

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

----- X

February 14, 2017
Start: 10:30 a.m.
Recess: 12:25 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm.
16th Fl

B E F O R E: INEZ D. BARRON
Chairperson

LAURIE A. CUMBO
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: James Vacca
Fernando Cabrera
Jumaane D. Williams
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Vanessa L. Gibson
Darlene Mealy
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Karen Koslowitz
Ben Kallos

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Chris Rosa, Interim Vice Chancellor
Student Affairs
City University of New York, CUNY

Jitinder Walia, Executive Director
Early Childhood Center
Bronx Community College

Carli Fraley, Student Leader
Hostos Community College

Shavon Ford, Director
Children's Center
Hostos Community College

Cecilia Scott-Croff
Administrator and Teacher
Early Childhood Center

Olivia Parrett, Student
Borough of Manhattan Community College

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

4

[sound check, pause]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good morning.

[gavel] I apologize for my tardiness. Good morning

and welcome to this oversight hearing on children

care services at CUNY. My name is Council Member

Inez Barron and I'm the Chair of the Committee on

Higher Education. I'm joined today by the Committee

of-on Women's Issues chaired by my colleague who is

also from Brooklyn, Council Member Laurie Cumbo.

Witnesses invited to testify include representatives

from CUNY administration, Directors of CUNY Child

Care Center, children and women's advocacy groups and

organizations, student groups and organizations, CUNY

student parents and other interested parties. Before

I speak on the topic, I want to address the executive

order signed by President Donald Trump on January

27th entitled Protecting the Nation from Foreign

Terrorists Entry Into the United States. It bans

nationals of seven Muslim majority countries

including Iraq, Syria, Iran, Libya, Somalia, Sudan

and Yemen from entering the country for at last 90

days. It also imposes a 120-day suspension on the

Federal Refugee Admission Program and bans Syrian

refugees indefinitely. It also slashes the country's

refugee quote—quote for—quota for 2017 to less than
half of the level set by President Barack Obama.

What followed was chaos at airports across the
country. Visa holders and approved refugees, people
who have endured more hardships than most can
imagine—imagine not to mention 18 to 24-months of
screening by several different international and
federal agencies, had their dreams of a permanent
home smashed. Students and workers were barred from
flights to the U.S. unable to return to school or
work. Families were separated and some were held in
detention. I commend those Americans who flocked—
Americans and others who flocked to the airports in
solidarity to protect the executive order and those
lawyers who worked long hours offering free legal
services. Though the order was suspended and a
Federal Appeals panel last week unanimously rejected
the President's bid to reinstate the ban, the
executive order's long-term repercussions remain
cause for concern. This country is indeed a country
of immigrants as the original inhabitants were the
Apaches, the Algonquin, the Comanches, the Iroquois,
the Cherokee, the Sioux and others. These original
people were subjected to near annihilation through

imperialist interests and deliberate strategies of
genocide. The forced labor of enslaved Africans
built the economic base of this country. Others who
immigrated came—came seeking the freedoms and rights
that they wanted to follow—to have here. Following
the second World War the U.S. became the world's
leader in resettling refugees. Since 1975 we have
welcomed over three million refugees from all over
the world. They have embraced their new country,
they built new lives, homes and communities in towns
and cities all across the 50 states, and now we are
in the midst of a global refugee crisis. More people
are living as refugees than ever before and staying
refugees for longer. According to the United
Nation's Higher Commission for Refugees, there are
approximately 21.3 million refugees in the world. We
cannot turn the back, and what would New York be
without is immigrants. Our city's diversity is our
strength. For more than 150 years people have been
drawn to the possibilities afforded by the wide array
of opportunities here. According to the latest
census data, with more than 3.1 million immigrants
making up 37% of the city's population, New York has
a diversity index that ranks fourth highest in the

country. Around 60% of New Yorkers are immigrants or the children of immigrants, and over 700 languages are spoken across the five boroughs. CUNY also has a proud history inclusiveness from its origins in the Free Academy of the City of New York now the City College of New York founded in 1847 as New York City's first publicly financed institution of higher education. It provided male children of immigrants and the poor access to free education based on academic merit alone. This was at a time when most private schools were restricted to the children of the Protestant establishments. Although CUNY is no longer free at this point, and now admits women, for nearly 170 years the university has remained committed to providing quality higher education for the children of immigrants and the working class across the city. Per its statutory mission, the university works to responsive to the needs of the urban setting, and a vital importance as a vehicle for the upward mobility of the disadvantaged of the City of New York. Additionally, CUNY will continue to maintain and expand its commitment to academic excellence and to the provision of equal access and opportunity. Today, CUNY is the largest urban public

university in the United States providing accessible education for more than 274,000 degree-seeking students and to 276,000 adults and continuing education students at 25 institutions across the five boroughs. According to the CUNY Office of Institutional research and assessment for fall 2015 there was an estimated 52,107 foreign born undergraduates including those from seven of the countries affected by the executive order. In conclusion, refugees and immigrants are not the enemy. It is with this rhetoric of the new administration. It does not understand or want to understand the value of multi-culturalism. It validates the bigoted and racist ideologies that we and so many people before us have fought hard to tamp down, steeling ourselves and creating "the other" will be our country's downfall, and so we look to CUNY to colleges and universities, hot beds of intellectual thought and movement to respond to and educate.

Now, onto Child Care Services at CUNY. Between an increasing demand for college educated workers and the rising costs of child care, student parents struggle to balance their responsibilities

and often drop out. This not only negatively affects the student parent and their family, high drop out rates have direct and indirect economic and social affects, social effects and has resulted in billions of lost income an economic activity in New York City over the past decade. Parents should not have to choose between caring for their families and going to work with school. With parent-student-when student parents endeavor to improve the quality of life for their children. When on-campus child care services are provided, student parents have the support they need to succeed. They are more likely to remain in school, graduate in few years and earn higher grades. However, the impact of on-campus child care serves can be even greater for the child. The benefits of early education programs include the promotion of socialization, cooperation, exposure to diversity and builds a strong foundation for emotional, social, physical and mental development better preparing these children for success in school. Additionally, data show that individuals with higher education- higher levels of education are more likely to read to their children, who are more likely to attain the same if not more education. Furthermore, college

graduates are more likely to have health and retirement benefits and to be healthier than less educated peers. They are also more likely to be satisfied with their jobs, to be civically engaged and twice as likely to vote. Overall, a college education not only benefits the individual when it comes to succeeding in today's 21st Century culture-economy, but has a long-term positive impact on society as a whole. Nationally, demographics shifts in higher education have revealed a trend toward a more growing demand of child care, that is there has been a growing number of students who are more likely to need reliable child care for low-income women under the-over the age of 25. According to CUNY's 2016 Student Experience Survey, 16% of community students financially support children of which 54% support children who are under years old, and 8% of community college students utilize on-campus childcare services while 39% pay for off-campus childcare services. Among senior college students 11% support children of which 46% support children who are under the age of five. The student survey also revealed that 53% of students at CUNY University Colleges have an annual household income of \$20,000

or less, and 52% work 20 or more hours a week. Among senior college students, 37% have an annual household income of \$20,000 or less and 49% work 20 or more hours a week. The majority of CUNY student parents are in their late 20s and early 30s and are either starting or returning to college after being in the workforce and having children. Change in demographics as well as the growing unemployment rate, and an influx of returning veterans have been contributing factors to the increased number of student parents attending CUNY. Earning a college degree is crucial for New Yorkers to assure good employment prospects with better income. However, for student parents, a lack of reliable child care can be a significant obstacle to earning a college degree and entering the middle class. Prioritizing and investing in affordable quality child care is, therefore, vital to the retention and success of students parents, their dependents and even the city. Currently, most, but not all, CUNY schools offer on-campus child care, and of those that do, not every student parent can be accommodated. Additionally the ages served, types of programming, hours of operation and fee structure varies from school to school.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

12

During today's hearing, I am interested in receiving an overview of all child care services offered at CUNY this includes their structure, funding, administration and the types of programming available. I'm also interested in receiving a demography break ground of—breakdown of student parents at CUNY as well as how that data informs child care services. I also hope to learn about how schools support these student parents who are on wait lists or otherwise denied on-campus services.

Looking forward, I would like to know about the future of child care services at CUNY, specifically plans for the expansion of child care services especially at those schools that do not offer any, and supports for student parents who are in need. Finally, I want to hear from CUNY student parents, those with and without children enrolled at an on-campus child care center. We want to hear about your experience, your child's experience and the impact of having or not having reliable child care while pursuing a college degree. At this time, I'm going to ask my colleague Ms. Laurie Cumbo to make her opening remarks. Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

13

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you, Chair

Barron. I want to acknowledge we've also been joined
by Council Member Ben Kallos. Good morning. I am
Council Member Laurie Cumbo, Chair of the Committee
on Women's Issues. I'd like to thank you all for
coming today. I'd also like to thank my co-chair
Council Member Inez Barron for her steadfast work and
leadership on this issued. I'd also like to
associate myself with her opening remarks that were
very eloquent, historical, and important in nature
given the time that we're living in. And, of course,
thanks to the staffs of the committees for their work
preparing for this hearing. We are here to discuss
an issue that disproportionately impacts women in our
city. Women make up 71% of all student parents in
the country, and almost 43% of student parents are
single mothers, 89% of whom are low-income mothers in
college are also disproportionately likely to be
women of color. Nearly half of all black women
undergraduate students are raising dependent
children, one-third of Hispanic women, two-fifths of
Native American and Native Hawaiian Pacific Islander
women are student mothers. Mothers in college often
have to juggle many roles, the role of parent,

employee, caregiver, bread winner, and more. With all the demands and pressures placed on them it's no surprise that single mothers struggle to stay in school and see themselves through graduation. This contributes to difficulties in finding employment and to gender inequities in general. As compared with students who do not have dependent children, student mothers are more likely unfortunately to drop out before they have a chance to earn a certificate or a degree, and they often cite caregiving and limited financial resources as their primary reasons for leaving. The astronomical and ever-growing cost of child care doesn't help. This cost could be the difference between a student parent graduating or not. Most student parents in our city enroll in CUNY Community colleges likely because of their affordability and flexibility. Almost half of CUNY community college students have household incomes, as Chairwoman Barron stated, of less than \$20,000 per year. The majority of CUNY student parents are in their late 20s and early 30s, and are either starting or returning to college after being in the workforce and having children. This underscores the importance of having accessible and affordable on-campus child

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

15

care the CUNY institutions where so many of our
city's student parents enroll. As chair of the
Committee on Women's Issues, this is an important
topic that's very important to me as the livelihood
and the viability of families is so critical to the
success of our community. I am very committed to
improving women's lives in all sectors of the city,
and that includes removing barriers and limited
access to a college education and ultimately to
finding a career. Women already earn less than men.
We need to do more shrink the wage gap and encourage
women's ability to graduate. Being a parent should
not come at the cost of sacrificing a college
education and pursuing a career. I look forward to
learning more about what CUNY has been doing to
provide accessible and affordable child care to its
student parents in all of its schools, and discussing
how the city can do more to support student parents.
Thank you all for your time, and I'd also like to
thank the Women's Issues Committee staff, Counsel
Aminta Kilawan and Policy Analyst Joan Povolny, and I
will not return my attention back to the floor to
Council Member Chair Barron. Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

16

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, Council
Member Cumbo. I would like to acknowledge that
Council Member Cabrera was here. He does have
another meeting. He'll be returning, and
additionally, I would like to thank Ndigo Washington,
my Director of Legislation, Joy Simmons, my Chief of
Staff, and CUNY liaison Quiero De Teru (sp?) the
Committee Council, Chloe Rivera, the Commit-the
Committee's Policy Analyst and Jessica Ackerman,
Finance Analyst for the committee. Now, in
accordance with the Rules of the Council, I will
administer the affirmation of-to witnesses from the
Mayoral Administration. Do you affirm to tell the
truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in
your testimony before this committee, and to respond
honestly to all committee questions?

PANEL MEMBERS: (in unison) I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good. I think we
have before us Christopher Rosa, Interim Vice
Chancellor; Jitinder Walia, Executive Director of
Bronx Community College, and Carli Fraley, Student
from Hostos Community College. You may begin with
your testimony.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

17

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Thank you. Good morning Chair Barron. Good morning Chair Cumbo and distinguished members of the Council. Thanks so much for creating this opportunity for us to talk about one of our key strategic resources, and our opportunity to keep college affordable and accessible to students and working parents and working families, and families who are among the least resourced among our CUNY students. [coughing] Our university child care centers are a critical resource in that regard and its honor to be here to-to chat with you about that today. I'm joined by my colleague the Executive Director of Bronx Community Colleges, Early Childhood Center, Jitinder Walia. Thank you for being here and an outstanding student leader from Hostos Community College, Carli Fraley. Thank you very much for being here. As I said, my name is Chris Rosa, and I proudly serve as CUNY's Interim Vice Chancellor for Student Affairs. CUNY's master plan and it's simply part of the strategic framework, highlight our university's connectedness to key institutions in our city and state as well as to the students we serve. As a key principle and strategic approach in our efforts to promote access and success for our more

than half a million students. Emblematic of CUNY's longstanding commitment is campus based childcare programs, which capitalize on federal, state and city resources and partnerships to leverage strong family bonds to promote the success of student parents and the wellbeing of their families. Campus based childcare is essential to student parents' ability to compete. Excuse me, to complete the college education. The attrition rates of undergraduate students who support children is a growing national problem. Limited access to affordable quality childcare is a significant challenge for student parents. This is especially true for New Yorkers as our state ranks high among the least affordable states for child care. As a result, national data indicates student parents are three times as likely as traditional undergraduates to drop out of college. Access to campus based child care can make a critical difference to the success of student parents and to the wellness of their children. Childcare is a particularly critical resource for working parents especially for single and low-income parents because it enables them to work, further their education and move towards self-sufficiency. Furthermore, high

quality child care's positive impact on cognitive social and physical development of young children is well documented. We know that CUNY's 16 on-campus child care programs are making a critical difference in the lives of student parents and their families. In a 2014 CUNY survey of student parents using on-campus child care, more than 8 out of 10 student parents said that they had more time to study and over 6 out of 10 said that they were able to take additional courses, building academic momentum. CUNY's child care centers serve over 1,300 student parents and more than 1,400 children. All CUNY child care centers enroll pre-pre-school children ages 2-1/2 to 5 years of age. Seven centers offer infant-toddler programs for children ages six months to 2.5 years of age. Ten centers offer after school programs for school aged children ages 5 to 12. The centers accommodate the needs of parents with some centers opening as early as 7:00 a.m. and closing at 9:00 p.m. and some centers are open on weekends. CUNY's Board of Trustees Campus Child Care Policy gives first priority to CUNY student parents. One the need of CUNY students are met, campus child care centers are available to community residents. CUNY

child care centers promote the success of student parents by providing subsidies for low-income student parents through funding from the New York State Child Care and Development Fund administered by OCFS and contracting with the New York City Department of Education to offer UPK at eight CUNY centers. Nine campuses have been the recipients of CCAMPIS Grants, competitive federal grants that support the participation of low-income parents in post-secondary education through the provision of campus based child care. At CUNY we recognize the importance of early alert systems for keeping all students on track in pursuit of their degrees. A proven early alert method is the close working relationships that child care professionals developed with student parents. Center staff developed strong individual relationships with student parents and are among the first to know even well before their professors when their students are experiencing academic or personal problems and are uniquely positioned to help students to leverage an array of campus based and community services to foster their wellness and success. In fact, our survey found that almost 60% of student parents said that as a result of having access to on-

campus child care, they were able to use on-campus support services to a greater degree? The university's child care programs provide a broad range of developmental experiences for children all of which feature parental involvement as a key program element and a core value. These programs provide an array of services that include parenting workshops, parent-teacher conferences, early intervention and prevention services, and health and wellness referrals. Children at the centers are engaged in high quality programs. The curricula reflecting the essential elements of quality program standards by the National Association for the Education of Young Children. These programs are thoughtfully planned, challenging, engaging and culturally and linguistically responsive to the families they serve. Experienced and dedicated Early Childhood educators plan activities and experiences based upon curriculum goals and developed multi-cultural classroom settings that value diversity, leveraging it as a strength in learning. The centers also serve as key resource to many academic departments by providing a venue for student internships, field work and research. The safety and

wellness of the children we serve is the top
priority. Every campus child care center is licensed
by the New York City Department of Health and Mental
Hygiene in compliance with New York City Health Code,
which provides regulations for staff qualifications,
staff-child ratios, program safety, emergency
procedures and facilities maintenance. We're proud
to report that CUNY's child care centers have
distinguished themselves through their excellence.
Several centers have achieved national accreditation
meeting the professional standards of high quality
early care and education programs developed by the
National Association for the Education of Young
Children. CUNY remains committed to maintaining high
quality university child care programs and expanding
services to meet the needs of evening and weekend
student parents. However, levels of city, state, and
federal support remain virtually unchanged for more
than a decade. Furthermore, the New York State
Executive Budget proposed a cut of \$900,000 to campus
child care programs at CUNY's community colleges.
These trends will make it difficult for child care
centers to attract and retain top quality teachers
and to provide campus based child care to adult

learners during the times when they need it most.
We ask for the Council's continued leadership in
having the city make investments in CUNY campus child
care to enable our centers to recruit and retain
qualified and experienced Early Childhood educators
to ensure that these teachers receive ongoing
training in professional development to allow our
centers to remain open during the times when our
students most need them, and to provide our colleges
the resources for the facility's maintenance and
management to ensure that our centers are safe,
clean, and welcoming to student parents and their
kids. We thank the Council for its abiding
commitment to creating access and opportunity to
higher education for CUNY student parents and for
your support of campus child care. Thank you, and
it's my privilege to introduce my friend and
colleague Jitinder Walia.

JITINDER WALIA: Good morning esteemed
members of the Council. My name is Jitinder Walia
and just to say I'm also an immigrant that came to
this country 30 years ago. So I'm very proud to be
here. CUNY colleges strive to represent the very
best of urban education. Often CUNY colleges serve

the poorest urban counties in the United States and admits Hispanic, African-American, Asian, Caribbean, and European students of all stripes. Almost all the students have jobs, and many are single mothers and fathers who either never began college or have returned after a long hiatus. The intersection of economic obstacles and familiar obligations make CUNY child care services especially important. Funding from city organizations ensures children of our students are given the best quality of care. This ensure students perform better in the academic classes because they are not left struggling to fill in the gaps of learning that a poor quality child care center might create for their child.

Additionally, with the support of funding, child care centers are able to offer services that support student and child success simultaneously. We as child care professionals understand that counseling and advisement are an invaluable resource for all student parents. In fact, this kind of service often proves just as valuable as academic courses. Through the continued support of the child care centers, child care administrators will have the resources necessary to create a lasting impact on both CUNY

students and students' children. One community college is Bronx Community College. Bronx Community College Early Childhood Center is an educational facility committed to development of the appropriate early care and education of children of an parents provide in-providing integrative family services. We educate, advocate and provide support and expertise that empowers and enriches students, parents, children, our college community and the Early Childhood community. Our program objective is to support student parents in achieving success. We help children make the successful transition from home to school as they go to kindergarten. We help them develop social competency with peers and adults and provide opportunities for self-expression for each child through language, dramatics, art, music and play. Children develop a positive self-concept respect for others, and their ideas by being engaged learners at the center. Our strategic goals include expanding our program to meet the needs of the parent population by having an infant part of the program. Hence helping in student retention success and graduation. We empower our student parents to succeed by supporting them at the center with a

family worker, a social worker and individualize
children. We help develop world citizens by engaging
families in trips and enjoy cultural immersion.
Campus Bishakha (sic) is instrumental in supporting
low-income parents to be successful in higher
education retention and graduation. Parents are
helped in their efforts to obtain a college degree,
which is critical for the economic stability of a
family. Investing in CUNY child care is direct help
to a student parent that will not be able to attend
college without child care support. The increasing
cost of child care is making it harder for campuses
to provide services as needed. We promote active
learning by initiating and supporting professional
development conferences for all CUNY teachers, which
empowers them with excellent tools to teach. Having
access to quality and affordable campus child care is
a support service the enables our student parents to
graduate and be successful. We are very proud of the
center and the support from the college
administration that is given to us for everything,
and I think the next person to talk would be a
student who proudly is taking advantage of this. So
it's my pleasure to introduce her.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

27

CARLI FRALEY: Good morning,
representatives of the New York City Council joint
Committee on Higher Education and Women's Issues. My
name is Carli Fraley. I'm a dental hygiene major at
CUNY Hostos. According to Benjamin Franklin, an
investment in knowledge pays the best interest. This
idea is a core value in our CUNY schools where
students from all walks of life are able to find
quality affordable higher education. However,
affordable tuition is not the only challenge facing
CUNY students. Women often shoulder the brunt of
caregiving at the expense of their career either
academic or professional. Funding programs like the
CUNY child care centers gives women more options, and
a chance to move into different fields rather than
staying home. Giving women with children a route to
enter or return to the workforce benefits not only
the woman herself, but also her children and family.
Affordable child care is imperative to the success of
CUNY students, and in particular women. CUNY Hostos
is a predominantly Hispanic Latino institution, but
it's also home to many other nationalities and
cultures. While in many ways I do not represent the
great diversity at Hostos, I am proud to count myself

among them. As an individual I have enjoyed many
privileges. I was born a child of white upper
middle-class parents, attended a top high school and
attained my bachelor's degree, and yet despite these
advantages, as a woman after having my second child I
was unable to find a job in my field that would cover
the costs of child care for my two sons. My choices
were to stay home and wait to return to work once my
children were older or return to school and get the
skills that would land me a better paying job.

Hostos Community College Children's Center made it
possible for me to return to school. I have the
great honor of sharing my classes with other parents
whose challenges outweigh mine many fold. For many
English is not their first language. They might be
parenting without a partner or have left family
support behind in other countries to pursue better
opportunities. Yet, affordable child care is helping
all of us achieve our goals and make a better life
for our families. At Hostos Children's Center I know
that my two sons are safe and well cared for. They
receive not only hands-on educational experiences,
but also nutritious meals and snacks. As a student,
the child care facility cares for my children while

I'm in class and while I study, allowing me the best chance of success academically and the ability to attain my degree without delay. I cannot express enough how important this on-campus care is. For many students including myself, school would not be possible without it. Reducing funding to CUNY Child Care would be devastating to parents like me who depend on CUNY's child care centers for their academic success and also devastating to the young students, our children who get to enjoy a wonderful educational experience while their parents do as well. In addition, an increase in funding would allow for CUNY Child Care Centers to expand their hours to evenings and weekends and further accommodate working parents. Benjamin Franklin also said, The only thing more expensive than education is ignorance. Please continue and increase funding for the CUNY Child Care Centers. Investing in women's and families' academic success will lead to stronger children and a stronger New York. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I want to thank the panel for your testimony, and I've got questions. I'd want to acknowledge we've been joined by Council Member Elizabeth Crowley who is here. [background

comments] Okay, we'll get to those as well.

[background comments] Just technicalities. Were you
here when I offered the oath and asked people to give
their agreement?

CARLI FRALEY: I wasn't. I-I, in fact, I
was-I was? Yes, I was. [laughs]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. [background
comments]

CARLI FRALEY: Oh, no, before?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

CARLI FRALEY: Right before said that.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So that we don't
have any confusion--

CARLI FRALEY: [interposing] Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --would you just
raise your hand? Do you affirm to tell the truth,
the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your
testimony before this committee, and answer questions
honestly?

CARLI FRALEY: I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. How does
a college campus go about determining if they will
have a child care center? Who makes that
determination? Is there a survey done? Because I

understand that not all campuses have the child care center. So who determines whether or not there will be a center established? Do you do a survey? Do you find out how many students need the services?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You need a budget manner.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: That's a good question. It's—it's determined by the college's senior leadership. Typically a college president relies on the Vice President for Student Affairs who—who has a rich sense of student needs. Sometimes it's done methodically through—through surveys. Lots of times it's just by relying on Student Affairs staff who are closely in touch with students and understanding their needs, and on the basis of that, most of our campuses have determined that it's a critical need for—for their student communities.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So for those campuses that don't have a child care center, how many of them don't have it, and are you saying that they don't have a need?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: No, there are three campuses that don't. Right now, the—the CUNY School

of Law I found that—that their need was not substantial enough in order to warrant the investment in—in its own standing center given its proximity to La Guardia Community College that has an outstanding child care center and had availability, and so they contract. They have an MOU with La Guardia to serve CUNY School of Law parents. Queensborough Community College had an arrangement with a Head Start center, which had lost its funding and since then Queensborough has made arrangements to place those parents and others in other Head Start centers in the community. So they're able to address their needs close by through Head-Head Start Centers in the community, and City College has right now is in the process of completing renovations to its child care center. As you know, Council Member, through an investment by the City Council, they were able to begin these renovations in June of 2015, and it's our understanding from the Administration that my office is to receive a proposing to—in hopes of reopening that center in September of 2018.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So then let me shift. I have other questions generically, but

since we're talking about City College, so what's the anticipated opening date?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: In the--the fall of 2018.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Fall of 2018, and what will be the capacity at that time, and how does that new capacity compare to what it had been previously?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: I--I believe that it's-- I'm sorry. Well, thank you. I'm sorry. I'm looking to my colleagues who are a little--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] That's fine.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: --right--right here. It's the same. It's 45 students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, your--I believe that your report says that it would be 60. Your Capital Year Plan says it will be 60. So, is that--is it 45 or is it 60?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: It's my understanding that it's 45, but I--I can check on--on the parent discrepancy in those.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, because we certainly want--wouldn't want to have fewer than what we had projected it would be. Okay.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And those parents that had--the students that had their children there, what became of those students--what became of those children?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Sure. They were--they were given the opportunity--they were given vouchers and the opportunity to enroll at other CUNY child care centers that had capacity, and a significant number of those students, for example, were served by the--the child care center at Lehman College.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So some of them from City College took their children to Lehman College?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: That's correct.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So do we have a tracking? Do we know what happened to all of those students? Were we able to chat with children there?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: They--we--all of them we know were successfully serviced.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what all?

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

35

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: By-by Lehman, and we also have heard that in the—in the interim that—that as of now, it seems as though there are still a handful of students that continue to be served by the Lehman College Center.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you. So back to my general question, and I want to acknowledge we've been joined Council Member Darlene Mealy, and Public Advocate Letitia James. We're glad to have you both here.

MALE SPEAKER: And me. Hello. It's me.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, talking about needing a doctor. (sic) [laughter] I'm sorry. I didn't look to my right. Thank you. [background comments] Thank you. We know that not all students are able to be accommodated with the child care services. So what percentage of—how do students apply? Do students know? How are they informed? What's the outreach that's done and is there a wait list, how are students moved from that wait list? Are there other sources that are made available to them?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Sure. I'll begin with the outreach. We have—our—our child care resources

prominently posted on a university website campus
child care directors are prominent presenters at new
student orientations, and our child care directors
spend a lot of time presenting and doing outreach to
the community to let community members understand
that for students who are interested in higher
education at CUNY that campus child care may be an
option. Our--our Office of Admission Services also
has our child care program materials. So that when
they do--when they participate in recruitment fairs
it's part of what they distribute as part of their
tabling. In terms of the wait list, I'll--I'll in a
moment I'll defer to my colleague Jitinder who is on
a campus and--and manages those issues, but it--in
referring to that survey that we did of--of student
parents, we found that of those--of the student
parents surveyed 78% have no wait to receive child
care services and of the 22% who did, 42% waited less
than a semester. 32% waited a semester and only 25%
had to wait more than a semester in order to gain
access to child care services. The other thing that
we found is that it was--it was uneven, and I'll ask
my colleague Jitinder to drill down a little further,
but the--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [off mic]

[interposing] But do you sit--

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Sorry.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --for you using that.

(sic) [on mic] So, the wait list was--was exhausted
and anybody that was on a wait list got services
within a semester?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: That--that was the
experiences of--of the students who were surveyed
that--and I was just about to explain that. The--the
wait list issues seem to be clustered at--at certain
campuses. In particular Queensborough Community
College has--has a significant wait list, and the CUNY
Graduate Center and the wait lists are not generic
wait lists. They're--they're program specific, and
could you collaborate a little bit on that?

JITINDER WALIA: So since each program
has individual needs, so for example with the fact
that right now I am trying at Bronx Community College
to start the infant-toddler program. We currently
have 18 parents who are on the list. I would love to
attend the program provided I have the 18 slots where
I could start the program. So that is the waiting
list, but I don't have the program because I don't

1 have the funding. I have the room. It's ready to be
2 opened, but I don't have the resources to start that
3 program. When it comes to waiting lists when they
4 register, we send out an email to all the freshmen
5 students through the Admissions Department, and yes
6 there are times when they start on the first day. We
7 will have four or five students who need child care
8 because the slots get all filled up very fast, but
9 most of the time in a couple of weeks some students
10 drop out. We are able to accommodate. Does it
11 happen some semesters that we are not able to
12 accommodate a few students? Yes, and it usually
13 happens in the younger age group, which is the two-
14 year old classroom because the need is very high, and
15 it is very expensive to find child care especially
16 where we are in the Bronx for that age group because
17 usually you can find early Early Learn for the 3s.
18 You can find UPK for the 4s, but 2s is a very, very
19 hard pressed age group. Their parents need
20 childcare. So yes and at this point I can only tell
21 you about my center. I have about six student
22 parents who are waiting to get a slot in the 2s, and-
23 and right now, we are not able to accommodate them.
24 [coughing] But most likely, when those two move to
25

the 3s next semester, we'll be able to take that in.
So it's usually for us. I can't, you know, talk
about all the 16 campuses, but for us it's usually
all for a semester, and we try to help them and
engage them by letting them know of other resources
where they can go to find child care.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And—and you spoke
about you have the funds, you have the resources, you
have the room. What does it cost? What's the
average cost to operate a child care center? What's
the average number of students, of children who are
at a child care center, and what does it cost to
operate a child care center, and who bears that cost?
Where does it come from? I saw in your—in your
testimony you talked about CCAMPIS grants through the
federal government. You talked about the Office of
Children and Family Services and the State. So how
does that money tie in? What does it cost? Is there
an average number of students at a particular child
care center, or is there a range? [background
comments] What's the ratio of staffing for the
children?

JITINDER WALIA: I'm—I'm an Early
Childhood Specialist.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh.

JITINDER WALIA: So I'm not very good with numbers, but I-I can say that it costs a lot of money to run a child care center, and this is coming from somebody who comes from the private industry. Before I took a job at CUNY, I owned and operated six private day care centers, which I started from scratch. It's-it's very expensive. I mean on an average, parents pay \$1,500 to \$1,700 in child care. So how am I able to or how are we able to survive when we need this much money to provide quality child care is by apply for grants. So by applying for CCAMPIS, having Universal Pre-K. Bronx Community College was very lucky to get the Early Learn grant. As these grants finish or end, and you if you're not able to get any more, we address of not being able to have all the resources. Yes, we are? That's why we are continuously looking for more money. So that we can provide quality child care. There's one thing to have a center. You can be open and just do babysitting. Family day cares do that, too, but if you come to our programs, you will see the quality, the high quality that we offer, and that is related to having a lot of money. Now, when it comes to

numbers, I'll have to go back to and get back to you
on exactly how much because I just keep on applying
for every dollar that's out there so that we can
provide more and more for our student parents. And
I'll give you an example. We've asked—we've applied
for a grant through CUNY Central, and got \$160,000
with which we were able to hire a social worker and a
full-time family worker and you might say, oh, why is
a social worker and family worker? Because every
student that comes to the Bronx Community College has
such serious emotional needs, and I can tell you by
our own internal data that we were able to save seven
student parents last semester from dropping out
because their emotional need was they were in crisis.
So we were able to have the social worker work with
them one-on-one. Family workers worked one-on-one.
What is it that you're struggling in? Math 50-105,
let's hook up with this—

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Okay.

JITINDER WALIA: --first then. So that's
what we try to do as individual child care directors—
—

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Okay.

JITINDER WALIA: --in all the programs.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

42

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you. I
would like to get the dollar amount for operating
each of the child care centers--

JITINDER WALIA: [interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --at the campuses
where they are, and--

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: [interposing] We can
for sure, and--and more specifically I think we can
get you what our spend is per available slot per
program, which I think would probably be a little bit
more than what our current spend is.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: But it'--you know, I
think our colleagues would tell you that it's--it's
not sufficient to meet their current needs.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] I'm
sure, yes.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: --and about it--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] And--

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: I'm--I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Go ahead.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: It--it has to do I
think with more resources it would expand the access
in terms of the amount of hours for example that

where—where child care could be—could be—centers
would be available, and our ability to be more
competitive to retain quality teachers and—and child
development staff.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. One last
question before I go to my colleagues. Is there a
standard staffing ratio at each of the schools? Does
every center--child care center have the same
positions listed? Because I heard you say you were
glad to get our social worker. So, I would like to
if you don't have it, I would like to know is there a
template that every center has in terms of a
director, assistant, the number of teachers, the
ratio that exists in each of the child care centers?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Right, there—there is
not—there is not that kind of parity presently across
campuses, and a lot of it has to do with how—how well
a—a particular center does in securing extramural
funding from—from different sources. But there are—
there are benchmarks, and there are quality standards
to which we aspire, and we can share those to you.
Those are—those are quite frankly our aspirational
goals. As we—as we look to invest going forward,
it's all trending towards those—that—that standard

array of--of resources in child--in child care centers
on our campuses.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. I do
have more questions as does my co-chair, but she has
agreed that she would defer and we would allow the
Public Advocate to at this time pose whatever
questions she has.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: So I'm still
trying to understand the--this disparity from one
campus to the next. Your--your vey explanation as to
why there is more of a need and--at one college as
opposed to the other?

JITINDER WALIA: Need in terms of--?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Child care.

JITINDER WALIA: I guess they are. I
mean I know community colleges have a higher need. I
mean we are in--in the Bronx. So, the last eight
years I've been there I've--I've never had to have an
issues with trying to recruit students because my
students are always looking for child car, and I'm
not sure. But as was indicated there's a greater
need in Kings--in Queens did you say?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: At-at Kings Borough,
and I think it has to do with the wait list for the
particular programs that they offer.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: So because of the
particular programs that's why there's a greater need
for child care?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: No, it's-it-it has to
do with the demand for-for a particular type-a
particular type of Early Childhood program.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I see.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Three are a limited
number of slots, and there's more demand for that
particular type of program.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And as far as you
know, and I don't know whether or not either of you
can speak to this issue. Perhaps individuals and the
executive of CUNY can speak to. It's my
understanding that there's been a cut in-in the
Governor's Executive Budget with respect to child
care.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: That's correct.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And what is that
amount?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: It's 9--\$900,000.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

46

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: So, \$900,000 was
cut by the Governor in his Proposed Executive Budget,
and the amount of money in the city budget has
remains stagnant since 1980. In New York City we've
only receive \$500,000 and it hasn't changed since
1980, and if you add inflation, that number should be
about maybe \$1.5 or \$2 million to meet the needs of
the entire university. Is that fair?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: That's correct.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Is that fair to
say?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Yes. Stacey?

[laughter] Yes, is that fair to say?

STACEY: More money.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: More money.
[laughter] More money.

JOHN KOTOWSKI: [off mic] \$500,000 is
equivalent to \$1 million right now and we have
suffered many cuts. (sic)

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] If we
want to get this on our—

JOHN KOTOWSKI: [interposing] Okay.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --onto the record,
please.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

47

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: So my comment--so
my--so could you just respond to the point that the
amount that the amount of money that the city
provides has been stagnant since 1980?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Just--

JOHN KOTOWSKI: [interposing] John.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --a formality. Do
you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and
nothing but the truth in your testimony before this
committee?

JOHN KOTOWSKI: Yes, I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Would you please
identify yourself. [coughing]

JOHN KOTOWSKI: John Kotowski, City
Relations Director for the University.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Mr. Kotowski, so
is it true that the amount of the money has been
stagnant since 1980?

JOHN KOTOWSKI: Correct.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And if you add--if
you take into consideration inflation, what would
that money--what would they--that amount be right now?

JOHN KOTOWSKI: I think the Public Advocate is correct, about \$1.5 million, but that's nowhere near what we would need for child care.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: What are your needs?

JOHN KOTOWSKI: Right now, we get \$7.9 million to do the whole university.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Uh-huh.

JOHN KOTOWSKI: Some as was testify—as was mentioned here in your testimony, many of the programs are looking for expansion. They have the space.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Wait, can I just state. You said you get \$7.9 million.

JOHN KOTOWSKI: Total.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Total from state and city?

JOHN KOTOWSKI: And feds.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And feds and only \$500,000 from the city, correct?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: We get \$2.1 million in federal funding, \$3.1 million in State funding, half a million from the city, and the campus contribution is roughly \$750,000.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Which totals
\$7.9, correct?

JOHN KOTOWSKI: That's correct.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And so given your
needs what that--what should the contribution of the
city be?

JOHN KOTOWSKI: Well, we would have to
come back to you with the number, and that's not
something that we can do off hand. For instance,
Hostos Community College, if you asked, how--how much
money would it you to--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
Could you give me a ballpark number? You're before
the City Council. You're engaging in negotiations
with the budget. We need a number?

JOHN KOTOWSKI: I would think that we
would have to almost double the \$7 million totally to
put child care on every campus, expand, and offer the
kind of programs. So I think Vice Chancellor Rosa
was saying to you before is there are certain
colleges offer certain programs for certain needs
groups, and that is where there becomes waiting lists
because people want to get their kids into those
particular programs.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Got it so you—you
would like to receive about \$14 million, but that's
from the three branches and the three levels of
government?

JOHN KOTOWSKI: Right. Right now, we--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] But
from the city how much would you like to see?

JOHN KOTOWSKI: Well, right now the city
is contributing \$500,000 since 1980.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Correct.

JOHN KOTOWSKI: I mean if we got \$1.5
million we'd be thrilled.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay.

JOHN KOTOWSKI: But that has not changed
in--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Is \$1.5 inclusive
of the \$500,000 or is that an additional \$1.5?

JOHN KOTOWSKI: An additional \$1.5 would
be more helpful.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: To bring your to
\$2 million?

JOHN KOTOWSKI: Right.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: So, you're asking
City Council, the members of the City Council the

chairs who are here. We're very powerful, powerful women, and one powerful man who just walked in, you're asking them for \$2 million, correct?

JOHN KOTOWSKI: We were going to put a proposal together and we were going to negotiate with the chairs on the number.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: So you were going to--you're going to--

JOHN KOTOWSKI: We are going to.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: --so the proposal will be before--be before the members of the City Council I would imagine by the end of next week after?

JOHN KOTOWSKI: Well, after the hearing took place today one of the conditions that we spoke about is that we had to ask for something, and we're going to propose to the chairs a--a number, and we would negotiate that with them. \$2 million is a fair number.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Let me play devil's advocate. What if a member of the City Council said well, since some schools only provide certain programs, why shouldn't we just give the

money directly to that particular campus, that
particular college--

JOHN KOTOWSKI: [interposing] Well--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: --as opposed to
the entire system.

JOHN KOTOWSKI: Well, I mean you could do
that, but I think that the, you know, overall there
are certain--you'd have at least 24 proposals, and
likely produce from my experience with the City
Council 24 proposals before the City Council. Not a
lot of them we're going to get funded--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] Go
it. Who oversees--

JOHN KOTOWSKI: --but that is--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Got it. Sorry,
finish your thought.

JOHN KOTOWSKI: No, that's it.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Who oversees all
of these CUNY child care services?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: It's our University
Director of Child Care and Leadership Programs.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Is that person
here today?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: She is.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Who is that? Oh, there she goes. Okay. So she's responsible for all child care services, and okay--[background comments]-- Okay, I-I could understand that, and do-have you-do you track the numbers of parents who dropped out of school because of their lack of child care? Do you track them?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Right.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Is there anyone that does--has CUNY done a study?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: I don't think so.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay. Okay, thank you, Madam Chairs, and obviously if there's a proposal that you submit, I would hope that you would provide a courtesy copy to the Office of Public Advocate. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Most certainly we will. We want to acknowledge we've been joined by Council Member Jumaane Williams, and at this time I'm going to ask my co-chair if she has questions.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Thank you. As I'm hearing the testimony from you as well as the questions from our colleagues, why since 1980 has there been no real concerted effort or coordinated

push in order to gain more support in funding and
services to this child care development program?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Well, I—I think
there's been a consistent effort by student parents
who are powerful ad-advocates to raise their voices
particularly in this state to talk about the need for
greater investment in university child care, but we
understand that in a lot of our areas that there are
a lot of competing priorities. This is an urgent
priority, and—and, you know, we feel very strongly
that this would be an important investment to expand
access particularly for poor and working parents to
have access for higher education.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: And I understand that
there are a lot of programs and there are a lot of
priorities. The concern is that because this is
predominately an issue that impacts predominately
women of color, that this issue hasn't risen to the
level of urgency as far as since 1980, we're talking
a very long period of time that we haven't seen that
increase, and so my concern really is that this issue
hasn't been brought to the forefront in way that that
would require the amount of funding that is needed to
do that. This the first time I, you know, and being

on the Higher Education Committee, this the first time that I've heard these numbers broken down in this way and this is the first time that I've heard that there had not been an increase, and that there had been no real demand or any real push on your part in order to secure that level of funding that's so necessary because this is something that impacts the vast majority of your student population. So my question is I know the waitlist question was asked. Wanted to know are there particularly like referrals that are given or vouchers that are given to parents that you're not able to accommodate through the child care program that you have. Are they given a voucher to go some place else once their waitlisted or do they just have to find services in some other way?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: They're—they are not typically vouchered. I—the—all of our child care center directors are—are deeply woven into the—the city's child care community, and they try to help them to make appropriate referrals. Can you talk about your experience with that?

JITINDER WALIA: Yeah, we—we make sure that we give them the numbers or even sometimes personally we call the program because especially in

the Bronx, most of my student parents are eligible for Early Learn or some sort of program. So we give them that information so they are able to enroll in those programs. The--the issue is that they'd rather be having the child on campus while they're in school and--and they see the quality of child care that we're giving. So sometimes for us it's not that they're not able to find a Head Start in the local Bronx area, but it's the quality of child care that we give is what they really want. That's why they want to be there--over there, but we hold their hands and take them through the process so that they can find child care, but sometimes, you know, they're not happy with those options.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: What about you're a parent, and you're going to school part-time. You go to work in the day. You go to school at night, you're going back and forth. Are you only providing child care for the time frame that the parent is in school or can you drop your child off at the beginning of the day and pick them up in the evening even though you're going to work, you're going to school, you're handling other issues back and forth

to school. Can a parent have their child all day in
your centers?

JITINDER WALIA: Okay. So this is like
several layers since every campus runs individually
based on what their need is. At Bronx Community
College we cater to the priority which is the time in
school, and we do this. We have flexible scheduling.
So while they're in class that's when we provide
child care. This way we're able to accommodate as
many students while they're in school. That's the
top priority. So at this point today, as of today,
we're serving 125 students in the building because we
cater to their school schedule. Beyond that, if they
have work, again since each campus is different we
have a program with Early Learn. So 20 of those
parents are able to stay in the center all day
because that's subsidized through that. Next step we
have Universal Pre-K. So 15 f those students are
able to stay for six hours in spite of their
schedule. So it's—it's kind a mixed—kind of modality
to try to meet as much as their needs as possible,
but again that's because that's the need of Bronx and
early college, and that's what we have. But, each
campus is different. There—I believe there are

campuses that provide child care all day regardless of whatever, you know, their schedule is, but Bronx Community College is not one of them. Our priority is--is school and then be in class while they're getting child care.

CARLI FRALEY: May I speak to Hostos--

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Yes.

CARLI FRALEY: --my experience. Mr. Ford here has been working really diligently on expanding the availability for students in--in my position.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Who is Mr. Ford?

CARLI FRALEY: Mr. Ford. This is Shavon Ford. She's the Director of the Hostos Community College Children's Center.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

CARLI FRALEY: And my children have been enrolled since last spring just about when Mr. Ford joined their team, and since then I have seen a vast expansion in the availability of child care that's been provided to us. I am allowed to leave my children there during my classes. I am allowed to apply and block out study time for myself, which in and of itself is tremendously helpful in terms of

making sure I can succeed academically and just recently we had a meeting, and he explained that they will now be accommodating people's work schedules as well. So as long as you commit to the amount of time and the fees that are associated with the amount of time they--and that they have the space, it would cover both in-classroom time, study time and work time.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: So I guess getting back into that particular point, and I'm sure Council Member Barron will raise it as well, you spoke about fees. Is there a fee across the board for parents to have to pay for services at the--and you can answer that in terms of did you have to pay fees for--for day care services?

CARLI FRALEY: It does vary per child. My oldest child was eligible for the P--the UPK program. So the fees associated that--with that are only that are beyond the hours that they are out--they're outside the hours that are UPK hours. So those are--the UPK hours are covered. So there's a rate for the extra hours, and then the--the rate for my two-year-old is just a flat day rate if it's over

eight hours. It's one rate and if it's under six,
it's--it's less, but both are--

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: [interposing] Is that
a sliding scale?

CARLI FRALEY: It's a sliding scale, yes,
and I would say that both are reasonable--very
reasonable. I mean part of the reason I ended up at
Hostos was because they had child care available and
the fees were affordable. I mean--

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Okay. Let me just
ask this because I want to turn it over to my
colleagues because I know that they also have other
committee hearings, but I guess the challenge, and
I'm hearing from you is--is more that you seem to
focus on more of the needs of the college and it
seems to be in terms of what are the needs of the
college in terms of the day care services that are
provided there. But it would seem that it's more the
needs of the family and the parents and the children
which is going to--which is going to vary vastly
across all of the different institutions. And you
can take classes at different institutions. So, I
can't imagine, you know, that maybe at Hostos they
have one kind of family structure and then at Medgar

Evers they have a different kind of family structure. It would seem that you would need some universality across the board in order to consistently serve your student body. My other question is for the day care service. What about night time services? Are there night time services for those parents that are working all throughout the day, and then they need services in the evening for day care services as well on the weekends where parents also have that opportunity, which would seem ideal for a working parent to take evening as well as weekend courses.

JITINDER WALIA: Again, this would vary from one campus to the other. We were last semester able to expand our services due to a grant that we applied for, and now we are open on Saturdays for-for our student parents, and we do have an evening program for our school aged parents, and they're open for them 'til 9:45 at night. Would it-would it be ideal to be open for the pre-school children 'til quarter to 10:00 also? Yes, but currently, I do not have the financial resources to be able to accommodate that. So a lot of this is also related to the resources we have and to be able to do that. So if I had the money ideally, would we want to have

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

62

the evening program for pre-school. Yes. The answer
to that is yes.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: So I just have one
final question. Can you give me a breakdown in terms
of the entire campus structure how many of the--how
many of the institutions, how many of them actually
have day care services provided? How many of them
have them on the weekends? How many of them have
them in the evening hours? What is the--what is the
portfolio in terms of what the structure looks like?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: We'd have to get you
that information. We--we absolutely can get you that
information. Thank you. I don't have it in front of
me at this time.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Okay because that is
what we ultimately wanted to discuss and gain
information through the process of this hearing? So,
if you could either--

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: [interposing] Sure.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: --call--

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: [interposing]

Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: --or to get that
information today because we desperately want to know

that information. Thank you and I'll turn it back to
Co-Chair Barron.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Before I
go to Council Member Crowley, Public Advocate in her
questions asked who had oversight, and you indicated
that you have a Director of Child Care Services and
that she's here.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: That's correct.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Are there any—is
there a reason why she's not a part of the panel to
be able to—to help address some of the questions that
are being asked?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: She's available as a
resource. I'm please to ask her.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So do we—is—
does she have any of the answers to the questions
that have been posed here today that she could share?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Not—not on hand, no.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, alright.
Thank you. Council Member Crowley and she'll be
followed by Council Member Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Good morning. I
want to thank both the chairs for having this
important hearing. I'm a little disappointed, too,

that we don't know which schools are lacking centers,
and I'm committed to advocating in this budget that
you receive more resources. So it is important that
we know just how much is needed. I'm curious to know
if--when so much of the bulk of the funding you
receive is federal or state, do they require
information such as income of the participants? Did
you have to transfer information about all the people
who benefit from your program to any government
source to show the need?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: We--we do particularly
for the federal program. A large portion of the
federal funding is for our CCAMPIS grants, which is
specifically designed to serve student parents from
low-income families who are underrepresented in
higher education, and it's a--it's a means of making
sure that there's greater representation of low-
income parents working. So, we have to document
eligibility to participate and be served through
these programs. So yes, we have to.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: So the potential
of getting an even greater amount from the federal
government is possible there if you continue to show

more and more families who fall into the category of
need.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Sure, and—and we're
competitive for those grants.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: So—so for us as
a city, our collar could be stretched that much
further because what we invest could be matched by
the city—by the federal government.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: That's correct, and
you should know that our—our—we—we have no absence of
eligible student parents on—on any of our campuses.
It's a competitive process, and actually Jitinder,
you might speak to your—your experience competing for
those grants.

JITINDER WALIA: You know, I did apply
for the CCAMPIS grant and I scored I think 99 points.
I missed by one point. So there are about five
campuses that do get the CCAMPIS grants. So we're
pretty much competing, you know, throughout the
United States for—for people to get that grant. I'm
hoping that when it opens up that I can apply again.
So somehow I can meet the need of my infant, toddler
or, you know, resources that I need, but it's very,
very competitive. So it's not because we're not

trying, it's that we all apply and some of us get it
and some of us don't.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: And actually the-the-
the child care center directors who are
extraordinarily experienced are a great source of
support and technical assistance to each other in-in
developing these-these proposals for the competition.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: So the schools
only receive funding if they a child center at the
location? There's no program where you could
reimburse a parent if they qualify for child care
expenses. [background comments] Back when I went to
college in the '90s, I actually was a mother and I
had two kids, and I was able to participate in
something that FIT, which was a community college as
well, and they helped pay for the cost of my child
care. Like they reimbursed like \$4.00 an hour. So I
just had to show my bills, and they-that was very
helpful and helped afford the-the ability to continue
to go to school. So I imagine that some schools may
have that. Do you know if FIT has still that
program--

JITINDER WALIA: [interposing] [off mic]
FIT is where?

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

67

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: --for the
community. It's a state university but it's part of
the community college system.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: I don't know.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Yeah. Do you
know what the state universities offer?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Do we have any sense?
[background comments, pause] I-I-I don't know. I
mean we could--we could certainly get that information
to you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Okay, I-I think
it's important that we at least help the parent if we
can give them the child care at the center, at the
school. If-if we could help them at least by paying
for their cost of their child care, too. So I would
be interested in expanding it so much so because it
takes years I imagine to you--for you to set up a--a
child care center, and all that time we have parents
who are probably not able to go to college because
they can't afford to pay for child care. So we could
make sure that that we have a system in place where
we could also reimburse if they find that private
child care. Okay, I have no further questions.
Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

68

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Than you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Just
before Council Member Mealy poses a question, you
said you didn't get the CCAMPIS grant because you
missed by one point?

JITINDER WALIA: Yeah, they have a rubric
by which they evaluate the--the--the grant--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] Okay.

JITINDER WALIA: --proposal itself, and
so I missed it by one point.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay so each of the
individual campuses--

JITINDER WALIA: [interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --in the system---

JITINDER WALIA: [interposing] Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --sends the
individual.

JITINDER WALIA: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Would it be perhaps
an opportunity for a system wide, CUNY wide grant to
be submitted to--

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: I don't--I don't think--

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

69

DONOVAN BARRINGTON: I'm sure that you
could have gotten that 100, but maybe somebody at
CUNY center have helped get that extra one point.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: I don't—I don't think
that—first of all, I don't think that they allow
system applications. There are—there are
applications by campuses, and the fact that the cut-
off score for successful proposals was a 100—

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: --shows you just how
fierce the competition is nationally for those
resources.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Thank you.
Council Member Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Wow, one thing I
do want to say child care should be on every campus,
and that brings me to the point I was asking in
regards to Queensborough's students is the only ones
who have a Head Start program.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: They—they had a Head
Start program, but they discontinued the funding for
that program, and as a result, they accommodated
those students at other Head Start programs in the
community.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

70

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So that means you
have a database that you can refer students where to
go?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: The college did use an
existing database.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But wasn't the
Queensborough Head Start Program the longest one with
really women in the college?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: I'm—I'm not clear. I—
I don't—I'm not sure that that's the case.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: The longest
waiting list?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: No, Kingsborough.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Kingsborough. Oh.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Sorry.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Kingsborough. So
Kingsborough still have the Head Start?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: I—I'm not—

JITINDER WALIA: Kingsborough doesn't
have a Head Start. You're about Head Start?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: That's correct. Yes,
ma'am.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Okay, then because
to me if every college have Head Start programs and

the waiting list was so long that mean the program is
working.

JITINDER WALIA: I'm sorry. Every
college does not have a Head Start.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: We know that.

JITINDER WALIA: Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I said if-if-if
this one college had the longest list. So that means
something they were doing right. So now that the
funding is gone, no other college have the Head Start
in the their college?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Some colleges have
offered Head Start programs.

JITINDER WALIA: I see—

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: [interposing] May I
ask—may I ask the—the University Director to come up.

JITINDER WALIA: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Do you
affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and
nothing but the truth in your testimony before this
committee, and to answer questions honestly?

SHAVON FORD: Yes, I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Please
state your name.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

72

SHAVON FORD: Okay, Shavon. At this point in time I'm very new in this role, and that's why I'm not at the table right now, but I did ask a lot Alati Humbella (sic) just to come and they have more experience and expertise, and I would like to call Cecilia Scott-Croff up here to—to answer some of your questions if don't mind.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's fine.

SHAVON FORD: And the next Shavon Ford.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Would you come forward please, the person who was invited.
[pause]

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Welcome.

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: Hi, good morning.
Welcome.

BARRON: Good morning. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee, and to answer questions honestly?

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good. Please state your name for the record and give us testimony.

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: It's Cecelia Scott-Croff.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you and you would have to answer the answer the questions.

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: Yes. So I'd just like to state and just go back for a second. So we have 16 campus based children's centers, and I think that it's important to sort of lay the-the framework for this conversation by stating that each one is governed very differently on each respective campus. So some of us are what we call a 501(c)(3), which is a separately incorporate entity on the college campus. Some of us are incorporated under another organization, such as an organization on campus. Some of us vary in size, and what I mean by size is-- is that in terms of the amount of slots that we are allocated based on the space that we have available or that has been deemed acceptable the New York City Department of Health and Hygiene. Some of us have multiple licenses. Some of us serve multiple age groups and some us have multiple or diversified funding, and that is very contingent upon typically the needs of the college campus, which Dr. Rosa spoke to with respect to the individual life campuses. So

I'm—I currently serve as the executive director of the—of Borough of Manhattan Community College's Early Childhood Center. We are open seven days a week. We offer care Monday through Thursday until 9:00 p.m., Friday 7:45 to 5:00 and Saturdays and Sundays based on some generosity of the City Council as well to start that. We have a mix of city, state and federal funding. Depending upon our structure, our staffing, our administration with respect to the actual centers is where and when these things— So like, for example, Jitinder was speaking to the C—the CCAMPIS grant. While we have had several CUNY campuses in past RFPs who have received CCAMPIS funding, which is a federal funding, there are only two—there are only currently two centers, one being Borough of Manhattan Community College, and the other being Brooklyn College that are currently receiving funding through CCAMPIS, which is the federal grant from the Department of Education. So, the other pieces is that depending on the size in terms of—depending on the size in terms of our licensure, really speaks to the size in terms of our budgets. So our budgets can be anywhere from let's say \$800,000 if—if we are let's say a relatively small center, and when I mean

small I mean in terms of child care slots. When I say--and then some of us might have budgets close to \$2 million or a little over \$2 million. So that really the funding structures really speak to the level of programs that we can support for our families. So I spoke to--we have very diversified funding. So for my family we only change anywhere between \$5.00 literally the minimum, \$5.00 a week to up to \$35 a week per child, right. The actual cost of childcare is anywhere which Ms.--what Leah spoke is anywhere between \$1,700 and \$2,000. So someone might say Cecilia, why are you able to offer \$5.00 a week? That's because we have such a diversified array of funding, and we're constantly beating the pavement because that funding is really very continuous. So like for example, our program in particular had what was called a Limited Purchase of Service Contract with the Administration for Children's Services. For many of you in the room, you are aware that that was eradicated during the Bloomberg Administration, and they went back to basically a point system. And so basically you have a program that has a 25-year rich history with AC--the Administration for Children's Services, and like that we are not eligible because

basically we are--or not basically. Our--our code of--
our area code does not meet those particular
catchment areas. So then you have a program like
let's say Ms. Walia's, which is high quality, the
same as BMCC that is afforded the opportunity to
compete and is given priority preference through the
Early Learn Grant. So they get Early Learn. We
don't and some of those challenges are--are supersede
the CUNY's administration somewhat, and super exceed
our rules and directors and executive directors.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes, my colleague
has a quick question. Can she intervene?

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: Yes,

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. She's--she's
going to yield a moment to you.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: [off mic] Thank you
so much. I appreciate that. [background comments]
I'm sorry. I just wanted to follow up in terms of
what you were saying as far as the differences in the
funding and so you have funding coming from so many
different--

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: --and so many
different streams. Is there someone that's

overseeing from—from a—I guess in the CUNY
development that's overseeing that everyone has—
because it shouldn't be that that the quality of the
center if you have a great grant writer or if you
have a great person who's able to do that level of
grant writing and fundraising that that determines
which centers gets what kind of funding.

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: Well, I—I would—I
would say this to—to your—to your point there and
this is a whole other conversation, but look at New
York City public schools, and the challenge because
so we have a couple of different things. It's
depending again—once again on the funding. So we get
some funding like our Office of Children and Family
Services, which is basically a child development
block grant is basically our—for some of us well our
city campus grants, and there is another portion of
funding that's managed through CUNY and through our
research foundation system. But if you—let's say you
have a Universal Pre-Kindergarten Grant, typically
most of those things are done on a really a very
grassroots level by the—the Center directors, and
they work—they work in tandem with let's say whatever
grants and development office. Like for us, we have—

currently we have City Council grant that supports our evening and our weekend structure. So I work in conjunction with our Government Relations persons for BMCC, but it's a very—it's—it's a very mixed bag on each particular campus, and although we have overarching structure in terms of our central office, and we have great support from—from Kesha (sic), the reality is that there are so many nuances, and I—I mean I—I personally would like to apologize, if that's acceptable, because we have so many different nuances with respect to our program, and it sounds like you're not able to like effectively answer some of your questions, but there are just so many different layers with respect to—to the program. If I were to let's say have Medgar Evers here or—or let's say La Guardia, it's such a different demographic, and if I were to go down and you were to say Jitinder what does your funding look like? Cecilia what does your funding look like? Sonia, what does your funding look like? They're all very different and they're very—they're very diverse.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: But let me just in conclusion on my question I just have one more and then I'm done. [laughter] The—the amount of funding

that--the question Public Advocate Letitia James brought up in terms of how much money would be needed, do you even have the physical space, let's say the level of funding that you needed, or would this level of funding also require capital expansion, capital improvements in order to be able to meet the needs of the campus in that way. And I know that each one would be different.

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: [interposing]

Right, yes.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: --but there needs to be a universal assessment--

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: [interposing]

Right, yes.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: --to find out the physical space requirements, which spaces are operating not at capacity, but are operating in the way that they're operating because they simply don't have the funding, but if they did they could expand to weekends. They could expand to evenings. They could expand to incorporate more young people.

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: I--I would say that that's an excellent--that's an excellent point from your--your behalf and certainly I know that there's a

commitment from Dean Rosa as well, and from
University Director Charles (sic) here to get the-
that information. However, the-the challenge for us
still remains that we are operating. We've had like
this flat funding for years. So many of us are
operating with a lot less in terms of-So like I'll
give you an example. Jitinder talked about, you
know, because we are-if you-let's say for example and
I think our-our licensure numbers similar. 125 is
serving families. That diversity we have to
diversify in those pockets because let's say for
example I have license for 65 children in the day and
45 in the evening. If I just purely did it on just
basically my license numbers and offered child care
based on that, then I would be boxing out a lot of
families. So we try to provide flexible-like for my
program, we offer for those who have on-campus jobs,
for those who have federal work studies, and even for
some of those families who might have to work a
couple of little part-time hours or whatever, because
our-our funding is so diverse and because our
population is also very diverse in terms of dailies,
we are able to do that a little bit structurally.
But we are still operating at a deficit because we-

our funding has been relatively flat for years, and this is tenth year at CUNY, and every year we go to Albany and we talk about the same. You know, we lobby and we talk about the same thing about our funding being very flat. And CUNY has done a phenomenal job I would say in terms of supporting us because, I mean we're operating many. Like, we in terms of BMCC, we're operating in a space that would cost us close to \$2 million if we were renting, and that is offered to the center, the Borough of Manhattan Community College Early Childhood Center, Inc. including myself. So it's-[coughing] So there's a considerable--there's a considerable commitment on the part of the City University of New York, but still it, you know, we--it requires a lot more. And the fact that we are just talking about we've been operating since the '80s with the same number.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes, you have.

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: You know, the office of Children and Families typically give us a block and--and what I mean by a block I mean anywhere from if my numbers or you these rough estimates of my numbers, it's \$200 per week pre-school children.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

82

It's \$350 for an infant and it's about \$180 for school age. So the more funding that we can get and the more diversified our parts become, the less of a burden it becomes on our family.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Council Member Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: A phenomenal job. [applause] Just to say thank you for candidacy and brought it right to the table. My last question, though.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Do you need her returned to table.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Could come back to the table. [laughter] [background comments]

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I did, too, I got a number where you moved from. [background comments] I just wonder how much it cost per child

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: So you mean in terms of cost per child. I, okay, so the Office of Children and Family Services has a—has a funding base that they allow us to charge per family. So that base could be anywhere between \$1,500 and \$7—and \$7—and \$1,700 per month. So that cost is not charged to

the parent when you have those sliding scale fees,
and most of us have sliding scale fees. Those
sliding scale fees may be different. I-I-we charge
between at BMCC we charge \$5 a week. That's
typically what our price point between \$5 and \$10 a
week. Some-some centers because they don't have that
diversity in funding, they might charge--

JITINDER WALIA: [interposing] They
charge much more.

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: --\$25 a day or \$10
a day and--and basically all of us are doing, and
that's not to say all of us are doing our part like
Ms. Walia talked about well I'm looking for
everything. We have our research foundation, which
we have a strong-our grants in development.
Individuals we have relationships with. We have our
government relations people that we have
relationships with. We have our Vice President for
Student Affairs, which many of us report to. We're
constantly trying to find different ways of funding
to take the push or the pressure off of the parent.
But because it's so tenuous, it's like it's and so
cyclical that it's-it's a constant juggle.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you so much.

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: You're welcome.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: And I have to go
just as well. Thank you for this hearing.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. Madam
Public Advocate, do you have follow-up question?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing]
Thank you to both chairs.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: First Ms. Croff,
we want to thank you for staying around for this.

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: Yeah.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, Ms.
Croff, I know you have to leave and thank you for
your insightful testimony. Cecelia. [background
comments] I-I don't know you, sir. I've got to be
proper. So thank you, Ms. Croff and Cecelia-

CECELIA SCOTT-CROFF: Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: --for your
insightful testimony and Ms. Shavon thank you as well
for all that you are doing. So just some
recommendations. Obviously, I think the point that
was made by Council Member Cumbo is that there needs
to be a centralized office of child care within CUNY.
That's to me something is-is previous obvious and I-I

1 suspect that in the event and-not in the event-when
2 the City Council provides you with additional funds
3 that perhaps it should be contingent upon a
4 centralized of childcare with CUNY because although
5 Ms. Croff is doing a job a BMCC, what about the child
6 at La Guardia or Medgar Evers who has to pay more.
7 It's just not fair. An individual should not have to
8 determine what campus they should go-they should
9 attend based upon the-the-the cost of child care, but
10 where they can get the-the-what college serves them
11 best educationally or academically. And I suspect
12 that to create a centralized Office of Childcare
13 would be a legislative fix contingent upon the money,
14 and I-something tells me that the Council Member has
15 already drafted the legislation. [laughter] Two,
16 Early Learn was a disaster. We-we-we led the fight
17 when I was in the City Council. It is about to
18 expire soon. It is-thank God-it is based on
19 demographics. We also know that given demographic
20 shifts that some centers are no longer eligible.
21 They're no longer eligible for Title 1 funds. When
22 we were-when I was in the City Council we decided to
23 look at not zip codes, but we looked at not EDs, but
24 something more specific, something more gran-granular
25

so that we could get in neighborhoods that were in
gentrified districts. That's why I was able to get
public housing funds because they, too, were no
longer eligible for Early Learn, and so we need to
change that formula whatever that shift-formula was
then when I was in the City Council. It needs to
continue. We cannot look at zip codes because zip
codes would exclude pockets of poverty in gentrifying
neighborhoods. So those are some of my--and my last
question is why was the Head Start Program
discontinued?

JITINDER WALIA: I'm sorry.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Funding.

JITINDER WALIA: It was the funding.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: On the federal
level?

JITINDER WALIA: Yes.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And the Mayor, as
you know, started UPK. It's only on one campus.

JITINDER WALIA: I think five, five
campuses.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: So another idea
or initiative is we need to see how we can expand UPK
on every campus.

JITINDER WALIA: That would also depend
on if the campus has space.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Sure, assuming
that they have space.

JITINDER WALIA: Yes, right.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Assuming--assuming
that they have space, UPK should be expanded on to
every campus in addition to a centralized or a--a
centralized office of child care so we can
standardize the system. It just doesn't make sense.
It needs to be universal and--and it needs to be
consistent and students really need to look at CUNY
for--in terms of their academic accomplishments and
how it can further academic goals as opposed to their
child care needs. Those are my thoughts.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, Madam
Public Advocate. Just a few more questions. Are
non-matriculated students eligible to receive child
care services?

JITINDER WALIA: On our--on our campus
yes.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: At--at all campuses.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: At all campuses.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: So according to our board policy it's—our first priority is to matriculated students.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: And non-matriculated students and then, of course, at that point campuses would have the opportunity if there's availability to petition if they were so inclined for faculty staff out there.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So are participants CUNY Start eligible for child care services?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: They—they would be. They would be. I mean in the—in the priority they would fall while they're in CUNY Start they would be non-matriculated, but they would be—technically they are eligible.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. So, CUNY Head Start participants are eligible to receive child care services?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Yes, they would be yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. In terms of the number of slots, do you have a total number of

slots? I think--did you say there were 1,400 slots?
Is that what you had said in your testimony?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: We're--we're serving--
no, we're serving 1,400 children.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How does that differ
from the slots?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: It means that we're--
we're not necessarily at capacity in every place. We
could--I--We could find out. There are--are areas on
the ground.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] So
there are openings?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: In certain programs
there are openings. In other programs they are over-
subscribed and there are some waiting lists.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So then it's by
program--

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: Right.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --that determines
it, and in terms of availability so once student
parents are accommodated, if there's availability it
can be offered to the other members of the community,
this college community as well as the community--the
larger community outside of college?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: That's correct. There would need to be a proposal sent to the office of the Vice Chancellor for Student Affairs, and then we would—we would examine the same considerations that you just referred to what the actual demand is versus capacity and then we would determine if it was in the, you know, in the best interest of the students at that time. And then those slots—that opportunity would be offered at prevailing market rates.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So I just want to be clear. The campuses that do not have child care would be the Graduate School of Journalism, the Graduate School of Public Health and Health Policy, Guttman, the School of Law, but you say parents are directed to La Guardia.

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: That's correct.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: The School of Professional Studies and the CUNY School of Medicine, our new school. They do not have them. These are the ones?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: That is correct, although some of those for example the School of Journalism is technically a part of the Graduate Center, and so those students could be served.

You're saying no? They're not served by the Graduate
Center?

JITINDER WALIA: The Graduate Center I
think, in fact, there's at least 23 slots. So I'm
not sure how that works but the Graduate Center
itself has a child care center, but it's a very small
space that they have. I mean they could look into
increasing the space.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So there are only 23
slots at the Graduate Center.

JITINDER WALIA: Yes, as far as I know,
Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, well we--

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: [interposing] It's a
very small child care center.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I'm sorry, the
School of Journalism then is not served. I'm
hearing--my counsel is saying that they're not served.
So they are or they aren't?

CHRISTOPHER ROSA: I'll track but I--I was
under the impression that they were, but I'll track
it.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you, and
how--how are students--how are student parents allowed

to use the—perhaps HRA vouchers? How does that play
into the services that are provided at CUNY campuses?

JITINDER WALIA: Again, at—at Bronx
Community College, if they are eligible for a HRA
voucher because I'm also part of Early Learn, it fits
right into it, but again, that funding is going to
change in a year when the contract expires, but we do
accept HRA vouchers, but not all campuses do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh. So, you
know, it seems that again as has been said, there is
some benefits and there's really not parity across
the campuses to allow students to be—to benefit from
those entitlements that they have.

JITINDER WALIA: Well, I—I—I'm not sure
what reasons, you know, people have because a lot of
time my parents—most of the time are qualified to get
an HRA voucher. I don't think the parents who are
coming to Brooklyn College probably are eligible to
get the HRA voucher, and that could be the reason
that, you know, it's not put in. I'm not sure of
that, and I'm not the expert on answering that. I
can only answer for—for the Bronx that if a parent
comes with a HRA voucher, and we have an opening, we
try to accommodate them to the best of our ability.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

93

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay. Madam, Public Advocate, any more questions?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: No.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: No. Okay. We do have other questions that we will put them in writing and send them to you, and as always we look forward to the response to our questions. We thank you for responding to the questions that we presented at our last hearing. We did receive them--

JITINDER WALIA: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: --and we thank for that. We thank you for coming, for your time, for your testimony. Thank you. We'll call the next panel. All of these are persons from BMCC. Claudia Ben-Benson. [laughter] Olivia Hurt and Gregory Bissan-Bizran, Jr. Thank you. [background comments, pause] Thank you. If you would raise your right hand, please. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your testimony before this committee, and to answer committee questions honestly?

PANEL MEMBERS: [in unison] Yes, I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you. You may begin. Give us your name and your testimony.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

94

GREG: My name is Greg Blason, (sp?)
Junior.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Say it again.

GREG: It's Greg Blason (sp?), Junior.
Greg-Greg is fine. [laughter]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I always try-try to
make an effort to pronounce a person's name.

GREG: The beginning is-is fine.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay

GREG: People usually tail off because of
the buon--

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: [interposing] It
shows a respect for the person's culture to try to
learn their name. So thank you.

GREG: Thank you. Thank you very much.
Thank you, Chair Barron, Cumbo and members of the
Council. I want to thank you for giving me the
opportunity to express my concerns about the
possibility of the Early Childhood Center and the
Borough of Manhattan Community College losing its
funding. Again, my name is Greg Warier Blason. (sp?)
I attend BMCC as a computer science major. I see the
logic behind the Early Childhood Center. This
service should be definitely nationwide. The

teachers in this facility are highly qualified,
educated and kind. I mention this because this
translates perfectly to the care and education that
they give the children. I remember my son Lucas. He
had an assignment where he was excited about his
homework that he had bring back some leaves and any
foliage that he needed to discuss with their types.
My wife, family and friends planned a trip to
Minnewaska State Park. It's in Ulster County in
Upstate New York. The excitement on Lucas' face
conveyed just was like beaming when he remembered his
assignment. It was priceless. He returned to the
school with a sample of different types of pines and
leaves and needless to say he was sort of like, you
know, eager to share and it was amazing for him. The
other ways that the Early Childhood Center stands
apart from just a day care is availability, and as
Cecelia attested earlier, it's open seven days a
week. Amazing we have a facility, and as a parent
this is true because it helps me a lot in my classes
and it helps me to study. Okay, my journey with the
Borough of Manhattan Community College and the Early
Childhood Center will kind of come to an end this
semester as I graduate with my associate's in

computer science. But also my son graduates also from the Early Childhood Center as well. So our story is not unique. However, this facility has helped me plant the seed of higher learner in my son, and it gives me the momentum to continue my journey to City College and placement in tech field that I'm going to be going into in the New York City area. Please continue to fund the Borough of Manhattan Community College Early Childhood Center as we add value and pride to the New York City Community.

Thank you. [pause, background comment]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes, you may go.

OLIVIA PARRETT: Good-good afternoon to the members of the City Council of New York [laughter] and all the-and the other individuals present here today. My name is Olivia Parrett. I'm a single mother and full-time student at the Borough of Manhattan Community College. My major is nursing, which after completion I plan to transfer to a four-year school to acquire my BSN. Today I'm here to express the importance of having an Early Childhood Center at the college and how it has significantly impacted my decision to further my education. The Early Childhood Center has provided me the time and

privilege needed to attend classes, study and get any additional tutoring that is required to maintain my A average, which is needed to remain competitive academically, and which has also resulted in me being awarded membership in some international honor society Phi Theta Kappa. The Early Childhood Center also provides child care at the cost that is affordable to me enabling young mothers like myself in my current situation to access quality child care for my son in a clean and nurturing environment. I wouldn't be able to afford child care in the private market due to how expensive it is. The center is unique in that it's not only child care, it's a family that incorporated learning while providing a safe environment for my child. Without the convenience and affordability of the Early Childhood Center at BMCC, it would be extremely difficult for me to complete my college education. Than you.

CLAUDIA BENCOMEZ: good afternoon. Thank you so much for having us here. My name is Claudia BENCOMEZ (sp?). I'm currently enrolled to the nursing program the Borough of Manhattan Community College. I have a four-year-old son enrolled in BMCC Early Childhood Center, and my plans for the future

will be to transfer in to a Hunter-to Hunter College and pursue my Bachelor's Degree. I was 26 years old when I decided to go back to school in 2015. One of my main concerns was my son. I didn't know how it was going to be-how it was going to be possible for me to combine my own life and my student life.

Regular day care was impossible for me because of the high prices, around \$200 a week compared to the BMCC, which will change me \$255 a semester, and I wanted to have my son as close as possible. It was going to be his first year in a school, too, and that made me very nervous. When I found out that BMCC had a child center within the school it easily lifted a weight out of my shoulders. In that moment, I knew that I had the support and I felt confident and focused on my school. The center is not just a place that watches kids while parents are in the school. It is an actual school. Their program is excellent. The kids actually learn new things without even noticing it. Even their meals are excellent, which is a big plus when you're a parent. Their-the staff members are the best that I could ask for. They not only help us-our kids to explore and learn new things, but also they are a support system for the parents. They

help the parents understand the new phase that the kids are going through. The center means opportunity. It means trust, community, barriers, equality and respect. For the—for the student parents our children means everything. We have the chance of pursuing a dream that will not be possible if it wasn't for them. I believe everyone deserves an education whether you are 18 or 40 and places like the BMCC Early Childhood Center at Borough of Manhattan Community College makes that possible.

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you very much. Question. How did you find—I understand that you did your research and you knew—

CLAUDIA BENCOMEZ: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How did the—how did the other panelists find out about the programs that were available at BMCC? How did you know about the child care program?

GREG: Actually, I ran into literally a parent who was walking their child away from the center, and I was—I needed a facility for my child at the time. He was already two years old and the day care was shutting down. I live in Brooklyn. So, and

I saw this woman just walking with her child, and I quickly ran over to her and I said, you know, I see with a child. Is there like a child center around here or something, and that's how I found out about it. Because other than that I was working and I didn't even investigate until I saw that and it was—it was amazing ever since.

OLIVIA PARRETT: For me I just hit Google [laughs] child care centers close to BMCC, and it came up with a Google search.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: The reason that I ask is because I've asked the question and you may have heard the answer of this panel, and in earlier committee hearings we've asked the question, and it doesn't appear that most of the students find it through the CUNY.

CLAUDIA BENCOMEZ: No, I didn't. No.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So it's a question—a question that I've raised before, and it's an instance where we need to find a better way that even through the—I know it's there, but obviously it doesn't jump at you because I've yet to hear someone say that they did it through the CUNY portals and the website online. So it's sort of been incidental and,

of course, the Google search brought that to you
attention.

OLIVIA PARRETT: Because I also live in
Brooklyn.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.

OLIVIA PARRETT: And I didn't want my
two-year-old in Brooklyn while I'm in Manhattan.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I agree with that.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: [off mic] Can I speak
to this?

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes, Council Member
Cumbo.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: I wanted to
understand the practicality of the services. So how
did you find the experience or the ability to work,
go to school, and from what one of the testimonies
were was although it's different going to work, you
may need a different child care provider than when
you're going to school. How are you able to—or did
the center that you attended were you able to just do
it full time and your child stay there the entire
time, or did you have to juggle that experience?

OLIVIA PARRETT: Well for me at BMCC she
extends like courtesies to parents or if you work

like part time you can always send her an email requesting additional hours, and she will grant it to you sometimes at no additional cost either. So they have a family worker there and a social worker. So if we are having difficulties we can always just stop in Bob's office. No appointment is necessary and just tell him what our challenges here, and they are there to help.

CLAUDIA BENCOMEZ: They're—they also help with like if, for example, for me last semester I did work study. Their hours are so like they have—they open like from the morning until night.

OLIVIA PARRETT: Uh-huh, 9:45.

CLAUDIA BENCOMEZ: Yes. I used to go to—to classes in the morning and then have one class in the afternoon and then do work study within the school. They—if I wanted to leave my son the whole day there they would provide those hours without charging me extra.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: I see.

CLAUDIA BENCOMEZ: I would have to pay the same thing.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Okay, that's excellent.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

103

GREG: And for me my schedule is a little flexible. I'm a personal trainer. So I'll train people sort of like in the mid-day between my study gap hours. So I'll take like a-a morning client that has like-is going to wake up around like 9:30 and if I drop him off first, then I can go to my morning client and just, you know, run on back.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: But you didn't feel- from what I'm gathering, none of you felt the pressure necessarily to okay I only have classes Monday, Wednesday and Friday from 9:00 to 12:00. Other than that for those other hours from 12:00 to 5:00 I've got to find something else to do because I'll be-because-

GREG: Right.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: --for your you'll be with a client from 12:00 to 5:00. You didn't necessarily feel the-the pressure to find other--?

GREG: Mine is also different, too, because I'm married, and I have my cousin who works nearby BMCC. So they would pick up or drop off Lucas depending--

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: [interposing] I see.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

104

GREG: --on my schedule, but it was--
Again, the facility was very flexible enough that I
can drop him off, and then pick him up at a flexible
time.

CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: I see. Thank you.

GREG: You're welcome.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I want to thank all
of you for coming. Mr. Greg Ranier Blason (sp?)

GREG: Thank.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Ms. Olivia Parrett
and Ms. Claudia Benscoms-Bencomez. I want to thank
you all for coming, and encourage you to continue on,
and commend you for your recognition as a member as a
member Phi Theta Kappa. Continue the good work.
Thank you so much for coming and giving your
testimony.

OLIVIA PARRETT: Thank you.

CLAUDIA BENCOMEZ: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Seeing that are no
others who have testimony, this hearing is adjourned.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I do.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, I'm sorry. Oh,
I'm sorry. I didn't realize that--I'm sorry. Do you
have questions for this panel?

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S ISSUES

105

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [off mic] No, I
don't.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, I just wanted
to recognize on center. (sic)

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [off mic] At
least you're ready to talk to me. [laughter] So
thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much.
Vanessa Gibson, our colleague from the Bronx is here
as well. Thank you so much. Seeing no other
comments or testimony, this hearing is adjourned.
[background comments]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 26, 2017