with capital projects, any type of a
24 skin that we've sort of added another layer of review
25 and oversight and process and I think now we've got a

process which is very, very challenging. I, I... Joe and his team once put together basically an enormous kind of gant shart [sp?] of what we have to do to get a capital project done, the, the steps we have to take, the oversight we have, the different agencies and groups that have to sign off on things, I mean it was as big as that, you know painting of, of George Washington in a nine-point font, I mean it was just immensely, immensely complicated. And I think the truth is to, to really chip away at some of that and Albany can't totally save us so the design build would make a big difference, it is the state of the art, all over the country and all over the world now but I think to sort of rationalize our complicated capital delivery process it does require really rolling up our sleeves and really taking a hard look at some of those steps and saying do we really need this step, does it add value and letting go of some of those steps and I think that's harder than it sounds but something I can tell you we have tried to do internally in the administration but would love to partner with the council and I, I, I definitely feel your frustration and the frustration of, of council members about how long it takes to deliver projects

and it's, it's not... it doesn't serve our constituents well. We happily announce we've gotten the funds to do this project and then they don't see the project for seven years and of course everybody feels frustrated at that point, I think we can do better.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, I won't ask any more questions but I will associate myself with the Chair's future questions about city bike expansion and how we get a robust citywide network and that if we need public resources to do it to have an equitable system we should, the Chair will ask you about that later I'm sure.

POLLY TROTTEBERG: So, so noted.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

Alright and I would also like to recognize Council Member Richards and Greenfield is here, now Council Member Chin and Council Member Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'd like to thank Council Member Chin for, for relinquishing... letting me go before her, I'm needed for a corium in land... in land use but first I'd like to say I would love to have a Town Hall and if you'd put us on the list and I have a couple of questions and I'm really happy to

1 know that the ferry contract has been registered, do
2 you have an idea of when the completion date will be
3 and will all three be delivered at the same time and,
4 and then if, if that answer's short then I can go
5 onto the other question?

7 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I, I will be short,
8 the ferries will not be delivered at the same time,
9 we'll get them one at a time approximately three to
10 six months between them. The first one should be
11 coming end of 2019 if all goes well but let's see if
12 all goes well on through 2020.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So and then the
14 first one 2019 and then three or six months... [cross-
15 talk]

16 POLLY TROTTEBERG: The next two... [cross-
17 talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: ...between... [cross-
19 talk]

20 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...in 2020 if all goes
21 well but I, I'll reserve the right to keep you posted
22 as, as, as you just... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: ...okay... [cross-talk]

24 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...saw the... you know as
25 the, the city's new citywide ferry got stuck in the

1 mud in Florida for a couple of days so we'll... and...
2 we're... ours are being built down in Florida as well.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yes, I, I saw that.
4 And, and that brings me to the citywide ferry, you
5 know we had the conversation about citywide bikes and
6 you know the fact that Staten Island is a part of the
7 city and you know I really want... I want you to
8 consider Staten Island as a... with a ferry site to
9 Brooklyn and we've been able to secure a reasonable
10 conversation with a private entity that is willing to
11 build the dock and so with that taken into
12 consideration would that facilitate the conversation,
13 a real conversation about Staten Island being a part
14 of the citywide ferry plan with a ferry to Brooklyn?

15 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Look I think on the
16 citywide ferry plan and again we're, we're helping
17 EDC but it's mainly an EDC program but I know the
18 Mayor has said in answer to Staten Island and other
19 parts of the city that, you know we've rolled out...
20 we're rolling out the first two phases but that he's
21 open to continued discussions about where other
22 routes could be. As you know we're also undertaking a
23 study at the... at the request of the, the borough
24 president to look at other Staten Island potential
25

1
2 ferry routes particularly Midtown Manhattan but we
3 can also consider Brooklyn as well so... look we
4 certainly agree that there is... you know that there is
5 a very good reason to start looking at what we can do
6 to enhance ferry service.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So... but we don't
8 have an idea of when that would become sort of a
9 capital reality?

10 POLLY TROTTERBERG: Not yet... not yet but
11 I... but I, I think at least our ferry... our ferry study
12 I think I'm looking over Joe, I think we're hoping to
13 have it done this year, am I correct about that?
14 Okay, so that, that'll give us some sense of
15 potential cost structures, what the capital needs
16 might be and what the operating needs might be.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'm very concerned
18 about the streetlights and LED light replacements and
19 the Mayor started about... more than a year ago a pilot
20 program where he put auxiliary lighting in several
21 NYCHA facilities so I'm, I'm wondering are NYCHA
22 facilities on the list or on a priority list to get
23 the, the new lighting to be a part of the new LED
24 lighting and if not why not?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: You know the, the... I think the NYCHA lighting is done separately from our DOT roadway lighting but that said there is now a working group that is run out of the office... the office of... Mayor's office of, I think it's Criminal Justice looking at... or Public Safety, looking at what we can do in terms of better lighting and public safety improvements around NYCHA developments. DOT and NYPD and NYCHA so we are, I think, all trying to work together. I know the NYPD brought in their very... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Right... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...bright sort of klieg lights which in some places I think people have liked and in some places, they're too bright and not what they're looking for but it's certainly a problem we're trying now to look at collectively... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: ...and it was supposed to only be a, a six-month pilot and it has now gone beyond that?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: It... and I will say if there are particular, particular areas that you want

1
2 to talk to us about that we can take a quick look at,
3 I'd be happy to do that as well.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Great and, and just
5 along with the lighting you're, you're only
6 addressing under overpasses and, and highway lighting
7 and not street grid lighting?

8 POLLY TROTTERBERG: No, we're, we're
9 doing... we're doing all street lighting, the, the
10 city... and it's, it's a... it's a multiple year process
11 to change out all of the city street lights to more
12 energy efficient LED lights. We are in addition to
13 that as, as I... as I mentioned to, to Council Member
14 Menchaca starting to... for our agency to look at what
15 we can do working with the MTA and the state in some
16 cases to improve lighting under elevated structures,
17 less of an issue in Staten Island but certainly in
18 the Bronx and other parts of the city are a real
19 challenging issue.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So there is a, a, a
21 plan because I'm not seeing it happen in my district
22 so... [cross-talk]

23 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...It... we haven't...
24 [cross-talk]

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: ...I'm... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...gotten to... right, we haven't gotten to Staten Island yet, we are coming in the course of this year.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, thank you.

POLLY TROTTERBERG: And, and I, I will just mention if there, you know we're, we're going borough by borough if there are particular priorities in a given borough happy to talk about, you know where it... my... to get started so happy to talk to you about it.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And just for the record I'd like you to, to know that we're supporting the naming of a ferry for Sandy Ground so I hope that that actually happens. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you and for... to the rest of my colleagues no offense to no one but please see that we have... also have MTA and we have five more five minutes each a half an hour let's keep it on time so that we can take them to MTA and TLC.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay. Thank you Chair, thank you Commissioner. First I wanted to thank you for all the safety measures that you have implemented in my district especially on Canal Street

1 and one of my questions is that we have, you know
2 requested a Lower Manhattan pedestrian traffic safety
3 and mobility study and we have put forth that in our
4 budget response to the Mayor's Preliminary Budget and
5 we hope that you would support that because right
6 here in Lower Manhattan and you... you know your office
7 is down here, I live down here and you... we see, you
8 know the, the boom and... in the residential
9 population, hundreds of thousands of people work down
10 here, you know tens of millions of tourists visit
11 down here so we have all these tour bus, you know
12 going up and down, rolling billboard tour bus and we
13 have garbage piling up worst of all we have a lot of
14 cars parking on the sidewalk and of course the
15 biggest, you know problem with placard parking then,
16 then we have agency parking taking up, you know a
17 whole block or two blocks of the sidewalk so... and
18 the, the street down here Colonial Street, back in
19 the days where there weren't that many people or cars
20 and now it's totally changed and did you know that
21 community board one out of 59 community board, it's
22 the 4th worst... has the 4th worst air quality so...
23 because any given day there's over 75 construction
24 projects going on so with all these different
25

1
2 elements coming together we really need to have a
3 comprehensive view of what we can do down here. I
4 know the last summer you know you test out the shared
5 street program where cars were going five miles per
6 hour and, and you know we had to share the street
7 which I think was quite helpful but every day we use
8 shared streets down here. So, I think that... one thing
9 that we're hoping that we can get DOT to really do
10 this study of Lower Manhattan and how we can tackle
11 all these issues.

12 POLLY TROTTERBERG: Look, happy to take a
13 look at that and as you know we are working at least
14 on some of those different pieces including the
15 discussion we had and what we can do to improve the
16 situation with Park Row and the access into
17 Chinatown, we're also doing a traffic study now
18 around the Holland Tunnel and all those surrounding
19 streets to see what we can do to improve congestion,
20 that's certainly another area where it's an air
21 quality issue. So, doing some pieces of that but
22 happy to talk about what a more comprehensive study
23 could look like.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah, I think we...
25 you know I mean we have community board, the borough

1 president is also working with us and then we have a
2 financial district neighborhood association which is
3 very interested in that because it's really an
4 interagency but we're hoping that DOT would be the
5 agency to really take the, the lead in looking at
6 this, we're, we're talking about shared street, we're
7 talking about parking, we're talking about garbage
8 and pedestrian flow, I mean there's so many good
9 public transportation here, do we really need all
10 that car traffic and the Chair earlier... or somebody
11 was earlier was talking about, you know all the
12 delivery, you know all the FreshDirect and all, all
13 the delivery people are getting, it just kind of adds
14 more to the congestion and then on top of that the E-
15 Hail, you know what I mean, people like... they won't
16 even like go down the block to get a taxi, they want
17 someone to come pick them up right in front of their
18 house or office, it just creates a really big mess
19 and we really need to look at doing the study because
20 I know that in the FY '18 budget you allocated 1.5
21 million over two years to do a study on Pier 40
22 development, a traffic study so DOT... [cross-talk]

24 POLLY TROTTERBERG: That's the... that's
25 the study around the Holland... around Holland Tunnel.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah, so I think that's something that we really urge you to take a look at the whole Lower Manhattan and really have a, a comprehensive view on that. So, we could definitely continue discussions see if you can, you know put forth some funding so that we could start in this, you know next fiscal year and get it going, I got 41 seconds. My other question is that when we were talking about capital projects the Plaza on top of Manhattan Bridge we're still waiting for that to get going, I mean it was avoided one of the plaza projects but it still hasn't, you know moved and that's really critical for the community and flowing down from that on Forsyth Street we also want to see if we can extend the Plaza really have one on the ground where... along Division Street and Forsyth Street, we can really utilize as a Town Square for the community there so that's something that we want to continue to work with DOT on.

POLLY TROTTERBERG: Let... I'm going to check on the, the, the status of the Plaza, I think I am happy certainly at least we got this year to make, I think some terrific pedestrian improvements around the Bridge and I'm happy to say I think we're seeing...

getting good feedback from pedestrians and cyclists and motorists too that that project is working well and let us come back to you on the, the progress on the plaza.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, thank you Chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner before I call on my colleague and probably you're not ready to answer the question but I, I need to ask the question... ask it to you which is about a Fair Fare, all editorial bore from the Daily News, New York Times they have thrown their support to these important initiatives. Seattle already has a Fair Fare and large numbers of my colleagues also have signed letters of support, as a leader of the transportation system that we have in this city like what can we do to follow Seattle when it comes to provide an important discount on transportation for those New Yorkers who live on the poverty lines?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: Look Fair Fare is... and I, I know some of you have heard the Mayor speak about it, there's... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I... the same question is going to be to the MTA, they coming after

1
2 so I understand that we should get the state to be
3 the one responsible so it... I understand the part, I
4 hope that we get something from the MTA but from the
5 city for us to be the same seeing the state all
6 others are not doing it, we are the city, I lead in
7 this too.

8 POLLY TROTTERBERG: Right and I'm, I'm
9 glad you'll also talk to the MTA about it look I
10 think the Mayor has said publicly he certainly thinks
11 the proposal is very worthwhile and understands of
12 course that, you know providing more affordable
13 transit fares for low income New Yorkers would be a
14 tremendous benefit, I don't... I don't think there's
15 really any dispute about that. The challenge is it's
16 a costly proposal and it would be over 200 million
17 dollars per year, I think if you look at the history
18 of things like, like Access-A-Ride or senior fares or
19 student fares the numbers go up so that would mean in
20 a five year period you're, you're going to be over a
21 billion dollars and this would be an ongoing
22 commitment and I think what the mayor has said is at
23 the moment he just doesn't feel like he wants to add
24 that, you know large new commitment to the city's
25 budget but he... I think he's, you know the MTA is a

1
2 state agency and I think he remains open to having
3 that discussion with the state but it is just a
4 question I think at this time in the city's budget
5 about whether we're prepared to take on, you know an
6 open-ended commitment of that magnitude and at least
7 while certainly seeing all the merits in the proposal
8 the Mayor has not yet been willing to commit to that.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I, I just hope
10 that we can again as we're in the middle of this
11 budget negotiation that we even can look at some
12 portion of that plan because we can provide metro
13 card for one group, we can choose let's say a student
14 at community college, 38 million dollars we provide
15 free metro cards towards students going to community
16 college, we can take a group of those who get public
17 assistance so even though I support the whole plan
18 but I hope again that... and I know that we're in the
19 middle of the conversation that we also can look at
20 this even as a pilot project... might start it with
21 something... [cross-talk]

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Right and look
23 obviously, we're, we're well aware of that so many...
24 so many council members have had an interest in this
25 and so many groups, you know that are... that the Mayor

1 is big supporters of and, you know the city just... I
2 mean for some background as we all know and in
3 partnership with you all the city is making a lot of
4 investments right now in housing, in health care and
5 education to try an increase a quality of reduced
6 poverty, the city has made an... a very large
7 commitment to the MTA capital plan, 2.5 billion so I
8 mean I do think in a lot of ways the city is trying
9 to step up and tackle some of these issues but
10 understood that this will certainly be a, a topic of
11 ongoing discussion and negotiation.
12

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I as, as he
14 already his check on UPK after school for all,
15 computer time for all, basic day, that also we can
16 see, you know is name on leading one of the most
17 progressive causes to see, to serve the disadvantaged
18 New Yorkers for them to move, go to look for jobs or
19 taking their children to a museum. Thank you, Council
20 Member Van Bramer.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you.
22 So, I know we're all being encouraged to be brief
23 and, and respect the fact that the MTA is here so
24 I'll try and do that. First of all I just want to say
25 thank you for the partnership that we've had, you

were just out on Northern Boulevard with me freezing yet again because you and I only have press conferences if it's about 10 degrees or below and I also want to say your testimony when you referred to the terrific capital investment in the Bridge that we all know and love as the Queensboro Bridge, not the 59th Street Bridge or the even it's more full, fully encompassing name so whoever helped write the testimony... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: They should have called it Queensboro, sorry.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I want to say... no, you, you called it by its right name then... and the... and the name that we appreciate so you had me at Queensboro Bridge Commissioner, let me just say that. You also mentioned the first phase of the Queens Boulevard project which I'm so proud that we've worked together on and the timeline, what is exactly the timeline on when we might expect capital construction to commence on the Queens Boulevard... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: I have... I, I will... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER:

...infrastructure... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTEMBERG: ...have Deputy

Commissioner Jarrin pull that out for us. I think we're starting next year, aren't we? Okay, go ahead, go.

JOSEPH JARRIN: Council Member the design for Queens Boulevard phase one is starting now and so it should be in... we have it in construction for fiscal year '19 so it should be in the next... by that time.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So fiscal year '19... [cross-talk]

JOSEPH JARRIN: That's two years from now.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Capital construction... [cross-talk]

JOSEPH JARRIN: ...will start... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: ...starts in two years.

JOSEPH JARRIN: It's, it's now the, the design phase that, that needs to go through with DDC notwithstanding earlier comments on moving these projects quicker but, but we, we hope to make it

1
2 happen in fiscal '18, if we can accelerate that
3 schedule but it's moving forward for, for... definitely
4 for fiscal '19.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Well I
6 looking forward to doing so obviously it's been a
7 remarkable success story, Queens Boulevard formally
8 the Queens Boulevard of death with now zero
9 pedestrian fatalities for, what is it two and a half
10 years now going on which is incredible, I'm really
11 proud of the work that we've all done together and I
12 think when we see the capital permanent, a
13 manifestation of that plan it'll be just so much
14 greater and I'm sure you and I will cut a ribbon or
15 break ground in about five degrees and a snow
16 blizzard when we do that Commissioner...

17 JOSEPH JARRIN: Do you guys work in the
18 spring at all?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: We have not,
20 we have really done several press conferences and it
21 has been absolutely freezing every single time
22 including our walk through of Queens Boulevard.

23 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Citi Bike was warm.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: That's right...
25 [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...we did that in the spring.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: ...yeah, that would have been odd if we were riding our bikes in 12-degree weather. I want to talk to you about select bus service because you talked very importantly about the select bus service and the funding there and, and I know that the MTA is in the room so I'm, I'm kind of talking to, to both of you at once with the influx in population in Long Island City that is already happened and that is anticipated including the Mayor proposing, rezoning of the core of Long Island City I think its imperative now for both agencies to be talking about and the Mayor investing in select bus service in and around Western Queens in particular so I wanted to ask if, if you are already at the table of the rezoning discussions and if this is part of that discussion?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: We, we are part of those discussions and you know one of the mandates actually of the citywide transit study that we're now undertaking was particularly to look at what is going to be the next phase of select bus service routes so... clearly Long Island City and areas all of the city

are going to be in the mix and, and obviously, we'll be taking input about what the next set of routes should look like.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Yes and I know this goes all the way to the top but obviously, the addition of a, a... an infusion of additional transportation options in Western Queens is absolutely imperative for the future of, of Western Queens and in my mind to any future potential rezoning in Long Island City.

POLLY TROTTERBERG: I, I would... I would say that I, I do feel like DOT and city planning and, and the MTA as well have really tried in, in the Mayors new set of rezonings to work together much more closely and try and anticipate I think in a much better way than perhaps was done in the past, how are we going to have all the infrastructure that's needed, the housing, the schools and the transportation.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Absolutely and look forward to continuing those discussions and, and my last 15 seconds I want to thank you also, I mean we're very proud that we're going to be getting additional ferry service in Western Queens and just

1 to point out that we are anticipating several
2 thousand new units of housing in the next year or two
3 alone and I had a meeting today that includes
4 thousands of units of affordable housing. So even
5 though we already have a ferry stop in Long Island
6 City it's actually imperative that we continue that
7 progress so those investments are worthy and well
8 placed in Western Queens, you can't do enough in
9 terms of transportation in terms of the growth of
10 Western Queens. I want to thank you again
11 Commissioner for being an exceptional partner with us
12 in all the progress that's happening in my district
13 and in Western Queens and the city of New York.

14 POLLY TROTTERBERG: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
16 Council Member Miller followed by Council Member
17 Reynoso.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Mr.
19 Chair. Good morning Commissioner you and your team.

20 POLLY TROTTERBERG: Good morning.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So I'd like to
22 talk about some of the things that we've been talking
23 about over the past three years as we kind of grow
24 this movement and, and figure out what this vision
25

looks like and, and... we... what we've been talking about where the transportation deserts that were throughout the city as my colleagues mentioned earlier in particular we're interested in Southeast Queens but we're also interested in district... the equitable distribution of those services whether... and, and what that looks like throughout the city. It was also mentioned that we... there were mention of the recent planning Town Halls that have taken place throughout the city needless to say there was not one in Southeast Queens that was disappointed, the two that occurred in, in the borough of Queens was in, I believe Jackson Heights and, and Ridgewood, we certainly requested and I have encouraged all constituency to participate as best as possible so the... although we were out last Monday for the Jamaica Now Plan which is... encompasses a very small portion of the greater Jamaica area outside of the downtown Jamaica community and the, the, the constituency was very concerned about that but what I did notice is a lot of the input that has occurred over the past few years were not a part of that plan and so people come out there very discouraged when they have really personal experiences and viable options around

1 transportation planning and, and we're not seeing
2 that. So, one of the things I'd like to encourage is
3 to, to come out and really have a Town Hall, myself
4 and Council Member Richards would, would, would
5 really love to do that now that we have the MTA here
6 just, just so you know we would like for you to be a
7 part of that as well. So, and, and then of course
8 it's about coordination of agencies, we're doing the...
9 I know that two... the Jamaica Avenue was partially
10 done from the city line to Francis Lewis Boulevard
11 and I know DDC was involved and the... and the rest
12 going in from 168... from Francis Lewis to 168th Street
13 but there's also a Vision Zero Project that DOT is
14 involved in does that include resurfacing of the
15 roadways?
16

17 POLLY TROTTERBERG: We're... which portion,
18 I'm going to make sure I'm... we're checking... [cross-
19 talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Jamaica Avenue...
21 [cross-talk]

22 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...the right... [cross-
23 talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...going... [cross-
25 talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...Jamaica Avenue...

[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...west from
Francis Lewis Boulevard to 168th Street.

POLLY TROTTERBERG: Okay. Yeah, let us...
let us check on that... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...Eastbound was
done already... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...but check on
Westbound... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...so... what I also
I have a flyer here that was distributed stating
that, that the Vision Zero project which would
increase the... would include additional mediums and
safety methods also repaving so if... I, I just want
you to clarify that and give me a timeline on that,
that is a, a, a big project that is going on but
also, I'd like to... we've heard over the last few
years about coordination between the agencies in
particular the MTA and what we noticed is that
particularly around bus operations and planning that
there have not been, that we have not seen what we've
asked for which is East, West, North, South
transportation opportunities. Not only are we not

1 connected to the rest of the city, we're not
2 connected to the borough. In order for... we're, we're...
3 our borough is like... our, our districts are right
4 next to each other but everything in the greater
5 Jamaica area forces you to go into downtown Jamaica
6 and take a bus back out to someone that's ten blocks
7 away or a mile away and, and that's something that's
8 so antiquated that we should be able to address that,
9 we've been talking about that and some other issues
10 we hope that collectively we could get to resolve
11 some of those issues and so as we... is there any
12 insight on the Jamaica Avenue plan and while you're
13 at it could we talk about the pedestrian way at
14 Parsons Boulevard?

16 POLLY TROTTERBERG: Well, well let me say
17 first of all we would certainly welcome Council
18 Members the chance to do Town Halls and we... let's try
19 and set those up as quickly as we can, we'd love to
20 have a discussion with your constituents, you know to
21 get obviously some firsthand understanding and we
22 know there are a lot of challenges in, in actually
23 both your districts in terms of transportation, we
24 recognize that, I mean one of the, the good things
25 we've been working through with the MTA, select bus

1 service, going out to the Rockaways and also now
2 doing a pilot project on the city ticket to hopefully
3 start to at least bring city constituents who live
4 near Long Island Railroad Stations the chance to use
5 Long Island Railroad at reduced fair so happy again
6 to have that Town Hall and jump into some of these
7 issues in more detail.

8
9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: That is great and
10 finally coordination of the, the, the cameras in the
11 bus lanes obviously you know we passed legislation
12 around commuter van, we're very thankful for the
13 assistance around that but the cameras in the bus
14 lanes are outside of the target area and we spoke
15 about that a few months ago and, and hopefully
16 there's a plan to put them where they need to be so
17 that they can really have an impact in easing the
18 congestion and illegal commuter van traffic that we
19 see in the downtown Jamaica area.

20 POLLY TROTTERBERG: Okay, let us... I want
21 to follow up with you again on the... on the camera
22 issue.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you so
24 much.

25 POLLY TROTTERBERG: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you for coming out.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Reynoso followed by Council Member Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Hello Commissioner and thank you for all you do for North Brooklyn, I really feel that we've made a lot of progress when it comes to the safety of our pedestrians, bicyclist and motorists across the board because of the great work that you do. I wanted to ask about the L train shutdown is coming, we have a study in I just want to know if in this budget, it's reflected... or if you've reflected any increase in funding for the possible bodark of a much more complicated gratuity for example and if not how are we supposed to accomplish that, is the MTA paying for it and so forth?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: We will be... we're working very closely with the MTA. As you know we've, we've done a lot of public outreach, met with a lot elected officials and we're hoping basically in the next couple of months to come back first to the elected officials with I think a more detailed set of plans and what we're looking for in terms of ferry

1 service, bus service, treatments we're going to do on
2 14th Street, treatments we may be doing on Grand
3 Street etcetera. I don't think we... we're, we're still
4 I think in a stage of doing some negotiations with
5 the MTA on exactly what those are going to look like
6 bringing them out to the elected officials and the
7 public, achieving some consensus and then pricing
8 different elements of it so it won't be in the budget
9 this year, it will certainly be teed up for next and,
10 and look we're talking to the MTA about how much will
11 be covered under the grants, the federal grants and
12 funds that they're putting towards this project and
13 what, what might be the city's piece and I don't
14 think we've resolved those discussions yet but we're
15 starting to piece through the numbers.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: And then my last
18 question is regarding bike infrastructure and so
19 forth I see that we get some of that money from the
20 federal government I just wanted to ask are you
21 concerned about losing any funding from the federal
22 government on any of these issues outside of... not
23 only biking but specifically biking I... [cross-talk]

24 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I mean look we, we
25 have used the Tiger Grant Program to make some

investments in Vision Zero upgrades which have helped with biking safety as well. Luckily for us the, the Tiger Grant Program is an important program but over a six year period the city has gotten about 58 million dollars so it's, it's been a good boost to our resources but certainly the city will continue it's, it's bike and pedestrian safety work, you know regardless of whether that program is around or not although it has been... it has been a source of funds for us.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you, keep up the good work.

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Reynoso left me two minutes, do I get seven... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Richards... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: No, I want... I want those two minutes... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...following Council... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: 7:43... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...Member... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...I went 7:43...
[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: The MTA needs to...
they... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright, let me go because I think my time is starting now. Thank you, Chairman, and thank you to the Commissioner and I thank Council Member Miller squarely put what, what I wanted to focus on today. So, I want to thank you first of all for your leadership and partnership on the extension and both the MTA, the extension of the 52 and also Select Bus Service for the 52 and 53 and also ferry service and, and, and whatever more we're going to do together I guess in terms of streetscape work this year in, in my district as well. A few issues that I wanted to bring up. So, median upkeep which is a huge issue, sanitation department, DOT always point at each other when it comes to maintaining medians in our district and I'm sure across other parts of Queens and other parts of the city they are going through the same thing. It's a big issue in our district because it causes flooding,

1
2 you know when DEP puts green infrastructure in its
3 put in to sort of soak up rainwater and, and help
4 with, with, with water overflow. The issue we're
5 having in our community is the lack of investment and
6 upkeep on, on a lot of these medians, there's no curb
7 cuts around them so I'm interested in hearing are you
8 budgeting any money to make sure that this issue is
9 finally addressed?

10 POLLY TROTTERBERG: I mean you, you are
11 right Council Member its certainly an issue I hear
12 about all over the city and you know one where I
13 think we're doing our best to work with local elected
14 to prioritize those areas where we can target
15 investments. Now happily in, in Southeastern Queens
16 obviously we're going to be... the city, DOT and DEP
17 are going to be working together on a lot of major
18 roadway and, and water and sewer infrastructure which
19 I think will do a lot to improve some of those areas
20 over all but if there are particular median areas you
21 want us to take a look at let us come take a look, as
22 I say I mean at this point admittedly we do... we have
23 to prioritize given that it is some... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And also just
25 keeping them clean so I hear that we have to call 311

but the upkeep of this infrastructure is disastrous and there needs to be more of an emphasis on upkeep as well so can you speak to that as well?

POLLY TROTTEBERG: I mean again we work with... we work with sanitation on that and you know if there are places that unfortunately are being I think particularly not as well cared for as they should let's try and work together and focus on those.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, alright. Traffic studies so we work very closely with your Queens office and I'm very happy at... with the progress that we have made but I feel there's a lot more progress that could be made if we had more traffic study engineers out there, is there any money in the budget to make sure... because this is the number one issue at least in Southeast Queens; speeding cars and I'm sure across the city there are many other people with the same challenges but one of the issues we find is the lack of engineers that we have or the, the little bit we have we can't maximize on opportunities that I feel we can move through to make sure a lot of these traffic studies move a little faster.

POLLY TROTTERBERG: As, as, as I had I think said in my opening testament look a challenge I think a lot of city agencies are seeing, we have, you know all of you and, and you constituents come to us with... for example requests for, for traffic signals and we have seen in recent years the number of requests we're getting for those types of studies has doubled and each of those studies requires engineers to go out and you all, many of you are familiar with this, requires engineers to go out in the field and do analysis and traffic counts. So, I, I'm... I want to be grateful to the Mayor, he has given me resources and we have increased the number of traffic engineers and teams we have out there doing this study but it's also true that the demand in a growing city understandably is also continuing to grow. So, you know particularly we're seeking to prioritize best we can and you know happy to talk if there are areas where you're feeling frustrated that we're not getting to them but we are certainly I think having some growing pains in terms of the incoming... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...yes... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...volume of, of study requests we're getting.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, city ticket any update on city ticket actually happening in Far Rockaway and I know the MTA is here as well and we've been having this same discussion for the last I feel like 15, 20 years so do you have any updates on... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: Well we... we're making some progress and I know the MTA will, will speak about this in more detail, I mean they have proposed along with our... the last time we looked at fares and tolls to do a pilot project to pick certain... to pick certain... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: No, I get that... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I get the freedom... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...you want... you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...ticket but I'm... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 94

2 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...want... you want to
3 fix... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...talking about...
5 [cross-talk]

6 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...the Rockaways...
7 [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...city ticket in
9 which Far Rockaway is the only... [cross-talk]

10 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...right, yeah... [cross-
11 talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...station...
13 [cross-talk]

14 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...is the only station...
15 [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...in New York
17 City... [cross-talk]

18 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...that doesn't get it...
19 [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...that doesn't
21 have city ticket... [cross-talk]

22 POLLY TROTTERBERG: I know it was on the
23 MTA's list of things they were considering and so I
24 guess I'll, I'll let them give you the final answer
25 on that one.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright...

[cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: We are certainly supportive of it.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Since I have 17 seconds I will direct all of the rest of my testimony to the MTA because I have to step out for a meeting but I am disgusted with the MTA's communication with my community and I was recently informed that the MTA is no longer doing community meetings and I just find that disturbing and disgusting, you know I think for New Yorkers across the city who paid their fare, I just paid mine this morning, they deserve to hear from the MTA on issues that are happening in their communities while I appreciate the freedom ticket pilot I will give you kudos for that but on city ticket on the A train which is dismal service our community deserves answers and we're not going to stop lobbying to ensure that there's better service not only in the Rockaways but Southeast Queens is a whole... we are being give third world service in terms of bus service, in terms of train service and it's just disgusting that we have to continuously have the same discussion and then be told that we don't do

community meetings and I have a problem with that and my constituents have a problem with that and they deserve to hear directly from the MTA so I'm hoping after this meeting, you know I will definitely hear from the MTA on this policy that I think is nonsense and, and a policy that does not serve the public well. So, I'm sorry I'm a little angry about it but my constituents deserve better and this city deserves better. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you Mr. Chairman. Welcome back Commissioner, how are you today? I can't hear you, I'm sorry, is the mic off?

POLLY TROTTEBERG: I'm well, thank you Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Is that an off the record comment?

POLLY TROTTEBERG: No, no, it was on the record... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: First of all I, I'm noticing a Queens bias over, all that you... you keep visiting all the Queens members, I haven't seen you in my district in a while, can we get you to come

visit, is it possible or do you just go to the Queens portions of... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: No, I'm in... I'm in five boroughs... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...the cities... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...would be happy to... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...yes... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...do a visit with you in your district.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Oh wonderful, so I'm looking forward to that just a little council member jealousy there. So, I, I would like to focus first on some... because it is a budget hearing, I'll focus first on some of the budget items and then I'll, I'll leave some of the other stuff for the end. I also want to add my voice as a, a strong supporter of the Fair Fares movement and certainly whatever can be done in that regard, I think you may have heard my comments in the last hearing even though you weren't here, you sent one of your trusted advisors and I'm sure he dutifully reported back my passionate

feelings on this subject. That being said I'm going to move on to some of the budget related issues. Last time we were chatting you said that you guys had some struggles with the bus time and the bus shelter contracts, have you fixed those problems?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: We have fixed them and look I, I, I do want to apologize we, we did have some struggles, we had both contracting struggles and then it took us more time than it should have to ensure that we were doing the proper accessibility for the visually impaired. So, I have to apologize to Council Members, we had promised we would get that out, up and running sooner than we did but we are on track now this year in this spring we're going to be rolling out the funds that were allocated fiscal year '13 and fiscal year '15 so we're hoping to get about 225 up this year and the rest in the next year.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Are my... are my bus lines included in that?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: I believe you're... what year was your allocation?

REBECCA ZACK: '16... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: What's that?

REBECCA ZACK: I think your allocation was in FY '16.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Was it in '16 I thought it was... [cross-talk]

REBECCA ZACK: I think so.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I thought it was '15... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: We, we have the chart, we'll double check, we're, we're going to be doing '13 and '15 this year and '16 and '17 next year and, and again I, I... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay, what about... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...I'll admit... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...what about the bus shelters, I know we had some drama with those as well so that's for the bus time, right?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: What about the bus shelters?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: I mean the, the... putting in the new bus shelters... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Yeah... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...we have you know a contract with JC Decaux which has been the city's contractor on all the bus shelters and you know the contract we originally had with them had had a fixed number of shelters we've been in some discussion about how we might expand that program, I have to admit so far, we have not I think reached... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: So you haven't had any success with that?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: We have not had any success yet in reaching a resolution... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Well disappointing to here. I'm, I'm just simply responding to you based on the information that I see here as we're going through a participatory budgeting process and the number one request was new bus shelters but we couldn't put the funding in because we knew that it wouldn't go anywhere so... I certainly would encourage you to look at that model. What about in lei of bus shelters in the meanwhile can we get some benches in maybe instead of bus shelters, we

1 don't need full shelters if you have the ability to
2 install benches at bus stops for those elderly folks,
3 I know you're young but you know for them older folks
4 it's difficult for them to stand and wait for the bus
5 and they don't even know when it's coming because the
6 bus time clocks were supposed to be there years ago
7 still haven't been installed.. [cross-talk]

8 POLLY TROTTERBERG: They will be coming..

9 [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...yet so...

11 [cross-talk]

12 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...the bus time clocks,
13 I'm happy to... I'm happy to look at locations... [cross-
14 talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...I mean at
16 least... [cross-talk]

17 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...for benches... [cross-
18 talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...my thought
20 is if they knew that the bus time... when the bus was
21 coming maybe they would sort of steal themselves and
22 sort of say oh the bus is coming in a few minutes but
23 now they have to stand there and hope and wait and so
24 if at least we give them some seats perhaps we'd make
25

1
2 their lives a little bit better and they are elderly,
3 some of them are sick.

4 POLLY TROTTERBERG: Yeah, happy to look
5 at locations for benches and, and fair point to
6 continue to wrestle though what has turned out to be
7 complicated in terms of expanding the contracts to do
8 new bus shelters.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: But you
10 definitely could do benches?

11 POLLY TROTTERBERG: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay. Let's
13 chat a little bit about snow cleaning, whose
14 responsible for snow cleaning of the bus stops, in
15 the last storm I know we were... we thought it was
16 going to be the Armageddon but it wasn't in the end,
17 it was six, seven, eight inches and it took in some
18 cases three, four days to clear the, the bus stops,
19 right, I'm not talking about the shelters, I'm
20 talking about a regular bus stop where people would
21 just sit there and wait, I mean I actually literally
22 saw people trying to get off the bus tripping over
23 mounds of snow, whose job is that and why haven't
24 they been doing it?

2 POLLY TROTTERBERG: The shelters... the,
3 the... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Not the
5 shelters... I get the shelters are... [cross-talk]

6 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...the, the... [cross-
7 talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...under
9 contract... [cross-talk]

10 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...bus stops... [cross-
11 talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...the regular
13 good old fashioned... [cross-talk]

14 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...right, right...
15 [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...bus stops...
17 [cross-talk]

18 POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...well I mean... [cross-
19 talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...like the
21 poles with those little signs.

22 POLLY TROTTERBERG: Right, right, DOT
23 works with sanitation on those and look one, one
24 challenge we had this particular snow storm is some
25 of those areas got cleaned and then re-plowed again

1 and then sometimes what got re-plowed got frozen into
2 a state that really required actually people to come
3 out with shovels and pick it open but... look I think
4 we always have lesson learns in every storm about how
5 we can do things better and we always do a... sort of
6 an after action where we look at where we got
7 complaints and weren't... things weren't done as well
8 as they could have been and try and be shrewder about
9 how to redeploy our resources for the coming storms.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFEILD: Final

12 question because I'm out of time, you mentioned my
13 funding for sidewalks the sidewalk funding will... what
14 is that going to go for so for example I've got a lot
15 of broken sidewalks, parks have broken sidewalks in
16 my district, the police department have broken
17 sidewalks in my district, is that separate pots of
18 funding or is that part of the funding that you're
19 referring to in terms of the sidewalk repairs and
20 good luck getting the parks department to... or the
21 police department to actually fix their sidewalk?

22 POLLY TROTTERBERG: It, it is a separate
23 pot, we have been for example in the case of NYCHA
24 using some of our sidewalk funds to help fix
25 sidewalks around NYCHA because there's been such a

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I look forward to welcoming you in the 44th council district and perhaps you and I will take a stroll along my favorite... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...Boulevard,
Busch... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...Parkway,
absolutely, it's a date. Thank you Commissioner.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES:

Commissioner always good to see you. I was outside this morning with James, ABC we had... looking forward to ferry launch. So, my question relates to Steinway Street, you know many of the merchants have approached me and, and really... it could be a bad

1
2 experience moving forward, you know I can buy a phone
3 online, I can buy a sweater online so shopping is
4 going to become the experience on the block and how
5 we can support our local store to go from the Gap to
6 Children's Place just equally distanced across the
7 street because there are no midblock crossings on
8 Steinway it's an extra 1,000 feet. It doesn't make it
9 convenient to get across, we've had 95 pedestrian
10 injuries and, and 243 traffic injuries on Steinway so
11 we're looking for more LPI's and then looking for a,
12 a, a town square or place to light a holiday tree, a
13 place to have a concert or place to have a town
14 meeting so I, I spoke to Nicole whose been great but
15 we definitely need your support in helping us think
16 through how we think about 21st... Steinway in the 21st
17 century and supporting the beating heart commercial
18 strip of our neighborhood.

19 POLLY TROTTERBERG: I mean Commissioner
20 Garcia has filled me in on your conversations with
21 her, something that she I know is enthusiastic about
22 and would love to sit down and actually maybe take
23 another walking trip through and then talk about what
24 we can do to help you there, we, we think we could do
25 some really great work there.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I'd, I'd love to invite you to come do that, I mean... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Okay and we'll... and we'll do it.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you Commissioner.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner I have like two or three more questions on... to summarize; one is on... and this is like one of the concerns Council Member Miller had which is when DOT is doing road repair do you or can you work to put this information online so that members of the community they know what they should expect in their local community?

POLLY TROTTEBERG: I mean we, we try and do as, as good a job as we can I think in getting the word out and we put it online, we send announcements to all the community boards, the local precincts, I usually see that the local papers around the city will print our resurfacing schedule for the week. if you've... if you've... and I know this is something that Council Member Deutsch had mentioned the last time I testified if there are places where we think there's

1
2 some failure in communication let us know and we'll,
3 we'll try and improve it, it's certainly... we want
4 everybody to know our schedule ahead of time so that
5 they can obviously plan for it.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You do put it
7 online?

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We put it online, we
9 send it out to the papers, the community boards, the
10 precincts, I mean I think we... I'm looking over at my
11 communications crew, I think we try and get the word
12 out best we can all over the, the internet.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, that's
14 good. And, and with the bus shelter in Council Member
15 Miller... I mean Greenfield had started this question,
16 it's very frustrating to see how those private
17 contractors they are not living to their
18 responsibility, it's too much and, and what's going
19 on like when can we expect that when we have a new
20 snow in our streets the bus shelter will be clean
21 like ice... I to... and I, I can... I know like in the past
22 I have sent photos to you guys so that you can see
23 and this is not about please let her know which bus
24 shelter are in that condition, this is about... you
25 know are we... are they reporting, how we put in this

1 information online. So, I saw people like three days
2 after the, the snow that got in the city being in the
3 middle of the street because the bus shelter was full
4 of snow like what... how are we making those private
5 contractors accountable for them to clean not in
6 particular area but in all bus shelters that we have
7 in the city?
8

9 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Mr. Chairman this is
10 obviously a topic that we've discussed before and I,
11 I think this past year we actually had a sit down
12 with, with JC Decaux and you to try and talk through
13 some of the issues, you know we are now looking at
14 them to clear the 3,500 bus stops every time there's
15 a storm and I think one thing we, we did... when I, I
16 spoke to you and I did look into what was happening,
17 you called me about some stops in your district and
18 obviously there was some other members who had
19 tweeted about it and we, we sat back down with them
20 and I think one of the challenges we saw and we're
21 going to be I think working through this and
22 obviously maybe your staff can be a part of the
23 discussions is one of the things we require them to
24 do is get in and clear the stops kind of on the same
25 time table that we have homeowners clear the

1 sidewalks but the one key difference is when a
2 homeowner clears their sidewalks they're clear, when
3 JC Decaux is... has their... has their contractors come
4 out and clear the bus stops unfortunately what, what
5 did happen this last time is in a lot of cases
6 sanitation came through and plowed the snow back in
7 again. So, we're going to try I think and sit down
8 and see if there is a... and then once that happens
9 then they'll complaints and then it takes them a
10 while to get back out and clear them again. So, I
11 think we're going to love to have your staff
12 participate, sit down and see do we need to have a
13 smarter protocol in the contract that will ensure
14 that by the time they clear the stop that it stays
15 clear and we're also going to bring sanitation into
16 that discussion to see... so at the very least we don't
17 re-plow back the stops that... [cross-talk]

18
19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I, I... [cross-
20 talk]

21 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...that the contractor
22 has just dug out because that is clearly something
23 that's happened and that's not the only issue but
24 that is one that certainly when I looked at some
25

cases that people were calling in about that was one of the problems we saw.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, I understand that again and, and I know that you're working hard the agency and... you know we had that experience with Cemusa in the past now it can be with the new one JC, it's about thousands of New Yorkers relied to take the bus especially senior citizens and we know that, we know that probably they go and clean once or twice a day and then sanitation they have to do their work and they plow the snow inside the bus shelter but we have to find a solution because, you know... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...yes... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...people cannot be waiting in the street or not to having a space to... especially senior citizens.

POLLY TROTTERBERG: We, we agree, we're, we're going to re-circle and, and see if there's a smarter protocol we can do for, for next winter's storms.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah and, and my other question is on... and it's more with the interest to know will the DOT work with intersection, we have

seen an expansion of more advertising in the sidewalk is that a pilot project that you're doing with this section or the contracts are ready for them to be advertising and, and is that advertising that we see in the sidewalk an agreement where also the city benefits... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: Do, do you mean the, the link NYC... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: ...kiosk... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...uh-huh... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTERBERG: That's really a program that's being run out of City Hall, out of... out of DoITT, the, the Mayor's Technology Office, I mean DOT we're... we sort of play a supporting role in helping as those kiosks go up and making sure they have the electrical connections and the permits they need but we're, we're not the lead agency on those, its, it's DoITT.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Who is the lead agency?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: DoITT and roast, the, the, the Department of Technology... I don't know what...

even what... Information Technology, I apologize I'm not even sure of the answer... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And, and again for me I, I see as a good move for us to take advantage of, you know the sidewalk but I'm more thinking on how if their... that agreement with the city and, and the private entity are we also using it for... do some educational Vision Zero for the city?

POLLY TROTTERBERG: Yeah, I, I know that they... a certain amount of that advertising is provided for, for public service announcements and I think we have been talking to them about doing a series of Vision Zero messages.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And SBS and BRT, how... what are the challenges and again like it's good to go with... transition for here for you leaving then MTA coming on board and I know that making more BRT, bringing more buses, bringing more technology from the MTA but also when it comes to really signing our sidewalk and also working with the... with the light signal so for the buses to be moving quickly like how are we... I mean and, and we saw the jump of New Yorkers using buses in the last two years so... and it should be our business to take... to bring back those

1 New Yorkers, we can argue that you know those close
2 to two million who are not using buses anymore they
3 are doing it because they are using app services
4 because they... we have the ferry transportation, I get
5 that part in the argument but I also believe that
6 there's another reason on why New Yorkers has say...
7 I'm not taking the M3 bus in Washington Heights
8 because I can get to my destination faster if I walk
9 than if I get into the bus and here we have good
10 experience with it be... SBA and the BRT and I see...
11 like SBS I take it... why do we turn that SBS as a BRT
12 so that we really send a sidewalk that we bring all
13 the tools that is part of the BRT to that SBS and do
14 we have another SBS throughout the city that also we
15 can bring anything that we have, any tools that they
16 need to provide those New Yorkers a better experience
17 for them to get to their destination quickly?

18 POLLY TROTTERBERG: I think... it's, it's
19 good to sort of distinguish between... I think the
20 three different things you're, you're talking about
21 Mr. Chairman BRT, Bus Rapid Transit which is
22 basically the highest level where you're, you know
23 you're potentially re-construction, redesigning the
24 street, putting in a lot of passenger infrastructure...
25

1 Woodhaven Boulevard was one of the places that we
2 really want to do that and I'll, I'll talk a bit
3 about some of the challenges we faced there then kind
4 of the next level which is what we I think have done
5 in great partnership with the MTA which is Select Bus
6 Service which is not as much of an elaborate capital
7 project, what... but what has enabled us to put
8 projects up all over the city relatively quickly and
9 relatively low cost, you know in the... in the ten to
10 20 million dollar range as opposed to capital
11 projects which in this city as we all know can often
12 cost hundreds of millions and we've... I think I'm
13 proud to say tripled the rate working with our
14 partners at the MTA in which we're doing those Select
15 Bus Service projects but they are time consuming,
16 they do require I think appropriately so a lot of
17 community outreach and a lot of working really
18 closely at a very glandular level with local
19 merchants and buildings and other, you know users on
20 the curb and making sure that as we speed our bus
21 speeds of... as we have done with Select Bus Service
22 that we're keeping the other parts of the street
23 functioning well. You also mentioned something that's
24 another area where we want to do more with the MTA
25

and actually where I'm happy to say the MTA board has been really having a robust discussion, what can we do to improve bus service all over the city even on routes that are not Select Bus Service routes and you know we know the toolbox of things. One is dedicated bus lanes which in some parts of the city have honestly proved more popular than in other parts of the city. Doing transit signal prioritization which requires both the city and the MTA to... the city needs to, to put electronic components in its signal system, the MTA needs to have some electronic components in their buses and we've got a few routes with transit signal priority, I think both agencies agree we'd like to pick up the pace on that. It, it does do a lot to speed bus speeds. The MTA is also now in the midst of their procurement as a lot of us know for their next generation of fare medium, moving from the metro card to whatever is going to come next and I, I think I've said before this is a very, very important procurement something everyone in the city should care about, this is kind of a once in a generation change in fare median, I think the city has certainly encouraged the MTA to look at something that is contactless, something that can particularly

1 for buses be done perhaps off board because one of
2 the things you see particularly on busy bus routes,
3 cross town routes in Manhattan a lot of the time that
4 the bus is dwelling it's dwelling while people get on
5 the bus and swipe their metro cards and if you can
6 have that happen as we do with SBS off board that can
7 speed up the travel time tremendously. There are
8 technological issues to work through there and the
9 MTA... and they'll... I'm sure they'll speak about it,
10 wants to make sure it's not going to lead to, to a
11 ramp in fare evasion although it hasn't in the case
12 of Select Bus Service. So, I think there's all three
13 levels of challenge. Woodhaven Boulevard is a project
14 where we would like to do something more robust like
15 a more BRT treatment with a big capital plan, you
16 know we are going to be putting in this year the
17 operational project, it's no secret it's been pretty
18 controversial, I'm hoping when that's in the ground
19 and it works well people will see the benefits of it
20 and then we can move on to the next bigger level of
21 the project and that's something that I think will be
22 a good showcase for other parts of the city to see.

23
24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You know for me I
25 look at not only... I, I see as important need to move

1 quick in that direction because we cannot attract
2 teachers let's say to go and teach in a school where
3 they don't have access to mass transportation. Now
4 there's a school in places in the Bronx and Brooklyn
5 that people got to be walking like they... the closest
6 thing that they have to go to the school and teach is
7 a bus because the train is like 20 blocks away from
8 there and this is probably one of the great access
9 that we have today because its less expensive than
10 building us a new train and it doesn't take as long
11 as making a new train and I just thought that we as a
12 city working together, DOT and the MTA, you know we'd
13 make this as a priority, we need to improve the
14 efficiencies and the safety of the bus system in New
15 York City. We have been behind other cities in the
16 world and, and I know that other places they only run
17 buses up to ten p.m. or 12 p.m. and we can say our
18 buses are there 24 hours but for many New Yorkers
19 this is the only access to transportation that they
20 have so I'm happy to hear that you're working on that
21 and with that thank you for your participation and
22 now we're going to be welcoming... [cross-talk]

24 POLLY TROTTERBERG: Thank you... [cross-
25 talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: the MTA. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, let's continue. So, as I said before now we will have the MTA institution which entity has a value of one trillion dollars responsible for running one of the most important mass transportation not in the nation but also in the world and, and I think that the conversation here as it all happened before is coming from the place of how much more can we do. The MTA is refusing to go to community to be a community board, yes they did in my district and, and that's something that... you know like I only see as a benefit for us to engage in conversation to listen and how can we do better and, and, and I just hope that if by any chance that's not a general policy that we learn from those experiences and you will hear from all the council member as I say in my own district, I have a, a Town Hall meeting with public advocate and myself with more than 200 residents sitting on Northern Manhattan to talk about... and the only thing that they came was to grow the suggestion on the condition of the elevator, how to improve it and I don't know why that we got like the last minute of conference for

nobody in that... in that Town Hall meeting but I hope again that this is not a general decision of the MTA and we can work together because everyone here is responsible to move and not only the 8.5 million New Yorkers but also more than 55 million tourists that come to our city so with that I welcome the MTA.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right hand, do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee and to respond honestly to council member questions?

[dialogue of affirmatives]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Good afternoon Chairman Rodriguez, can you tell me if Chairwoman Ferreras-Copeland is here today too? I thought this was a joint hearing with her committee? If not I'm backing off and I'm starting again... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: This is a preliminary budget this chair is organized by the Committee of Finance but is run by each committee and therefor this is Committee of Transportation.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Okay. Good afternoon Chairman Rodriguez and members of the city council. I

am Michael Chubak, Chief Financial Officer for New York City Transit. Joining me today are David Keller, Senior Deputy Director for MTA Budget and Stephanie DeLisle, the Director of MTA Capital Funding. We are here today at the Council's invitation to discuss the Mayor's Fiscal Year 2018 Preliminary Budget, particularly as it relates to the City's contribution to the operating and capital budgets of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority. The MTA is pleased to have a fully funded 29.5 billion dollars 2015 through 2019 capital program which includes 2.5 billion dollars in funding support from the City of New York and 8.3 billion from the State of New York. this is the single largest capital program in the MTA history and a major accomplishment towards our efforts to transform, renew, enhance and expand the system. Overall, the MTA's current five-year capital program, approved last spring allocates more than 16 billion dollars in capital funding for New York City Transit initiatives to improve and expand the system. The city has also contributed one billion dollars, or nearly seven percent, of our annual 15.6-billion-dollar budget to support day to day operations of New York City Transit, MTA Bus, and Staten Island

Railway, as well as the maintenance of the commuter rail stations within New York City. The MTA is working hard to be a prudent steward of the funds targeted for mass transit. In our February financial plan, MTA increased its savings targets by 50 million dollars per year and expects to achieve annual recurring savings of two billion dollars per year by the year 2020. This cost cutting effort is the most aggressive in the MTA's history and the savings we are realizing are benefitting our operations and our customers in countless ways. Most notably, it has allowed us to keep fare and toll increases at an average of two percent per year, below the rate of inflation. In fact, this year's increase is the smallest increase since 2009. NYC Transit is also committed to continually identifying innovative, cost effective solutions for long standing operational challenges, and addressing concerns created by the very high ridership and capacity constraints our system is experiencing. As many of you know, we are seeing record high ridership, the heaviest ridership we have experienced since the years following World War II. On the subway system alone we serve close to six million riders on 8,000 daily trips across 472

stations. Our capital program seeks to renew and enhance the system to accommodate this growing ridership. We took a big step toward that goal with completion of the first phase of the Second Avenue Subway earlier this year, marking New York City's first new subway line in over 60 years. With three brand new fully accessible stations at the 72nd Street, 86th Street and 96th Street, Q train service now links the Upper East Side to Midtown and the West Side. Second Avenue Subway ridership is continuing to grow and is already alleviating crowding at Upper East Side stations along the Lexington Avenue line during morning rush hour by an average of 46 percent. We are also making substantial investments to modernize the signal system. Much of the subway's signal system was built in the 1930's, and roughly 30 percent of the signal system was installed before 1965 and has never been rehabilitated. Signal failures are a major cause of subway delays. This is why we are spending 2.75 billion dollars in the current capital program to modernize our signal system, including more than one billion dollars to install Communications Based Train Control, CBTC, which will allow trains to run more closely together

and more reliably. We are working to install CBTC on the EFM and R lines in Queens, the AC and E lines in Manhattan, and the F line in Brooklyn. CBTC is already fully in place on the L line and is nearing completion on the 7 line where we are spending 774 million dollars to complete the work on the Flushing line by the end of this year. We are also spending 1.8 billion dollars to replace 72 miles of track and 127 switches. This work will improve reliability on line segments and reduce defects and failures, as well as reduce impacts to service. And, we are investing billions on new subway cars, including new open ended connecting cars, with wider doors and more space near the doors to add capacity. This configuration will allow customers to distribute more evenly in the train, thereby helping to reduce dwell time and delays. The MTA is also investing heavily to improve the passenger station environment. The MTA has accelerated cellular connectivity in underground stations, as well as Wi-Fi capability to meet the demand of our customers for underground communications and connectivity. As of January, cell phone coverage and Wi-Fi are available in all underground subway stations a full two years ahead of

1 schedule. Our "Enhanced Station Initiative" is
2 revamping the design guidelines for more than 30
3 stations system wide to completely overhaul these
4 stations in the most efficient way possible. In order
5 to fast track the renovations, the stations will be
6 temporarily closed, enabling the contractor to get
7 in, get the work done, and get out quickly.

8 Contractors are incentivized to keep closures as
9 short as possible. When they are reopened, stations
10 will have improved signage for easier navigation,
11 including digital, real time service updates at
12 subway entrances before customers even enter the
13 station, as well as countdown clocks, and new art
14 that considers the architectural legacy of each
15 station. NYC Transit is fully committed to making the
16 subway system increasingly accessible to customers
17 with disabilities. We have completed 86 of the 100
18 Americans with Disabilities Act, ADA Key Stations
19 designated via our agreements with the Federal
20 Transit Administration and New York State. All of the
21 remaining 14 key stations are scheduled to be
22 complete by July 2020, consistent with these
23 agreements. Elevators are also installed in an
24 additional 31 non-key stations. We are also
25

1 accelerating the implementation of countdown clocks
2 to the entire system on a line by line basis. The
3 exact timeframes will be announced for each line,
4 with the goal of having all lines completed by the
5 end of this year. This effort will provide real time
6 train arrival information to customers awaiting
7 trains on station platforms. The new clocks rely on
8 technology that is straightforward, cost effective to
9 deploy, and does not require major construction; it
10 utilizes the existing wireless network in the
11 stations in conjunction with cloud computing and
12 Bluetooth devices located along the platforms of each
13 station to accommodate, to... excuse me, to communicate
14 with Bluetooth devices installed in the first and
15 last cars of every train operating on the line. We
16 are also expanding and renewing our bus operation.
17 The first of 83 new busses equipped with Wi-Fi
18 service and USB ports have arrived in the Bronx. The
19 first 43 new SBS buses have also arrived in the Bronx
20 and Queens. The new arrivals are part of the
21 Governor's initiative to revitalize the MTA's bus
22 operations with over 2,000 state of the art buses
23 joining the fleet over the course of five years. The
24 new buses will replace nearly 40 percent of the MTA's
25

current fleet and represent a 1.3-billion-dollar investment of Capital Program resources. The MTA is also working closely with the New York City Department of Transportation to cut bus travel times by converting additional routes to Select Bus Service. In addition, the MTA has installed digital information screens on 131 buses as a pilot on the M15 SBS, B46 SBS and S79 SBS routes, with the aim of rolling out digital screens to 3,600 buses. The digital screens will offer audio and visual route and next stop information, including transfer points. Beginning this year, all new buses delivered to the MTA will come with digital information screens and all buses that are not earmarked to be replaced over the next five years will be retrofitted with the screens. These are just a few highlights from a diverse and robust program that invests in nearly every aspect of our operations and infrastructure, modernizing, enhancing, replacing and bringing essential system components to a state of good repair for the record ridership we experience... excuse me, we expect to experience for the foreseeable future. The City's investment in the MTA yields tremendous dividends, as subway, bus and commuter rail

operations are critical to the day to day functioning of New York City and provide the foundation for the economic well-being of the City and the region. Our capital program is creating hundreds of thousands of jobs, in New York City and the region, and will continue to fuel our region's thriving economy for decades to come. We thank the City for partnering with us financially and otherwise to deliver safe, reliable service to New Yorkers. My colleagues and I will now respond to any questions you may have with respect to our testimony. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. I would like to start with bus service as you heard sitting back there, this is something that many of us we have a concern as also many New Yorkers which is the decrease on New Yorkers using buses like have the MTA done some study or trying to figure out why is that we have seen a major decrease of New Yorkers giving up from using our public buses?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: So we... [clears throat] excuse me, the decline in bus ridership actually is a, a long-term trend that's been going on for many years. There was a time after the introduction of Metro card when ridership picked up on buses but

1 since 2009 or so the historical decline has resumed.
2 One of the major reasons we believe is competition,
3 essentially the subway has improved over the last 20
4 or so years and so it provides an alternative to bus...
5 to bus riders and we've noticed one fact which is
6 that on routes that parallel... excuse me, bus routes
7 that parallel subway lines ridership is declining
8 more. I should also point out that the, the ridership
9 decline on buses is not uniform, it's been pronounced
10 in Manhattan and less so in Brooklyn but in the other
11 three boroughs; the Bronx, Staten Island and Queens
12 ridership has basically been holding steady for the
13 past few years. One of the obvious problems is
14 traffic and congestion which reduces bus speeds and
15 we're convinced that higher speed speeds can help
16 encourage ridership and in fact our experience with
17 SBS confirms this, as the, the package of
18 improvements that we've implemented in conjunction
19 with the New York City DOT for SBS has resulted in
20 faster speeds and also better ridership results for
21 those lines.
22

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I, I would like
24 to say that, you know that the main factor of the
25 reduction is the competition but I also agree with

1 many New Yorkers say we've been leaving negative
2 experience. We get to destinations faster if we walk
3 than we take a bus and because of traffic and because
4 so many factors. So how is... and like I say like M3 in
5 my district like I heard the complaint from hundreds
6 of New Yorkers like... and what are we doing like... you
7 know like are we... is MTA working with the DOT to say
8 like you know this is not only because we had the
9 apps company, this is not because people are
10 switching more to, to prearrange a car but being
11 realistic and say like our buses are running slow,
12 you know...

14 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So we're looking at a... I
15 mentioned SBS, we're also looking at improvements
16 other than SBS again in conjunction with DOT, the two
17 most notable would be to install bus lanes
18 independent of SBS, we're very hopeful for that as
19 well as to reconsider the spacing of bus stops to
20 improve speeds but, but it's, it's a difficult
21 challenge. There's obviously a lot of congestion out
22 there.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I just hope... I
24 just hope you know that we can decide to leave a
25 legacy because you... no, we're, we're going to be

1 doing business as usual, we will one day leave our
2 role and somebody else will take him... that will come
3 and take it and the buses will continue running as it
4 is today and I think that we had a potential, we have
5 a ceiling to grow when it comes to bringing like a
6 major problem, providing a better experience for
7 people because for some people let's say Manhattan
8 sometimes we had choices but someone who is a teacher
9 as I said before in a school in the Bronx and the
10 only modern transportation that they have is to take
11 a bus to get close to their school and the time of
12 waiting and the time for them to go from destination
13 A to B is taking so long like that's not the best way
14 of how we can recruit teachers to say I would like to
15 go and teach in that school but now that same
16 experience for a parent who also is saying I would
17 like to take my child... my children to a after school
18 program or a cultural event like... and again we can...
19 we don't have the billions of dollars to build a new
20 train in those areas, the only thing that we have in
21 our hand is our buses and I believe... and you are the
22 experts on that, I think it'd take less money if we
23 work together in this case led by you guys and be
24 sure that we can move our buses quickly in, in our
25

1 city. The second question is on the CBTC again I
2 represent a district that we cover A train in
3 Washington Heights but the A train, you know is not
4 only... is very important not only for residents of
5 Northern Manhattan but for many New Yorkers coming
6 from Queens and then going to Northern Manhattan and
7 the train again is a... it's a long road, a route
8 however it's a slow train and what we heard from you
9 guys and others from your team is that if the CBTC...
10 you know when the CBTC is complete it will help the
11 train to come quickly to the train station how are
12 we... I mean and you mentioned in your testimony the
13 whole plan but what is the deadline, when are you
14 planning to complete all the new work that you're
15 doing with the CBTC?

17 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So the... it will take a
18 good number of years to be honest to, to convert to
19 CBTC the entire system. The... in my testimony I
20 mentioned and... the improvements we're planning in
21 this capital program on the AC and E line and you
22 mentioned the A train so I can say that that, that
23 project is expected to be awarded towards the end of
24 this capital program which is to say 2019 and it will
25 cover the, the piece of... the section of the line,

excuse me, from 59th Street to J Street. I know you mentioned Washington Heights but the truth is the improvement from the central section, from 59th Street and J Street will really improve the operation on the entire line and then... so I would say that that's the time frame at least for the A train.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: My next question is about the possibility of a, 67 million dollars being reduced to the MTA by... the state budget, is the MTA ready to get the 67 million dollars from other sources or are you confident that the end of this budget, the 67 million dollars will be put back to the MTA?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: So the, the 67 million dollars which some people call 65 million dollars is only one element in a very large package of subsidies that we get from state sources that package totals in the vicinity of 4.5 billion dollars annually and while that particular item has in fact gone down by 65 million dollars the total package is going up by 30 million dollars from last year's budget to this year's budget and so I as a budget guy and, and bottom line oriented and so we're focusing on the improvement of the 30 million dollars and our

1 financial plan, the latest version of which was
2 presented in February includes the latest information
3 with regard to expected state... excuse me, state
4 subsidies and so in fact we do believe that we can
5 and will accommodate the new state budget.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Access-A-
8 Ride what is the plan, are... is the MTA ready to work
9 or any discussion of the MTA to work with the TLC
10 since we have thousands of cars sitting in park... at
11 parking garages and we heard that they were some
12 conversation on doing some pilot project with an
13 entity that they could supplement the demand for the
14 Access-A-Ride, is there any possibility to use the
15 green... the city borough taxi, green taxi and, and the
16 green taxi medallions also to be included as
17 providers for Access-A-Ride?

18 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes, we have as you
19 mentioned been doing a pilot and we are now ready to
20 proceed to the next step which is to develop a... an
21 agreement for what we call E-Hail which is a program
22 that, that TLC is sponsoring and, and we are hopeful
23 that we'll be able to incorporate E-Hail vehicles
24 which isn't just yellow and green taxis, it's also
25 some other providers as well but we are looking

1 forward to including that because the truth is our
2 objective is to develop as many different channels,
3 as many different means of accommodating paratransit
4 customers as we possibly can because with more
5 choices we're able to choose the right one for any
6 individual trip and thereby keep our costs down as
7 well as improve the service we provide.
8

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Right. My last
10 one before calling my colleague is about elevators
11 and this is going to be very local. This is about my
12 district, 168 A train and 120 station and C train
13 like you know we have one of the major New York City
14 hospital there and Columbia Medical School and
15 thousands of residents live in this area and the
16 elevators are out of order... out of service, one train
17 doesn't stop at 168 therefore it keep going to 181st
18 and 181st... is it like a domino effect because at 181st
19 we only have two elevators where there's not any
20 stairs there and we have a negative impact at 181st
21 as also it doesn't allow patients or family going to
22 visit any patients or students or residents in this
23 community and while... I heard that, you know the money
24 is there but can the MTA work you know in a plan to
25

1
2 expedite the process to address the situation with
3 those elevators at 168th?

4 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So we're familiar with
5 the situation and while our elevator service and
6 escalator service around the city we think does very
7 well. We acknowledge that at 168th Street there have
8 been some problems. We've responded to that by
9 assigning maintenance employees to be on site at the
10 station during the a.m. and p.m. rush hour every day
11 in order to respond to any problems that might arise
12 and we've also put in place a procedure whereby if
13 something goes wrong and the station platform starts
14 getting crowded to the point of becoming dangerous we
15 then would inform transportation management that
16 trains need to skip the station which I understand
17 from what you said is, is not the best solution but
18 we are concerned with safety. Ultimately the solution
19 for the elevators at 168th Street is to replace them
20 with new ones and in fact we have a project in our
21 current capital program that will rehabilitate, well
22 it's actually 12 elevators at three stations but it
23 includes all four elevators at the 168th Street
24 station and that project is being designed right now
25 and we expect to award it next year. So that

1 hopefully will be the ultimate solution to this
2 problem.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, I also
5 would like to bring to your attention to look at the
6 elevators at 191st A train too, I have also heard
7 some... a concern from some residents for that area of
8 that one of those elevators are being out of service
9 very often so I had not been there personally but I...
10 this is a complaint also or a concern that I also
11 heard from some resident about the A train a, at
12 191st elevator.

13 MICHAEL CHUBAK: We will do that, thank
14 you.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
16 Council Member Vacca.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you Mr.
18 Chair. The Chair touched on the elevator escalator
19 issue, I have to touch on that as well. We have very
20 few elevator, escalators in the Bronx, very few in my
21 district, the ne we have at Pelham Bay Station is
22 constantly breaking down, it was out again last week,
23 we never know when it's out, how long it's going to
24 be out until the MTA post a sign but my question is
25 we can't have all these outages constantly when we

1 have disabled people who depend on these elevators
2 and escalators and without them getting to where they
3 want to go becomes really almost impossible situation
4 so my question for you is when do we... well how much
5 money do we have in the budget to repair elevator,
6 escalators or replace them when they age and do we
7 have a hard time getting parts for these elevators
8 and escalators because I was told two years ago when
9 I had the elevator out at Pelham Bay Station that
10 parts had to be sent for and that it would... and that
11 it took months so do we have... can you answer these
12 questions for me please?

14 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So I will say that some
15 of our machines; elevators and escalators are in fact
16 more than 20 years old and in situations like that it
17 is possible that it is difficult to get parts, that's
18 a fact, I can't speak to the Pelham Bay Station in
19 particular, I'm not really familiar with that one, I
20 can also say that we are working through the capital
21 program to replace elevators and escalators on a
22 consistent basis. In fact, in the current capital
23 program we will for the first time be replacing many
24 of the elevators that were added for ADA purposes
25 originally in the program, it's now reached a point

1 where those elevators are now scheduled for
2 replacement. So, we are in fact allocating sufficient
3 money in order to maintain a regular replacement
4 schedule for those units but I, I honestly don't know
5 enough about the, the Pelham Bay Station in
6 particular to speak to, to that issue.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well I'd like you
9 to look into it, we have constant outages. Those are
10 the original escalator, elevators so these, these are
11 the originals basically I think they were built in
12 the late 80's and if, if we have to replace more than
13 parts and get new updated... [cross-talk]

14 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: ...elevators and
16 escalators I want the public to be served in that way
17 and I'd like someone to get back to me to tell me...
18 [cross-talk]

19 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I, I understand and we
20 will get back to you on that.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay. You
22 mentioned signal stations, I'm going quickly but we
23 have time... you know time issues, you mentioned the
24 signal stations they're very important signal
25 stations because of course updating them allows

1 trains to move quicker but I noticed in your
2 testimony on page two all... we have no signal
3 modernization plans in the Bronx, we have Queens, we
4 have Manhattan, we have nothing in the Bronx...
5 Brooklyn, we have nothing in the Bronx in so much as
6 updating our signal stations and I'm a strap hanger,
7 I'm on the 4, 5, 6 train and if you can see how
8 overcrowded it is the fact that signal stations being
9 old and antiquated hurts the mobility that we could
10 have if they were updated.

12 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So in fact the, the
13 Bronx has had its signals rehabilitated, they, they
14 basically had their signals rehabilitated really just
15 before the advent of CBTC. So, while the signals in
16 the Bronx are not CBCC they're sort of our prior
17 technology, they are in fact new, the Pelham Line,
18 the Jerome Line, the White Plains Road Line, those
19 have all been completed probably in the last 15
20 years... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: The last... the, the
22 Pelham Bay Line's been updated?

23 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well then, I have
25 to tell you that even with these updates I... then I

1 want other neighborhoods not to hold out hope because
2 the, the overcrowding is just tremendous on many of
3 our trains. The, the, the timing and the overcrowding
4 is tremendous and I know we're getting more
5 passengers but we don't have enough capacity for what
6 we're getting to be honest with you and I, I'm, I'm
7 thrilled that the Second Avenue Subway opened and
8 that the Governor was able to get it so quickly but
9 that did help some but we have to look at ways to
10 help further address the overcrowding issue if you
11 can.
12

13 MICHAEL CHUBAK: We will.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Also Middletown
15 Road Station was rehabbed and I think there was a
16 lawsuit because the Middletown Road Station was not
17 rehabbed with an elevator, escalator there was... the,
18 the advocates filed a lawsuit on that, are you aware
19 of that and I wanted to know if you were what the
20 status was?

21 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I'm aware of the issue
22 but I don't know what the current status is. It has
23 not been resolved I can tell you that.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I'm just concerned
25 and I know there's a price tag to it but we're, we're

renovating new... we're renovating stations and not including handicap accessibility and that's what happened at Middletown Road and I know there was a lawsuit so if someone can get back to me to, to let me know about that I would appreciate it.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: We will.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Chin followed by Council Member Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Chair, good afternoon. I wanted to start off first with a compliment about opening up the J Line on Broad Street in the weekend that has been great, I've seen a lot of ridership at that station especially on the weekend and after hours because in the past they closed at seven and it was closed on the weekend. So that... I think that's a, a wonderful addition especially with the growing population in Lower Manhattan, I ride the J Train but one of the things though is causing a lot of confusion is in the folds and transit help with the signage's often time people gets on the wrong J Train, they wanted to go to Queens and they ended up on Broad Street the last stop and they all... they get out of the train and they

1 got to go up and they got back to the other side and
2 so I think there should be some better signage at
3 Fulton Street to really help guide people to the
4 right train, that's one thing. The other thing I
5 wanted to follow up on is the, the question about the
6 paratransit, the Access-A-Ride. I chair the Committee
7 on Aging and often time the biggest complaint we hear
8 from seniors is how unreliable Access-A-Ride is. So,
9 I'm glad that you are, you know trying out a new
10 program and I'm looking at that you are reflecting an
11 annual saving about 280 million dollars in terms of
12 these paratransit spending, I just wanted to make
13 sure that there is sufficient... that you're using
14 enough funding to really improve this program.

16 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I'm not really familiar
17 with that savings estimate but I can assure you that
18 we are allocating sufficient funds in the budget to
19 meet our paratransit obligations.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Can you give us
21 some more information in terms of how many riders
22 that have Access-A-Ride and they are using the other
23 program that you offer like the, the low-cost voucher
24 and taxi?
25

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So I don't have those
3 numbers off hand, no I'm, I'm, I'm not really sure of
4 the... of the breakdown between the various... between
5 the various modes so I can't give you that
6 information but... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Well if you could
8 follow it and give it to us because it would be good
9 to really see if, you know if seniors and, and people
10 with disability are taking advantage of these
11 programs and then they do see that their improvement
12 in sight, if they are not happy with Access-A-Ride,
13 if they have this... you know they're able to take
14 taxis and... or other, other forms of transportation to
15 get them where they need to go I think that is really
16 critical and we also want to make sure that, that you
17 sort of expand this program because you talked about
18 early in... that there is an agreement with the E-Hail
19 industry, with the yellow and green and other
20 options?

21 MICHAEL CHUBAK: No, there's no agreement
22 yet we're working towards that.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: You're working
24 towards that?

25 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 145

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay, how far... how
3 soon can you get it going?

4 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I can't answer that
5 question because I don't know, it's... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Can you get back to
7 us?

8 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: ...because it
10 sounded... [cross-talk]

11 MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...of course... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: ...great, right, I
13 mean that... there's going to be more option out there
14 for our seniors, I mean even though not everybody use
15 the computer and to be able to take advantage but the
16 one that... who actually have the skill and can utilize
17 it, it would be great.

18 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes, well we're very
19 hopeful but I'll have to get you that information.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay. Yeah because
21 I just wanted to stress the point that Access-A-Ride
22 has been problematic and we just want to make sure
23 that resources are put in to improve the transit
24 options for our seniors. Okay, so we'll look forward
25 to getting that information. The other question I

1
2 have is that a couple of weeks ago, a month ago there
3 were... the F Train wasn't running over the weekend and
4 we heard that there were some issues about fixing the
5 tunnel and that in the future that might happen even
6 more often?

7 MICHAEL CHUBAK: This was the... [cross-
8 talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Is that part of
10 your capital project?

11 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I... it probably was... did
12 you say the F Train?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: The F Line, yes.

14 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Which portion of the... of
15 the line was out of service, do you know?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Coming in to from
17 Brooklyn.

18 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Uh-huh. I, I don't know
19 the particulars, undoubtable was a capital project...

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: If you can get back
21 to us we just wanted to see if there was some future
22 planning on the F Line, you know with the tunnel,
23 repair issues, we want to make sure that the
24 community are informed that we could, you know work
25 on preparation before that.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: We will do that.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, thank
you Chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
Miller and also, we've been joined by Council Member
Deutsch.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Mr.
Chair, good afternoon. So, I'm... I, I have tons of
questions here so I, I want to get through them
really quickly but more, more importantly if we can't
finish I do want to kind of just verify whether or
not there is a new policy around community, community
engagement for the MTA, are you or are you not
participating in community Town Hall and other
meetings?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I'm not sure about the
terminology Town Hall but I can say that we do
participate with community boards at their meetings.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aside from
community boards.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I'm not sure then.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Is somebody there
sure?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I, I don't have the answer.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Come on... come on, we need answer like you know New York City makes major contributions and, and we have a great level of collaboration and, and I think again if that has not been happening we need to fix it, okay, if that is not happening, is that a commitment that the MTA, you know you have a governmental relation team always with whom we have great access and we have to weigh, we know... we continue developing the great working relationship or you know we take it like everything public and we go after you guys.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, so... yeah, that, that... you know first of all I've, I've spent 27 years in the MTA family spearheading many of these such meetings and, and so they have been done in the past up until a few months ago that's why I asked if it was a new policy and whether or not... so, so this is very important that we be able to engage the community as to some of these projects that are going on. So, I... so I just want to keep going and, and if not perhaps we can have this conversation in the district. So, from looking at your budget on the... on

1 the collective bargaining agreement that is reflected
2 with the past TWU collective bargaining agreement is
3 there money set aside for that pattern to be
4 continued with the outstanding bargaining units?

5
6 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes, we... once the
7 collective bargaining agreement was reached with TWU
8 we made any necessary change to our financial plan to
9 reflect that as the pattern for other unions going
10 forward.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So I do happen to
12 know that there are other locals out there who, who,
13 who have been out without a contract since 2012 who
14 are looking to have the same pattern and, and, and I
15 hope we can take you at... for your word that this will
16 certainly occur but I'm not going to be-label that
17 either. In terms of, we talked about state funding
18 and subsidies that exist I know in the past the, the
19 MTA has not taken a favorable position in supporting
20 dedicated funding legislation those are hundreds of
21 millions of dollars that are obviously earmarked for
22 the MTA but we're not seeing what is the current MTA
23 position on that?

24 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I don't believe it's
25 changed.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: It doesn't change so when folks are, are paying recording fees and, and, and whatever surcharges that, that clearly say that this is for the MTA it's okay that that money doesn't go back to those communities?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: To my knowledge dedicated taxes that are earmarked for the MTA do go to the MTA.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: They go directly to the MTA and not into the stake office?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Do you want to weigh in?

DAVID KELLER: That varies actually by type of tax, the mortgage recording tax for example which you stated actually is collected by the county clerk's offices and transmitted directly to the MTA, there are other taxes that are collected by the state and then they... then they send them to... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: How, how, how much... how much... how much would you say that are dedicated MTA funds that, that, that are allocated annually then how much of would you say are collected?

DAVID KELLER: I do not have the answer to that, we'd have to look into that for you.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, we'll, we'll, we'll get back to that one. The capital plan, Jamaica Depot what is... what is the status of, of that location, have they purchased all the adjacent... adjoining properties, is it ready to go, I see on here 2019 what is the actual status of that?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I'm not sure if the... all the property has been sort of assembled but the capital program continues to include that job and, and so we're hopeful.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So that money is still in the capital budget earmarked for, for Jamaica Depot?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes, it is.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, I'm, I'm sorry and I know I did have an additional few seconds there. What, what is... what is the current age of the fleet of buses and what is the current... do you have outstanding orders to purchase buses and, and what are we looking throughout the city, I know when we met last year at this time we were... we were woefully insufficient and had not received... we were on a back log?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: There was a period in fact when bus purchases weren't keeping pace and so the average age of the fleet had been rising however we have been catching up on that regard. The current capital program includes 1,400 buses and there are other buses still not yet delivered from the prior capital program. So, we are in fact making good progress.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Commuter equity, some might call it the freedom ticket that is where there is an adjustment in the fare in, in certain communities wherever metro North or Long Island Railroad, stops in the city of New York, we'd be able to access it of those communities where it is currently cost prohibited such as Southeast Queens where I represent somewhere where it takes me an average of one hour and 40 minutes where I live 4.2 miles from the subway and then take the subway from the first to the last stop and it cost ten dollars one way and then I have to pay 2.75 but for those whose average commute is... there has been a proposal, there has been a suggestion that there will be a pilot, do you have any update on that?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: So the MTA board has authorized a field study of the, the Freedom Ticket ideal and the MTA staff is working on putting that together, so yes, we will in fact be looking... and when I say field study I mean an actual limited implementation... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Right... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...not just a study on paper.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So do you have any information on that?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I don't have the timing but I know that it's being worked on.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, so that would also... it... that would also help to alleviate obviously overcrowding on lines such as the E, the F, the J, the number 7 because there's no additional room for capacity, right so that is kind of a win, win for, for not just for those who are currently cost prohibited but alleviating the, the overcrowding on some of those lines as well. I, I thank you, I have a lot of questions but... for operations... can I just one more question. So, there was a question

about enforcement of cameras in bus lanes and so forth for the department of buses and to my knowledge does the... does the superintendents and the Department of Bus... buses still have the ability to write summonses?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I don't know, I know they used to but I, I'm not 100... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Could you turn and ask someone who knows?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Does anybody? Yeah... not 100 percent but we believe they do still have that authority.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So we... because we, we have this tremendous problem in enforcement, we passed four bills around illegal commuter vans throughout the city but no one's enforcing that, we can't get TLC and so forth and the buses cannot pull into a bus lane which has cameras, which is a dedicated bus lane because there are hundreds of illegal vans out there and, and there is a method already in place because bus superintendents have the ability to write summonses, could we get the MTA to... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL CHUBAK: We'll, we'll try to confirm that for you.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, thank you so much for your time.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Thank you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Before I call on my colleague... the... one is related to the... to the area in Queens where they had to take two buses and then to take a train is the MTA trying to look at those areas and provide opportunity for those New Yorkers in areas such as in Queens that have to deal with that reality to be able to say we can transfer from the two buses to a train?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I know that there are a limited number of locations in the city where an extra transfer privilege is provided, I would need to know the specific routes or the location that you have in mind.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, I, I just... that's... at least you know we can... I can bring it to your attention but some of my colleagues they have brought to my attention that there's some area... that's there's some area that... you know that's,

1 that's a reality that people they have to take two
2 buses and they take a train and I think that if we
3 can look at it and see if anything that the MTA can
4 do to address that... those... you know... my only thing
5 is... my other thing is about New Yorkers who take the
6 bus and they pay cash when they get a transfer they
7 cannot transfer from there to the train.

8
9 MICHAEL CHUBAK: That's true.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How can we... how
11 can we... [cross-talk]

12 MICHAEL CHUBAK: The simple solution is
13 to buy a metro card... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, but...
15 [cross-talk]

16 MICHAEL CHUBAK: That was a deliberate
17 decision that was made when metro card was first
18 introduced as a way of encouraging metro card
19 utilization.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: No, I'm 100
21 percent on board but in our city we have close to 50
22 to 70 New Yorkers who live on the poverty line, you
23 know like and that's a reality so I remember myself
24 when I was a student at city college sometime I
25 walked, many times from 174th Sherman Avenue Inwood

1 to City college not because I thought that walking
2 health... walking was very good for my health which I
3 realize it today but it was because I didn't have the
4 money and that's a reality for 100,000 of New Yorkers
5 so I understand the rational but how can we also
6 understand that there's people out there they don't
7 have the money to buy a week metro card.

9 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I didn't say a weekly
10 metro card; any metro card will give you a transfer
11 privilege to the bus and if you're... if you're desire
12 is take the bus and then transfer to the subway you
13 will need a metro card to get on the subway.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: but don't you
15 think that those who pay cash is like the poorest New
16 Yorkers that they don't have the money to buy the
17 metro card?

18 MICHAEL CHUBAK: But it's the same price,
19 it's the same 2.75... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...but it isn't
21 fair after I pay my... pay my fare in bus cash that I
22 cannot get it transferred to take a train so I have
23 to pay another fare in a train.

24 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Right but if you have a
25 metro card you won't have to do that, so the 2.75

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But we, we, we do agree that there's a group of New Yorkers that they don't have money to buy the metro card.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It's not true, we have a percentage of people that they have limited cash all they have is like just say whatever is equal for that fare at that moment, we have homeless people and I don't expect answer if you don't have the answer okay I just wanted to bring it to your attention to know that, you know like let's look at the number, how many of those groups... and, and I'm for bringing more incentive for, for people to buy the metro card but also we have to realize that there's that group of New Yorkers that they live on the poverty line, that sometimes they don't have the money to buy the metro card or they have the cash there and that's all they have to use but they have to transfer from the bus to a train.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I hear what you're saying, I'm not sure what the answer is.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, Fair-Fare do you think that we should provide 50 percent discount for people who live on the poverty line?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: So there's no doubt that the Fair-Fare Proposal would provide a valuable benefit to low income New Yorkers but it's really a social services question, we don't think it's a, a decision for the MTA to make, it's really a, a question of social policy and would need to be decided upon by New York City or the Regional counties and municipalities for their riders as well.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Council Member Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you Mr. Chairman, welcome back Mr. Chubak. I noticed a new title, Chief Financial Officer is that new?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Since October.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Congratulations.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I appreciate your decades of service to MTA and New York City

Transit. A few quick questions for you, F Express my favorite topic as... you know something I've been fighting for since I... since before I was elected to the city council, do you have an update for us on that, last year there was a recommendation to move forward with the F Express and then I know there was some... I know it's shocking but there was some politics involved and it seems like that the analysis may have slowed down; do you know where we're at on that?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: So it is true that the, the recommendation last year was in favor of the F Express but we mentioned at that time that we couldn't do... couldn't take any immediate action because of scheduled capital work that was taking place on the line. The immediate project at that time was station renewals that are still taking place and so with that still the case we don't have any new news to give you but I can tell you that the matter is under review within MTA.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS GREENFIELD:

Okay, good I encourage you to move towards six more positive steps, I can tell you that in that section of Southern Brooklyn it's... as you know it's veritable

transit desert, folks who are getting into Manhattan and as you further down the line the significant economic disparity partially because of the fact that they don't have the same transit options that other folks have so it'd be very important to give folks that slight benefit that they used to have as you know until it was taken away some 30 odd years ago. Thank you for that. The train times and I'm also going to focus a little bit locally for a moment then I'll go back to some of the global questions. On the F, D, and Q Lines when do you expect that to, to come?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: That would be by the end of this year, we're, we're aiming for.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay, great. Any plans to get Wi-Fi on the trains themselves and congratulations on getting them on the underground stations. I certainly appreciate it, just so you know every time I pull into the underground stations I get my little e-mail updates.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: So do I but we have no plans to do Wi-Fi on trains, no.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: At least not at the moment.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: The Q Line in particular heavily trafficked line has seen a significant increase in ridership and honestly even in the non-peak rush hours very congested line, have you folks look at maybe adding some service on that line?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: So we have... [clears throat] excuse me, we have... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I'm referring of course to the Brooklyn just to be clear as... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I understand, we, we have... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...the Brooklyn to Manhattan line during the rush hour in the morning.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: So we have what we call our loading guidelines which is essentially a set of standards that matches service to the ridership on the line so if in fact as, as you're suggesting ridership has increased on the Q then we would be able to see that in our statistics on ridership and

1 if it's not during the peak period when we are
2 capacity constrained then that would translate
3 potentially into an increase in service.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: If you could
5 take a look at it I'd appreciate it, you have a
6 loading guidelines I'd refer this... I'd refer to that
7 line as fully loaded, it's beyond standing room only
8 even past sort of the peak, you know seven or eight
9 a.m., folks taking it even later tell me, you know
10 nine, ten o'clock it's still very full in the
11 mornings so I'd appreciate you taking a look at that.
12 I'm curious one of the issues that we've discussed
13 for quite a while here in the council and its
14 certainly my personal pet peeve is the issue of bus
15 bunching's, you know this is phenomenon where several
16 buses at a time pull into a bus station, it's very
17 frustrating for people because you've waited a while
18 and you realize that if you miss those several buses
19 you're not going to wait a further while, I've heard
20 all the answers as to why this happens and you know I
21 know... I trust that it's not a conspiracy by the MTA
22 to intentionally delay the riders but it seems like
23 in 2017 with all the technology that we have out
24 there, there must be a way especially considering GPS
25

tracking of buses which you currently have of
adjusting that schedule so that doesn't happen
because it's perhaps one of the most frustrating
things for bus riders, have you studied that, do you
have a solution for that, are you cognizant of the
fact that this is a very important and frustrating
issue for literally hundreds of thousands of New
Yorkers?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: So I've not studied it
personally... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Well I, I
wasn't suggesting that... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I, I can tell you...
[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...Mr. Chubak...
[cross-talk]

MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...I can tell you that...
[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...I mean has
the MTA studied the issue?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Right... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Yes, I don't
expect you to study every issue personally.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Thank you. I can tell that with the advent of bus time and now that the bus time has been rolled out to the entire fleet we do in fact have access to information that we never used to have and it is possible that that might be a potential mechanism for doing... for undoing bus bunching, let me put it that way but... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Sure. So, I've, I've heard... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...I'm speaking only... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...that... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...conceptionally...

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I've heard that before and we, we brought it up in past hearings, I think it was Lois who I believe has since retired, right, good for her, I hope she's enjoying wherever she's watching this from on her live feed but I do think it's an important point because we've raised it in the past as... if the technology exists it is a very worthwhile investment and I would ask that because this is a budget hearing that you follow up and send us what the costs involved would be to in

1 fact implement that technology because you have the
2 technology to actually implement it to make sure that
3 the bus bunching doesn't occur because I can tell you
4 that it is certainly the most frustrating feature for
5 one of... for any one of your riders which is to either
6 notice that you've waited for an hour and then three
7 buses show up or to run to the bus station and notice
8 that three buses have just left and realize you will
9 now have to wait for another hour and once again I
10 trust that there isn't a vast conspiracy among the
11 drivers as some of my constituents actually believe,
12 I'm, I'm, I'm saying that's not the case but I
13 certainly think that if we have the technology if you
14 could price at... cost it for us and tell us what it
15 would cost to actually do that and how we can do that
16 I think that would be very helpful.

18 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So I, I don't what to
19 belabor this topic too long but I, I think... [cross-
20 talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: No, no it's
22 worth discussing... [cross-talk]

23 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I, I think... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...I promise
25 you the... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...you're, you're making
a... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...right now in
New York City there are thousands of people sitting
there and angry because a bus or two or three have
pulled up all at the same time so this is worth
discussing I assure you.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: So I, I think you're
making a leap in, in presuming that there's simply a
question of how much will it cost to use the
technology to solve the problem, we don't know in
fact that it can be done, what we would need to do is
in effect experiment with that. What I would like to
add though is that while customers may still be
subject to bus bunching now that we have bus time
data there at least is information in their hands to
let them know when the bus is coming.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: That's fair,
I would just point out though and actually this
directly relates to and I'll wrap up Mr. Chairman,
thank you, this directly relates to my last
conversation which you may have heard with the DOT
Commissioner which is that many of my constituents
especially the elderly they don't have access to that

1 technology, right, so they don't have the smart
2 phones or even the cell phones at all and especially
3 in some of the lower income folks so I, I appreciate
4 that and its certainly an improvement but you'd be
5 surprised at how many folks in this city actually
6 don't have access to that technology and are still
7 frustrated and even if you do have access to
8 technology the fact that you know that the... it's
9 still pretty frustrating. So, anything you can do in
10 that regard if it is a cost issue if you can just
11 update us on that I think that would be an important
12 service... improvement that doesn't involve the other
13 issues that you mentioned like you know regulating
14 traffic or things like that just... [cross-talk]

16 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...something
18 that perhaps you folks may have the power to do and
19 if it's a cost issue we're happy to help with that as
20 well. Thank you very much and congratulations on...
21 again on your ascension to CFO and with that the
22 privilege of coming to lustrous bodies like ours to
23 engage in this friendly back and forth and I'm sure
24 that was a coveted part of the promotion as well.

25 MICHAEL CHUBAK: It's my pleasure.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Good

afternoon so I, I... I'm also I'm going to focus on some local issues which definitely would appreciate some follow through on. This is now my fourth year in office and I'm asking pretty much the same questions every year. So, I'm going to ask my question yet again this year and hope that there's a different answer. So, the elevator that's supposed to be placed, there's not one elevator on the N Q Line in, in Queens, on the Queens portion, we've been promised the elevator on the Astoria Boulevard stop, what is our time... what is our hard time table for getting the elevator installed?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: If you could give me a minute to check my notes I might be able to give you an answer.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: That would be great.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Okay, so Astoria Boulevard is in fact one of our 100 key stations...
[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay...
[cross-talk]

MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...which means that we are committed to delivering that elevator by July of 2020.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Is there somewhere in between now and July 2020 that I can tell my constituents it will be coming?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: So I... the answer is maybe but I'll have to get that information for you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay and as well we've had the students at PS85 who have been promised that there are going to be track amendments so that every time a train goes, goes by these students don't have to stop their learning, I know this very well because this tells the students to stop talking because A trains about to roll by and there's supposed to be a changing of the track bed so is there a timetable, hard deadline that that's going to be actually done?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I believe the project to replace switches and track will take place this summer.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: This summer, that's fantastic. Alright, so I can be able to tell my constituents that... this summer. The

renovations of our stations, I know we're scheduled to set our reservations, what is the plan for implementing these construction projects, will it be two stations in a row, how will this be done to make sure that we still have access to mass transit service while these, these renovations are going on?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I don't believe the exact staging plan has been worked out but I can tell you that we would not do two stations in a row...

[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay...

[cross-talk]

MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...we, we might do 39th and Broadway at one time and then 36th and 30th at a different time but it would not be two consecutive stations going out.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES:

Fantastic, so I can assure my residents that there may be one station that's, that's closed for a short period of time but it will not be Astoria Boulevard and 30th Avenue back to back?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Alright, that's great to hear. Last I know that we're

1 purchasing new subway cars, I have noticed since the
2 advent of the Second Avenue Subway which is a huge
3 win for the entire city but in my particular neck of
4 the woods we've seen a lot of the older trains,
5 trains that I used to ride on in the 90's return back
6 to the, the... back to my line on the... of the, the Q
7 and, and N Line when will these older... that we've
8 seen a lot more delays, a lot more issues with these
9 particular trains, issues on the line in general, I'm
10 getting lots of e-mails, more e-mails than I've
11 gotten ever in my time in office since the Second
12 Avenue Subway's gone online that we're having delays
13 on the line so when are we getting the new technology
14 brought back to the N and W Line?

16 MICHAEL CHUBAK: It may not be for a
17 while, we... the current capital program is approved
18 last year included approximately 1,000 cars that
19 would be used to replace some of the older cars in
20 the system that particular contract is under
21 negotiation right now but I mean even if it were
22 approved tomorrow it takes probably two to three
23 years before a significant number of trains begin
24 rolling off the assembly line.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINEDES: As we were... you know I had no complaints on, on the actual cars prior to January and we've seen a huge influx of the old... again I... you know I grew up in the neighborhood I remember these trains from the 90's so I'm wondering how we got stuck getting back these older particular cars without the digital digitalization of what stop we're at, about... you know without a lot of amenities that we used... the, the residents have been accustomed to and frankly the line ran better when we had them and now again 2nd Avenue subway's a great thing but we got the older subway cars back so I hope to see them cycled back through.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Its possible, I, I don't make the car allocation decisions to be honest and..

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Well I mean there's, there's other people there who do.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Right so we'll try to get... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: ...you're just the guy whose taking... whose, who's taking the questions and I appreciate that.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: We'll try to get you an answer.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay, wonderful. And my, my colleague... oh I'm out of time so I guess I can't ask the question for him but thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chair and Mr. Chubak, is that right, did I say that right?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Close enough.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Well thank you for being here today and I understand that you are a budget guy and this is your budget team but you're going to hear from us because you have a large... your part of a larger family of conversations that are happening within the MTA and you need to hear how, how the MTA has failed this community that I represent in Sunset Park. Well we believe this is not a... this is not an isolated incident this is a pattern, we want to break this pattern in a very real way. Our communities across the city are multilingual, immigrant, people of color and they deserve the kind of respect that I'm going to ask

specifically about the budget. And specifically, what I want to think about is the billions of dollars that you've presented in your testimony about the improvements both of the stations, there's some elevators that are going to get installed in Red... specifically in Sunset Park along 4th Avenue come with a lot of responsibilities about community engagement. So, as the numbers guy can you tell us a little bit about how much you're investing in community engagement for simple things like communication, translation, we've asked for Arabic, we, we have yet to get it in, in Sunset Park. We have... we have a big Jewish community, it would be great to have some, some Hebrew signs in the neighborhood for other things that are happening. Tell us a little bit about how the budget is impacted with community engagement for this massive multibillion dollar infrastructure work in our city and then I have some other projects... or questions about the shuttle bus response to our service line disruption in Sunset Park, actually I'm going to wait for that but I want you to answer that question and then I'll have the second question for, for you in the next two minutes?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: So we have a multi-billion-dollar capital program and part of having that program is to make sure that we have sufficient resources to do community engagement... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: what does that look like and can you give us a sense about what that... what those numbers are because we're not... we're not feeling that, that, that budget part that you're... that you're claiming that is part of your community engagement?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I'm, I'm not sure about what your specific complaints have been but we have a, a... we'll call it a division of government and community relations whose mission is to engage stakeholders throughout the city and their focus is not only on the, the capital program but it is really a primary part of the work they do that when projects come along that will affect the communities they engage with the, the elected officials and with the community boards to make sure that they know that that's going to be happening.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So I guess the main... my main point is that the system is failing here, they're failing a community that needs to get

correct... connected to and communicated to in different languages and so we want to follow up with you about what you're spending, how you're spending it on just the community engagement piece. The second piece I want to talk about is the shuttle bus program that you've... and I don't know if... it'd be great if you can talk to us a little bit about what's happening on 53rd Street because this is going to happen across the entire system but right now the solution from MTA is not to bring shuttle service on 4th Avenue where the line is going down they're instead pushing people into the 3rd Avenue B37 and the 63 Line and adding shuttle service so there's a picture here of a... there's two buses here, the first bus is the shuttle bus, it's off, it doesn't have any... it doesn't have any, any lighting mechanism that shows what it is, it's confusing for, for folks and it's not moving. What we're about is that you're using funds... funding to, to provide a solution that doesn't work, we want it on 4th, you're putting it on other avenues that, that aren't, aren't going to be the solution and so we're, we're trying to understand what's the efficiency of your funding streams for the

service that you're cutting during these renovations of this multi-billion-dollar project?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: So I'll say this when we do a station closure and we've been doing station closures for a while we evaluate the availability of alternative transportation options for the people who are affected and in cases where we don't believe that a dedicated shuttle bus is required then we won't run a dedicated shuttle bus as is the case at 53rd Street where there is a parallel bus, a regular route on 3rd Avenue and a regular route on 5th Avenue as well as the fact that it's a relatively short distance from 53rd Street to the 59th Street station and to the 45th Street station. I'm, I'm confused really by the picture that you were showing because you said it was a picture of a shuttle bus but as we both know we're not running shuttle buses so I'm not sure... it may simply have been a bus that was out of service and parked somewhere and isn't... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Here's, here's my main... my main point is that the, the solution is to add another, another bus on a current line and I think your key word was relative, it's relatively not far is, is the MTA's kind of response to everything,

1 it's relative to all of you but we're... what we're
2 saying is your... the MTA continues to be disrespectful
3 to communities of color, immigrant communities about
4 communication and offering solutions that are not
5 going to work for our community, we want a larger
6 plan that connects Bay Ridge to, to Barclays Center
7 on the 4th Avenue Line that's going to have massive
8 impacts across the line itself, we have yet to see a
9 budget allocation that fulfills that necessity and as
10 the numbers guy... because we're dealing with your
11 inner gov folks, as a numbers guy you need to
12 understand how important that is to our community and
13 the relativity question is that we are telling you
14 that that is not enough, your current... your current
15 operations and your current responses are not enough.
16 On the communications side and then the alternative
17 service disruption response with buses. So, I'm
18 calling it shuttle, I'm telling you that, that, that
19 the, the current solution is, is not enough and it's
20 incredibly disrespectful and I'm hoping that you can...
21 we can get your numbers team to figure out how we
22 actually have a solution that's, that's respectful.
23 End of story so look this is... this is an important
24 conversation for all the teams to get together, you
25

heard it here and it's an important thing for us to communicate with the rest of your team. Okay, you heard it... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I've, I've heard what you said, my belief is, is that we do a good job of communicating with the community and if in fact... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And, and you do a good job of communicating the fare hikes, that's everywhere, that's in every language that we can... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL CHUBAK: No, not just the ferry... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: ...even languages we are not speaking right now in, in, in the city of New York what we're failing is when those... when these stations go down you're asking us to celebrate this work which we should be celebrating and instead we're trying to kick your pattern off the bad track of not engaging our communities of color, our immigrant communities and that we think that it might be a budget issue which is why we're talking to you about it right now in the budget hearing, so help us here,

help us connect the dots and bring a respectable response, thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I understand that definitely we need to find a way on how we establish the best channel of communication. Again, now on the governmental relation, the direct person Mr. Marino who also is there who is accessible to all but you heard loud and clear there has been some concern. I think that New York City made major contributions to the MTA and when we look on all the municipality the benefit from this great one trillion access system of transportation, it's not only what the state brings to the... to the... to the MTA is that when we look over all the city from Long Island to Westchester to Yonker to Connecticut like... and that's a question to me like do you have the breakdown, the contribution of each municipality?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: That information...
[cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...and what is the rank of New York City?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Maybe you should tell us?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I don't...

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: We don't have that
3 information on municipality by municipality bases but
4 we probably can look into it for you.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah because
6 sometimes like you know what we get from some of you
7 guys like a level of arrogance when it comes to how
8 we engaging... planning together from the city... at the
9 city level and not a personal level but it is the
10 energy that we get sometimes and like we're supposed
11 to have here the director of the New York City
12 Transit, what is the person, all commissioner or
13 director be here and I have all the respect, you know
14 but to come to a budget hearing the preliminary one
15 and not sending from the MTA as an agency the person
16 who is in charge in you city transit.

17 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I've been to several of
18 these and we've never done that.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Excuse me?

20 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I'm not... I don't want
21 to... I don't want to have to... I'm not sure how to
22 respond...

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah and... so the
24 city expects a lot, you know it's not only what you
25 can compare from the 26 billion dollars if you say

margin one billion contribution the city's made but when we do selling real estate there's a percentage that goes to the MTA so it's not only... we've got to see all the contribution that we made and, and I think that it is time for us to say, you know the city deserves more respect from the MTA and in this case we as a body also deserve more respect. I have a question, when was the last time that the MTA was audited?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Do you know that?

DAVID KELLER: You know I... actually this is a question that was given to us I looked into this yesterday and I spoke to the MTA general, the state of New York has not audited the MTA finances however on an annual basis we do have our finances audited by the independent firm, the most recently completed audit was conducted by Deloitte and Touche for the fiscal year ending December 31st, 2015 and Deloitte and Touche is in the process right now of completing their audit for the fiscal year ending December 31st, 2016.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And the last time... the last time that the state audited the MTA?

DAVID KELLER: The state has not audited the MTA on... on authority wide financial basis.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, what is the debt of the MTA right now?

DAVID KELLER: The MTA's current outstanding debt is 36.3 billion dollars.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Do you think that if we continue balancing budget then getting into debt that we can reach a place... a point where we cannot be able to pay that debt?

DAVID KELLER: I actually don't know the answer to that, that would be a question for, for the MTA finance department but we can post it... postulate it to them if you'd like.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, with that thank you for your participation, I will call on the TLC.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you Chair. I just wanted talk to you for a moment about, I know you may have brought it up in your testimony the El train Canarsie tube repairs, I represent Williamsburg around the Bedford stop which is likely to have significant economic impact can you tell us what your

1 plan is for the next six months and, and beyond
2 before the, the, the shutdown to, to engage with the
3 community on, on mitigating the, the negative impacts
4 that the community is going to be seeing?

5
6 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So the question of
7 mitigating impacts obviously is very important...
8 [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...Uh-huh... [cross-
10 talk]

11 MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...and we have been
12 working with New York City specifically with the
13 Department of Transportation and with the Economic
14 Development Corporation on those questions. We've
15 also been doing a fair amount of outreach with all
16 the affected communities on both sides of the river
17 and our intention is to continue studying the issues
18 in conjunction with the city agencies and to continue
19 engaging with the, the communities and our objective
20 is to have a, a plan in place as to how we'll
21 mitigate the, the disruption during construction by
22 the end of this year. I do want to point out that
23 the, the contract that we've negotiated, it's not yet
24 been approved by the... by our board but we expect it
25 to be approved soon we're able to reduce the duration

of the shut down from 18 months to 15 months which may actually be a very good mitigation in its own right.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, in terms of how it's going to be affecting commuters I think that it's fair for and I said this before, for the MTA to be looking at this and saying nobody is going to see an extension of their commute by more than 20 minutes, I think that the general public can accept 20 minutes more on their commute each way to work every day more than that I think is, is going to be a problem and so I believe that throughout the system working with the Department of Transportation, working with DDC on the ferry system that there's a... there's an... I think that, that it's possible to achieve that with different redundancies throughout the line but it's going to cost money so what I would like to see from the MTA and I would like you to commit to that now is that you're going to... so the MTA is going to be approaching the mitigation to commuters primarily on... you know with the primary focus being how do we... how do we lessen the burden on them and their daily lives instead of what's it going to cost the MTA another words the cost should be a

secondary concern and the, the, the relief to commuters should be the primary concern, is that fair?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes, it is fair although I won't go... as a budget person I won't go to the point of saying that cost is irrelevant...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: It's not irrelevant it should be secondary though, I think that, that it should... it should not be the primary... another words when we're... when we... when we talk in six months or whenever MTA is going to come out with the mitigation plan what I don't want to hear from the MTA is well we considered that but it was going to cost too much money.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I believe that that's really the point of the study that's being done right now is to determine the best possible solutions.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Do you think if cost were not a concern that you would be able to find a way working with the other agencies to ensure that nobody's commute either way was extended by more than 20 minutes?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: It's a very specific number and I'm not equipped to comment on that.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I think it's... I think it's possible and it's something that I think that, that we should be aiming for.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: We'll know more as, as the work progresses.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, thank you.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Thank you...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you for your time.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you... thank you for coming and thank you for your service. Now we'll go to the TLC to, to be the next agency. Thank you, thank you Commissioner and as, as you know you've been in the leadership of this agency of very challenging for your time for the taxi industry and I know that your leadership has also been very important in the effort to level the playing field for the sector that plays a role in the TLC so we will be going to do the swearing.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right hand, do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony today and to answer council member questions honestly?

MEERA JOSHI: I do.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

MEERA JOSHI: Good afternoon everyone. I want to first just introduce the people to my right and left; Midori Valdivia, who's our Deputy Commissioner of Administration and Finance and Operations and Dianna Pegnetti who is new to the TLC who's our new Chief of Enforcement. Good afternoon, Chair Rodriguez and members of the Finance and Transportation Committees. I am Meera Joshi, Commissioner and Chair of New York City Taxi and Limousine Commission. Thank you for the opportunity to preview TLC's Fiscal Year 2018 Preliminary Budget. To update you on the continued growth of, of the industry we regulate, let me begin with some numbers. In the five years... in five years, the number of TLC licensed vehicles has gone from 41,000 to 107,000 and the number of TLC licensed drivers has increased from 110,000 to 160,000. As council is aware, the largest increase in licensed vehicles is in the black car sector. This increase in licensed drivers and vehicles has made our enforcement team more important than ever. Our uniformed personnel protect passengers and drivers and the general public by enforcement

against bad actors in the for-hire industry, including unlicensed drivers who operate unsafely or pick up passengers illegally depriving customers of their right to a safe ride and professional drivers of their income. As you know only yellow taxis are authorized to pick up street hails throughout the city while green borough taxis can pick up street hails only in defined areas. There are other drivers, however, who do not have this right and nonetheless pick up illegally. Unfortunately, some of the individuals picking up street hails are licensed by TLC but there are also many unlicensed or so called straight plate operators. These operators in particular present serious safety risks to New Yorkers. Their vehicles have not been inspected for safety, they do not carry the proper commercial insurance, and the drivers have not been subjected to our background checks, including criminal and DMV record checks, as well as ongoing drug testing. As I testified last year, the TLC lost its best enforcement tool, the ability under section 19-506 of the Ad Code to seize vehicles used for illegal pickups, in October 2015, when a federal judge ruled that seizing the vehicles was unconstitutional in certain

circumstances. To illustrate the importance of TLC seizures, in Calendar Year 2015, before the court decision, we seized over 6,100 illegally operating cars and vans. The court's decision was of limited scope, focusing only on first time offenders. So, in accordance with local law, we've developed a program to identify and seize unlicensed vehicles that have been used repeatedly for illegal activity. And for those vehicles we're able to seek forfeiture. We have begun this program and alongside with this program we are working with DMV to ensure that the underlying DMV drivers licenses and vehicle registrations of illegal operators are suspended and revoked but both of these efforts although very effective can be undermined by the easily employed delayed tactics allowed in current law. An illegal operator can undo a suspension or revocation by simply asking for a new hearing without any requirement that he or she show proof of why they failed to appear for the first hearing. Moreover, OATH judges do not demand an explanation and they do not make any findings as to the adequacy of any explanation should it be proffered. This is made worse by the extremely long period of time that licensees have that's two years

to reopen any default judgement against them. both the lack of the cause requirement and the two year reopen period are unique to TLC administrative cases, but more importantly they deprive the public of the finality needed to get dangerous repeat offenders off the streets. we urge the council to amend the Administrative Code and require drivers and owners to make a credible showing of legitimate cause for their failure to appear at a prior proceeding and shorten the time period for reopening defaults to six months or less. And I'm happy to provide the council with stats on the impact of this loophole after the hearing. TLC's Enforcement personnel play a vital role in Mayor De Blasio's Vision Zero program, as do External Affairs staff who do education and outreach on key safety initiatives. Since 2015, both taxi and FHV drivers required to take a 24-hour pre-licensure course, including instruction on Vision Zero, which we developed with the Department of Transportation. The Vision Zero curriculum provides instruction on road features like protected bike lanes, high risk driving behaviors that lead to crashes, and the important role professional drivers play in promoting the culture of safe driving. In 2016 alone, over

37,000 TLC licensed drivers took this course, an average of almost 3,000 drivers a month. TLC Enforcement officers, including a dedicated safety squad, place a high priority on traffic violations among TLC licensed vehicles such as traffic sign and speeding violations. In 2016, we doubled the number of the agency's Enforcement officers trained by PD to use LIDAR guns, a decisive tool in enforcing our city's speed limits. We've also focused on ensuring commuter van safety for both passengers and other street users. In 2016, our squads paired with the NYPD for 195 joint enforcement operations to combat dangerous unlicensed commuter vans throughout the city, it's resulted in over 1,000 summonses for illegal operation. And I note in those joint operations PD often has several arrests that occur as part of the operation. Our Vision Zero outreach to drivers continues, and as of this month we've held over 450 meetings with drivers to discuss traffic safety rules and safer driving practices. In addition, the TLC provided enhanced support and materials to business owners to improve their drivers' safety records. In 2016, we recognized 378 TLC licensed drivers at our third annual Honor Roll

ceremony for their strong driving history of no crashes involving fatality or injury, no traffic violations, and no TLC violations for safety related rules for four or more years and that's incredible given the number of miles they drive every day. We're grateful to joined then by Rodriguez... Councilmember Rodriguez, Gibson and Dromm and we welcome you all to join us at our next Honor Roll event celebrating our safest drivers in this, this fall. And while we're on the subject of safety I want to address a topic of driver fatigue. Most people are aware of the dangers of drinking and driving but don't realize that drowsy driving can be just as dangerous. Last month the Commission approved new rules to combat fatigue driving across all sectors. TLC developed the rules based on a review of scientific research on fatigued driving, best practices and an analysis of our own data. The new rules will reduce serious safety risks of both acute and chronic fatigue through daily and weekly hour limits. This spring we're doing extensive outreach and education on the new rules and our goal is to reduce risky driving behavior and give all drivers and bases adequate time and information to stay within the limits and keep all street users

safe. One of our core functions is processing license applications for drivers, vehicles and bases so that drivers can get on the road and start earning money. As I said at the beginning, our numbers tell us that we have more drivers and vehicles than ever and demand continues to be steady. For example, in the last five Calendar Years, the annual amount of driver license applications has gone from 71,000 to 114,000 and in the same period the amount of vehicles license has grown from 23,000 to 53,000. To address this high demand, we continue to prioritize licensing efficiencies and customer service and after legislation sponsored by Council Member Rodriguez, we now offer one universal license for all drivers and we began issuing them this fiscal year. We've moved more application processes online, including new and renewal applications and allow applicants to submit more documents online from their computer or from their phone which saves them a trip to our facilities. We've extended the driver's license term from two to three years which reduces the amount of time spent on renewals and we've moved fingerprinting to an offsite vendor rather than in our offices which allows applicants to go to 12 different sites that

are open well beyond our normal office hours. We look forward... looking forward, we're developing a program to allow self-scheduling of vehicle inspections which... to allow vehicle licensees who've met all other requirements for licensure to select a date and time that best fits within their busy schedule. In addition to changes that licensing has made to personalize our communications for individual applicants and drivers our External Affairs unit has launched several large-scale driver and base related campaigns including sharing taxi about... including sharing information about the TLC Driver's License, about driver's school redesign, off site fingerprinting and our online services. External Affairs communicates with driver and base communities in languages that most reflect the industry and through the expansion of our translation services and internal review protocol, drivers and bases receive important information in their preferred languages; Spanish, Russian, Mandarin Chinese, Urdu, Bengali and Arabic. The agency continues to refine the ways we communicate with drivers by assessing the communication channels that work best for them.

before discussing the preliminary budget there's two

1 additional issues I'd like to address; industry wide
2 accessibility and the economic health of our licensed
3 drivers. The TLC continues to advance Mayor, Mayor De
4 Blasio's vision that every passenger in New York City
5 have meaningful choice when seeking an accessible
6 ride. Because yellow and green fares are set by the
7 TLC, these operators have less flexibility to absorb
8 costs related to providing accessible service. So, to
9 achieve the city's goal of 50 percent accessible
10 yellow taxi fleet, the costs of conversion for yellow
11 vehicles... for vehicle owners and drivers are defrayed
12 in part by a 30 cent per ride taxi improvement
13 surcharge on all yellow and green taxi street hailed
14 trips. The surcharge is used for two programs, one to
15 compensate drivers and another to compensate yellow
16 wheelchair accessible taxi owners. We are in the
17 process of rolling out the same program or a similar
18 program for the green taxi fleet for green accessible
19 taxis. We've sold over 7,500 green taxi permits and
20 1,900 of them are for accessible taxis. In January,
21 we expanded our green taxi grant program to give
22 green taxi owners and drivers some of the same
23 benefits that yellow taxi owners and drivers are now
24 receiving and that means up to 30,000 dollars over
25

four years. These efforts are crucial to our Accessible Dispatch Program citywide and we are happy that we have the new rules in place which will allow us to expand the Accessible Dispatch program from Manhattan to the entire city later this year. While there are accessibility mandates in yellow and green taxi sectors, there is still work to be done to bringing true accessibility to the FHV sector. Passengers with disabilities cannot patronize this sector and are thus denied the full range of choice available in the for-hire industry. We believe that the best approach is a requirement that each base dispatch a set percentage of trips accessible vehicles and we look forward to continued discussions with the council on the best way to ensure that all passengers have an equal opportunity to get an accessible ride, whether by street hail, telephone or mobile application. The rapid and sustained growth of for hire industry has uncertain implications for drivers and other industry stakeholders and the TLC has begun reviewing how industry economics have shifted in the past few years. We will be giving the public an opportunity to address changing industry economics at our next commission meeting on April

6th. We are required to hold a hearing every two years on medallion lease costs and fares, which includes a review of several factors affecting driver income and expenses. Because we now have just one license type for medallion and FHV drivers, and because of the demonstrably large growth in the number of FHV drivers, we are going to open up the hearing to the entire industry, including yellow and greens, but also traditional black cars and liveries and also app-based drivers. We hope to learn even more about the industry's economics, but this is just one phase of a longer process, and we would welcome testimony and insight from Councilmembers. I'd like to now preview the TLC's Preliminary Budget for Fiscal Year 2018, which is 58.2 million dollars, broken down into 40.4 million dollars in personal services and 17.8 million dollars in other than personal services. Our Preliminary Budget for Fiscal Year 2018 represents a 12.4-million-dollar difference from Fiscal Year 2017. The budget includes 7.2 million dollars in grant issuance for Green Boro taxi permit holders to bring more wheelchair accessible taxis into service. The grant amount is a decrease of 13.8 million dollars from Fiscal Year 2017 and it is

partially offset by an increase for our new cadets.

As I mentioned, we swore in 36 new cadets for Field

Enforcement this January, but the need for more

enforcement personnel continues, so the Preliminary

Budget restores the TLC's personnel spending to prior

levels, which will enable us to start recruiting

another Cadet Class dedicated to field enforcement in

our Uniformed Services Bureau. In November, as part

of the Fiscal Year 2017 budget, we received funding

to improve our enforcement operations by

participating in Mayor De Blasio's initiative to make

administrative summoning more efficient and

consistent through a uniformed summons. To support

this initiative, the TLC will be upgrading our

officers' electronic handheld devices to streamline

our summoning process. The upgraded electronic

summoning system allows for enhanced features and

greater mobility, which is critical to our officers

who conduct almost all of their enforcement

activities in the field. We continue to prioritize

ongoing projects such as Vision Zero, dedicating

funds to enforce safe driving for our licensee

population, including through TLC's Safety Squads,

who use LIDAR equipment to reduce speeding in

critical areas across the five boroughs. Finally, the Preliminary Budget reflects efficiencies that the TLC has made to support the city's overall savings plan, primarily by efficiencies attributable to improving the automation of our inspection system at the Woodside Safety and Emissions facility. The TLC's projected Fiscal Year 2018 revenue budget is 55.7 million dollars. This is a decrease from Fiscal Year 2017, which is attributable to the recent extension of the license period from two years to three and the related increase in the license fee to cover this longer period. This Preliminary Budget does not include revenue from any medallion sales, which have been deferred into Fiscal Year 2019. I note that new legislation sponsored by Chair Rodriguez and signed into law last week will address potential barriers in the medallion market by reducing the medallion transfer tax and eliminating the, the distinction between Individual and Corporate medallions. In the midst of a greatly transformed for hire vehicle industry, the TLC continues to advance our key goals; safety, consumer protection, driver welfare and accessibility. I am grateful to our partnership with the council, which helps achieve these goals for all

1
2 New Yorkers. Thank you for the opportunity to speak
3 today and I'd be happy to answer any questions you
4 have.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
6 Commissioner and now my colleague here Council
7 Member, Council Menchaca has a few questions and I'll
8 give him the opportunity first and then come back and
9 ask my question.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chair
11 and thank you Commissioner for coming, coming today
12 and you have some really great updates on, on not
13 only the, the work that we're doing on the drivers
14 and all the Vision Zero stuff. I... I'm interested in
15 really understanding the impact around adult
16 education, this is a theme that we've been talking a
17 lot about in the city but also with your agency as
18 well. So the city of New York is really poised in
19 this next budget to make some big commitments around
20 educating our adults and one of those workforce
21 entities are, are TLC drivers, these are
22 predominately immigrant community members so what I
23 want to do is work with all of you and if you can
24 talk to us a little bit about the budget how, how can
25 you... how can you under... how can we understand through

1
2 your perspective what TLC needs in terms of kind of
3 full commitment to educating our drivers and give us
4 a sense about what that need is so that one I can
5 fight for it on a larger scope but also just what the
6 actual need is for our TLC drivers on the ground?

7 MEERA JOSHI: Yeah, we have done
8 something extremely different in the last three years
9 with our drivers. Historically the only drivers that
10 got training were those that drove yellow medallion
11 taxis and beginning in about 2014, 2015 we started
12 phasing in school for everybody and it's a 24-hour
13 training curriculum, I think we have trained about
14 55,000 drivers by now but what it also creates for
15 the larger city and for... to advance initiatives that
16 are important to many of the people who become TLC
17 drivers is it gives an opportunity or a forum for
18 some messaging to be provided. So, it's not just
19 Vision Zero information that we're giving them in the
20 24-hour curriculum there's also some human rights
21 information about what their rights are and, and how
22 they should handle it should they be violated, about
23 customer service, about financial empowerment.
24 There's lots of opportunity within the 24 hours. Now
25 there's always a balance because we've got to keep

our crucial lessons in there, which are what is... you know geography and how to handle TLC regulations but I do think you've identified a, a good spot to message some of the things that would be beneficial to our licensee population.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Well thank you for that and, and I think this is the more comprehensive conversation and I'm glad you're the one before I could get there about know your rights workshops that are happening right now in our communities. We need to... we need to bring that to our workforce and so I'm really... you are just light, light years ahead of the panel that was here before, the MTA in really understanding how to engage communities, communities of color and immigrant communities and maybe you two should talk and give him some, some tips but I think... I think that's... that says a lot that you were already thinking about it in the last three years, you've really kind of re-shifted the focus. So we want to partner up with you and, and, and really I think what, what I'm trying to do in build my immigration agenda through the committee is really bring all the different agencies that impact immigrants to the table to talk about how

1 each agency is really impacting the immigration
2 budget portfolio and I think you just give... you've
3 given us an opportunity to maybe, maybe next year
4 bring you in to that discussion and right now we have
5 Moya, we have HRA and DYCD but I think this is a
6 larger impact and your insight can really help other
7 agencies that are trying to tackle this in a
8 different perspective, you bring the workforce in a
9 very important workforce for us in the city of New
10 York that are really generating a lot of economic
11 power for our immigrant communities and so are you...
12 are you open to, to working with me to figure out
13 maybe next year to come to an... [cross-talk]

14 MEERA JOSHI: Yeah... no, we'd... [cross-
15 talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: ...budget
17 hearing... [cross-talk]

18 MEERA JOSHI: ...look forward to that. I
19 think about 98 percent of our drivers were born in a
20 country other than the United States so... and that
21 population is growing.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Exactly. And,
23 and, and so tell me a little bit next about, about
24 the, the impact of the, the license, the kind of one
25

1 license and one... how's that impacted maybe the
2 budget, maybe there is no impact but is it... is it
3 cause any savings, this is something that the Chair
4 really pushed and, and we kind of negotiated the
5 final... the final bill can you tell us a little bit
6 about, about that?

8 MEERA JOSHI: I think from the driver's
9 perspective it brings a level of simplicity. We had
10 two licensing classes before... actually we had more
11 like four, four or five with a different set of rules
12 and sometimes people held two licenses and they'd be
13 in a different point on one license than they were on
14 the other. So, there I think was some unnecessary
15 confusion that was caused by having multiple license
16 classes. It was a real recognition that the drivers
17 were doing the same job, they're safely transporting
18 passengers for hire. What it's done for us
19 administratively is created a lot of efficiencies,
20 it... you know we were duplicating work essentially and
21 now each driver has only one license and I think it's
22 streamlined it for those that are coming into the
23 business they're not choosing which they have to
24 drive for they just get a license and can make that
25 decision at any point. So, it's been a boon for us

and I, I hope that it's been a boon for drivers and so far, the feedback we get is that it has been.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Good and, and I think... I think that's, that's what we're hearing too but we want to make sure that we get a good sense and have, have good touch points on the ground for, for that feedback since it was... it was a pretty major change but it really helped a lot of... a lot of the mechanisms work better. I do want to mention that we have... we have some folks in, in the audience here from Sunset Park who are going to be testifying in, in some panels in the future; Melissa and we have UPROSE and community board seven... Sunset from community board seven and they are going to talk a little bit about the MTA issues that we have but I just wanted to give them a shout out that I have the mic and thank you and thank them for being here. I know we're, we're a little bit late in, in our... in our timing. Now that the Chairs back I'm going to hand it right, right back over to him. Thanks Chair.

MEERA JOSHI: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Well Access-A-Ride how can MTA say that they were open to work and I don't know if they've been working with

you and conversation and how does thousands of green...
an opportunity that we have to have vehicles from the
green cars and yellow taxis can take advantage of
that huge resources of half a million dollars... half a
billion dollars that is part of the Access-A-Ride?

MEERA JOSHI: We have been working very
closely with the MTA on piloting or testing how to
integrate TLC licensed vehicles into the Access-A-
Ride program and I really commend the MTA for
launching this project starting with the technology.
So how we're testing it with them is dispatching
Access-A-Ride rides through the hailing apps that are
now available on the FHV side and on the taxi side
and I think that's a huge efficiency right, right
then and there and we've also worked with them to
make sure that our wheelchair accessible taxis are
part of this testing and that customers are able to
have on demand accessible service through Access-A-
Ride by using those taxis and that has been... made
very good progress on the customers that don't need
an accessible vehicle there's been a tremendous
number of app based bases that have provided that
service in the testing environment and the customer
surveys that have come back in that regard have been

1 positive. So, so far there, they're doing I think
2 what is prudent, testing it, there is a big
3 difference in for hire and taxi culture and Access-A-
4 Ride culture because the customer driver dynamic can
5 be slightly different and the pay, you know it's a
6 set 2.75 dollars versus the meter or a dispatched
7 amount but they've, they've been very prudent about
8 testing this to make sure that we've overcome that
9 and I look forward to working with them to bring that
10 to a broader range of vehicles and a larger testing
11 environment like a pilot. So, I think we've made good
12 progress but there's still more to come.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay and in, in
15 that direction my interest... well I would say from my
16 end and to be short that the yellow and the green
17 should be the one leading the opportunity in that
18 pilot project not just being part of it because we
19 also know that there is... I... first of all I, I think
20 that we live in a city of opportunity, we live in a
21 market economic... economy and everyone should be able
22 to invest and get their return but... I believe that we
23 have a responsibility to keep working this chaotic
24 city with those sectors that they been... we know and
25 we... and this is something that we had shared, there's

MEERA JOSHI: Yeah, I think... I'm taking, taking full advantage of the accessible vehicles that are currently on the road would be tremendous customer service benefit for Access-A-Ride riders but also a cost saving for the city and the state and it would be an income stream for the drivers of those vehicles... [cross-talk]

MEERA JOSHI: It's a... [cross-talk]

MEERA JOSHI: ...it's basically a

competition... not a competition, it is basically an opportunity so anybody who has an app based dispatch service there's two of them in the yellow and green industry and then any of the app based and FHV can put a proposal together and MTA will give them an opportunity to test their technology and the, the results of that so far have been very positive, there

has been some... an app based service in the yellow industry, green industry that's doing very, very well as well as in the FHV.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So you think that there's opportunity for all sectors?

MEERA JOSHI: There is opportunity for all sectors, it's a matter of who wants to come to the table and, and try to get that work.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Right, so you have someone in your team, new on your team that has a lot of expertise of enforcement and, and how are we doing on enforcement when it comes to knowing that Access-A-Ride talk about it right now in Midtown, I'm talking about the JFK, LaGuardia what is the number like when we think about... what is the number of drivers that they got fined because they were doing illegal and street hails in those areas?

MEERA JOSHI: So I'm going to give you some general numbers but I also want to give Dianna an opportunity to speak about strategy because as you know we have limited personnel and it is a very large city so a lot... a lot of what we do depends on how well we do it not necessarily the numbers that we have but in 2016 we issued almost 19,000 summonses

1 for illegal activity and year to date 2017 over
2 14,000. There has been a, a... I'd say more than half
3 of them in each year have been in what we call hot
4 spots that'd be Manhattan central business district
5 as well as the airports and the penalties for those
6 that are... occur in those two hot spots have recently
7 increased and that's attributable to a local law that
8 you sponsored that was signed into law which raised
9 the penalties for illegal activity in those areas.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And, and I'm
12 sorry with that number how would... how, how are those
13 numbers in 2016 compared to 2016... I'm... and those
14 numbers from 2016 compared to the previous year,
15 2015, 2014?

16 MEERA JOSHI: They... 2016 will be... I'll,
17 I'll get you the 2015 number but I know from the top
18 of my head that it is going to be lower than 2015,
19 2015 at the end of the year is when we got our horal
20 decision which was the decision that caused us to
21 sort of stop and have to rethink a lot of our
22 enforcement initiatives and it did have an effect on
23 our summonsing levels.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.
25

DIANNA PEGNETTI: Good afternoon, it's very nice to be here today. So, I know the Chair wanted me to talk to you about some different strategies that we've employed because we are a bit understaffed and still when fully staffed would have a large area to cover we have made a great effort to work with the NYPD and the PAPD in areas of joint enforcement. The Chair and I recently met with the police commissioner who has already provided great support in commuter van operations and illegal operator operations but has since also committed dedicated officers throughout the precincts to work with us on, on a more regular basis and this will allow us to deploy more people consistently for better results. In addition, I've met with the PAPD and we've... although the label... we've also has a good working relationship with them since we started operations at JFK in 2016 and then... or 2015 and then LaGuardia in 2016 we have begun joint operations specifically targeting hustlers in addition to the illegal street hails. So... and we have boots on the ground at JFK and then hope to do the same at LaGuardia once construction is complete but the foundation of the enforcement really rests in two

1 areas in my mind, training and the community. In the
2 area of training because we've had some changes in
3 operations due to litigation and due to new rules and
4 regulations we've increased training and this enables
5 more officers within our department to take part in
6 different types of operations as opposed to being
7 specialized. So, we've kind of decentralized the
8 special units and put more people out into the field
9 but with the community we've gone through great
10 community outreach to meet with the industry so that
11 we can get their input on their concerns because in
12 addition to protecting the public by providing a safe
13 transportation system through taxi and limousine we
14 also want to protect the industry. We have a lot of
15 law abiding drivers and owners that are trying to do
16 the right thing for, for New York and we're trying to
17 do the right thing for them. So with that we've met
18 with them and we're actually getting daily input from
19 members of the community with their specific hot
20 spots so that... they're kind of like helping us with
21 our net, we have our traditional law enforcement
22 initiatives where we gather intelligence, we gather
23 information, we look at complaints, we look at the
24 different hot spots but by bringing in the community
25

we're getting it right from the people and that enables us to respond and, and have a better communication and relationship with the public.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: We need to be clear zero tolerance for illegal street hail at the JFK and the Midtown area. I think that this is too much and we are overdue, I... and, and again there's not going to be any person in our city that will advocate stronger for our working class New Yorkers than myself and I believe everyone deserves to make the living and, and I was one of those who had started washing dishes, working in restaurant, I drove a delivery taxi but I believe also that there's 6,000 independent medallions owners as I said before in other hearings that they were relying on the value of their medallions to get a mortgage, to... for their house and to send their kids to college and we sold those individuals the dream that they would be the only one that had the right to do a street hail and there has to be some corruption going on at the JFK like you know when, when you see a... if we lander at JFK... especially JFK, he seen people soliciting passengers still today, I will take you hear like we declare that JFK is closer for the yellow taxi, we

1 say that and... unless prearrangement is made and I
2 think that... the same thing in the Midtown area, you
3 know those individuals that now they are dealing with
4 tough times, they thought that when they purchased
5 the medallion they were only be... they would be the
6 only one that we have the right to do a, a street
7 hail and, and I believe that they are... the city
8 provide the opportunity for everyone, we have the
9 green taxi, I think that there's even more
10 flexibility in some area in the outer borough but
11 when it comes to the Midtown where it is a hard core
12 of the 55 million tourists that came to our city,
13 opportunity is there for everyone and I just hope
14 that, you know we see the urgency because every day
15 there's another medallion owner that is parking his
16 car in the garage and, and this is too much and... I
17 understand this isn't too much to you guys but it is
18 too much for us as a city on how we have seen this
19 grouping failing day by day like I've been getting
20 phone calls, I got so much... someone has called me she
21 say my husband used to own this medallion now he's
22 dealing... through... in a tough situation, the only
23 thing that we have for our retirement was his
24 medallion and no one... we don't have anyone that's
25

1 interested in buying this medallion and this is the
2 reality of thousands and thousands of New Yorkers.
3 So, I believe that we... it's not the only solution, I
4 would like to hear also from the Commissioner on
5 what... you know it's a tough time where we are when it
6 comes to this industry, do you have any perspective
7 or how do you see the future of the yellow taxi
8 industry?
9

10 MEERA JOSHI: Well I think enforcement is
11 key, one of the issues at, at, at JFK and LaGuardia
12 especially is that even when we arrest hustlers
13 they're back out pretty quickly because the charges
14 that they are arrested for result in usually a desk
15 appearance ticket, there's no real severe penalty
16 with them. so that is one thing... one area where we
17 can continue do, do the work but the, the, the low
18 penalty continues to undermine the good work that we
19 do and we see repeat offenders regularly. As far as
20 the medallion industry it is completely accurate,
21 trips are down in yellow taxis and it is in part
22 there's a huge culture change, there's new
23 competition which wasn't around about four or five
24 years ago and there's a new passenger base,
25 passengers that are very much accustomed to using

1 their telephone to get for hire service and, and
2 maybe for younger passengers that's their
3 introduction to for hire service now is their
4 telephone rather than the traditional yellow taxi.
5 What that means for the industry and I applaud the
6 industry these are very difficult times but using
7 that new technology to integrate it with the existing
8 vehicles and so there are now apps that are available
9 to hail yellow taxis and I think that that is where
10 the focus is going to have to be in order to respond
11 to competition and keep the sectors... keep vitality in
12 all of the sectors. There are also some regulations
13 regarding medallion transfers that make the market
14 frozen and, and you sponsored one important piece
15 that undid some of that work and so we'll see what
16 affect that has in the coming months on transactions
17 within the market.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So thank you and
20 with that is part is, is done and we will go now to
21 the public section. Thank you. Kate Slevin, Eric
22 McClure, Julia Kite, Nick Sifuentes, Clayton Brooks.
23 We will put the clock on two minutes so if your
24 testimony is too long please summarize and you may
25 start.

ERIC MCCLURE: Thank you, good afternoon.

On behalf of StreetsPAC I'd like to thank you for the opportunity to weigh in on the Mayor's Preliminary Transportation Budget for Fiscal Year 2018. The additional 400 million dollars for Vision Zero that Mayor De Blasio announced in January provides a major boost for safety on city streets. While those funds will be spent over several years, they'll begin to have an effect right away, especially on critical initiatives like the replacement and refurbishment of street markings. The Mayor's capital budget... the, the Mayor... the Mayor's capital commitment to shortening the replacement cycle for crosswalks and bike lanes and the Department of Transportation's improved ability to handle restriping, is vital to better street safety. Likewise, more spending on crossing guards, additional funding for implementation of hardened center lines for left turns, enhanced street lights... lighting, and upgrades for intersections along the bike network will similarly have an immediate effect in improving safety for vulnerable street users. We applaud this commitment to Vision Zero spending. This commitment is especially important in light of a brand-new Health Department

report that reveals that pedestrian fatality rates in poor neighborhoods are triple those in wealthy communities. It should be a moral imperative that we prioritize Vision Zero spending in high poverty areas, which would be very much in keeping with the Mayor's goals of addressing inequality. It's also critical that we get lifesaving infrastructure upgrades in the ground quickly, and unfortunately, that's not frequently the case with the Department of Design and Construction. The Department of Transportation is nimble with paint and plastic, but those things can't stop a speeding car. We need to make sure that DDC implements Vision Zero work in a much more timely manner. While this increased spending on Vision Zero initiatives is laudable, there are some areas in which we believe the proposed budget is deficient. Citi Bike will complete its planned phase II expansion by the end of this year, and at this juncture, no concrete plans exist for further growth of the bike share system. While... will we top out at 12,000 bikes? Or will Citi Bike continue to grow to serve even more New Yorkers, delivering the convenience and efficiency of bike share to neighborhoods hungry for this reliable low

cost transit option? The original white paper drafted by the Department of City Planning eight years ago, which laid out the potential for bike share in New York City envisioned a 49,000-bike system serving significant portions of four boroughs. Such a robust system would cover all high and mid density neighborhoods with a projected capital cost of 200 million dollars and an annual operating cost of 100 million dollars, the latter fully offset by membership and user fees and sponsorship. Widespread support exists in the council for public funding of the capital cost necessary to expand Citi Bike and we strongly urge the administration to commit to working with the council to earmark the funds necessary for full Phase III expansion of... outlined by City Planning in 2009.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Summarize, ten seconds.

ERIC MCCLURE: Okay. We also would like to express our support the Fair Fares initiative proposed by our friends at Riders Alliance. We urge the Mayor and the council to find funding for expansion of the public space, the pedestrian and bike lanes on the Brooklyn Bridge, which is an idea

that was first loaded by Council Members Lander and Levin and Chin several years ago and lastly, we urge the council and the administration to take a very hard look at parking policy. The underpricing of curbside space in New York City contributes greatly to congestion which in turn harms productivity and constrains economic activity. Given the negative externalities of private automobile use, our failure to properly price parking has societal consequences beyond the legitimate revenue that we're leaving on the table. Great, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

JULIA KITE: Council Member Rodriguez and members of the committee, thank you for calling this hearing. My name is Julia Kite and I'm the Policy and Research Manager for Transportation Alternatives. We'd like to offer our profound gratitude to Mayor De Blasio for the increase in funding for Vision Zero projects set forth in the Preliminary Budget. This 400-million-dollar investment over five years is essential to moving New York City closer to zero deaths and injuries because it will allow for the redesigned and reconstruction of some of New York City's most dangerous streets. as we've observed

through the success of Queens Boulevard this funding is not only the difference between life and death but it also changes arterial roads from barriers into opportunities to reclaim public space for New Yorkers to live their fullest lives. We are mindful that Vision Zero projects will only save lives if they create high quality complete streets that put pedestrian and cyclist safety above driver convenience. With the inclusion of elements like protected bike lanes, widened sidewalks, signal protected pedestrian crossings, dedicated transit facilities we can more than help injuries on some streets as we've seen already. As demonstrated in the Transportation Alternatives Vision Zero Street Design Standard, we do have the opportunity to create world class safe streets using tools already available in the DOT Street Design Manual. And the opportunity we have now, with this investment, is too great to not do the job properly. Twenty-Two Council Members, most recently Julissa Ferreras of the Committee on Finance have signed onto our letter to the Mayor urging that this funding must be used for comprehensive, best practice street redesign. And while capital projects are absolutely essential they can take several years

1 to complete fortunately this... there are city's...
2 steps... there are steps the cities could take to
3 integrate street safety improvements through the
4 routine resurfacing program and we would urge more of
5 that as well. The December 2016 Court of Appeals
6 ruling in Tuturro v. City of New York, which found
7 the city partially liable for nearly ten million
8 dollars for a crash on a dangerous street that did
9 not receive traffic calming, adds urgency and a
10 fiscal responsibility argument to the need to
11 redesign these streets sooner not later. We also urge
12 the department to swiftly overrule the objections of
13 obstructionist community boards because the city has
14 a Vision Zero mandate to do whatever it takes to
15 redesign blatantly dangerous streets. Finally, we'd
16 like to lend our support for direct funding of Citi
17 Bike. Bike share has been an undeniable success in
18 the neighborhoods where stations are located,
19 encouraging New Yorkers to pursue active
20 transportation. We need a five-borough bike share for
21 equity and for... in order to reach... sorry, one second,
22 in order to reach our 80 by 50 emissions goals and in
23 conclusion I'd like to thank the Department of
24 Transportation for 18.5 miles of protected bike lanes
25

achieved last year and we know that going forward we can reach our Vision Zero goals. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

NICK SIFUENTES: Thank you for the opportunity to speak today and thank you to Chairman Rodriguez for leading the fight for Fair-Fares in the city council. I'm Nick Sifuentes, the Deputy Director of the Riders Alliance. We're New York's grassroots organization of subway and bus riders fighting for better transit and more affordable fares. As we all know, fares just increased yet again for public transit riders in the five boroughs. For many New Yorkers, the fare increases are merely an inconvenience but for hundreds of thousands living in poverty, fare increases, which can eat up as much as ten percent of a poor family's annual budget, can force a cascade of impossible decisions; pay rent or get to work, buy groceries or go to the doctor with your kid, and no one should have to make those kinds of decisions. The end result of course, is that we either limit economic and social mobility for many of our fellow residents, or people resort to fare beating, risking arrest just to access opportunity. Because the reality is that virtually no one is

1 jumping turnstiles for fun; they're doing it because
2 the system has essentially locked them out. And while
3 good jobs and affordable housing are key city
4 priorities and for good reason, it's just as
5 important that the public transit that binds the two
6 together is affordable as well. After all, if you and
7 your family can't get from your affordable apartment
8 to a good job, the entire edifice falls apart. At
9 this point, the city already provides discount fares
10 for students and the elderly and also passed the
11 sweeping Commuter Benefits legislation that saves
12 middle class New Yorkers an average of 450 dollars a
13 year. While we are of course proud supporters of
14 Commuter Benefits, the reality is that the only folks
15 left out of those benefits are low income New Yorkers
16 who make too little to take advantage of the tax
17 savings. In effect, New York City subsidizes everyone
18 but working age, poverty level New Yorkers.

19 Unfortunately, the current city administration is
20 turning a blind eye to the needs of those New Yorkers
21 calling Fair-Fares quote, "a noble idea," but quote,
22 "the states responsibility. I'd argue that creating a
23 pathway for poor New Yorkers to access good jobs, to
24 actually lift themselves up, to improve their lives,

1 is very much the city's responsibility and exactly
2 what the Mayor stands for. Public transit must remain
3 affordable for every member of the public, not just
4 those who are fortunate enough to never have to think
5 about the cost of a Metro Card swipe. So, we look to
6 you. I'm here today to thank City Council for your
7 support, we've proud to have well over a majority of
8 the council supporting Fair Fares and ask you to
9 ensure that Fair Fares is included in the council
10 budget response. Hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers
11 are counting on you. Thank you.

13 CLAYTON BROOKS: Good afternoon Chair
14 Rodriguez, Council Member Menchaca, thank you. my
15 name is Reverend Clayton Brooks, I'm the Director of
16 Advocacy at Covenant House. Covenant House has served
17 the homeless youth of New York City since 1972 now
18 having expanded to 30 cities throughout the world,
19 serving 50,000 young people every year. Here in New
20 York we serve... we've housed 1,744 youth this last
21 year many from... come from your districts and so we
22 are grateful to continue doing that work moving
23 forward but I come here today to talk to you about a
24 major issue facing many of our young people and it
25 was alluded to earlier with questions from both of

you namely accessing the subway system. A significant number of our young people do what any New Yorker does when they need to get to their job or they need to get to a homeless shelter or they need to go to an interview and they don't have the money to afford a subway ticket, which is to have to turnstile. Metro cards are a, a crucial element of the everyday lives of almost every New Yorker but in particular those who have fallen through the city's safety net, the youth that we serve and these youths who cannot afford metro cards continue racking up fine after fine and escalating consequences without any ability to pay. Those who are lucky enough to make it into shelter obviously can access cards through a, a, a homeless service providers but that also is a burden on the budgets of those service providers and is often not included in the contracts, explicitly included in the contracts that they receive from the city that funds them. and so, I, I guess my ask is twofold gentlemen, one we are incredibly supportive of the Fair Fares campaign. I'd like to amend a statement by my colleague which is that those who hop the turnstiles do not just do so for fun, they do so for survival, that is the reality for the youth that

1 we serve. We thank you for supporting that but my
2 second ask is to work with Covenant House and other
3 providers to think about introducing a resolution
4 before the council to push the MTA to offer
5 additional options beyond just a monetary fine for
6 those individuals who hop the turnstile. We've pushed
7 for possibly community service but have been told
8 that that is currently not an option available to the
9 transit adjudication bureau. So, would love to work
10 with your offices if that is something of interest to
11 either of you. thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, the
14 next group two residents from Sunset Park; Kiya Vega-
15 Hutchens and Melissa Del Valle Ortiz, we're going to
16 be also calling Verna DuBerry and Richard Conroy. We
17 will get the residents from Sunset Park first since
18 they are testifying on a particular issue and then we
19 get to the other two members of the public.

20 MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: Can you hear me
21 now, oh you can hear me now. Say it again, bring it
22 closer, can you hear me now? Okay. Alright. So, good
23 morning members of the committee, city council. My
24 name is Melissa del Valle Ortiz and I'm a tenant
25 leader and 25-year resident of Sunset Parks Project

Based Section 8 Housing. My development is comprised of families including seniors and disabled and youth, many who go to school and work outside of Sunset Park. While walking a few extra blocks may not prove to be a hardship for most, it is a hardship for some of us and that's who I'm here to speak on behalf of. During our press conference organized by our City Council Member Carlos Menchaca, I mentioned how not having a 4th Avenue shuttle bus during the station shutdown would impact persons with physical disabilities, breathing conditions and who walk with assistance like canes and walkers, only to receive a call from a couple later that afternoon that you'll hear from in a recording. These eight extra blocks can take them up to an extra eight minutes per block to walk. I can only imagine what they will experience during the sweltering summer months, during the slippery rain and snow filled winter. I also failed to mention persons with mental disabilities including autism whose commute becomes confusing when given extra instructions or being rerouted away from their routine commute. I also feel very strongly that it's a direct violation of the American with Disabilities Act, by not providing them with uninterrupted service

1 for their routine along 4th Avenue. Additionally, we
2 have many staff at NYU Lutheran, Brooklyn Army
3 Terminal and hundreds of businesses on 4th and 2nd and
4 3rd Avenues. Their walk... their work time will now be
5 significantly impacted by having to accommodate the
6 extra walk on top of the potential and routine delays
7 that we already experience. To be without a subway
8 station is one thing but to be without direct access
9 to the nearest one is something else. I'd also like
10 to point out that the MTA on their website posted
11 public hearings for, for closures on the J Train
12 Broad Street but Sunset Park never was given that
13 opportunity. I would also like to take this moment to
14 remind the MTA that while we are in a low-income
15 community, many of the families in these communities
16 work as do many of the families in subsidized
17 housing. We all pay our fares to get there on time,
18 our bosses don't want to hear the excuses as to why
19 there are delays and would sooner fire you if it
20 happens one too many times. As... is that it? Oh I can
21 keep going. As a tenant leader in HUD subsidized
22 housing I would also like to remind the MTA of their
23 commitment to the community... to the commuters from
24 NYCHA Development and the outskirts of Brooklyn such
25

1 as Canarsie and Red Hook. Residents of Canarsie in
2 Bayview Houses where I grew up, whether seniors or
3 disabled will be hugely impacted by Broadway Junction
4 transfer point on the L Line during the Canarsie
5 tunnel repair. They deserve an express bus to the
6 nearest handicap accessible station at Utica Avenue,
7 without having to be forced to take an extra eight to
8 ten-minute non-accessible walking transfer at
9 Broadway Junction. In addition, the NYCHA residents
10 of Red Hook Houses need increased and dedicated
11 shuttle to subway station bus service. While it may
12 not be the case, it seems that the MTA is not giving
13 any consideration for the working poor whose jobs
14 become expendable, when they are experiencing
15 repeated routine and extended MTA delays.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sorry, can you
18 please summarize because...

19 MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: Wrapping it up.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Wrap it up, five
21 seconds.

22 MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: The working
23 poor cannot afford these, these delays to, to lose
24 their jobs while the MTA is under construction. The
25 extended lack of consideration for accommodation to

the seniors and disabled as part of the fabric of New York is clear and obvious and needs to be rectified, we need a 4th Avenue shuttle bus.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, thank you.

KIYA VEGA-HUTCHENS: Good afternoon members of the committee. My name is Kiya Vega-Hutchens and I'm a Climate Justice Policy Organizer at UPROSE. We are an environmental and justice... environmental and social justice organization based in Sunset Park. We have a long history of working for transportation justice in our community, from restoring mass cuts, cuts to mass transit to improving pedestrian infrastructure. We have known for some time about the... that the 3rd... that the 53rd Street subway station would be affected by the governors MTA plans. However, the exact dates of this closure were not brought to the community's attention until very recently. Moreover, the communications came only in the form of limited signage in the station, all in English only. Sunset Park is a predominately immigrant community, where over half of our residents are foreign born and half face linguistic isolation. Aside from English, prominent languages in our community include Spanish, Chinese

and Arabic. It is not acceptable that community... that the communications target only half of the community and in limited scope at that. About 7,500... I'm sorry, 7,500 people use the 53rd Street subway station during weekdays. This number is even higher on the weekend. The R train is a lifeline for our community, serving our small businesses, students, institutions, elders, and community based organizations. Moreover, the R train is part of an economic hub that connects... that connects Sunset Park to similar communities in Queens. The abrupt shutdown of the 53rd Street station will disrupt thousands of community members daily. It is not feasible that the MTA expects community members to walk to 3rd or 5th Avenue, take a bus parallel to the R line, then walk back to 4th Avenue to the next subway station. We need the MTA to consider public shuttle services to fill this transit gap that now exists in our community. We honestly believe that Sunset Park that were Sunset Park a more affluent community this failure to communicate would not have occurred and that the MTA would be open to exploring alternative transportation options. We look forward to having a conversation with the MTA and all relevant agencies to determine how to best serve the

community. I thank you very much for your time and consideration and for your work.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

KIYA VEGA-HUTCHENS: Uh-huh.

RICH CONROY: Good afternoon members of the city council Transportation Committee. I'm Rich Conroy, the Director of Education at Bike New York. Bike New York provides free bicycle education programs for adults and children throughout the city. In the last two years, we've reached 17,000 adults and children each year with a variety of programs and Council Member Rodriguez I want to thank you personally for just discretionary funding that you allocated to us for a bicycle education center in Inwood Hill Park, it's been very successful for both public programs and our youth programs. My comments today are focused on calling for public financing to expand Citi Bike, 2017 is the last year of planned expansion for the Citi Bike system and it's been wildly successful with tens of millions of rides and tens of millions of miles. I think the payoff has been huge in terms of cleaner air for New York City as well as promoting healthy active transportation for New Yorkers but its only covering a small area of

1 the city. Bike share is exploding across the United
2 States and across the world even into small towns and
3 small communities. Our system is one of the few that
4 is entirely privately financed but really if you
5 think about it it's a type of public transportation.
6 A subsidy of less than .0025 percent of the city's
7 73.8 billion budget would infuse nearly 18.5 million
8 dollars into Citi Bike. Like existing public transit
9 option, Citi Bike brings people together and bridges
10 gaps. If subways, buses and ferries were private
11 entities with no public assistance as Citi Bike is
12 those systems would be forced to charge more money
13 than most New Yorkers could afford or they would
14 cease to exist. It is time to put the city in Citi
15 Bike. Thank you.

17 VERNA DUBERRY: Good afternoon, on behalf
18 of the New York... on behalf of Bedford Stuyvesant
19 Restoration Corporation I'd like to thank the New
20 York City council and Chairman Rodriguez for this
21 opportunity to speak on this budget hearing today. My
22 name is Verna DuBerry and as you consider the 2018
23 budget I want to urge you to support Citi Bike with
24 city funding as a five-borough affordable
25 transportation option in the face of the current

1 transportation affordability crisis impacting low
2 income communities. As you may know restoration is
3 the nation's first community development corporation
4 and we have a long history and a long track record.
5 Programs foster economic self-sufficiency, enhance
6 family stability, promote the arts and culture and
7 transform neighborhoods into safe, vibrant, and
8 livable spaces. We serve over 50,000 people annually.
9 As a community development corporation, we know that
10 transportation is the key economic mobility.
11 Residents need to be able to get to work, to look for
12 employment, to go to school and to travel to
13 essential services. The average clients we serve
14 spends 200 dollars a month in transportation. For a
15 community where the median income is less than 24,000
16 dollars, this is a lot. This monthly expense is an
17 outlay that is unaffordable. The price of... a, a 30
18 dollar... the, the metro card is ten percent average..
19 is ten percent of the household average income. Many
20 low... no... many low income New Yorkers are forced to
21 choose between necessities of food and medicine and,
22 and, and transportation. Many resort to begging for
23 swipes or... I'm sorry, or avoiding the fare altogether
24 as we heard earlier. Over 52,000 New Yorkers were
25

1 stopped for fare evasion in 2016. This underscores
2 the needs. In central Brooklyn, Northern Bed Stuy is
3 a transportation desert. In addition to having
4 pronounced economic education on health disparities
5 this is why Citi Bike and bike share is essential.
6 Public housing residents are eligible for up to 60...
7 to pay 60 dollars a year and five dollars a week... a
8 month. Clients of selected credit unions in... and
9 restoration also have a discounted rate. Citi Bike
10 membership has increased over... in Bed Stuy over 56
11 percent in the past year and that's 5,500 more active
12 members in the past year alone. We just want to, to
13 ask you to support Citi Bike and bike share
14 throughout the boroughs that really needs it.

15
16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, thank you.
17 Council Member Menchaca:

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chair
19 and again I just want to highlight the leadership of,
20 of this chair, Ydanis Rodriguez, Council Member for
21 your incredible leadership on this... on these issues
22 that we are facing right now in our community both on
23 the Fair Fares and the immigrant communities that
24 need to get respected, I just can't thank you enough.
25 Second I just want to thank Sunset Park for being

1 here, for representing in a big way our community. I
2 know some members couldn't come today for many, many
3 reasons; fear, immigration issues, disability issues,
4 people who are home taking care of, of children who
5 are... who are... who, who are representing and I, I
6 don't know if there's any other way that you were
7 able to kind of bring your testimony with us today.

9 MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: Well actually I
10 mentioned that we had a, a video... not a video
11 recording but an audio recording if we could... if I
12 could play it.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah, there's
14 like ten seconds you can play with us that would be
15 great but I just want to say thank you for bringing
16 that voice here to the city council and bringing the
17 MTA into an accountability that we need with, with
18 every, every force of nature so if you have... you can
19 just play ten seconds of it that'd be great and tell
20 us who this is.

21 MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: Oh my god, give
22 me one second, I'm so sorry. This is Marilyn Coma,
23 they live on 52nd Street and they're a senior citizen
24 couple that were impacted by... they were impacted... I,
25 I can't play it now.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: That's okay, so they're... just, just give a ten second bit because these are the voices that need to be in the city council and you're doing that with, with every, every, every intention if you will.

MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: It's literally not... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So what was their issue if you can... [cross-talk]

MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: Their issue was just that the, the grandma has asthma, the grandfather has recent stroke and they actually had to walk and couldn't and they have... they both have weak knees and weren't able to make it to the train station. I... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you.

MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: Yeah, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, I'm sorry we're a little bit rushed. We are going to be calling now the next panel. Tracey Capers, Omar Arias, Chris Fulong, Jeff Orlick and Shaquana Boykin, Boykin.

MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: I should have mentioned that I was standing in for Tracey Capers.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Everybody stay here, I think that we have one more seat, what is your name? Joanna, go. Please help us here and stay with two minutes and if you know that it is taking longer just summarize when you... when you are getting close to the two minutes.

JOANNA OLTMAN SMITH: Good afternoon, my name's Joanna Oltman Smith, I'm a long time safe streets advocate in New York and I wanted to thank the council for the opportunity to discuss these budgets that so directly affect our everyday lives as we move around our city. Like all New Yorkers, I also am grateful for the additional Vision Zero funding that we're seeing in this budget but as I am unaffiliated with any organization I would like to point out some areas where I think that we are falling short starting by just noting that the DOT's entire budget is only 1.1 percent of the city's overall budget and I believe that the agency that's charged with the responsibility for our mobility and productivity and basic well-being and safety deserves a lot more than one percent of the city budget. The

1 impact of this chronic underfunding at the city level
2 will only be felt more as our streets bear the strain
3 of our new federal administration that is maliciously
4 targeting urban transportation needs such as transit
5 funding and the cutting of the Tiger Grants that the
6 DOT mentioned. We all know that active transportation
7 projects yield the largest return on investment, they
8 are the least expensive to implement while reducing
9 health costs and environmental impacts and at the
10 same time increasing our overall transportation
11 system efficiency and safety for all street users.

12 So, I'm curious, I was going through the DOT's report
13 why the total number of bike lane miles that we're
14 targeting to build in the next fiscal year is
15 dramatically less than in past years. Fiscal year '14
16 we were building 70 miles, fiscal year '18 we're only
17 building 50. Our bike network is still far from
18 complete and we also should be very cautious about
19 putting all of our funding needs in the federal
20 basket which is already shown to be faulty. I'm going
21 to try and summarize because I see my time is almost
22 done. I just think our city funded transportation
23 vision needs to be a lot bolder. I would also like to
24 see us improving an intersection for every person who
25

has been killed on our streets each year. Right now, we're budgeted to improve 20 intersections a year, we lost over 150 bikers and pedestrians last year, let's fix an intersection for each of them.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, thank you.

OMAR ARIAS: Thank you council. I'm here today to support the inclusion of public funding of Citi Bike... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sorry, can, can you say your name please?

OMAR ARIAS: Sorry, my name is Omar Arias. I'm here to support the inclusion of public funding of Citi Bike for the city's transportation budget for 2018. My experience with New York City bike share has been one of social mobility, opportunity and advocacy. I began my journey as one of over 100,000 Citi Bike users and coming from a historically black and Hispanic neighborhood in Harlem. Citi Bike was 26 blocks away from my home when I first joined through the NYCHA discount. Last summer I joined the NYCHA community champions program where I reached out to other NYCHA residents about the benefits of bike share. I was given the opportunity to address the New York City Council at a

public hearing last November and again in January at a press, press conference. I gained employment from Bed-Stuy Restoration as an Active Living Coordinator, working alongside Better Bike Share partners, working to engage communities of low income and color. I was interviewed for the citywide NYCHA journal about bike share and sat at the same table with the General Manager, Manager of Citi Bike to speak about jobs for local residents. The reason I share this with you today is because it is the opinion by some that people like me from neighborhoods like mine will be shut out of such a bike, bike share system and it will harm more than benefit us. To the contrary, my, my voice has been heard countless times and moved.. and I moved my way up. Not everyone will follow the same path I have but the takeaway is that there is a path to gain leadership positions and to have a say in the process. Citi Bike is for someone like me but like many I'd like to see an increase in membership and ridership amongst communities of color and low income. In order to do so we need the system present in our neighborhoods. Along with expansion, we need biking infrastructure, increased access to bike education and safety classes and local residents like

myself to have a say. Still in order for all neighborhoods to experience the same transportation, physical activity and economic benefits of bike share. It is necessary to publicly fund the expansion of Citi Bike into more neighborhoods beyond the current plan. Public funding will help close the gap between existing transportation deserts and allow for an alternative and convenient transportation option for New Yorkers. Thank you.

SHAQUANA BOYKIN: Hi, thank you. my name is Shaquana Boykin, I am a New York City Public Housing Citi Bike member in favor of public funding for Citi Bike expansion. Without Citi Bike membership, I could not get to work, college, my internship at Legal Aid Society and back home. I am able to cut my travel time to five to 15 minutes a trip. I have lost three dress sizes, no longer a diabetic and get to community meetings and Fort Greene and Clinton Hill quickly. Citi Bike can change New Yorkers lives, saving us money, travel time and regulating our health. Fund Citi Bike, bike share works. Thank you.

JEFF ORLICK: My name is Jeff Orlick. I'm coming here today as a... as a car driver, as a subway

1 rider, a Citi Bike user and a resident of Queens who
2 commutes five days a week to Hell's Kitchen. I also
3 work with new immigrants mostly in Queens. I just
4 came here to say how disappointed I am actually with
5 the state of bike share in Queens and also the public
6 funding but more so for Queens. As it is now Queens
7 has the same number of bike share stations as Fargo,
8 North Dakota, a city of 100,000 people even... we...
9 Queens has two and a half million people and we are
10 well below any city even close to that size in the
11 amount of support and structure of a bike share
12 system. As it is Manhattan is wonderful for bike
13 share, they've done a great job but I feel like
14 Manhattan is the reason why Queens is such a... has
15 such a small share of the bike share. Now if we're a
16 city of our own... of our own we'd have a network of
17 hundreds but it's only tens, it's 11 right now and
18 the expansion is for maybe 40, not that much. So, I
19 guess I'm just asking... I guess why shouldn't we be
20 benefiting from Manhattan, the, the financial center
21 of the world, shouldn't Queens be getting more
22 amenities like this. We... I feel like we may have to
23 go through a route of Jersey City and have our own
24 system cooperating but I don't know, it's just a
25

question of why isn't Queens treated the same and why don't we have the same amount. That's it, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Next, next panel; David Beier, Beier, Mark Wiltshire, Tom Glendening, Tom Murphy, Kweli Campbell. So, we have one... no, nobody else from the public.

DAVID KELLER BEIER: My name is David Beier and I am President of the Committee for Taxi Safety which is comprised of licensed lease agents which manage approximately 20 percent of New York City taxi medallions and the drivers of those medallions. Together we work to provide transportation to 400,000 people every day. The city holds preliminary budget for fiscal year 2018, provide for the next medallion auction in 2019. In 2015, City Hall initially released figures showing that it expected to collect 1.266 billion dollars by auctioning off taxi medallions between fiscal years 2015 and '19 but just months later the Mayor's 2016 fiscal year executive budget revised that revenue projection indicating that the city should only anticipate realizing 731 million dollars from the sales, a reduction of 500 million dollars. It is commonly assumed that it was solely the introduction

of app based technologies such as Uber that was the primary reason that created a diminished marketplace for taxi medallions but that is not true and we would like to address the contributing factors as to why the taxi medallion prices are falling and the industry suffering. When the Uber taxi app initially launched in New York City drivers did not leave the taxi industry to drive for Uber, rather the industry's loss of drivers instead coincided with the accessible vehicle mandate imposed only on the taxi industry and the taxi of tomorrow program which the program took away the Camry Hybrid as an option for taxi drivers and mandated the use of the Nissan taxi of tomorrow. In contrast, 65 percent of Uber vehicles are Camry Hybrids and neighborhood cars are almost exclusively Camry Hybrids. Both the accessible taxi and the taxi of tomorrow vehicles proved to be wildly unpopular with the drivers because neither of the vehicles were fuel efficient nor economical in other ways resulting in less driver income. Drivers have rejected these vehicles and let the taxi segment of the industry to drive their vehicle of choice. Additionally, taxis are also now not allowed to experiment with any new or improved technology. The

communities. We have two locations, one in the South Bronx and one in Bedford Stuyvesant Brooklyn. We train more than 500 adults every year and more than 90 percent of our students are people of color and all of them live in households under 200 percent of federal poverty, poverty guidelines. Our Brooklyn students enjoy having access to Citi Bike as it enables them to travel to class at a much lower cost than taking the bus or train. We have a Citi Bike dock right outside of our location in Bed Stuy and its actively used. We are also working on an effort led by Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration Corporation to make Citi Bike inclusive and accessible to everyone through community bike rides and bike safety education. Our students in the Bronx don't have the access to the bikes that our Brooklyn students do and there are significantly less bike lanes installed in the Bronx than other boroughs as we... most of us know according to the... according to the Department of Transportation. Many of the longest, easiest to ride lanes extend through parks and roads in the North, North Bronx such as Mosholu and Pelham Parkway. There are a few dedicated lanes in the South Bronx and riding in the South Bronx can feel very dangerous for

1 residents. And there are no... and for that reason
2 there are, are no Citi Bike docks in the Bronx. By
3 improving bike safety in the South Bronx and
4 expanding Citi Bike to our home borough, you will
5 enable more students to reach Per Scholas every day,
6 which will in turn lead to life changing jobs in
7 technology. You will also improve the health and
8 reduce congestion on trains and buses. Finally, you
9 will enable more residents of the Bronx to access
10 recreation on Randall's Island and in Manhattan via
11 the new Randall's Island connector. At Per Scholas,
12 we firmly believe that biking would benefit the
13 Bronx. Please don't underestimate the interest you
14 would find in the Bronx for more bike lanes and a
15 program like Citi Bike. We hope you will consider
16 expansion to our home borough.

18 KWELI CAMPBELL: Hi, good afternoon. My
19 name is Kweli Campbell and I am a Citi Bike member
20 from Brooklyn, New York. I am here to testify in
21 support of public funding of the Citi Bike program. I
22 moved back to Brooklyn three years ago and brought my
23 bike... my vehicle with me, I quickly realized that I
24 would be unable to drive any and everywhere between
25 traffic and parking even for short trips to the

grocery store became long and stressful experiences.

One day I passed a Citi Bike stand around the corner from my home and decided to look into it. The pricing was affordable in my opinion. I had a coupon that allowed for an annual membership of 130 dollars. I started riding everywhere within a ten-block radius which quickly expanded to riding to work in downtown Brooklyn. Citi Bike has transformed my transportation experience in New York City. Today not only am I able to ride stress free, I get 30, 30 minutes of cardio daily, I share my Citi Bike experience with family and friends, my car is parked most of the time and I've extended my rides to other neighborhoods in Brooklyn and beyond. In my spare time thanks to the better bike partnership and collaboration with Bed Stuy Restoration I have served as a Citi Bike ambassador where I lead monthly rides during the March through October bike season. I enjoy inviting new bike riders to take rides on Citi Bike to different locations in Brooklyn, recently I held my first ride where I had attendees from the South Bronx as well as East New York where they don't have Citi Bike.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So thank you and thank you everyone who came to testify and the agency that also came today. We have some written testimony which we'll read right now.

COMMITTEE CLERK: The following testimony was submitted for the record, Financial District Neighborhood Association, American Council of Engineering Companies of New York. Gary Brown from the Sunset Park Redevelopment Committee. S. Mckenzie, Duane Jonathon Parnell, Margaret Pemberton, E. Crandon, Pamela Guigili, and Cesar Zuniga.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you and with that this hear... this hearing is adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 24, 2017