

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING,
DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS

----- X

December 1, 2016
Start: 1:00 p.m.
Recess:

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Room

B E F O R E: INEZ E. DICKENS

COUNCIL MEMBERS: DARLENE MEALY
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
ANDREW COHEN
MARK TREYGER

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

ARTI PEARSON

Director of land use

NADJA RATCLIFFE

Director of homeownership programs at HPD

CHRISTOPHER ILLUM

Vice president of home ownership and family
services at Habitat for Humanity New York City

1
2 Check one, two, one two. Today's date is
3 December 1st, 2016. This is a subcommittee meeting on
4 planning dispositions and concessions being recorded
5 by Allen Shoo.

6 [gavel]

7 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Good afternoon, I
8 am Council Member Inez E. Dickens of the subcommittee
9 on planning dispositions and concessions and I
10 welcome everyone to today's hearing and I want to
11 thank and acknowledge my sergeant in arms, Allen
12 Shoo. I first want to apologize to everyone for the
13 lateness but this is the people's house that we serve
14 in and our council members tried to negotiate to the
15 best of their abilities what is needed in their
16 respective districts and so there was an issue that
17 was raised that had to be negotiated and I want to
18 thank my colleagues for their patience and
19 understanding and, and continuing to be available. I
20 want to thank my land use director Raju Mann, deputy
21 director Amy Levitan and my attorney Julie Lubin and
22 Dillon Casey and I say both of them even though
23 Dillon sticks it out with me all the time and project
24 managers Jeff Ewin and Liz Lee. We are joined today
25 by Council Members on the subcommittee Andy Cohen,

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

5

3 Darlene Mealy, Mark Treyger, and Ydanis Rodriguez, oh
4 my god 100 percent attendance. Whoo, we giving out
5 gold stars all day today. I want to thank you again
6 and I want to thank the public and apologize to the
7 public and to HPD for their, their patience in this
8 and for habitat for agreeing to stay here to see this
9 through and that shows a commitment on your behalf.
10 We have six items on our calendar today. We are
11 holding hearings on five of the applications before
12 us because the sixth item was laid over from our last
13 hearing. Today's hearings are on the following
14 applications. For phase two through six of the small
15 homes rehab NYCHA slash HFH land use items 535
16 through 539. I am now going to open up the public
17 hearing for small homes rehab NYCHA slash HFH phase
18 two through six land use items five through five
19 through five through nine. These applications are
20 located in Council Member Lancman, Miller, Richard,
21 and Will's district in Queens and Council Member
22 Darlene Mealy's district in Brooklyn. Each
23 application is by HPD for approval of an urban
24 development action area project and tax exemption.
25 Approval of these actions would facilitate the
rehabilitation and sale of a 20 single family home

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

6

3 currently owned by NYCHA and these homes would be
4 available for sale and affordable to families making
5 between 50 and 80 percent of the area median income.
6 I'm going to ask Arti [sp?] Pearson, director of land
7 use at HPD to come up. Nadja Ratcliffe, director of
8 small homes rehab programs at HPD, Christopher Illum,
9 Habitat for Humanity New York City and you're going
10 to give testimony on all of the five items. Alright,
11 please identify yourselves; turn on your mics, thank
12 you.

13 ARTI PEARSON: I'm Arti Pearson, director
14 of land use [inaudible 4:17] governmental relations.

15 NADJA RATCLIFFE: Hi, Nadja Ratcliffe,
16 director for homeownership programs at HPD.

17 CHRISTOPHER ILLUM: Christopher Illum vice
18 president of home ownership and family services at
19 Habitat for Humanity New York City.

20 ARTI PEARSON: Land use numbers 535, 536,
21 537, 538, and 539 consist of a, a total of 20 small
22 homes slated for redevelopment under HPD small homes
23 and rehab NYCHA programs. Land use number 535 is
24 located in council district 24 and consists of one
25 home. Land use number 536 is located in council
district 27 and consists of seven homes. Land use

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

7

3 number 537 is located in council district 28 and
4 consists of four homes. Land use number 538 is
5 located in council district 31 and consists of five
6 homes and land use number 539 is located council
7 district 41 and consists of three homes. Each home
8 was foreclosed upon more than 20 years ago as a
9 result of FHA mortgage default and they were turned
10 over to NYCHA to operate as part of their public
11 housing portfolio by HUD. Over time the homes became
12 vacant and are currently in dire need of
13 rehabilitation. NYCHA with approval from HUD selected
14 Habitat for Humanity as the sponsor to convey the
15 properties to and each will undergo gut
16 rehabilitation through the small homes rehab NYCHA
17 program which is a home ownership program for one to
18 family homes affordable to families earning up to 80
19 percent of AMI as per HUD guidelines. This group of
20 buildings is a second closing for habitat with the
21 program. Of the 20 homes, 17 are located within
22 Queens, council districts 24, 27, 28, and 31 and
23 three are in Brooklyn council district 41. Once the
24 homes have completed rehabilitation the properties
25 will be conveyed to low to moderate income families
earning between 50 and 80 percent of AMI with sales

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

8

3 prices averaging \$328,000. In addition the sponsor is
4 committed to conducting marketing outreach events in
5 the community where the homes are located in order to
6 reach as many potential local applicants as possible
7 including NYCHA residents as well as provide
8 information for first time home buyers in an effort
9 to help prepare for eventual home ownership. Today HP
10 is before the planning subcommittee seeking tax
11 benefits in order to offer the homes at affordable
12 purchase price to potential purchasers as well as
13 provide longer term affordability over the years. We
14 are available to answer any questions that you might
15 have.

16 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you so much
17 Arti do... does anybody... I'd like to hear something
18 from Christopher.

19 CHRISTOPHER ILLUM: I'm here to answer
20 any questions you may have about our... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Alright, no... the...
22 let me ask you, the council members because I'm going
23 to ask Council Member Mealy to give a statement about
24 her district but Council Members Lancman, Miller,
25 Richards, and Wills are they all in agreement?

ARTI PEARSON: Yes.

3 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Alright. Council
4 Member Mealy?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you madam
6 Chair. I want to thank my colleagues for staying a
7 little late and we do have a great quorum now. I want
8 to thank Habitat for Humanity. I just was thinking
9 that Habitat for Humanity was about sweat equity and
10 making sure people get affordable housing and I'm
11 glad that you was able to help me and produce in that
12 for my district, that's for community board nine and
13 community board 17 and with these one family home
14 ownerships now I believe our community no matter what
15 needs to me affordable housing is prosperity and to
16 get it at this economic time where everything is
17 skyrocketing I really appreciate this, I know I took
18 you through something but just know that the
19 community will appreciate this having a one family
20 house for 250,000 can, can go a long way for one home
21 owner and I just hope that... I will try to make sure
22 that they get the home ownership training, we didn't
23 talk about that as of yet, do you, do you all have
24 that in this package, could you explain... [cross-talk]

25 CHRISTOPHER ILLUM: Yes... [cross-talk]

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: That please, thank
4 you.

5 CHRISTOPHER ILLUM: I would be happy to.
6 And, and thank you so much for, for your words. So
7 Habitat for Humanity in New York City mandates at
8 minimum always the first time home buyer program for
9 a single family homeowners versus normally we do
10 multi-family but for single family homeowners they'll
11 also go through credibility workshops focusing on
12 personal finance, the importance of maintaining good
13 credit, proper credit, appropriate credit for not
14 only the time in which they are qualifying for the
15 home they're going through underwriting but on... well
16 into the future. Habitat for Humanity in New York
17 City also provides training on home maintenance so
18 that way they're... the families who are purchasing
19 this know how to care for their home to maintain the
20 home but also to make any minor improvements they may
21 choose to do so without having to always go out and
22 you know hire a contractor to do so.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Can I just ask
24 one... and I know we've been here long enough. Home
25 maintenance is different when it's multiple homes;
this is a one family single...

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

3 CHRISTOPHER ILLUM: Yes...

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So will you have
5 different...

6 CHRISTOPHER ILLUM: Yes, we... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Maintenance...
8 [cross-talk]

9 CHRISTOPHER ILLUM: Have a different... we...
10 yes, that's exactly right. So the home maintenance
11 training that we will do is based solely on the, the
12 systems that are in each individual home so they'll
13 be trained about their boiler, they'll be trained
14 about proper caring for their gutters, leaders... that...
15 those are major problems that can happen for single
16 family homes. So we have a team in place as well as
17 we often work with community based organizations to
18 get such training.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you, just
20 want to say thank you madam Chair for being so
21 patient that's why you the queen.

22 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you. Thank
23 you so much council member. I too, I want to enter to
24 the record the letter from Habitat from Humanity
25 which spells out what the purchase... the approximate
projected sales price of the homes would be and the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

3 AMI's which is in accordance with Council Member
4 Mealy's negotiating skills. I too want to join in
5 thanking Habitat for Humanity's Matthew Dunbar,
6 Christopher Illum and Michael Gilliard for agreeing
7 to, to negotiate and listen to the council member and
8 I appreciate the fact that even though it's not my
9 district I take the prerogative as the chair of this
10 committee to help to navigate and negotiate on behalf
11 of the colleagues of... in this institution and
12 particularly on my committee. So I wanted to thank
13 all of you for agreeing to that because you didn't...
14 you, you, you could of taken a little harder stance
15 and... which would of forced us to look at it a little
16 differently. So I, I want to thank you and
17 acknowledge that and enter for the record please to
18 my attorney, thank you so much. That... are there any
19 questions from the public, uh seeing that there are
20 any of my colleagues have any questions that they... or
21 statements that they would like to say or ask about?
22 I see none, I'm now going to close the public hearing
23 on land use items 535 through 539 that we will be
24 voting on all projects that we've heard today and we
25 will also be voting on land use item 525 PRC Fox
Street Maria Estela which we held a hearing on at our

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

3 last hearing. I know for the record that all
4 applications that we are voting on today have the
5 full support of the council members as well as my
6 support. I am now coupling land use items 525, 535,
7 536, 537, 538, and 539 at... for a vote to approve. I
8 will now call on my counsel to call the roll on a
9 vote to approve.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: CHAIRPERSON DICKENS
11 Dickens?

12 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: I vote aye on all.

13 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Mealy?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: May I explain my
15 vote? I forgot to mention... [cross-talk]

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Please... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: just to let the
18 constituent know for a two bedroom apartment in
19 Corona Heights, \$375,000 for a one family house, for
20 a next two bedroom apartment... two bedroom home,
21 \$250,000 and a three bedroom one family home for
22 \$315,000 that's a good price for that, that area so I
23 just want to say thank you and I vote aye on all.

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member
25 Rodriguez?

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye and I
4 would like also to take this opportunity to
5 congratulate my chief of staff, [inaudible 13:15] of
6 the council.

7 FEMALE: I'm going to... hold on that
8 because I had something to say about that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye nay... I
10 vote aye. She's actually going to be joining our
11 chair and I thinking as a new assembly woman too.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Cohen?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I vote aye.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member
15 Treyger?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Just a brief
17 explanation of my vote, I just want to commend my
18 colleague Council Member Joey Mealy was also my co-
19 chair of the Brooklyn delegation for doing some
20 really good work in her, in her district and making
21 sure that this affordability discussion also reaches
22 home ownership which is and, and, and again my view
23 the view of many that is how we provide opportunities
24 for [inaudible 14:12] mobility for residents to build
25 equity in the communities that they have poured their
hearts and soul into and it's painful when you keep

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

3 reading stories of people being displaced and priced
4 out of their neighborhoods helping build those
5 neighborhoods and they never were able to really
6 prosper from that growth. She has insured that her
7 residents now will have a stake in a seat at the
8 table and I, and I... I also want to commend Habitat
9 for Humanity because they've really championed this
10 cause in this issue as well and I think it's very
11 fitting for the chair of this committee as she is
12 nearing the end of her counsel tenure and beginning
13 soon her tenure in the assembly to really do today
14 what she's done throughout her tenure in the council
15 having the member's backed and making sure that we
16 are negotiating in good faith on behalf of the
17 residents that we serve every day. She has personally
18 been involved in so many of these land use agreements
19 to make sure that all residents and I repeat all
20 residents have access to affordable housing, quality
21 affordable housing, she has asked all the right
22 questions, she has held people accountable, agencies
23 as well even though she's... she can be very sweet, she
24 can be very equally as tough and so I... I think she
25 has been a champion for us here in the council on

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

3 this very important issue and I commend her for her
4 leadership, thank you and I vote aye.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: By a vote of five in
6 the affirmative, zero in the negative, and zero
7 abstentions land use items 525, 535, 536, 537, 538,
8 and 539 are approved and referred to the full land
9 use committee.

10 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: Thank you so much
11 and I wanted to... wanted to acknowledge that former
12 staff as of today will be now the assemblywoman to
13 represent the 72nd assembly district in Manhattan and
14 although we've been working together for the last few
15 years we will continue to work together on a state
16 level and I wanted to congratulate her publicly and
17 that's a assembly member elect Carmen Delarosa of the
18 72nd assembly district. Please give her a hand.

19 [applause]

20 CHAIRPERSON DICKENS: I want to thank the
21 members of the public, I want to thank my colleagues,
22 my personal staff the council and the land use staff
23 for attending today's hearing. I see that the chair
24 of land use, council member and chair David
25 Greenfield has joined us and I want to thank all of
you for your patience and understanding as we

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
2 CONCESSIONS

3 navigated and negotiated this. Again thank you and
4 this meeting is hereby adjourned.

5 [gavel]

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 14, 2016