

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

January 18, 2017
Start: 1:28 p.m.
Recess: 3:08 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- INEZ D. BARRON
- JOSEPH C. BORELLI
- FERNANDO CABRERA
- MARGERET S. CHIN
- ANDREW COHEN
- COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES
- ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.
- ELIZABETH S. CORWLEY
- LAURIE A. CUMBO
- CHAIM M. DEUTSCH
- DANIEL DROMM
- RAFAEL L. ESPINAL, JR.
- MATHIEU EUGENE
- JULISSA FERRERAS-COPELAND
- DANIEL R. GARODNICK
- VINCENT J. GENTILE
- VANESSA L. GIBSON
- DAVID G. GREENFIELD
- BARRY S. GRODENCHIK

COUNCIL MEMBERS: (CONTINUED)

COREY D. JOHNSON
BEN KALLOS
ANDY L. KING
PETER A. KOO
KAREN KOLSOWITZ
RORY I. LANCMAN
BRAD S LANDER
STEPHEN T. LEVIN
MARK LEVINE
ALAN N. MAISEL
STEVEN MATTEO
DARLENE MEALY
CARLOS MENCHACA
ROSIE MENDEZ
I. DANEEK MILLER
ANNABEL PALMA
ANTONIO REYNOSO
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
DEBORAH L. ROSE
HELEN K. ROSENTHAL
RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.
RITCHIE J. TORRES
MARK TREYGER
ERIC A. ULRICH
JAMES VACCA
PAUL A. VALLONE
JAMES G. VAN BRAMER
JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS
RUBEN WILLS

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Rachel Ain
Rabbi
Sutton Place Synagogue, Manhattan

Patty Morello Causo [sp?]
Non-Profit Organization: Survivor

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

[gavel]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Alright, we're going to get... we have one ceremonial today. So, it's, it's being led by Council Member Crowley and we'll ask her to come up and any members who will join us please this is about... yeah, the Women's Caucus and Elizabeth and we would ask our male colleagues to also join us please. Eric, suddenly I see Jumaane just ignoring you today, I wonder why. There are no cameras around.

[background talking]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Some things more than others, here you go.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Good afternoon, I'd like to ask Patty Morello Causo to come up, Patty is a survivor of cervical cancer and she also...

[background talking]

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: ...runs a non-profit organization called Survivor.

[background talking]

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Cervical cancer is a preventable cancer unfortunately 13,000 people are diagnosed with this type of cancer every year.

1
2 Cervical cancer is a preventable cancer
3 unfortunately 13,000 people are diagnosed with this
4 type of cancer every year and a few of those
5 thousand almost 4,000 die, these are preventable
6 deaths. Women need to know that in order to prevent
7 cervical cancer they must go to their gynecologist
8 regularly and that means every single year and
9 that's how you catch cervical cancer. In addition
10 to that there are ways of preventing the HPV virus
11 which nearly every sexually transmitted.. every
12 person who's sexually active is exposed to this
13 type of virus and not only are women victims of HPV
14 type cancers also men are and they can get
15 vaccinated at a young age which is also important.
16 So, I would like to ask Patty to say a few words
17 about her organization and remember that January is
18 cervical awareness month, get tested and be
19 educated.

20 [background talking]

21 PATTY MORELLO: Hi everybody I just want..
22 I just want to speak to you regarding the
23 organization survivor, it's a non-profit
24 organization, is nationally we are ambassadors,
25 she's a New York City Ambassador and so am I. We

1
2 educate women to try to let them know that there
3 are tools out there to prevent this cancer. If you
4 ever speak to an oncologist which is a cancer
5 doctor he will tell you that cervical cancer should
6 not be on the map because it's 99 percent
7 preventable, okay, we got the tools, we got the
8 vaccination, you don't hear of a vaccine taking
9 care of a cancer, this one does, okay. we got
10 your... you have to have your pap test and your HPV
11 test for women unfortunately we don't have HPV test
12 at this moment for men but we do for women, okay.
13 So, you have to know that this is preventable yet
14 like... like Council Woman said 13,000 women in the
15 United States alone are diagnosed every single year
16 and 4,000 of them die every signal year. Compared
17 to other cancers you might think these numbers are
18 very small but remember these are women that are
19 somebody's mother, somebody grandmother, somebody's
20 aunt and they do matter, they do matter, okay.
21 Worldwide is over half a million diagnosed every
22 year and 256,000 women die every year of this
23 preventable disease. So please educate yourself. We
24 are survivors dot org, you can go there and, and
25 all, all resources are there, okay. I... I'm an

1
2 ambassador, we have ambassadors all over the
3 country and we try to educate not only women but
4 men too, okay. We have a stigma because HPV like she
5 say is a sexually transmitted disease and people
6 think that you have to promiscuous to get that
7 absolutely not, absolutely not, you could have one
8 partner or you could have 100 partners, you will
9 get the HPV virus, okay. Fortunately to all of us
10 the majority has the capability to fight this virus
11 like a cold but some of us that we don't... we don't
12 know the, the, the why we do not have the
13 capability and it stays in our body for many years
14 and when the body starts changing that's when the
15 cells begins to change so that's when you have to
16 go to the doctor because there are procedures to
17 even do before you get that, that, that cancer
18 diagnoses. Okay, thank you very much.

19 [background talking]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I want to, I
21 want to thank you for... and, and I just love the
22 name, it's very... you know I can't fully... I hadn't
23 seen it before, it's a very clever name, yes but I
24 want to thank you for your advocacy and effort and,
25 and we know as women that we get really busy in our

1
2 lives and sometimes we overlook our health, we
3 don't get our checkups as regularly as we should
4 and obviously when I divulged that I had to get a
5 biopsy based on the HPV diagnosis but we have to
6 really educate people on the vaccine and, and be
7 able to know that are options for men and for women
8 as children, right young but obviously as adults we
9 have to make sure that we tend to ourselves and
10 that we love ourselves and that means getting our
11 checkups as quickly as... and as soon as we... as we
12 can. So, I want to thank you for your advocacy...

13 [background talking]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: ...We're going to
15 ask the clerk to read the proclamation and again
16 thank you so much.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council city of New York
18 proclamation, the council of the city of New York
19 is proud to reaffirm its commitment to fighting
20 cervical cancer, promoting prevention, and
21 providing hope to those affected by it and whereas
22 each year nearly 13,000 women in the United States
23 are diagnosed with cervical cancer. Several
24 thousand women die from the disease. Every case of
25 cervical cancer is a tragedy that devastates

1 patients and their loved ones and whereas
2 fortunately cervical cancer can be detected early
3 and is virtually always preventable with
4 vaccination and regular screening tests including
5 pap and HPV tests. If it is detected early,
6 cervical cancer is one of the most successfully
7 treatable cancers, and whereas cervical cancer
8 vaccines are now widely available and combined with
9 regular screenings they provide an effective means
10 of preventing the disease. In the past 40 years,
11 the number of cases and deaths from cervical cancer
12 has decreased significantly but continued progress
13 depends upon everyone to help spread this
14 lifesaving information. Increasing awareness of
15 prevention and detection techniques among patients
16 and health care providers is a key component in
17 safeguarding cervical health. Now therefore be it
18 known that the council of the city of New York
19 including all members of its Women's Caucus hereby
20 proclaims January, 2017 to be Cervical Cancer
21 Awareness month in New York City and we encourage
22 everyone to promote the importance of cervical
23 health and cervical cancer prevention by sharing
24 prevention messages with others not only this month
25

1
2 but throughout the year. Melissa Mark-Viverito
3 speaker for the entire council, Elizabeth Crowley
4 Council Member 30th district Queens, Laurie A.
5 Cumbo Co-Chair Women's Caucus, Helen Rosenthal Co-
6 Chair Women's Caucus, and many other members of the
7 city council.

8 [background talking]

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Alright, that was
10 our only ceremonial and so with that we end it,
11 thank you.

12 [pause]

13 [gavel]

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Everyone please
15 have their seat. Quite in the chambers please. All
16 rise for the Pledge of Allegiance. [off mic] I
17 pledge allegiance to the flag of the United States
18 of America, and to the republic for which it
19 stands, one nation under God, indivisible, with
20 liberty and justice for all.

21 [audience recites pledge]

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated,
23 roll call.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

11

COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli? Cabrera?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quite in the chambers please, we're in session, quite in the chambers, thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides? Cornegy?

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you, Crowley?

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [off mic] Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch? Dromm?

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you, Espinal?
Eugene? Ferreras-Copeland?

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick?

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile?

STATED MEETING

12

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson?

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield? Grodenchik?

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic]
Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson? Kallos?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: King? Council Member
King?

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [off mic] Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Koo?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: [off mic]
Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We... may we have
quite in the chambers please, may everyone please

1
2 have their seat, we are in the midst of roll call,
3 please quite in the chambers.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel? Mealy? Menchaca?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [speaking
8 Spanish]

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez? Miller?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma? Reynoso?
12 Richards?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose? Rosenthal?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: [off mic]
20 Present.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres? Treyger?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.
25

1

2

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca? Vallone?

3

Williams?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] Here.

5

COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills? Matteo? Van

6

Bramer?

7

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

8

COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito?

9

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Here.

10

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quite in the

11

chambers please. All rise for the invocation. The

12

invocation will be delivered by Rabbi Rachel Ain of

13

Sutton Place Synagogue 225 East 51st Street in the

14

great borough of Manhattan. Quite in the chambers.

15

RACHEL AIN: Eleanor Roosevelt once said

16

perhaps in God's wisdom God is trying to show us

17

that a leader may chart the way, may point out the

18

road to lasting peace but that many leaders and

19

many people must do the building. Eleanor Roosevelt

20

statement regarding leadership is a crucial one

21

during this time of year as we are just days past

22

the observance of Dr. Martin Luther King's birthday

23

and in anticipation of a new president at a time of

24

a deeply divided nation. We recognize that all of

25

us must come together to find ways to commit and

1
2 recommit ourselves to bringing the world together
3 even through our disagreements. We might not all
4 agree on policies but I know we agree in the human
5 dignity of each person that everyone here in this
6 assembly and everyone that is represented by each
7 of you was created in the image of God and that
8 demands a sense of respect and love. One piece of
9 Jewish tradition that reflects the importance of
10 all of us sitting together teaches that for three
11 years there was a dispute between Beit Shammai and
12 Beit Hillel the first asserting that the law is an
13 agreement with our views and the latter said it is
14 an agreement with our views then the heavenly voice
15 announced while both of these are the words of the
16 living God the law is in agreement with the rulings
17 of Beit Hillel because they were kind and modest,
18 they studied their own rulings and those of the
19 house of Shammai and were as so humbled to mention
20 the actions of Shammai. It is clear what the point
21 is that even if both sides of an argument have
22 merit how we debate will have an impact on the
23 dialogue not only the content itself and so we pray
24 heavenly God who desires us to do justice, love,
25 mercy, and walk humbly with you. We thank you for

1
2 giving us the opportunity to be in the presence of
3 one another as we do the important work of this
4 great city. We ask that you grant us the wisdom to
5 truly understand that all of humanity is created
6 equally in your image, open our hearts to stand
7 with those who need our love and support for today
8 we gather not as people of a particular party,
9 religion, race, creed, gender orientation, today we
10 gather as New Yorkers and we ask God to shine God's
11 blessing on this assembly today and so in my
12 tradition and in many of yours we ask God to give
13 us the strength... to perfect the world and so we
14 must understand that in a world torn apart by
15 differences this room and these ideas must be the
16 bastion of wisdom about which Eleanor Roosevelt was
17 speaking, amen.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you Rabbi,
19 a motion to spread the invocation. Council Member
20 Garodnick.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
22 much Madam Public Advocate and good afternoon
23 everyone and I wanted to welcome and extend my
24 deepest gratitude to Rabbi Rachel Ain for joining
25 us today. Rabbi Ain is the Rabbi of Sutton Place

1
2 synagogue, a conservative congregation founded in
3 1901 but a community with roots on the east side of
4 Manhattan going back to the 1800's. Rabbi Ain's
5 sits on the Chancellor's Rabbinic of JTS, she's on
6 the clergy task force for Jewish Women
7 International and was selected to be a part of the
8 Inaugural Cohort of the Rabbinick fellowship for
9 visionary leaders at the UJA federation of New
10 York. Prior to her work at Sutton Place she was the
11 senior Rabbi of a congregation in Syracuse and the
12 director for National Young Leadership of the
13 Jewish Federations of North America. Through her
14 experiences, Rabbi Ain has been a remarkable civic
15 leader. She served as a commission lieutenant for
16 the U.S. Navy, Navy Chaplains Corps and sat with a
17 round table of faith leaders for Interfaith Works
18 Syracuse. On a final note, I'd like to add that
19 Rabbi Ain's congregation, Sutton Place Synagogue
20 has been an incredible friend to important
21 neighborhood groups on the east side of Manhattan.
22 From community boards to precinct counsels her
23 congregation has always had an open door and a
24 willingness to host these organizations for their
25 monthly meetings and many, many more. For this we

1
2 are all very appreciative so thank you Rabbi Ain
3 for everything you and your staff do, we are so
4 glad that you are here with us today, and, in this
5 spirit, I would like make a motion to spread the
6 invocation in full upon the record.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
8 adoption of minutes Council Member Deutsch.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I make a motion
10 that the minutes of this stated meeting of December
11 6th, 2016 be adopted as printed by Council Member
12 Chaim Deutsch.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
14 messages and papers from the mayor?

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
17 from city, county, and borough offices?

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
20 communications?

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land use call
23 ups?

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: M466 unenclosed sidewalk
25 café.

STATED MEETING

19

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Roll call?
3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron?
4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.
5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli? Cabrera?
6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.
7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin?
8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.
9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen?
10 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Yes, aye.
11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides?
13 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.
14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy?
15 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.
16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley?
17 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye.
18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo?
19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.
20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch?
21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.
22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm?
23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.
24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal?
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

20

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: [off mic] I vote
aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene? Ferreras-
Copeland?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Ferreras-Cope...

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: ...Aye...

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: ...Okay.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick?

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile?

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson?

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [off mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield? Grodenchik?

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic]
Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson? Kallos?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: King?

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Madame Public
Advocate I would like to vote aye on all call ups
and with your permission I'd like to vote on all
coupled general orders and resolutions.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I vote aye.
3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo?
5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.
6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz?
7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.
8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman?
9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic] Aye.
10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander?
11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [off mic] Aye.
12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin?
13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [off mic] Aye.
14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine?
15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.
16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel?
17 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Yes.
18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy? Borelli?
19 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: [off mic] Aye.
20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca?
21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.
22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez? Miller?
23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.
24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma? Reynoso?
25 Richards?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez?

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose? Rosenthal?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [off mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca?

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Madame Public

Advocate I would like to vote aye on all call ups
and with permission I would like to vote on all
coupled general orders and resolutions.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all,
thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres? Treyger?

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich? Vacca?

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone?

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills? Greenfield?

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo?

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: [off mic] Yes.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer?

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Today's land use call ups were adopted by a vote of 40 in the affirmative, zero in the negative.. Quite in the chambers. Quite in the chambers as we now hear from the speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, thank you.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madama Public Advocate and good afternoon. [speaking Spanish] to all my colleagues. If I could just ask you to rise a moment please.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please rise.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So before we begin today I definitely want to take a moment to acknowledge the recent death of NYPD Detective Steven McDonald. Detective McDonald has been an exemplary model of compassion and empathy since the attempt on his life 30 years ago, and the mass last week and the service was incredibly moving. He has left a lasting impact on all of us here in New York

1
2 City so our thoughts and prayers are with his
3 family, with the entire NYPD police force and thank
4 him for all the efforts that he has led over these
5 years and so with that I'd like to ask all my
6 colleagues to just join in moment of silence to
7 honor his passing.

8 [silence]

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you my
10 colleagues.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: The council will
13 be voting on several items today recognizing the
14 upcoming Asian Lunar New Year we begin with
15 introduction 1061 sponsored by Council Member
16 Margaret Chin which would temporarily lift the
17 requirement of a vending license for purposes of
18 selling flowers and plants on the day of Asian
19 Lunar New Year and during the seven days prior. For
20 our staff, I want to thank; Lavoni Rockmon
21 [phonetic], Israel Martinez, David Seitzer, and
22 Rachel Cordero. Again, this is Council Member Chin
23 and, who is the sponsor and ask her to say a few
24 words.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Madame
3 Speaker. Today we will vote on intro 1061,
4 legislation that would allow individuals to sell
5 flowers for seven days prior and on the day of
6 Asian Lunar New Year without the fear of collecting
7 large fines and of even being arrested by
8 enforcement agents. Lunar New Year is a holiday
9 that Asians and Asian Americans from across the
10 world celebrate every year and even though each
11 culture has a unique tradition flowers play a big
12 role in many of these celebrations. For Chinese
13 families, flowers are purchased prior to the New
14 Year and allowed to bloom in their homes in the
15 days and weeks that follow. This tradition
16 signifies a fresh start to the New Year, one that
17 brings good luck, fortune, and prosperity. In
18 Chinese, we say; [speaking foreign language] when
19 the flowers bloom good fortune will come. Lunar New
20 Year is just days away, this year it will be on
21 Saturday, January 28th. Many residents in my
22 council district and in neighborhoods with large
23 Chinese residents across New York City will be
24 heading out to buy these plants and flowers. More
25 often or not they will buy these flowers from

1
2 vendors who are selling without general vending
3 license as well as those with a food license... food
4 vendor license. Sometimes enforcement agents arrest
5 these vendors taking them away from their families
6 during one of the most important cultural holidays
7 of the year. With a passage of Intro 1061 food
8 vendors will have to follow the rules to sell fruit
9 and vegetables but this legislation will merely
10 insure that vendors selling flowers during the Luna
11 New Year season will be able to do so without the
12 fear of heavy fines or even arrest. For many New
13 Yorkers Intro 1061 will not have a huge impact but
14 let there be no doubt this bill will make a big
15 difference for the growing number of families
16 celebrating Asian Luna New Year. I want to thank
17 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito and the Chair of the
18 Consumer Affair Committee Council Member Rafael
19 Espinal as well as Majority Leader Van Bramer,
20 Council Member Menchaca, Lancman, Ferreras-
21 Copeland, Levine, and Treyger for their support of
22 this bill. I also want to thank Ramone Martinez,
23 Rob Newman, Rachel Cordero, David Seitzer and
24 Lavoni Rockmon and my legislative director Vincent
25 Fang for all their hard work on this bill and I

1
2 want to wish everyone here a happy and healthy
3 prosperous year of the rooster, [speaking foreign
4 language] and I urge all my colleagues to vote for
5 this bill, thank you.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you
7 Margaret. The second item being voted on today is
8 an important element of the city's ongoing work to
9 keep digital information secure, introduction 1052A
10 sponsored by Committee on Technology Chair James
11 Vacca would require any city agency disposing of
12 electronic equipment that is capable of storing
13 information when powered off to ensure that all of
14 the information is erased before it is disposed of.
15 As far as staff I want to thank Malaika Jabali, and
16 Patrick Mulvihill and ask Council Member Vacca to
17 say a few words.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you Madame
19 Speaker. The, the bill we're considering today that
20 I've sponsored would codify a city policy to ensure
21 that all data is erased from city electronic
22 instruments when disposed of. Additionally, it
23 requires the deletion of data when electronics are
24 transferred to another agency. I think we all know
25 that data breaches today are very, very common and

1
2 they facilitate fraudulent activities such as... such
3 as identity theft. In 2015 there were 979 data
4 breaches in New York State affecting 5.5 million
5 people. The New York City department of information
6 technology DoITT, created a policy to address
7 security and this bill codifies the policy and goes
8 a step further. The... by... it goes further by
9 expanding the definition of disposed to include
10 equipment transfers from one agency to another.
11 Some agencies deal with more sensitive information
12 than other... than others and this bill ensures that
13 data stays where it's supposed to be within city
14 government. So, I want to thank the members of our
15 technology committee which I chair and it's been my
16 honor to chair and thank the speaker and all the
17 staff here at the council and I ask the members to
18 vote aye on this legislation.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
20 Member. Today the council will be voting on a
21 legislative package to reform the commuter van van
22 industry. Intro 570A sponsored by Council Member
23 Jumaane Williams would remove some unique
24 restrictions relating to record maintenance and
25 authorization renewals that do not apply to any

1
2 other sectors regulated by the taxi and limousine
3 commission and are not connected to safety. These
4 restrictions have merely created unnecessary
5 burdens on small business owners. This bill would
6 also remove the requirement that commuter van
7 services renew their authorization with the
8 Department of Transportation every six years.
9 Additionally, commuter vans would no longer be
10 required to carry evidence of prearrangement or
11 passenger manifest. For the staff, I want to thank
12 Kelly Taylor, Jonathan Masserano, Gafar Zaaloff,
13 Emily... didn't have a last name, Brandon West, Chima
14 Ovichere. Council Member Williams will speak to
15 this bill.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you
17 Madame Speaker for your leadership on this issue.
18 This is a, a proud day for myself. I do want to
19 invoke the name of Council Member Una Clarke who
20 worked very hard on commuter van issues when she
21 was here and Assemblyman Nick Perry who does the
22 same in the state. Today along with my colleague
23 Council Member Daneek Miller and I want to thank
24 him for his partnership. We have a package of
25 legislation that will crack down on legal road

1
2 commuter van operators and assure that legal
3 licensed and insured operators can operate safely
4 across the city. Just as a pre-text this industry
5 is an industry that the city goes to in times of
6 emergency where there's strike, blizzard, or a
7 blackout and there's no other transportation in the
8 city this is what the city depends on and often
9 times ignores them afterwards and I believe this
10 package strikes the right balance trying to make
11 sure that there's no onerous policies and laws that
12 prevent the legally insured and licensed van
13 operators from operating and providing
14 transportation in transportation starved deserts
15 across the city while providing for and allowing
16 for increased enforcement on those operators that
17 are not licensed and have no insurance. This is not
18 to provide any kind of carte blanche for people to
19 jump in who have not gone through the proper
20 processes in fact we are urging and asking for the
21 NYPD and TLC to step up enforcement. I want to say
22 thank you to the mayor's office including TLC
23 Commissioner Joshi, Bill Heinzen and Chuck Pasanti
24 [phonetic] all from TLC, DOT Commissioner
25 Trottenberg and their teams, again to Speaker

1
2 Melissa Mark-Viverito and her staff including Matt
3 Gewolb, Laura Popa, a special shout out to Kelly
4 Taylor, thank you to the chair Rodriguez and his
5 staff Russell Murphey, CM Miller and his staff,
6 Greg Rose, CM Kallos and Koo, Nick Smith from my
7 staff and again to... former Council Member Leroy
8 Comrie who is now a Senator and working with this,
9 with me before and two very special folks who I
10 know are in the balcony now watching us, Hector
11 Ricketts owner of the community transportation
12 system and part of the community van association
13 with New York Queens and someone who's become a
14 very close friend of mine through all of this,
15 Leroy Morrison, owner of Alexis Van Lines and part
16 of the commuter van association of New York,
17 they're both in the balcony now and Leroy's with
18 his daughter Alexis who's the company's named after
19 and today is his birthday so Happy Birthday and
20 hope this is a great present for you. Lastly, we're
21 asking all those who take the vans like I do on
22 occasion and only way I got to High School to look
23 for the New York City commuter decal, this means
24 that they are insured and licensed and hopefully
25

1
2 these are the only ones that you will take. Thank
3 you again and I urge my colleagues to vote aye.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.
5 introduction 860A sponsored by Civil Service and
6 Labor Committee Chair Daneek Miller would limit the
7 number of commuter van licenses to 735 provided
8 that the TLC could increase the number of available
9 licenses upon finding that there is a need for
10 additional vans in an annual study. Introduction
11 861A also sponsored by Council Member Miller would
12 set the minimum Civil penalty for a first violation
13 involving the operation of a commuter van at
14 \$1,000. Penalties for the operation of a commuter
15 van service without the required authorization or
16 license would be raised to a range of between 1,000
17 and \$3,000 for a first offense and a range of 2,000
18 and \$4,000 for subsequent offenses within two
19 years. These two bills are by Council Member Miller
20 and he will speak to both of them.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Madame
22 Speaker. For years, communities like mine in
23 southeast Queens have been striving to obtain mass
24 transit facility, equivalent to those central of
25 the central business districts throughout the rest

1
2 of the city instead our communities and many
3 transportation deserts have been subdivided by
4 often illegal transportation of our alternatives
5 including those of the dollar van commuter van
6 industry. Today we have legislation, two pieces of
7 legislation here that will help to bring structure
8 to this industry so that we may provide our
9 communities with the services that they deserve.
10 Intro 860 would mandate a much needed study of
11 safety related issues on commuter van industry, it
12 would compile data on safety and violations of
13 operators and van vehicles that are currently
14 registered and, and unregistered as well. This
15 legislation is supported by all the many local
16 community boards including 10, 12, and 13 and
17 Queens. Queens city..., the... and the TW and many
18 other civic groups. Intro 861 because we have been...
19 the city has lost one of its major tools in
20 enforcement which was the ability to seize vehicles
21 we submitted this legislation to increase the
22 penalties that would deter the illegal operation of
23 commuter vans throughout the city here. I want to
24 thank first of all Council Member Williams for
25 working with me on this, Council Member Williams

1
2 this is something that I had been working on since
3 my days in, in the council and, and I just want to
4 attribute his efforts and his diligence to us
5 making this happen because we certainly started out
6 on two different sides here but in order for us to
7 provide the services that our community deserved we
8 had to come together and put together a package
9 that would certainly regulate a industry that has
10 been known to be the greatest up front on Vision
11 Zero but also an industry that had provided a well
12 needed service so with that I'm very grateful to
13 the Council Member and his staff Nick, I also would
14 like to thank again the Speaker, the Chair of the
15 Transportation Committee Ydanis Rodriguez and
16 certainly Kelly Taylor and Russell Murphey, my
17 legislative director Gregory Rose and as mentioned
18 earlier there are those who came before us like Una
19 Clarke and certainly Senator Comrie who was
20 instrumental in driving me towards this legislation
21 so I'd like to thank them, I look forward to the
22 passage and certainly there's much, much more work
23 to be done so that we can give this industry the
24 tools that it needs to provide the services that
25 are necessary, thank you.

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. Today
3 the council will be considering two finance bills,
4 introduction 1281A sponsored by finance committee
5 Chair Julissa Ferreras-Copeland and Economic
6 Development Committee Chair Dan Garodnick would
7 require the independent budget office to review and
8 evaluate economic development and tax expenditures
9 identified by the council on a schedule set forth
10 by the council. Introduction 1385A also sponsored
11 by Council Member Ferreras-Copeland would re-
12 authorize the city's tax lien sale program for
13 another year. In addition, it would allow greater
14 flexibility with payment plans for property owners,
15 expand notifications and communication
16 requirements, mandate greater data collection and
17 reporting on the impact of a lien sale and allow
18 emergency repair charges that remain unpaid for
19 more than a year to trigger lien sale eligibility
20 for non-owner occupied one, two, and three family
21 homes. I want to thank Latonia McKinney, Raymond
22 Majewski, Emori Etta [phonetic], Rebecca Chasan,
23 Maria Enache, Jonathan Seltzer, Eric Bernstein,
24 Paul Sturm, Sheetal Deshmukh, and Rob Newman and I
25 will ask the Finance Chair Julissa Ferreras-

1
2 Copeland to say a few words followed by Council
3 Member Garodnick.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
5 you Madame Speaker. Intro 211281A will create a
6 process for the ongoing evaluation of the city's
7 economic development tax expenditure or tax break.
8 The city provides \$2.8 billion in such tax breaks
9 to encourage investment in commercial real estate,
10 create jobs, and promote investments in equipment
11 in training however we have been limited in our
12 ability to measure how well these tax breaks have
13 fared in achieving this goal. This bill will
14 improve the council's oversight of these programs,
15 help lawmakers better understand the impact of this
16 tax break and help guarantee that the public is
17 getting the best bang for their buck. This
18 legislation reflects the work of the task force on
19 economic development and tax expenditures who for
20 months work to develop a non-partisan standardized
21 process of evaluation. I'd like to publicly thank
22 Council Member Dan Garodnick for partnering with me
23 on this wonderful project. Michael Dardia, Hector
24 Figueroa, Marilyn Marks Rubin, Marvin Markus, James
25 Parrott, Seth Pinsky, Michael Simas, Javier Valdes,

1
2 and, and, and also the council staff who have
3 worked diligently and tirelessly to make sure that
4 this day would come to fruition. Thank you, thank
5 you, thank you; I can't say enough thank you's to
6 Dr. Ray Majewski, Latonia McKinney our director,
7 Maria Enache, Emori Etta, Paul Sturm, Rebecca
8 Chasan, Eric Bernstein, Sheetal Deshmukh, and Rob
9 Newman. I also want to talk about the land.. the
10 lien sale, I am proud of the reauthorization of the
11 city's lien sale program because of its reform it
12 will put in place to help safeguard property owners
13 offering flexibility in payment, offering low
14 interest rates and connecting property owners to
15 financial counseling among other improvements. This
16 is a strong and impactful bill so the Speaker and I
17 are committed to continuing to improve the lien
18 sale program so that it can help more fully protect
19 struggling property owners to that end we will
20 continue to work and I know the public advocate
21 will be introducing legislation today. So even
22 though we are reauthorizing the lien sale today
23 rest assured that our work is not over. I want to
24 thank the members of the lien task force who helped
25 get us to this improved legislation, Council

1
2 Members Cornegy, Richards, and Rose and I wish Rose
3 a speedy recovery as well as Tanisha Edwards,
4 Rabecca Chase, and Jeffrey Shear, Allen Anders,
5 Chris Allred and Joseph Murin finally thanks to my
6 Council colleagues who are joining me on a yes vote
7 today to reform... to bring reform to the tax
8 expenditures and the lien sale program and I look
9 forward to working with the finance committee to
10 continue to improve our city's economy, thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
12 much Madame Speaker. I am speaking on intro 1281
13 today. I want to give a particular thanks to the
14 finance committee Chair, Council Member Ferreras-
15 Copeland for serving as not only the chair of the
16 finance committee but as the chair of that task
17 force that she noted on tax expenditures that led
18 to this legislation. I was pleased to serve as a
19 member of that task force and it was many, many
20 hours and many, many months and needless to say we
21 owe much to your efforts for bringing us to this
22 day. As we all know New York City offers \$2.8
23 billion each year to recruit, to retain,
24 incentivize business and to create jobs. This is
25 not novel and it is not news but what we lack is a

1
2 legitimate way to evaluate whether these benefits
3 are actually working, a method to determine whether
4 or not we are simply throwing our money away. The
5 city council's action today is going to shine a
6 spotlight on the tax benefits that we offer for
7 economic development, it creates a simple blueprint
8 for evaluation. Tax expenditures that might have
9 worked at one time may no longer be necessary or
10 may even be wasteful and taxpayers deserve a
11 regular evaluation and a critical eye before we
12 allow these benefits to go on into perpetuity. With
13 our bill today, we are beginning to allow greater
14 insight on a sizable piece of our budget that is
15 functionally unable to be examined budget cycle
16 after budget cycle. It is an important step for
17 getting a better handle on the city's spending. So
18 again, I want to thank the Speaker and my
19 colleagues especially Chair Ferreras-Copeland and I
20 encourage you all to vote for this bill today,
21 thank you.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you both.
23 The final set of items being voted on today deals
24 with enhancing and establishing reporting
25 requirements for city wide public art initiatives

1
2 in culturally institutions, intro 1276B sponsored
3 by Cultural Affairs Committee Chair Jimmy Van
4 Bramer would require the New York City Art
5 Commission to submit to the mayor and the speaker a
6 report detailing data relevant to the operation of
7 the commission. The next five bills in the package
8 were jointly sponsored by Council Member Van Bramer
9 and Cumbo. Intro 865B would require the department
10 of cultural affairs to report data on the cultural
11 institutions groups performance for the previous
12 fiscal year. Intro 1290A would require an advisory
13 panel to recommend eligible works of art in a
14 project administered by DCLA in the Percent for Art
15 Program. Introduction 1295A would require the DCLA
16 to publish on its website information all works of
17 art in the Percent for Art Program and intro 1296A
18 would provide that at least one percent of the
19 first \$50 million of capital funds appropriated by
20 the city for a capital project are allocated for
21 works of art and intro 1297A which would require
22 the DCLA to engage in outreach and educational
23 efforts to inform the public about opportunities to
24 submit works of art to the Percent for Art Program.
25 Staff I want thank Aminta Kilawan, Chloe Rivera,

1
2 Aliya Ali, Nathan Toth, Ace Schaumberg [phonetic]...
3 and will ask Jimmy Van Bramer our majority leader
4 to say a few words followed by Council Member
5 Cumbo.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
7 very much Madame Speaker and it is a historic day
8 for this council and for the city council's
9 cultural affairs and libraries committee. This is
10 the largest cultural package that we have ever
11 passed and it is the most significant reforms to
12 the percent for art program since it was signed
13 into law by mayor Koch in 1982. we are also passing
14 a bill today that requires and mandates an annual
15 report by the public art commission, the public art
16 commission was formed in 1898, this is the first
17 such reporting requirement for the public art
18 commission something that many Council Members have
19 expressed and interest in because some of our
20 capital projects have been delayed at the public
21 art commission. So, I'm enormously proud to have
22 worked with Council Member Cumbo on so many of this
23 but want to salute the speaker because this package
24 put together with the work that we been doing on
25 the funding side for culture and the arts reflect

1
2 our passion for the arts and our understanding that
3 New York City is driven in large part by culture
4 and the arts. So, these six bills which create more
5 feedback in the percent for art process, allow more
6 funds to go for projects which will allow for even
7 more ambitious projects, more ambitious works of
8 public art to be displayed in every neighborhood in
9 the city of New York. We're also going to encourage
10 diversity among the percent for art commission to
11 make sure that women and people of color are
12 getting those commissioned. We're also going to
13 require transparency and reporting from the art
14 commission and the cultural institutions group
15 members which do great work but we want to make
16 sure that they're also filing an annual report that
17 speaks to how their program and services are
18 targeting those who most need culture and the arts
19 in their life and they are working to eliminate
20 barriers to access to culture and the arts.
21 Together this package represents a growing shift in
22 how this city and this council approaches and is
23 involved in the arts and culture; more
24 transparency, more diversity, more community
25 engagements and we are so proud to be a part of it.

1
2 I want to signal my thanks to the speaker because
3 over the last three years the city of New York has
4 allocated over \$500 million in cultural capital
5 funding. City council cultural initiatives are at
6 an all time high of \$25 million. Last year the city
7 of New York allocated over \$330 million for
8 cultural funding more than the entire nation at the
9 federal level if you can believe it allocates to
10 culture and the arts through the NEA. The Su Casa
11 Program is the largest senior oriented arts program
12 in the country and our cultural immigrant
13 initiative and Casa Program have exploded
14 exponentially. So, I want to thank the speaker for
15 her support on all of that and all of the pieces of
16 legislation that we're passing today. I want to
17 thank Council Member Cumbo for her passion for
18 these issues and also thank my staff, my chief of
19 staff Matt Wallace, my Deputy Chief of Staff and
20 legislative director Andres Villa, my
21 communications Director Arielle Swernoff, Matt
22 Gewolb and his entire staff have been so helpful...
23 Aminta Kilawan our Committee Council and everyone
24 who cares about culture and the arts in the city of
25 New York and all of my colleagues for supporting

1
2 this legislation, thank you very much Madame
3 Speaker.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Speaker
5 Melissa Mark-Viverito. Thank you so much Chair
6 Jimmy Van Bramer. I am so pleased today this is
7 three years in the making to pass this monumental
8 legislation that is going to impact the artistic
9 community throughout New York City. As a lifelong
10 lover and consumer of the arts and as founder of
11 Brooklyn's first museum dedicated to the African
12 Diaspora I value artistic freedom self expression
13 and the vital role that it plays within our
14 society. My legislation and partnership with
15 Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer intro's 1295, 1296
16 and 1297 is an opportunity to diversify
17 participation within the percent for art program
18 and expand our city's investment in artists who can
19 transform public spaces into our canvases that will
20 showcase their creativity and beautify our
21 neighborhoods. Since the program's inception nearly
22 300 projects have been completed with accumulated
23 artwork commissions of over \$41 million. 70 new
24 projects are currently in progress. This has been
25 going on for the last 35 years but up until today

1
2 we had not made a change to that program. Through
3 this legislation, we are going to increase
4 transparency, we're going to make sure that more
5 voices are at the table to select the public art
6 that will immortalize our contributions to the
7 cultural environment of New York City, we are going
8 to raise the threshold so that more artists are
9 getting paid what they adequately should be for
10 creating such beautiful works of art. The threshold
11 will be raised from \$400,000 a year to \$900,000 a
12 year and the amount of money will be spent will
13 increase from \$1.5 million to \$4 million a year.
14 This is a monumental change, I'm proud to be a part
15 of it and as I stated earlier at the pre-stated
16 just as an African American woman working here at
17 city hall when I walked in and I saw the beautiful
18 photographs displaying the array of diversity of
19 the New York City it validated my presence here, it
20 made me feel welcomed here and it made me feel that
21 the contributions that my people have made to the
22 city of New York are valuable. Through this
23 particular piece of legislation, I hope that we
24 will be able to immortalize more history, more
25 culture, more voices and more forms of expression

1 through this very important piece of legislation.
2 We need to make sure that women, people of color,
3 people of all backgrounds, races, and religions are
4 included in the artistic fiber of New York City.
5 Thank you so much and thank you to my colleagues
6 and I want to thank all that made this possible
7 today, thank you.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay, thank you
10 to all the Council Members and the, the legislation
11 but before I conclude I just wanted to take a
12 moment to discuss something that's very near and
13 dear to my heart and as many of you have already
14 heard that president Obama announced he was
15 commuting the sentence of Oscar Lopez Rivera. For
16 me this is a watershed moment for our island of
17 Puerto Rico and for the rest of the nation. This is
18 an issue that not only belonged to me and to also
19 the Puerto Rican people it was also belonged to a
20 greater movement that was built with solidarity
21 across communities. Noble Peace Laureates that
22 supported this campaign, Pope Francis and others
23 who believe in justice. Oscar Lopez Rivera is 74-
24 years-old, he is a Vietnam veteran, a bronze medal
25 recipient and a grandfather who has renounced to

1
2 violence and committed himself to living a peaceful
3 life but for 35 years Oscar was unjustly imprisoned
4 for his political convictions and that is what it
5 was that he was incarcerated for. He was never
6 accused of committing any harm against anyone
7 against all odds even if it was not popular we
8 organize, we rallied, and we remained unwavering in
9 our efforts to make sure Oscar would one day be
10 free. As many of you know I visited him in prison,
11 I communicate with him, I've embraced him, I stand
12 in solidarity with him and I want to thank all of
13 those who have stood up for justice and played a
14 part in this historic moment. The council which
15 overwhelmingly passed a resolution in support of
16 Oscar just a year and a half ago, the black Latino
17 nation caucus as well as the Jewish caucus for
18 their advocacy and solidarity throughout the years.
19 To congressmen Luis Gutierrez my strong ally in
20 this fight the entire Hispanic congressional
21 caucus; the mayor of San Juan Carmen Yulin Cruz,
22 Melina Valasquez, Jose Santano, and lima Muemerando
23 [phonetic who was instrumental in this battle as
24 well. Of course I want to thank Oscar himself who's
25 spirit and strength has been an inspiration to me

1
2 and to Puerto Rico and I've said that although I've
3 never been in agreement with the decision by
4 President Obama to instill an undemocratic fiscal...
5 tour boat on our... in our island that I wanted his
6 legacy to be one where people remember him for
7 having liberated Oscar and that is the memory that
8 I will have of this president when it comes to
9 issues of Puerto Rico that he brought Oscar back to
10 us and to a people that desperately needed this
11 boost at this moment so thank you very much for all
12 of you for that support, it was a very happy day
13 for me and for many of us yesterday and I thank you
14 all and with that I add communication from the
15 speaker.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Discussion of
17 general orders seeing none, reporter special
18 committees?

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
21 standing committees?

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the committee
23 on consumer affairs intro 1061 Asian Lunar New
24 Year.

25

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on
3 general orders?

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the committee
5 on Cultural affairs libraries and international
6 intergroup relations intro 865B cultural
7 institutions group?

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and
9 coupled on general orders.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1276B art
11 commission report?

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and
13 coupled on general orders.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1290A art advisory
15 panel?

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and
17 coupled on general orders.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1295A percent for
19 art projects?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and
21 coupled on general orders.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1296A percent for
23 art program?

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and
25 coupled on general orders.

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1297A public art
3 opportunities?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and
5 coupled on general orders.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the committee
7 on finance, intro 1281A evaluation of development
8 tax expenditures?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and
10 coupled on general orders.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1371 DUMBO
12 business improvement district?

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and
14 coupled on general orders.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1385A sale of tax
16 liens?

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and
18 coupled on general orders.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1352
20 expense budget?

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on
22 general orders.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the committee
24 on land use Reso 1349 Roosevelt Island operating
25 cooperation?

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on
3 general orders.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the committee
5 on technology intro 1052A agency disposal of
6 electronics?

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and
8 coupled on general orders.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the committee
10 on transportation intro 570A commuter vans?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and
12 coupled on general orders.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro, intro 860A
14 commuter van licenses?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and
16 coupled on general orders.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 861A penalties for
18 operators of commuter, commuter vans?

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and
20 coupled on general orders.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: On the general order
22 calendar resolution appointing various persons
23 commissioner of deeds?

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and
25 coupled on general orders and at this time I ask

1
2 for a full roll call on all items on the coupled
3 general order calendar. Quite in the chambers
4 please for roll call, thank you.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye and I
7 would like to congratulate the Speaker for being
8 there when fighting for the freedom of Oscar was
9 not a popular one a... but very challenging and I
10 know that it... she was there and I'm pretty sure
11 that yesterday was a big day for her and we need
12 many Oscar at... for whatever he has done for he's
13 done for his 72 years old fighting for justice in...
14 inequality and society [speaking foreign language].

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
20 except intro 1296A.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin?
24
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Congratulation to
3 all my colleagues on important legislation, I vote
4 aye on all.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: So
9 congratulations to all my colleagues on all their
10 bills today, I vote aye.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I proudly vote aye
17 and congratulations to everyone who has passed
18 legislation today.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal? Eugene?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: With
3 permission to explain my vote?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: I also
6 wanted to acknowledge and take this time, the
7 finance committee Tanisha Edwards went, went onto
8 the state, Rebecca Chasen went on to maternity
9 leave so Dr. Ray Majeski and Emori Etta really
10 stood up to the plate and insured that we were able
11 to pass a, a, a lien sale proposal that was
12 reflective of all the advocates but also took into
13 account the need for balancing a budget so I wanted
14 to publicly acknowledge them and thank them for all
15 of their tireless work and staying here till very
16 late hours to make this happen, I vote aye.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Vote aye on all
22 except for 570A, I abstain.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: With my warmest
25 congratulations to our Speaker and all of my

1
2 colleagues passing legislation today, I vote aye on
3 all.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you,
6 congratulations to the Speaker, a wonderful
7 congratulations to our majority leader and to Chair
8 Cumbo and especially to Council Members Miller and
9 Williams for their outstanding collaboration, I
10 vote aye on all.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic]
13 Aye.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to
16 explain my vote?

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I'd like to
19 congratulate Council Member Williams and Miller for
20 working together on the commuter van package, I was
21 there from the beginning and I think everyone did
22 really great work and this is what legislating is
23 really about coming together to solve a problem and
24 sometimes coming from opposing viewpoints and
25

1
2 hopefully folks in D.C. might learn a thing or two
3 from our colleagues, I proudly vote aye on all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Permission to
7 explain my vote?

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I, I vote aye on all
10 except intro 1061 which I... which I will abstain
11 from it and I want to explain this. While this bill
12 has good intentions, I'm concerned that you could
13 have unintended consequences in my district. My
14 district is really, really busy, it's the second
15 most busy district in the whole New York City and
16 with many of my district's local businesses Lunar
17 New Year... Lunar New Year makes up the bulk of the
18 income for the year while I understand the cultural
19 aspects of this bill, this bill will dangerous
20 precedent and further hurt our small businesses who
21 are already struggling to compete now if I am a
22 flower store owner I would hate this bill to pass
23 because all of a sudden I have 100's of, of
24 competitors in the area to compete with my business
25 and even though there are not too many flower

1
2 stores but we want to protect their business
3 because the bulk of the income is from Lunar New
4 Year. Imagine someone do the same thing for
5 Christmas... anyone can sell the same stuff you sell
6 on the... in the store. We pay high... they pay a high
7 rent and then face so many regulations but the
8 bill... no, I understand you have good intentions but
9 I will abstain for voting for it, thank you.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz? Lancman?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic] Aye.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: 1061.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Lander?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
17 permission to explain my vote?

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you first
20 of all just enormous not just congratulations but
21 thanks to the Speaker for you know reminding us
22 that organizing for mercy is inspiring in helping
23 restore faith in the possibilities of what
24 democratic government is about. A big
25 congratulations to Julissa and to Dan and I just

1
2 want to shout out Ray Mejeski as well, this is
3 something we have cared about in the council a long
4 time and the fact that we're taking steps forward
5 to have real transparency and the ability to
6 evaluate our economic development programs and tax
7 breaks is really critical so a big thanks to Ray,
8 Julissa, and to Dan. Congratulations to Council
9 Member Van Bramer on helping to shed some light on
10 the art public design commission which we have long
11 worked on in this chamber as well, I vote aye on
12 all.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: with congrats to
18 the sponsors of the many great pieces of
19 legislation we're voting on today I vote aye on
20 all.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Yes.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy?
24
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I'd like to vote
3 on all call ups and with permission I'd like to
4 vote on all coupled general orders and resolutions?

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye on all.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye on all.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye on all.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye on all.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye on all.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye on all
18 with congratulations to the sponsors of these
19 important pieces of legislation.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye on all.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Vacca?

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone?

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Abstain on 1061
and aye on all the rest.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I will
congratulations to all of my colleagues who have
bills and on behalf of Hector Ricketts, Leroy
Morrison, and his daughter Alexis I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal?

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Permission to
explain my vote?

SPEAKER MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote aye on
all except intro 1385a I'll vote no. The reason
being is that at this point in time in New York
city this is one of the most expensive cities to
live in the country and when the income inequality
gap is at its highest New York city should not
continue to finance itself on the backs of
struggling New Yorkers. The unfair tax lien system

1
2 that we are voting on would continue to force
3 people out of their own homes. This is especially
4 true in my district which was the hardest hit by
5 the foreclosure crisis in 2008 and continues to
6 have some of the highest rates of tax lien in the
7 city. According to reports in Brooklyn 42 percent
8 of homes that receive tax liens were sold within
9 five years compared to only 13 percent of all such
10 properties that were sold in the borough during
11 that same time. It has become impossible for
12 working class and middle class families not only to
13 buy a home but to hold onto their homes and we as a
14 body should be doing everything we can to keep them
15 in those homes. I'm tired of the speculators
16 knocking on our doors trying to take our homes and
17 we shouldn't be making it easier for those
18 predators to get a hold of those homes. Let's put
19 this to context, the city's annual budget is over
20 \$80 billion yet the tax lien sale program has only
21 generated \$1.3 billion in the past 20 years, that's
22 a drop in the bucket, that's funding that could be
23 used to help owners... help home owners rather than
24 put them out in the street that is why I vote no

1
2 today and we must do everything we can to protect
3 our middle class, thank you.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 1296, aye
6 on the rest.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito?

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay, thank you.

12 All items on today's general order calendar were
13 adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, zero
14 negative, and zero abstentions with the exception
15 of intro 1385A which was adopted by a vote of 44 in
16 the affirmative, one negative, and one abstention
17 and intro 1296A which was adopted by a vote of 43
18 in the affirmative, two negative, and zero
19 abstentions and intro 570A which was adopted by a
20 vote of 44 in the affirmative, zero negative, one
21 abstention and intro 1061A which was adopted by a
22 vote of 43 in the affirmative, zero negative, and
23 two abstentions. The revised land use call ups...
24 call ups vote is 45 in the affirmative, and zero
25 negative. Introduction and reading of bills.

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
3 referred to committee as indicated on the agenda.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We now begin... go
5 to the discussion of the resolution, quite in the
6 chambers please. The resolution reads as follows.
7 It's resolution 104, a resolution calling upon the
8 New York State united unified court system to
9 require the integrated domestic violence courts in
10 New York City to issue regular reports on batter or
11 intervention programs and it is sponsored by
12 Council Member Cabrera who now has the floor.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
14 much. We currently have no way to easily determine
15 whether these programs that you just mentioned
16 Madame Public advocate make a real difference in
17 batterers behavior. This report would allow us to
18 make sure the effectiveness of batterers
19 intervention programs, to make sure that the
20 underlying causes of domestic violence are
21 addressed and domestic violence is eliminated.
22 Adding a requirement of accountability will ensure
23 that participation in a court or intervention
24 program is meaningful and impactful and not simply
25 a procedure that the batterer must follow. I want

1
2 to thank you Madame Speaker, Council Member Cumbo
3 chair of the Committee on Women's Issue and
4 committee members, Council Member Kallos, Mealy,
5 Crowley, Koslowitz, and all the staff for your
6 support on this resolution. I encourage all my
7 colleague, colleagues to vote yes on Reso 104.
8 Thank you so much.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Seeing no other
10 speakers on the resolution all of those in favor
11 say aye?

12 [combined "aye"]

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those
14 opposed? Any abstentions, the ayes have it and now
15 to general discussion let... let me begin by ask..
16 urging my colleagues to sign onto intro 1438 a bill
17 that I am introducing sponsored... co-sponsored by
18 council member Ferreras-Copeland, Williams,
19 Reynoso, and Rosenthal. The legislation would
20 leverage the city's significant bargaining power
21 created by the tax lien sale to create and preserve
22 more affordable housing by creating a preservation
23 trust. The trust would be a new municipal debt
24 purchaser for buildings that are good candidates
25 for preservation outcomes and the trust would pay a

1
2 discounted rate to the city for outstanding
3 municipal debt and would have access to the same
4 enforcement mechanisms available to current
5 municipal debt purchasers. Basically, the city
6 could have a new tool to generate affordable
7 housing while still making money in the process.
8 The government that was created to protect us
9 should not be the entity that is breaking us and
10 that is why we must use the tax lien sale to
11 achieve this greater purpose and I urge all of my
12 colleagues to sign onto this bill. And the next
13 speaker is council member Barron.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madame
15 Public advocate. This Sunday, January the 8th was
16 the 1000th day since the capture of the girls by
17 Boko Haram and we want to make sure that we don't
18 forget them and that we continue to be vigilant and
19 keep them in the forefront. Secondly, I also
20 applaud the release that's going to be occurring on
21 may the 7th for Oscar Lopez Rivera and wish that
22 president Obama had, had the courage to also extend
23 commutation of the, of the sentence for Mumia Abu-
24 Jamal. Thirdly governor Cuomo has talked about the
25 Excelsior Scholarship which would provide for free

1
2 tuition and I believe as late as yesterday I heard
3 he is raising tuition by \$250 on a particular group
4 of people which is contradictory to what he talked
5 about when he said he wanted free tuition. As we
6 know we celebrated dr. Martin Luther King's
7 birthday recently, Monday we celebrated the day and
8 I just want to share with you one of his quotes, we
9 must rapidly begin the shift from a thing oriented
10 society to a person oriented society where machines
11 and computers, profit motives and property rights
12 are considered more important than people, the
13 giant triplets of racism, materialism, and
14 militarism are incapable of being conquered and
15 lastly I want to invite my colleagues to look at
16 Reso 1350 which calls upon the New York state
17 legislature and the governor to enact legislation
18 to require New York City and state employees to
19 forfeit their pensions when they are found to of
20 violated the law, talking about felony acts here
21 and we're trying to look to see how we can't tie it
22 to a particular point in time when those actions
23 occurred which were illegal and tie it to then so
24 that they don't perhaps lose all of their pension
25 but from the point of the felony. So, I invite you

1
2 to look at it, I'm sure we're going to have some
3 interesting discussion on it, thank you.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Council Member
5 Cornegy.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you Madame
7 Public Advocate. Almost 41 million people have
8 outstanding federal student loans as of June 2015,
9 according to federal student aid. Nearly four
10 million borrowers are now on an income driven plan,
11 double the number who participated this time last
12 year but a lot of eligible grads still don't
13 realize that they're able to tie their student loan
14 payments to their incomes or that the government
15 will help them do so for free. As student debt
16 continues to rise our nation is facing possibly a
17 student debt crisis. More and more borrowers are
18 seeking ways to get rid of their debt. Recently
19 I've learned that there are businesses profiting
20 off borrowers through student debt relief scams,
21 they're targeting the already vulnerable. Those
22 citizens who are already struggling and may be
23 unaware of the free resources to, to help them. You
24 may have seen or heard the radio ads offering lower
25 student loan monthly payments and even debt

1
2 forgiveness these scammers are calling the programs
3 the Obama Student Loan Forgiveness Program. This
4 program and others like them do not exist within
5 our federal government. The services they are
6 selling at 700 or more a pop can be obtained for
7 free. Intro 1426 is a local law to amend the
8 administrative code of the city of New York in
9 relation to banning companies that charge a fee for
10 student loan debt relief already provided by the
11 federal government and creates a private cause of
12 action for borrowers who fail to... who fall victim
13 to these scams. I have already believe that higher
14 education is a viable path to the middle class
15 therefore as a council we should not stand idly by
16 and allow a handful of predatory companies to take
17 advantage of our citizens. For this reason, I'm
18 asking you to sign on to intro 1426 and let these
19 companies know that we will not allow them to
20 continue their disreputable and dishonest business
21 practice in New York City, thank you.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
23 Council Member Gentile.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Thank you Madame
25 Public Advocate. Today with Council Member Ydanis

1
2 Rodriguez I'm introducing a bill that will reform
3 how New York City issues permits for dumpsters.
4 There is a 19 percent increase from last year and a
5 77 percent increase from 2012 and the number of
6 dumpster complaints which indicate a clear and
7 pressing problem. Constituents constantly express
8 their frustration to our offices when dumpsters
9 remain on neighborhood streets for too long
10 depriving community's already scarce parking
11 spaces. The littlest metal shoeboxes are vulnerable
12 to illegal dumping, intensifying health, safety,
13 sanitary and air quality concerns among residents.
14 Though dumpsters cannot be completely removed the
15 way in which the city issues permits for them must
16 be refined so intro 1430 will create a more
17 systematic procedure to... the, the Department of
18 Transportation's method of issuing permits.
19 Sticking with the subject of today's meetings the
20 construction debris containers for example this
21 bill will mandate that a valid DOB permit be
22 required to obtain a dumpster permit. This will
23 ensure that dumpsters are placed adjacent to lawful
24 construction sites only decreasing the thread of
25 illegal dumping and increasing accountability for

1
2 state licensed engineers and architects.
3 Additionally, the legislation will end the debus of
4 unlimited permit renewals of commercial refuse
5 containers by restricting usage to 21 days which is
6 plenty of time for the dumpster to serve its
7 purpose of a household cleanup or remodeling
8 project. All together these responsible measures
9 will ensure a more diligent process for obtaining
10 waste container permits striving towards a cleaner,
11 safer, and more manageable city so I, I urge my
12 colleagues to join me and Council Member Rodriguez
13 in co-sponsoring intro 1430, thank you.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
15 Council Member Kallos.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Good afternoon,
17 thank you Housing and Building's Chair Jumaane
18 Williams for his leadership on construction safety,
19 please sign onto his introduction, introduction
20 1447 I know I will. Today I'm also introducing two
21 bills related to construction safety, the first is
22 a reintroduction of Council Member Diana Reyna Safe
23 Jobs Act, similar to introduction 1447 that
24 requires job training around projects that happen
25 in the city over a certain size however it focuses

1
2 on projects that receive financial assistance from
3 federal, state, or city governments logic being if
4 we are giving them taxpayer dollars shouldn't they
5 be treating their employees better and actually
6 training them so that we don't have the accidents
7 we've seen. We're investing a small paltry sum of
8 only Two billion dollars a year on these
9 initiatives and the legislation would also require
10 that people on the construction sites be
11 apprentice, apprenticed at New York State
12 Department of Labor approved programs and, in
13 addition, because we've seen a lot of these
14 programs being set up without actually graduating
15 anyone, they'd actually have to graduate people to
16 actually show that the school is doing great work.
17 Another bill that I've introduced, introduction
18 1433, the first one is 1432 with Council Member
19 Rosenthal, Levine, Torres, and Crowley would force
20 the department of buildings to better count the
21 death that we're seeing at construction sites,
22 we're now over 30 in the city which is a serious
23 problem for last year and right now DOB only tracks
24 that that involve violations of the construction
25 code, OSHA tracks that that involve violations of

1
2 workplace safety all in all it's a problem because
3 if somebody is dying on a construction site that's
4 something we should be counting regardless and I
5 hope that my colleagues will sign on to all of
6 these bills 1447, 1432, 1433 and join us at what I
7 assume will be a very long and interesting hearing
8 as we try to protect our city's workers.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
10 Council Member Williams.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you, I
12 too just want to call my colleagues attention to
13 the package of legislation on the construction site
14 safety, I ask my colleagues to read all of them and
15 to sign on, I look forward to a healthy debate that
16 is focused primarily on safety of construction
17 workers. I do want to express my concern on the
18 governor's new proposal called Affordable New York
19 Housing Program that is supposed to be in
20 replacement of 421A. I want to say that, that...
21 Vickie Been from the HPD will be stepping down.
22 She's... in 2014, plans to teach at New York
23 University and serve as a faculty director of the
24 Firma Center. I wish her well and look forward to
25 working with the new commissioner Maria Torres-

1
2 Springer on creating affordable housing for New
3 Yorkers, I enjoy working with Commissioner Been, I
4 found her forthcoming and, and willing to
5 compromise in the best interest of the city. On
6 this Monday we celebrated Martin Luther King day,
7 there are many who confuse that his peaceful
8 protest as being appeasing as possible I beg to
9 differ his protests were meant to disturb the peace
10 and cause significant disruption to assist him of
11 bigotry hate and equality, this took strength and
12 conviction now more than ever we need Dr. King's
13 true revolutionary spirit in that vein I'll be
14 participating in a non-violent disruptive civil
15 disobedience on noon this Friday at Trump Tower,
16 anyone who would like to join me please let me know
17 to resist from day one anything that Trump said
18 that is an anathema to what we believe including
19 his nominees moving the Affordable Care Act, his
20 immigration policies, and criminal justice
21 policies. Lastly, I want to also say
22 congratulations to the Speaker on all the work she
23 did with Oscar Lopez that is a just commutation and
24 I look forward, hopefully, in the next few days for
25 the same for... and others, thank you.

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Jumaane if you
3 need a lawyer Friday call me. Reality show star;
4 Eric Ulrich.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you, thank
6 you Madame Public Advocate. Thank you. There are no
7 cameras today, but I am happy to rise and bring to
8 your attention, if you have not already realized,
9 that we are joined today by an ex-member of the
10 state legislature who is my friend and he.. I know
11 he just made his grand entrance into the chamber,
12 Phil Goldfeder who now works for Yeshiva
13 University. He was my former assemblymen who
14 represented pretty much almost all of my district,
15 we overlap with the exception of Woodhaven and
16 Richmond Hill. He did a phenomenal job, was a very
17 hard working elected official and I'm glad that
18 he's here because Councilwoman Koslowitz is going
19 to introduce some funding for the QueensWay and I
20 know how much Phil Goldfeder loves the QueensWay
21 project. And she's very happy to see him too today
22 apparently but anyway... No, Phil was a great for... is
23 a great friend, was a great assemblyman. I was
24 very, very close to him. I still am. And he did a
25 phenomenal job. He's been replaced by Assemblywoman

1
2 Stacey Pheffer Amato, Audrey Pheffer's daughter
3 coincidentally, and she's actually having a
4 swearing in which we'll be attending this weekend.
5 I'm very proud to work with some really great
6 partners in the state legislature that overlap in
7 my district, I'm sure many of you have that
8 opportunity as well but I just wanted to let you
9 all know there's life after death and that public
10 service apparently does take a toll on you, Phil is
11 a little greyer today than when he was first sworn
12 into office but he says he sees his kids a lot more
13 and I'm sure that we, we could all probably benefit
14 from spending some more time with our families but
15 he did a great job, it's great to see him and you
16 never know he might be back one day because you
17 know we're term limited and who knows where he's
18 going to live and what the districts will look like
19 but anyway Phil thank you for coming, we'll see you
20 soon, thank you again, thank you.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Welcome and
22 congratulations assembly member Goldfeder you look
23 so much more happier. Council Member Chin.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Madame
25 Public Advocate. Good afternoon. I want to draw my

1
2 colleagues attention to three pieces of
3 legislation, Intro 1421 crane GPS, intro 1422 crane
4 wind restriction, and intro 1423 sidewalk sheds.
5 Sidewalk sheds are supposed to protect us when
6 buildings are being constructed, demolished or
7 going through a renovation however when they remain
8 up year after year they not only become eyesore
9 they become a major source of security and quality
10 of life concern. Worst of all we have very little
11 information about these sidewalk sheds intro 1423
12 requires the Department of Buildings to create a
13 public report that contains information about each
14 permitted sidewalk shed. We hope intro 1423 will
15 empower elected official and community leaders to
16 hold the parties responsible for sidewalk sheds
17 that stays up year after year long after the work
18 that made them necessary has been completed. The
19 other two bills that I'm introducing today address
20 another serious issue one that results in tragedy
21 for too many workers and residents. The tragic
22 crane collapse in Tribeca of Worth Street in my
23 council district was a horrible reminder of the
24 danger posed by increase in construction throughout
25 our city. That is why I am proud to stand with our

1
2 speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, borough president
3 Gail Brewer and my Council colleagues to introduce
4 a package of legislation to ensure these crane
5 safety measures are in place. My bill intro 1421
6 will require all cranes to have GPS device equipped
7 to allow inspector to easily find the cranes and
8 ensure real time audits. Additionally intro 1422
9 will require cranes to provide safeguards for the
10 public and adjoining properties when the wind
11 speeds exceeds 20 miles per hour. I want to thank
12 Council Staff for their hard work on this bill and
13 I encourage my colleagues to sign on, thank you.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
15 Council Member Cabrera.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
17 much Madame Public Advocate. Today I'm introducing
18 bill 1420 along with Council Member Cumbo which
19 regulates the use of conductor electrical weapons
20 known as many as taser. The bill will require the
21 NYPD to provide all appropriate personnel a
22 conducted electrical weapon and to train such
23 personnel in the proper use of the weapon. The bill
24 also requires on their reporting to include total
25 number of conductor... conducted electrical weapons

1
2 issue, number of department personnel trained in
3 the use of the weapon, and the number of trainee
4 hours provided, the number of instances in which
5 the department personnel used the weapons not
6 including training and rate and severity of
7 injuries to civilians resulting from the use of the
8 weapon. This information is to be desegregated by
9 precinct and other unit to which the officer is
10 assigned. I encourage all my colleagues to sign on
11 to bill 1420, thank you so much.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
13 Council Member Mendez.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you Madame
15 Public Advocate first I want to give a shout out to
16 Council Member Chin for her legislation today that
17 will go a long way in our communities for people to
18 be able to purchase flowers and plants anywhere in
19 our districts and also to Speaker Melissa Mark-
20 Viverito thank you for all of your work, for Oscar
21 Lopez Rivera and everyone's whose worked on this
22 issue [speaking Spanish] Oscar. Oscar, [speaking
23 Spanish]. [speaking Spanish] Thank you Madame
24 Speaker and thank you Madame Public Advocate.

25

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Council Member
3 Treyger?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you Public
5 Advocate. Colleagues I respectfully request your
6 support of Intro 1444 which would require that
7 workers on construction sites receive onsite site
8 specific safety training. Construction job sites
9 while a routine necessity of life in a growing
10 metropolis are fraught with potential safety
11 hazards for both those who ply their trade and earn
12 a living on these sites as well as the public
13 living in a city consistently strewn with countless
14 active construction projects. There is no doubt
15 that requiring safety training on site for workers
16 responsible for such potentially dangerous work is
17 a no brainer yet until now no such safety training
18 was mandatory and we have seen 31 laborers lose
19 their lives due to onsite accidents over the last
20 two years. As our city sees record spending on
21 development it has never been more important to
22 ensure that safety precautions are in place. That
23 is why I am proud to sponsor this common-sense
24 legislation that will make such training a
25 requirement. This bill will ensure that anyone

1
2 working on a construction site receives the proper
3 safety training so that they are prepared to
4 complete the task they are responsible for in the
5 safest possible manner. Furthermore, requiring
6 developers in construction companies to make such
7 training available in a language that their workers
8 understand means that none of our wonderfully
9 diverse cities building site workers are denied
10 this fundamental training that will serve to better
11 protect their safety as well as that of all New
12 Yorkers. I'd like to thank Speaker Melissa Mark-
13 Viverito for her leadership on, on, on this issue
14 and in the push to ensure the safety of New
15 Yorkers, thank you.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Council Member
17 Levin?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you Madame
19 Public Advocate. Today I am pleased to introduce
20 legislation with Council Member Johnson to
21 strengthen and extend reporting on the detection or
22 remediation of polychlorinated biphenyls or PCB's
23 in New York City schools. PCB's are a known
24 carcinogen that were commonly used in construction
25 materials such as caulking and light fixtures until

1
2 they were banned in 1979 although systemic the
3 systematic testing have... has not yet been done to
4 verify the presence of PCB's the chemical is
5 suspected to be present in caulking, it was
6 obviously in lighting ballasts and... it was on... been
7 found to be in soil and heating ventilations
8 including systems in over 700 New York City
9 schools. Exposure to heightened levels of PCB's may
10 result in adverse health effects especially for
11 young children at a critical period of neurological
12 development. New York families deserve to know
13 where and when PCB's are found in their schools and
14 be assured that the city is taking swift action to
15 protect their health. Intro 1434 ensures that
16 parents, educators, and Council Members are
17 notified of the presence of PCB's contaminated
18 materials and the city's plan for removal to keep
19 them safe and I want to thank Health Committee
20 Chair Corey Johnson for co-sponsoring this
21 legislation and I want to extend my gratitude to
22 New York Lawyers for the Public Interest especially
23 Rachel Spector and Christine Appah for their
24 steadfast dedication to help finding and
25 identifying solutions to address this health

1
2 concern. Additionally, I would like to thank
3 council staff for your tireless work on this issue
4 especially to Alexis Swazenberg [sp?] for the
5 extensive research that went into drafting this
6 bill, to my legislator director Julie Bero,
7 Communications Director Ed Paulino, and Chief of
8 Staff Jonothan Boucher. We at this council did
9 legislation a number of years ago in the previous
10 term on PCB's in the lighting fixtures and lighting
11 ballasts in New York City schools it had a
12 tremendous impact, I was proud to be the sponsor of
13 that legislation and I was proud to have my
14 colleagues work with me. I know Council Member
15 Barron I remember going out to East New York and...
16 at a press conference with Council Member Charles
17 Barron at the time, Assemblymember Barron, on the
18 issue and we need to continue to advocate for a
19 total remediation of PCB's in our schools, they
20 have no place in our schools and we must stop at
21 nothing to ensure that they're removed and that
22 health impact...

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: ...Thank you...

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...Is removed from
25 our children's future, thank you.

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
3 Member. Council Member Johnson?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: With permission
5 to vote on all orders on the general order calendar
6 and call ups I would like to vote yes on all, thank
7 you very much.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes, thank you.
9 Council Member Lander to close?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madame
11 Public Advocate. As members of this body may have
12 seen the New York state senate voted yesterday to
13 nullify or I guess proactively retroactively
14 preempt the plastic bag bill that was passed in
15 this chamber. I know we had a robust debate in this
16 chamber, we had two great hearings, we listened to
17 each other, we adjusted that bill, we dropped the
18 fee from ten cents to five cents, we extended the
19 time, we exempted people on SNAP and WIC, we did a
20 massive increase in the number of bags to be given
21 away, we took a lot of thought. What I would ask
22 today is that however you voted on that bill
23 whether you voted in favor of it or against it, it
24 is of grave concern what the legislature is doing.
25 They have dressed up what I think is a special law

1
2 of dubious legality and dressed it up as a general
3 law, Suffolk county passed the same bill as we did,
4 Long Beach and Nassau passed the same bill as we
5 did, those would not preempted by what the state
6 legislature is doing, they are specifically
7 targeting New York City with an illegal special law
8 and I submit to you whatever you thought of the
9 plastic bag bill if they do this here what would
10 they not do it on, every single bill this council
11 passes will be subject to the legislature specific
12 overturning if they disagree with us. It is
13 remarkable to me that at this time with Trump and
14 Scott Pruitt at the EPA rolling back environmental
15 regulations that Albany can't figure out how to
16 spend the \$2 billion on affordable housing, how to
17 make progress on ethics and instead are going to
18 overturn a law that we democratically adopted after
19 a lot of thoughtful debate and that has worked in
20 hundreds of cities around the country so I would
21 just urge you whether you support it or you didn't
22 support it think about giving a call to your
23 assembly member and saying you know what I
24 supported this or I opposed it but we debated it,
25 we passed it, let it go into effect and see how it

1
2 works, don't make the job of the New York state
3 legislature looking to Trump the New York City
4 council. Thank you very much Madame Public
5 Advocate.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. all
7 today's... all items on today's general order
8 calendar were adopted by a vote of 46 in the
9 affirmative, zero negatives, zero abstentions with
10 the exception of 1385A which was adopted by a vote
11 of 45 in the affirmative, one negative, and zero
12 abstentions and we're still in session, keep it
13 down, keep it down. Thank you and Intro 1296A which
14 was adopted by a vote of 44 in the affirmative, two
15 negative, zero abstentions and Intro 570A which was
16 adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, zero
17 negative, one abstentions and Intro 1061A which was
18 adopted by a vote of 44 in the affirmative, zero,
19 zero negative, two abstentions and the revised land
20 use call ups; 46 in... 46 in the affirmative, zero
21 negative, and now closing remarks by the Speaker
22 Melissa Mark-Viverito, quite in the chambers
23 please.

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Now again thank,
thank you to all, have a great rest of the
afternoon and we're adjourned.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, state
adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 23, 2017