

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

1

2 CITY COUNCIL
3 CITY OF NEW YORK

4 ----- X

5 TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

6 Of the

7 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

8 ----- X

9 March 1, 2017
Start: 1:50 p.m.
Recess: 2:45 p.m.

10 HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

11 B E F O R E: TISH JAMES
12 Public Advocate

13 MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
14 Speaker for the Council

15 COUNCIL MEMBERS:
16 Inez D. Barron
17 Joe Borelli
18 Fernando Cabrera
19 Margaret S. Chin
20 Andrew Cohen
21 Costa G. Constantinides,
22 Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
23 Elizabeth S. Crowley
24 Laurie A. Cumbo
25 Chaim M. Deutsch
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Daniel R. Garodnick
Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson
David G. Greenfield
Barry Grodenchik
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos

2 Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
3 Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
4 Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
5 Mark Levine
Steven Matteo
6 Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
7 I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
8 Bill Perkins
Antonio Reynoso
9 Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
10 Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
11 Rafael Salamanca
Eric A. Ulrich
12 James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
13 James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams

14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Reverend Fernando Cabrera
New Life Outreach International Church
Bronx, New York

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: May we all rise for
3 the Pledge.

4 [Pledge]

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Please be seated. Roll
6 call? Quiet in the chambers.

7 CLERK: All rise for the invocation.

8 [All rise]

9 CLERK: The invocation will be delivered
10 by Reverend Fernando Cabrera, the Senior Pastor of
11 New Life Outreach International Church in the Borough
12 of the Bronx.

13 [Invocation]

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: I move to spread the
15 invocation upon the record and we want to thank
16 Reverend Cabrera for that invocation on this Ash
17 Wednesday. Adoption of minutes. Council Member Van
18 Bramer? The motion that the minutes of the Stated
19 Meeting of January 18th be adopted and printed.
20 Messages and papers from the mayor?

21 CLERK: None.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Communications from
23 city, county and borough offices?

24 CLERK: M483 Certification of Bill
25 Perkins, new council member, 9th District Manhattan.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

4

2 CLERK: Received order printed and filed.

3 [pause]

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: We now welcome the new
5 council member, Council Member Bill Perkins and his
6 family.

7 CLERK: Please raise your right hand and
8 repeat after me.

9 [Oath Administered]

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Please be seated.

11 [pause]

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Let us resume. Let us
13 resume proceedings. Again, we welcome Council Member
14 Perkins to the chambers again. Shhhh. Let us
15 continue with communication from city, county and
16 borough offices.

17 CLERK: M484, Manhattan Borough President
18 budget priorities.

19 CLERK: Received order, printed and
20 filed.

21 CLERK: M485, Queensborough President
22 budget priorities.

23 CLERK: Received order, printed and
24 filed.

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

5

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Shhh... petitions and
3 communications?

4 CLERK: None.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Quiet in the chambers,
6 please. Lane Use call-ups?

7 CLERK: None.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Quiet in the chambers
9 as we now hear from the Speaker, Melissa Mark-
10 Viverito.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madam
12 Public Advocate and good afternoon, buenas tardes to
13 all my colleagues and all the woman and all of us,
14 including the men, happy Woman's History month. If I
15 could just ask my colleagues to rise for a moment.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: All rise.

17 [All Rise]

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Before we begin,
19 I would like the chamber to join me in a moment of
20 silence for the passing of a former council
21 colleagues, Council Member Priscilla Wooten, who
22 served this council for 20 years and died two weeks
23 ago at the age of 80. We thank her for her service
24 and extend our deepest condolences to her family.

25 Thank you to my colleagues and I believe there may be

2 some here that may have served with her and so we can
3 -- I thank my colleagues for that.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Please be seated.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: As we dive into
6 today's docket, again we --

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Shhh...

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: -- want to
9 congratulate Council Member Bill Perkins. There are
10 some people in this chamber that have served with him
11 before. I did not have the pleasure to do so but we
12 extend ourselves to him. We give him another round
13 of applause.

14 [Applause]

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And Bill, I don't
16 really think the voting process has changed much
17 since you were last in this chamber so I am sure
18 you're going to pick up right where you left off.
19 So, it is great to have you here today. So the
20 Council today is going to be voting on a handful of
21 introductions and before we begin with those, I just
22 want to mention a couple of separate items. First,
23 the Council is going to be voting on two recommended
24 appointments to City Oversight Boards: one for
25 Jeffery Freeland to the New York City Conflict of

2 Interest Board and the second for Malini Cadambi
3 Daniel to the New York City Equal Employment
4 Practices Commission. Also, the Council will vote on
5 landmark designation status for six buildings
6 throughout Brooklyn, Manhattan and Staten Island.
7 These buildings include a colonial period home, a
8 Roman Catholic Church and the iconic Bergdorf Goodman
9 Building. For legislative items, the Council is
10 first going to consider introduction 1280B sponsored
11 by Council Member Chaim Deutsch which would require
12 the NYPD to make automobile collision reports
13 available online to persons named in the report. For
14 staff, I want to thank Beth Golla (SP), Dia Abercar
15 (SP), Casey Addison and Steve Rister (SP). I am
16 proud of the close work that Council Member Deutsch
17 did with the NYPD to develop this initiative and this
18 legislation, now going to become law. This will
19 improve how our residents access important
20 documentation following an accident and I would like
21 to invite Council Member Deutsch to say a few words.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you
23 Speaker. Today, we vote on Intro 1280B. My bill
24 that would [inaudible] into law access to collision
25 reports through the NYPD's online system. Until now

2 the fastest way for involved parties or their
3 representatives to obtain a copy of their report was
4 to appear in person at the police precinct where the
5 collision occurred, an inconvenient task that could
6 take days or weeks making an already stressful
7 situation even more aggravating. After I introduced
8 Intro 1280B last year, I worked closely with NYPD to
9 complete and launch the collision report retrieval
10 portal. In today's day and age of technology, this
11 online portal allows drivers to easily obtain copies
12 of their report electronically with no fee. The
13 system is secured with a two-step verification
14 process requiring specific details about the accident
15 to be input before offering access. This is to
16 ensure that only those involved in the collision can
17 obtain the report. At the same time, the program is
18 easy to navigate and extremely senior friendly.
19 Providing this online access saves time for drivers
20 and also frees up time for the NYPD officers assigned
21 to each precinct giving them time to focus on more
22 important matters including crime victims. I look
23 forward to this passage of Intro 1280B and I thank my
24 colleagues for their support on this bill. I also
25 want to thank Beth Gallop (SP), legislative counsel

2 and Depa Ambercar (SP), counsel to the Public Safety
3 Committee as well as the NYPD Deputy Commissioner of
4 Information Technology, Commissioner Tish, and the
5 NYPD Director of Legislative Affairs, Oleg Chunosky
6 (SP). Finally, I want to say thank you to my Chair
7 of Public Safety, Vanessa Gibson, and I look forward
8 to my colleagues [inaudible].

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
10 Member. Next, the Council will vote on Intro 820A
11 which would require the Department of Transportation
12 to consult with the Ney York City Housing Authority
13 on implementing a pilot incentives programs to
14 increase recycling rates in public housing. For
15 staff, I want to thank Colin Howe, Nadia Johnson and
16 John Seltzer. This legislation was sponsored by
17 Public Advocate Tish James who is going to give some
18 short remarks on the importance of this bill.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: I want to the speaker,
20 the mayor, the Chairs of Sanitation and Public
21 Housing, Council Member Reynoso and Torres, as well
22 as Council Members King, Richards and Menchaca for
23 supporting this legislation and I also want to thank
24 Committee Counsel Colin Howe (SP) for his hard work
25 negotiating this bill. I want to thank all the NYCHA

2 residents for their input in helping move this bill
3 forward. Every New Yorker, no matter where they
4 live, must have the ability to recycle or we will
5 never achieve our shared goal of a greener New York.
6 New York City law requires landlords of buildings
7 with four or more units to provide recycling service
8 to all of their residents. Unfortunately, New York
9 City Housing Authority, the city's largest landlord,
10 have historically failed to comply with the law.
11 This bill, which we are considering today, will
12 require NYCHA to take a holistic look at the
13 challenges and opportunities of expanding recycling
14 in our cities public housing including through
15 incentive programs. Recycling incentive programs
16 allows participants to earn points for their
17 recycling efforts. These points in turn can be
18 redeemed on rewards through participating retailers:
19 restaurants and other commercial establishments
20 including discounts and deals from local businesses.
21 Such incentive programs have proven successful in
22 large cities such as Philadelphia where recycling
23 rates have increased and taxpayers have saved money
24 from reduced disposal costs. Such -- there is much
25 work to be done but recycling more accessible in

2 commonplace is an important step in the right
3 direction and more importantly saving monies for
4 taxpayers is in all of our best interests. Thank
5 you, Madam Speaker.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
7 Public Advocate. Next, our first packet of
8 legislation or today deals with established a car
9 share parking pilot program. As short-term car
10 rentals grow their presence, car sharing has become
11 more prevalent in New York City. Given its potential
12 for lessening environmental impacts and road
13 congestion, the Council has taken a particular
14 interest in such services.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Shhh... Quiet in the
16 chambers, please.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Intro 873A --
18 today is a shortage on the colleagues, let's get
19 through this as quickly as possible. Thank you.
20 Intro 873A, sponsored by Council Member Mark Levine,
21 would direct the Department of Transportation to
22 conduct two-year car sharing pilot program during
23 which a limited number of on street parking spaces
24 would be reserved for car share vehicles.
25 Introduction 267A, sponsored by Council Member Rosie

2 Mendez, would require the Department of
3 Transportation to include designated parking spaces
4 in municipal parking facilities as part of the pilot
5 program. I want to thank Kelly Taylor, Gafar Zalof
6 (SP), Jonathon Masarano (SP), Emily Rooney, Chimal
7 Pachair (SP) and Brandon West. Sponsors Mark Levine,
8 Rosie Mendez will deliver some remarks on this great
9 and green project alongside Borough President Gail
10 Brewer, who initiated the request for the program,
11 and then Committee on Transportation Chair Ydanis
12 Rodriguez.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Guys, could we please
14 quite down in chambers.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Guys, come on, we
16 need some quiet in the room. Mark, if you want to
17 start.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam
19 Speaker. You know, there are 1.5 million households
20 in this city that own private cars and most of them
21 are unused most of the time. That's why it is so
22 hard to find parking in almost every neighborhood of
23 this city and we need to get an alternative, to offer
24 an alternative to people who are in neighborhoods
25 without good transit or need to take trips to places

2 without good transit so they have an alternative to
3 owning a private car and that is exactly what car
4 sharing is. It offers people a chance to save money,
5 to avoid the hassle of owning a car and there are
6 many great environmental benefits as well. It is
7 part of why this sector has taken off in the City in
8 recent years. But, for it to be more than a niche,
9 there's got to be a place to park the car share
10 vehicle. Our bill would instruct the Department of
11 Transportation to create a pilot that they would use
12 of what we estimate would be about 300 spots around
13 the city to rollout this program to neighborhoods
14 that don't currently have access. That will save New
15 Yorkers a lot of money and it will free up a lot of
16 parking for the rest of us since it is estimated that
17 every single car share vehicle leads to 11 private
18 vehicles coming off the street. So this is a
19 transportation innovation that will free-up parking
20 in the neighborhoods that most need it and why I am
21 proud to be sponsoring it together with the
22 incredible leadership of Manhattan Borough President
23 Gail Brewer and with wonderful support and leadership
24 from the Chair of Transportation Committee, Ydanis
25 Rodriguez, and I want to acknowledge the staff that

2 works so hard on this including Johnathon Massarano,
3 (SP) and Kelly Taylor from the legislative division,
4 my own Amy Slattery and I want to acknowledge former
5 council staff for Ben Smith who at DOT was a great
6 partner in this process. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
8 Council Member. Council Member Mendez?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you, Madam
10 Chair. I want to thank you for your leadership and
11 Chair Ydanis Rodriguez in helping to make this bill a
12 reality but mostly I want to thank Manhattan Borough
13 President Gail Brewer. This is a bill she introduced
14 when she was in the council with us and she trusted
15 me to guide it through the council. I think this is
16 a bill that makes a lot of sense as the sharing
17 economy is becoming more vibrant in New York City and
18 the car sharing industry is one that is becoming very
19 popular and gives people different options for
20 transportation setting aside parking spots on streets
21 or in New York City parking facilities for car shares
22 will help many individuals have another option. I
23 also want to thank the administration for agreeing
24 and participating and making this a reality. Thank
25 you very much.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. I know
3 our Borough President has played a big role in this.
4 She spoke at the pre-stated press conference and we
5 thank her for that and now Council Member Rodriguez?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
7 Speaker, for your support and leadership in this bill
8 and many other bills. In our City, we have New
9 Yorkers who live close to mass transportation, buses
10 and trains, who they don't need to have a car. At
11 the same time, we have other New Yorkers who live
12 especially in places in Queens, Bronx, Staten Island
13 and some in Brooklyn that they rely on the car and
14 they are the group who make the 1.5 million New
15 Yorkers who have cars to a total 1.8 million cars.
16 Now the question is how can we incentivize the share
17 car services, share car in our city and this is the
18 right thing to do since congestion creates a problem
19 for everyone from smog and pollution to time loss in
20 traffic to good and services facing delays to
21 frustration of drivers. That's why this pilot
22 project is so important to review the numbers of cars
23 and that's why I thank the Speaker, my colleague
24 Council Member Levine, Manhattan Borough President,

2 the whole body for being so proactive in this issue.
3 Thank you.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

5 Finally, the Council will be voting on a package of
6 legislation establishing reporting requirements on
7 reproductive health in the city. Intro 1161E, 1162A
8 and 1172A would require the Department of Health and
9 Mental Hygiene to report to the Council on
10 independent data sets regarding Human Papilloma Virus
11 immunizations, use of contraceptives methods among
12 both adults and high school students and on rates of
13 maternal mortality. The data gathered in these
14 reports will help inform council initiatives, city
15 programming and the resources that our medical
16 professionals have to draw upon when making vital
17 decisions. 80 million Americans have been diagnosed
18 with HPV and millions more report new infections each
19 year. If left unchecked, these diagnoses can lead to
20 cancer and other chronic health problems. As a
21 public health concern, it is imperative that we do
22 everything possible to address the reproductive
23 health issues affecting New Yorkers. This is
24 especially relevant as we launch the improved sexual
25 education curriculum detailed in the last month's

2 State of the City and also the continued attacks on
3 women's reproductive health. So with that I want to
4 thank Amintuc Kilawanz (SP), David Sitszer (SP),
5 Crystal Ponds, Jeanette Merrill. I want to thank
6 Elizabeth Crowley for her leadership and being such a
7 vocal advocate on this matter and would ask her to
8 say a few words.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you,
10 Speaker. First, it is important to emphasize the
11 fact that all over the country women's health and
12 reproductive rights are being attacked. Today's
13 bills on health are necessary for this city to
14 protect those rights and to better understand
15 utilization rates of women's health services which so
16 many of our local communities need better access to.
17 Women's health is family health and family health is
18 community health. Under the leadership of our
19 speaker, young women's initiative was started and
20 certainly expended services to many underserved
21 communities from vaccinations for cancer causing
22 viruses to utilizing more effective forms of birth
23 control to improving maternal health. We as a city
24 need to know better who these programs are reaching
25 and where the Department of Health and health

2 facilities in our communities are falling short.
3 When we have more comprehensive information on how
4 the city is effectively reaching these target groups
5 we can work more effectively on building a healthier
6 city. Thank you, Speaker.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
8 Council Member. Again, before I end, just to remind
9 people, we typically have a reception downstairs for
10 our new council members and returning council members
11 in this case so people can come downstairs to the Red
12 Room after our meeting today to celebrate alongside
13 and to congratulate Council Member Perkins and also
14 to celebrate, I guess it is, Council Member Roy
15 Lancman's birthday today I hear, right? You are
16 older than me. Let me just say that by a couple of -
17 - by one month exactly actually since my birthday is
18 April 1st. Older but not wiser, okay. So
19 congratulations to Rory on his birthday and with that
20 I end communication from the Speaker.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Happy Birthday Council
22 Member Lancman and congratulations Council Member
23 Perkins. Discussion of General Orders? Council
24 Member Rosenthal? No? Council Member Rose?

25 CLERK: [Inaudible].

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes. Thank you.

3 Council Member Koslowitz for a vote?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. Council
6 Member Salamanca?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: With
8 permission, I would like to vote on all couple items
9 on General Orders on the calendar. I vote aye.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank -- Council Member
11 Vacca?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: With permission, I
13 would like to vote aye on all general calendar items.
14 Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes, thank you.
16 Council Member, the birthday boy, Council Member
17 Lancman?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Thank you. With
19 permission, I would like to vote on all coupled items
20 on the general order calendar and I would vote aye.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. Okay.
22 Moving on, report or special committees?

23 CLERK: None.

24 PUBLIC AVOCATE: Reports of standing
25 committees?

2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
3 Finance, pre-considered Reso 1390 Organization
4 Funding.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Couple of General
6 Orders?

7 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
8 Health, Intro 1161A HPV vaccination rates.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Quiet in the chambers,
10 please.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
12 coupled on general order.

13 CLERK: Intro 1162A, Contraceptive
14 Methods.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
16 coupled on General Orders.

17 CLERK: Intro 1172A, maternal mortality.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
19 couple on general order.

20 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land
21 Use LU544 and Reso 1395 sidewalk cafe.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Couple in General
23 Orders.

24 CLERK: LU545 and Reso 196.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

21

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Couple to be
3 filed pursuant to letter or withdrawal.

4 CLERK: LU574 and Reso 1397 through LU583
5 and Reso 1402 on page 4, landmark designations.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Couple on general
7 order.

8 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Public
9 Safety Intro 1280B, auto collision reports.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
11 coupled on general order.

12 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Rules,
13 Privileges and Elections, pre-considered Reso 1391
14 committee changes.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
16 general order.

17 CLERK: M476 and Reso 1403 approving the
18 appointment of Jeffrey D. Freeland, Conflict of
19 Interest Board.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Couple in general
21 order.

22 CLERK: M479 and Reso 1404 approving the
23 reappointment of Malini Cadambi Daniel, Equal
24 Employment Practices Commission.

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

22

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 General Orders.

4 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
5 Sanitation and Solid Waste Management, Intro 820A
6 voluntary recycling in public housing.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
8 coupled in General Orders.

9 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
10 Transportation Intro 267A, municipal parking

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
12 coupled on General Orders.

13 CLERK: Intro 873A, car sharing program.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15 coupled on General Orders.

16 CLERK: On the general order calendar,
17 resolution appointing various person commissioner of
18 deeds.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: A couple General
20 Orders and I ask for a roll call on all items on the
21 general order calendar.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Quiet in the chambers
23 for the vote.

24 CLERK: Borelli?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all.

2 CLERK: Cabrera?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.

4 CLERK: Chin?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to
6 explain my vote?

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: It is with great
9 pleasure that I give my full support to the landmark
10 designation of the Excelsior Steam Power Company
11 Building in my district. Nestled amidst modern
12 skyscraper, the Excelsior Building at 33-33 Gold
13 Street is the oldest known purpose built commercial
14 power generation station still standing in Manhattan.
15 A constant reminder of our city's prominent role as a
16 pioneer in electrical illumination and power. This
17 building is a testament to lower Manhattan's history
18 as a hub of print houses and jewelry manufacturers as
19 one of the several properties in my district that are
20 being designated as part of the backlog initiative of
21 the Landmark's Preservation Commission. I am very
22 happy to see the Excelsior Building get the
23 recognition that it has long deserved. I encourage
24 all my colleagues to vote yes on this designation. I
25 vote aye on all. Thank you.

2 CLERK: Cohen?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

4 CLERK: Constantinides?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: With
6 congratulation to all my colleagues on the bills that
7 are getting in today, I vote aye on all.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

9 CLERK Cornegy?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.

11 CLERK: Crowley?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on all.

13 CLERK: Cumbo?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to
15 explain my vote?

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: on this women's
18 history month, at the very beginning I want to
19 congratulate Council Member Elizabeth Crowley in
20 continuing the work to push a women's agenda forward
21 in the City of New York and beyond and I also want to
22 thank and I also want to thank Council Member Chaim
23 Deutsch for his incredible work and all my colleagues
24 for passing important legislation today. I vote aye.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

2 CLERK: Deutsch?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

4 CLERK: Dromm?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all.

6 CLERK: Espinal?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye on all.

8 CLERK: Eugene?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye on all.

10 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: With
12 permission, I vote aye on all call-ups and all
13 General Orders.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

15 CLERK: Garodnick?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

17 CLERK: Gentile?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Permission to
19 explain my vote?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I applaud the
22 Council's efforts to promote car sharing programs
23 that prove beneficial to the environment to our
24 cities overburdened transportation and traffic
25 system. I do have concerns with Intro 873A in regard

2 to my neck of the woods. What is really overburdened
3 is the parking situation in my district. Residents
4 of Bay Ridge, Dyker Heights, Spencer Hurst and Bath
5 Beach all have already high car ownership that they
6 will not relinquish resulting in limited parking
7 options curbside. Intensifying the already scarce
8 resource or illegal curb-cuts and immobile dumpsters
9 which can result in residents looking for a parking
10 spot up to 30 or even 60 minutes. The car sharing
11 pilot program is certainly a noble effort, however,
12 my district's needs for regular curbside spots is
13 already greater than the need to study potential
14 spaces for car sharing organizations. So I support
15 all efforts to increasing the amounts of parking
16 spaces city-wide but will be voting no on Intro 873.
17 I vote aye on the rest. Thank you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

19 CLERK: Gibson?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: With my warmest
21 congratulations to colleagues introducing a passing
22 bills today, I vote aye on all.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

24 CLERK: Greenfield?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Pass.

2 CLERK: Grodenchik?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

4 CLERK: Johnson?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye on all.

6 CLERK: Kallos?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

8 CLERK: King?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.

10 CLERK: Koo?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

12 CLERK: Lander?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye on all.

14 CLERK: Levine?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

16 CLERK: Maisel?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

18 CLERK: Menchaca?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
20 explain my vote?

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you to
23 all my colleagues who were involved in legislation
24 today. I want to particularly lift Council Member
25 Crowley and the women's caucus on 1161A, 1162A,

2 1172A. The work that went into these bills and the
3 work that is going to happen after these bills are
4 passed today is going to have a really huge impact
5 and especially in my district where so many of these
6 issues are coming in even into the district office.
7 I also want to invite the women's caucus actually to
8 come into the district and talk about the process
9 which it took to bring these to the floor. This is
10 what happens when we have representation. This is
11 what happens when we have women representing the
12 community and I just want to say thank you publically
13 to all women on this council. When we think about
14 how we ignite folks we can go right, specifically
15 young women in the district, this is the result so I
16 am hoping we can do something very soon in the
17 district. I vote aye on all. Thank you.

18 CLERK: Mendez?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye on all.

20 CLERK: Miller?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye.

22 CLERK: Palma?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Congratulations to
24 Council Member Crowley and the woman's caucus. I
25 vote aye.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

29

2 CLERK: Perkins?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

4 UNKNOWN FEMALE: Very good.

5 CLERK: Reynoso?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye on all

7 CLERK: Richards?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Rodriguez?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

11 CLERK: Rosenthal?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: With

13 permission?

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I would like

16 to welcome our new Senator -- oh, that was funny.

17 That was like muscle memory. Senator Perkins, our

18 new City Council Member Bill Perkins who is one

19 district to the north of mine. I am really looking

20 forward to working with you and aye on all.

21 CLERK: Torres?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

23 CLERK: Treyger?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Congratulations

25 to Council Member Perkins and aye on all.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

30

2 CLERK: Ulrich?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.

4 CLERK: Vallone?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Welcome Bill and
6 aye on all.

7 CLERK: Williams?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye on all.

9 Congratulations to my colleagues. Welcome Council
10 Member Perkins. Let's start some trouble as soon as
11 we can.

12 CLERK: Greenfield?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you. I
14 vote aye on all including the General Order calendar.
15 I also welcome back Council Member Perkins. Looking
16 forward to some of the tricks from back in the day
17 that he can teach us some of the stuff that we may
18 not know in this illustrious body. I also want to
19 congratulate my budget director and district
20 director, Becky Stern, who will be moving on next
21 month and joining a public policy firm here in New
22 York City and thank her for her service. Thank you
23 very much.

24 CLERK: Matteo? Van Bramer?

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Welcome Home,
3 Council Member Perkins and I vote aye on all.

4 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito?

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Welcome back Council
7 Member Perkins, we are now more timely and more
8 efficient. All items on today's General Order
9 calendar were adopted by a vote of 47 in the
10 affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0 abstentions with
11 the exception of Intro 873A which was adopted by a
12 vote of 46 in the affirmative, 1 negative and 1
13 abstention, and that concludes. Introduction and
14 Reading of Bills.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
16 sent to committee as indicated on the agenda.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: We do not have any
18 resolutions and now to general discussion beginning
19 with Council Member Kallos. We are still in session.
20 Quiet in the chambers. Council Member Kallos?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you. That
22 is incredibly quick stated so just give me a moment
23 to pull up my comments. Today I am introducing three
24 pieces of legislation. The first requires the
25 Department of Education to release data on the number

2 of children from each neighborhood who applied to
3 attend a particular school, the number of seats
4 available at each school, how many offers of
5 admissions were made and the total enrollment in all
6 public schools. The reporting required in the
7 legislation will show the current geographic
8 diversity in New York City schools, whether there are
9 sufficient number of schools seats in each
10 neighborhood and how many children are being turned
11 away from public school systems because the City
12 lacks the capacity to allow even enough children to
13 attend schools in the neighborhoods in which they
14 live. This legislation enables us to more
15 efficiently determine where to create new seats and
16 will assist in integration efforts as we can use this
17 information to make sure we are planning
18 appropriately so we don't see some of the segregation
19 that we see in my district where we see schools that
20 are majority white across the streets from schools
21 that are majority non-white. In addition, we have
22 also introduced legislation with Council Member
23 Garodonick and Council Member Greenfield on privately
24 owned public spaces made most famous recently by a
25 gentleman named Donald Trump. There are 538 POPS

2 attached to 329 buildings throughout the city. The
3 first bill would require signage on POPS to tell
4 folks what's actually amenities they are entitled to.
5 The other bill would actually add fines much more
6 than the \$14,000 that Donald Trump paid in fines but
7 actually \$10,000 for the first offense, 20,000 for
8 each additional offense and 2500 for each month they
9 fail to deliver on their promises. I want to thank
10 David Greenfield for his leadership on our initial
11 hearing on POPS and Dan Garodnick for being a
12 longtime advocate and please consider sponsoring all
13 three bills.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member Gibson?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you Madam
16 Public Advocate. Good afternoon colleagues. I am
17 proud to join with our Chair of Small Business,
18 Council Member Cornegy, in introducing the CARS Act,
19 the Commercial and Auto Repair Stability Act, CARS
20 for short, recognizing that we must further protect
21 many of our auto repair industries. For me in
22 particular, the Bronx's Jerome Corridor is home to a
23 vibrant community of mostly immigrant owners and
24 employees who live and work in the Bronx and provide
25 a number of services in the auto related industry.

2 Over the past two years, my stake holders in my
3 district and I have been working to discuss the issue
4 and the proposed Jerome Avenue rezoning and one thing
5 has become increasingly clear. The livelihoods of
6 many of these owners and workers are in danger. Not
7 just because of potential displacement or relocation
8 but because many of them are currently not in
9 compliance with city regulations. Why? Many of
10 them were misled by landowners and leased space for
11 which their type of business was not allowed to
12 operate and since then they have expended between
13 15 and \$20,000 to bring these spaces up to code.
14 They're otherwise good actors. They use certain
15 materials and chemicals to account for a number of
16 drainage issues that they have on-site but without a
17 valid certificate of occupancy, they are denied the
18 opportunity to apply for other licenses they need.
19 Today, with the CARS Act, we will address this
20 problem head-on by requiring landowners to disclose a
21 Certificate of Occupancy as well as any liens or
22 fines on the property to perspective tenants before
23 they finalize any lease agreement. In addition, the
24 Department of Small Business Services, we are
25 directing them to create and make available education

2 and outreach materials for auto repair workers in
3 this district and in other districts throughout our
4 city. I encourage all my colleagues to look at Intro
5 1483, the CARS Act, and join aboard to sign-on to
6 this important piece of legislation.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. Council
8 Member Cabrera?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
10 much. Today I am introducing a bill with Council
11 Member Richards that will expand, that will add
12 expand polystyrene to the list of recyclable
13 materials in the city recycling program. This
14 includes cups and various takeout containers. By
15 decimating this substance as recyclable in the
16 residential waste system, we will be taking an
17 important step in preserving our environment. We will
18 appreciate your support for this bill. Thank you so
19 much.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member
21 Garodonick?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODONICK: Thank you
23 very much, Madam Public Advocate. I wanted to draw
24 my colleagues attention to Intro 1482 which I have
25 the pleasure of introducing with Chair Gibson. It is

2 the Public Oversight of Surveillance Technology Act.
3 Right off the bat, let me just say that the NYPD
4 needs to have a strong capability for surveillance.
5 We live in uncertain times and surveillance is
6 critical to their operations in keeping New Yorkers
7 safe. But surveillance technologies are too
8 frequently not only used in secret but they are
9 acquired in secret. Even in local officials like us
10 are kept in the dark about what technologies the NYPD
11 is buying and certainly how they are being used. The
12 key point is this, civilians are in charge of the
13 police force not the reverse. We need to be able to
14 understand why decisions are being made to ensure
15 public trust in our criminal justice system. So what
16 does this bill do? It would require the police
17 department to issue on their website an impact and
18 use policy for each piece of surveillance technology
19 it employs. That would include important information
20 on surveillance tools, what they are, what they can
21 do, internal rules on their use and how the police
22 department protects and shares the sensitive data
23 that it collects. The public would have a chance to
24 read the policy and make recommendations to the PD
25 before it is finalized. Why is it important? First,

2 it forces the police department to actually think
3 about privacy before they jump into a new
4 surveillance scheme. Second, it gives the public and
5 elected officials a chance to meaningfully engage
6 with the NYPD's decisions when it comes to buying and
7 using surveillance tools. We are already moving to a
8 much higher level of police community engagement in
9 New York City, engaging with the public on this level
10 is a natural next step. Third, let's face it because
11 of a new federal approach, New York City now has a
12 data security problem. This bill will require the
13 police department to detail if any outside entities,
14 including the federal government, have access to the
15 data that we ourselves are collecting. And lastly,
16 it is representative of the best thinking of 21st
17 Century policing so I want to encourage my colleagues
18 to take a look at the bill and I encourage you to
19 sign on. Thank you very much.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member King?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you Madam
22 Public Advocate. First, I want to welcome back
23 Council Member Perkins. It is a delight to see a
24 brother back in that is going to help us shake New
25 York again. Also I want to add just a reminder to

2 you all in November of 2016, we passed a three-fifths
3 clause resolution declaring March 5th as Three-Fifth
4 Clause Awareness Day. Just want to remind everyone
5 that is coming up this Sunday. A number of churches
6 around the city are having a conversation but we just
7 want to remind y'all that the big event is happening
8 this Sunday, March 5th, at the Shamburg at 3 o'clock
9 to 5 p.m. If you haven't RSVP'd, we are looking
10 forward to each and every one of you being part of
11 this great conversation on the impact of the Three-
12 Fifth Clause and the constitution from yesterday to
13 today. A number of great speakers and great panelist
14 and a number of young people performing. Till then,
15 God Bless and be well.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member
17 Williams?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAM: Thank you.
19 First, just want to recognize Women's History Month.
20 My mother happens to be a woman and so is my sister.
21 It is a very special month to celebrate all of the
22 accomplishments. Hopefully, we can do it all year
23 round and I feel very comfortable that we will be
24 pushing back on Mr. Trump because women are in the
25 lead of that resistance and that is a very exciting.

2 I too want to lend my name to admonishing the treats
3 that have gone out to our Jewish brothers and
4 sisters. Lastly, I watched most of the Trump speech.
5 I knew a lot of it would be a lot of divisive talk
6 and BS and I was at one point just shocked at his new
7 creation of voice violence of immigrant crimes. I
8 forgot what the E stands for but it was primarily
9 focused solely on crimes of illegal immigrants. Yes,
10 there is a lot of talk about how his tone has been
11 different but I can't understand for the life of me
12 why we allow this nation to focus on one particular
13 crime. When I look at the date from '04 to 2013, 313
14 people were killed, Americans were killed from
15 terrorism. 316,544 were killed by gun violence.
16 This year alone 90 something thousand Americans will
17 be shot, 33,000 will be killed, 15,000 will be
18 murdered. If we were to look at the data and the
19 stats of where our urgencies, where our resources
20 should be put, it should be dealing with the scourge
21 of gun violence. So I just want to ask those who
22 continue to pile on and focus on immigrants and their
23 families, why do you choose that when all of the data
24 shows that is probably the least thing we should be
25 worried about. I have an answer and it is because I

2 think all of us walk around whether we admit it or
3 not with some prejudice and we have to spend a lot of
4 time pushing back on that but there are times when
5 people, leaders allows those to run wild. I think
6 that is what is happening now. I think the prejudice
7 that are in some of us has found an avenue that can
8 explode against all logic and against all data and I
9 hope we regroup soon. Thank you.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. Council
11 Member Cumbo?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I also
13 want to join in welcoming our colleague, Bill
14 Perkins, to the City Council. It is nice when you
15 come in at this time because you get a party. I
16 missed my party. In 1987, Congress declared March as
17 Women's History Month to highlight the contribution
18 of women to events in history and contemporary
19 society. By the early months of 2017, the woman of
20 New York continue to make so many historic strides.
21 In January, I along with hundreds or thousands and
22 millions of women from here in New York all the way
23 to Antarctica pounded the pavement for historic
24 Women's History March to stand up for equality for
25 all groups, especially women, LGBTQ, people of color,

2 immigrants and those with disabilities. In
3 solidarity, we remind every person in every country,
4 every state, every town and every village that women
5 will never be silenced. We raised our voices to tell
6 the highest branch of government we can think for
7 ourselves, define our own reproductive rights, we
8 will push back against hateful rhetoric and will
9 continue to make our voices heard. We live in a time
10 where woman feel unprotected and powerless. While we
11 represent 51 percent of the US population, we only
12 represent 19 percent of the legislative body in
13 Washington D.C. I want to acknowledge the Democratic
14 legislators, including Minority Leader Nancy Pelosi,
15 who wore white during Mr. Trump's first joint address
16 to Congress last night in remembrance of the
17 suffragettes who wore the same color as they fought
18 for the right to vote. This month let us each use
19 our time to educate our sons and daughters of the
20 women who said who is going to stop me. I want to
21 invite everyone to join the Fourth Annual Women's
22 History Month celebration honoring women in the Labor
23 Movement on Wednesday, March 15 at 5:30 p.m. in the
24 Council Chambers. I also want, in the spirit of
25 Women's History Month, to introduce my next bill that

2 is going to be in collaboration with Council Members
3 Cumbo, Gibson and Rosenthal requiring all NYPD
4 officers to receive sensitivity training to assist
5 them in responding to victims of gender based street
6 harassment and sexual assault. Thank you.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member
8 Richards?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you,
10 Madam Public Advocate. I would like to call your
11 attention to a piece of legislation introduced today.
12 My bill, Intro 1494, is part of the Fair Share Packet
13 of legislation aimed at ensuring no neighborhood is
14 overburdened by an unfair amount of city facilities.
15 With this bill, the city must provide additional
16 information on its statement of need to include
17 proposed capital projects over the next two years
18 including property acquisitions and investments in
19 streets, bridges and tunnels. In many cases,
20 communities like southeast Queens, can be
21 overburdened by city facilities such as homeless
22 shelters and waste transfer stations. The city must
23 look at bringing in infrastructure investments
24 including transportation improvements and street-
25 scaping to alleviate potential burdens before they

2 develop. This bill is about transparency and equity
3 which is the heart of good fair share policy like I
4 think my colleagues also, Council Member Lander and
5 Miller and all the others who have a package are a
6 part of this package as well. Thank you.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member Lander?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam
9 Public Advocate. Welcome Council Member Perkins,
10 great to have you here and you know many ways the
11 work you did in your last term on the lead paint bill
12 and other progressive initiatives really help set the
13 path that this council has tried and worked hard to
14 follow. I will also add my comments to enthusiasm
15 for Women's History Month, fighting misogyny and
16 gender inequality would be important even if my mom,
17 sister and daughter were not women so I am glad we
18 are focusing on it here. I want to thank those of my
19 colleagues that have reached out on the desecration
20 of cemeteries. As some of you know, my grandparents
21 are buried, my mom's parents, in the cemetery in
22 University City, Missouri, just outside of St. Louis
23 that was desecrated and the support that the Jewish
24 community has received at both the JCC threats and
25 the cemetery desecration's is obviously extremely

2 important at this time. Thank you. And finally, I
3 just want to call people's attention to the Fair
4 Share Package that Council Member Richards just
5 mentioned which includes Intro 1484, 85, 90, 91, 92,
6 93, 94 and 95 being introduced in various
7 combinations by Council Members Greenfield, Johnson,
8 Richards, Rose, Miller, Reynoso, Levin, and myself
9 and also thank the Speaker for her support and the
10 support of the staff. There is a great policy report
11 that is now up on the council's website doing our
12 fair share, getting our fair share, reforming New
13 York City's system for achieving fairness inciting
14 municipal facilities. In the 1989 charter, the
15 charter framers sought to achieve more fairness
16 inciting all our facilities, homeless centers and
17 waste transfer stations but also firehouses and
18 police stations. We would not deny a neighborhood,
19 an elementary school or a firehouse or a police
20 station because the real estate is expensive and nor
21 should we deny fairness in all the other facilities
22 that we are citing. Unfortunately, since the '89
23 charter was adopted, we have not moved forward in
24 that direction and actually many of the things we
25 looked at are cited less fairly than they were when

2 the fair share rules were adopted. This
3 comprehensive package of legislation looks to achieve
4 more transparency and effectiveness in that system
5 and I hope members will sign off. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: And the last speaker is
7 Council Member Cornegy.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you Madam
9 Public Advocate. I just want to speak on the fact
10 that the Democratic Party has had elections and looks
11 to be moving and opening a new chapter. I want to in
12 turn congratulate its new Chairman, Tom Perez, and my
13 state and federal colleagues, Grace Ming and Michael
14 Blake. Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: I apologize, one
16 additional speaker. Council Member Miller?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam
18 Public Advocate and welcome Council Member Perkins.
19 I look forward to working with you. Over the past
20 three years, there has been a lot of conversation,
21 discussion over community fairness and equity around
22 services and how they get delivered, how and where
23 they get delivered. As it was mentioned by my
24 colleagues before me they have put forth a Fair Share
25 Package that I am looking forward to its passage

2 because over one year ago, many of our constituents
3 from throughout the city and southeast Queens as well
4 stood on City Hall and complained about equity in
5 this area. This package and this council addresses
6 those concerns. Not only are we concerned about
7 things as they mentioned, the homeless shelters, the
8 waste transfers and the drug dependency, but also
9 whether or not we are getting our fair share on the
10 good end whether in terms of public safety and parks
11 and libraries. This legislation put forth today will
12 track that, will report that and give us the tools to
13 understand whether or not we are being fair and
14 equitable throughout the city. My Resolution 1392
15 will certainly call on the state to do the same.
16 Often we have found in our communities while we do
17 our due diligence here, some of the facilities that
18 we do not know about are state run facilities so we
19 are asking that our colleagues in the state pass this
20 legislation and the governor to sign so that we bring
21 equity and fairness to all communities in the State
22 of New York. Thank you Madam Speaker for your
23 support on this and to all our colleagues looking
24 forward to this legislation getting passed. Madam
25 Public Advocate.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: I too want to
3 congratulate Chair Tom Perez, Deputy Chair Keith
4 Ellison and Vice Chair Congress Member Grace Ming as
5 well as Assembly Member Michael Blake. And to close,
6 our Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito. Woops, one more
7 speaker.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Again, thank you
9 to all -- what? Oh, Council Member Barron?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [Inaudible]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: How do you vote Council
12 Member Barron?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye on
14 all.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Again, thank you
16 to all my colleagues. This has been a really quick
17 meeting be again downstairs in the Red Room to spend
18 a couple minutes and some time with Council Member
19 Perkins. Please join us downstairs to congratulate
20 him and with that, we are adjourned.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE: The amended calendar
22 vote is all items on today's General Order calendar
23 were adopted by a vote of 48 in the affirmative, 0
24 negative, 0 abstentions with the exception of 873A

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

48

2 which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative,
3 and 1 negative and we now stand adjourned.

4 [gavel]

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 17, 2017