

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HEALTH

----- X

March 7, 2024
Start: 10:22 a.m.
Recess: 10:53 a.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Lynn C. Schulman, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Joann Ariola
Oswald Feliz
James F. Gennaro
Kristy Marmorato
Julie Menin
Mercedes Narcisse
Kalman Yeger
Susan Zhuang

OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ATTENDING:

Keith Powers
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
Eric Dinowitz
David M. Carr
Jumaane Williams, Public Advocate

A P P E A R A N C E S

Peter F. Vallone, Jr.

Lea Vallone

Anna Marie Vallone

Michelle Villagomez, Legislative Senior Director
for the ASPCA

Allie Taylor, President of Voters for Animal
Rights

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: This is a microphone
3 check for the Committee on Health, recorded in the
4 Council Chambers on March 7, 2024, by Layla Lynch.

5 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning, and
6 welcome to the Committee on Health.

7 At this time, we ask that you please
8 place phones on vibrate or silent mode.

9 Thank you.

10 Chair, we are ready to begin.

11 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Okay. [GAVEL] Good
12 morning, everyone. I am Council Member Lynn Schulman,
13 Chair of the New York City Council's Committee on
14 Health.

15 Before I start, I want to acknowledge the
16 Vallone family who is here today. I am joined by
17 Council Members Menin, Zhuang, Narcisse, Powers,
18 Ariola, Marmorato, Feliz, and Yeger, and we're also
19 joined by Public Advocate, and we're also have James
20 Gennaro on Zoom.

21 It is with deep sadness that we
22 acknowledge the recent passing of former New York
23 City Council Member Paul Vallone, a dedicated public
24 servant and passionate advocate for animals. Mr.
25 Vallone's commitment to improving the welfare of

2 animals in New York City was exemplified by his
3 instrumental role in passing significant legislation
4 during his tenure. One of his most impactful
5 achievements was the successful passage of Local Law
6 123 of 2018, which mandated the establishment of
7 full-service animal shelters in all five boroughs by
8 July 2024. This landmark legislation has not only
9 enhanced the City's capacity to provide comprehensive
10 care for animals but has also significantly improved
11 the overall animal welfare landscape. In honor of
12 Paul Vallone's unwavering dedication to the well-
13 being of animals, we will be officially designating
14 the new 50,000 square foot animal care center
15 facility in Queens as the Paul A. Vallone Queens
16 Animal Care Center. This gesture not only serves as a
17 fitting tribute to a man who tirelessly championed
18 the cause of our four-legged friends but also as a
19 lasting reminder of his enduring legacy in creating a
20 more compassionate and humane city for everyone. As
21 we mourn the loss of a true advocate, let us also
22 celebrate the positive impact Paul Vallone had on the
23 lives of countless animals and the communities he
24 served. The Queens Animal Care Center, bearing his
25 name, will stand as a testament to his commitment to

2 creating a more compassionate and animal friendly New
3 York City. I want to thank the Vallone family for
4 being here today and for their support, strength, and
5 dedication to improving the lives of all New Yorkers.

6 I want to go off script for a second and
7 say that I've known the Vallone family for a very
8 long time. I am a Queens Member of the City Council,
9 and Paul Vallone has been very instrumental in my
10 tenure in Queens politics, which is a very long time,
11 so I want to thank all of you for that.

12 What we're going to do now is going to
13 have some of the Members speak and then we're going
14 to have testimony from the family.

15 I would now like to invite the Public
16 Advocate, Jumaane Williams, to make a statement.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you so
18 much, Madam Chair. My name is Jumaane Williams. I'm
19 the public advocate for the City of New York. I'd
20 like to thank Chair Schulman and the Members of the
21 Health Committee for holding this hearing today.

22 I had the great honor of serving
23 alongside Paul Vallone during my tenure in New York
24 City Council. His untimely passing is a great loss,
25 not only to his friends, family, and loved ones, but

2 also to the communities he uplifted and the lives he
3 touched. From his time in the Council to his time as
4 Deputy Commissioner for External Affairs at the
5 Veterans Services Department, Paul was a dedicated
6 public servant. As a former Council Member, he led
7 with confidence and fought for what he believed in,
8 and as our Deputy Commissioner, he worked tirelessly
9 on behalf of our city's veterans. Our city is
10 stronger because of his work and efforts. I support
11 this Council's proposal to rename the Queens Animal
12 Care Center as the Paul A. Vallone Queens Animal Care
13 Center. Renaming the Queens location after Paul would
14 be a fitting tribute to honor Paul's work in passing
15 legislation to ensure that there is an animal shelter
16 in every borough. I know his family is here. God
17 bless you all. I got to serve with both him and Peter
18 Vallone, and I'm sorry, Peter, you guys fought the
19 same fights, but he always did it with a smile, and
20 the interactions I had with him are what we actually
21 need in this city, in this state, in this country,
22 people being able to differ and doing it while
23 respecting each other. Godspeed to Paul, to you all,
24 and he will be missed so I wanted to make sure I was
25 here to show my support.

2 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Thank you, Public
3 Advocate.

4 I also now want to ask Council Member
5 Keith Powers to make his statement.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you, Chair.
7 Thank you, guys, for being here with us today.

8 I think for many of us over the last few
9 weeks, it's been tremendously difficult to deal with
10 the news and the pain of losing such a dear friend to
11 the City Council, a personal friend and, without
12 question, a friend to this entire city. I had the
13 honor and privilege of serving with Paul, becoming
14 his friend even before I got here into the City
15 Council, but also have the tremendous privilege of
16 knowing the Vallones and the Constantinoples for
17 almost more than a decade now, and with Peter Sr.,
18 Peter Jr., and Paul, we have had a long-standing
19 legacy here in the City Council of having a Vallone
20 presence but having the good nature and the hard work
21 that they bring to this city and this job every
22 single day. Paul was the true embodiment of that. I
23 worked for the Vallones, as you know, Peter would
24 always tell us just the most important thing was to
25 do the right thing, and I think that Paul carried

2 that with him every single day in the City Council,
3 no matter whether it was politically popular or
4 something that he had tussled with. I think he was
5 driven by that kindness that his father handed down
6 to his entire family and handed down to Paul's kids
7 and family as well, which is to do what's right at
8 all times, and the Vallones, famously when Peter was
9 Speaker, would be home to be with his family to have
10 dinner almost, it seems every single night, and I
11 will tell you, and I'm going to tell us to, to his
12 kids. When I got the news about Paul, the first thing
13 I did was think about you guys, and I knew every
14 single one of your names. I don't think we've ever
15 met, but I know because Paul talked about you guys
16 every single instance he had, and anybody who knew
17 Paul knew about you guys because of how much he loved
18 and talked about you guys at the job, off the job,
19 and everywhere else. We're going to put Paul's name
20 on a building today and that will be a permanent way
21 to remember his legacy but, in this Body, I want to
22 let you know, it's much bigger than that. Paul was a
23 fantastic guy who brought something to this job every
24 single day, and I know me and everybody who got the
25 chance to serve with him remembers, which is to smile

2 every time you do this job, no matter how hard it is,
3 always do the right thing, and make sure you're there
4 for your family all the time. Thank you, guys.

5 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: By the way, I also
6 want to acknowledge some family friends. Michael
7 Sorreo (phonetic) and Anthony Constantinople, who is
8 a partner in the Vallone Law Firm.

9 I want to ask if any of my Colleagues
10 would like to make a statement. Council Member Menin.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: I, unfortunately,
12 did not have the pleasure of serving at the same time
13 as Paul, but I knew him for many years. He was such a
14 wonderful man, and I just want to extend my deepest
15 condolences to the family. I think this is such a
16 beautiful and fitting tribute. Animals bring such joy
17 and compassion and love to people's life, and that's
18 what Paul did. He was one of the kindest people and
19 always had a smile on his face and so I think this is
20 an unbelievably beautiful and fitting tribute for us
21 to be able to do to remember and honor your father's
22 legacy.

23 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Council Member
24 Narcisse.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: I did not serve
3 with Paul, but one thing we have in common before we
4 start talking is just smiling and laughing and that's
5 why I had known him by, and another thing, because
6 I've been involved in politics since I was very
7 young, 19 years old, and every time we've seen each
8 other, even when your grandfather was serving, is
9 just amazing people, good people, and I benefit their
10 office, which I love to change things around his
11 office, and I haven't done anything to that office
12 because he left it very clean, very nice. Another
13 thing on behalf of my two cats, Xena and Trigger,
14 we're going to make sure that we get a visit to the
15 center as well because when it come to the love and
16 the heart and the service, he has it, so thank you
17 for sharing him. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

18 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Thank you. Any
19 other Member want to make comments?

20 No? Okay. Now, with that, I'll turn the
21 mic over to Committee Counsel. Thank you.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL PEPE: Thank you, Chair.
23 We're now going to move to public testimony.

24 First, we'll hear from Peter Vallone, Jr.

2 PETER VALLONE, JR: Thank you. Mr.
3 Jumaane, I've heard about his smile and my lack of a
4 smile about 5,000 times in the last month and it's
5 100 percent true. I am smiling today though, and I am
6 speaking before my goddaughter because I've learned
7 in a very short time that never to follow Lea when
8 she speaks. She's in Fordham Law School. She's
9 already probably a better attorney than the rest of
10 the family, and you'll hear from her after me.

11 Thank you, Chair Schulman, Speaker Adams,
12 Jumaane, all the Council Members that came out today.
13 As a former Chair of the Public Safety Committee, I'm
14 very impressed with the turnout and the promptness. I
15 know how rarely that happens. I am also speaking on
16 behalf of my father. He really wanted to be here
17 today. He's in the hospital, and my brother, Perry,
18 is with him or they would both be here. I'm
19 testifying today as a former Council Member. I want
20 to let you know a little bit about the legislative
21 history that got us all today because it is actually
22 very interesting, but I'm testifying mostly as a
23 proud older brother and uncle and godfather. This
24 fight for shelters in every borough started in 2000
25 and, right in this room, my mother testified,

2 probably right over there, there was a picture of the
3 table that's over there, usually with her testifying
4 at it and the Speaker, my father, introduced the bill
5 requiring a shelter in every borough. Mom testified,
6 and last night at 10 p.m., my daughter, Casey, found
7 my mother's testimony and took a picture of it and
8 sent it over to me so I'm just going to give a little
9 portion of it. She said right here in this room, "For
10 every dog or cat adopted, four are euthanized, 40,000
11 are killed each year. This is a crisis, and strong
12 measures have to be taken. The pounds, shelters, and
13 humane societies are overwhelmed. The law you are
14 considering is a major step in the right direction to
15 reverse this terrible trend. The shelter program will
16 provide a full-service shelter in every borough and
17 will allow for humane adoptions and ensure a clean
18 and safe environment for the animals and for those
19 that administer to them." Speaking of those that
20 administer to them, I know some of the animal rights
21 advocates are here today. They were very helpful
22 throughout this. Michelle Villagomez is still around.
23 I think she's testifying. She worked with my brother
24 and myself and my dad back in the day and very
25 pleased that they're here in support. The bill passed

2 and the shelter was being built in every borough. It
3 was built in three boroughs but was never built in
4 Queens and it was never built in the Bronx so a
5 lawsuit was brought by many people, including those
6 same animal rights advocates to try to force the
7 Mayor to build the shelters. Rather than build the
8 shelters, on the day of a stated meeting two weeks
9 before the lawsuit was going to be decided in court
10 and it was obviously going to be decided in the
11 Council's favor, he prevailed upon the Speaker who
12 shall not be named but rhymes with Finn who passed a
13 bill that day to eliminate the requirement for a
14 shelter in every borough, and so I found out about it
15 the day of the stated and couldn't stop it obviously.
16 I put the bill back in later on. It never moved,
17 obviously, and that was that. We kept up the fight,
18 the entire family and, with Paul's help in 2013, I
19 proposed and the Council passed an animal abuse
20 registry, which is now first of its type in the
21 entire country being copied worldwide and, in fact,
22 the Mayor vetoed that too, and he vetoed that right
23 before term limits took place so we actually didn't
24 even have time to override the veto so 2014,
25 actually, because Paul Vallone is elected. First

2 thing he does is gets the new Council to override the
3 Mayor's veto of the Animal Abuse Registry, and that's
4 why we have that today. Second thing he does is
5 reintroduce the Shelter in Every Borough Bill. Didn't
6 move for the first four years, but then Corey Johnson
7 became Speaker, and he and Paul were very close. They
8 worked together very closely, and Corey said, what's
9 your priority. Paul said, this bill, the Animal
10 Shelter in Every Borough Bill, and here we are, and
11 we're naming the shelter after the person most
12 responsible for it, and I can't think of a better
13 tribute to him. In fact, this is the City Council's
14 idea. You guys came up with it, and we are hugely
15 thankful that you did that and are doing that today,
16 and I'm smiling, Jumaane, but it's hard through the
17 tears as I think of how happy Paul would be right
18 now, especially to see his family here and to hear
19 his daughter testify so that's what I want to hear so
20 I'm going to now finish up. Thank you for all your
21 time and effort and go to my godchild, Lea Vallone.

22 LEA VALLONE: Thank you to my wonderful
23 godfather, and thank you all for your such amazing
24 and kind words.

2 When I was little, I wanted to be a
3 veterinarian until I took chemistry and decided law
4 was more my thing, but that's beside the point. This
5 passion stemmed from my father who taught me to love
6 all creatures, no matter how big or small. In return,
7 I can't think of an animal that did not love him
8 back. It was as if they were able to sense his pure
9 soul and kindness instinctually. Whether it was
10 hermit crabs, hamsters, birds, carnival fish, or
11 snails, he cared for whatever we brought home with
12 open arms. My dad taught our family how to appreciate
13 the beauty of nature in a way few truly understand.
14 His care towards animals reflects fundamental parts
15 of himself. To love selflessly, to understand without
16 words, to give with no expectations. While there are
17 countless examples of his acts of service, I'll give
18 one. I returned home from college and found a
19 strange, borderline aggressive stray cat under my
20 bed. Of course, he was out in the rain and my dad
21 felt bad. Aside from a temporary reprieve, he made
22 sure Rocco found a forever home. If his devotion to
23 making a difference for the most simplest of beings
24 was sprinkled around, the world would be a much
25 better place. I know he is with us today smiling as

2 we take one step closer to accomplishing this goal.
3 He was so proud of his effort in finally getting the
4 shelter built and making sure that there is one in
5 every borough, an idea dreamed by my grandmother. As
6 he remarked in 2016, if it were its own city, Queens
7 alone would rank as the nation's fourth largest. It
8 is unacceptable that no animal shelter currently
9 exists. This is for his childhood cats, Cleo, Missy,
10 Piccolo, Pixie, and Tomcat. This is for our family's
11 assorted animals over the years. Ziggy, Hercules,
12 Rosamund, Theodore, Jon Snow, Ron, and, of course
13 Daisy who is still waiting for her best friend to
14 come home. This is for the countless animals my dad
15 will continue to help for years to come, thanks to
16 his dedicated work to this city and, most of all,
17 this is for Paul, whose guiding light and heart has
18 impacted us all for the better. Thank you so much.

19 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Any other family
20 members would like to speak? Yes? No? You sure? Go
21 ahead.

22 ANNA MARIE VALLONE: I just wanted to
23 thank you all for everything, keeping his memory
24 alive. He was just such a compassionate and beautiful
25 person, and I'm so happy that some, if not most of

2 you, were able to meet with him and work with him and
3 remember him as the most amazing person we know, and
4 I just again wanted to thank you for everything.

5 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Thank you very
6 much. I also just want to say that I ran three times
7 for City Council, won the third time. The first two
8 times I ran as an insurgent, so I didn't have county
9 support and Paul kept encouraging me and meeting with
10 me and telling me, you can do it, you can do it,
11 don't worry about them, and I actually worked for
12 another Council Member who worked under your father,
13 Peter Sr., and so I knew the whole family. I also
14 want to tell you that I'm a Member of the Budget
15 Negotiating Team, so when I came into the Council and
16 I was assigned as Chair of the Health Committee,
17 Peter, you know this, so B and T, you get to really
18 shape how the budget's going to be so there was this
19 amount of money for the Queens ACC center so people
20 were like that's so much money, maybe we should move
21 it and this and that, and I fought like hell to make
22 sure that money, the last two cycles, stayed in so
23 that we could do this, and I'm very proud of doing
24 that.

2 With that, we're going to call up some
3 other folks to testify and please stay and listen.
4 Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL PEPE: Thank you so much
6 to the Vallone family for being here. We're going to
7 hear from Michelle Villagomez from ASPCA. If you
8 could please come up.

9 You can proceed.

10 MICHELLE VILLAGOMEZ: Thank you so much
11 for letting me have the opportunity to say something.
12 I'm going to go off script for a second. I was
13 looking at the hearing transcripts to see what Paul
14 said, and he was an ally of the ASPCA going back
15 generations, back to his mother, and just how special
16 a person he was. In his remarks, when this bill
17 passed Committee, he remembered that I just had a
18 baby and in there, it was saying, calling out my son,
19 Mateo, by name, saying there's a new advocate for
20 animals, I hope the shelters are open before Mateo
21 starts school. That being said, Mateo's in first
22 grade, and we're very excited that this year we're
23 going to see the Queens Animal Care Center open in
24 Paul's name, and that was just like a little detail
25 that he just remembered that we were all human

2 beings, advocating for good things, and he was just
3 such a special person. That sort of got to be what I
4 was looking at and seeing that he remembered my son
5 and then had a whole conversation with me about it.

6 Good morning. I'm Michelle Villagomez.

7 I'm the Legislative Senior Director for the ASPCA. I
8 want to thank everyone, Chairman Schulman, Speaker
9 Adams. I'm really honored to provide testimony in
10 support of this legislation. Paul was a wonderful
11 ally in our work, and I really genuinely enjoyed
12 collaborating with him. I'm a resident of Queens,
13 lifelong, and now I live in what was his District. I
14 believe that this renaming would be a fitting tribute
15 to a man who dedicated himself to the well-being of
16 both animals and the communities he served. As Peter
17 Vallone just said, the commitment runs for a very
18 long sort of lineage in the Vallone family. It was a
19 personal passion but a continuation of his family's
20 legacy. The Vallone family has long been synonymous
21 with advocating for the welfare of animals in New
22 York City. Council Member Vallone, his father,
23 Speaker Peter Vallone, played a pivotal role in
24 passing legislation in 2000. His mother, Tina
25 Vallone, demonstrated unwavering dedication as a

2 volunteer in various animal welfare initiatives
3 throughout the years, and Council Member Peter
4 Vallone was a staunch advocate against animal
5 cruelty, and Paul carried this torch forward with
6 great fervor. When he championed this legislation to
7 ensure that all boroughs have access to full-service
8 animal shelters, he did it in recognition that
9 shelters are not merely facilities for housing stray
10 pets but vital community resources offering a wide
11 array of services, including surrender prevention,
12 food assistance, medical care, humane education, and
13 adoption programs. He understood that by supporting
14 animal welfare, we also support the well-being of our
15 communities. His vision for the Queen's Animal Care
16 Center was one of inclusivity and compassion, where
17 both animals and people could find the assistance and
18 resources that they needed. Renaming the center in
19 his honor would not only commemorate his dedication
20 and hard work but also serve as a reminder of the
21 profound connection between human and animal welfare.
22 Every time I met with him, he always asked one
23 question. What can we do with the kids in my
24 District? And it was like, what can we do? Can we
25 bring adoption vehicles? Can we do some humane

2 education? How can we spread the word about the
3 human-animal bond? We'd love to see that. The new
4 facility under its new name is going to serve as a
5 lasting reminder of Paul's legacy of empathy,
6 kindness, and commitment to making our world a better
7 place.

8 In conclusion, I urge the Committee and
9 the Council to support this initiative, which I see
10 that you are, and ensure that the legacy continues to
11 inspire and uplift us all. We have to continue to
12 invest in advancing the services provided by animal
13 care centers throughout the City of New York and make
14 sure that the compassionate spirit lives on. Thank
15 you.

16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL PEPE: Thank you very
17 much. This concludes in-person testimony.

18 At this time, we will be moving to
19 virtual testimony.

20 We will be hearing from Allie Taylor.
21 Please wait for the Sergeant-at-Arms' cue before you
22 begin your testimony.

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

24 ALLIE TAYLOR: Thank you and good morning,
25 everybody. Thank you to Speaker Adams for introducing

2 this bill and thank you to Health Committee
3 Chairperson Schulman and the Health Committee for the
4 opportunity to honor the memory of Council Member
5 Paul Vallone.

6 My name is Allie Taylor, and I'm the
7 President of Voters for Animal Rights here in New
8 York City. This legislation is such a fitting way to
9 ensure that Paul Vallone's legacy and spirit of
10 advocating for homeless animals and the people who
11 care for them will live on forever. I will never
12 forget that day in June of 2018 when Paul's bill
13 passed, mandating full-service animal shelters be
14 built in every borough which was incredibly needed
15 considering that Queens in the Bronx had no full-
16 service animal shelter at all. Council Member Vallone
17 fought for over a decade to make this happen
18 alongside his brother and now, thanks to him, Queens
19 and the Bronx will finally have equal access to an
20 adoption center, low-cost vet care, humane education,
21 dog training, a pet food pantry, a lost and found,
22 and a surrender prevention counseling unit. I have
23 many fond memories, one of which was getting a call
24 from Paul when he found a stray orange cat in his
25 neighborhood and he didn't hesitate to drop

2 everything he was doing and bring the cat indoors.
3 Whether it was shelter pets, wildlife, horses, or
4 animals in the circus, Paul unapologetically stood up
5 for the animals and never backed down, even when he
6 was challenged by those who couldn't understand why
7 there was such a need to protect our city's animals.
8 As a trap, neuter, release cat rescuer myself, I know
9 the difficulties that rescuers face so I can't stress
10 enough how impactful the opening of the Bronx and
11 Queens animal shelters will be for generations to
12 come thanks to the work of Paul Vallone. On behalf of
13 the cat rescue community, thank you for honoring his
14 memory through the official naming of the Paul A.
15 Vallone Queen's Animal Care Center.

16 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Thank you very
17 much, Allie. We really appreciate your testimony.

18 A couple things. One, I want to
19 acknowledge Council Member Gale Brewer has joined us
20 earlier, Jonathan Schott who is now the Chief-of-
21 Staff to Council Member Menin was Chief-of-Staff to
22 Paul Vallone, so I wanted to acknowledge him.

23 I also want to tell you, just to show you
24 how important Paul was to all of us, this is the
25 first time that I have had full quorum here for this

1 COMMITTEE ON HEALTH

24

2 Committee this year so that shows you what he meant
3 and what his legacy is.

4 I just want to ask, any of my other
5 Colleagues just want to make a statement, last call?
6 No? Okay so then we're going to go to a vote. Thank
7 you.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Good
9 morning. William Martin, Committee Clerk. Roll Call
10 Vote, Committee on Health on Proposed Introduction
11 1B. Chair Schulman.

12 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: I proudly vote aye.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Yeger.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Gennaro.
16 Feliz.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Madam Chair, I
18 wish to speak on my vote. Madam Chair.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Council
20 Member Gennaro, thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Madam Chair, am I
22 recognized to speak?

23 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Okay. Thank you
25 very much, and I'm sorry that a doctor appointment is

2 keeping me from being there in person. I want to
3 salute the Vallone family who I've known for 34
4 years. I was hired by Peter 34 years ago, and it's
5 been a wonderful journey to know the Vallone family
6 and, my colleague, Peter, my colleague, Paul, and
7 Anna Marie and his wonderful family. I look forward
8 to seeing the Vallone family and Charlie on retreat
9 this year. A happy day, a sad day. Again, I echo the
10 words of many that have said that this is such a
11 great fitting tribute to Paul, and indeed it is. I'm
12 happy that his good efforts brought this forward.
13 I've been very inspired by Tina's passion and
14 everyone in the Vallone family's passion for animals.
15 We're running a little animal shelter here in our
16 home. We have our cat and four foster cats and two
17 cats living in the backyard and heated cat condos
18 with three squares a day. Once you get into it,
19 there's no going back. A fitting day to honor Paul,
20 to be inspired by Paul and the Vallone family, and to
21 do what we can on behalf of the animals that were
22 graced to share the planet with and God bless Paul,
23 God bless the Vallone family, and thank you to all my
24 Colleagues and those that testified in favor of this

1 COMMITTEE ON HEALTH

26

2 wonderful bill today, and I proudly vote aye. Thank
3 you.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank
5 you. Feliz.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Proudly vote aye.
7 Congratulations to the family.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: De La
9 Rosa. Menin.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: I proudly vote aye.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Narcisse.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Happily, aye.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Zhuang.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: Aye.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Ariola.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: I proudly vote
17 aye. I give you my deepest condolences. Having known
18 Paul and all of you, I know the type of love you
19 shared between each other, among each other, and the
20 love that he put out when he came here into this room
21 and, if I could say there was one lesson that I
22 learned from being a friend of Paul Vallone's, it is
23 you can disagree without being disagreeable and
24 that's something that I take with me when I'm now in
25

2 the Chair here, making decisions as a Council Member.
3 My prayers are with you and your family.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank
5 you. Marmorato.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: I vote aye, and
7 I'm very sorry for your loss.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: With a
9 vote of nine in the affirmative, zero in the negative
10 and no abstentions, Introduction is adopted by the
11 Committee.

12 CHAIRPERSON SCHULMAN: Okay, now I'm going
13 to close it out. Congratulations, we're going to have
14 a new building. I hope and expect everybody to be at
15 the opening of that building, which is going to
16 happen fairly soon. With that, I close it out. Thank
17 you. [GAVEL]

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 13, 2024