

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

----- X

April 14, 2016
Start: 1:24 p.m.
Recess: 1:59 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers
City Hall

B E F O R E: DAVID G. GREENFIELD
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

PALMA
ROSE
DICKENS
GARODNICK
KOO
LANDER
WILLIAMS
RICHARDS
BARRON
COHEN
REYNOSO
TORRES
TREYGER
RAPHAEL ESPINAL
KALLOS
LEVIN

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

2

CHAIRPERSON DAVID G. GREENFIELD: Good afternoon; my name is David Greenfield. I am the council member from 44th council member District Brooklyn, public chair service and chair of the land use committee. I want welcome my esteemed colleagues and members of the committee joining us today. I want folks to try to whisper, if they can or take conversation outsides. Council member council member Gentile, council member Palma, council member Rose, council member Dickens, council member Garodnick, council member Koo, council member Lander, council member Williams, council member Richards, council member Barron, council member Cohen, council member Reynoso, council member Torres, council member Treyger, and we have been joined superstar of the day council member Raphael Espinal. Give him a round of the applause, should give here and nice hair color, like you have Ritchie Torres.

Before we began to consider the modification to the East new York rezoning, I first will call on a vote to add the items to the agenda, because we were not able to distribute a regular

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

calendar prior to scheduling this meeting, this vote is required under the Land Use Committee rules.

Council clerk, please call the roll for a vote to add land use items No. 341, 342, 343 and 344 to the agenda. The vote to add the items to the agenda. The clerk, please call the roll.

COUNCIL COMMITTEE CLERK LEE MARTIN: We roll call vote on the motion.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: I vote, aye.

Council Member Gentile: Aye.

Council Member Palama: Aye.

Council Member Dickens: Aye.

Council Member Garodnick: Aye.

Council Member Mendez: Aye.

Council Member KOO: Aye.

Council Member Lender: I vote, Aye.

Council Member Rose: Aye

Council Member Williams: Aye.

Council Member Richards: Aye.

Council Member Barron: Aye.

Council Member Cohen: Aye.

Council Member Reynoso: Aye.

Council Member Torres: Aye.

COUNCIL MEMBER Treyger: Aye.

Council Member Mendez: Aye.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: By a vote of 16 votes in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions. Motion has passed.

CHAIRPERSON DAVID GREENFIELD : Thank you Mr. Clerk. Before we move on to the formal portion of the proceeding, I just want to recognize that today really is an extraordinary day in the work that we do here in the New York City Council. Our voting today to approve with modification a plan for East New York that is quite literally the best community affordable housing plan ever in the history of New York. Off course, it is complementary to the plan that we passed just a couple of week ago. The mandatory inclusion the housing plan, and this is the first of 15 such plans but just to put this. But just to put this in perspective, council member Espinal and I am not exaggerating when I say this, literally over the last few weeks spent 20 out of 24 hours a day. I can tell you that spoke to him at 2 am and then I spoke him at 6 am. So, that's how I can actually know. I presume that among those 4 hours, he slept, might be he went jogging, but he spent 20 out of 24 hours a day negotiating the best possible

1 deal for his constituents and in fact and this is
2 really not an exaggeration that I am actually calling
3 this the "Unicorn Deal" and the reason, I am calling
4 this the "Unicorn Deal" is because quite frankly, you
5 never going to see a deal like this. Again, this is
6 the new standard that is being set in the city that
7 quite frankly everybody else will chase but rest
8 assure that I can tell you as chairman of the land
9 use committee they are not going to capture it, but
10 that's okay, because East New York is in fact an
11 iconic part of New York city and council member
12 Espinal for tooth-to-nail to get the best possible
13 deal.
14

15 Just to give you some highlights, a
16 guarantee within the next two years of 1300 brand new
17 units of affordable housing in East New York that
18 alone is unprecedented. A guarantee that in the
19 public sites, 50% of the units will be below 50% AMI.
20 Just to be clear they are going to be 100% affordable
21 but 50% will be below 50% AMI. In the private units,
22 40% below 50% AMI and the City has made a commitment
23 that they will not finance any private units unless
24 they are using the lowest AMI level financing, which
25 is called the ALA term sheet plus that those units

1
2 have to be a 100% affordable, means the put this in
3 perspective a single mom, who works 40 hours a week,
4 who makes 11 dollars an hour, who has two kids will
5 be able to rent a brand new two bedroom apartment for
6 600 dollars a month, that's astonishing. That really
7 is astonishing but what's more council member Espinal
8 did interest to see this as an opportunity to create
9 affordable housing, he used this rare opportunity,
10 literally a once in a life time opportunity as an
11 elected official to revitalize all of the East New
12 York with 267 million dollars and promised capital in
13 infrastructure improvements.

14 I am going to say the number again
15 because rest assure you never going to see this
16 number again, ever again, so that's how important
17 this is; 267 million dollars committed, committed, my
18 friends from city planning, just want us to note in
19 writing, thank you very much. In writing 267 million
20 dollars committed to improvement in East New York.

21 We are talking about a brand new public
22 school. We are talking about new parks, new streets,
23 senior centers facilities, really on a scale that no
24 one can even imagine. This is really something that
25 is extraordinary and I tip my hat to council member

1
2 Espinal and I can tell you folks. I am not
3 exaggerating, one week ago today, we did not have a
4 deal and the nature of the way, we do things is, we
5 do not leak the reporters can watch for us, we did
6 call say them and say that we do not have a deal. We
7 simply went to City Hall and said listen, it's not
8 good enough. It is not good enough. This is too
9 important, not to get everything that this community
10 need a council member Espinal asked for and a week
11 later, we have a deal because every major issue that
12 he fought for, he was successful.

13 So, I am now going to turn over for a
14 remarks to council member Espinal. I will remind you
15 all that today is the day, today is a unique day
16 Thursday April 14, 2016, the day that we will have
17 voted through the "Unicorn Deal" for East New York.
18 I will turn over to council member Espinal and then
19 we will proceed with the formalities. Council member
20 Espinal.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you so
22 much Chair Greenfield and I really want thanks also
23 Richards for the opportunity to speak today and for
24 your support that is in entire process, you both have
25 truly played a really significant role and making

1
2 sure that East New York gets that 260+ million
3 dollars. So, thank you for all the work, he has done
4 on behalf of my constituents. I thank my community
5 including CB5 and 16, the collation of community of
6 advancement and many individual constituents, who
7 have through their value input help make this plan
8 the best possible plan, we can produce for this
9 district.

10 I will like to thank the Board President
11 Erik Adams for his support and for his many helpful
12 suggestions. I also want to thank my colleagues and
13 Inez Barron, who has fought tirelessly just to make
14 sure we get as many as affordable apartments as we
15 can. I want to thank my colleagues in this committee
16 as well. I also extend a very special thanks to the
17 staff the council of land use division, especially
18 Rajuman and James Lloyd, who have worked tirelessly
19 on this proposal as well as my staff Courtney
20 Peterson and Lloyd Lesperance for their many, many
21 hours of work on this project.

22 I finally want to thank the
23 administration for working with me over the last two
24 years and for Green to many request to DCP put in
25 many hours on this project. HPD created a separate a

1
2 housing plan for East New York and EDC created its
3 own plan for the industrial business zone to make
4 this a comprehensive plan. This has been a very long
5 process with extensive public input to remind
6 everyone here, this area has been under study for
7 years with fairly funded sustainable communities plan
8 coming before the actual East New York plan.

9 We carefully read the recommendations
10 from the community board, the board president and the
11 city planning commission reports and we listen to 8
12 hours of public testimony in council chambers, which
13 we carefully considered as a part of this process.
14 From the start, I told my community that I would
15 fight for a better plan, one that was not just about
16 housing but about rebuilding a neighbourhood that has
17 been neglected for decades and that takes more than
18 just affordable housing. It takes investments in our
19 infrastructure, our parks, our schools, creating
20 supports for our small home owners in our local
21 businesses and making sure that we created
22 environment, where new jobs are able to flourish in
23 the neighbourhood, so those who are unemployed can
24 have an opportunity to have a good paying job.

1
2 I fought for a better plan and I am proud
3 that we voting on today is vastly better than one
4 census by the City Planning Commission. First and
5 foremost, I fought hard for additional affordability
6 and as result the plan now includes more units for
7 families making below 38,000 dollars a year on public
8 sites. Over a 100 more units of affordable housing
9 at public land identified on Christopher Street and
10 Glenmore Avenue, meaning that we are guaranteed over
11 1300 units of affordable housing in the first year of
12 the plan. We are also getting 500 link voucher to
13 help 500 homeless families, who lives in the East New
14 York community, get out of the shelters and it's
15 affordable housing. We will be converting homeless
16 shelters and two clusters sites into permanent
17 affordable housing and MIH deep affordability option,
18 so that more residents of extremely low income can
19 get affordable housing.

20 The preservation of affordable housing is
21 just as important. Now only HPD committed to be
22 known regularity agreements for the 1100 units that
23 would expire next five years. They are also
24 launching the Community Retro Fair New York City
25 campaign to boost participation in the green housing

1 preservation program, which targets small buildings.

2 Tenant harassment is a major concern of mine and I

3 fought to extend free housing legal services from two

4 years to five years.

5
6 I fought hard for improvements to our

7 schools, parks, streets, IBZ and the plan now

8 includes a recorded billion dollar in capital

9 improvement to the neighbourhood up from 150 million

10 dollars and those improvements would come to help to

11 build a community center, help to rebuild our

12 schools, help to build a brand new school, help

13 revitalize all of my parks, create a safer Atlantic

14 Avenue, create a fund for home owners and also create

15 an economic development plan in the IBZ, which also

16 will bring in a Work Force 1center to connect the

17 local residents with good paying jobs.

18 I spent hours on the zoning with my staff

19 and as a result we have changed the proposed zoning

20 to preserve industrial jobs, providing buffer for

21 IBZ, reduce height in ocean hill and on the Fulton

22 street to reflect the character of the local

23 buildings, adjust the zoning a part of landscape for

24 needed medical center. I removed Arlington Village

25 from the rezoning.

1
2 I am confident that this plan is the best
3 that we have ever seen in the city and I probably ask
4 my colleagues to vote yes.

5 CHAIRPERSON DAVID G. GREENFIELD: Thank
6 you council member Espinal and congratulations once
7 again really an amazing and historic deal. I want to
8 point out just because it's something that we have
9 never done before ever in the history of rezoning
10 either. Not only, there are going to be a guaranteed
11 1300 new units of affordable housing but is also a
12 guarantee that council member negotiated that folks
13 who lives in the East New York, who are already
14 displaced and who unfortunately now homeless and that
15 we have never done this before in the history of
16 rezoning in the City of the New York that they will
17 be 500 link vouchers that will be utilize to bring
18 these folks back into East New York and find them
19 apartments paid for by the City of the New York.

20 Really it's unprecedented and that's
21 something that quite frankly, I do not even think, we
22 imagine when we first went down this path. I really
23 is only thanks to your perseverance and to your hard
24 work and to your vision for what you want to future
25 of East New York. I salute you council member

1
2 Raphael Espinal. Now to the formal part of the
3 proceedings.

4 The iconic rezoning plan is a major
5 victory for the residents of the East New York. East
6 New York is first of its neighbourhood that is said
7 to be rezoned and this plan truly sets standard for
8 affordable housing. This plan will apply the
9 mandatory inclusionary housing for the first time and
10 HPD has committed to expedite in the construction of
11 over 1300 units of deeply affordable housing over the
12 next two years. In addition, the administration has
13 pledged 267 million dollars in capital improvement
14 for East New York.

15 So, I will thank for council member
16 Espinal and I just want to thank our speaker Malissa
17 Margareta for her unwavering leadership. I want to
18 thank her right hand on Ramon Martinez for working
19 hard with us day and night to get this done as well.
20 I also want to acknowledge chair Richards for his
21 work. He was an excellent partner in this process
22 and really incredibly grateful for his leadership as
23 well.

24 The improvement of this plan required
25 countless hours of work. We thank everyone here in

1
2 the council at the mayor's office DCP and HPD and
3 particularly, I want to give special thanks shoutout
4 to our outstanding land use staff Rajuman is our
5 director and assistance Amy Leviatan, General Council
6 Julie Labuan, Deputy General Council Dillon Cassey
7 and project manager James Lloyd. We also want to
8 thank from council member Esipnal staff Courtney
9 Paterson and Lloyd Lesperance. I want to thank also
10 my chief staff Denny Presley and my council Alina
11 Strava, who spent many hours working on this as well.

12 The modification of zoning tax amendment
13 Land Use No. 344 includes making the deep
14 affordability option available in OMIH proposed areas
15 in the rezoning. This option would require 20% of
16 the floor area in the development to be reserved for
17 families making an average 40% of the AMI. That's
18 31,080 dollars for a family of three, paying 775
19 dollars rent on a two bedroom apartment.

20 Measures to avoid displacement of the
21 existing East New York residents is a key concern of
22 this council. The modification attributes to the
23 protection of this community in this regard. I want
24 to stress this is actually very important point.
25 When we passed MIH QA, we had always said that the

1
2 MIH was going to be the floor not the sealing. So,
3 the technical legal floor is 20% at 40% AMI but with
4 the agreement that what we have with administration
5 is actually going to be 50% of the units are going to
6 be affordable overall and in fact as we said before
7 on private site is going to be 40% below 50% AMI and
8 public site to be 50% at 50 AMI, which proves our
9 thesis that the MIH was simply a floor, not a
10 sealing. Today, quite frankly, you see in the
11 sealing.

12 HPD is making deeper subsidy commandments
13 ever before pledging to subsidize new affordable
14 housing and now choosing extremely low and low
15 income program known ALA throughout the entire
16 neighbourhood including all private sites that opt to
17 accept cities subsidies. The City will also dedicate
18 500 link vouchers as we discussed to take folks of
19 out of homeless shelters and bring them back into the
20 community and affordable housing.

21 Subcommittee has recommended the
22 modification of pro-zoning map amended Land Use No.
23 341 to cut back some of the zoning changes in order
24 to protect the neighbourhood character in some area
25 providing more coherent framework in others and

1 called by areas showed distinctive from the
2 surrounding. This changes reflects concerns to the
3 community and include removing all intervention from
4 rezoning and removing a portion of Shepherd Avenue
5 from rezoning, provide a buffer for the industrial
6 business zone. We are hearing intense industrial
7 activities are allowed. While we are not proposing
8 to modify Land Use No. 342 with 343 the urban renewal
9 plan amendment and disposition, these items we
10 referred to the city planning commission that it is
11 related to the modified items in accordance with a
12 charter in the City Council rules.

14 Finally, the Deputy Mayor has been a
15 number of commitments for city investment into East
16 New York and those commitments are actually reflected
17 in a letter that we have here to council member
18 Espinal from the deputy mayor Alicia Glen dated April
19 14, 2016 and so we will submit the letter into record
20 and refer to you that letter.

21 Once again, I want to congratulate
22 council member Espinal. I want to thank him for his
23 leadership, I want enthusiastically recommend to my
24 colleagues to show support for this and with that I
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

will turn in to my colleagues and the clerk to please call the roll.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: I vote and Aye.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I vote, aye.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I vote, aye.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I vote, aye.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: I vote, aye.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODNICK: I vote, aye.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote, aye.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote, aye and congratulation to council member Espinal.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council member Lander explain his vote.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I just vote, aye. I just want to add my congratulations to council member Espinol. There is to have thought comprehend not only to a far for deeper affordable and protection from displacement but you have thought so comprehensively about the planning issues in the neighbourhood. It's really great. It had some of that to be short to begin with the city planning had done it but to add in the focus on looking at the accessory dwelling units and add in focus on

1
2 strengthening investing in the industrial business
3 zone to add in vision zero and safety Atlantic Avenue
4 to add in broadband. You know, this is a one of the
5 most awful and comprehensive rezoning, not just from
6 point of view of affordability and deep affordability
7 and mandatory affordability, it's a first on all of
8 those other things, it's a very strong and impressive
9 comprehensive plan for the community. So, I
10 congratulation to you and congratulation to the chair
11 and thanks to them and staff for helping. I vote,
12 aye.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I vote, aye and
14 congratulation. You did a great job. You had a
15 herculean task and you did it well. Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I vote, no.

17 CHAIRPERSON DAVID G. GREENFIELD: Council
18 member Williams to explain to his vote.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you Mr.
20 Chair, you are so kind. So, I give a quick speech
21 during the.

22 CHAIRPERSON DAVID G. GREENFIELD: Can you
23 we get Aye this time, may be? Can we get aye, this
24 time, if you are going to explain vote already?

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Oh no, that's I works brother. But to give a little speech in the zoning committee, I did have some time review and asked some additional questions of some folks. I just have to say I, again I don't think that Espinal could have done anything better with everything that's under his control. I do have some concerns about what ALA is not chosen and goes to MIH but because of council member Espinal is a believer in having much as low income as you can, he choose two options that will make sure that they are some low income units there. So, I just want to reward that effort that he gave with I vote, aye.

CHAIRPERSON DAVID G. GREENFIELD:

Congratulations on voting, aye.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVID G. GREENFIELD: Clerk, can you continue the roll please.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Just I want to say congratulations to council member Espinal again David let's not set ball low here, you know, we know he walked away with 267 million and we know, you do not want let up on the ADMEN. We know, what we should think that, you know that we are not going to

1
2 aim high at rezoning as we move forward. So, this
3 was a great rezoning with a lot of capital put in but
4 we are not going to aim lowers, we move forward, so
5 would that make set I vote, Aye.

6 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Just taken worth
7 my assessment to "Unicorn Deal".

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
9 explain my vote.

10 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council member
11 Barron to explain her vote.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I
13 want to commend my colleague Raphael Espinal, we are
14 neighbours and he has 99% the loin share of this
15 district of this rezoning plan. I know that he works
16 diligently. I know he work courageously. I know
17 that the has fought to get a deeper, deeper and
18 deeper and broader in terms of what it is this plan
19 represents. So, once again, I commend him, he stood
20 forth while in that regard and I admire that,
21 however, I am not able to vote in the affirmative one
22 Land Use 344, I am voting in the affirmative on the
23 others, but I do feel that when we look at the
24 community, we are 25% of the residents on the less
25 than 15,000 dollars that they still does not go deep

1
2 enough, when the federal government conducted the
3 sustainability studies, they said in their document
4 that this does result in gentrification because
5 people will be displaced, not specifically this plan but
6 this type of plan over all. So, we know that there
7 are a lot of issues in East New York and we know that
8 this plan addresses some of that and goes down to I
9 believe 23,000 but there are still people, who out
10 went burden they are not going to be eligible to
11 benefit from this plan and there is no requirement
12 that developers in fact do the ALA. I have heard, it
13 has been explained to me that most probably they will
14 because they will be beneficial to them and I
15 understand that will impact on the increased
16 affordability in the East New York but I still feel
17 that the city has an obligation to try to make sure
18 that all of its residents have the benefit of decent
19 housing and that in accord or in conjunction with the
20 housing available to people at even the lower income
21 levels, there is got to be sustained economic
22 development plan. So, the people can afford to live
23 and work in a communities and have that, so with that
24 I vote, aye on all except for Land Use No. 344. Once
25 again, I do commend my colleague. I am voting, no.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to
3 explain my vote. I just want to congratulate council
4 member Espinal. I think that this is one of the best
5 plans I have seen. One of the key pieces that of
6 huge importance is that he is protected the life in
7 air in his district for the foreseeable future with
8 this, every single rezoning, every single up zoning
9 includes context, which means no super scrappers, no
10 building shadowing out the new parks that they are
11 getting no forcing children to play in the shadow of
12 a huge tall building. Everything will be
13 contractual, everything will have a light in air and
14 will protect his residence. I think that for one
15 reason that is huge model. The next piece is
16 selecting the deeper affordability and deepest
17 affordability options with 20% of new housing to be
18 set-aside for household making less than making 40%
19 of the area meet an income and also including option
20 1. Last but certainly not least is, we do not have
21 enough school seats in the City. His district is
22 already overburdened and over and over again, we see
23 the City rezoning without providing adequate seats
24 and his district will be getting several thousand new
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

seats and so for all those reasons, I vote, Aye and say that this is a model for future rezoning.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to explain my vote.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council member Reynoso to explain his vote.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I just want to say a quarter billion dollars 267 million DCP HPD just want to make sure that you guys heard that on the record and I do not believe in Unicorn and I think the Unicorn is not going to come next standard. The next standard is what we are trying to achieve here. We should not give preferential treatment because he was the first but I do want to say, looking at this plan, I have never seen anything closed, where there is one project that is city owned that's going to be 80% and 60% or below or 50% of that project or 50% or below, which is significant. I have never seen that, so I want to just commend council member Raphael Espinal. I also want to say that I had three items or two items of extreme concern to members of East New York when they met with me and one of them was reduction in the overall units to this whole rezoning, which was achieved and

1
2 also the increase in M zones of the removal of MX
3 zones and again there is slither alongside off of the
4 Pennsylvania Avenue and Shepherd Avenue, which we are
5 now letting that say as M1-1, which is going to work
6 as buffer to allow for M3-2 right next where to drive
7 and not worry about speculation and we will two sites
8 of Wyona, Bradford and Liberty Avenue that also going
9 to stay manufacturing, so we are able to increase the
10 amount of manufacturing and economic development,
11 decreased the overall units and actually add
12 affordability and overall affordable housing units.

13 Again, council member Raphael Espial,
14 very, very good job and thank for setting the bar at
15 267 million. A lot of council members are going to
16 thank for that.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Permission to my
18 explain vote.

19 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council member
20 Torres to explain his vote.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Yes, I just want
22 to just take a moment to express admiration for how
23 council member Espinal conducted himself, even though
24 you under extraordinary pressure from various forces,
25 you stood firm in your independence. You shutout the

1
2 noise, you did what you thought. You and your heart
3 were best for district. You got a level investment
4 that you are community is not seen in decades that's
5 public service at its finest. You should be proud
6 but my admiration is accompanied by envy. Envy is
7 that the Unicorn is going to your district rather
8 than mine but with that said I happily vote, aye.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
10 explain my vote.

11 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council member
12 Treyger to explain his vote.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So, I want to
14 join my colleagues in commending council member
15 Espinal, I thank for, really I think being a
16 testament for enduring a firestorm of criticism from
17 all directions but I think at the same time
18 understanding that the status quo in his community
19 was not acceptable and making sure that he does
20 everything possible to make that this plan is not
21 just a plan about affordable housing but actually
22 remembering that there is a neighbourhood at stake.
23 So, I truly appreciate the fact that there are
24 significant investments and I have to tell my
25 colleagues that I know we count these things as

1
2 victories but quite frankly that's governments job
3 that's the government job to invest in schools, in
4 roads and parks, so commend council member Espinal
5 for making sure that government does its job because
6 I represent a community that in 2009 was promised the
7 whole host of things as well in Coney Island and that
8 plan has not been fully actualized yet. I appreciate
9 the fact the council member Espinal has put into
10 place yearly measurements to make sure that things
11 will be monitored and securitized rightfully, So I
12 also appreciate the fact that in this plan, I just
13 read that there will be HPD assistance to provide
14 home ownership opportunities for families because if
15 not enough to say that New York should be affordable
16 for all, everyone should be able to give a chance to
17 own a piece of New York, that mean is an affective
18 answer to gentrification because you own a piece of
19 the neighbour, no one could force you out. So, I
20 commend my colleagues commend Chair Greenfield, Chair
21 Richards for all of their support and all the Land
22 Use staff and with that I vote Aye on all

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote, aye.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to
25 explain my vote.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Counsel member
3 Rodriguez to explain his vote.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
5 first of all thank you to Chairman Greenfield,
6 council member Espinal, speaker Melissa Margarita and
7 may applause you and you know everyone, all the
8 staff, who worked so many hours on this negotiation, I
9 think, I so wonder that that he is working also with
10 the administration the rezoning of inward. We will
11 be looking at how the administration, the local
12 council member in this case, council member Espinal
13 is able not to going to have these conversation and
14 these negotiation. You know what we have in front of
15 us is a big responsibility. We are building housing
16 for those that had lived in our communities for so
17 many decades, when we were effective by jobs and
18 crimes and a lot of people left and at the same time,
19 can we also built, no for the new coming. I think
20 that with this plan nothing is perfect thing like,
21 neither we are but I believe that this plan is close
22 to whatever we can deliver that can guarantee the 40-
23 50 year for now, we can say that the working class
24 and middle class who live in this community that can
25 say we are living here in the area where we are

1
2 sharing spaces and resource with the more wealthy
3 sector of society but without pushing our people out.
4 So with that I congratulation, council member
5 Espinal. Thank you speaker Margarita and Chairmen
6 Greenfield so because I know that the timing here on
7 this important rezoning is very important only for
8 the council districts that council member Raphael
9 Espinal represents but for all of us, who represents
10 on the sub-community that want to build for all
11 sectors. For the more vote to won, by preserving for
12 working class and middle class with that I vote, aye.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote, aye. I
14 want to offer my congratulation to my colleague
15 Raphael Espinal, who I know has worked for how many
16 months? over a year now on this project and has put
17 diligent thought into this and has also taken very
18 taken very seriously his responsibility to his
19 constituents to negotiate a rezoning that is going to
20 be though in the long term interest of the community
21 in maintaining affordable housing and creating
22 affordable housing and creating academic development
23 that benefits the community that is not economic
24 development for the very rich to be further enriched
25 but for the community to build a long term

1
2 sustainable prosperity and I want to congratulate him
3 and offer him my enthusiastic support in voting Aye
4 on all.

5 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you. I
6 want to just make a three final points before the
7 clerk will call the final roll. The first point is
8 both council member Espial, myself and council member
9 Richards were actually in conversations with the non-
10 profit affordable housing developers, just to put
11 this in context, they actually told us that it was
12 simply not possible to go any lower, so that just
13 speaks to us literally hitting the ceiling, we have
14 maximized that level of affordability.

15 The second important thing to note which
16 each one of these items is noteworthy on its own, is
17 that the administration has reached on an agreement
18 with council member Espinal that they will work to
19 convert three homeless shelters in the district and
20 turn that into three permanent affordable housing,
21 which is sounding as well and then finally something
22 that I mentioned as well but it is also incredible
23 that administration is committing 12 million dollars
24 to work on a pilot program to legalize basements.
25 This has been a conversation in the city for decades,

1
2 literally, this is the first time and we are giving
3 to **shout out** to council member Lander, who has been
4 working on this issue for years as well. This is the
5 first time in the City that The City has agreed to do
6 this and actually put money aside to do this as well
7 . Finally, you know I think my team but really the
8 hardest working people for years on this have been
9 the Brooklyn City Planning Office lead by Winston Van
10 Angel and his entire team, I want to thank them, I
11 want to congratulate them and recognize them in their
12 entire city planning staff throughout the city for
13 having the vision years ago, years ago to come up
14 with this and to say, we can actually make a positive
15 difference for all New Yorkers and especially for the
16 residents of east New York. They have been working
17 on this for nearly a decade and today's the
18 combination of that work, so I really want to
19 congratulate all the folks at City Planning, who has
20 spent so much time and effort working on this and
21 thank you also much and with that I will ask clerk to
22 call the roll and then I will conclude this meeting.

23 COMMUNITY CLERK ON LAND USE: Land use

24 items 341, 342, 343 have been adopted by a vote 19 in
25 the affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

and Land Use item No. 344 has been adopted by the committee vote of 18 in affirmative, 1 in the negative and no abstentions. Thank you.

Thank you the Land Use committee for Thursday April 14, 2016 is hereby adjourned.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.



Date 04/14/2016