

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

January 15, 2015  
Start: 10:19 a.m.  
Recess: 11:52 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:  
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:  
ANTONIO REYNOSO  
CARLOS MENCHACA  
COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES  
DANIEL R. GARODNICK  
DAVID G. GREENFIELD  
DEBORAH L. ROSE  
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS  
I. DANEEK MILLER  
JAMES G. VAN BRAMER  
JAMES VACCA  
MARGARET S. CHIN  
STEPHEN T. LEVIN

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Richard Schroeder  
Asst Commissioner of Strategic Technology Division  
New York City Police Department

Michael Marsico  
Asst Commissioner for Parking Operations  
New York City Department of Transportation

Jeff Lynch  
Assistant Commissioner  
Intergovernmental Community Affairs

Joseph Freer  
Sergeant  
New York City Police Department

Eric McClure  
Executive Director  
StreetsPAC

Julia Kite  
Policy and Research Manager  
Transportation Alternatives

Josef Szende  
Executive Director  
Atlantic Avenue BID

Alex Slacky [sp?]  
Representative  
AAA Northeast

Tom Murphy  
Resident

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...everyone. This morning we're not talking about horses, neither we're talking about Uber but we are talking about important issues which is how to modernize parking in our streets. Last year I went with my two daughters and my wife to visit a museum in Washington D.C. and we were able to park our car in the area and be able to put money as we were inside the museum so we didn't have to waste our time. So we will be addressing similar ideas for New York City as also all the ideas on my colleague Council Member Dan Garodnick also has introducing his bill. Good morning and welcome to today's hearing of the New York City Council Transportation Committee. I'm Ydanis Rodriguez, Chair of the Committee. And I am joined by Council Member Vacca, Garodnick, and Menchaca. Today we will hear three bills all related to how our city can better manage and think about parking in the vast amount of space we provide for city drivers throughout the five boroughs. For many New York drivers myself included the search for in coastal park and is the burden we will take on to enjoy the imagined convenience of

1  
2 car ownership. The early morning wakeup to move the  
3 car from one side of the street to the other has  
4 become the tired ritual for many of the 1.4 million  
5 car owners in New York City. Today's hearing seek  
6 to find new ways of thinking when it comes to  
7 parking, ways that might create greater convenience  
8 but at a greater price or way that might come as a  
9 benefit to some but a detriment to others  
10 automatically... several months ago. Our city... our  
11 city's policy should reflect a good... a goal of  
12 moving people away from single occupancy vehicles  
13 and more toward mass transit. And parking can play  
14 a key role in this vision. The Department of  
15 Transportation has already come up... come up with  
16 some ideas about how to better manage parking  
17 system throughout the city in our always engaged  
18 community of advocate is constantly looking to  
19 expand the boundaries of our thinking in a more  
20 progressive direction in this area. We hope to hear  
21 from them about how we can push this conversation  
22 forward. And... export action towards safer and more  
23 open roadways mitigating the stress and congestions  
24 that impact all who use our streets. From the Park  
25 Smart Programs used by DOT to account for the shift

1  
2 in supply and demand for parking at different hours  
3 of the day to the parking availability map also  
4 inaugurated by the DOT that shows drivers where  
5 open spot are and helps cut down on cruising for  
6 hours to find parking to ideas for residents..  
7 residential permits parking programs like those  
8 employed in Boston. San Francisco and Washington  
9 D.C. presently getting studied by the DOT in 2012.  
10 We should put all ideas on the table with the goal  
11 of better organizing our parking systems with a  
12 clear policy goal in mind. The DOT as... as 2012  
13 managed... manage it... managed 85,000 on the streets  
14 meters' packs. This number falls far short of the  
15 many thousand more free parking spaces available to  
16 city drivers on side streets and in some central  
17 business areas. Progressive ideas advocate have  
18 long questions the city provision of free parking  
19 given that in some luxury housing developments  
20 choice parking amenities can run up to over one  
21 million dollars for a spot. Now I not suggesting  
22 the imposition of new financial burdens on drivers  
23 already facing a struggle to keep they cars. But we  
24 need to gradually... gradually move away from the  
25 ideas that free parking is a right in New York

1  
2 City. This is especially true for those who look to  
3 succumbance... suncumberance parking rules through  
4 the use of fake parking placards. Intro 326  
5 introduced... introduced by Council Member Dan  
6 Garodnick who help ticket agents easily identify  
7 fake parking placards as all placards issued by the  
8 city would be require to have a scannable... a  
9 scannable... a... a barcode to prove it's valid... valid...  
10 with this bill we can ultimately crack down on  
11 anyone who abuse or come... a parking placard to  
12 circum... circumvent the rules as we seek to  
13 modernize and rethink our parking system we can  
14 also make... make it more accessible to a changing  
15 technology landscape. Intro 996 introduced by  
16 Maisel would allow drivers to purchase money meter  
17 trying time from their phones via... a text message.  
18 This would allow people sitting in a restaurant to  
19 add time to the meter without having to interrupt  
20 dinner with the family... with their family.  
21 Additionally, Intro 990... 999 which I also  
22 introduced will allow drivers to buy and sell  
23 excess time on their own all via the touch of a  
24 finger on a smartphone. Now I have here concerns  
25 about these ideas in fears that a single entity or

1  
2 two could buy up everyone's excess parking time. So  
3 control must be put in place. But I still believe  
4 that if done correctly this could connect drivers  
5 to one another to exchange time left on the meter  
6 after they leave their park... they parking spots.  
7 This ideas and more are what we hope to hear  
8 elaborated on and debated this morning. And I look  
9 forward to... to a lively discussion to and issue an  
10 import toward... and I'm sorry to elaborate  
11 discussion to an issuing important to many New  
12 Yorkers. I'd like to thank my committee staff  
13 Counsel Kelly Taylor, Policy Analyst Jonathan  
14 Masserano, Gafar Salo [sp?], and my Chief of Staff  
15 Carmen del A Rosa [sp?] as Deborah... and Deborah  
16 Roso... Russel Murphey. Now I would like to also to  
17 give the opportunity to my colleague Council Member  
18 Dan Garodnick to speak on Intro 326.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you  
20 very much Mr. Chairman. Thank you for this hearing  
21 today on both bills. And I... I will just speak about  
22 Intro 326 very briefly. As... as you noted Intro 326  
23 addresses ongoing parking placard abuse by  
24 requiring that placards have some sort of a barcode  
25 or some sort of a technological and identifiable

1 feature so the traffic enforcement agents can scan  
2 it for its validity. We have seen a significant  
3 number of fraudulent uses such as Xeroxed, expired,  
4 or fake placards. In 2008 then Mayor Bloomberg  
5 significantly cut down on the number of city issued  
6 permits as a way to address traffic congestion and  
7 inappropriate use. However, this did not address  
8 placards which were scanned or fabricated which  
9 currently constitute a not inconsiderable number of  
10 placards out there on the street. A report issued  
11 by transportation alternatives a number of years  
12 ago stated that 57 percent of placards that were  
13 surveyed on city streets were fake which suggests  
14 that there may be thousands or even tens of  
15 thousands of invalid placards being used in the  
16 city. While this bill cannot address state issued  
17 permits which might also be fabricated or expired  
18 it should not stop us from being proactive here and  
19 addressing the enormous problem that we can tackle  
20 on our own streets. I am also open to taking  
21 suggestions from the Department of Transportation  
22 and the Police Department on their preferred  
23 validation method if it is not a barcode or a QR  
24 code or anything similar. The point of this  
25

1  
2 legislation isn't to get stuck on a particular  
3 technology but rather that we utilized a technology  
4 that can successfully root out fraudulent parking  
5 placards. As a matter of safety congestion and  
6 simple fairness we shouldn't have cars masquerading  
7 as official vehicles to park where they please.  
8 We've tried to crack down on this issue for many  
9 years and previous administrations have supported  
10 the concept. Although we have not gotten to the  
11 next step on this bill. So it's past time that we  
12 act and remove that question about whether any  
13 individual parking placard is legitimate. So again  
14 I want to thank Chair Rodriguez for his  
15 thoughtfulness and including this bill on today's  
16 hearing. And I look forward to the testimony from  
17 P.D. and DOT. Thank you Mr. Chair.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you  
19 Council Member Garodnick. With that I would now  
20 read the affirmation and invite all members of  
21 administration to present their testimony made.. But  
22 before that I also would like to recognize Sheema  
23 Obitrary [phonetic] Obitrary [phonetic] who is a...  
24 finance analyst for the council especially to this...  
25 for this committee. Please raise your right hand.

1  
2 Do you... to tell the truth, the... the whole truth,  
3 and nothing but the truth in your testimony before  
4 this committee. Okay. You may begin.

5 RICHARD SCHROEDER: Are we good? Okay.  
6 Good morning... good morning Chair Rodriguez, members  
7 of the council. My name is Richard Schroeder. I am  
8 Assistant Commissioner of Strategic Technology  
9 Division for the NY Police. I am joined today by my  
10 colleague Sergeant Joseph Freer of the Office of  
11 the Chief of Department and on behalf of our  
12 Commissioner William J. Bratton. I wish to thank  
13 Council for the opportunity to comment today on  
14 Introduction 326. As we just heard Intro 326 would  
15 amend the city charter, require the NYPD and the  
16 Department of Transportation to place barcodes on  
17 the parking placards that are issued which would  
18 allow for traffic enforcement agents to confirm the  
19 validity of those placards. I am here to speak  
20 about the technology associated with such an  
21 initiative and some other matters that may address  
22 the councilman's commentary earlier. As you know  
23 the Police Department will soon be piloting new  
24 portable scanned handheld devices to be used by our  
25 traffic enforcement agents in the field. While

1  
2 these new state of the art devices will certainly  
3 be able to scan a barcode on a parking placard. The  
4 ability of the device to determine from the barcode  
5 whether or not the actual placard is legitimate or  
6 not raises several operational and technological  
7 issues in order for the device to scan the barcode  
8 and determine its validity. To scan the barcode is  
9 easy, determine its validity not so much. We would  
10 need a backend database which would have to be  
11 built to properly capture every vehicle across  
12 every agency that has been legitimately issued a  
13 permit or placard by DOT or NYPD, multiple agencies  
14 would need access to this database in order to  
15 properly catalogue all of the vehicles that have  
16 been issued parking permit or placard and a city  
17 agency would have to be charged with administering  
18 that database in order to keep it current so that  
19 our traffic enforcement agents in the field would  
20 have access to current information. Moreover, as  
21 the police department we would require that this  
22 backend database require robust security,  
23 encryption features among them, so that identifying  
24 information the police department personnel is  
25 protected. These are significant fiscal operational

1  
2 technological issues that the bill does not address  
3 fully and these issues certainly cannot be  
4 resolved, I don't believe within one year,  
5 effective date of the legislation. Furthermore,  
6 even if these issues were to be resolved it is  
7 important to underscore that traffic enforcement  
8 agents will be receiving the new portable scan  
9 devices. Police officers will not. Last year on  
10 their own police officers again distinct from  
11 civilian traffic enforcement agents. Police  
12 Officers issued 825,000 parking summons. Police  
13 officers do not possess scanners in the field and  
14 they will not be receiving the new scan devices.  
15 Thus the addition of the barcode technology to city  
16 issued placards would be of little value to that...  
17 to those persons, police officers, who are trying  
18 to discern the validity of the placard. It will  
19 only be useful to civilian traffic enforcement  
20 agents. Given the rapid pace of the development of  
21 security technology the barcode may become obsolete  
22 as an effective tool even for them for the validity  
23 and validation of the parking placards within a  
24 relatively short period of time. Moreover, we would  
25 note that the use of a barcode will not necessarily

1  
2 prevent production of fraudulent placards since it  
3 can be easily replicated with a mere access to a  
4 standard copy machine. I would note however, and  
5 this is important, the parking placards that are  
6 currently issued by NYPD and DOT both carry  
7 security features which we would be happy to  
8 discuss in a non-public forum but which we believe  
9 are quite substantial. And as DOT will testify the  
10 adoption of the Pay by Cell technology will allow  
11 for more efficient permit management, achieving  
12 many of the goals sought by this barcode  
13 legislation. I thank you for the opportunity to  
14 speak with you this morning. I'm happy to answer  
15 any questions with my colleagues from NYPD and DOT.  
16 And any questions you may have...

17 MIKE MARSICO: Good morning Chair  
18 Rodriguez and members of the Transportation  
19 Committee. I am Mike Marsico, Assistant  
20 Commissioner for Parking Operations for the New  
21 York City Department of Transportation. And I'm  
22 joined by Jeff Lynch, DOT's Assistant Commissioner  
23 of Intergovernmental Community Affairs. On behalf  
24 of Commissioner Trottenberg I want to thank you for  
25 having us here to discuss modernizing our street

1 parking system in New York City. At DOT we are  
2 constantly searching for ways to make it easy to  
3 navigate the streets by approving operations.  
4 Specifically, on the parking front, we are working  
5 to improve the customer experience by expanding  
6 payment options, ensuring liability, and ease of  
7 use. One major advancement in parking management  
8 was the launching in 1996 when DOT installed the  
9 first Muni Meters in New York City. Beginning in  
10 2000 we significantly expanded their use in the  
11 commercial core of Manhattan. Over the past 15  
12 years we have established one of the largest most  
13 advanced meter systems in the world. The gradual  
14 adoption of Muni Meters allowed for additional  
15 methods of payment such as parking cards and credit  
16 cards citywide. Parking cards are great for  
17 customers. They're purchased online, they display  
18 the balance every time the motorist pays for  
19 parking and do not expire until the balance is  
20 exhausted. The use of Muni meters creates the  
21 maximum amount of parking along a curb as opposed  
22 to the single space stalls. In 2013 DOT  
23 successfully completed converting the management of  
24 all parking spaces in the city to Muni Meters.  
25

1  
2 Through this initiative DOT converted over 80,000  
3 single space meters to just over 13,700 Muni meters  
4 regulating the same number of spaces. Recently DOT  
5 upgraded to a smart meter system which was  
6 completed in the summer of 2015. The new system  
7 provides a wide array of operational and consumer  
8 benefits such as the ability to program different  
9 hours of operations, rate structures, smart  
10 collection, improved visual information on the  
11 display screen, and high resiliency to vandalism.  
12 The new platform allows the DOT to achieve new  
13 benefits for our customers and we continue to  
14 embrace technological advances and parking to  
15 improve the overall parking experience. DOT used  
16 this new technology to program our Muni Meters to  
17 turn off when they're out of paper and during times  
18 when meter parking rules are not in effect based on  
19 local law 49 of 2013 that the council passed. Now  
20 motorists do not inadvertently spend their hard-  
21 earned money for parking when they are not required  
22 to do so. In addition, DOT's new smart Muni Meters  
23 allowed us to give motorists the option to prepay  
24 for parking before the meter regulations are in  
25 effect each day. We're happy to continue to work

1 with Council... including Council Member Greenfield  
2 who sponsored this bill to improve the parking  
3 experience for all motorists. Looking to the future  
4 benefits for New York... for New Yorkers DOT ran a  
5 single pilot program ending in March 2014 to  
6 evaluate electronic payment parking known as Pay by  
7 Cell. This pilot took place in the Belmont Arthur  
8 Avenue area of the Bronx and allowed motorists to  
9 pay for parking via a smartphone app. The user  
10 friendly pilot provided motorists with warnings via  
11 email or text message when they paid for parking  
12 time and when it was about to expire. The driver  
13 then payed for additional time easily and quickly  
14 up to the posted time limit. This proof of concept  
15 was a model for the Pay by Cell program under  
16 current development. DOC has been extensively  
17 collaborating with New York City PD to launch a  
18 citywide Pay by Cell program. Using an app or phone  
19 call motorists will be able to use an efficient,  
20 secure, cash free mechanism to manage their parking  
21 transactions. Traffic enforcement agents will have  
22 a record of the active parking transactions for  
23 each vehicle allowing for accurate enforcement. Pay  
24 by Cell will allow New York City to offer major  
25

1 benefits currently not available with Muni Meters.  
2 Motorists will be able to stop their parking  
3 transactions, stop their transactions in real time.  
4 This means that customers will only pay for the  
5 time they are actually parked. These elements  
6 address the core issues raised both in Intro 966  
7 and Intro 999. As we get closer to implementation  
8 of the Pay by Cell program we will continue to  
9 update the committee. In the meantime, I want to  
10 acknowledge the hard work both by NYPD and the  
11 parking management team at the DOT and making sure  
12 that the roll out will be successful. I want to  
13 briefly touch on Intro 326 that requires barcodes  
14 on... on permits. New technology enabling Pay by Cell  
15 will also provide opportunities for much more  
16 enforcement ways of managing permits. DOT takes  
17 permit reform very very seriously and we will look  
18 to leverage all available technologies and  
19 collaborate with NYPD to improve the overall  
20 management of permit use in the city of New York.  
21 Thank you very much and we are happy to answer any  
22 questions.  
23

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Thank  
25 you. I have few question. ...know that my colleagues

1  
2 they also have question. One is what was the cost  
3 to the city of the pay by phone and parking  
4 availability pilot in the Arthur Avenue  
5 neighborhood... private phone call... calls of a  
6 citywide pay by phone program?

7 MIKE MARSICO: I apologize... I do not  
8 have that figure with me but I will get back to and  
9 find out the exact cost of that. We had worked with  
10 several vendors on that technology.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: The other thing  
12 is what was were the Arthur Avenue pilot  
13 successful? And what were the biggest lessons  
14 learned?

15 MIKE MARSICO: We feel that the pilot  
16 was successful. There were issues with the  
17 technology though. So it did appear that people do  
18 like the... the program. It's just that  
19 technologically we had to find some things to  
20 improve in it.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So can you  
22 elaborate a little bit more on lessons learned from  
23 that pilot program?

24 MIKE MARSICO: And I just got whispered  
25 the pilot was no cost to the city.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It did... it did  
3 not cost the city?

4 MIKE MARSICO: Did not cost the city.  
5 The issues that we had we were using in ground  
6 sensors. There were a lot of problems with the  
7 pucks. They were picked up by plows. Sometimes they  
8 didn't report properly. And that inconsistency was  
9 something that we were not comfortable with.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: What about... what  
11 have you learned? What it... when... when it come to  
12 what is experience of other cities that you team  
13 had been looking at and what have you learn from  
14 those initiatives in other city that already been  
15 using at to allow drivers to pay for the meters?

16 MIKE MARSICO: Actually I was at TW  
17 [phonetic] last week in DC and was talking to a  
18 traffic agent that was using a pay by app cell. And  
19 they are very pleased with it. They felt that  
20 they've gotten a lot of positive push back...  
21 response from both the users and the enforcement  
22 agents that put it into place.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great.

24 MIKE MARSICO: Philadelphia also. So we...  
25 we've gotten positive feedback on it.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So what... what is  
3 your based on the pilots program that you had done  
4 how much it will cost assuming that we can move  
5 together supporting this bill and make... make this  
6 initiative citywide how much will it cost the city  
7 to do it?

8 MIKE MARSICO: I... I... I unfortunately do  
9 not have that information on what the total cost. I  
10 know... I can defer to the police department on this  
11 also on cost but we're looking at pilots first to  
12 vet this app before we do that.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Well I'm  
14 happy to hear that we are in the same direction,  
15 that we can continue having this conversation. And  
16 for me the no doubt as I have said before that  
17 great respect for the leadership of the DOT  
18 Commissioner, the NYPD commission the whole thing  
19 and this administration. But we want to make this  
20 things through legislation because we don't want  
21 to... to whoever is the new administration 15 20 year  
22 for now. We want to be sure that we continue  
23 working together because we want to make this thing  
24 part of the law of New York City where it doesn't  
25 matter who is the new mayor 20 year for now this is

1 something that we can say that we leave in place.  
2  
3 Council Member Dan Garodnick.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you  
5 very much Mr. Chairman. I... I just wanted to follow  
6 up on mostly on the placard question but I did have  
7 some follow-ups on the... the Pay by Cell and how it  
8 relates to Chair Rodriguez' proposal. So just a...  
9 Commissioner Schroeder on this in your testimony  
10 you noted that in order for a device to be able to  
11 scan a barcode and determine validity there would  
12 need to be some sort of a backend database to  
13 capture all those placards that are out there. I  
14 guess I have a threshold question here which is  
15 does the city have a list of all of the placards  
16 which have been issued and are valid at least for  
17 city agencies?

18 RICHARD SCHROEDER: From... from... I'm  
19 going to answer this yes and allow my colleague Joe  
20 Freer here, Sergeant Freer to provide some more  
21 detail.

22 SERGEANT FREER: So for New York City  
23 Police Department permits we have a vehicle  
24 identification unit whose function and they  
25 function under the office of the chief is to verify

1  
2 and account for all parking permits issued by the  
3 NYPD. Furthermore, in order to receive your new  
4 year permit it's 2016 everyone's getting the newly  
5 issued permits, you have to turn in your old permit  
6 as a strict one for one accountability measure. So  
7 as far as NYPD issued permits there is strict  
8 accountability for... for those items and... and we do  
9 take that very seriously.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Are there  
11 permits... [clears throat] excuse me, permits issued  
12 by other city agencies other than the PD?

13 SERGEANT FREER: I believe our  
14 colleagues at DOT issue some permits.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Ah-ha okay,  
16 so let us ask DOT the same question. So PD has a  
17 list of all the placards that you issue when you  
18 redeem a new one based on a new year it's a one for  
19 one transfer. DOT presumably you have the same?

20 MIKE MARSICO: We... we replicate the  
21 system too. It's the same thing. We have an account  
22 of every permit that we issue. You do not get a new  
23 permit until you send back the old permit. So it  
24 files the same. We... we issue approximately 65,000  
25 permits. Clergy, agency, business, DOT... there are a

1  
2 host of ones that we... give out. And then what we do  
3 is we furnish... what the... the permit looks like in...  
4 in specifics to the PD for the traffic enforcement  
5 agents to carry.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Sorry can you  
7 just say that again just a little louder?

8 MIKE MARSICO: We issue... we provide an  
9 insert for the traffic enforcement agents to carry  
10 to identify all the permits that the DOT issues.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: An insert did  
12 you say?

13 MIKE MARSICO: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: What... what...  
15 what do... what do you mean by that?

16 MIKE MARSICO: A reference card that  
17 goes in their... their book.

18 SERGEANT FREER: Police officers carry  
19 what's called a memo book which is sort of like a...  
20 a log. It's a pocket-sized binder that fits in  
21 their back pocket. And an insert is something that  
22 fits into that binder. So that's a... that's our  
23 jargon, is what you call an insert.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And how many  
25 placards does PD issue?

1  
2 SERGEANT FREER: So annually we issue  
3 placards to our employees for parking at police  
4 facilities. So those placards are roughly about  
5 30,000 a year. We issue approximately 4,000  
6 placards a year to our unmarked police vehicles so  
7 basically those are placards that identify a  
8 unmarked vehicle as a marked police vehicle. And  
9 additionally we issue about 5,000 placards to  
10 outside agency partners such as federal agents,  
11 metropolitan transportation police, the MTA police,  
12 and district attorney offices.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay so a  
14 little bit over 100,000 placards that are issued  
15 between PD and DOT today?

16 JEFF LYNCH: And.. and councilman just  
17 to.. just to clarify of the ones the DOT issues  
18 that's for a number of agencies but also about  
19 approximately half are for people with  
20 disabilities.

21 MIKE MARSICO: 30,000.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I see. The  
23 DOT permits include.. include people with  
24 disabilities.

25

1  
2 JEFF LYNCH: Correct. And it does not  
3 include the state issued hang tags for people with  
4 disabilities which... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay so about  
6 half... so you say about half of them?

7 JEFF LYNCH: Approximately half. And we  
8 can... and we can give you a breakdown after.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay. Are  
10 there other agencies in New York City that issue  
11 parking placards beyond PD and DOT?

12 MIKE MARSICO: Not to my knowledge no.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay. Okay so  
14 if the PD is issuing placards for some of the  
15 partners like MTA or did you say Port Authority  
16 also?

17 SERGEANT FREER: No just MTA, District  
18 attorneys...

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Oh DA...

20 SERGEANT FREER: Yeah.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: ...I'm just  
22 reading my notes I said I had PA but you said DA.  
23 Okay got it, District Attorneys.

24 SERGEANT FREER: And federal law  
25 enforcement.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And Federal.

SERGEANT FREER: Correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: So are there any agencies that are state or other agencies that have the power to issue valid parking placards in the city of New York that are not otherwise done by the Police Department or the Department of Transportation?

MIKE MARSICO: We do the state... the hang tags... which are not used for... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Can you just pull that microphone a little closer to you?

MIKE MARSICO: Sure. We issue the state hang tags and New York City only. Outside of New York City it's the state issues their own. But these are the hang tags that are used in off street facilities parking lots and so forth. So when you go in there it says handicap parking or persons with disability that's where these are used. We issue those. But I do not know of any other ones that are being issued.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: So there's no... there's no other state agency that is issuing

1  
2 parking placards other than for those hang tags  
3 for... and that's for disability purposes right?

4 MIKE MARSICO: Correct.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: That... that we  
6 know. So there's no other jurisdiction out there  
7 which is issuing parker... parking placards which are  
8 legitimately being used on New York City Streets.

9 SERGEANT FREER: ...there are... there are  
10 state police, state court officers. So there are  
11 other law enforcement related placards... placards  
12 again that identify law enforcement vehicles that  
13 are not issued by the city. As far as their  
14 authority you know I can't speak to that not being  
15 an attorney but they are issued to state police  
16 vehicles.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: DOT when the  
18 state police department or other law enforcement  
19 court officials have parking placards they are  
20 allowed to be used on New York City streets and  
21 allowed to avoid general parking rules on the basis  
22 of their being on official business, is that  
23 correct? Or are those invalid parking placards?

24 JEFF LYNCH: That's correct.  
25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: They are  
3 correct... they are legal?

4 JEFF LYNCH: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay. Does...  
6 does anybody have a sense as to how many legal  
7 state PD law enforcement state issued non... I guess  
8 disability or non-disability state agency permits  
9 that are being issued?

10 JEFF LYNCH: No we... we wouldn't have  
11 that number on our side.

12 MIKE MARSICO: We could... I... I could go  
13 back into it and determine it. Because we do have a  
14 record of every one that we do. I don't have that  
15 figure with me now.

16 JEFF LYNCH: But as to state ones we... we  
17 don't again keep track but if we can... if we find  
18 out that information we can share it with the  
19 committee.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay thank  
21 you. And Commissioner Schroder in your testimony  
22 you mentioned that it would be difficult to keep a  
23 database current and up to date. Sounds to me like  
24 if at least for the 39,000 permits that PD is  
25 issuing and the 65,000 permits that DOT is issuing

1  
2 they're replaced every single year. There's an  
3 ability to have a high level of control. What's so  
4 hard about keeping that database up to date?

5 RICHARD SCHROEDER: Okay. I'm going to  
6 ask Sergeant Freer to comment first of all...

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Can you also  
8 move the microphone.

9 RICHARD SCHROEDER: Yeah sure.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Maybe it's  
11 just me but I'm...

12 RICHARD SCHROEDER: I'm going to ask the  
13 Sergeant first of all to comment on the 30,000  
14 because they're a little bit different in the sense  
15 that they're not for street use right?

16 SERGEANT FREER: Right. I mean I guess  
17 in terms of the keeping up the database the number  
18 of placards that we issue for the employees for  
19 parking at police facilities we said is about  
20 30,000. On the average course of a year there might  
21 be approximately 100 that are reported lost and  
22 stolen. And again you need to report these to get  
23 the permit the next year. So it's not something  
24 that we know or they're just going away and they're  
25 not happening. So the universal... the number of

1  
2 updating that database you know isn't... isn't a lot  
3 from that portion of it for internal PD use. For...  
4 for outside agencies I'll defer to the  
5 commissioner.

6 RICHARD SCHROEDER: Okay so that would  
7 seem to support your contention it shouldn't be  
8 difficult but in fact there are many... there are...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I'm sorry did  
10 you say that it would support my contention that it  
11 is not extremely difficult?

12 RICHARD SCHROEDER: Yes, it would...

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.

14 RICHARD SCHROEDER: ...seem to but I don't  
15 believe...

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.

17 RICHARD SCHROEDER: ...it does.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.

19 RICHARD SCHROEDER: Let... let me... let me  
20 explain further.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Please.

22 RICHARD SCHROEDER: A lot of the  
23 tickets... placards I'm sorry are issued to persons,  
24 not to vehicles right. So I may take my placard  
25 from one vehicle to another. I may be issued a

1  
2 vehicle from a... from a vehicle pool. I can know  
3 from the backend database whether or not it's a  
4 valid placard yes that's true. I can't know if it's  
5 associated with a valid vehicle unless we maintain  
6 the association in real time of the placard to the  
7 vehicle. And that is where I think the  
8 administrative difficulties would ensue.

9 SERGEANT FREER: Right. And to further  
10 what the Commissioner said since these placards  
11 identify basically it's employee parking, no  
12 different than you would have for a homeowners or  
13 condo association these are used in police lots  
14 around police facilities for security purpose so we  
15 know who's... who's parking where. You might... your  
16 car might be in the shop. You might have to switch  
17 out and get a rental or a loaner for that day. You  
18 might have to take your wife's vehicle because it's  
19 an SUV and have to get into work. So tying the... the  
20 one to one is the administrative difficulties that  
21 the Commissioner is speaking to. Yes, we can see if  
22 the permit's stolen or not, sort of a thumbs up,  
23 thumbs down, that's fine. But as far as associating  
24 to any specific vehicle that's where the  
25 maintenance gets it.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Got it. And  
3 this bill is not intended to solve every potential  
4 problem that's out there. It's looking to solve the  
5 problem of fraudulently issued of whether this is  
6 in fact a bogus document. Because there are plenty  
7 of them out there and... you know they... they all have  
8 some sheen of you know appropriateness if you were  
9 just passing by as an agent and say ah is it worth  
10 my headache to go to my insert, my... my binder, my...  
11 they all call it the cheat sheet right, like  
12 there's so many of these things out there, or am I  
13 just going to go onto to something that's likely to  
14 going to be faster and more fruitful for me as an  
15 enforcement agent? Okay so what I hear is that for  
16 the purpose of determining the legality of the  
17 permit itself database exists and that... and keeping  
18 it up to date is what you do.

19 RICHARD SCHROEDER: Database for the  
20 NYPD... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And these  
22 guys have a valid one for the... the DOT.

23 RICHARD SCHROEDER: Correct. But in  
24 order to join those two together we would have to  
25 undertake a cross agency joining.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Oh my  
3 goodness, love it. Okay so actually putting it all  
4 together in one place so we can do it most  
5 efficiently...

6 RICHARD SCHROEDER: And that can be  
7 done.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I think that  
9 makes a lot of sense. I mean you know even if you  
10 are two separate agencies issuing permits the idea  
11 that they couldn't be... you know live in the same  
12 place with their own separate PD or DOT designation  
13 to me sounds very very reasonable.

14 RICHARD SCHROEDER: There is no reason  
15 technologically why they cannot be conjoined. That  
16 has not been contemplated previously... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay well  
18 that's... I think it's a very fair suggestion and a  
19 fair observation.

20 SERGEANT FREER: And there just are some  
21 points about a... a comingle database. So the... the  
22 parking placards that are assigned to police.  
23 Sometimes they're assigned to undercover officers.  
24 They can also be assigned to what are called the...  
25 basically confidential police vehicles. They're not

1  
2 your typical Ford looking police vehicle that you  
3 have, sort of nondescript vehicles. So a comingle  
4 database could... some security challenge... We're not  
5 saying they're insurmountable but it's something to  
6 definitely consider when we're building this.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.

8 Presumably traffic agents and the police officers  
9 were issuing the 825,000 parking summonses per year  
10 are trained to identify what is a legitimate and  
11 legal parking placard correct?

12 RICHARD SCHROEDER: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay so they  
14 have a list and they are trained to identify what...  
15 what's bogus and what isn't.

16 RICHARD SCHROEDER: They are so trained.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: How much... how  
18 much time and attention is given to that either for  
19 a NYPD police officer or for a traffic enforcement  
20 agent... How much of a... I have no sense as to... in...  
21 relative to the rest of your training for either a  
22 traffic enforcement agent job or for a police  
23 officer position how much time is... is ascribe to  
24 this particular question?

25 RICHARD SCHROEDER: Want to take that?

1  
2 SERGEANT FREER: Yeah. So while I don't  
3 have in front of me the exact time that's dedicated  
4 to this. You can liken it to the fact that much as  
5 a cashier who handles currency all day can easily  
6 sort of spot a fake because the police officers  
7 themselves use their parking placards every day  
8 when they come to work they can pretty much readily  
9 spot a fake. There's also again the security  
10 concerns behind that these placards are being used  
11 around police facilities so I know they do take  
12 effort to... to spot them out when they're used in  
13 those areas. Bu we'll get back to you with a exact  
14 time. I don't have that.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay I'd be  
16 interested. Also if a... if a police officer or a  
17 traffic enforcement agent spotted a bogus placard,  
18 you make it on your computer, Photoshop, whatever  
19 it is you need to do... it looks somewhat official  
20 but based on your training and experience you know...  
21 and you reference on your book it's not on there...  
22 what is the... what is the penalty, what is the  
23 ticket, what is the summons for that? What is the...  
24 what is the act that is being committed there other  
25 than you're parking illegally. What is the

1  
2 supplemental act that you're... you know you're  
3 subject to?

4 SERGEANT FREER: So... well it depends  
5 upon what you're getting at. If it's someone who's  
6 just making a permit... and again you know... [cross-  
7 talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Yes, you make  
9 it on your home computer.

10 SERGEANT FREER: You make it on your own  
11 computer, I can't speak to the charge exactly  
12 behind that now but if you're duplicating a police  
13 permit there's a very specific administrative code  
14 provisions, I believe it's like 14-1-08 that  
15 prevent the duplication of police related placards  
16 to as far as... as making up your own that'd probably  
17 fall under false personation realm but again we'll...  
18 the attorneys will get you an exact answer for  
19 those.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Do... is  
21 duplicating a police permit the same as duplicating  
22 a DOT issued permit for the purposes of the law?  
23 I'll give it to you again so I know you had a quick  
24 consult. If someone were to duplicate a DOT issued  
25 permit is it the same provision of the law that

1  
2 would be applicable for having duplicated a police  
3 department issued permit?

4 SERGEANT FREER: As far as the  
5 administrative code section?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Yes.

7 SERGEANT FREER: I don't... I don't know  
8 what DOT permits are specifically under. There is a  
9 specific provision for duplicating... I don't know if  
10 it's 14-1-08.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Do you guys  
12 know?

13 MIKE MARSICO: I know that we... we get a  
14 call from 3-1-1 that there's a bogus permit. All  
15 our permits have a hologram on it specifically. If  
16 we get notification of that we will send an  
17 investigator out to determine if it's a valid  
18 permit or not. If it is not we will send it to DOI,  
19 Department of Investigation, and then they will  
20 start an investigation. But they eventually work  
21 with the PD for fruition if... if there are charges.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay so I  
23 guess really the... the... the conclusory question  
24 there would be how many investigations have  
25 resulted in any penalty for anybody for either

1  
2 duplicating a police permit, duplicating a DOT  
3 permit, or my example of making it on Photoshop at  
4 your... at your own home. How... how many of those in...  
5 you know in 2015 2014... any... any staff that you  
6 have.

7 SERGEANT FREER: In three-year period so  
8 that's 2013, 14, and 15 the Internal Affairs Bureau  
9 and the NYPD receives 68 complaints of NYPD placard  
10 forgeries of which they substantiated 56 of those.  
11 As far as improperly using the placards etcetera in  
12 that same three-year period... So 13, 14, 15 our  
13 investigative unit received approximately 480 some  
14 odd complaints of placard abuse. So that's using  
15 restricted parking placards in improper areas  
16 etcetera. So that's kind of the universe of what we  
17 have. As far as the fraudulent DOT end of it I  
18 don't know but we can run the charges to see that  
19 for you and get you a better answer.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARDONICK: So the... the...  
21 the one which is really the one which is really the  
22 one relevant for this bill is the first... the first  
23 grouping right?

24 SERGEANT FREER: Right.  
25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: The... the  
3 cases where it actually was bogus. And that is a 68  
4 complaints of bogus over three years and 56  
5 substantiated. Is that correct?

6 SERGEANT FREER: Correct. And the... the  
7 bulk of those cases were against our paper placards  
8 like the employee parking placards. We received  
9 very few against the... the laminated vehicle  
10 identification plates that we use for the unmarked  
11 vehicles.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I see. The  
13 paper ones are the ones which are around the... the  
14 station houses...

15 SERGEANT FREER: Correct.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: ...and then for  
17 unmarked vehicles you have a separate...

18 SERGEANT FREER: We... we categorize...

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: ...a laminated...

20 SERGEANT FREER: ...them separately.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: ...it's a  
22 laminated... it looks different...

23 SERGEANT FREER: Correct.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And it says  
25 police department presumably.

1  
2 SERGEANT FREER: Correct, it's NYPD,  
3 yep.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay well I...  
5 I also noted you know in the testimony you say that  
6 there are security features which are available  
7 there. You know the... the question that we're really  
8 trying to get at is the fact that... and maybe it's  
9 an enforcement question. And maybe it is a... you  
10 know the idea that's... there are just too many  
11 parking placards of different types out there for  
12 us to reasonably expect parking agents to be able  
13 to discern what is legal and what is not. But we  
14 would like to continue this conversation with you  
15 because you both have a database. There's no  
16 technological challenge to merging databases.  
17 Traffic enforcement agents at least are going to  
18 have a handheld device that would allow them to  
19 read this sort of thing if there were any point of  
20 confusion. To me that sort of suggests well we  
21 should just allow for them to do a... a... a check and  
22 also even to perhaps highlight a bogus placard for  
23 the Department of Investigation if it rings up as a  
24 bogus placard. But I... I don't know what I... I'm  
25 rebutting in light of the fact that you say that

1  
2 there are certain security features which you  
3 prefer to discuss in a non-public forum. So we  
4 will... we will have that conversation.

5 SERGEANT FREER: Certainly.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And... and  
7 we'll see... we'll see where that turns out. I have  
8 just one question about the chairman's bill if you  
9 may, is that okay? You noted that there... there was  
10 this pilot program, the Pay by Cell pilot program  
11 on Author Avenue. And it sounds... it sounds similar...  
12 a similar concept to what is being proposed here if  
13 I understand everything correctly. Is that... is that  
14 right?

15 MIKE MARSICO: Conceptionally yes,  
16 technologically different though.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay. So  
18 that's really what I wanted to understand. Because  
19 I have seen this at... you know in use in other  
20 cities. And it's extremely convenient to be able to  
21 be up and in... you know in an apartment on a cold  
22 day and to know that your... your meter is running  
23 out to be able to add some time or be able to you  
24 know wake up in the morning and instead of running  
25 out before 7:00 to actually put some money on the

1 meter that all makes sense using an... using an app.  
2  
3 But this is all called Pay by Cell. IT sounds like  
4 there's telephone calls involved but it also from  
5 your testimony sounded like there is an app. What's  
6 the difference in the technology because I don't  
7 understand the difference between the... the... the  
8 pilot technology and the... and the... and the app  
9 related technology that's being... [cross-talk]

10 MIKE MARSICO: ...the pucks... the pucks are  
11 really well used in a single space environment  
12 which we do not have. So locating the pucks or  
13 putting enough pucks out there for... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: The pucks?

15 MIKE MARSICO: The pucks are these  
16 devices that go in and identify occupancy of that  
17 area.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Oh... oh the  
19 pucks... [cross-talk]

20 MIKE MARSICO: And these are the ones  
21 that... I'm sorry.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: That's okay...  
23 [cross-talk]

24 MIKE MARSICO: ...ones that were... [cross-  
25 talk] that were pulled up or that there's always

1  
2 been an issue with them. And when we... when we did  
3 put them in the pilot there were problems with  
4 them. And then... now we have a multi-space so the  
5 vehicles are different sizes, there are smaller  
6 ones, different ones... it's difficult to get the  
7 alignment to work whereas the technology that we're  
8 proposing to date doesn't use that. And I think the  
9 state of practice has moved beyond to where most  
10 people do have the smart technology and also the  
11 ability to call in for a spot. So we're trying to  
12 make sure... ensure once again that payment options  
13 are as easy and as flexible as possible. And work  
14 with the PD I think that's what we're doing.

15           JEFF LYNCH: So and just... and just to  
16 clarify. There will be an app. I mean this is... this  
17 is how it's done in other cities. But to leave open  
18 flexibility for somebody that might not have a... a  
19 smartphone there will be a call in feature so that  
20 somebody could from the same apartment call it in  
21 if you have a... I mean there are still folks that  
22 may not have a... be... a phone that's able to use an  
23 app and that allows flexibility, we expect the bulk  
24 of that to be app based.

25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay well I...  
3 I'm not sure I completely understand the  
4 relationship between pucks, the non you know single  
5 space environment but I... I don't need to... I don't  
6 need to educate myself on this point here and with  
7 everybody else waiting. But I will ask one last  
8 question which is something which has confused me a  
9 little bit about this bill. And while I actually... I  
10 think this is a fantastic initiative and I think we  
11 should do this without any question at all in my  
12 mind is the issue of feeding meters. We have over  
13 the last ten years... somehow in my mind it has  
14 gotten stuck that there is technically speaking  
15 under the law something not appropriate about  
16 putting more money into a meter after it has  
17 expired, that feeding the meter is some... like when  
18 you go and you put money in the meter for that two-  
19 hour period, if you come back after an hour and 55  
20 minutes and you re-up for another two hour... two  
21 hours, technically speaking you have done something  
22 wrong under city law. Is this correct?

23 JEFF LYNCH: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay.

25

1  
2 JEFF LYNCH: The... the posted regulation  
3 times there is a maximum time on the parking  
4 regulation on the... the sign. So it may say one-hour  
5 meter, two-hour meter...

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Right I got  
7 it. So it says one-hour meter and you come back  
8 after 55 minutes and you re-up for another hour you  
9 have done something wrong under city law?

10 MIKE MARSICO: Not if you're within the  
11 two hours.

12 JEFF LYNCH: If you're within the... the  
13 maximum time posted on the sign you're not but  
14 it's... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay so let's  
16 say yes. You... you're...

17 JEFF LYNCH: But if you... if you do that  
18 correct that is not supposed to be happening on the  
19 streets.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Right. So...

21 JEFF LYNCH: And that's to promote  
22 turnover for businesses that want continued  
23 turnover for...

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Understood.  
25 It's also obviously something which you know many

1  
2 New Yorkers believe is a god given right to  
3 actually feed the meter. And so where those... those  
4 two points do run in conflict with one another so  
5 we should all at least acknowledge that. How does  
6 that... how does that... that particular challenge come  
7 to play in an initiative like either Pay by Cell or  
8 the app based technology which the chairman is  
9 proposing here today. It seems like it's a very  
10 easy way to keep somebody from re-upping beyond  
11 what the legal period is. Does it keep people from  
12 re-upping beyond the legal period? What is the  
13 vision of DOT as to how you deal with that  
14 particular challenge?

15 MIKE MARSICO: The... if you have a two-  
16 hour meter and you pay for your time of two hours.  
17 On the Pay by Cell you have to move that vehicle.  
18 You may not go back. Whereas somebody could  
19 actually just go buy another receipt and put it on  
20 your dashboard. It's not going to happen that way  
21 if they're Pay by Cell. So the desire to have that  
22 turnover for businesses is reinforced with the Pay  
23 by Cell.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay so  
25 that's just an interesting point which is that that

1  
2 rule, law, etcetera which is widely ignored and not  
3 at all enforced almost by its impossibility of  
4 being enforced would suddenly come into play in an  
5 interesting way with this technology. So okay I...  
6 that's a... that's... that's an important point for me  
7 because I didn't understand exactly how that was  
8 going to work. And I think that we need to find a  
9 way to do what has been initiated and what the  
10 chairman is pushing here. I think it will make  
11 people's lives a lot better... a lot easier... and... and  
12 it certainly is where we should be heading as a  
13 city. So thank you for all the time Mr. Chairman I  
14 appreciate it.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And... and we  
16 will... now on the process of conversation we will  
17 continue talking about details assuming that  
18 working with the support of the speaker and the  
19 administration we can find a common ground on this  
20 legislation. So even the limit of time for someone  
21 if they pay using a apps a... have to come out with  
22 something the middle this is something that I hope  
23 we will address you know as we continue  
24 conversation. I have a question on the fraudulent  
25 placards. So we have a hundred for DOT NYPD

1  
2 official placard that we give NYPD, see member of  
3 the city agencies they use. 2015, how many ticket  
4 were giving to drivers who were using fake  
5 placards?

6 SERGEANT FREER: Well as far as fake  
7 placards our enforcement action again I have the  
8 three-year number which was... there was 56 fake  
9 placards. As far as tickets issued to vehicles  
10 displaying placards that was approximately 24  
11 hundred. But that doesn't necessarily mean they're  
12 fake, that could just mean you used your placard in  
13 a area you weren't authorized. Like you have an all  
14 street parking placard and you parked at a fire  
15 hydrant or something similar. So that doesn't  
16 necessarily mean that number doesn't reflect fake,  
17 that just reflects in general a total number of  
18 tickets issued to vehicles that displayed some form  
19 of placards.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So you have not  
21 been... the city has not being able... or have a system  
22 to identify those fake placards?

23 SERGEANT FREER: So the fake placards  
24 have to be brought either to our attention via  
25 calls which again I told you we had about 488 calls

1  
2 over three years for people reporting placard abuse  
3 or they're spotted by the officers themselves. And  
4 again they have material that they're given,  
5 handouts, there's security features much like on  
6 your currency that tell us if it's fake or not. So  
7 that's... that's sort of where we use to determine if  
8 a placard is fake or not.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. I... I just  
10 hope you know that we definitely do some work  
11 upgrading the system because I as a council member  
12 I know with my plaque what I'm allowed to park and  
13 where not. I know that I no allow to park what it  
14 say... no parking anytime. However, I know that I can  
15 park where there's a meters, where there's no  
16 truck... where truck and commercial allow to park.  
17 However, I had got my ticket in the past even when  
18 not being park in a meter what I have park where I  
19 say no parking any time... allowed to park. It could  
20 be sanitation or whoever they needed to... the  
21 ticket. Then you know we clear with the... that we  
22 had the right to be there. So for me it's more...  
23 it's no going against individual from the NYPD,  
24 DOE, or any other agency that you... that have their  
25 right to use a plaque. For me it's about those that

1  
2 make up it... those... certain plaques that are using  
3 something illegals... What is the fine for someone  
4 that use a fake plaque?

5 SERGEANT FREER: I will have to get back  
6 to you on the exact fine... because it depends upon  
7 if it's a forged plaque of a current placard  
8 because that's a criminal charge if their forging a  
9 plaque. If they're making one up just sort of out  
10 of the blue I don't have the fine for that but we..  
11 we'll get you the information.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Have we had some  
13 case in 2015 or anyone committed that criminal  
14 activity? So that... such as the one that you  
15 describe...

16 SERGEANT FREER: I'm sorry can you  
17 repeat that.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Have you in... Did  
19 we have... the city have any case in 2015? How many  
20 cases do... do... do you face or were you able to  
21 identify of someone that wasn't that...

22 SERGEANT FREER: So I have a three-year  
23 number. So for three years there was 56 and that  
24 relates to NYPD issued placards. We had 56 ones  
25 that were determined to be fraudulent.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Are... are...  
3 is the city following the same placard operation  
4 system of the previous administration or has the  
5 city upgrade the way of how we operate the placard  
6 request, distribution, and control in this current  
7 administration?

8 SERGEANT FREER: For the NYPD our  
9 procedures changed in approximately 2012 when it  
10 was placed under the internal affairs bureau and we  
11 dramatically reduced the number of placards we  
12 issued as well as the accountability and controls  
13 behind that. So not necessarily under this  
14 administration but fairly prior we... we did make  
15 those changes on our end.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So most of the  
17 changes was made 2014 2012 and you being... you have  
18 continue working under those changes that you made  
19 in 2014?

20 SERGEANT FREER: Correct. And as we  
21 mentioned they're strictly accountable now. We make  
22 sure it's a one for one issuance. There's a full  
23 application process in which even the police  
24 officers' licenses are checked for... offences and  
25

1  
2 tickets. So there's a very robust procedure in  
3 place for these for... on the police end.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Is that a same  
5 standard for the other...

6 MIKE MARSICO: We... we haven't changed  
7 up...

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You haven't  
9 changed.

10 MIKE MARSICO: ...procedure at all.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Like I assume  
12 you was... what was it a year when we got rid of the  
13 phrase... of the press parking placard? Was it 2012  
14 too?

15 [background comments]

16 MIKE MARSICO: It was 2009.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So 2009 we are  
18 not distributing press parking permits right?

19 SERGEANT FREER: Press I'm not aware of.  
20 There's parking at headquarters for designated  
21 members of the press themselves who park at police  
22 headquarters when working out of that building but  
23 I'm not aware of permits issued to the press as a  
24 whole but we... we'll check on that for you.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah. And I have  
3 a bill you know. Is... not related to those two but  
4 do have a bill that have 35 council member that  
5 have signed on that bill to restore the rights of  
6 the press to be able to get the... the... the press  
7 parking when they covering their story. Council  
8 Member Chin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Chair.  
10 Relating to Intro 326, the placard parking. Placard  
11 parking is still a big problem in my district. I  
12 represent district 1, lower Manhattan and recently  
13 the Chinatown BID did a survey and found that  
14 almost one quarter the... of the available on street  
15 parking were taken over by placard parking. And I  
16 myself has walk up and down those street and  
17 sometime when you look at some of those placard  
18 they don't look real. But you know but they... we  
19 never see a ticket on those cars. So I think in  
20 terms of you know what people... my constituents a  
21 lot of time are upset that all these placard  
22 parking are taking up on the street and especially  
23 you know as DOT... you testify in your testimony you  
24 know you switch over to Muni Meter which created a  
25 lot more parking space. And now everybody has to

1  
2 pay... I mean which is great for the customers you  
3 know they're willing to pay but then they can't  
4 find a space. And that space is taken up via a  
5 placard park... you know car with a placard in there.  
6 And they never get a ticket when they don't have a  
7 Muni ticket. So one of the suggestion that was  
8 given to me by one of the leaders in Chinatown... he  
9 say Margaret why don't they just give ticket to  
10 anybody who park at the meter... Muni Meter without  
11 paying. And then if they're there for official  
12 business then they can go and fight the ticket just  
13 like a ordinary citizens. You get a ticket that you  
14 think is not fair you have to go fight it.  
15 Meanwhile we're loving revenues of all these  
16 people. We're taking up a lot of the parking space,  
17 especially the Muni parking. So can... can NYPD or  
18 DOT address why they never get a tickets on those  
19 cars?

20 SERGEANT FREER: Sure so... unfortunately  
21 your district is in a unique position where it's  
22 situated with multiple court houses; from federal  
23 state to... to local and city as well as Federal  
24 Plaza, police headquarters, etcetera. So there's a  
25 large number of people that work in... in those

1  
2 buildings and do conduct... business in the area. So  
3 their... their vehicles do need a place to park. We...  
4 we will help you to work with you on that in  
5 determining which permits and I know that there is  
6 a unit that did patrol directly around headquarters  
7 with tow trucks to remove illegally parked  
8 vehicles. That was an initiative that we've... we've  
9 undertaken. And we're happy to work with you as far  
10 as ticketing the vehicles and having them fought  
11 out later. I mean that's really an administrative  
12 burden and... and a time burden on that. I know it  
13 doesn't replace the burden that your... your district  
14 constituents face in terms of finding their parking  
15 but I'm sure we can try to work for a mutual  
16 solution.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Well especially  
18 for a lot of businesses. They rely on customer. And  
19 one of the biggest complaint is that I don't come  
20 to Chinatown anymore because I can't find parking.  
21 And meanwhile you increase DOT. You like more than  
22 double the number of parking space with the Muni  
23 Meter. But it... it hasn't really help when you know  
24 constituent see that the placard card... they don't  
25 have a Muni ticket and they're okay. So I think we

1  
2 really have to kind of work on that problem just  
3 because we are close all the government building...  
4 building doesn't mean we... the community should be a  
5 parking lot. I mean already a lot of streets has  
6 been taken over by NYPD because the headquarters  
7 there to do parking. I mean people see that every  
8 day. So we really have to work together to try to...  
9 to mitigate this problem that certain streets  
10 should be off limits or... So we look forward to  
11 working with you on that.

12 SERGEANT FREER: Right. And there are  
13 certain areas that are designated no permit areas  
14 where even NYPD placards aren't supposed to be  
15 valid. And... and we'll work with you on... on... [cross-  
16 talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Maybe we can  
18 expand those are. Well we should work together.  
19 Thank you. Thank you Chair.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: This is not  
21 about when we talk about those individual, the 104  
22 that have the placard this isn't about... this  
23 hearing and this effort is not about trying to get  
24 rid of... of those men and woman that need the  
25 placard as part of the jobs. This is about those

1  
2 who abuse the placard system that we have in the  
3 city. So I know that we will be working together to  
4 be sure that we correct a... whatever way and manner  
5 we can operate the system so that those individual  
6 that are abusing it they should be accountable.  
7 Thank you. Now let's go the next panel which is  
8 Eric McClure, Julia Kite, Alex Likely [phonetic],  
9 and Joseph Szende. Thank you. Thanks. You may  
10 begin.

11                   ERIC MCCLURE: Okay good morning. My  
12 name is Eric McClure. I'm executive director of  
13 StreetsPAC. On behalf of my colleagues at Streets  
14 Pack I'd like to thank Chairman Rodriguez and the  
15 Committee on Transportation for the opportunity to  
16 testify today. Implementing the right parking  
17 policies in New York City could be tremendously  
18 helpful in improving mobility, reducing congestion,  
19 making housing more affordable, lowering emissions,  
20 reducing dependency on automobiles, and moving us  
21 closer to achieving vision zero among other  
22 benefits. However, our views on parking aren't  
23 keeping up with innovations in other areas of  
24 transportation policy. And we hope that today's  
25 hearing is just the first of many devoted tackling

1  
2 this thorny issue. The city council should be  
3 providing leadership on citywide parking policy  
4 when DOT isn't acting aggressively enough. Free and  
5 below market rate parking provides a huge subsidy  
6 to private vehicle owners at the expense of  
7 everyone else. It encourages driving and should be  
8 phased out especially in the more densely populated  
9 areas in the city. Curbside space should be managed  
10 according to a hierarchy of parking uses that  
11 prioritizes commercial parking and loading over the  
12 parking of private vehicles and shorter term  
13 parking... Parking given priority over long term car  
14 storage. The Department of Finance has stipulated  
15 fine program which allows chronic parking offenders  
16 like FedEx, UPS, and Fresh Direct to pay a small  
17 fraction of the fines they accrue for double  
18 parking violations in effect legalizing double  
19 parking for a small fee that is well below market  
20 rates. As a tremendous cost in traffic congestion  
21 it creates safety risks formed by vulnerable street  
22 users. Transfer and curbside use is from long-term  
23 private vehicle parking to commercial loading and  
24 short term parking will significantly reduce double  
25 parking, congestion, and, crashes and will

1  
2 discourage unnecessary vehicle trips. New York City  
3 DOT began taking some positive steps toward  
4 rationalizing parking policy in 2008 with the park  
5 smart pilot program increasing meter parking rates  
6 slightly in commercial districts in Greenwich  
7 village and a handful of other neighborhoods. But  
8 despite park smart's effectiveness in meeting its  
9 objectives the program has languished. It's time  
10 not only to greatly expand this effort throughout  
11 the city but to begin adopting dynamic market based  
12 parking rates and implementing 21<sup>st</sup> century  
13 technology like payment centers and pay by phone.  
14 San Francisco's pilot study using this  
15 neuroethology led to a 50 percent drop in cruising  
16 for parking space, a 30 percent reduction in  
17 overall driving, fewer violations, and less double  
18 parking. Those are significant results. And if San  
19 Francisco can do it so can New York. We strongly  
20 support Intro 966 which would require New York City  
21 DOT to implement mobile app and text message based  
22 parking payment systems. Such systems will make  
23 metered parking more efficient and allow more  
24 nuance control over the hierarchy and priority of  
25 curbside uses including different rates for

1 commercial and private vehicles and will help  
2 facilitate the eventual implementation of demand  
3 based pricing. In addition, an app based payment  
4 system makes life easier for drivers by sending  
5 expiring meter reminders and allowing for the  
6 remote addition of time and should enable the city  
7 to move toward automated enforcement of meter  
8 violations. We also support intro 999 for many of  
9 the same reasons. While we believe that parking  
10 rates should be increased it's also fair that  
11 people should only have to pay for the time they  
12 use. And this in combination with automated  
13 reminders about expiring meters will go a long way  
14 toward eliminating "gotcha" complaints about  
15 parking regulations. Perhaps it will even let us do  
16 away rightfully with grace periods and broadly  
17 expand the use of Muni Meters. Finally, we strongly  
18 support Intro 326 which would require that  
19 government issued parking placards include a  
20 scannable barcode that would allow traffic  
21 enforcement agents to verify their authenticity.  
22 Placard abuse is a major contributor to illegal  
23 parking and one more form subsidize free parking  
24 for private vehicles. And the existence of  
25

1  
2 counterfeit placards adds to congestion. We'd all  
3 urge that the city continue efforts to  
4 significantly reduce the number of placards it  
5 issues to employees. We encourage the council and  
6 the Department of Transportation to think big on  
7 parking policy. Paris is eliminating more than  
8 50,000 parking spaces per year. And if we're going  
9 to achieve the council's laudable goal of reducing  
10 private vehicle ownership in New York City to one  
11 million cars by 2030 progressive parking policies  
12 will have to play a key role. Thank you.

13 JULIA KITE: Thank you Chair Rodriguez  
14 and members of the Committee on Transportation for  
15 convening this hearing. I am Julia Kite, the Policy  
16 and Research Manager of Transportation  
17 Alternatives. We're a 43-year-old non-profit with  
18 more than 150,000 activists in our network  
19 dedicated to improving the safety of New York City  
20 streets. I'm also presenting this testimony on  
21 behalf of the NYPIRG Straphangers Campaign, Riders  
22 Alliance, and the tristate transportation campaign.  
23 As an organization at the forefront of Vision Zero  
24 we know that comprehensive redesign of New York's  
25 most dangerous streets is crucial to eliminating

1  
2 deaths and serious injuries. But it's impossible to  
3 have a discussion about street redesign without  
4 considering the issue of parking. In fact, we found  
5 that pretty much nothing else is as contentious a  
6 subject. But personal cars parked on city streets  
7 are private property being stored in public cases,  
8 taking away a resource that by rights should be  
9 shared. We cannot allow prioritizing parking spaces  
10 to stand in the way of street improvements that  
11 will benefit all New Yorkers. We look forward  
12 to reform of the parking permit system as  
13 stipulated in Intro 326. But we also call upon city  
14 agencies to make more extensive changes to on and  
15 off street parking systems that will foster greater  
16 equity and improve street safety in accordance with  
17 the Vision Zero promise. With regard to Intro  
18 number 326 we are pleased to see city council  
19 addressing the issue of parking placard abuse which  
20 transportation alternatives has been drawing  
21 attention to since 2006 when we published the  
22 uncivil servants, a report detailing how government  
23 workers abused parking privileges in Chinatown and  
24 civic center. Our 2011 report entitled Totally  
25 Bogus found that 57 percent of permits in five New

1  
2 York City neighborhoods were either completely  
3 fraudulent or were being used to park illegally.  
4 Our research indicated that one in four displayed  
5 placards was fake. Meaning there could be easily  
6 tens of thousands of fraudulent placards currently  
7 in use in the city. In Manhattan Civic Center where  
8 we sit now fewer than five percent of displayed  
9 placards were being used properly. Furthermore,  
10 fraudulent placards are a public safety risk. In  
11 2010 a van responsible for a time... for a bomb scare  
12 in Times Square was left alone for two days because  
13 it was displaying a placard. Unfortunately, that  
14 placard was from a non-existent agency.  
15 Furthermore, even if a placard is authentic on the  
16 more everyday level the abuse of it increases  
17 dangerous double parking, adds to air pollution by  
18 forcing other drivers to cruise for space, delays  
19 deliveries for businesses and the roads trust in  
20 government bodies. Barcodes are a simple and  
21 effective means to preventing individuals taking  
22 advantage of the permit system and preventing those  
23 who have no right to be using one from jeopardizing  
24 public safety. We called for them in 2011 and we  
25 applaud Council Member Garodnick for continuing to

1  
2 move this legislation forward. However, in addition  
3 to passing Intro 326 we urge the city to reduce the  
4 overall number of parking permits and issues with  
5 the aim of phasing out the placard system all  
6 together. Other than emergency first responders and  
7 disabled people with mobility limitations there's  
8 no reason for anybody to receive special privileges  
9 for parking based solely on where they work. The  
10 extensive fraud in the city when it comes to  
11 placards is so massive and has been going on for so  
12 long that it's clear city agencies simply cannot  
13 contain it. Many large American cities manage just  
14 fine without placards even though they have much  
15 higher rates of commuting by car than New York  
16 City. By eliminating placards, the city can  
17 encourage the use of public transit which will ease  
18 congestion. And furthermore agencies are free to  
19 reimburse employees as they see fit and they can do  
20 this without the permit system. Fixing the park  
21 permit system alone however will not fix the  
22 multitude of street safety and equity issues  
23 related to parking. In recent months the burdens  
24 caused by off-street parking requirements have  
25 become evident in debates over affordable housing.

1  
2 While this is not the time to discuss development  
3 proposals it is beyond doubt that requiring a  
4 minimum number of parking spaces is an impediment  
5 to developing affordable housing. In New York City  
6 parking above in aboveground garages cost more than  
7 21,000 dollars per space to build and then  
8 underground garages that can run up to 50,000  
9 dollars per spot requiring off-street parking in  
10 new developments thus pushes up the cost of  
11 creating housing which makes it a less appealing  
12 prospect for builders and stands in the way of  
13 actually meeting an important need. A city  
14 commissioned study by the NYU Furman Center  
15 concluded quote the largest most difficult zoning  
16 constraint affecting the development of new housing  
17 has been the requirement of building on-site  
18 parking spaces. And while lower income households  
19 are less likely to own cars parking minimums will  
20 require them to pick up the cost instead of  
21 encouraging car ownership by enshrining a minimum  
22 number of parking spaces the city should be looking  
23 towards ways to make public transit more appealing.  
24 In the city of high rents and high prices there's  
25 one thing however that's free for a relatively

1  
2 privileged few and that's on street parking. All  
3 tax payers fund city streets but only those with  
4 cars get to use it to store their private property  
5 either for free or at below market meter rates.  
6 This is not only fundamentally unfair but the  
7 inefficient use of public resources. A study by  
8 Schaller Consulting and Transportation alternatives  
9 found that in 2007 on street parking in New York  
10 was 1/14<sup>th</sup> the cost of parking in lots. Since then  
11 the difference has become even greater as lot  
12 prices have increased faster than meter rates.  
13 Furthermore, the near 100 percent occupation of  
14 meter parking spaces means drivers have to spend  
15 time cruising which is wasteful and detrimental to  
16 local businesses. To reduce the congestion plaguing  
17 much of our city we suggest much of the following.  
18 Curbside parking rates should be raised in order to  
19 meet a goal of 15 percent vacancy. And the DOT's  
20 park smart program which raises meter rates at peak  
21 hours in select neighborhoods should be expanded  
22 citywide. Finally, on the streets the issue of  
23 parking is irretrievably designed.. tied to the  
24 issue of street design. For too long our arterial  
25 roads have prioritize the parking of private

1  
2 vehicles in spaces that would be better used for  
3 improvements that would benefit all New Yorkers.  
4 Commercial needs, public transit, and public safety  
5 should all trump private vehicle storage. A car  
6 sitting empty and idle on an arterial road  
7 sometimes at no cost to its owner is taking up  
8 space that could reengineered to serve as a safe  
9 commercial loading zone, a dedicated bus lane, a  
10 bike lane to protect... road users, or a city bike  
11 station. There is no time to waste when it comes to  
12 redesigning streets for safety. But we see one  
13 improvement project after another held up by  
14 community boards that oppose any loss of on street  
15 parking spaces. Even in districts where only a  
16 minority of residents own cars the result is a  
17 system that considers the loss of parking more  
18 troublesome than the loss of life. And this is not  
19 an attitude that will get us to Vision Zero. We  
20 incur... we continue to urge the DOT to not lift the  
21 opposition of community boards with no  
22 transportation expertise, stall plans for street  
23 safety improvements. Thank you for your time and  
24 consideration.

1  
2 SERGEANT SZENDE: Hi. My name is Josef  
3 Szende. I'm the Executive Director of the Atlantic  
4 Avenue BID from Brooklyn. The permit parking system  
5 is broken in the city. It's devastating mom and pop  
6 businesses and it is rife with abuse. Here I have  
7 the testimony from Horseman Antiques. It is one of  
8 the last and oldest antique shops in Brooklyn, 54  
9 years old. In this testimony he says that he's at  
10 the point of selling a 54-year-old business because  
11 customers that formerly came in from a driving  
12 distance can no longer find parking and it's no  
13 longer viable to do business on our street in  
14 Brooklyn. Every day the abuse of parking placards  
15 by municipal workers occurs without any single  
16 agency being the sole cause. We have many people  
17 parking with corrections permits, court officers  
18 permits which are issued by the state if they're  
19 being issued legitimately. The Department of  
20 Education, the Department of Sanitation, the MTA,  
21 HR&A, Police... all of these placards are on our  
22 street in Brooklyn. And there are offices for all  
23 of these agencies within downtown Brooklyn. But  
24 these are not intended to be used for commuting  
25 purposes. These are meant to be used for agency

1  
2 business. We have Park Smart on Atlantic Avenue. We  
3 have Park Smart because we believe in the idea of  
4 increasing turnover, making parking available for  
5 customers who want to buy something and want to  
6 frequent our small businesses. The Park Smart  
7 Program has been rendered almost ineffective  
8 because of the number of permit parking vehicles  
9 that are using up all the spots on Atlantic Avenue.  
10 In a recent study we did we don't have a lot of  
11 capacity but we can do a study a... a few times a  
12 year. We took down 27 permit parking vehicles  
13 within two blocks. On one of these blocks 50  
14 percent of the spots were occupied by permit  
15 vehicles. The permit vehicles do not always even us  
16 a placard. They often will use just an... a piece of  
17 clothing that just identifies them as working at a  
18 city agency. There's to us an obvious failure to  
19 ticket those that do not have a permit at all and  
20 certainly not to ticket those that have a fake  
21 placard. We think this is an important first step.  
22 Obviously the... the system needs a lot of... a lot of  
23 work. We're submitting all of the documentation  
24 that we've taken recently and we really look  
25 forward to... to working with you further on this

1  
2 because it is one of the most important issues for  
3 our small businesses. I wanted to thank both you as  
4 the chair and Council Member Garodnick for  
5 introducing this legislation.

6           ALEX SLACKY: Good morning, I think it's  
7 not yet noon. My name is Alex Slacky. I'm here  
8 representing AAA Northeast which serves a  
9 membership of over 570,000 drivers in the five  
10 boroughs and over 1.6 million in the.. in the  
11 greater metropolitan area. And I want to thank you  
12 Council Member Rodriguez or Chair Rodriguez for  
13 holding it. Parking in New York City obviously is a  
14 very frustrating experience. If you're fortunate  
15 enough to find a spot, sometimes you might need a  
16 little Rosetta Stone to actually read the signs and  
17 we.. we certainly applaud the efforts of.. of the  
18 council to.. to make parking a more efficient  
19 endeavor. I'd first like to just give a couple  
20 general statistics about parking in New York City.  
21 And this info is from Fiscal Year 15. There were  
22 9.1 million parking summonses given out. 9.1  
23 million. Parking meter revenue is 211 million which  
24 is dwarfed by parking summons revenue 658 million  
25 which is I think an all-time high would be enough

1  
2 to you know fund the payrolls of all eight  
3 professional sports teams in the city of New York.  
4 So it's... it's certainly big business. And the city  
5 has made really major improvements to the parking  
6 infrastructure process over the last decade  
7 obviously from meters to Muni Meters was great.  
8 Council Member Greenfield... you know there was a lot  
9 of you know some bills that you had sponsored, pre-  
10 payment, five-minute grace period. And... and these  
11 have been excellent. They brought parking into the  
12 21<sup>st</sup> century. But the pace of technological changes  
13 quickening obviously pay by a phone is a fan...  
14 fantastic idea. It seems like DOT is... is on board  
15 with that. And... and we're certainly happy to hear  
16 that. And there are some other ways that can be...  
17 that we can make parking more efficient. And we're  
18 working on finishing up a report on parking  
19 summonses in... in fiscal year 15. So one thing that  
20 we've seen actually in... in D.C. with the  
21 introduction of pay by phone the fines... or the  
22 tickets for Muni Meter violations have been cut in  
23 half over three years since they introduced it. And  
24 there were 2.4 million tickets issued for either  
25 expired Muni Meter or no Muni Meter receipt

1  
2 displayed in fiscal year '15. That's about a  
3 quarter of all the tickets that were issued. And  
4 when you implement the pay by phone that's going to  
5 decrease the number of tickets which is good for  
6 drivers obviously it affects the city coffers. But  
7 the efficiency of the process should be the main  
8 consideration. One other thing that we've really  
9 seen in... in looking at the data and... and we're  
10 still analyzing it but the biggest offenders by far  
11 are out of state vehicles. There were 245 passenger  
12 vehicles that incurred more than 200 violations in  
13 fiscal year '15. Of those only six were registered  
14 in New York state. Because in New York state you  
15 could suspend the registration for enforcement.  
16 Can't really do that as much with out of state. So  
17 that's something that certainly should be taken a  
18 look at in terms of enforcement. And we also want  
19 to make sure we're focusing on the violations that  
20 impair safety and mobility like blocking the box  
21 which only had 10,000 tickets issued last year  
22 which is paltry or like double parking rather than  
23 the more technical infractions like you know late  
24 registration. There were 11,000 tickets issued for  
25 late registration that was just a single day late.

1  
2 That's not what should we... we should be focusing  
3 on. We should be focusing on the violations that  
4 are hurting safety and mobility. And I'd like to  
5 thank you for the opportunity to come and... and for  
6 your interest in this matter. Thanks.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Before we finish  
8 let's also call Tom Murphy who also is in the list  
9 to testify. If you can put a chair close to the...  
10 can add another chair...

11 TOM MURPHY: My name is Tom Murphy. I  
12 wasn't planning on talking. I'm from Brooklyn. I'm  
13 representing myself as an owner and a driver. I am  
14 also a member of AAA but they seemed to have missed  
15 the ball. There was a disconnect between supply and  
16 demand in the city of New York. From what I read  
17 last week in the New York Times America had its  
18 highest sales of automobiles, 17 and a half  
19 million, just doubled 2008, yet DOT is wiping out  
20 parking space even as we talk. In my neighborhood,  
21 Sunset Park, Industry City has announced that they  
22 are go... going to spend a billion dollars and add  
23 10,000 jobs to the area. They're subdividing  
24 apartments and squeezing in... densifying the  
25 neighborhood yet as we speak DOT is partnering with

1  
2 two organizations to wipe out 200 parking spots in  
3 the working areas of Sunset Park. Nobody's paying  
4 attention to this you know. A friend over here,  
5 Atlantic Avenue, it wasn't too long ago that the  
6 Atlantic Avenue BID had DOT drop the no... no  
7 standing no parking during peak hours because their  
8 merchants were suffering. Now they're saying that  
9 it... you know what it is that they've reserved those  
10 spots for city employees. You are the city council  
11 and I always thought it was... would be a great idea  
12 if you built in a boiler plate, preambles all your  
13 bills saying and this law we're proposing applies  
14 also to city employees, period. Not to be  
15 forgotten. Because I had... had discussions with... I  
16 live at 413 43<sup>rd</sup> Street which is next door to what  
17 is known as the 64<sup>th</sup> precinct on Shades of Blue.  
18 It's also the New York, NYPD applications and  
19 processing division. My house will probably be on  
20 TV tonight. But every time they do a film I have to  
21 move my car, not that I park in front of my house  
22 because NYPD placards are parked there all the  
23 time. And it's an office, it's not cops. Now you  
24 have to remember that there's no... you know you hear  
25 these bold arguments about free parking and then

1  
2 you turn the page and they tell you how expensive  
3 it is to own a car in New York. I pay a... for a... a  
4 registration. That means it's not... I can't park on  
5 the street so I... unless I have a valid  
6 registration. It's not free, it just starts there.  
7 Number two, I would like to see DOT give an actual  
8 measure of all the parking spots on street and off  
9 street before they move against reducing, excuse  
10 me, excess parking. That's their excuse, it's  
11 excess. There's somebody... you know they can't see  
12 the parking spot because there's a car parked there  
13 so they don't recognize it as being a parking spot.  
14 And another thing is that people using mysterious  
15 numbers to how many cars there should be in New  
16 York City or county. The census and the city  
17 registrations are about a million off. There are  
18 cars that are registered outside the city and cars  
19 that are registered inside the city. I... I have two  
20 cars registered inside the city. God bless me. I'm  
21 a real patriot, real tax payer. But my neighbors  
22 are part... have Pennsylvania plates, Connecticut  
23 plates, New Jersey plates yet they are accorded  
24 parking. And it's never recognized that you know...  
25 That's why we don't have resident parking permit.

1  
2 And when you talk about smart parking it only  
3 prefers to commercial areas. Doctor Schupp  
4 [phonetic] out in California defined the smart  
5 parking business as being to have only 85 percent  
6 parking occupied. Only in commercial areas. He did  
7 not have an answer for residential areas. He said  
8 residential parking permits. Doesn't work in New  
9 York because everybody parks their car as... up by  
10 the... seaway where they don't have to pay insurance.  
11 But...

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great.

13 TOM MURPHY: Okay. I'm... you know I just  
14 basically said you know you sit here and you get  
15 one side of the equation. You never never never ask  
16 why is the law never changed. And the law is never  
17 changed because the reality on... facts on the ground  
18 say don't mess with the... with those tax paying car  
19 owners and residents who drive to work every day,  
20 can't use the subway, can't use the bus. They use  
21 their cars in pursuit of their business. The  
22 Councilwoman of Chinatown would agree with me.  
23 Chinatown is desperate for parking because their  
24 businesses are there.

25

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Thank  
3 you. I like to recognize council member who are  
4 here on the left Council Member Reynoso, Richard,  
5 Van Bramer, Miller, Constantinides, and Levin.  
6 Thank you everyone for your opinion. This is only..  
7 okay Councilman.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very  
9 much Mr. Chairman. I just wanted to thank Joseph  
10 and Eric in particular this whole panel but I've  
11 worked very closely with Joseph and Eric over the  
12 last several years on these matters as it relates  
13 to downtown Brooklyn on Atlantic Avenue around the  
14 Brooklyn House of Detention and along Jay Street.  
15 It is a serious serious problem. And it is... we have  
16 not... you know whatever iteration that we... how..  
17 whatever iteration we've seen it. Whatever  
18 administration, whatever is happening with the  
19 broader transportation network and movement towards  
20 safer streets in downtown Brooklyn whether it's  
21 Atlantic Avenue or Jay Street parking placard abuse  
22 continues. That's the constant. You know you can  
23 make Jay Street a lot safer through infrastructure  
24 improvements and in changes to the streetscape.  
25 Same with Atlantic Avenue. We... unless we make a

1  
2 significant... a serious change in policy and  
3 enforcement that issue of parking placard abuse is  
4 going to continue and it's going to make... that  
5 alone will make those streets less safe. And so I...  
6 I applaud you both for the amount of time and  
7 effort that you've put into this. Sometimes you  
8 know beating your head against the wall or... feeling  
9 like that and... and you have my commitment that I'll  
10 continue to work with you on this.

11 [background comments]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you  
13 all. I want to thank all of you for your advocacy  
14 work. I just wanted to share an interesting story  
15 related to what some of you folks are saying which  
16 is that in my district we have a post office like  
17 in many other districts. And like in most other  
18 districts the post office is dysfunctional but  
19 that's not for two days hearing. But they get  
20 placards that they're supposed to use when they're  
21 officially working on official business  
22 specifically when it's restricted for postal  
23 parking. However, in my particular district in  
24 Coney Island Avenue there is no postal parking  
25 because there's mass transit. And they use the

1  
2 parking placards to park all along the avenue. And  
3 as a result it's similar to the story that you were  
4 saying about the antique business store. What  
5 happens is the business in the district, they have  
6 a problem because customers literally have nowhere  
7 to park. And whenever you drive down the block you  
8 will see literally a row of cars, all of whom are  
9 postal service employees. They're not using it on  
10 official business. They're using it to get to and  
11 from work despite the fact that they're four blocks  
12 away from a train station. And they are blocking  
13 access to businesses that are literally crying to  
14 us. And so we engage with a fight with the NYPD to  
15 try to ticket these vehicles. The NYPD well they...  
16 they have placards. And we say well the... the  
17 placards aren't authorized. So we call the DOT. DOT  
18 says we haven't authorized the placards. NYPD says  
19 well how do we know which placards are authorized  
20 and which placards are not. And it's one of these  
21 sad... and it would be comical but for the fact that  
22 it's having a real implication where each agency is  
23 blaming the other agency. NYPD says it looks like  
24 an official placard to us. DOT says it's not an  
25 official placard but we don't issue tickets. And so

1  
2 you literally have a round and round game where  
3 these folks are using placards that they should not  
4 be using because they're certainly not allowed to  
5 use them. I think you know there are a few... a  
6 handful of places in the city where you can  
7 actually use postal service parking placards but  
8 not... not in those neighborhoods. And as a result  
9 the businesses are suffering. And so that's just a  
10 real life example of the frustration that... that we  
11 face on... on a regular basis. And... and the... the  
12 final point I make is that I find it completely  
13 ludicrous that because someone has a shirt that  
14 says Department of Buildings and literally they'll  
15 take their Tee-shirt and stuff it into the front...  
16 and this happens... district all the time, right, you  
17 stuff it into the front of the car... and exactly I...  
18 I see it all the time. And then people like oh well  
19 I guess the car's on unofficial... Wow, because you  
20 have a tee-shirt, really? I mean it... it's beyond  
21 bizarre. And so certainly this would go a long way  
22 but we want to thank you because I know you guys  
23 have been raising this issue for years. And I want  
24 to thank my colleagues and especially the chairman  
25 who's really trying to bring some common sense to

1  
2 the world of transportation. So thank you Mr.  
3 Chairman.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Well... Council  
5 Member Constantinides? Great. Well with this like  
6 we closing this hearing and this is about upgrading  
7 the parking system that we have been using in New  
8 York City. No doubts that we have teacher who live  
9 in places that they need to get a car to go to the  
10 school. A member of the NYPD they need to use a  
11 placard to do their jobs. I'm more into moving the  
12 transportation system into mass transportation. But  
13 I understand in New York City we have so many  
14 community with transportation desert. People who  
15 live in some places in Brooklyn in Queens they need  
16 a car in order for them to move around they borough  
17 and to go to other places. So this is about  
18 protecting the right of the 104 New Yorkers who  
19 work in different agencies. And they went through  
20 the process of getting the placard by going after  
21 those individual that being... they using fake  
22 placard in New York City. So this is where we are.  
23 With... this is only a beginning of the debate. It is  
24 only about... and this about bringing the... the  
25 parking system in New York City as close as it is

1  
2 in some place like close to the.. are in Washington  
3 D.C., San Francisco, and other places. With that  
4 this hearing is adjourned. Thank you.

5 ALEX SLACKY: Thank you.

6 [gavel]

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...acknowledge the  
8 great group of student, the future president and  
9 member of supreme court, future mayor, and future  
10 council member. Keep working hard and we are here  
11 to work and support you so that you become whatever  
12 you like to be in your future. Congratulation and  
13 have a good day.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 1, 2016