

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

November 24, 2015
Start: 1:31 p.m.
Recess: 2:57 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker
VINCENT J. GENTILE
The President Pro Tempore

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Maria Del Carmen Arroyo
Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Inez E. Dickens
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Daniel R. Garodnick
Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson
David G. Greenfield
Barry S. Grodenchik
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Laurie Sherman Graff
Founder
Heart Gallery NYC

Karen Shaffer
Executive Director
Office of Public and Private Partnerships
NYC Department of Homeless Services

Janet
Mentee Photographer
Heart Gallery NYC

Daniel Nigro
Commissioner
FDNY

Lt. Adam Vilagos
Firefighter
Engine 316
FDNY

Rev. Dr. Amy Butler
Riverside Church

Rabbi Gerald C. Skolnik
Forest Hills Jewish Center

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

TRANSCRIPTION NOTE: Speaker Mark-

Viverito speaks Spanish at time stamps **00:59:25** and **01:00:02**.

SERGEANT OF ARMS: Once again, ladies and gentlemen, please find a seat; we ask you to please keep it quiet; we are about to begin. Once again, please find your seats. [background comments] Keep it down, please. Thank you.

[pause]

[background comments]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, we're gonna get started on our ceremonials. [background comments] Council Member Levin will join me on this one.

So today the Majority Leader, myself and Chair Levin had the pleasure of doing the rounds -- if our members haven't done that, I really would encourage anyone in this room to really take a look at the exhibit we have here today in the rotunda; we did this in partnership and collaboration with Heart Gallery; I'm gonna ask the representatives from Heart Gallery to join us, and also with the Department of Homeless Services. The exhibit that is outside is called *Through the Eyes of the Homeless*.

1
2 So the photographers are formally
3 homeless individuals who have been mentored by
4 professional photographers and so the work is
5 outside; very excited and really happy that we were
6 able to do this. All the organizations that work in
7 the City of New York on behalf of homeless New
8 Yorkers, we thank them -- Goddard Riverside, BRC; a
9 whole bunch -- Project Renewal; a lot of different
10 organizations. Take a look at those. And we're also
11 gonna be sending information out because they are
12 artists, that is their work and their work is also
13 for sale. So if anybody would be interested in
14 purchasing any of the images; that is money that
15 directly goes back to the photographer that took the
16 photo. So this is a great partnership; really
17 excited about it and thank Council Member Levin and
18 Majority Leader Van Bramer for working with us to
19 make this a reality and to Heart Gallery, thank you
20 for your commitment.

21 So we're gonna read the Proclamation and
22 then ask the chairs and the Majority Leader to say a
23 few words, and then we'll obviously ask our
24 recipients as well. And Janet has one of the
25 photographs outside; [clapping] it is the one of the

1 manhole cover, right, it's a manhole cover; right?

2 It's a manhole cover; it's actually really beautiful,
3 so take a look at it. And so again, anyone that has
4 not seen it, I definitely ask you to take a quick
5 little tour of the rotunda and check them out. With
6 that I'll ask the clerk to read the Proclamation.
7

8 CITY CLERK: Council, City of New York
9 Proclamation.

10 Whereas, the Council of the City of New
11 York is proud to pay tribute to *Through the Eyes of*
12 *the Homeless*, an initiative and exhibit that has
13 empowered homeless New Yorkers and increased
14 understanding of their lives among others. And
15 whereas, founded by Laurie Sherman Graff, Heart
16 Gallery NYC is a unique, nonprofit organization that
17 partners with photographers to raise awareness of the
18 plight of foster children in desperate need of
19 permanent adoptive families.

20 This year the Heart Gallery NYC, in
21 collaboration with the NYC Department of Homeless
22 Services, expanded its mission to launch *Through the*
23 *Eyes of the Homeless*. And whereas, to empower
24 homeless individuals and to increase awareness of the
25 lack of affordable housing, Heart Gallery NYC's team

1
2 of photographers mentored homeless individuals and
3 encouraged them to photograph the city they see. The
4 stunning results now comprise a photo exhibit that
5 premiered on November 16, 2015 at the beautiful
6 Prince George Ballroom Gallery, located at 15 East
7 27th Street at 5th Avenue. A selection of the
8 exhibit is on display today, Tuesday, November 24,
9 2015 at City Hall.

10 And whereas, the photos in *Through the*
11 *Eyes of the Homeless* illuminate lives too often in
12 shadow and misunderstood. Homelessness is a complex
13 social issue that impacts our communities at every
14 level, but it is important to remember that
15 homelessness is a condition, not an identity.
16 Several common issues among homeless families and
17 individuals; the lack of affordable housing, living
18 wages and poverty, are the same challenges facing our
19 society. During this time of thanksgiving, may this
20 exhibit remind everyone that we truly succeed not as
21 isolated individuals, but as members of a city and a
22 nation who shares our blessings, lift every voice and
23 leave no one behind.

24 Now therefore be it known, that the
25 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors

1
2 Heart Gallery NYC and the New York City Department of
3 Homeless Services for their initiative and exhibit
4 *Through the Eyes of the Homeless*. Melissa Mark-
5 Viverito, Speaker for the Entire Council; Stephen
6 Levin, Chair, General Welfare Committee; Jimmy Van
7 Bramer, Majority Leader, Chair, Cultural Affairs
8 Committee.

9 [background comments, clapping]

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you so
11 much. And before... you know, and... again, I'm just
12 gonna say, 'cause I feel really, really strongly
13 about this and I think when the clerk just read the
14 Proc and it says that homelessness is not your
15 identity, you know let's not lose ourselves in some
16 of the unfortunate debate and coverage that we see
17 around this issue; it is a true crisis that we have
18 in the city, but these are individuals we're talking
19 about; this is not some sort of abstract issue and
20 challenge, and dehumanizing of life sometimes that
21 happens is really unfortunate. So let's just reflect
22 ton that. But thank you so much, Laurie, for
23 everything, Heart Gallery; I'll ask Council Member
24 Levin and Majority Leader Van Bramer to say something
25 before we hear from you.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Well thank you
3 very much, Madame Speaker; I wanna thank the Heart
4 Gallery and all of our artists, both our mentors and
5 our mentees for this amazing exhibit, *Through the*
6 *Eyes of the Homeless*. And you know this exhibit,
7 this process really exemplifies part of what the core
8 mission I believe of the Heart Gallery is, which is
9 empowerment; the artists that have all faced
10 challenges in their lives have had this opportunity,
11 this empowering opportunity to show all of us their
12 artistic vision and it's a beautiful vision, and the
13 photographs that you'll see in the rotunda at City
14 Hall today show, you know that the beauty that we see
15 all around us in New York City, 'cause this is a
16 beautiful city, that belongs to everybody; the sun
17 belongs to everybody, the streets belong to
18 everybody, and all of that beauty belongs to all of
19 us, and this exhibit reminds us all of that in a very
20 meaningful way and reminds us of our common humanity
21 and all that we share together, which is especially
22 important during this holiday time.

23 So I really wanna thank Laurie and the
24 Heart Gallery, which, as I said, their mission is to
25 bring that empowerment to everybody. So this is

1
2 really a great thrill and thank you very much, Madame
3 Speaker.

4 MAJORITY LEADER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
5 very much; I'll be very brief. I just wanna thank
6 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito and our Chair Steve
7 Levin. The tour through the exhibit this morning and
8 meeting the artists and the photographers was one of
9 the highlights of the day, if not the week; it was
10 really illuminating; the photographs are beautiful;
11 Janet, you're amazing and an inspiration to all of
12 us, as were all of the artists, so Laurie, thank you
13 for doing this and to our Speaker and to our Chair,
14 thank you for caring just so very much, and to all of
15 the artists, you're very, very talented and I know
16 there will be a bidding war for all of those pieces
17 that are out there, because they're just so special,
18 so thank you all very, very much.

19 And now I'm gonna hand it to Laurie, our
20 founder and the woman who brings us here today.

21 LAURIE SHERMAN GRAFF: Thank you so much,
22 thank you everyone. I wanna say a special thank you
23 to Speaker Viverito, Jimmy Van Bramer, Council Member
24 and Stephen Levin and of course, NYCDHS and of
25 course, our mentor photographers who took time out

1
2 of... they're so talented and they took time to work
3 with the mentee photographers, to all of the mentee
4 photographers, Heart Gallery staff; Heart Gallery
5 volunteers. We are a small organization, just very,
6 very briefly, 'cause I know we don't have a lot of
7 time and I want to pass this microphone to Janet,
8 because they have the beautiful work out there. But
9 just very briefly, Heart Gallery NYC, actually our
10 primary mission is to raise awareness of children in
11 foster care; the Heart Gallery project started in
12 2001 in New Mexico within the New Mexico Children and
13 Family Services, spread across the country and
14 there's a bout 100 Heart Galleries across the
15 country.

16 We are tiny, small organization, but
17 maybe it's because we're in the Big Apple we do
18 things in a big way, so I'm also proud to say that we
19 launched the National Heart Gallery Exhibit on
20 Capitol Hill in 2011 and we're the first Heart
21 Gallery in the country to launch and produce the
22 *Pride Exhibit*, which focuses on LGBTQ use in the
23 foster care system.

24 We are so thrilled that DHS invited us to
25 be a part of this, because it gives us the

1
2 opportunity to utilize the talents of the
3 photographers we work with and to use photography to
4 raise awareness of yet another socially relevant
5 cause, homelessness. And the images are really
6 amazing and if anyone wants to purchase them, please
7 contact -- shall I... shall I... [background comments]
8 yeah, we'll facilit... 'cause we had them on sale at
9 the event; the money goes directly back to the mentee
10 photographers, outside of printing, we don't take
11 anything off that, they deserve it, they did
12 beautiful work.

13 So thank you so much; I'm gonna pass this
14 to Karen Shaffer, who is the Executive Director of
15 the Office of Public and Private Partnerships at
16 NYCDHS; it was her phone call to me in March that
17 started all this and they've been incredibly great
18 partners to work with. Here, Karen.

19 KAREN SHAFFER: Thank you, Laurie; this
20 has been a wonderful partnership and Department of
21 Homeless Services is very happy to be a part of it,
22 especially how it's empowered our individuals, our
23 mentors and photographers. So I really do not wanna
24 take anymore time; I want Janet to speak, because she
25 really tells the whole story.

1
2 JANET: Hi, everybody. [background
3 comments] Thank you for having me here today; thank
4 you for Laurie and for everybody for giving me this
5 opportunity.

6 I was homeless for 15 years and I didn't
7 travel a lot within Manhattan or the other boroughs;
8 I pretty much stayed in one place. Once I got off
9 the street into transitional housing, I was contacted
10 by DHS through the Homeless Outreach Center that
11 helped me get off the street and they asked me to
12 participate; would I like to, and I said yes; it was
13 a great, great mental healing for me and a positive
14 for me and the camera in my hand helped me to forget
15 about my area and to let go and actually see some of
16 the finer things that Manhattan has to offer. Thank
17 you so, so much.

18 [background comments, applause]

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, thank
20 you all very much. And again, take a look at the
21 exhibit.

22 Okay. The next ceremonial will be with
23 Council Member Ferreras-Copeland. We are going to be
24 recognizing Lieutenant Adam Vilagos of Engine 316,
25 who saved the life of a 3-week-old baby boy from a

1
2 burning house in Corona, Queens on the night of
3 Tuesday, November 17th. He pulled a newborn out of
4 his crib in the attic of the two-story house after a
5 fire broke out, and that is quite an amazing feat and
6 it reminds us of the work that our firefighters and
7 police officers do each and every day. Wow, thank
8 you; congratulations on that. I'm gonna ask...
9 [background comments] Yep, we have a lot of support
10 here today for the lieutenant, so it's great -- hi,
11 how are you? Great. Yeah, we can have space. Oh
12 and the Commissioner is here too; I didn't realize
13 our FDNY Commissioner Nigro was here.

14 COMMISSIONER NIGRO: My nephew.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh and he's your
16 nephew.

17 COMMISSIONER NIGRO: Yes he is.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Wow, okay, there
19 goes; good stock there. Alright; it runs in the
20 family. So congratulations so much; thank you very
21 much. We're gonna read the Proclamation and then
22 obviously hear from the council member, the
23 commissioner and the lieutenant. Clerk; if you could
24 read the Proclamation.
25

1
2 CITY CLERK: Council, City of New York
3 Proclamation.

4 Whereas, the Council of the City of New
5 York is proud to honor FDNY Lieutenant Adam Vilagos
6 for his heroism during a house fire in Corona, Queens
7 that saved the life of a 3-week-old baby boy. And
8 whereas, around 9:30 p.m. on Tuesday, November 17th,
9 Lieutenant Vilagos of Engine 316, and 18-year veteran
10 of the FDNY, responded to a blaze that erupted at a
11 home on 106th Street in Corona. Upon his arrival he
12 heard the clambers of the family who were forced to
13 escape the fire before they were able to reach the
14 infant in the attic. And whereas, as the fire
15 continued to roar, all hope appeared to be lost, but
16 Lieutenant Vilagos sprinted through heavy black smoke
17 and up two flights of stairs in search of the child;
18 with zero visibility in the blinding smoke and
19 struggling to breathe, he made his way in the dark to
20 reach the attic bedroom, following the baby's cries
21 until he bumped into the child's crib. And whereas,
22 with baby Sanjay securely in his arms, Lieutenant
23 Vilagos flew down the stairs and back outside; he
24 handed the infant to EMS workers. With their support
25 and readily available equipment for oxygen, the child

1 was quickly on his way to New York Presbyterian.
2 Thanks to Lieutenant Vilagos and his colleagues, baby
3 Sanjay is alive and on his way to a full recovery.
4 And whereas, remarkably, after Lieutenant Vilagos
5 ensured the infant was safe, he went back to the
6 house to battle the blaze with his fellow
7 firefighters. He has truly distinguished himself as
8 one of New York City's bravest and has earned the
9 enduring gratitude of all New Yorkers.
10

11 Now therefore be it known, that the
12 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors
13 FDNY Lieutenant Adam Vilagos for his courageous life-
14 saving rescue on November 17th, 2015. Melissa Mark-
15 Viverito, Speaker for the Entire Council; Julissa
16 Ferreras-Copeland, Council Member 21st District,
17 Queens; Elizabeth Crowley, Chair, Fire and Public
18 Service Committee.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you; I'm
20 gonna... [applause] I'm gonna pass it to the council
21 member who brought us here today and we'll hear from
22 our commissioner, but the commissioner just indicated
23 he has six relatives that continue to serve in the
24 Fire Department, so wow, it's a great tradition that
25

1
2 lives on in your family. Council Member Julissa
3 Ferreras-Copeland.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
5 you, Speaker.

6 Every day the brave men and women of the
7 FDNY go to their firehouses and they don't know what
8 they're going to face that day. Last week's rescue
9 by Lieutenant Adam Vilagos shows how unpredictable
10 the circumstances can be and it also demonstrates how
11 swift, strong and courageous our firefighters are.

12 At the beginning of the year there was
13 another fire in my district where a Haitian family
14 was not so fortunate and did not survive; they also
15 didn't have a smoke alarm in their apartment. So as
16 we honor Lieutenant Vilagos today for his truly
17 heroic rescue of baby Sanjay, I think nothing would
18 make him happier or would honor his efforts more than
19 to have every family in Corona and New York City
20 protected by a working smoke detector; that is
21 something that this Council has prioritized in its
22 funding and I will support always in my district.

23 Lieutenant Vilagos -- made you super
24 Latino there -- [laugh] I give you my endless
25 gratitude for your service and your compassion to the

1
2 people of District 21 in Corona. Commissioner Nigro,
3 thank you for leading the bravest fire department
4 ever; I don't know what you put in your family's
5 turkey, but clearly they raised amazing, brave men
6 and women and I thank you for your time and for
7 deciding to take this as your profession. Thank you.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We'll have the
9 commissioner say a few words, [applause] and then
10 we'll hear from the lieutenant.

11 COMMISSIONER NIGRO: Well certainly the
12 members of the Fire Department live for this, to save
13 lives; there's nothing more important to them, and
14 when that life can be a helpless 3-week-old baby,
15 that is the ultimate, so the entire Fire Department
16 is proud of Lieutenant Vilagos and my family is proud
17 of my nephew, Adam, and what can I say, just a
18 fabulous rescue, great job.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And lieutenant,
20 it's all yours.

21 [applause]

22 LT. ADAM VILAGOS: I just wanna say I'm
23 proud to be a member of this fire department for 18
24 years; like you said, every day is different, we
25 don't know what we're gonna go into, and like I said

1 before, I have the luxury of working with great
2 firemen, [background comment, applause] these guys
3 back here are fantastic and I couldn't do anything
4 without them and that's it.
5

6 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND:

7 Alright. [laughter, background comments]

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you again
9 very much.

10 [background comments]

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright.

12 Alright, our last Proclamation today, Council Member
13 Levine, on a great celebration here, [background
14 comment] yep, 85th anniversary of Riverside Church.
15 I'll hand it off to the council member to say a few
16 words before we [background comment] get the
17 Proclamation. Yes, anybody that's affiliated
18 [background comment], the Riverside Church
19 representatives, you could come on up. Council
20 Member Levine.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you. Thank
22 you, Madame Speaker.

23 Well I am so pleased to represent
24 Riverside Church, which is... come colleagues, come;
25 you wanna be part of this. [background comments]

1
2 Riverside Church is a true, true great New York City
3 institution that is now celebrating its 85th
4 anniversary. I'm so pleased by the fact that we're
5 joined today by its Pastor, Rev. Dr. Butler. This
6 institution, it's a marvel of gothic architecture and
7 more importantly, it has been the center of political
8 and spiritual change for almost a century now. It
9 has been the site of historic, unforgettable
10 addresses by figures no less than Martin Luther King,
11 Nelson Mandela, Cesar Chavez, heads of state,
12 President Bill Clinton; so many others; the funeral
13 for Jackie Robinson, an incredibly storied history,
14 and its congregation, which numbers close to 2,000,
15 is about the most diverse group of New Yorkers you
16 could find; people of virtually every ethnic,
17 national and racial background, even spiritually
18 diverse in so many ways, and it continues to be a
19 source of light for the district, for the city and
20 really for the whole country and I'm so glad we're
21 able to honor you today on this auspicious 85th
22 anniversary. Thank you.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: If I could ask
24 for some quiet in the room, please, [background
25 comments] we're... 'Kay; I appreciate it.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: 'Kay. And now
3 I'd like to ask the clerk to please read the text of
4 the certif..

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Proclamation.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Proclamation;
7 thank you. [background comments, laughter]

8 CITY CLERK: Council, City of New York
9 Proclamation.

10 We are a city made stronger by houses of
11 worship that inspire us all to embrace and uphold our
12 highest ideals. During times of trouble and times of
13 peace, these community pillars unite everyone in a
14 spirit of fellowship to cultivate the best of our
15 character, treat each other with dignity and find
16 purpose, meaning and direction. The Council of the
17 City of New York is proud to publicly honor the
18 Riverside Church for achieving this in Manhattan for
19 the last 85 years.

20 And whereas, the Riverside Church, an
21 inclusive interdenominational, interracial,
22 interethnic, international and welcoming place of
23 worship stands at 490 Riverside Drive in Morningside
24 Heights as a beacon for all who seek truth, justice
25 and harmony and share a commitment to charity,

1
2 compassion and dignity; its positive impact locally,
3 nationally and globally is immeasurable, profound,
4 humbling and inspiring all at once.

5 And whereas, since it was established in
6 1930, the Riverside Church has helped promote a
7 spiritual message that fosters social change, builds
8 communities and shapes the world for the better.

9 With more than 1700 members from more than 40
10 different denominational, national, ethnic and
11 cultural backgrounds, as well as many affiliates, the
12 church strengthens our community in a wide range of
13 endeavors, including organizing holiday food and gift
14 drive, community events and forums.

15 And whereas, where the world and society
16 has changed dramatically in the last 85 years, the
17 Riverside Church has remained unwavering in its
18 commitment to human dignity, whether advocating for
19 immigrant rights, LGBT rights and prison reform or
20 guiding people towards peace and nonproliferation or
21 providing support for people living with AIDS. Over
22 the years the church has been a meaningful platform
23 for numerous champions of social justice, including
24 Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr., Nelson Mandela and Cesar
25 Chavez, among others.

1
2 And whereas, at this special milestone we
3 reflect not only upon the rich history of the
4 Riverside Church, but also reaffirm our faith in its
5 equally promising future.

6 Now therefore be it known that the
7 Council of the City of New York proudly honors the
8 Riverside Church in its celebration of its 85th
9 anniversary and its enduring contributions to
10 compassion and human dignity around the world.
11 Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the Entire
12 Council; Mark D. Levine, Council Member 7th District,
13 Manhattan.

14 [background comments, applause]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: 'Kay, I'm gonna
16 now ask the wonderful Rev. Dr. Amy Butler, who leads
17 this fine institution, to say a few words.

18 REV. DR. BUTLER: Thank you. Thank you
19 everyone and I want to express the thanks of the
20 Riverside Church and the City of New York, to Council
21 Member Levine and Madame Speaker and the whole City
22 Council of New York, thank you so much. It's an
23 honor for this institution to have been part of the
24 history of this city for the last 85 years and we
25 want to continue to be a place where people are

1
2 brought together, where we again live out the
3 conviction that we are better together moving
4 forward. So thank you so, so very much.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you very
6 much. Thank you.

7 [applause, background comments]

8 [pause]

9 SERGEANT OF ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,
10 can I have your attention, please? Can I please have
11 your attention? [background comment] At this time,
12 please place all electronic devices, all electronic
13 devices to vibrate. Will all non-Council employees,
14 non-Council employees please leave the main floor of
15 the chambers at this time? There is seating in the
16 balcony for the public. Thank you.

17 [gavel]

18 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: I hereby
19 call the order, the Stated Council Meeting of
20 November 24th, 2015. Please rise for the Pledge of
21 Allegiance.

22 [background comment]

23 [full body Pledge of Allegiance]

24 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Roll
25 call.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo. Barron.
COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera.
COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin.
COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.
COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.
Corney.
COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.
COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.
COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.
COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens. Dromm.
COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal. [background
comment] Ferreras-Copeland.
COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.
COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield. Arroyo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo. Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Yes.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander. Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel. Mealy.

Menchaca. Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller. Palma.
Reynoso. [background comments] Richards.
COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.
COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose.
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres. Treyger.
COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.
COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.
COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams. Wills.
COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo.
COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer.
COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.
SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Here.

1
2 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: We have a
3 quorum. Please stand for the invocation.

4 The invocation this afternoon will be
5 delivered by Rabbi Gerald Skolnik of the Forest Hills
6 Jewish Center in Queens, New York.

7 RABBI SKOLNIK: Dear God, source of all
8 blessing, sovereign of the universe. With humility
9 and awe we invoke the full bounty of your blessings
10 upon the duly elected members of the New York City
11 Council as they gather together this afternoon. We
12 ask dear God that you grant them strength of body and
13 resilience of spirit, compassion and resolve equal to
14 the daunting challenges that they face and the wisdom
15 to persevere in the face of the many obstacles that
16 inevitably arise as they seek to do the critically
17 important work of this city.

18 We are living through times of
19 extraordinary anxiety, days and nights that truly try
20 our souls. The scourge of global terror casts a pall
21 on our lives and threatens to dim if not extinguish
22 the glorious and brilliant light that shines from
23 this great city as a beacon of hope and inspiration
24 to people around the world. Help us all, dear God,
25 both elected officials and the citizens who look to

1
2 them for guidance to stand firm and resolute as we
3 confront the unique challenges of this time. Be with
4 the men and women of our military and our first
5 responders who are in harms way and shield them from
6 danger. Be with us all and keep us safe here in our
7 beloved city from those who conspire to do us harm
8 and protect our families and loved ones. Help all
9 the citizens of New York to withstand the relentless
10 anxiety of these violent times to stand with heads
11 unbowed and resolve not shaken to live the lives that
12 we aspire to and deserve; let the specter of terror
13 never dim our vision, narrow our horizons or bring us
14 to a rational fear and senseless hatred of the other.

15 And finally, dear God, last but most
16 certainly not least, as we approach the festival of
17 Thanksgiving, we ask that you help us to be grateful,
18 a condition that does not always come as easily as it
19 should to us. May we always understand and never
20 forget that each and every one of us, every single
21 person in this room has much more than he or she
22 needs to be happy in this life. As we struggle to
23 ensure that those in our city who are the most needy
24 receive the aid and support that they desperately
25 need to make life livable day to day and paycheck to

1
2 paycheck, it behooves us all to remain ever conscious
3 of what it means to live a life of relative plenty.
4 We read and hear every day of men, women and children
5 who are both literally and figuratively running for
6 their lives from a variety of trouble points around
7 the world. May we always remember to acknowledge in
8 our hearts and in our actions those for whom
9 gratitude is too often supplanted by longing and
10 lack. Open our hearts always to be more gracious and
11 more kind and may the members of this august body
12 always find favor in the eyes of those whom they
13 serve and in your eyes as well, and we say amen.

14 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Motion to
15 Spread the Invocation, Council Member Koslowitz.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Before I do
17 that I wanna recognize Rabbi Skolnik, who is the
18 spiritual leader of Forest Hills Jewish Center, one
19 of the largest Conservative congregations in Queens,
20 if not the largest. Rabbi Skolnik is involved in
21 many communal activities; he is the immediate past
22 President of the prestigious Rabbinical Assembly, the
23 1600-member international organization which serves
24 as the voice of Conservative Judaism. He has been a
25 vice president of organizations; Rabbi Skolnik is the

1
2 past president of the Commission on Synagogue
3 Relations at the UJA Federation, past chairman of its
4 Committee on AIDS and member of its board of
5 directors. He is well appreciated in Forest Hills
6 and throughout the City of New York with all his
7 involvement and I thank him for being here today.

8 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Thank
9 you, Council Member Kos... [crosstalk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I spread the...
11 I spread the invocation upon...

12 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Thank
13 you. Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Council.

15 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Adoption
16 of Minutes, Council Member Mendez.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I make a motion
18 that the Minutes of the Stated Meeting of October
19 29th of this year be adopted as printed.

20 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Thank
21 you. Messages and Papers from the Mayor.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

23 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE:
24 Communication from city, county and borough offices.
25

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: M 0350, Certification
3 of Barry S. Grodenchik, new Council Member 23rd
4 Councilmanic District.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Received,
6 Ordered, Printed and Filed.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: M 0351, Certification
8 of Joseph C. Borelli, new Council Member 51st
9 Councilmanic District.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Received,
11 Ordered, Printed and Filed.

12 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: The City
13 Clerk and the Clerk of the Council will now perform
14 the formal ceremony; the elected Council Members
15 Barry S. Grodenchik and Joseph C. Borelli taking
16 their oath of office and both members will be
17 escorted into the Council Chambers by the Majority
18 Leader and Minority Leader of the Council.

19 [applause, cheers]

20 [pause]

21 [cheers]

22 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Welcome
23 to the Council. [background comments] Okay, please,
24 we're gonna continue with our meeting. Petitions and
25 Communications.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

None.

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Land Use
Call-Ups.

COMMITTEE CLERK: M 0352, disposition of
two city-owned properties.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Roll Call.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron. Borelli.

[background comments]

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: You get
to vote.

[background comments]

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Oh, okay.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I vote aye and
with permission, I would like to vote aye on all
items on the General Orders Calendar.

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE:
Permission granted.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 34

2 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I vote aye. Thank

3 you. Have a happy Thanksgiving, every one.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.

5 Cornegy.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: With permission,

9 Majority Leader.

10 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I'd like to vote

12 aye on all calendar items and all Call-Ups and

13 congratulate two new colleagues.

14 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE:

15 Permission granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you. I

17 vote aye.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here. Yes.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 35
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal. Eugene.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.
4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: I vote
6 aye and with permission I'd like to vote aye on all
7 Call-Ups and General Orders.
8 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE:
9 Permission granted.
10 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
11 you and congratulations to our colleagues.
12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.
14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.
15 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Aye.
16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you. With
18 permission I'd like to vote yes on all Call-Ups and
19 Coupled General Orders, as well as all items on the
20 calendar. I vote aye.
21 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE:
22 Permission granted.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you so
24 much. Happy Thanksgiving to all my colleagues and
25

1 friends and certainly to our council members, welcome
2 and congratulations. Thank you.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I vote aye
5 and I welcome our new colleagues, Council Members
6 Grodenchik and Borelli; looking forward to serving
7 with both of you. Thank you.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: King.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo. Koslowitz.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye and I also
18 wanna congratulate our two new council members.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: With
23 congratulations to our new members, I vote aye.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote aye and to
Council Members Grodenchik and Borelli, welcome to
the family.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca. Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I vote aye and
congratulations to our new colleagues.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye. Yes on
3 all. [sic]

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I vote aye.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I vote aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.

9 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE:
10 Councilman Vacca, Land Use Call-Ups.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye and welcome
14 gentlemen to the Council.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye and
17 welcome. [sic]

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye. [sic]

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo. Van Bramer.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye.
24
25

1
2 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Today's
3 Land Use Call-Ups were voted by 44 in the
4 affirmative, 0 in the negative; adopted.

5 Communications from the Speaker.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
7 Council Member Gentile.

8 So I wanna say good afternoon to everyone
9 and before we get into the business of the day, I
10 definitely wanna begin today, I wanna ask my
11 colleagues to join me in standing as we recognize the
12 victims of the terrorist attack on November 13th in
13 Paris, France; also the recent attacks in Nigeria and
14 Lebanon. These brutal attacks obviously are all
15 senseless and horrific. Here in New York City we
16 know all too well what it feels like to have our
17 friends and neighbors, our entire city and our entire
18 country targeted by a terrorist attack. So today and
19 every day we stand with France, with Nigeria, with
20 Lebanon and everyone around the world who has faced
21 terrorism as they bravely move forward in the
22 aftermath of these travesties. Our thoughts and
23 prayers are with them all and I'd like to ask
24 everyone to join me in a moment of silence.

25 [moment of silence]

1 Thank you, my colleagues.

2
3 So today we'll be voting on a legislative
4 package to provide New Yorkers with better access to
5 public data on the internet. The Council passed the
6 Open Data Law last session and it required agencies
7 to make a lot of their data available to the public
8 on a single website. We have overseen its
9 implementation this session, holding three oversight
10 hearings on open data issues and while it has mostly
11 been a success, we have also found areas of
12 improvement. For example, some of the data sets used
13 difficult to understand terms, like carbonation
14 biochemical oxygen demand; unless you are a
15 wastewater treatment specialist, you probably don't
16 know that term, but one of the bills in this package
17 would require the creation of a data dictionary to
18 provide such definitions.

19 Another problem we found is that some
20 data sets are constantly losing data. For example,
21 DCA posts a list of licensed businesses, but when a
22 business closes or loses its license, it also
23 vanishes from the list. This is not only a loss of
24 valuable information, but it also frustrates attempts
25 to study changes over time, so one of the bills in

1
2 this package would therefore require the preservation
3 of such data.

4 All five of the bills in this package are
5 similar commonsense updates to ensure our city's Open
6 Data Law remains one of the best in the nation.

7 On the staff end I would like to thank
8 Brad Reid, Ken Grace, Jeff Baker and Ed Atkin. I'd
9 also now like to ask the sponsors of the legislation
10 to each say a few words; if we could start off with
11 the Chair of the Technology Committee, Council Member
12 Vacca.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you, Madame
14 Speaker and I wanna thank the members of this body
15 and all the staff for their fantastic assistance in
16 putting together this package.

17 This package may not be sexy, very
18 honestly; it really relates to the minutiae of
19 transparency, but we in this council certainly have
20 taken the lead over the course of many years to make
21 sure that there was transparency and open data is the
22 way to the future. Open data is something that more
23 and more New Yorkers will be using every day and as
24 Chair of the Committee on Technology, I'm pleased
25 that my committee was able to pass this package

1 because it's going to give citizens the information
2 they need and they're going to be getting it in a
3 timely way; it's going to mean that agencies are
4 going to have to meet deadlines that are prescribed
5 insomuch as posting the information and it's going to
6 allow people in our neighborhoods on a grassroots
7 level to know what city agencies are doing, how
8 they're performing; when they're taking action.

9
10 So I wanna thank the Speaker; I wanna
11 thank all the staff; this package is significant in
12 that it relates to the day-to-day operation of
13 government, making it more efficient, making it more
14 accessible, getting the information online sooner and
15 making it more user-friendly as well, so access is
16 the key to all that we're doing today, citizen access
17 to government at a local level. Thank you.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
19 Council Member. Council Member Cabrera.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
21 much, Madame Speaker and Chair Vacca and to the
22 staff.

23 Intro. 0890-A, in particular, seeks to
24 address a current problem with NYC's open data
25 portal. Right now the portal has data on individuals

1
2 and businesses who are current with licenses, permits
3 and other documents, but we have no way to know when
4 individuals or businesses go off that list; we cannot
5 do a longitudinal study because the data from even a
6 few years back is getting lost, which makes it
7 impossible to track trends. The bill calls for the
8 creation of snapshot of data that allows us to track
9 trends over time.

10 The second problem that this bill seeks
11 to address is that some of the data sets are so
12 massive that they become too long to download.
13 Yellow Taxi's GPS data is the largest data set on the
14 portal, there are over 170 million entries in a
15 single year; what's the plan where there are 10 years
16 worth of data? We want to make sure that there are
17 protocols in place to divide up this data into
18 smaller data sets rather than removing the data set,
19 which is the current practice, that are getting lost
20 and is unacceptable; ensuring the creation of
21 preservational archives is particularly important as
22 we examine historical trends and look back to
23 determine how best to move forward.

24

25

1
2 I'm excited to be part of this movement
3 and I hope the Council will recognize its importance.
4 Thank you so much.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
6 Council Member. Council Member Gentile.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Thank you,
8 Madame Speaker.

9 Open data is neither useful nor
10 transparent if you can't understand the terms that
11 are being used on the open data portal. So the bill
12 that we're voting on today will create an online
13 dictionary of all the terms on the open data portal
14 that the general public would otherwise not
15 realistically understand, so it's a good bill; I urge
16 a yes vote and thank our Chair James Vacca and our
17 Speaker for this opportunity.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
19 Council Member. Council Member Kallos.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you,
21 Speaker Viverito as well as our Technology Chair,
22 Jimmy Vacca for their leadership on open data.

23 Government is kind of stuck a little bit
24 in Government 1.0; a lot of people feel like
25 government speaks but doesn't really listen; we are

1
2 doing a lot in Government 2.0, making sure it's in
3 both directions. Today's legislation actually brings
4 us to Government 3.0 where things would be as simple
5 as we're use to, which is on our mobile phones,
6 everything being a location-aware, and so this
7 legislation says that as we're putting the data sets
8 out we would be using GPS, GIS information that would
9 be standardized so that people can make all of the
10 data that we're releasing geographically relevant so
11 that you know if something's happening in your back
12 yard. I urge my colleagues to please vote yes on
13 this and the entire package. Thank you.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I was looking for
15 Council Member Torres; he has the other bill, but I
16 don't see him, but we appreciate his support and
17 sponsorship of those bills. Additionally, we'll be
18 voting to extend the city's biotechnology tax credit
19 against the unincorporated business tax and the
20 general corporation tax through December 21st, 2018.

21 This credit provides small New York City-
22 based, research-based, qualified, emerging technology
23 companies with a refundable credit of up to \$250,000
24 for a maximum of three consecutive years.

25

1
2 On the staff end I'd like to thank Ray
3 Majewski, Tanisha Edwards, Paul Sturm and Rebecca
4 Chasen [sp?], and Council Member Garodnick is the
5 lead on this one, and if he could say a few words.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
7 much, Madame Speaker. And to my colleagues, I just
8 want to speak for a moment on Intro. 0956, which as
9 you heard, would extend the biotech tax credit
10 through the end of 2018.

11 Biotech is emerging as one of the most
12 important sectors in the world's economy and
13 significantly New York City is in a unique position
14 to take advantage of this. We are home to 59
15 hospitals, 900 life science companies and a fast-
16 growing startup scene. Our city received \$1.4
17 billion in research funding from the National
18 Institute of Health in 2013, biotech companies, as
19 you know, bring advanced research and development
20 into the city, creating middle class jobs and
21 tremendous innovations at the same time.

22 The small emerging businesses face
23 several challenges; there is a scarcity of laboratory
24 space, rents are constantly rising and energy costs
25 are high. To help the City Council passed a biotech

1
2 tax credit in 2009. The tax is a refundable credit
3 against the City's general corporation tax and
4 unincorporated business tax. Its purpose is to help
5 offset the cost of equipment, research and employee
6 training for small businesses for New York City. The
7 money saved goes into patents, space, equipment,
8 training and more.

9 Recent startups can receive a maximum of
10 \$250,000 a year and preexisting companies can earn up
11 to \$125,000 in credits under certain conditions.
12 This represents a huge savings for small companies.
13 Twenty-eight companies took advantage of it in 2013;
14 that was up from 23 in 2012; those applications
15 totaled about \$2.4 million in credits; this credit
16 works and we should continue to foster a healthy
17 environment for biotech startups.

18 This tax credit is about keeping New York
19 strong in our rapidly growing biotech sector; these
20 resources pave the way for New York to continue to
21 lead in this industry, so I encourage my colleagues
22 to vote yes and thank you again, Madame Speaker and
23 also to Chair Ferreras-Copeland for holding the vote
24 today at the Finance Committee. Thank you very much.

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. And
3 obviously we all know; I just wanna formally say that
4 we wanna welcome Council Members Borelli and
5 Grodenchik here into the chambers; we're really glad
6 to have you on board, congratulations on your victory
7 and I know you've been joined here by friends and
8 family; we welcome them all. Also, Assemblyman
9 Michael Simanowitz is here, as well as Assemblyman,
10 current colleague and Council Member [sic] David
11 Weprin, and former Assemblyman and Council Member
12 Mark Weprin, [cheers, applause] thank you all for
13 being here and joining us as we celebrate them.

14 Also wanna remind everyone that Small
15 Business Saturday is this weekend; it's important now
16 more than ever for us to support the small businesses
17 in our own neighborhoods that create jobs and revenue
18 for our own communities. Small businesses are the
19 life force of every local economy and definitely it
20 is challenging times for them. They provide reliable
21 services, jobs for residents in the area and remain a
22 major building block for prosperity across America.

23 So while I know that many get excited
24 about finding deals on Black Friday and a lot of
25 times we look at the megastores and the shopping that

1
2 you can do there; we definitely want people to keep
3 your small local businesses in mind and please do
4 some of your shopping at your community shops and
5 stores this year on Small Business Saturday, and of
6 course, every year. Before Small Business Saturday
7 comes Thanksgiving, **[00:59:25] Spanish.** So I wanna
8 wish all of you and all New Yorkers a happy safe
9 Thanksgiving this year with your families; it really
10 is a time of year to do a lot of reflection.

11 And finally, because I think it needs to
12 be said, obviously we've all been hearing in the news
13 today; our colleague that is here with us today,
14 Council Member Arroyo, will be resigning at the end
15 of this year to dedicate her time to pressing family
16 needs; I know you've been a great colleague to all of
17 us, Maria and I know we all wish you the best, but
18 definitely wanted to make sure that we thanked you
19 from the floor, since it's out there in the universe
20 as they say. **[01:00:02] Spanish.** Okay, so thank you
21 very much.

22 [cheers, applause, background comments,
23 laugh]

24 And with that, I end the communication
25 from the Speaker.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 50

2 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Thank

3 you, Madame Speaker.

4 Discussion of General Orders.

5 [background comment] Alright, seeing none. Reports

6 of Special Committees.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

8 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Reports

9 of Standing Committees.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee

11 on Finance, Intro. 0956-A, biotechnology credit.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and

13 Coupled on General Orders.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro. 0982-A, hotel

15 room occupancy tax.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and

17 Coupled on General Orders.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered Reso

19 0911, Metrotech BID.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on

21 General Orders.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered Reso

23 0912, organization funding.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on

25 General Orders.

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 0304
3 and Reso 0916 and LU 0305 and Reso 0917, Jamaica
4 Crossing.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
6 General Orders.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
8 on Rules, Privileges and Elections, M 0347 and Reso
9 0918, approving the appointment of Janet Alvarez, Tax
10 Commission.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
12 General Orders.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
14 on Technology, Intro. 0890-A, retention of data on
15 the open data portal.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
17 Coupled on General Orders.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 0898-A, online
19 data dictionary.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
21 Coupled on General Orders.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro. 0900-A, address
23 and geospatial information.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
25 Coupled on General Orders.

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro. 0914-A, public
3 request response timelines.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
5 Coupled on General Orders.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro. 0915-A, updating
7 of public data sets.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
9 Coupled on General Orders.

10 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: On the
11 General Order Calendar, resolution appointing various
12 persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
14 General Orders and at this time I ask for a roll call
15 on all items on the Coupled General Order Calendar.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Sorry. Aye on
22 all except for Intro. 0982-A.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to explain my vote.

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I just wanna acknowledge Council Members Vacca, Cabrera, Mealy, Gentile, Mendez, Kallos, Torres, and Koo for introducing legislation that would increase transparency within the City of New York by improving how we archive data, inform our public and respond to inquiries. I would like to thank Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito and Council Member Vacca for their leadership on this set of bills and I also wanna thank everyone today in support of the resolution authorizing the increase in the amount to be expanded annually in the Metrotech Area Business Improvement District in the Borough of Brooklyn within my district as well as Council Member Steve Levin. Thank you. I vote aye.

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote aye on
all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD:
Congratulations to my colleagues, happy Thanksgiving.
I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I vote aye and I
also wanna welcome our new colleagues and just say
that I'm gonna miss Council Member Arroyo; she's been
a wonderful colleague; she was my predecessor in

1
2 chairing the Health Committee; she is fearless and
3 relentless and smart and pointed and does not mind
4 holding people accountable and I have really
5 appreciated that, and I'm happy for her and I'm gonna
6 miss her. Aye on all.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: King.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
17 permission to explain my vote. I'll take that as a
18 yes. I vote aye on all; I want to again say welcome
19 to our new colleagues in the Council and also express
20 my regret at our departing colleague from the
21 Council. I also wanna take one moment to say a word
22 about the... we're voting today on the nomination of
23 Janet Alvarez for the Tax Commission; as people know,
24 we had two hearings with her; the first raised some
25 issues that we had concerns about and the second she

1
2 answered those issues well, but I wanna say a special
3 word of thanks to our staff who did the work in-
4 between those two hearings to make sure that we had
5 all the information that we need and that we got a
6 really good look and this body did its advice and
7 consent job. So thank you to Chuck Davis, Director
8 of Investigations; Deandra Johnson and Alicia Vissel
9 [sp?], as well as Abid Hossain, the Counsel of the
10 committee and Kathleen Ahn, our General Counsel. I
11 think the Council really acquitted itself well in
12 taking a good hard look at that nomination, making
13 sure that we got everything that we need; thanks to
14 them. Happy Thanksgiving and I vote aye on all.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
17 explain my vote.

18 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Yes, you
19 may.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I want to welcome
21 our two new colleagues to the City Council and I wish
22 them well and I look forward to working with them
23 both. And I too want to thank and acknowledge our
24 colleague Maria Del Carmen Arroyo for her years of
25 service; I know that we're gonna have another

1
2 opportunity to thank her, but you know, Maria has
3 two, I believe, of the most important qualities that
4 you can have in public service and that is honesty
5 and gut; Maria has both of those qualities and she
6 has been a great friend and instructor to me and I
7 will always treasure that. Thank you. Aye on all.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

11 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE:

12 Councilman Maisel.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes on all. [sic]

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present. Aye.

16 [sic].

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye on all.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Just would like

to welcome our new colleagues here to the Council,
both Council Member Grodenchik and Council Member
Borelli; also to say to Council Member Arroyo, even
though she still has some more time left, truly
respect someone that speaks their mind; is not afraid
to speak their mind in front of any audience, so I
really give you kudos, Council Member Arroyo for
that, and with that I vote aye on all and wish all my
colleagues a very happy and healthy Thanksgiving.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: If I can explain
my vote... [crosstalk]

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Yes you
may.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I first have to
3 speak of Maria Arroyo for a minute in the context of
4 the Bronx; when Maria was in the room you knew the
5 Bronx was in the room. She knew the borough, she
6 knew the issues and she was a fighter for the borough
7 and she's still here, but losing her... [laughter,
8 background comments] I'll repeat my speech on
9 December 31st, but I wanted to make it in case the
10 New Year came and went.

11 Also, in announcing the technology packet
12 of bills, I did thank the Speaker, but I also want to
13 thank the staff; they did a great job; I wanna single
14 out Brad Reid, Attorney to the Committee, and I do
15 also wanna single out Stacy Gardener, my Legislative
16 Director and Deputy Chief of Staff, and very proud of
17 this package of bills that we just passed. So I vote
18 aye on all with that explanation.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.
21 Happy Thanksgiving everyone and Council Member
22 Arroyo, my entire family gives you your blessings and
23 thank you for what you've done for us. Thank you.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 0982-A, yes
on the rest.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye.

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: All items
on today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a
vote of 45 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative, 0
abstentions, with the exception of Intro. 0982-A,
which was adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative,
2 in the negative; 0 abstentions.

[background comments]

Oh and the revised Land Use Call-Ups were
adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative and 0 in
the negative.

Since we have no resolutions.. [background
comments] Oh Introduction Reading of Bills, I'm
sorry; Introduction Reading of Bills.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.

1
2 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: And since
3 we have no resolutions, we have no discussion on
4 that. We'll go to General Discussion and since I
5 have the mic, let me start off first by saying that
6 each one of you received a reminder flyer this
7 morning in your offices about our upcoming Council
8 Caucus dinner, which will be a week from this coming
9 Monday and it'll be in Dyker Heights, Brooklyn; Dyker
10 Heights becomes Dyker Lights for the holidays and so
11 you're all invited to join us as we do a bus tour of
12 the lights in Dyker Heights, Brooklyn and then we'll
13 go to a restaurant for a Council dinner right there
14 after. So the flyers are in your office and also
15 there will be an email and calls made, but remember
16 it's a week from this coming Monday. We'll go now to
17 Council Member Mark Levine.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you very
19 much. I wanna call my colleagues' attention to
20 Intro. 1008, which I'm pleased to be introducing
21 today. You know there's a revolution underway in the
22 way we pay for things; some of you with these fancy
23 phones know what I'm talking about -- Apple Pay,
24 Samsung Pay, Android Pay -- that are allowing people
25 to simply tap at a point of sale and make the

1
2 payment; much safer, more convenient, more secure
3 than paying by credit card or cash or by a check.
4 But there's one place that you can't make a payment
5 that way and that's the City of New York, where we're
6 still stuck in technologies of the past century when
7 it comes to paying for a parking meter, a license, a
8 ticket; tax bills, so this bill would change that by
9 mandating that the City begin to accept this new form
10 of payment called near field or NF, which would have
11 the benefit of saving the City money; we spend a
12 tremendous amount of money processing checks, it
13 avoids the fraud that we risk with credit cards and
14 it will allow consumers to avoid the significant
15 usage fees that we tag on for credit card payments.
16 And I invite my colleagues to join me in pushing for
17 this 21st century payment system. Thank you.

18 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Thank
19 you, Council Member Levine. And now Council Member...
20 [interpose]

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Wait, Council
22 Member Gentile, I forgot. There is a little
23 gathering in the red room, just so people who don't
24 know and the people who are leaving and voting, but
25 for our new colleagues and their family members that

1
2 are here, so if anybody wants to swing by downstairs
3 in the red room, that will be great before you head
4 out.

5 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Thank
6 you, Speaker. Council Member Cornegy. [background
7 comments] Is Council Member Cornegy here?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Oh, yes, I'm
9 here. Sorry.

10 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Okay.

11 [background comments]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: This is my
13 opportunity for general comments; I'm assuming,
14 Public Advocate substitute; [background comments]
15 yes? Huh? [background comments]

16 I'm pleased to speak today as sponsor of
17 Preconsidered Intro. known as Building Service
18 Workers Protection Act; this bill aims to update and
19 improve legislation initially passed by the City
20 Council in 2002 of a type successfully enacted in
21 other cities as early as 1994, so this is time-tested
22 and effective policy intervention to give workers an
23 opportunity to retain their jobs and continue
24 supporting their families at a time that ownership or
25

1
2 other business changes outside their control might
3 jeopardize that.

4 As council members, we know that many New
5 Yorkers live paycheck to paycheck; our homeless
6 system is overburdened by families whose economic
7 circumstances have changed too quickly for a safety
8 net to catch them. I believe this bill is one that
9 means to assist some New York families in maintaining
10 their economic equilibrium by having a fighting
11 chance at retaining the employment that pays the
12 bills. One significant change this bill makes is to
13 eliminate the carve-out for city-leased buildings;
14 it's important that the City holds itself to the
15 standards we demand from the private sector; this is
16 a wonderful opportunity for the City to demonstrate
17 leadership.

18 In addition, this update reflects the
19 current state of building service worker wages and
20 changes in the business environment, such as
21 insourcing, outsourcing and problems created by
22 transitions between major commercial lessees. In
23 all, I believe these are important and sound updates
24 to a proven intervention that has great practical
25

1
2 value to many of New York City's workers. I
3 encourage my colleagues to vote in favor of the bill.

4 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Thank
5 you, Councilman Cornegy. Please keep it down; we're
6 still conducting business. Council Member Williams.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.
8 Today Brooklyn's own has received the recognition she
9 has long deserved, as President Barak Obama has
10 awarded Congresswoman Shirley Chisholm the
11 Presidential Medal of Freedom; it's no small victory
12 that the first black president of the United States
13 is recognizing this honor with the first African
14 American woman freedom fighter herself. Her brand of
15 unbought and unbossed leadership led her to become
16 the first African American woman member of Congress
17 in 1968 and the historic campaign for democratic
18 nomination for president in 1972. I'm proud to
19 represent many areas that she represented and I'm
20 also proud to be a Brooklyn College alum, as she was.

21 Also, I'm asking folks to sign onto my
22 resolution calling... there are many units that are not
23 rent-stabilized or rate-controlled; we wanna provide
24 incentives for landlords to rent these units as
25 affordable and so we have a resolution which calls on

1
2 the state to establish a tax exemption that would
3 give small landlords across the city a tax exemption
4 in exchange for renting units below market rate to
5 low- and moderate-income New Yorkers.

6 With the last minute, I'm very happy that
7 we paid a moment of silence for those in Paris,
8 Lebanon, Beirut; there's ones in Mali, one in Tunisia
9 as well; this across the board; unfortunately I don't
10 see Facebook many times offering the flags of those
11 other countries; hopefully that will change. I do
12 know... [crosstalk]

13 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Order
14 please. [background comment]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: there is a big
16 push... there is a big push using the excuse of
17 terrorism to spread xenophobia as we move forward and
18 while there is a very real threat in the United
19 States that we have to take seriously, the biggest
20 threat when it comes to terrorism is from the right
21 wing and white supremacist groups that have executed
22 offices that have shot up churches and burned
23 churches. Just yesterday there was a shooting in
24 Minneapolis of Black Lives Matter, a peaceful protest
25 [sic] was shot at by some supremacists. I actually

1
2 saw the Tweet this morning and tried to ignore it and
3 my colleague actually brought it back up to me and
4 I'm glad he did. If we really wanna deal with it, we
5 should be honest of where our biggest threats are
6 [bell] and do what we can to neutralize those
7 threats. Spreading xenophobia and ignoring the
8 biggest threat does us no help; it does a disservice
9 to the position this country is in right now. Thank
10 you.

11 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Next up,
12 Council Member Barron.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I
14 wanna just call my colleagues' attention to Reso
15 0908, which is being introduced and it supports the
16 bill in Albany, Assembly Bill 8364, which calls on
17 the barring of grand juries where there have been
18 killings or excessive force by police that resulted
19 in death, and we know that there's an expression that
20 a prosecutor can get an indictment for a ham
21 sandwich, but yet and still we know that in the cases
22 of Eric Gardner and Michael Brown there was no
23 indictment, so those officers were not brought to
24 justice.

25

1
2 So I'm asking that you would sign onto
3 this reso that there will be public grand juries,
4 there will be no more secret grand juries; we're not
5 even able to get the record of what transpired in
6 those secret sessions and these people are not
7 brought to justice, so I'm asking you to sign onto
8 that, and it will be akin to the effort that we're
9 making in our package of bills to have police
10 identify themselves and to make a chokehold illegal
11 and to have police no longer engage in brutalization
12 and murder of black lives.

13 And the incident that my colleague
14 referred to in Minneapolis was a protest, because a
15 police officer shot a black man in the head because
16 he said the man was interfering with EMTs who were
17 responding to a situation. So we still have a
18 protest movement going on, we have to be vigilant; we
19 can't allow these things to go on and we've got to
20 support those persons who are struggling to make this
21 country accountable to all of us who are living here;
22 not just a select few. Thank you.

23 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Council
24 Member Cumbo.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Good afternoon
3 colleagues. I want to remind you as we approach the
4 Thanksgiving holiday it's so important that we
5 remember that for so many it's going to be a sad time
6 for some when they look around the table and there's
7 going to be some missing seats. So let us show
8 compassion, love and support towards one another
9 today and every day; it's important that we
10 recognize, particularly for those who have been given
11 so much, that it's important to reach out, knock on
12 someone's door, see if they need a slice of cake or a
13 piece of pie or to just be out there and to make sure
14 that those that do not have families are actually
15 invited to your home or you check in with them.

16 I also want to congratulate Janet
17 Alvarez, Esq., who will become the first Latina who
18 will serve in that agency, so we are very proud of
19 her for that.

20 I would also like to call your attention
21 to a bill that I'm co-sponsoring with Council Members
22 Crowley, Mealy, Rosenthal and Cornegy that would
23 require agency Minority and Women-Owned Business
24 Enterprise utilization plans to be published online.
25 In other words, it would give a place for all

1
2 contracts in excess of \$5 million online for the
3 purpose of transparency.

4 In addition to that, I also, as my
5 colleague, Council Member Williams made mention of,
6 to make mention of the Shirley Chisholm Presidential
7 Medal of Freedom. Today President Obama will aware
8 Shirley Chisholm with a Presidential Medal of
9 Freedom, the nation's highest civilian honor. She
10 made history in 1968 when she ran as the first
11 African American woman elected to Congress and then
12 four years later, in 1972 she became the first
13 African American woman to run for president and in a
14 race of 13 individuals she came in fourth place. She
15 has inspired young women all over the country.

16 And I also wanna commend First Lady
17 Chirlane McCray for her leadership and in services on
18 expanding mental health and wellness services,
19 ThriveNYC, a plan to action to guide the city toward
20 a more effective and holistic system; outlines 54
21 initiatives, 23 of them new, to support the mental
22 well-being of New Yorkers. [bell]

23 And finally, I just want to say a
24 farewell to my good friend, Council Member Arroyo,
25 she is a dynamic woman and I remember when I first

1
2 came into the Council I came in under some tumultuous
3 circumstances and she said to me, "I see you always
4 walking around so happy all day.. [interpose]

5 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Okay.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: "you don't seem so
7 happy today," and she said, "When you walk in that
8 Council, always walk in with your held high..."
9 [interpose]

10 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Council
11 Member...

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: "and make sure you
13 walk in like you own the place."

14 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Thank
15 you, Council Member.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So thank you so
17 much to Council Member Arroyo; she will be missed and
18 thank you Council Member... [crosstalk]

19 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Thank
20 you, Council Member.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Gentile for the
22 extra time.

23 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Council
24 Member Chin.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Good afternoon. I
3 would like to call my colleagues' attention to
4 Resolution 0909, introduced at the request of the
5 Manhattan Borough President Brewer by Council Member
6 Treyger and myself.

7 Resolution 0909 urges the U.S. Department
8 of Housing and Urban Development to support New York
9 City's application for National Disaster Resiliency
10 Competition, which would potentially award the City
11 with up to \$500 million. Like many council members
12 in this chamber, I saw firsthand the devastation that
13 Superstorm Sandy caused when it hit the city; Seniors
14 were stuck in high-rise buildings without power or
15 water; the streets of the South Street Seaport and
16 many parts of Lower Manhattan were pitch black and
17 littered with debris days following the storm. The
18 woman who owned a local small business, Cowgirl
19 Seahorse, showed me the chalk line that's still there
20 today of how high the water level was within the
21 restaurant; that chalk line was much higher than me
22 and I think it's probably as high as Council Member
23 Cornegy. This competition [laughter] this
24 competition would not only bring needed funding to
25 protect our coastline from floods and storm surges,

1
2 it will create opportunities for green spaces, public
3 parks and other amenities.

4 I want to thank William Murray for work
5 on this resolution and I hope that my fellow council
6 members will sign onto this resolution and I also
7 wanna wish all my colleagues a happy Thanksgiving and
8 welcome to our new colleagues, especially Council
9 Member Grodenchik; I knew him when he was in the
10 Assembly. Welcome. Thank you.

11 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Thank
12 you, Council Member Chin and Council Member Reynoso.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you.

14 So today I wanna speak on bikes, and
15 people probably saw today on the New York Post, our
16 fair and balanced New York City news, that I wanna
17 allow for bicyclists to run through stop signs and
18 run through red lights and that is absolutely not
19 true. What I'm asking to do is that we treat
20 vehicles like vehicles, bikes like bikes and cars
21 like cars and what my legislation would actually do
22 is; it would allow for cyclists to treat stop signs
23 as yield signs and proceed through a red light when
24 it is safe to do so as a stop sign. This is a
25 resolution, so it would have to go to the state, so

1
2 even if this resolution passes, doesn't mean that
3 traffic law changes.

4 The de Blasio administration is looking
5 to double the number of cyclists in New York City by
6 2020; if we're gonna have twice as many cyclists, we
7 need to start being a lot more practical and sensible
8 about what traffic looks like in the City of New York
9 when it comes to bicyclists, drivers and pedestrians.
10 For legal purposes, cyclists are treated as vehicles,
11 but we need to make sure that it's acknowledged that
12 cyclists don't have the same potential for injury on
13 the roads as vehicles do. From 2000 to 2013, the
14 most recent years for which this data is available,
15 cyclist fatality struck 10 people, while 2,418
16 pedestrians were killed by drivers; meaning cyclists
17 account for 0.4% of pedestrian deaths. Cyclists are
18 not cars and the punitive measures taken against them
19 should not equate to those taken against cars, so I
20 really would like for you guys to look at that
21 legislation and refrain from media hype, to say the
22 least.

23 I also have two bills on small schools;
24 physical activity, they're very great bills; easier
25

1
2 to follow through, so I hope I can get your support
3 on that. Thank you, guys.

4 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Thank
5 you, Councilman Reynoso. Before we go to concluding
6 remarks from the Speaker, I'm gonna ask Councilman
7 Menchaca to vote on all Land Use Call-Ups and General
8 Order Calendar.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you so
10 much, and I want to vote yes on all Land Use Call-Ups
11 and General Order items, and also wish everyone a
12 happy Thanksgiving to you and your family. Thank you
13 so much.

14 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: Just to
15 correct for the record, all items on today's General
16 Order Calendar have been adopted by a vote of 46 in
17 the affirmative, 0 in the negative; 0 abstentions
18 with the exception of 0982, which remains at 44
19 affirmative, 2 negative; 0 abstentions and revised
20 Land Use Call-Ups adopted by a vote of 46 in the
21 affirmative and 0 in the negative. And now closing
22 remarks. [background comment] Oh I'm sorry; you
23 weren't on the list, I'm sorry; somehow we didn't get
24 you on the list. I'm sorry... [crosstalk]

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you. That's
3 okay. Thank you, Council Member Gentile.

4 I rise to just thank the Speaker, Melissa
5 Mark-Viverito for leading by example and for changing
6 the signs on the bathrooms in both City Hall and over
7 at 250 so that they are more inclusive and inclusive
8 of all transgender people as well. If you will
9 notice, downstairs on the first floor it now reads
10 "All-Gender Bathrooms" and I think we're gonna see
11 that in 250 also.

12 Unfortunately, not everybody in the City
13 of New York follows the example led by this Council,
14 so I do have a piece of legislation that will address
15 this issue as well and I'm just asking my colleagues
16 to sign onto Intro. 0871, which would amend the code
17 to allow single-stall bathrooms or would require
18 single-stall bathrooms to be designated as all-gender
19 bathrooms and would allow the Construction Code to be
20 changed so that if a person who is building a
21 building wanted to have single-stall, all-gender
22 bathrooms instead of a male and female bathroom, they
23 could do so. So thank you very much and happy
24 Thanksgiving, and again, thank you to our Speaker for
25 leading by example.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE GENTILE: My

apology and thank you, Councilman Dromm. And now,
concluding remarks from our Speaker.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Council Member

Gentile, thank you so much for holding down the fort
today. Again, wishing everyone a happy Thanksgiving
and to please go downstairs; let's share a little bit
in the red room with our new colleagues Grodenchik
and Borelli. Again, thank you to everybody.
Gracias.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 9, 2015