

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

May 25, 2016
Start: 1:40 p.m.
Recess: 3:50 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chamber - City Hall

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES
Public Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Inez E. Dickens
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Daniel R. Garodnick
Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson
David G. Greenfield

Barry S. Grodenchik
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Apostle E. C. Dorsey, Pastor
Tehillah Word Ministries
220-10 131st Avenue, Laurelton, N.Y. 11413

2 [sound check, pause]

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We're going to
4 get started with ceremonials. We've got three today.
5 The first one, if we can ask Girls Who Code to come
6 on up. We have Council Member Mark Levine who is
7 giving a proclamation to Girls Who Code, honoring the
8 art--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: [off mic] Come,
10 come, come, come, come, come.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We want people to
12 see you. An organization of six to close the gender
13 gap in technology and engineering sectors. We're
14 very, very appreciative of your work, and I will
15 hand it off to our colleague.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Well, thank you,
17 Madam Speaker, and you have been an incredible leader
18 on empowering women and girls, and that absolutely
19 must include giving them access to the number one
20 career of the future, which is computer science and
21 computer coding. And the sad reality is that far,
22 far, far too few computer science professionals today
23 are women. I believe only 18% of people graduating
24 with computer science degrees are women. That's half
25 what it was a couple decades ago. We can do better.

2 We must do better, and Girls Who Code has hit upon a
3 winning formula, providing incredible role models,
4 real life experience, and showing girls that they can
5 succeed at this important work, and I'm so pleased
6 today that we are joined by the founder of Girls Who
7 Code, Resh--Reshma Saujani we'll be hearing from in a
8 moment, known to many of you [applause] whose vision
9 it was to empower girls and young women, not just in
10 New York City but now nationally, and we're going to
11 hear from you in a second. But I would like to ask
12 our Committee Clerk, if he could, to read this
13 incredible proclamation to us.

14 CLERK: Council City of New York
15 Proclamation.

16 Whereas, the Council of the City of New
17 York is proud to honor Girls Who Code for its
18 excellent commitment and contributions to closing the
19 gender gap in technology; and

20 Whereas, thanks to the incredible
21 strength, resilience and sacrifice of many previous
22 generations, women and girls in America have greater
23 opportunities and more representation than ever
24 before. Despite this enormous progress, women,
25 roughly half the population, not only remain under-

2 represented in technology and other fields, but they
3 also lack the encouragement to pursue such fields.
4 In 1984, 37% of all computer science graduates were
5 women, but today that number is just 18%, close to a
6 quarter of all advance placement computer science
7 test takers are female, and 0.4% of high school girls
8 express interest in majoring in computer science; and

9 Whereas, Girls Who Code was founded in
10 2012 by its current CEO Reshma Saujani, the former
11 Deputy Public Advocate of New York City and the first
12 South Asian woman to run for Congress. Ms. Saujani
13 has worked tirelessly for years galvanizing industry
14 leaders to close the gender gap in science
15 technology, engineering and mathematics, STEM
16 education and empower women and girls to pursue
17 careers in technology and engineering for years; and

18 Whereas, Girls Who Code inspires,
19 educates and equips young women with the computing
20 skills to pursue computer science by exposing them to
21 real life and on to being role models. It engages
22 engineers, developers, executives, and entrepreneurs
23 to teach and motivate the next generation. With
24 guest speakers, mentors and instructors who are
25 leaders in their fields, Girls Who Code provides a

2 singular pairing of high quality instruction in
3 programming fundamentals, we development and design,
4 mobile development and robotics with exposure to real
5 world technology companies that is unmatched by any
6 other program; and

7 Whereas, since Ms. Saujani founded Girls
8 Who Code just four years ago, it has served almost
9 4,000 girls in 29 states. With more girls exposed to
10 computer science at a young age, more women will soon
11 be trailbraze--blazing in the technology and
12 engineering fields; and

13 Whereas, the U.S. Department of Labor
14 projects that by 2020 there will be 1.4 million
15 computer specialists job opening. To reach gender
16 parity by 2020, women must fill half of these
17 positions or 700,000 computing jobs. Girls Who Code
18 has set out to teach. Twenty-five percent of those
19 young women needed to realize gender parity,
20 providing computer science education and exposure to
21 one million young women by 2020.

22 Now, therefore, be it known that the
23 Council of the City of New York is proud to honor
24 Girls Who Code for closing the gender gap in
25 technology and equipping young women with the 21st

2 Century tools for innovation and social change.
3 Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the Entire
4 Council, Mark D. Levine, Council Member, 7th
5 District, Manhattan. [cheers/applause]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: You know, I--I
7 didn't point out that all these women up here are
8 themselves experienced coders. They are serving as
9 role models to other young women. So together with
10 the incredible leadership of Reshma, we're just so
11 grateful for all of you. [background comments] Whoo,
12 I like the sound of that. [laughter] All right,
13 here I'll hold this if you want to say a few words.

14 RESHMA SAUJANI: I'm just going to be
15 really brief. I want to thank the Speaker and thank
16 Councilman Levine. We've had numerous conversations
17 about the exciting effort that's happening through
18 your Girls Initiative, through CS for all in the
19 city, and how do we--should we get it to every single
20 child. When we started Girls Who Code, we started
21 with 20 girls in New York City. Over a thousand
22 girls have gone through our Summer Immersion Program
23 in New York City alone, and we have 89 clubs across
24 New York City. We're going to reach 40,000 women
25 nationally in all 50 states, and so we've had

2 tremendous, tremendous growth. We celebrated our
3 first clubs graduation yesterday. They were two
4 middle-school girls who were literally in seventh
5 grade stood up and demonstrated a technical
6 innovation that they built to help fight against lead
7 poisoning in Flint, Michigan. Like that's what's
8 happening. You know, whether it's climate change,
9 recycling like our girls are solving problems, and
10 I'm really grateful for the support, and for--for
11 recognizing the team and the girls today. So thank
12 you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you,
14 actually. Thank you everybody. Let's do some
15 pictures. [cheers/applause] All right. [background
16 comments, pause]

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Congratulations
18 to all of you. Good luck. Thank you. Okay, the
19 second ceremonial our Majority Leader Jimmy Van
20 Bramer. I think we're also asking Gentile, right--
21 and Koo and King and Koo is here with us--to--to come
22 up here. So this is honoring the New York City
23 Neighborhood Library Award Winners. Anybody for that
24 ceremonial, please come on up. So I'm going to hand
25 it off to our Majority Leader, and then we'll hand it

2 off to our Library Subcommittee Chair and--and then
3 Gentile, right? Okay, so I'm going to hand it off to
4 Majority Leader Van Bramer.

5 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
6 very much, Madam Speaker, and as all of the libraries
7 who have been selected as finalists for the New York
8 City Neighborhood Library Awards come forward, and
9 all of the staff members and representatives who are
10 here. I want to welcome our colleagues and--and
11 mention that each year this amazing competition
12 exists where folks get to nominate their favorite
13 libraries--

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic]
15 [interposing] Come on in, come one in.

16 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: --and
17 library staff. Come in everyone from the libraries.
18 Come close. Come in. All those shirts, and we are
19 so thrilled that the following libraries are here,
20 and have been selected as finalists. The Dyker
21 Library represented by Council Member Gentile.
22 [cheers/applause] The Kings Day Library represented
23 by Council Member Deutsch. The Sunset Park Library
24 represented by Council Member Menchaca.
25 [cheers/applause] The--this was very smart. The

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 11
2 Aguilar Library represented by Speaker Melissa Mark-
3 Viverito. [cheers/applause] The Forth Washington
4 Library represented--represented by Council Member
5 Ydanis Rodriguez. [cheers/applause] Also the Inwood
6 Library represented by Council Member Rodriguez. The
7 Morrisania Library rep by--represented by Council
8 Member Gibson [cheers/applause] and two from Council
9 Member Richards' district. [cheers/applause] The
10 Auburn Library all the way from Auburn and the Far
11 Rockaway Library. [cheers/applause] And Council
12 Member Grodenchik has the Glen Oaks Library
13 represented here as well. We're thrilled to have the
14 presidency of the Queens Library Dennis Walcott with
15 us, and Julie Sandorf from the Revson Foundation who
16 does so much for libraries and she'll speaking on
17 behalf of everybody. But I know I just want to speak
18 on behalf of all of us. We at the City Council love
19 and appreciate our libraries. We value library
20 workers so much for their support, and I'm very
21 proud, very proud to serve with this Speaker in this
22 City Council, which I believe is on record as the
23 most supportive of our public library of just about
24 any city council in the history of the city of New
25 York. [cheers/applause] So thank you for all you

2 do. Good luck and I'm going to pass it over to our
3 Chair of the Select Committee on Libraries, Council
4 Member Andy King.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you, Mr.
6 Chair and to everyone and Madam Speaker, thank you
7 for all your support and energy and helping us making
8 our children have better opportunities to access to
9 reading. To all our librarians, to all our branches
10 even though you are the ten that's selected today, we
11 still have a host of libraries across the city of New
12 York who are one team in making sure that our system
13 works well as a hub for our neighborhoods, as an
14 inspiration to others, and just an opportunity for
15 our New Yorkers to improve themselves. Libraries
16 definitely are the pinnacle of where we stand as New
17 York City. So I am thankful and grateful for all the
18 work they do, and keep on shining bright, and more
19 importantly, keep on wearing that orange. You all
20 look good. [laughs] [applause]

21 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: And a great
22 lover of libraries, and the first ever chair of the
23 Select Committee on Libraries Council Member Gentile.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Thank you.
25 Thank you, Council Van Bramer. You know, libraries

2 are so much about neighborhoods. Wherever you are,
3 libraries are about neighborhoods. So the fact that
4 all of you are here today as winners of the
5 Neighborhood Library Award means you're the cream of
6 the crop, right? You're the best of the best, and we
7 want to be able to say thank you, and we do that
8 today. Keep up the good work. Thank you all very
9 much. [applause]

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Right, and we can
11 read the proclamation. By chance--I think this
12 actually one of the shortest proclamation [background
13 comments] that I've seen.

14 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: There's so
15 many names.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So many names
17 attached. That's the importance of our libraries.
18 Go ahead.

19 CLERK: Council City of New York
20 Proclamation. The Council of the City of New York is
21 proud to honor ten neighborhood libraries that have
22 distinguished themselves as 2016 NYC Neighborhood
23 Award Finalists; and

24 Whereas, we are a city proud to have
25 three excellent public library systems, the Queens

2 Library, the Brooklyn Public Library and the New York
3 Public Library, which provide access to knowledge,
4 programs and resources to the community. Ten of our
5 207 branches have truly excelled in their efforts to
6 become finalists for the NYC Neighborhood Library
7 Awards; and

8 Whereas, the ten finalists are determined
9 by patrons' nominations, data on circulation and
10 program attendance, visits to see the branches in
11 action and the recommendations of a philanthropic
12 review committee. Each of the ten finalist branches
13 will receive \$20,000 to strengthen the important
14 neighborhood and community services they provide; and

15 Whereas, all ten of these community
16 libraries teach ESL, provide digital literacy
17 courses, host story time for children, provide job
18 search help for the unemployed in addition to
19 offering access to books and reference materials to
20 everyone who seeks it.

21 Now, therefore, be it known that the
22 Council of the city of New York is proud to honor and
23 congratulate these ten NYC neighborhood library award
24 recipients for their stellar service. Brooklyn
25 Public Library, the Dyker Library, Kings Bay Library

2 and Sunset Park Library, the New York Public Library,
3 Aguilar Library, Fort Washington Library, Inwood
4 Library, Morrisania Library and Queens Public
5 Library, the Auburn Library, Far Rockaway Library,
6 Glen Oaks Library. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker
7 for the Entire Council; Jimmy Van Bramer, Majority
8 Leader, Chair of Cultural Affairs and Libraries
9 Committee; Andy L. King, Chair of Select Committees
10 on Libraries. [cheers/applause]

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And I think we
12 have--we have our youngest library patron here,
13 little baby Donovan. He's very happy and I know
14 Julie is going to speak on behalf of all three
15 systems and it's great to see you, our former deputy
16 mayor. Thank you so much for being here.

17 JULIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I want
18 to thank Councilman and Majority Leader Van Bramer,
19 Council Member King, Council Member Donovan, and the
20 entire City Council for the unprecedented--
21 unprecedented extraordinary support have given to New
22 York City's neighborhood libraries. It's
23 extraordinary, the biggest support of the history of
24 the libraries. So thank you very much. This year
25 the New York Neighborhood Library Awards received

2 almost 19,000 nominations by New Yorkers who told us
3 their stories about why they loved their libraries
4 from little ones as little as Donovan to a senior
5 from Glen Oaks who said she was 89 young. The
6 libraries, the neighborhood libraries are not only
7 the life line for so many people in our city, but
8 they are also the glue that ties our neighbors
9 together in communities across the city. The
10 nominations came from every single neighborhood,
11 every single branch library. We could have picked 50
12 extraordinary libraries, but as Councilman Gentile
13 said, this is the best of the best, and we hope you
14 join us on June 6th for the ceremony where we will be
15 vetting. [cheers/applause] Thank you again for all
16 your incredible support.

17 [background comments]

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I think we have
19 one more ceremonial. Council Member Ulrich.

20 [background comments] Council Member Ulrich. [pause]

21 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,
22 we ask you to please keep it down. Find a seat,
23 please find a seat. If you are exiting the building,
24 please keep it down on the way out. Thank you.

25 [pause]

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We're not--we're
3 going to proceed with the ceremonial. We have a
4 sole--and actually many of us are, although our
5 council member and our colleague, Council Member
6 Ulrich is not here, there are many of us who are more
7 than happy to lead this ceremonial. I'm going to ask
8 Maria Termini if she can please come up.

9 [cheers/applause] So, Maria is the Associate
10 Commissioner of Customer Service and Government
11 Relations. Everyone of us here has had a personal
12 interaction with Maria. She works at the Department
13 of Sanitation. She is retiring after 36 years.

14 [cheers/applause] Maria, thank you so much for your
15 service. I know we've had personal interactions as
16 well. Thank you for all the work that you've done,
17 and from my district and my constituents all of us
18 the same. So I think that we've all had a great--
19 you've been wonderful to work for, very responsive, a
20 great public servant. So thank you for your 36 years
21 of service, and I'm very happy that we're able to
22 give you this proclamation to really commemorate
23 that, and I'm going to ask Council Member Vacca, who
24 has been asked to stop in by Council Member Ulrich to
25 say a few words.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you. Thank
3 you, thank you very much Madam Speaker, and I want to
4 echo our Speaker's words. Maria Termini go back
5 many, many years because before I came to the Council
6 I was a district manager to a community board for 26
7 years, but Maria made them even better because she
8 was always at the other end of the phone. She was
9 always helpful. Sometimes she calmed me down, and
10 needed that, and--but the reality is that Maria was
11 committed to her agency, to the Sanitation Department
12 and to the City of New York and she exemplifies all
13 this fantastic and public service. So Maria, I know
14 I--I echo the Speaker's words on behalf of the
15 Council and Council Member Ulrich and all, but we
16 thank you for your service. We--we realize all that
17 you did, and very few public servants are like
18 yourself, and many can emulate your--your sense of
19 duty to our city. [cheers/applause] Thank you very
20 much.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All right if the--
22 -if I--oh we feel it. If we can have the clerk read
23 the proclamation.

24 CLERK: Council City of New York
25 Proclamation.

2 Whereas, Termini--mi--excuse me--whereas,
3 Maria Termini joined the New York City Department of
4 Sanitation DSNY in 1980 in the Operations Planning
5 Unit and two years later was appointed Assistant
6 Director the District Planning and Assistance Unit.
7 In that role she assisted community boards in their
8 efforts to develop service delivery plans and also
9 reviewed and coordinated their implementation. To
10 facilitate this process, she prepared a Guide to
11 Community Board Participation in the planning of the
12 delivery of Sanitation enforcement services also
13 called the Blue Book; and

14 Whereas, in 1990, Ms. Termini was
15 appointed Assistant Commissioner for the Office of
16 Community Affairs making her the DSNY's liaison to
17 elected officials, community boards, civic and
18 merchant associations, the Mayor's Community
19 Assistance Unit, the Mayor's Office of
20 Correspondence, the NYC Citizens Service Center, 311,
21 the Mayor's Office of Intergovernmental Affairs Area
22 Bids and Non-profits such as NY Restoration, Grown
23 NYC, and Citizens Committee; and

24 Whereas, since 2012, Ms. Termini has
25 excelled as the Associate Commissioner for the Bureau

2 of Customer Service and Government Relations
3 representing the DSNY at high level meetings with
4 elected officials and forums and serving as the DSNY
5 Ambassador to the community. S he also played a key
6 role as Advisor to DSNY officials about neighborhood
7 concerns, service requests and public policy issues.

8 Now, therefore, be it know that the
9 Council of the city of New York gratefully honors
10 Maria Termini for 36 years of extraordinary service
11 to the New York City Department of Sanitation and to
12 the community at large. Melissa Mark-Viverito,
13 Speaker for the Entire Council; Eric A. Ulrich,
14 Counsel Member 32nd District, Antonio Reynoso; Chair
15 Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management;
16 Margaret Chin, Council Member First District; Daniel
17 R. Garodnick, Council Member Fourth District
18 Manhattan and many--and James Vacca, Council Member
19 Thirteenth District and many other Council Members.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you so
21 much. Maria, say a few words, but it's great--it was
22 great to be here amongst all of us. [cheers/applause]

23 [background comments]

24 MARIA TERMINI: Thank you, Councilman
25 Ulrich, Speaker Viverito and members of the City

2 Council. It has been an honor and a pleasure working
3 with all of you throughout the years. I enjoyed our
4 collaboration on public policy, service delivery and
5 programs. Today's proclamation and recognition by
6 the City Council means so much to me. I really
7 appreciate it, and I am truly honored. Today is a
8 special day for me, which I will always cherish and
9 remember with pride. Thank you everyone. I will
10 always remain interested in public policy and
11 government. [laughs] [cheers/applause]

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Congratulations.
13 [cheers/applause] Enjoy your retirement.

14 MARIA TERMINI: Thank you.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And that ends
16 ceremonials. Enjoy your retirement, Maria.

17 [pause]

18 [background comments, pause]

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,
20 all non--non-Council--Council staff please make your
21 way up to the balcony. Non-council staff make your
22 way up to the balcony. Staff only on the floor. If
23 you are not staff, please make your way up to the
24 balcony. [pause] Also, we ask you to please silence
25 all electronic devices at this time, all electronic

2 devices please silence. Any private conversations
3 throughout the course of the hearing please take
4 outside. Thank you. [pause] [background comments]

5 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet down. Quiet on
6 floor, please.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
8 Chambers. Everyone please have their seats. Quiet
9 in the chambers.

10 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please have your
12 seats. Please find a seat. Quiet in the Chambers.
13 Everyone rise for the Pledge of Allegiance. Quiet in
14 the Chambers.

15 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

16 [pause]

17 CLERK: Barron.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
19 quiet]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [off mic]

21 Present.

22 CLERK: Borelli. Cabrera. Chin.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

24 CLERK: Cohen.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

2 CLERK: Constantinides.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

4 CLERK: Cornegy.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

6 CLERK: Crowley. Cumbo. Deutsch.

7 Dickens. [coughs]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.

9 CLERK: Thank you. Dromm.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

11 CLERK: Espinal. Eugene.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.

13 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: [off

15 mic] Here.

16 CLERK: Garodnick.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [off mic]

18 Here.

19 CLERK: Gentile.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for

22 quiet]

23 CLERK: Gibson.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet down, quiet

25 down.

2 CLERK: Gibson.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [off mic] here.

4 CLERK: Greenfield.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.

6 CLERK: Grodenchik.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic]

8 Here.

9 CLERK: Johnson.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.

11 CLERK: Kallos.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

13 CLERK: King.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

15 CLERK: Koo.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

17 CLERK: Borelli.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

19 CLERK: Koslowitz.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

21 CLERK: Lancman.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

23 CLERK: Lander. Levin. Levine.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

25 CLERK: Maisel.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

3 CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

5 CLERK: Mendez.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

7 CLERK: Miller.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Here.

9 CLERK: Palma.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic] Here.

11 CLERK: Reynoso. Levin.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

13 CLERK: Richards.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye. I meant,

15 here. [laughs]

16 CLERK: Thank you. Rodriguez.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

18 Here.

19 CLERK: Rose.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

21 CLERK: Rosenthal.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

23 CLERK: Salamanca.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: [off mic] Here.

25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
3 quiet]

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.
5 Quiet, please. Quiet, please.

6 CLERK: Torres.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet down, please.

8 CLERK: Treyger.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

10 CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

12 CLERK: Espinal.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: [off mic] Here.

14 CLERK: Mealy.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [off mic] Present.

16 CLERK: Vallone.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [off mic] Here.

18 CLERK: Williams.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

20 CLERK: Wills. Matteo. Van Bramer.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

22 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Here.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May we have quiet
25 in the Chambers. Please rise.

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise and
4 please remove your hats for the Invocation delivered
5 by Apostle E. C. Dorsey, Past--Pastor of Tehillah
6 Word Ministries, 220-10 131st Street in Laurelton.

7 APOSTLE E.C. DORSEY: Father God in the
8 name of Jesus we thank you for this day for this is
9 the day that you have made, and we shall rejoice and
10 be glad in it. Father, we invoke your presence even
11 in these Chambers in the name of Jesus. We thank
12 you, Lord God for all of the Council Members. We
13 thank you Lord God for the Speaker even of the
14 Council. Lord, we pray for those that are in
15 authority in the City of New York, and most of all,
16 we pray for our communities. Father, we pray, Lord,
17 that there be peace in our communities, peace in our
18 nation, priest--priest--peace, we pray priest--peace
19 in the might name of Jesus, and Father, continue to
20 direct in their wisdom with knowledge and even
21 understanding. This in Jesus' name we pray and
22 everyone said amen.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen. Please be
24 seated. A motion to spread the Invocation? Council
25 Member Richards.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Well--

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

4 Quite in the Chambers, quiet in the Chambers. We
5 apologize Council Member.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Well, I want to
7 thank Apostle Dorsey who comes out of Tehillah Word
8 Ministries in Laurelton, Queens and he is a man--
9 [background comments]

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
11 quiet]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --of faith, a
13 man that has done so much for our community, and
14 actually practices and DC3 is also chiming in, too,
15 as you can see.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: But who does so
18 much for our communities outside of the church
19 whether it's feeding the hungry, clothing people who
20 don't have clothing on their back. Being just a
21 blessing to our community. We're so appreciative to
22 have you today, and one of the things I love about
23 him is that, you now, he realizes church doesn't
24 [Baby Donovan Richards talking] end on Sunday. It
25 begins on Sunday, but real church starts on--right

2 after service and on Monday, and I'm so grateful to
3 have him her today. S o thank you, Apostle Dorsey for
4 what you continue to do. We love you and the
5 community loves you. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Adoption of
7 Minutes. Council Member Chin.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Motion that the
9 minutes of the Stated Meeting of April 20, 2016 be
10 adopted as printed. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Message and
12 papers from the Mayor.

13 CLERK: M 407 withdrawing Robert Farrell,
14 Jr. for appointment to the Tax Commission.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Received order,
16 printed and filed.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
18 from City, County and Borough Offices.

19 CLERK: Preconsidered M 408,
20 Communication from the Banking Commission.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Finance.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
23 Communications.

24 CLERK: None.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-
3 Ups.

4 CLERK: M 409 and M 410, various
5 applications.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on call
7 of vote and I ask for roll call.

8 CLERK: Barron.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

10 CLERK: Borelli.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

12 CLERK: Cabrera.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

14 CLERK: Chin.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

16 CLERK: Cohen.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I'm sorry, this is
18 Call-Ups?

19 CLERK: Yes.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I with--with
22 permission I would like--I vote aye on all call-ups,
23 and with permission I'd like to vote on the General
24 Calendar. The General Orders Calendar.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 31

2 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I vote no on Item

3 1057-A and 1057-A, no on Intro 1070-A and yes on all

4 other items on the Coupled General Orders Calendar.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you.

7 CLERK: Constantinides.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

9 CLERK: Cornegy.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

11 CLERK: Crowley. Cumbo. Deutsch.

12 Dickens.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.

14 CLERK: Dromm.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

16 CLERK: Espinal.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

18 CLERK: Eugene.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

20 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: [off

22 mic] Aye.

23 CLERK: Garodnick.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

25 CLERK: Gentile.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.

3 CLERK: Gibson.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [off mic] Aye.

5 CLERK: Greenfield. Grodenchik.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye. (sic)

7 CLERK: Grodenchik.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic] Aye.

9 CLERK: Johnson.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

11 CLERK: Kallos.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

13 CLERK: King.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye.

15 CLERK: Koo.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

17 CLERK: Koslowitz.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye and with
19 permission, I'd like to vote on all coupled General
20 Orders.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye on
23 all.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 CLERK: Lancman.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic] Aye.

3 CLERK: Lander. Levin.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

5 CLERK: Levine.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

7 CLERK: Crowley.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye.

9 CLERK: Maisel.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Aye.

11 CLERK: Mealy.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.

13 CLERK: Menchaca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

15 CLERK: Mendez.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

17 CLERK: Miller.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

19 CLERK: Palma.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic] Aye.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I'm sorry.

22 CLERK: Richards.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

25 CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [off mic] Aye.

3 CLERK: Rosenthal.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

5 CLERK: Salamanca.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.

7 CLERK: Torres.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [off mic] Aye.

9 CLERK: Treyger.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

11 CLERK: Vacca.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye and I'd

13 like to ask permission to voted on all General Order

14 Calendar items.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye on all

17 except for 1057-A, 1058, 1059, 1067 and 1070.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 CLERK: Vallone.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

21 CLERK: Crowley.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I'd like to vote

23 aye and with permission I'd like to vote on all

24 Calendar items.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote aye/

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

4 CLERK: Williams. Matteo. Van Bramer.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

6 CLERK: Lander. Cumbo.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye.

8 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic]

10 [background comments]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Today's Land Use

12 Call-Ups were adopted by a vote of 48 in the

13 affirmative, 0 in the negative. Quiet in the

14 Chambers, please.

15 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [off mic] Keep it

16 down, please.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now we will

18 hear from the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam

20 Public Advocate, and good afternoon, buenas tardes to

21 little Donovan Richards. It's great to see him here

22 and beautiful, beautiful. [cheers/applause] I think

23 everyone is going to want a baby photo soon. So, you

24 know, I'll get in line, and to welcome back to

25 Jumaane. I know he had been ill. [cheers/applause]

2 He continues to heal. We're very happy he's here
3 with us today. We're wishing you the best. So as
4 everybody knows, this Monday we're going to be
5 celebrating Memorial Day, and as always, this is a
6 day to remember the sacrifices made--

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
8 [shushing for quiet]

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --by the
10 countless men and women who have served in America's
11 armed forces, and as we remember we also look forward
12 to serving our present and future veterans. So I
13 think that all of us in this Council can be proud
14 that thanks to legislation passed last November, and
15 thanks to the leadership of Council Member Ulrich,
16 New York City now has a citywide department devoted
17 to serving our large and diverse veteran community,
18 the Department of Veteran Services. And also, this
19 week is the 28th Annual Fleet Week in New York City
20 where we celebrate our naval services. So, if you
21 see our men and women of the Navy, Marines or Coast
22 Guard around town this week, be sure to thank them
23 for their service.

24 Before I get into the main issue, I also
25 just wanted to say personally, right now as we speak,

2 one of the subcommittees in the House of
3 Representatives is debating the future of Puerto
4 Rico. I put out a statement last week saying that I
5 had major concerns, and I could not support a bill
6 that imposes a fiscal control board in Puerto Rico.
7 It's a legislation that strongly many of us believe
8 will prioritize the interest of the bondholders and
9 not the people of the island. Right now as we speak,
10 there's a lot of amendments being discussed with
11 regard to that particular bill that was introduced
12 last week, and that debate will continue. We will
13 see where these amendments lie. In some cases it may
14 weaken the role of the control board. We don't know.
15 So please keep my island in mind. We still demand
16 that the Republicans do what is right, and put the
17 interest of the Puerto Rican people first and
18 foremost, and not the financial interest of the
19 bondholders. We see a lot going on, and it's--it's
20 just something that is very personal to me and to
21 many of those of you--of you who have expressed
22 support, I continue to thank you.

23 So today, we're going to be voting on the
24 Mayor's Appointment of Nora Marino to the Taxi and
25 Limousine Commission. That is definitely something

2 that is on our agenda. I'm also very happy to be
3 here with my colleagues, because this is a very
4 important day for this Council and for our city.
5 Over a year and a half ago, this Council began a deep
6 examination of our city's Criminal Justice System.
7 Specifically, we began investigating how New York
8 enforced low-level non-violent offenses. The deeper
9 we looked, the clearer became, New York's Criminal
10 Justice system is broken. Low level non-violent
11 offenses like being in the park after dark or
12 drinking on a stoop were leading to hundreds of
13 thousands of criminal summons for New Yorkers each
14 year. And these summons lets many New Yorkers having
15 criminal records, records which then followed them
16 for the rest of their lives making it difficult to
17 get a job or obtain housing. These summonses also
18 left our city with 1.5 million arrest warrants for
19 missing an appearance in Summons Court. Our policies
20 just weren't fair, and they weren't making economic
21 sense either. It was New Yorkers who were paying the
22 bill whether it was the cost of locking up someone
23 for at least 24 hours, if not longer for one of these
24 1.5 million warrants or the public assistance many
25 found themselves on after being given a permanent

2 criminal record. We knew we need to right this
3 wrong. Too many New Yorkers were paying too high a
4 price for minor offenses. So in my State of the City
5 in 2015 we laid out a new vision for approaching
6 criminal justice in New York city. Our vision was
7 simple: Creating a more fair and just city, a city
8 where penalties fit the crime while also keeping
9 people safe. A city where a conviction for a low-
10 level non-violent offense does not mark one for life,
11 and a city where we work to build people back up, not
12 to keep them down or tear them down. These bills
13 collective called the Criminal Justice Reform Act is
14 the embodiment of our vision. It is the result of 15
15 months of extensive discussions and negotiations with
16 our partners at the NYPD and the Mayor's Office of
17 Criminal Justice. This package of eight bills will
18 positively impact many lives. We will divert over
19 100,000 cases from the Criminal Justice System every
20 year, save almost 10,000 people from a permanent
21 criminal record, and prevent approximately 50,000 or
22 more arrest warrants from being issued for these low-
23 level offenses. It will ensure proportionality and
24 fairness on a grand scale all while keeping our city
25 safe. It took a year and a half of thoughtful

2 dialogue with our council colleagues, the NYPD and
3 the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice, but today we
4 are here. Lives and trajectories will be changed
5 because of what we're set to pass today. I've
6 constantly said we are at a unique moment in our
7 nation's history on criminal justice issues. Here in
8 New York we are not letting this moment slip by. We
9 are seizing it. We need to put the justice back in
10 our justice system, and that is precisely what we are
11 doing. So I thank my colleagues. I thank the
12 Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice and I think the
13 NYPD for their cooperation. And now, we're going to
14 hear from a few more colleagues who have been
15 critical voices in our push. Staff wide, I really
16 want to thank--the staff has been unbelievable in
17 this conversation. We have put so many hours and the
18 staff in particular in negotiating it, but the Admin
19 has put in so many hours. I want to thank Richard
20 Cordero, Rob Calandra, Brian Crowe, Deepa Ambekar,
21 Beth Golub, Laurie Wenn, Laura Popa, Rob Newman, Matt
22 Gewolb and everyone else. So thank you so much and
23 we're going to first hear from our Chair of our
24 Public Safety Committee Vanessa Gibson.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very
3 much, Madam Speaker, Madam Public Advocate. Good
4 afternoon to all of my colleagues. This is such a
5 great day for the city of New York, the Criminal
6 Justice Reform Act of 2016 has arrived. I am so
7 thankful after 15 months of working with the Mayor's
8 Office of Criminal Justice, the NYPD, the
9 Administration as well as the incredible staff. We
10 have come to this point in recognizing that this act
11 is of vital importance to our city. It would make a
12 significant impact on the lives of thousands of
13 thousands of New Yorkers every year. These bills
14 will give our police force the tools they need to
15 address low-level offenses for exactly what they are,
16 infractions to be taken seriously, but not ones that
17 should yield life-altering consequences. Through
18 this package, we will divert an estimated 100,000
19 cases from the Criminal Justice System, reducing the
20 burden on our already over-burdened Criminal Court
21 system. By diverting from the Criminal Justice
22 System, we will be saving close to 10,000 New Yorkers
23 a year from receiving a permanent criminal record.
24 It is hard to understate how big of an impact these
25 bills will have on our city especially for those low-

2 income New Yorkers and communities of color, our
3 young men and women of color, where harsh penalties
4 have been disproportionately hard and given out the
5 low-level non-violent offenses for years. When we
6 first heard the Criminal Justice Reform Act earlier
7 this year, there was lot of misinformation about
8 these bills. But let me be perfectly clear, these
9 bills do not remove or reduce the NYPD's power to
10 enforce these low-level offenses. Everything that
11 was illegal yesterday remains illegal today and it
12 remains illegal tomorrow. Instead, what this bill
13 will do is change the way the NYPD enforces these
14 low-level offenses by sending them to a more
15 appropriate venue. I strongly support every bill in
16 this collective package. I'm particularly proud to
17 have prime sponsored Intro 1067-A, which is a bill
18 that relates to having an open container of alcohol
19 in public. So my colleagues understand, last year
20 2015, the NYPD issued 1,000--104,859 open container
21 summons, 104,859. This one offense along is
22 responsible for the largest number of summons than
23 the next summons offenses combined. Currently, this
24 offense is only adjudicated through the Criminal
25 Justice System. Legally, officers cannot issue civil

2 summons. However, this bill opens up that
3 possibility. Given the disproportionality, and the
4 high number of summonses that are issued for this
5 particular offense. Adding a civil penalty option and
6 allowing this offense to be adjudicated in OATH will
7 give the NYPD the opportunity to issue a punishment
8 that is actually proportionate to the offense. And
9 to the impact a person with an open container on
10 their stoop will have on the overall public safety
11 across this city. In addition, we are allowing the
12 police to really go after violent offenders of
13 violent crime, and not low-level offenses. New
14 Yorkers do not belong in jail for these infractions.
15 And under the current law, that is exactly what can
16 happen. I want to thank our Speaker Melissa Mark-
17 Viverito for her tireless efforts in leading this
18 Council and this conversation in reforms that are
19 necessary that promote fairness, justice and dignity
20 for all who may come into contact with the Criminal
21 Justice System. Together, these bills will make up
22 the most significant Criminal Justice legislation
23 that we have passed in quite some time. And the
24 scope of the bill's impact is simply massive. I am
25 very proud to have been a part of this discussion,

2 and working with all of my colleagues and certainly
3 urge all of my colleagues to recognize the value and
4 the investments that we are making to create a fairer
5 and more equitable Criminal Justice System in our
6 city. Thank you, Speaker. Thank you to all of the
7 staff, Laura Popa, Matt Gewolb, Rachel Cordero, Brian
8 Crowe, Beth Golub, Deep Ambekar, Laurie Wenn, Theo
9 Moore, Faiza Ali, Ramon Martinez, Eric Koch, Saba
10 Debesu from the Mayor's Office. My staff Dana Wax
11 and Kaitlyn O'Hagan, and I also want to recognize my
12 fellow co-sponsors, Council Members Rory Lancman and
13 Council Member Mark Levine for their incredible
14 support. I look forward to this vote this afternoon,
15 and to making our Criminal Justice System fair and
16 equitable for every New Yorker. Thank you.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. We're
18 going to hear next here from Council Member Lancman
19 who chairs our courts and Legal Services Committee.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Thank you, Madam
21 Speaker. Good afternoon everyone. Today the Council
22 is going to take an important step towards bringing
23 rationality and fairness to our Criminal Justice
24 System, particularly the way that we police low-level
25 non-violent quality of life offenses. And I do want

2 to emphasize that it is what we are talking about
3 this afternoon, low-level non-violent quality of life
4 offenses. The policing of these offenses through our
5 Criminal Justice System is having an extraordinarily
6 detrimental effect on our courts. We held a hearing
7 last year, maybe a year and a half ago that was
8 titled, *Is Broken Windows Breaking Our Courts?* And
9 the answer was emphatically yes. Hundreds of
10 thousands of New Yorkers being pushed through the
11 Criminal Justice System for low-level non-violent
12 quality of life offenses at extraordinary cost--costs
13 to the court system, and an extraordinary burden for
14 those people who are charged with those offenses.
15 Unlike if you fail to pay a parking ticket or fail to
16 pay a Sanitation ticket. If you show--don't show up
17 at a Summons Court hearing, a warrant will be issued
18 for your arrest, and then the next time you have an
19 interaction with a police officer of any kind, boy,
20 you really will be in the Criminal Justice System.
21 In fact, there are over a million and a half
22 outstanding warrants that our police officers are
23 charged with processing and tracking down when they
24 interact with people wit those warrants. It is an
25 enormous drain our court system, and an enormous

2 drain on our police department. We need to be
3 focusing our resources on fighting real crime, and we
4 should be recalibrating our justice system to make
5 sure that the punishment, the accountability matches
6 the offense that a person has committed. Nobody who
7 has littered or made excessive noise or engaged in
8 any of the other behaviors that we're talking about
9 today should feel--should bear the brunt of the
10 Criminal Justice System. And that is all that we are
11 doing today. As has been pointed out, every offense
12 that every kind of conduct that was prohibited
13 yesterday, will still be prohibited tomorrow, but we
14 are moving these offenses primarily into the civil
15 justice system so that the Criminal Justice System
16 and our police department is not overburdened, and so
17 that people can be held accountable for their
18 conduct, but not have the heavy ham--heavy hammer of
19 the Criminal Justice System come down on their head.
20 Thank you.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
22 Council Member. We will now hear from Council Member
23 Williams.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you--

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]

3 Well, you don't have to say anything.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I will--I just--
5 --no thank you.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I'm more than
7 happy to like, you know, okay.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you, yes,
9 thank you, Madam Speaker. I'm very happy to be back
10 here in particular on this day to pass this
11 particular act. First, I want to say what a
12 difference and administration makes in these type of
13 discussions. A thank you to the Speaker for her
14 leadership in fully understanding the problems and
15 providing the leadership for this City Council to
16 move forward against opposition. And--and also to
17 have a Mayor--although there was opposition--that
18 understand the progressive values of this act, and
19 allow this discussion to go forward civilly. Given
20 the state that we are in this country, it's important
21 that we all look at a thing and say it is the same
22 thing. We look at a problem and say there is an
23 issue that has to be addressed, whether it's a peace
24 dividend--dividend as the Police Commissioner called
25 it, or a simple injustice that most of us know it is.

2 We have to all be able to look at the system and say
3 that system needs addressing, and too many of the
4 opponents every time we have a discussion of reform,
5 Armageddon is discussed of what's going to happen.
6 It rarely ever happens. I can't remember any kind of
7 reform whether it was policing or criminal justice
8 that caused Armageddon. I remember a discussion
9 around the criminal--the CSA, the Community Safety
10 Act that the city was supposed to fall apart. Quite
11 the opposite. Murders are down. Shootings are down.
12 People are proud of the work that the Inspector
13 General of the NYPD is doing. It is about having
14 this discussion together, and I think that's what
15 happened here because of the City Council leadership.
16 Even though their polls came to the table to discuss
17 this issue in a way that would not make people
18 unsafe, but would just provide some justice and
19 equity to everyone particularly black, brown and
20 poorer communities. This--and I hear people talking
21 about discouraging that it's going to make people--
22 discourage them--not being able to discourage them
23 from performing, from doing these things. This act
24 has not changed the level of discouragement at all.
25 The same level of discouragement is there. In fact,

2 this act just followed the pattern that already
3 existed in what we were doing now. The only thing
4 that it changes is the outsized lifelong impact that
5 these low-level offenses were causing, and I think we
6 all agree, that this should not be an lifelong impact
7 for an open container. That has had too much
8 problems in these communities where people can't get
9 jobs. They can't get loans to go to school. They're
10 kicked out of their homes, and none of that should
11 anyone be saying is deserved even for your nation.
12 So I'm proud that this Council has led this
13 discussion. I hope the nation is--is watching, and I
14 hope everyone is watching, the PBA, all of the police
15 units that we have to come to this table and have a
16 civil discussion so that we continue to move forward.
17 But I'm proud of my bill particularly Council--mine
18 and Council Member Levine's, it's a very important.
19 The reporting bills can help us continue to provide
20 the oversight that's needed to see where these
21 policies are being administered and if they're being
22 administered fairly. I want to thank our Speaker
23 along with Public Safety Chair Vanessa Gibson, Rory
24 Lancman and Mark Levine, Rob Newman, Brian Crowe,
25 Deepa Ambekar. I pronounced that wrong. I

2 apologize. Beth Golub, Laurie Wenn, Dana Wax, and my
3 staff Nick Smith for all of this. Thank you.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
5 Council Member, and finally we'll hear from Council
6 Member Mark Levine.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam
8 Speaker. I just want to briefly point out that
9 nowhere is the contradiction and the inconsistency
10 between the nature of an infraction and the level of
11 punishment more glaring than in the park where the
12 violation of any park rule is considered a crime,
13 it's a misdemeanor crime punishable potentially by
14 jail time and by a record that lasts a lifetime, and
15 to remind colleagues just what is in the parks rules,
16 I'm not sure everyone knows. It includes such things
17 as walking on newly seeded grass. Again, this would
18 be a criminal offense under current rules.
19 Unauthorized possession of gardening tools, another
20 criminal offense--offense.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
22 quiet]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Most terrifying
24 of all, climbing a tree. Yes, that is currently
25 considered a criminal act in our part system today.

2 As is being in a park after hours, and failure to
3 comply with a sign, anything written on a park sign
4 and there's park signs all over the city saying
5 things like possession of glass bottles is
6 prohibited. Children must wear shoes on playground.
7 The violation of any of these signs is also a
8 criminal act today. So Intro 1056 would simply bring
9 some rationality to all of this by downgrading the
10 violation of most park rules so they're no longer
11 criminal misdemeanors. They will be treated as
12 violations much like parking in front of a fire
13 hydrant. I also want to mention as my colleague
14 Council Member Williams spoke about that we have a
15 very important reporting bill here. Everything in
16 this package deals with state law--city laws but, of
17 course, there are state laws that apply in the five
18 boroughs as well, and we have important questions
19 about how fairly those are being applied. So Intro
20 662 would require for the first time reporting on the
21 use of desk appearance tickets. Those are for state
22 laws, and the demographics and geography of how those
23 are used in our City. Thank you, Madam Speaker for
24 your leadership. I won't repeat the staff again that

2 deserves accolades, but I appreciate the effort of
3 the staff and my co-sponsor today. Thank you.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you so
5 much, Mark Levine, and to all the members that have
6 spoken. Just a reminder or not a reminder.
7 Hopefully a lot of people in this room, colleagues
8 know, we have one of our colleagues that is not here
9 today, which is Council Member Antonio Reynoso
10 because he got married the past weekend and
11 [cheers/applause] he's on his honeymoon right now.
12 And so we say congratulations to Antonio that wish
13 him Edian (sp?) all the best, and it was really nice
14 to be able to share that moment. The last thing I'll
15 say before I pass it off, back and close the
16 Speaker's time. As--as many of you know, I think you
17 all know I'm Puerto Rican, right. [laughter] If that
18 hasn't been made clear. So two Sundays from this
19 Sunday is the Puerto Rican Day Parade. [cheers] So I
20 obviously encourage all of you to march. I'm very
21 excited for many, many reasons. There's a lot of
22 dedications and--and of the parade. One of the
23 issues and themes and areas that is really being
24 highlighted this year is the LGBT community and the
25 success and the efforts of the LGBT community in

2 celebrating all the accomplishments and advances that
3 have been done. One of our own, Pedro Julio Santiano
4 (sic) is being recognized in the parade. So we
5 definitely want to congratulate him [applause] for
6 the work he has done on behalf of the LGBT community
7 not only on the island, but also internationally. So
8 we appreciate that, and recognize that, and also
9 myself as well as the Mayor of San Juan would be
10 godmothers of that contingent of the LGBT contingent
11 in the parade. So very happy about that, and also
12 someone else has actually joined us here today.
13 Joanna Rosalie if I could ask you to stand up. She
14 is [applause] someone that is growing in Puerto Rico
15 people should know, but she is an accomplished film,
16 television and theater actress on the island. And
17 also as we mentioned, one of the LGBT godmother--
18 godmothers of the LGBT contingent in the Puerto Rican
19 Day Parade. So we welcome you to the Chambers and
20 [Speaking Spanish] It's a real, real pleasure for me,
21 someone who has high respect for Joan Rosalie. Thank
22 you for being here and joining us today. Yes? Oh,
23 yes. Okay. [background comments] Oh, okay. So,
24 yes, so with that, I want to thank everyone. I hope

2 to see you at the parade, and I--I end Communication
3 from the Speaker. [pause]

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Discussion of
5 General Orders, Council Member Garodnick.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
7 much, Madam Public Advocate. I--I rise to speak
8 today on the Criminal Justice Reform Act. In my
9 view, these bills are as much about good government
10 as they are about criminal justice, and they deserve
11 our support. There are currently 1-1/2 million open
12 warrants in our city of 8-1/2 million people, many of
13 which are for people who missed court dates or
14 committed low-level offenses. Shackling people with
15 criminal records for small violations not only is bad
16 policy but it also doesn't work. These warrants
17 crated a backlog in the city's court system and end
18 up causing way more trouble than they are worth.
19 When someone spends time in jail on a five-year-old
20 warrant for missing their court date for getting
21 caught in the park after dark, that isn't justice.
22 In fact, it just doesn't make sense. And while it's
23 important to hold people accountable for their
24 actions, we also need to make sure that when all is
25 said and done, the punishment fits the crime. If

2 you're in the park after hours, you should get a
3 civil violation. If you have an open container you
4 should get a civil violation, and in all cases the PD
5 should be able to check your ID and to make sure that
6 you are not being pursued for a more serious crime.
7 And the police should rate--retain the ability to
8 arrest you for these violations. This is the right
9 policy, and that is what we are providing for in this
10 package. By issuing civil summonses and violations
11 to people who commit these low-level non-violent
12 offenses, we will free up law enforcement and the
13 court system to focus on more serious crimes even as
14 we continue to maintain a high quality of life for
15 New Yorkers. And by the way, the conviction rates in
16 civil tribunals like OATH are much higher and more
17 people will be truly held accountable for their
18 violations. So I want to thank Speaker Mark-Viverito
19 for her significant leadership on this issue. You
20 know, I had read a press release somewhere that this
21 was someone else's initiative, but we know that the
22 credit belongs right here. And I want to
23 congratulate you for that, and all my colleagues
24 particularly Chairs Gibson and Lancman as well as

2 Council Member Levine and Williams who authored these
3 bills, and I will be voting yes today. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Minority Leader--
5 Leader Matteo.

6 [background noise, pause]

7 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Thank you, Madam
8 Public Advocate. I want to start by echoing my
9 colleague Jumaane Williams' sentiments that obviously
10 we disagree, but through leadership and through our
11 negotiations we--we've had those respectful
12 discussions, and I--and I believe in the open passion
13 and debate. We've had that over the last year.
14 We're talking all these bills, and I want to thank
15 the Speaker and her staff for having discussions with
16 myself, my delegation, and while we're not going to
17 see eye-to-eye on the bills, I, you know, being--
18 having respectful debate is good for this body, good
19 for the process. So I want to thank everyone for
20 that. Obviously, I have a different view on the
21 bills. I believe the proposed changes in this
22 package of legislation are unnecessary and send the
23 wrong message about our priorities. As supporters
24 have pointed out, those who are found guilty of the
25 low-level offenses covered in this package are never

2 sentenced to jail time. In fact, the vast majority
3 of the summonses are dismissed when the offender
4 actually shows up in court. Others receive fines.
5 But if you receive a summons, and you do absolutely
6 nothing there are consequences. There should be
7 consequences. It should be uncomfortable,
8 inconvenient. It should be at the very least make
9 you think twice before committing the crime again.
10 And yes, these are crimes. They are not major
11 felonies, but just because they are not serious
12 crimes does not mean they should not be taken
13 seriously. Our society has decided that urinating in
14 public, throwing garbage on the sidewalk or making
15 excessively loud noise at certain times are
16 unacceptable behaviors. So the question is do we
17 really want to enforce them? On Staten Island we
18 have been pouring a tremendous amount of resources to
19 clean up the garbage tossed on the streets and in
20 public spaces by people who show no respect for our
21 communities. We want litter laws to be enforced
22 vigorously. In fact, I want litter fines to be
23 increased, and I've introduced--introduced a bill in
24 this Council that does just that. We don't want
25 people to think it's okay to urinate in public. We

2 want there to be real consequences because there's a
3 big difference between a criminal fine and civil
4 fine, and the city's failures to collect civil fines
5 are well documented. Collection efforts are most
6 effective when the agency has the ability to deny the
7 offender something of value, their license, their
8 ability to legally register a vehicle even their
9 freedom. Those are some of the tools at the Criminal
10 Courts judges' disposal. What happens when someone
11 does not pay that \$75 civil summons for urinating in
12 public? They receive a few threatening letters in
13 the mail. What are the real consequences. This
14 package of legislation in many ways takes the teeth
15 out of enforcing the laws that help prevent these
16 behaviors, and we are legislatively imposing policies
17 that should be decided by the NYPD in collaboration
18 with the communities they are policing. I feel these
19 bills are retrieved from the Broken Windows policies
20 that have vastly improved the quality of life in the
21 city. It is a strategy that I have supported that I
22 believe will save the city from the scourge of crime
23 and rampant indifference for our public spaces that
24 plagued the five boroughs in the not too distant
25 past. Again, while we disagree, I do appreciate the

2 debate, but I do feel that unfortunately that we are
3 rolling back a piece of that success if we pass these
4 bills today. So with that, I will be voting no.
5 Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
7 Menchaca.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
9 Public Advocate. I rise to speak on Preconsidered
10 Land Use Items 376 and 377. Members, today I urge
11 you to deny a Red Hook Land Use application submitted
12 by a private developer who wants to change heavy
13 industrial zoning to allow the construction of a 200-
14 bed nursing home. This vote comes at the end of a
15 year-long process of land use that we know so well,
16 and my consideration and direct engagement of both
17 the developer and 1199 and my constituents was great.
18 At public hearings during the ULURP process we heard
19 extensive testimony from the applicant and their
20 supporters. We also heard from petitions and public
21 meetings in the neighborhood from community
22 residents, resiliency experts and small business who
23 were decidedly opposed to the project. This project
24 has been given fair consideration on its merits and
25 in the context of Red Hook's long-term development.

2 It must not go forward at this location, and we must
3 find an alternative and safe site. Here are the
4 negative impacts: This project would place our most
5 frail nursing home residents and the professionals
6 who care for them in a mandatory evacuation zone
7 where five weeks passed in Red Hook without
8 electricity after Sandy where ambulances response
9 times are dismal, and where we have distant and
10 unreliable public transit. Either the city is
11 planning for the resilience and sustainability of
12 essential services or it isn't, and I say we must.
13 The proposed rezoning from rare M2-1 to large scale
14 mixed-use residential would further erode Red Hook's
15 already diminished and manufacturing space at the
16 very moment our city has redoubled its commitment to
17 preserving industrial areas and the jobs that they
18 generate. Either the City is protecting
19 manufacturing zones or it isn't. I say we protect
20 them. The project will undoubtedly stress Red Hook's
21 already insufficient infrastructure. I'm talking
22 about the sewers and the power grid to a breaking
23 point. The narrow roadways, truck routes and our
24 nearby industrial uses also make placement of a

2 nursing home at this location a short-sighted and
3 unsafe proposition.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
5 quiet]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Either the city
7 is making honest decisions about infrastructure or it
8 isn't. I say we do. Indeed this proposal is
9 completely divorced from Red Hook's ongoing community
10 planning efforts. We are currently actively planning
11 the Red Hook Integrated Flood Protection System, and
12 mother other initiatives like protecting NYCHA
13 properties with new resilient design, and controlling
14 storm runoff. For example, a New Yorker called me
15 after hearing the land use decision last week to deny
16 application. Her mother was evacuated from nursing
17 home after Sandy. He mom spent weeks in a hallway at
18 receiving nursing home. She told me this should
19 never happen to anyone's loved one again. I agree.
20 I ask you to vote yes to file this application, and
21 as a member representing Red Hook I urge all of you
22 to do the same after last week's unanimous Land Use
23 vote. Thank you so much.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
25 Council Member Richards.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Well, I'll wait
3 until we vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
5 Council Member Koo. Council Member Koo. Going once,
6 going twice. Okay, Council Member Cornegy for an
7 introduction.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I would just like
9 to call the members' attention to guests we have in
10 the Chamber from the School Construction Authority's
11 Mentorship Program, their new graduates are in the
12 balcony.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please rise.
14 [applause] Council Member Koo.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Madam
16 Advocate. I want to talk about this--the law we're
17 going to pass today about the criminalizing some--

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [off mic] Do you
19 want to say something? (sic)

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: --some regulations
21 or some laws. I think our--our criminal system is
22 overburdened with too many misdemeanor case--
23 misdeman--misdemeanor cases. So a lot of people over
24 there, they have to wait a long time, to wait for
25 trial, and in the Bronx they have the department.

2 They have to wait for two years when they read some
3 of the petty crimes. So there's no question that our
4 police do a great job when it comes to fighting
5 crime, but we need to be tougher on the quality of
6 life offenses without overburdening our criminal
7 system--system. I represent transportation and
8 arrests have increase. It is constantly battling
9 transportation problems. Unfortunately, enforcement
10 of these complaints is sparse. If there's one thing
11 I know it's our prisons maybe crowded and
12 overburdened, but the are not overcrowding with
13 people who litter in Flushing. Let me ask you: What
14 police officer would--what police officer wants to
15 send to jail for flipping a cigarette in the street.
16 Giving police officers the discretion to issue a
17 civil or criminal penalty can actually help to
18 incentivize our police to crack down on these quality
19 of life offenses. I think if we--if we dig deeper in
20 the hole, the criminalizing label that is being--that
21 has been stamped on the bill, we will find that they
22 will actually give our law enforcement the necessary
23 tools [bell] to get the job done and improve our
24 quality of life. Thank you.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member,
3 can you please conclude. Thank you. Just--you
4 concluded your remarks? Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I concluded. So I
6 urge my colleagues to support the bills.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
8 Council Member Williams it's an honor and a
9 privilege. I'm so glad that you're back in the
10 Chambers and like--unlike Samson who cut his locks,
11 I'm so glad you still have the power.

12 FEMALE SPEAKER: He doesn't have the
13 power.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oh, come on.
15 [laughter] Report of Special Committees. [laughs]

16 CLERK: None.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
18 Standing Committees.

19 CLERK: Report of the Committee--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: [interposing]
21 Madam Public Advocate.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oh.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I'm on your
24 list.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oh, Council
3 Member Gentile.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Thank you, thank
5 you. Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. It's been no
6 secrete that I have had serious reservations about
7 CJRA. I was concerned about the risk, the
8 degradation of quality of life. However--however,
9 after due examination I have found this package
10 sensibly and reasonably codifies the penalties for
11 many of these quality of offenses. Moreover and
12 essential to this package, these changes will not
13 prevent the NYPD and the courts from enforcing
14 penalties as necessary. The simple penalties for
15 offenses will not be grouped under one penalty
16 structure, but the penalties remain. Littering in
17 the park for example is currently handled differently
18 than littering on the street, which does not
19 represent the kind of unified and fair penalty
20 structure our city should have. These bills make it
21 uniform. The lynchpin for me is 1057-A, which would
22 provide the NYPD with the authority to decide when a
23 criminal or civil summons should be issued leaving
24 the route to criminal court open for many of these
25 offenses. Yes, allowing the option of civil

2 summonses not only help ease the congestion in
3 criminal court and also allows low-level non-violent
4 offenders to answer for their offense by paying a
5 fine with the possible consequences of a criminal
6 conviction, but ultimately, however, at this one
7 place the decision of when to charge an offender with
8 a criminal summons lies in the capable hands of our
9 NYPD officers. It will likely be the case that one-
10 time offenders will receive a civil penalty and a
11 chance to make amends while repeat bad actors likely
12 will be processed with an issuance of criminal
13 summons. In doing so we play fair and require
14 offenders to still answer for their offense, and
15 should one default on a civil penalty, these laws
16 allow for the civil judgment to be filed. Multiple
17 offenders--multiple offenders will not get off, but
18 rather face criminal proceedings. For these bad
19 actors it's like almost saying fool us once, pay the
20 price, but fool us repeatedly, we don't play nice.
21 That's the kind of lawmaking I can support, and
22 because of these sensible [bell] things on this
23 package, and still holding offenders accountable I
24 can support it, and I will vote aye on CJRA.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

67

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 Seeing no other, Report of Special Committees.

4 CLERK: None.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
6 Standing Committees?

7 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
8 Finance, Preconsidered M 408 and accompany
9 Preconsidered Resos 1067 through 1070, Council set an
10 interest rate for non-payment of taxes and water
11 sewer charges.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
13 General Orders.

14 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 366 and Reso
15 1077 through Preconsidered LU 372 and Reso 1083 Tax
16 Exemptions.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
18 General Orders.

19 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land
20 Use, LU 350 and Reso 1084 through LU 352 and Reso
21 1086, 198 Johnson Avenue, Brooklyn.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
23 General Orders.

24 CLERK: LU 357 and Reso 1087, Tax
25 Exemption.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 68

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 General Orders.

4 CLERK: LU 363 and Reso 1088, Zoning
5 Amendment.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
7 General Orders.

8 CLERK: LU 364 and Reso 1089 and LU 365
9 and Reso 1090, Tax Exemptions.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
11 General Orders.

12 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 373 and Reso
13 1091, UDAP Bronx.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
15 General Orders.

16 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 374 and Reso
17 1092 and LU 375 and Reso 1093, Tax Exemptions.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
19 General Orders.

20 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 376 and Reso
21 1094, and LU 377 and Reso 1095 Zoning Amendments.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Motion to
23 Disprove.

24 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Public
25 Safety, Intro 639-B, Issuance of Summonses.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

69

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
3 Coupled on General Orders.

4 CLERK: Intro 662-A, Issuance of Desk
5 Appearance Tickets.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
7 Coupled on General Orders.

8 CLERK: Intro 1056-A, Penalties for
9 Violating Park Rules.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
11 Coupled on General Orders.

12 CLERK: Intro 1057-A, Enforcement of
13 Criminal and Civil Offenses.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15 Coupled on General Orders.

16 CLERK: Intro 1058-A Penalties for
17 Excessive Noise.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
19 Coupled on General Orders.

20 CLERK: Intro 1059-A, Quality of Life
21 Offenses.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
23 Coupled on General Orders.

24 CLERK: Intro 1067-A, Possessing an Open
25 Container of Alcohol.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

70

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
3 Coupled on General Orders.

4 CLERK: Intro 1070-A, Distribution and
5 Advertising Matter.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
7 Coupled on General Orders.

8 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Rules,
9 Privileges and Elections, M396 and Reso 1096
10 Approving the Reappointment of Nora Marino, Taxi and
11 Limousine Commission.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
13 General Orders.

14 CLERK: On the General Order Calendar
15 Resolution Appointing Various Persons Commissioner of
16 Deeds.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
18 General Orders, and at this time I ask for a roll
19 call on all the items on the Coupled General Order
20 Calendar.

21 CLERK: Barron.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
23 explain my vote.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [off mic] My
3 comments today--[on mic] My comments today are
4 regarding the Criminal Justice Reform Act. I'm
5 pleased to know that it will reduce the penalties for
6 low-level non-violent offenses, and that it will have
7 an opportunity to change the disproportionate
8 consequences that people have been subjected to.
9 It's important to note that it's still against the
10 law for these low-level crimes to occur, and that
11 people will be penalized fro that. My problem with
12 the bill is that the guidance in when a person will
13 be issued a civil summons or arrested is still
14 arbitrary. It's still discretionary, and it's still
15 at the opportunity of the officer to decide when to
16 do that, and that the guidance to, in fact, codify
17 the specificity is still yet to come. There's no
18 specificity as to when a person will be arrested or
19 given a desk appearance ticket. The CCRB has
20 continued to highlight that unlawful searches is a
21 continuing problem and that police abuses with no
22 apparent conse--no appropriate consequences is still
23 prevalent. The reports that police are required to
24 fill to re--to fulfill in terms of why they stop a
25 person have been reported in the newspapers as having

2 been grossly inaccurate and incomplete. Yet they
3 have been pushed on by their supervisor--they've been
4 pushed forward by the supervising police. But I'm
5 voting for this bill because I think that this is an
6 opportunity for us to overcome the inertia that we
7 are looking at in terms of moving forward the right-
8 to-know bills that have come out of community--out of
9 the committee, have had hearings and are languishing
10 and waiting to come to the floor. But I think that
11 the potential benefits of this bill are significant,
12 and there will be [bell] an opportunity for people to
13 not be put into the criminal justice system. So I'm
14 voting aye n all.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

17 CLERK: Borelli.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
19 except 1056-A, 1057, 1058, 1059, 1067-A and 1070-A.

20 CLERK: Cabrera.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.

22 CLERK: Chin.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

24 CLERK: Constantinides.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on
3 all.

4 CLERK: Cornegy.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Permission to
6 explain my vote.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I would like to
9 congratulate everybody involved in this landmark
10 legislation. I vote aye on all.

11 CLERK: Cumbo.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye on all.

13 CLERK: Deutsch.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yes.

15 CLERK: Dickens.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Congratulations
17 to my colleagues and aye on all.

18 CLERK: Dromm.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all.

20 CLERK: Espinal.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye on all.

22 CLERK: Eugene.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye on all
24 except Land Use 376 and Reso 1094, and Land Use 377
25 and Reso 1095. I vote no.

2 CLERK: Okay. Ferreras-Copeland.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: With
4 congratulations to all my colleagues for today and
5 also to congratulate--I'm very proud that the
6 Governor has now--now signed legislation eliminating
7 seven--taxes on feminine hygiene projects.
8 [cheers/applause] I vote aye.

9 CLERK: Garodnick.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

11 CLERK: Gentile.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye on all.

13 CLERK: Gibson.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
15 quickly explain.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you so much
18 and I thank all of my colleagues. I really
19 appreciate a lot of the dialogues we've had back and
20 forth. Reforming our criminal justice system is
21 certainly no easy task--

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
23 [shushing for quiet]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --but I think
25 when you come to the table with the right mindset to

2 achieve balance, and recognize that you must always
3 find compromise, the bottom line is achieving
4 fairness for everyone regardless of your ethnicity,
5 your zip code, the neighborhood you live in.
6 Everyone deserves to be treated and given the respect
7 that each New Yorker deserves, and I believe the
8 Criminal Justice Reform Act strikes that necessary
9 balance, and really brings equity to a system that
10 has been broken--

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
12 [shushing for quiet]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --for quite some
14 time. Thank you to our Speaker. Thank you to all of
15 my colleagues and I especially want to recognize and
16 welcome back Council Member Jumaane Williams who
17 truly has made a lot of--of leeway in criminal
18 justice reform and has really done a tremendous
19 amount of work to pass necessary criminal justice
20 reform bills. Welcome back. Thank you, Council
21 Member Williams. Thank you, Madam Speaker as well as
22 all of my colleagues. I proudly vote aye on all.
23 Thank you.

24 CLERK: Greenfield.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you.

3 May I explain my vote?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
6 very much. I want to congratulate all of my
7 colleagues, and especially the Speaker for keeping
8 what was regarded public commitment to make reforms.
9 I--in reference to the Criminal Justice Reform Act, I
10 support much, but not all of the pieces of
11 legislation. So I'm going to vote aye on all, and on
12 the Criminal Justice Reform Act I'm going to vote aye
13 on 639-D, 662-A, 1059-A, 105-A, 1067-A. I'm going to
14 vote no on 1056-A, 1057-A and 1070-A. Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 Continue.

17 CLERK: Grodenchik.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic] I
19 vote aye.

20 CLERK: Johnson.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye on all.

22 CLERK: Kallos.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

24 CLERK: King.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Permission to
3 explain my vote?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Over the past year,
6 I've been having a number of conversations in regards
7 to quality of life. As the summons conversation
8 started and knowing more--knowing more on the topics
9 I think that people are little bit confused as far as
10 freedom of urination in the city of New York, which I
11 think was so misleading in the conversation, but I do
12 understand that rules are put in place in society to
13 keep some type of order.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
15 quiet]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: So while we look at
17 the Council to make life that much more freer for us,
18 that we continue to--to remain a quality of life that
19 doesn't disrespect whether you're in the park,
20 whether you're walking down a city street or whether
21 you're sitting on your own porch. I say all of that
22 because as time has progressed, we've noticed that
23 when it comes to summonses, couples who might have
24 sat in Poe Park in the Bronx--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: -were to get a
5 ticket for that same beverage being open where a
6 couple sitting in Central Park having a picnic would
7 not get that summons. So we're saying to us as we
8 continue to have reforms, police reform might be one
9 of the things that we need to move forward as well
10 because it's the way how we look at different
11 communities of how summonses are actually issued. So
12 I ask all of us to be mindful of that, but I do thank
13 the Speaker for taking the band-aid of the injustices
14 that have happened to help change the culture of how
15 we look at summonses and criminalize people for some
16 small infractions, but while trying to maintain the
17 quality of life for the city of New York so with that
18 all being said, I thank everyone today who put time
19 and energy in to help improve New York while we
20 continue to have a conversation to help our police
21 officers work and do the best they can within our
22 communities, respect our communities and provide that
23 quality of life that we also deserve. With that all
24 being said, I vote aye on all.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

2 CLERK: Koo.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Before I vote I want
4 to welcome Donovan Richard, Jr. to our City Council.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: And I also want to
7 welcome Council Member Jumaane Williams after his
8 absence. I wish good health. So I will vote yes on
9 all the bills. Thank you.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 CLERK: Lancman.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic] Aye on
13 all.

14 CLERK: Lander.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
16 permission to explain my vote.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. sir.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very
19 much. I want to give a big congratulations to and
20 kudos to the Speaker and to Council Members Gibson
21 and Williams and others who have taken the lead here.
22 This is a big deal. It's been done in a smart way,
23 both respectful debate and dialogue, but also very
24 through research, painstaking legislating and
25 thoughtful dialogue with One Police Plaza and the

2 NYPD as well. It is smart. It is fair. It is just.
3 I don't know about others, but I know several people
4 who missed a summons on a low-level offense and then
5 the next time totally different low level offense.
6 One turnstile jump, on open container, and the next
7 thing they knew they spent a day at Rikers, and we
8 all know that the majority of people that happens to
9 don't look like me, but are people of color, are
10 young men and young women and the consequences of
11 winding up at Rikers for that is just far too harmful
12 and significant, and that's really what we're talking
13 about here. It's been done in a way that's smart.
14 It's been done in a way that will preserve public
15 order. It's been done in a way that respects
16 appropriate discretion for the NYPD, but let's
17 remember that that's what--fundamentally what this is
18 about is preventing those collateral consequences
19 that are counted in lives. So I'm proud of this body
20 day. Now, we're not done on criminal justice reform.
21 I'm excited to see the results of Judge Lippman's
22 commission and the continuing work we have to do to
23 make this a more fair and just city, but this is a
24 good day in that process. I also want to give a
25 shout-out to Council Member Menchaca. I spent the

2 month after Hurricane Sandy every day, every night at
3 the Park Slope Armory where 500 frail elder evacuated
4 from flooded nursing homes and adult homes in the
5 Rockaways, lived on cots with sea rations basically.
6 It was not pretty though we did as best by them as we
7 could. It's not where we want our seniors to be, and
8 I think at a time when people are raising a lot of
9 questions about a lot of different land use issues,
10 to be led by just fundamental policy concerns does,
11 you know, sets a very good example in this body, and
12 I want to give you congratulations. I vote aye on
13 all. [bell]

14 CLERK: Levin.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
16 explain my vote.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I want to commend
19 the Speaker and Chairs Gibson and Lancman and Council
20 Member Levine for the Criminal Justice Reform Act
21 bills. I think that these bills are going to be
22 important to mitigating some of the negative impacts
23 that--that communities have been facing in New York
24 City when it comes to excessive arrests and
25 incarcerations. I think that this is thoughtful. As

2 my colleagues have said, this has been taking a very
3 thoughtful approach and I commend the Speaker for
4 taking on this issue in an earnest fashion in--in
5 looking at all sides of the issue, but ultimately
6 being committed to making sure that we are creating a
7 city for the future that will support communities,
8 will reduce some of these--the harmful effects that
9 can happen to an individual when they're arrested,
10 when they are incarcerated, when they spend time at
11 Rikers Island, where they are subject to a very, very
12 adverse impact. In addition, our Criminal Justice
13 System, as Chair Lancman referenced, is--is
14 overburdened as it is, and we need to have thoughtful
15 policy moving forward. I think that from a
16 bipartisan--bipartisan perspective we can agree on
17 that, and--and think and act in a--in a thoughtful
18 and conscientious manner, which is what we're doing
19 here at the City Council today, and with that I vote
20 aye on all.

21 CLERK: Levine.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

23 CLERK: Maisel.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Aye on
25 all.

2 CLERK: Mealy.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: May I explain my
4 vote?

5 ALFONSO JENKINS: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I just wanted to
7 thank all my colleagues for this great legislation,
8 and all I can say it is about time and I vote aye on
9 all.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 CLERK: Menchaca.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
13 explain my vote?

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I also want to
16 make sure that we celebrate this moment and thank the
17 Speaker and all the Council Members that have been
18 pushing the legislation--

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
20 quiet]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --for the
22 Criminal Justice Reform Act--

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [off mic] Quiet down,
24 please.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: It's a good day
3 for our young men and women of color and I also think
4 it's a good day for Red Hook. It's a good day for
5 resiliency and it's a good day for manufacturing
6 districts. I vote aye on all. Thank you.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 CLERK: Mendez.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you. I
10 would like to be associated with the comments of my
11 colleagues Council Member Inez Barron and Council
12 Member Andy King. Having said that, I will vote aye
13 on all, but no on Intro 1070. Thank you.

14 CLERK: Miller.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote no on 1094
16 and 1095 and aye on all the rest.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 CLERK: Palma.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: No on 1057-A. No
20 on 1070, aye on all the rest.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Richards.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to
24 explain my vote.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So I want to
3 speak just a few comments on the Criminal Justice
4 Reform efforts that the Speaker and Public Safety
5 Chair Vanessa Gibson and all our colleagues, the
6 legislation they put forward. Today, we are righting
7 a wrong, a systematic wrong that has taken place for
8 far too long, and I know we're legislating this, and
9 it could get--the conversation could get muddled a
10 little. But this is about ensuring that Black and
11 Latino communities who are over--overly targeted with
12 summonses get at least a portion of a level playing
13 field, and I think that that is critical in ensuring
14 that more of our young people, many of the people who
15 I grew up who just might have got these low-level
16 offenses and can't find a job and then, you know, we--
17 we read the newspapers. We read about crime, but
18 this is--these summonses, these low-level offenses
19 have stymied progress for so many young black--

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,
23 please.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --and Latino
25 communities across the city, and let's be clear,

2 other communities share the same quality of life
3 issues, but we are overly targeted, and I could just
4 look at Rockaway Beach as a prime example where I
5 represent the eastern end. And I was looking at a
6 map because it's just so telling. 50 million
7 visitors to the beach and the majority of my beaches
8 aren't even open, 70% of them aren't even open. But
9 yet, 80 to 90% of the summonses in the Rockaways are
10 on my side of the Rockaways, which is a Black and
11 primarily Latino community. So we are sending a very
12 clear message today, and I'm proud of this council
13 that redemption shouldn't be some, but it should be
14 all communities, and even I didn't plan on speaking
15 today on this. My son being here, all of our mothers
16 and--and--and fathers across the city in public
17 housing and other places where we're being overly
18 targeted, we all when we look at our kids have dreams
19 of them going on to do better and to do good. And
20 because they hopped a turnstile, when people don't
21 even--who are going into Long Island may not even use
22 or buy--buy the ticket to get on the LIW and are--are
23 tossed into jail for it. So this is about leveling
24 the playing field and I want to commend the Speaker,
25 and all the people who bravely took on this issue--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

3 Thank you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --to ensure
5 that we can get some justice. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank
7 you, Council Member.

8 CLERK: Rodriguez.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to
10 explain my vote.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: For me one
13 more time this is like--

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
15 [shushing for quiet]

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quite, please.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: --a day that
18 we have a lot to celebrate, a lot that we can say on
19 how the difference is when we have a progressive
20 leadership in the city led by our Speaker Melissa
21 Mark-Viverito and the Mayor--Mayor Bill de Blasio,
22 how we can be able to move good legislation. How
23 important it is that we've been able to say we will
24 be working together with the DA. As we have seen,
25 the Brooklyn DA, the Manhattan DA, they've been

2 putting a lot of energy trying to address the 1.4
3 million New Yorkers that have open arrest warrants
4 since the 1980s. So today's reform that permits one
5 of the most important legacies that our Speaker and
6 our colleagues who's living in city, let's free the
7 DA from minor offense and let's focus on going after
8 some criminals that we have in our city. So
9 congratulations. Thank you, Speaker Melissa Mark-
10 Viverito and our colleague, and again one more time,
11 this is what a progressive Mayor and progressive
12 Speaker can do together. Thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: And I vote
15 aye.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Uh-huh.

17 CLERK: Rose.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to
19 explain my vote.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. [shushing
21 for quiet]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: At the end of the
23 last term we passed the Community Safety Act, which
24 was an important first step in addressing the many
25 issues that fed into the over-criminalization of

2 black and brown people in New York City. These bills
3 are the next step in this process. There has been a
4 lot of misinformation surround this package of bills,
5 and I want to be clear that I would not and I do not
6 support any bill that would decrease our quality of
7 life, not one iota. That would be an anathema to me
8 and to my constituents. However, this bill--this
9 bill--these bills do not result in relaxed
10 enforcement.

11 [Baby Donovan Richards crying]

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

13 [shushing for quiet]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Rather, they move
15 offenders into a civil process rather than through an
16 already clogged court system. It streamlines the
17 system while ensuring that our police have the tools
18 they need to enforce all levels of crime in all of
19 our neighborhoods. I support this package because it
20 is a more fair and productive way to address these
21 quality of life issues for both the accused and the
22 public, and I just want to say I want to commend
23 Donovan Richards, III for his laudatory behavior in
24 this Chamber today. [laughter] Thank you.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
3 quiet] Thank you.

4 CLERK: Rosenthal.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to
6 explain my vote?

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Hard to follow
9 Council Member Rose and all of her comments. So I
10 would just say I'm very proud to be a member of the
11 City Council today in voting aye on all of these
12 bills. Thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Do
14 you--

15 CLERK: Sal--

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Go ahead.

17 CLERK: Salamanca.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

20 CLERK: Torres.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Permission to
22 explain my vote.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I'm proud to
25 support the Criminal Justice Reform Act. Some of the

2 criticisms have been thoughtful, but I have found
3 much of the criticism to be hysterical. To hear some
4 of the critics you would think that the Criminal
5 Justice Reform Act would unleash an apocalypse of
6 public urination in the city of New York and that
7 public uriners will feel more emboldened to do so
8 never before, and that quality of life will never be
9 the same again. I obviously reject this quality of
10 life hysteria. We obviously have every reason to be
11 concerned about quality of life, but I wish those
12 same critics could be a little more mindful of the
13 impact of a criminal record on the life and
14 livelihood of our fellow New Yorkers including young
15 New Yorkers and particularly young New Yorkers of
16 color. Their access to financial aid and higher
17 education, their access to housing, their access to
18 employment. These essential elements of decent life
19 that many of us in this Chamber take for granted, can
20 be easily blighted by the lingering stigma of a
21 criminal record. And so if we are going to saddle a
22 minor actor with the lingering stigma of a criminal
23 record, we should do so lightly. The Criminal Justice
24 Reform Act would empower the NYPD to consider both
25 the nature of the offense, and the offender. Is the

2 offender a first-time offender or a repeat actor, and
3 if the actor is a repeat actor is it driven by sheer
4 willfulness or mental illness? These distinctions
5 matter, and distinctions in judgments about both the
6 nature of the offense and the offender should lie at
7 the heart of responsible, nimble, thoughtful policing
8 and it should have bearing on the penalties that we
9 impose. Wit that in mind, I vote aye.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 CLERK: Treyger.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye on all.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

14 CLERK: Vallone

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Permission to
16 explain my vote.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Today, I rise to
19 defend common sense and preservation of our quality
20 of life her in New York City. While the arguments of
21 reducing the judicial backlog and preserving the
22 future of someone who made a mistake may be
23 meritorious, today's actions would, in fact, not
24 accomplish--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: --either goal.
5 To fix the court system, you budget for more judges,
6 officers, court clerks, and staff. You don't
7 eliminate the crime. To remove the protection,
8 safeguard and quality of life invites even more
9 disregard of the very practices we were taught by our
10 parents not to do. Policy over legislation is always
11 the preferable tool. It has been proven time and
12 time successful prosecuting low-level offenses often
13 leads to the conviction of career criminals with
14 outstanding warrants. Today's legislation renews--
15 removes yet another tool from our NYPD's ability to
16 defend and protect our city. Once again, we will be
17 shifting the burden to our police officers to
18 determine who gets the criminal summons---

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
20 [shushing for quiet]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: --and who gets
22 the civil fine.

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: The chilling
25 effect of these bills is simply unacceptable.

2 Therefore, I urge my fellow Council Members to vote
3 no. Otherwise, today will be remembered as the day
4 quality of life in the city of New York was ever
5 changed and not for the better With that in mind, I
6 vote no on Intro 1057, 1059, 1067-A, 1070-A and vote
7 aye on all other bills and resolutions. Thank you
8 Madam Advocate.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

10 CLERK: Ulrich.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Permission to
12 explain my vote.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you. There
15 were a lot of good points that were made today, and I
16 think one thing is clear, and one thing we can all
17 agree on, we desperately need criminal justice reform
18 and we need a lot of reforms at Rikers Island, and
19 I'm happy to have discussions about true criminal
20 justice reform. But the package of bills, which are
21 before us today I think represent not a return to the
22 days of crime and grime as some people might suggest
23 and some have said in the papers--

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

25 [shushing for quiet]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: --but really
3 speak more about why--what type of city we are, and
4 what type of city we would like to be. And one of
5 the things that I try to do when I vote on bills here
6 as we all do is put ourselves in the shoes of our
7 constituents. How would you like if the person in
8 front of your home was urinating on a regular basis,
9 was getting--drinking alcohol and creating havoc on
10 the block? How would you like it if you lived next
11 door to the house where they just played bombastic
12 music--

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
14 [shushing for quiet]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: --almost every
16 single night of the week, and--and just drove
17 everybody crazy? I think what we're doing today is
18 taking the teeth out of the law, and the law is
19 supposed to act as a deterrent for would-be
20 offenders, and instead of worrying about protecting
21 the quality of life, and the rights of taxpaying, law
22 abiding New Yorkers, we're legislating for the
23 exceptions and not from--and not for the norms, and I
24 have a big problem with that. I think we're sending
25 the wrong message that your actions don't have

2 consequences, and I think that if any of us believe
3 that we are going to collect all of this money that
4 we're going to generate as a result of summonses in
5 lieu of arrests, I think we're being a little bit
6 delusional. It's just not going to happen. People
7 don't pay their parking tickets. If they don't pay
8 their parking tickets, they get their license
9 suspended. If people don't pay the summonses for
10 drinking in the public, for committing some other
11 quality of life offense, there really is no way for
12 us to hold them accountable, truly accountable. So
13 I'll be voting no on Intro 1056-A, 1057-A, 1059-A,
14 1067-A1, 1070-A and aye on all the others. Thank
15 you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 CLERK: Williams.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be
19 excused to explain my vote?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

22 First and again, this pack of legislation does not
23 change the ability---

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

25 [shushing for quiet]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --to enforce.

3 It does not encourage people to continue this
4 behavior. It falls in with what is already existing.
5 80% of these summonses already result in just fines.
6 And in my opinion is if we continue this, the
7 paternalism in a lot of these oppositions will stop.
8 It is time to stop thinking that the black and Latino
9 community, or those that are represented do not
10 understand the complications and stop thinking that
11 we want crime in our communities. Stop thinking that
12 we don't want quality of life to be enforced [bell]
13 because we want all of those things. We get those
14 calls from our constituents. Our constituents
15 understand the need for police, and often request
16 them. They also understand that they don't want
17 over-policing or police brutality. Our constituents
18 understand that they want quality of life issues
19 dealt with because they call us and call the
20 precincts, but they also understand that they want
21 them to be dealt with, with equity. They also
22 understand that they don't want someone who's playing
23 loud music to have a record for the rest of his or
24 her life and not be able to get a loan to go to
25 school to better their life or to lose their housing.

2 My hope is that people will stop telling us that we
3 don't understand those things as clearly as we do
4 because we live in those communities, and we get
5 those calls. The paternalism in this organization
6 sometimes is frustrating, but I think we are making
7 some headway as we move forward, and I'm taking that
8 as the rainbow in this discussion. But we want our
9 communities just as safe as everyone else, but we
10 want equity and justice in doing that. And this
11 package of legislation balance that beautifully, and
12 I'm very proud to vote aye on all. We have to
13 consider what the crime is, and what the punishment
14 is lifelong [bell], and I invite anyone to come to my
15 community and discuss with those constituents their
16 concerns. You will find--

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

18 Council Member--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --are similar to
20 those of your constituents.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member,
22 welcome back.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Well, except
24 the impact is much greater.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 Council Member.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 CLERK: Deutsch.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: No on 1056-A,
8 1057-A, 1058-A, 1059-A, 1067-A, 1070-A and yes on the
9 rest.

10 CLERK: Matteo.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 1056-A,
12 1057-A, 1058-A, 1059-A, 1067-A, 1070-A. Aye on the
13 rest.

14 CLERK: Van Bramer.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

16 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic]

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: As we await the
19 tally, I would like to invite my colleagues to sign
20 onto Intro No. 1197, a bill that I am sponsoring with
21 Council Members Ferreras-Copeland, and Council Member
22 Levin. This bill would strengthen Local Law 46 of
23 2014, a bill that I sponsored, which requires ACS to
24 report on programming to prepare youth who are likely
25 to age out of the foster care system. The amendments

2 in Intro 1197 will strengthen the reporting
3 requirements and enhance agency cooperation. This
4 bill is part of a legislative package being
5 spearheaded by Council Member Levin to address
6 several of the problems with the foster care system,
7 and I thank Council Member Levin for his leadership
8 on this issue, and encourage all of my colleagues to
9 sign onto this important bill. And we welcome DJ to
10 the Chambers. [laughs] [pause] [Baby Donovan
11 Richards squealing] Oh, quiet in the Chambers.
12 [laughs] [pause] Good.

13 CLERK: Three pages.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Three pages.

15 Okay. All items on today's General Order Calendar
16 were adopted by a vote of 49 in the affirmative, 0
17 negative and 0 abstentions with the exception of
18 Intro 1056-A, which was adopted by a vote of 44 in
19 the affirmative, 5 negative, and 0 abstentions and
20 Intro 1057-A, which was adopted by a vote of 40 in
21 the affirmative, 9 negative and 0 abstentions. And
22 Intro 1058-A, which was adopted by a vote of 45 in
23 the affirmative, 4 negative and 0 abstentions, and
24 Intro 1059-A, which was adopted by a vote of 43 in
25 the affirmative, 6 negative and 0 abstentions, and

2 Intro 1067-A, which was adopted by a vote of 43 in
3 the negative, 6--43 in the affirmative, excuse me--6
4 negative and 0 abstentions, and Intro 1070-A, which
5 was adopted by a vote of 39 in the affirmative, 10
6 negative and 0 abstentions, and LU 376 and
7 accompanying Resolution 1094, which was adopted by a
8 vote of 47 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0
9 abstentions, and Land Use 377 and accompanying
10 Resolution 1095-A, which was adopted by a vote of 47
11 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0 abstentions, and
12 the Revised Land Use Call-Up Vote is 49 in the
13 affirmative and 0 in the negative. Introduction and
14 Reading of Bills.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
16 referred to committees as indicated on the Agenda.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: There are no
18 resolutions today. We will begin general discussions
19 with the Minority Leader, Minority Leader Matteo.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: There's a lot of
21 things.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Where were is he?

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: He must have
24 left.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay, Council
3 Member Levin.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: [off mic]
5 Levine.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Levine.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you very
8 much, Madam Speaker. I want to call my colleagues'
9 attention to a bill I'm pleased to be introducing
10 with my colleague Council Member Menchaca today.
11 It's Intro 1193, which would required reporting on
12 the number of students in our public schools who are
13 receiving training on computer science. When I talk
14 to entrepreneurs, tech entrepreneurs in the city,
15 they tell me their biggest obstacle--

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
17 [shushing for quiet]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: --towards
19 expansion here is not the cost of real estate or red
20 tape in local government, it's the lack of adequately
21 trained talent. And if we can train our public
22 school students for this career of the future, then
23 we're going to unlock the door to hundreds of
24 thousands of jobs. I also want to call my
25 colleagues' attention to Intro 1182, which I'm

2 pleased to be introducing with Council Members Chin,
3 Mendez and others today, which would require that all
4 lifting of deed restrictions in New York City go
5 through community boards, City Council Members and
6 the borough president for review. Thank you very
7 much.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
9 Garodnick.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
11 much. I am very pleased to introduce a bill today,
12 Intro 1189--

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] [off
14 mic] Keep it down, please. Keep it down.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
16 quiet]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --that would
18 require the Mayor's Office of Operations to develop a
19 one-year pilot program for the use of Beacon
20 navigation technology, which provides navigation
21 assistance to people with disabilities. The program
22 would be implemented in at least 20 different
23 locations throughout the city including both indoor
24 and out door public spaces. Our physical environment
25 and infrastructure here in New York City should

2 reflect the needs of the people who live here and use
3 our public spaces everyday, we need to recognize that
4 every individual does not navigate these spaces in
5 the same way. Beacons would be a lifeline for people
6 with disabilities, and we should get them up and
7 running here in New York. Using Bluetooth
8 transmitters, Beacons can send signals to a user's
9 phone and provide location information, which can
10 then be used to provide audio or visual cues to the
11 user. They can help alert people to crosswalks or
12 physical barriers, inform commuters, which bus is
13 arriving and guide users to the closest public
14 amenities. In other cities around the globe, Beacons
15 have seen great success. In Bucharest, visually
16 impaired users can received real time information
17 about public transit through Bluetooth enabled
18 Beacons including when the correct stop is
19 approaching on the bus that they are arriving. San
20 Francisco International Airport tested a prototype
21 for a comprehensive indoor positioning system
22 complete with a sortable directory that can be used
23 to get audio directions to the correct gate--

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

25 [shushing for quiet]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --or to the
3 nearest coffee shop.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quite please. You all
5 are going to be quiet.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
7 quiet]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: The program
9 would be developed by the Director of the Office of
10 Operations in consultation with both DOITT and the
11 Mayor's Office for People with Disabilities. Our
12 primary focus with the pilot program would be to
13 develop this technology for people with disabilities,
14 but the potential users--

15 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
16 down.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --and usage
18 for Beacons are numerous, and that's part of what
19 would make this pilot program so exciting. So I
20 encourage my colleagues to take a look at Intro 1189
21 and I look forward to speaking with you about it.
22 Thank you.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
24 Council Member Koo.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [coughs] Thank
3 you, Madam Advocate. I want to use this opportunity
4 to welcome my intern Joyce Choi. She is from Queens
5 College and a political science major. She's going
6 to graduate in June, and she's speaks a second
7 language in Korean, and she's also looking for a job,
8 if my colleagues want some help [laughter] just let
9 her know or let me know. Thank you.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations.
11 [laughs] Council Member Deutsch.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Hi. Thank you
13 Madam Public Advocate today--

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
15 [shushing for quiet]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Today--

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
18 We're still in session.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: --today I--I
20 introduce Intro 1185, a bill that will mandate the
21 Department of Aging to provide multi-lingual
22 information to seniors about how to register their
23 life sustaining equipment with utility companies.
24 This would include outreach--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: --to senior
5 center, to our local NORCs and making the material
6 available--

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
8 quiet]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: --online. Many
10 of our districts experience power outages that affect
11 thousands, particularly during windy or rainy
12 seasons. When I coordinate with OEM in my district
13 the NYPD and the Fire Department during such an
14 incident, our priority is always checking on those
15 with life sustaining medical equipment and restoring
16 their power first. It is important that those who
17 need this emergency response are aware of how to go
18 about registering with their utility company. But
19 many, particularly those who do speak English as a
20 first language are unaware that they are able to
21 register utilities--like--like utilities like Con-
22 Edison to ensure their protection in the event of a
23 power outage. I had an incident in my district
24 during the power outage last year when a senior was
25 connected to vital medical equipment and was not

2 registered with the utility company. Thankfully, her
3 grandson was visiting at the time and called 911
4 immediately averting disaster. But situations like
5 this are avoidable, and I encourage my colleagues to
6 join me as a co-sponsor of Intro 1185 to ensure that
7 the distribution of this crucial information is
8 widespread in 10 commonly spoke languages in our
9 city. Thank you very much.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
11 Council Member Williams.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very
13 much. I just wanted to say thank you to all of my
14 colleagues. I went through a harrowing experience.
15 I'm not completely finished but, all of your texts
16 and all of the phone calls, and all of the visits
17 were very much amazing, and they were helpful going--
18 going through what I went through. So I just want to
19 say thank you so much. The camaraderie was great. I
20 got out of the hospital the day before my 40th
21 birthday. Thank God for that. So I just wanted to
22 say thank you so much. I really, really, really
23 appreciate it, and it really, really helps in the
24 fight. You don't really understand until you're
25 going through it. In terms of my hair, I don't know,

2 I just woke up. It was gone, but thank you so much,
3 and God speed.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
5 Council Member Mealy.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I just want to let
7 everybody--tell everybody enjoy your Fleet Week and
8 the Memorial Weekend, but please do not forget the
9 reason for this weekend. And I want to thank Howard
10 Teich, the Founding Chair of the Brooklyn Jewish
11 Historic Initiative, and I want to thank the New York
12 Chambers of Commerce, President Mark Jaffe for giving
13 \$4.2 million to upgrade the Zion Triangle--

14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
15 down, keep it down.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: -Monument in
17 Brownsville. The Brownsville Triangle Monument, what
18 it say on this monument: To commemorate those who at
19 the call of their country left all that was dear,
20 endured hardship, faced danger and finally passed out
21 of sight of men. And that's what happened in
22 Brownsville today. We had this great memorial.
23 Brownsville, a neighborhood that was predominantly
24 Jewish when the World War II Memorial was erected in
25 Zion Park in 1925. Today, Brownsville is

2 predominantly African-American and Latino. The
3 ceremony brought the unity and transition of a
4 neighborhood over time. All--as all of these
5 communities of diverse backgrounds, ethnicity and
6 religions came together today to honor our uniformed
7 service men and women who were lost in service, and
8 those who have served our country and returned, and
9 remain with us predominantly Jewish then. Now,
10 predominantly Latino and African-Amer--African-
11 American. And just please remember, everyone, as
12 freedom is not free, we must continue to remember
13 those who have served and died for their country, for
14 our freedom. Our veterans we should show our
15 appreciation to all those men and women in service
16 for today who are serving today.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So let us give
19 homage, pay homage to those who have val--I cannot
20 say it--valiantly served our country during--during
21 this horrific war and that was World War I.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

23 Thank you Council Member.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: And thank you, and
25 please do not forget.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you so
3 much. Council Member Richards.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you Madam
5 Public Advocate. Colleagues, I would like to call
6 your attention to several pieces of legislation being
7 introduced today. [background comments] For decades
8 communities in Southeast Queens lived with the fact
9 that--

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
11 [shushing for quiet]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --a slight rain
13 could end their home.

14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
15 down, keep it down.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --but last year
17 the historic Ten-Year Plan by Mayor de Blasio
18 committed \$1.5 billion [background comments] to build
19 out a sewer system that never caught up with the
20 population growth. Today, I am introducing Intro
21 1198 along with Council Members Miller, Ulrich and
22 Wills that requires that DEP submits a thorough flood
23 mitigation plan to the Mayor, the Council and the
24 Speaker. This bill will ensure that the plan is
25 implemented in a--implemented in a timely fashion,

2 and the community can be updated on the progress on a
3 regular basis. During the negotiation process of MIH
4 and ZQA, one major concern was around the Board of
5 Standards and Appeals, and their role in granting
6 zoning variances and special permits. Today, we--I
7 am introducing Intro 1200, which will require the BSA
8 to notify and send a copy of each proposal to the
9 local council member when any developer applies for
10 these variances and permits to make sure that we are
11 not blindsided by anyone developing in our community.
12 I'd like to thank Council Members Salamanca and
13 Dickens for partnering with us on this bill.
14 Finally, after we--after I participate--and I want to
15 thank Council Member Levin--in the Fourth Akia Shadow
16 Program last year, it became clear that we needed to
17 do more as a city to protect and improve the lives of
18 our foster children. This is why I work on--with--on
19 Intro 1199 with Council Members Levin and Eugene,
20 which requires ACS to provide all youth in foster
21 care ages 13 and older to fill out an anonymous
22 survey about their experience with their foster
23 parent to make sure that the only foster parents are
24 those who have the best interest of every child in
25 mind. And I cone again would like to thank Council

2 Member Levin for his package of bills introduced
3 today by the focus on this very bill. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I urge my
6 colleagues to sign on.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
8 Council Member Chin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Madam
10 Public Advocate. Good afternoon. Today I'm pleased
11 to join Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer and
12 Council Member Mendez, Levine, Lander and Kallos to
13 introduce Intro 1182, a bill that will increase
14 transparency in our city for properties with deed
15 restriction. Intro 1182 will create a searchable
16 database of properties with deed restrictions imposed
17 by the city. This allows community members and
18 elected officials to identify and monitor properties
19 in their neighborhoods with deed restrictions like
20 Rivington House in my district. This database and
21 the reports that will come from it will be crucial in
22 identifying and protecting valuable city assets. The
23 legislation will also require the city to hold public
24 hearings when considering lifting any deed
25 restriction protecting the public interest. Public

2 hearings will require notification of the community
3 board, the borough president and the City Council
4 member. This will ensure that public input and allow
5 community members to protect crucial city assets
6 provided from removal. While I'll continue to fight
7 to restore Rivington House to the Lower East Side
8 community, these piece of--this piece of legislation
9 is a vital step to ensure that another Rivington
10 House will never happen again. I want to thank Mitta
11 Dashma (sp?) for her work on this bill, and I ask my
12 fellow council members to sign on. Thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
14 Menchaca.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
16 Public Advocate and today Majority Lead--Majority
17 Leader Van Bramer is introduction Resolution 1075
18 urging Albany to life the cap on the school zone
19 speed cameras so that every school can benefit from
20 the life saving technology. Limiting the use of
21 these cameras to only 140 locations leaves more than
22 93% of New York City schools and more than one
23 million school children at risk. Relatedly, the
24 State Law also currently keeps city speed cameras
25 from issuing tickets beyond hour before and after--

2 one hour after school events, although students are
3 often on or near camps for several hours before or
4 after school events. This means that tickets are not
5 issued at night, although this is the time when fatal
6 crashes are most prevalent. For this reason I'm
7 asking you to-- especially those who signed onto Van
8 Bramer's resolution to join me in asking the state to
9 remove the restriction that would prevent speed
10 cameras from issuing tickets 24 hours a day. If you
11 haven't done it all--if you haven't done so, I have--
12 that resolution is mine at 0235. Next, Intro 1195.
13 This is adult literacy reporting local law. Today,
14 I'm introducing that with all of you who are
15 supporting me and the 700 young and old people
16 outside who were asking for this adult literacy
17 initiative. I'm here before you to ask that you sign
18 onto Intro 1195, which would require the city to
19 report on the status of adult literacy courses
20 offered by the city or through a contract with the
21 city. In my time advocating for adult literacy
22 services, I found that there is a great need for data
23 such as the number of persons who apply to these
24 programs, the number of applicants who are denied
25 admission to these programs based on the results of

2 examinations, and the number of applicants who are
3 denied admission. This is going to give us valuable
4 data to understand how much we need to actually fund.
5 Lastly, in the last 18 seconds, I want to give a
6 shout out to the parents of Red Hook and Sunset Park
7 who are demanding more commuter--computer science
8 education. We know that the Mayor has a commitment
9 to ensuring the 10-year--in ten years that we get all
10 city public schools required computer science
11 education, and I stand with Council Member Levine on
12 Intro 1195. Please sign on. Thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
14 Treyger.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,
16 Public Advocate. Colleagues, I ask you to join me as
17 well as my colleagues Council Members Greenfield,
18 Grodenchik, Rose, Borelli and Richards in supporting
19 Intro 1201, a common sense bill that protects drivers
20 from incurring parking fines in situations where the
21 relevant signs are illegible. The Department of
22 Finance lists illegible signage as a common defense
23 for disputing a parking ticket. This bill simply
24 codifies that as an--as an affirmative defense, and
25 provides clarity as to evidence requirements. We

2 found many cases in my district where the parking
3 signs are completely flicked--faded and illel--
4 illegible, and people are getting tickets unfairly.
5 I also just want to just add my voice to say that as
6 many of my colleagues and their family and friends
7 gather to observe and celebrate Memorial Day. Let's
8 never forget the sacrifice of those who have put
9 their lives on the line to make sure that our country
10 remains free, remains the greatest country in the
11 world, those who have served, those who are still
12 serving and those who are enlisting in service. We
13 should never forget our veterans, and thank the
14 Speaker, Councilman--as well as Councilman Ulrich for
15 pushing through the creation of the Department of--of
16 Veteran Services Affairs here in New York City.
17 Thank you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
19 Council Member Steve Levin.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
21 much, Public Advocate James. Today, I join nine of
22 my colleagues, Council Members Richards, Eugene,
23 Grodenchik, Palma, Salamanca, you Public Advocate
24 James, Ferreras-Copeland, Dromm and Cumbo in
25 introducing a package of bills that can improve the

2 foster care system for the nearly 10,000 New York
3 City children and youth in care. We developed many
4 of these bills following the Council's Foster Youth
5 Shadow Day in November, and I want to thank the
6 Speaker her--for her support of that initiative.
7 During the event, youth shared ideas about improving
8 the foster care system in New York City informed by
9 their own experiences in the system. While a number
10 of children in foster care has decreased
11 significantly in the past year, and continues to
12 decrease over the last 10 years in a downward trend,
13 still there is more--there is much more that we can
14 do to ensure that they receive vital services and can
15 return to their families or be adopted by lifetime
16 families. That's why we're introducing bills that
17 would first create a taskforce to recommend
18 improvements to our foster care system, which would
19 include experts such as child advocates and foster
20 youth, implement a survey for children and youth in
21 foster care regarding experiences with their foster
22 parents. As Council Member Richards pointed out in
23 his legislation to call on the New York State
24 Legislature to improve the housing subsidy for former
25 foster youth in order to reduce their risk of

2 homelessness as they age out of care. To ensure that
3 we have the necessary data to push through systemic
4 reforms. We must expand reporting on foster care
5 regarding educational stability and graduation rates,
6 instances of abuse and neglect, attainment of
7 government issued identification and barriers to
8 permanent placement. I want to--there are other
9 legislation that are also part of this package, but I
10 want to express my sincere gratitude to the youth
11 that were instrumental in crafting the framework of
12 many of these bills. Thank you very much for sharing
13 your experiences to make a positive and lasting
14 impact [bell] on the foster care system. And I want
15 to thank in addition to that Stephanie Gendell, the
16 Citizens Committee for Children; Jessica Maxwell of
17 the Children's Aid Society for the valued advisement--
18 -

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
20 Council Member.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: --and unfailing
22 dedication as well as the Red Hook Horowitz
23 Foundation

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
25 Thank you.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: --for bringing
3 forward the issue of--

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: --of barriers to
7 permanency.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I just want to
10 thank all the staff that worked on this as well.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
13 much Public Advocate.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
15 Council Member Ulrich.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you, Madam
17 Public Advocate, my good colleagues Council Member
18 Mealy and Treyger and I think somebody else already
19 beat me to it, but I did want to [laughter] just rise
20 and express my deep appreciation for our veterans who
21 have made the ultimate sacrifice in defense of our
22 country and our freedoms, and I know that this
23 Council stands behind our veterans, And I appreciate
24 all of the support of my colleagues not only in the
25 bill that we recently passed, but at the hearing,

2 which the Speaker also attended over the Department
3 of Veteran's Services. And we're looking forward to
4 fulfilling our commitment, and honoring those
5 sacrifices by doing right by our veterans who are
6 still with us thankfully, and we have more than
7 225,000 of them. But Memorial Day on Monday is not
8 about sales. It's not about barbecues. It's even
9 about the parades that some people might want us to
10 believe it's about. It really is about the price of
11 freedom, those who have paid it, and honoring the
12 dead by taking care of the living. And Memorial Day
13 is not one day on the calendar. It should be
14 everyday on the calendar and, you know, I think of
15 the men and women who fought on the beaches of
16 Normandy and died. I think of the men and women who
17 fought in Vietnam in the jungles of Vietnam and on
18 the battlefields of Korea, and--and the mountains of
19 Afghanistan and the deserts of Iraq so that we could
20 stand here in this body in a democracy in the
21 greatest country that God has ever created on the
22 face of the earth and debate issues and talk about
23 issues, and talk about the type of city we want to
24 live, and how we ought to get along. That is only
25 possible because of the sacrifices that our veterans

2 have made on our behalf and--and I know that all of
3 you join me in saying thank you and honoring them,
4 but we simply can't do enough. But if in some small
5 way we can do something this weekend to honor the
6 fallen, I hope that we all take time to reflect and--
7 and do just that. So thank you again to my
8 colleagues. [bell]

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
10 Council Member. Council Member Gibson.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very
12 much, Madam Public Advocate. I, too, want to join
13 all of my colleagues in wishing all of us certainly a
14 happy Memorial Day, which is a time of reflection and
15 remembrance, and making sure that we pay homage to
16 our veterans, past and present. I want to thank our
17 Speaker and Council Member Eric Ulrich for being
18 champions for veterans. My uncle a Vietnam vet
19 sincerely thanks you. He watches all the hearings
20 and always says we have champions here fighting for
21 our vets. So we are definitely being taken care of.
22 During my tenure here as Public Safety Chair, and all
23 of the hearings that we've held, I really have come
24 to develop a deep appreciation for our sergeant-at-
25 arms. And this week we are losing one of our

2 sergeant-at-arms, one of my residents in the Bronx,
3 and I certainly want to take this opportunity to
4 express my appreciation for him for his support for
5 always having my back during some very fruitful
6 hearings that we have had in the past few years. So
7 I want to recognize Raoul Rosario as he is leaving us
8 at the City Council. Raoul wave so we all know who
9 you are. [applause] [laughs] Thank you so much.
10 He's moving on and moving out of the state. So we
11 are certainly going to miss you, but we thank you for
12 being a part of an incredible team her at the City
13 Council making sure that we are safe each and every
14 day and thank you for your work. And on that note,
15 everyone have a great Memorial Day, and it's great to
16 see D3 here. Thank you, Council Member Richards for
17 bringing your son here, and thank you so much.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 Council Member Barron.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madam
21 Public Advocate. I just want to call my colleagues'
22 attention to the recent passing of Ms. Susannah
23 Mushatt Jones, who was affectionately known as Ms.
24 Susie. She did live in my community, and she had the
25 distinction of being the world's oldest person

2 living. So at the age of 116, she recently passed.
3 During the time that she was in her prime, she did
4 serve on the boards of many of the NYCHA develops
5 that she served in where she lived. She was a member
6 of the Committee that provided watch service for
7 people coming in and out, and she was very active in
8 the senior center at Van Ballier (sp?) Houses where
9 she lived. So we just wanted to put it on the record
10 that she recently passed, but we did want to extend
11 our condolences to her family, and appreciation for
12 the life that she lived. Ms. Susie at 116 years old.
13 Thank you.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May she rest in
15 peace and the last speaker is Council Member Rose.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.
17 Colleagues, I hope that you can support me and my co-
18 prime sponsors on Intro 1195, which will require the
19 city to report on adult literacy programs offered
20 pursuant to the contract with the city. And Intro
21 1201, which would waive parking violations when a
22 parking sign is illegible. Both of these bills are
23 very needed for different reasons. With respect to
24 adult literacy, I want us to have a better
25 understanding of the multitude of programming that

2 the city funds so that we can be better stewards of
3 the taxpayers' dollars in determining how to allocate
4 those funds. For 1.8 million New Yorkers limited--
5 limited proficiency in English can be a serious
6 impediment to all aspects of life from getting a job
7 to communicating with physicians, government
8 personnel and our children's teachers. Cuts in adult
9 literacy programs last year were felt throughout the
10 city. With a better understanding of where and how
11 the city's dollars are being spent, we can begin to
12 create a better, more strategic system to address
13 this issue. And with respect to the other bill, I'm
14 sure--do any of you think you should have to pay for
15 a parking violation fine when it was not clear that
16 you should not have parked in that space? And yet,
17 it happens everyday because of illegible signs.
18 Intro 2001 is logical. It's good sense, and I only
19 need to repeat the old saying, the thing speaks for
20 itself. So I hope that all of you will support both
21 of these needed and worthy bills. Thank you.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
23 Mealy.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I just want to
25 thank this whole body for the condolences for my

2 staff Murray (sp?) L. Phillips who passed away. He
3 was with me for about 20--I can say in politics for
4 20 years and he's the nephew Ella Vay (sp?) Stan--
5 Stanford of the education, and I just want to say
6 thank you to all who called and wished the family
7 condolences. Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May he rest in
9 peace, and now to close, the Speaker Melissa Mark-
10 Viverito.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
12 Public Advocate. Two quick things that we had gotten
13 the news today that I was not able to include in my
14 notes, but that State Controller Tom DiNapoli's
15 father has passed away, Nicholas DiNapoli so that
16 anyone can keep him in their thoughts, and maybe
17 extend condolences. Also, that today's meeting
18 stands in recess, and so with that, thank you again.
19 This has been a very important day. I think the
20 Criminal Justice Reform Act is going to be a great
21 way to bring greater equity and justice to our city.
22 I'm so happy that we were able to do that. So thank
23 you all to my colleagues and again we stand in
24 recess. [gavel] Thank you so much. Thank you.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

127

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 31, 2016